

# **Evaluation Summary**

Evaluation	STRENGTHENING THE PREVENTION OF GENDER BASED				
	VIOLENCE (GBV) IN MALAWI				
Publication year:	2021				
Donor:	The Royal Norwegian Embassy				
Name of Organisation(s):	Norwegian Church Aid				
Internal, External or Mixed team?	External				
Local Partner(s):	Rights Advice Centre (RAC), Evangelical Association of Malawi (EAM),				
(1)	MNAT,				
Country/Region:	Malawi				
Author:	JIMAT				
Commissioned by:	Norwegian Church Aid GBV programme and MEAL team				
Type of evaluation (midline endline, formative):	Endline				
DAC-sector:	Multi sector and cross cutting				
DAC-criteria used:	Relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability				
Intervention period:	2018- 2021				
Key words:					
Evaluation summary and recommendations (max 2 pages):	Objective:				
	<ul> <li>Assess the project design in terms of its relevance to the overall development situation in the focus districts and relevance to beneficiaries</li> <li>Assess relevance and effectiveness of the project's strategy and approaches for the achievement of the project objectives</li> </ul>				
	Method:				
	The evaluation used both qualitative (Focus group discussions and Key informant interviews) and quantitative (Household questionnaire) methods				
	Key Findings:				
	<ul> <li>Outcome 1</li> <li>276 against a target of traditional and faith leaders (representing 92% achievements rate) had undertaken a demonstrable social action</li> <li>19 against a target of 6 (representing 317% achievement rate) men ministries and boys clubs were capacitated to advance positive masculinities.</li> </ul>				

- A majority of the survey respondents indicated that traditional (74.5%) and religious leaders (75.6%) had demonstrated social action
- Majority of the respondents indicated that traditional leaders have denounced in public negative social norms perpetrating GBV (52.40%) and faith leaders have preached against negative social norms perpetrating GBV (61.20%).
- The least performed social action is mobilizing communities to build safe houses/homes (0.3% for traditional leaders and 1.9% for faith leaders) and providing shelter to survivors of violence (2.8% for traditional leaders and 4.00% for the faith leaders).

#### Outcome 2

- 6 against a target of 4 (representing 150% achievement rate) faith based theological institutions had their curriculum reviewed to integrate gender-based violence
- 72 against a target of 10 faith leaders advocated for implementation of laws, policies and guidelines on GBV and TIP.
- The private sector was engaged and a number of private sector players were trained on TIP.

10 private sector players have included issues of TIP in their policies and guidelines.

#### Outcome 3

- 1196 (372 male and 824 female) survivors of GBV received various forms of support services.
- The police VSU is the most accessed formal service provider
- Survivors of violence also use informal means and there is a clear pathway on accessing informal GBV service providers starting with the marriage counsellor.

# Specific Recommendations:

- This project should be extended because the TIP and GBVrelated behavioral changes sought have begun but will take more than two or three years to complete.
- The evaluation suggests an integrated approach to addressing individual, relational, community, and structural issues. The project aims to provide GBV and legal literacy knowledge and skills to women, men, boys, and girls. It should encourage the establishment of community-based safe spaces for women and girls. NCA and partners should make it possible for local women and girls to participate fully in the processes. In terms of legal

literacy, the project should ensure that project participants understand their responsibilities, including their roles as witnesses, particularly during court litigation processes.

- The NCA and its partners must develop a strong advocacy strategy and engage in evidence-based advocacy on policy and legal frameworks.
- Gender transformative conscious practice tools and frameworks that challenge negative gender social norms, such as gender dialogue sessions and participatory gender analysis tools like the Venn diagram, should be used in the project.
- Advocate for the funding and implementation of GBV and TIP policy and legal frameworks that would allow survivors to access services and justice.
- The project should ensure that males are involved in all three components of ideal male involvement, so that men are involved as users of GBV services, actors in anti-GBV promotion and service delivery, understand the critical importance of men taking responsibility for GBV, and understand gender and gender-based violence.
- NCA and partners should facilitate district-level coordination mechanisms, particularly in the areas of harmonization of GBV and TIP indicators, as well as the creation of spaces for GBV implementation learning, with a focus on sharing and documenting best practices and approaches, among other things.
- NCA and partners should ensure that time is set aside for reflection and learning with stakeholders. The reflection and learning exercises should be carried out at various levels, beginning with the community and progressing to the district. Reflection and learning sessions at the community level can be done at each impact community or by combining several impact communities to enhance learning among and between communities.

Cross-cutting issue(s):

#### **COVID-19 Restrictions**

 The restrictive measures had an impact on project implementation because meetings were limited to a few

	people; there was a widespread fear among the population that attending a meeting would expose them to COVID-19.
	Strong Cultural Beliefs
	■ The project was carried out in conservative cultural and religious settings and contexts. As a result, breaking down cultural and religious barriers was difficult for the project, despite some positive changes among religious and traditional leaders
Link to full report:	NCA Evaluation Report Final-5th Draft-30062021.docx
Link to preregistration form:	Had none that time



ENDLINE EVALUATION OF STRENGTHENING THE PREVENTION OF GENDER BASED VIOLENCE (GBV) IN MALAWI – A FAITH BASED APPROACH 2018-2021



FINAL REVISED REPORT

June 2021



# ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CO Country Office

EAM Evangelical Association of Malawi

GBV Gender Based Violence
JCP Joint Country Program

MCC Malawi Council of Churches

MNAT Malawi Network against Trafficking in Persons

NCA Norwegian Church Aid

OECD-DAC Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development-Development

**Assistance Committee** 

RAC Rights Advice Centre

RNE Royal Norwegian Embassy

SADC Southern Africa Development Cooperation

SRH Sexual Reproductive Health

TIP Trafficking in Persons

TWG Technical Working Group

# **Table of Contents**

<u>ABB</u>	BREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	
EXE	ECUTIVE SUMMARY	IV
<u>1.0.</u>	INTRODUCTION	1
<u>2.0.</u>	ENDLINE EVALUATION	2
2.1.	PURPOSE	2
3.1.	METHODOLOGY	2
3.3.	QUANTITATIVE METHOD	3
3.4.	QUALITATIVE METHOD	3
3.5.	DATA MANAGEMENT AND ANALYSIS	3
3.6.	SUMMARY OF ISSUES AND PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	4
<u>4.0.</u>	EVALUATION FINDINGS	5
4.1.	ACHIEVEMENT OF RESULTS - OUTCOMES AND IMPACT	5
4.2.	RELEVANCE	12
4.3.	EFFECTIVENESS	13
4.4.	EFFICIENCY	18
4.5.	SUSTAINABILITY	21
4.6.	IMPACT	22
<u>5.0.</u>	LESSONS LEARNT	26
<u>6.0.</u>	RECOMMENDATIONS	27
7.0.	REFERENCES	28

# \_Toc75951506

List	of	Fig	gu	res
------	----	-----	----	-----

23
3
6
8
10
11
22
24

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

From April 2018 to May 2021, Norwegian Church Aid (NCA)with support from the Royal Norwegian Embassy implemented "Strengthening the Prevention of GBV in Malawi – A Faith Based Approach" Project. The project aimed to achieve three outcomes: (a) dominant social norms protect girls and women from Gender based violence (GBV); (b) laws, policies, and budgets to end GBV are improved and implemented; and (c) women and girl survivors have safe access to adequate and appropriate support services.

The evaluation was carried out in the 17 Traditional Authorities spread across Mchinji, Lilongwe, Dedza, Dowa, and Mangochi Districts where the project was implemented. The evaluation's goal was to assess the program's performance and capture program accomplishments, challenges, and best practices to inform future similar programming. The evaluation was guided by the OECD/DAC approach and consisted of three components: a population-based survey with 422 respondents; qualitative interviews with 23 focus groups and 22 key informant interviews; and a literature review. Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) was used to analyse quantitative data, and content analysis was used to analyse qualitative data.

On overall achievement of results; the project scored 100% or more achievement rate in 5 of the 13 output indicators; and a 100% or more achievement rate in 3 out of the 5 outcome indicators. The general picture though is that substantial progress has been made on the implementation of the activities and achievement of outputs and key results.

The review observed that the program was and remains appropriate given contextual trends, community needs, and the priorities of the Malawi government. At specific implementation level, programming of activities closely followed community identified priorities as articulated in the district development plans. At the national level, the program has made some contributions towards the national policies, for instance, the Malawi Constitution, The Malawi Growth and Development Strategy III, the National Gender Policy and National Plan of Action on Combating TIP and Ending GBV. At the global level, the program contributed towards the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal (SGD) # 5.

On design, the project's main approach was faith-based, which was praised by KII and participants as a critical approach to addressing GBV and TIP. Faith groups' presence at the grassroots level and everywhere, as well as their accessibility and trustworthiness in the communities they serve, is one of their key strengths. Furthermore, by facilitating curriculum reviews for six church-based theological institutions, the project aided in the implementation of the two key national plans of action on GBV and TIP. The review discovered that there is a growing demand for theological reflections on GBV and TIP in colleges and other faith community sectors because of this process.

While the program conducted an analysis of the current context and identified needs and opportunities for programming, the project did not adequately address the challenges faced by GBV service providers in providing GBV-related services. Furthermore, the program did not adequately analyze the presence of other players in the impact area, particularly non-governmental organizations, which could have resulted in a synergy of efforts and collaboration. However, the project used the same volunteers as other organizations, thereby

adhering to a key programming principle of not creating parallel structures that can cause conflict.

On program strategies, the evaluation noted that the strategies used were effective albeit some of them not being fully utilised to optimum levels. The cascading training approach used had benefits and, some challenges, especially in relation to volunteer motivation. On advocacy, the project did not have a robust advocacy strategy.

On monitoring, evaluation, accountability and learning, while the program had a robust system to monitor outputs and results, there was little invested in learning- the program placed emphasis on 'doing' and created opportunities for reflection through annual meetings with different impact groups. However, the reflection was not well translated into tangible actions or results.

The conventional wisdom among stakeholders consulted is that the program was among those considered to be less expensive projects operating in the country- the program had a moderately lean staff at the top; partner staff based in the field operated with low facility and transport costs. The team worked in partnership with other agencies like government entities and district stakeholders.

The general view is that the project interventions are sustainable as the program put in place key sustainability measures and strategies which included capacity development. The evaluation however noted that while the policy environment was conducive some of the key GBV and TIP service delivery related activities would not be sustainable as they require heavy investment of resources which the government departments may not fully commit.

The household surveys measured perceptions of impact of the COVID-19 program. The project has brought changes in behaviours and practices especially among the program participants and GBV and TIP service providers, according to the study. If it were not for some of the challenges, the outcomes achieved could be more.

The project was supposed to be completed over a three-year period. However, because the project was implemented during COVID-19 and contested elections, the review recommends that it be extended because the desired behavioural changes have begun but cannot be fully addressed in two or three years. Further NCA and partners should advocate for the funding and implementation of GBV and TIP policy and legal frameworks that would allow survivors to access services and justice.

#### 1.0. INTRODUCTION

Strengthening the prevention of Gender Based Violence (GBV) In Malawi – A Faith Based Approach Project seeks to support vulnerable women and adolescent girls and boys fighting gender-based violence, human trafficking and child labour. The project was implemented under a multi-stakeholder approach and each stakeholder had their own roles and responsibilities.

The Royal Norwegian Embassy (RNE) funded the project. The GBV programme was implemented by the Norwegian Church Aid through partners namely Evangelical Association of Malawi (EAM), Rights Advice Centers (RAC), The Salvation Army (TSA) besides accompanied partners of Malawi Council of Churches (MCC), Women Judges Association of Malawi (WOJAM) and Malawi Network Against Trafficking (MNAT). NCA also worked closely with the Malawi Government through the Ministries of Gender and Homeland Security; fighting gender-based violence, human trafficking and child labour.

The three-year (2018 - 2021) programme that built upon the Gender Justice Programme was implemented in Lilongwe, Mchinji, Dowa, Dedza and Mangochi districts.

## 2.0. ENDLINE EVALUATION

# 2.1. Purpose

The purpose of this evaluation was to assess the performance of the program and capture program achievements, challenges and best practices to inform future similar programming. The evaluation was also to ensure accountability towards RNE as a donor and the beneficiaries of the program. On the other hand, it offers a learning avenue for all stakeholders. The evaluation therefore used the OECD/DAC criteria assessing project relevance/appropriateness, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and its contribution towards impact.

# 2.2. Specific Objectives.

The specific objectives of the end-line evaluation were;

#### 2.2.1. Relevance

- ✓ Assess the project design in terms of its relevance to the overall development situation in the focus districts and relevance to beneficiaries.
- ✓ Assess relevance and effectiveness of the project's strategy and approaches for the achievement of the project objectives.

#### 2.2.2. Effectiveness

- ✓ Produce end line values for key project indicators and assess performance against baseline values and set targets and determine impact of project on beneficiary population by assessing the key impact and outcome indicators.
- ✓ Assess performance of the project in terms of effectiveness, efficiency, and timeliness of producing the expected outputs;
- ✓ Assess the quality and timeliness of inputs, the reporting and monitoring system and extent to which these have been effective;
- ✓ Assess positive or negative effects (intended/unintended, direct/indirect) that are produced by the project's interventions.

# 2.2.3. Efficiency

✓ Assess the value for money and how economic resources/inputs (funds, expertise, time etc.) under the project were converted to results.

## 2.2.4. *Impact*

- ✓ Assess the positive and negative, primary and secondary, long-term effects produced by the project implementation, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended.
- ✓ Analyze underlying factors beyond the project control that affected the achievement of the project results;

# 3.0. Sustainability

- ✓ Assess the continuation of benefits from the project after major development assistance has been complete.
- ✓ Document lessons learnt and draw relevant recommendations from the evaluation for future programming.

#### 3.1. Methodology

The evaluation was gathered using both quantitative and qualitative methods.

# 3.2. Sampling Frame.

The study population was 1,238,024 males and females aged 15-60 years, based on national census population data from the 17 traditional authorities in the five districts of Mangochi, Lilongwe, Mchinji, Dedza, and Dowa. The evaluation was carried out in all 17 Traditional Authorities across the five districts where the project was carried out. This means that the areas were purposively chosen, and a sample frame was established.

#### 3.3. Quantitative Method

# **3.3.1.** Survey Sample Population

The sample size for the population was estimated at **384** for males and females using Cochran's Formula<sup>1</sup>. Assuming a 10% non-response rate, the sample size was **422**. The actual sample size achieved in total was **426**; thus representing a 101% achievement rate as shown in the table below;

**Table 1: Survey Targets and Achievement Rate** 

District	Target	Achievement	Achievement Percent
Dedza	24	19	79
Dowa	142	145	102
Lilongwe	115	114	99
Mangochi	109	113	104
Mchinji	32	35	109
Total	422	426	101

# 3.3.2. Household Questionnaire

A questionnaire was created to gather information in five major areas. The questionnaire was adapted from a number of internationally recognized tools developed by UN Agencies such as UNFPA and UN Women. The surveys were carried out using the Computer-Assisted Personal Interviews (CAPI) powered by KoBo application.

#### 3.4. Qualitative Method

The purpose of qualitative research was to reveal a target audience's range of behaviours and perceptions that drive it in relation to specific topics or issues. Focus group discussions and indepth interviews were used to collect data in this context. A total of 23 focus groups and 22 KIIs were held.

## 3.5. Data Management and Analysis

All FGD and KII were recorded. The recorded data was transcribed where thematic analysis was done to identify key themes and issues. On the other hand, questionnaire data was collected using KoBo Collect, a mobile app and was later exported to SPSS for analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>In statistics, Cochran's theorem, devised by William G. Cochran, is a theorem used to justify results relating to the probability distributions of statistics that are used in the analysis of variance. The full details of the formula are contained in the Inception Report for the Evaluation

# 3.6. Summary of issues and problems encountered

Non-availability of respondents: In Mchinji, the team had **challenges in accessing respondents** due to poor communication channels coupled with "internal politics". In Mangochi, some FGD respondents were reluctant to participate in the absence of incentives. The team resolved these issues by constantly engaging with the implementing partner at the higher level and this did not impact on the data collection exercise.

# 4.0. EVALUATION FINDINGS

## 4.1. Achievement of Results - Outcomes and Impact

This section focuses on project performance at the **outcome** level. It delves into planned activities as they appear in the logical framework, implementation plan and progress reports juxtaposed with respondents' accounts and evaluator's direct observations. Evaluation process goes by project **outputs**, recognizing achievements, and reviewing challenges, gaps and lessons learnt. It concludes with a collective view of the project's added value across outputs.

#### 4.1.1. Overall Achievement of Results

The project has efficiently produced a variety of outputs in diverse and large volumes. As can be seen from the table below; the end-line values for outputs show significant progress made on all output indicators against the baseline values. Measured against the targets, the project scored a 100% or more achievement rate in 3 out of the 5 outcome indicators as compared to a 100% or more achievement rate all the 5 outcome indicators against the baseline values. On output indicators, the project scored 100% or more achievement rate in 5 of the 13 output indicators. The general picture though is that substantial progress has been made on the implementation of the activities and achievement of outputs and key results-refer to table below on achievement of key outcomes.

#### TABLE OF KEY SUMMARYOF FINDINGS

**Table 2: Summary of Achievement of Outcomes** 

OUTCOME	INDICATOR	BASELINE (2018)	TARGET 2018-2020	ACHI EVEM ENT	RATE AGAINST BASELINE (%)	RATE AGAINST TARGET (%)
Dominant social norms	Outcome Indicator 1.1.: Number of community, traditional and religious leaders who demonstrated social actions to change negative and violent social norms and behaviour (mandatory indicator)	0	300	276	27,600.00	92.00
protect girls and women from gender-based violence	Outcome Indicator 1.2: Number of men's ministries and boys' clubs capacitated to advance positive	0	6	19	1,900.00	316.67
	Outcome Indicator 2.1: Faith actors advocated for implementation of laws on GBV prevention and response, including TIP.	0	10	72	7,200.00	720.00
Laws, policies, and budgets to end gender-based violence improved and implemented		0	17	10	1,000.00	58.82
Women and girl GBV survivors safely accessed adequate and appropriate support services	Outcome 3.1 Number of female and male GBV survivors receiving support services (Global GBV Outcome Indicator 4.1)	109	520	1196	1,097.25	230.00

### 4.1.2. Achievement Against Outcome

# 4.1.2.1. Dominant social norms protected girls and women from GBV

# **Key Findings on Outcome 1**

# **Key Findings**

- 276 against a target of traditional and faith leaders (representing 92% achievements rate) had undertaken a demonstrable social action
- 19 against a target of 6 (representing 317% achievement rate) men ministries and boys clubs were capacitated to advance positive masculinities.
- A majority of the survey respondents indicated that traditional (74.5%) and religious leaders (75.6%) had demonstrated social action
- Majority of the respondents indicated that traditional leaders have denounced in public negative social norms perpetrating GBV (52.40%) and faith leaders have preached against negative social norms perpetrating GBV (61.20%).
- The least performed social action is mobilizing communities to build safe houses/homes (0.3% for traditional leaders and 1.9% for faith leaders) and providing shelter to survivors of violence (2.8% for traditional leaders and 4.00% for the faith leaders).

# 4.1.2.1.1. Traditional and religious leaders who demonstrated social actions to change negative and violent social norms and behaviour

The review considered social action as any action that brings people together to help improve their lives and solve the problems that are important in their communities.<sup>2</sup> In terms of "demonstrated social action"; the review considered as this is more of civic engagement- the process of connecting individuals in society with one another, to share common interests and work for the common good. To this end, the review focused on whether the traditional and religious leaders had in the past 3 years undertaken any social action. The study explored 10 possible social actions which the traditional and faith leaders might have undertaken around gender-based violence (-refer to attached household questionnaire.

276 against a target of 300 traditional and faith leaders were reported to have **demonstrated** social actions to change negative and violent social norms and behaviour in the project impact areas. The key actions undertaken by the faith and traditional leaders included but not limited to formulating by-laws; speaking in public and in faith gatherings against gender-based violence.

Survey participants in the review were also asked if they knew that faith and traditional leaders had undertaken social action. 74.9% of the respondents indicated to know that the traditional leader had undertaken a social action as compared to 75.6% of the respondents who indicated that a faith leader had undertaken social action.

The table 3 below shows the actions undertaken by the traditional and religious leaders based on the perception of the survey respondents;

7 | Page

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/591797/A\_de\_scription\_of\_social\_action.pdf

**Table 3:** Proportion of Respondents on social action undertaken by faith and traditional leaders

	TRADITIONAL	FAITH
ACTION	LEADER	LEADER
Conducted GBV sensitization	46.70%	43.80%
Counselling to GBV/TIP Survivors	47.60%	44.70%
Formulated GBV or GBV related by-laws	14.70%	3.40%
Facilitated formation of anti GBV group	14.10%	5.90%
Provided shelter to survivors	2.80%	4.00%
Supported survivors directly	30.10%	20.80%
Mobilized communities to build safe house	0.30%	1.90%
Denounced in public/preached negative norms perpetrating GBV	52.40%	61.20%
Withdrew children from child labor	28.20%	18.00%
Withdrew children from early and forced marriages	36.10%	24.50%

As can be seen from the table above, the most social actions which survey respondents indicated to have been undertaken by traditional and faith leaders are; traditional leaders denouncing in public negative norms perpetrating GBV (52.4%) and faith leaders preaching against negative norms perpetrating GBV (61.2%). The least done social actions are; providing shelter to survivors of violence; mobilising communities to build safe house/homes; facilitating formation of anti-GBV group.

# 4.1.2.1.2. Men's ministries and boys' clubs capacitated to advance positive masculinities.

19 men's ministries and boys' clubs were capacitated to advance positive masculinities against a project target of 6 and a baseline value of 0. The review observed that the men's' ministries and boys were agents of change within the male engagement framework.<sup>3</sup> The review learnt that the men's ministries and boys' clubs influenced other males; were actively involved in community spaces - especially in spaces where they are found influencing other males and carrying out actions to promote gender equality. 46% of the survey respondents indicated that they knew that pastors' fraternal had undertaken some social action against GBV.

# 3.1.2.2 Laws, policies and budgets to end GBV improved and implemented

## **Key Findings for Outcome 2**

**Key Findings** 

• 6 against a target of 4 (representing 150% achievement rate) faith based theological institutions had their curriculum reviewed to integrate gender-based violence

• 72 against a target of 10 faith leaders advocated for implementation of laws, policies and guidelines on GBV and TIP.

 The private sector was engaged and a number of private sector players were trained on TIP.

• 10 private sector players have included issues of TIP in their policies and guidelines.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Sonke Gender Justice Network, 2012. Building Male Involvement in SRHR: A Basic Model of Male Involvement in Sexual Reproductive Health and Rights. Cape Town. South Africa.

# 3.1.2.2.1. Faith actors advocated for implementation of laws on GBV prevention and response, including TIP

The project developed the capacity of faith leaders in legal frameworks on GBV including TIP. It was expected that the faith leaders would conduct advocacy initiatives to influence effective implementation of the legal frameworks on GBV and TIP.

72 against a target of 10 faith leaders advocated for implementation of laws, policies, and guidelines on GBV and TIP. At the community level, the faith leaders advocated for formulation of community level by-laws on GBV and TIP. They also engaged with law enforcement officers on following up cases to ensure that justice has been done. The project could have built this momentum with a high-level advocacy initiative by the mother bodies at the national level. Within the faith communities, the mother bodies' voice on national matters is considered as directives to the faith leaders hence the GBV and TIP messages being reached to a wider audience.

One of the key focus areas of Malawi Trafficking In Persons National Plan of Action is: "Mainstream TIP education in training curricula of professional education institutions e.g. police training school, theological colleges etc". On the other hand, the National Plan of Action to Combat GBV's focus action include: "Review GBV training curriculum to include all triggers of GBV". The project contributed to the implementation of the two key national plans of action on GBV and TIP through facilitating review of curriculum for 6 church based theological institutions. Although the curriculums reviewed have not yet been adopted by the boards, some aspects of the modules have been incorporated into ongoing sessions. The review discovered that there is a growing demand for theological reflections on GBV and TIP in colleges and other faith community sectors as a result of this process.

On budget advocacy, the project through partners advocated for specific budget lines for anti-trafficking initiatives. Key to this advocacy initiative was lobbying government to allocate resources towards the TIP Fund. This was enhanced by NCA's capacity of holding the chairperson position of the resource mobilisation committee for the NCCATIP. Through the project and NCA's position, the national committee has a TIP resource mobilisation strategy. Further government through the Ministry of Homeland Security has been allocating resources from the national budget over the past 2 financial years.

4.2.2.2.2. Number of targeted private sector actors that have aligned their policies to address GBV and TIP.

The National Plan of Action on TIP identifies two key activities on the private sector namely; (a) Orient private sector on TIP and NPA TIP and (b) lobby and engage private sector for financial and technical support to TIP as part of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). Out of the two key activities, the project focused on developing the capacity of the private sector on TIP. Based on key informants; 75 private sector players were oriented on TIP and institutional policy formulation. 10 against a target of 17 private sector players<sup>4</sup> aligned their

9 | P a g e

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> These include Transporters Association of Malawi; Informal Sector Association of Malawi; Railways Association of Malawi; Tobacco Allied Association of Malawi; Hotels Association of Malawi; Mechanical and Automobiles Association of Malawi, Tea Association of Malawi; ESCOM; Malawi Institute of Tourism; AXA Bus Service

policies to address GBV and TIP. Two institutions, the Malawi Institute of Tourism and ESCOM were singled out as star performers.

# **4.2.2.3** Women and girl GBV survivors safely accessed adequate and appropriate support services

# **Key Finding for Outcome 3**

# **Key Findings**

- 1196 (372 male and 824 female) survivors of GBV received various forms of support services.
- The police VSU is the most accessed formal service provider
- Survivors of violence also use informal means and there is a clear pathway on accessing informal GBV service providers starting with the marriage counsellor.

#### 4.2.2.3.1. Number of female and male GBV survivors receiving support services

A review of the project documents from partners indicated that 1196 (372 male and 824 female) survivors of GBV received various forms of support services. The support services ranged from counselling services and legal services.

Survey participants were also asked if survivors of violence seek any support and where they seek that support. 78.4% of the respondents indicated that survivors of violence look for help when they experience gender-based violence. In terms of where they seek the support, the table below shows that a majority of the respondents mentioned the police as one of the places where they seek support when they have experienced violence;

**Table 4:** Survey Respondents on where survivors access services

Place	Responses		Percent of Total Cases <sup>5</sup>	
Flace	N	Percent	Percent of Total Cases	
Police	254	35.10%	76.30%	
Relatives	46	6.40%	13.80%	
Hospital	93	12.80%	27.90%	
Place of worship	64	8.80%	19.20%	
Hotline	2	0.30%	0.60%	
Survivor service centre	63	8.70%	18.90%	
Community leaders	94	13.00%	28.20%	
Peer group	10	1.40%	3.00%	
Support Group/Volunteers	43	5.90%	12.90%	
Court	46	6.40%	13.80%	
Other	9	1.20%	2.70%	
Total	724	100.00%	217.40%	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> This was a multiple response question, and the column is showing the percent of cases against the total under each of the places where survivor goes to access a service

As can be seen from the table above, a number of people opt for the formal systems of service provision as compared to the informal service provision- for instance the project established structures.

On the specific services sought; protection (62.2%) and counselling (52.9%) services were the most accessed as shown in the table below;

Table 5: Survey Respondents on Type of Services Accessed by Survivors

Services	Resp	Percent of Cases	
Services	N	Percent	Percent of Cases
Counselling	176	27.80%	52.90%
Treatment	96	15.10%	28.80%
Referral	35	5.50%	10.50%
Safe Home	5	0.80%	1.50%
Legal	77	12.10%	23.10%
Protection	207	32.60%	62.20%
Psycho-social support	33	5.20%	9.90%
Other	5	0.80%	1.50%

Focus group discussions with women and girls also indicated the same institutions as where they go to seek services. However the focus group discussions highlighted the challenges which women and girls face to access services both from the formal and informal service providers. Women in FGDs expressed concern that, while they expected to seek services from the courts, the courts were not assisting them as expected, either because the courts were too far away or did not have enough clerks, or because the services were subject to abuse because some officers and clerks were untrustworthy and accepted bribes. As a result, the project could have investigated mechanisms for bringing the court closer to the people, such as facilitating mobile courts and legal clinics with pro-bono legal services. To summarize, the paralegals, particularly in Mangochi, provided some legal education, but the survivors required more formal justice services, such as protection orders. The most common type of formal assistance mentioned was police assistance via the VSU. However, almost all FGDs had the impression that the police were ineffective for a variety of reasons, ranging from being slow to react to being corrupt and only supporting those with money. Respondents also spoke about police being intimidating and lacking respect as per the following example:

".... If nothing is done at the police and health departments here.... Efforts to fight GBV will be in vain due to increase in corruption in these two departments..... you report a case to the police and they effect an arrest and the next day you find the person walking free..... they say there was no evidence at the health facility....."

## Male FGD Participant, Mangochi.

On informal support services, FGD participants mentioned support ranging from that provided by family members, to that provided by the chief, to that provided by the church and other community-based institutions. There is a sense from most FGDs that there is a continuum of seeking help, starting with the village head or local village committee, then escalating to the group village head (who can also call out the elders), and ultimately the police. The extent to which it is escalated also depends on the severity of the issue and whether the perpetrator makes any changes in behavior.

Before going to the headman, the first option is to go to elders, parents, family members and/or friends for support. For women especially, and in relation mostly to problems with their husbands, the first port of call is often the marriage counsellor or mother or best friend. Many expressed the sense that one should first go to parents, elders or traditional marriage counsellors to resolve domestic issues.

#### 4.2. Relevance

# 4.2.1. Relevance of the project to global and regional legislative and policy frameworks

The project's significance to global and regional legislative and policy frameworks is well established. Malawi relies on global frameworks to keep its programs relevant. GBV has been recognized as a public concern and a human rights issue by the international community for decades, beginning with CEDAW in 1979 and continuing with the World Conference on Human Rights (1993), the Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women (1993), the International Conference on Population and Development (1994), and the Fourth Conference on Women (1995). Many international human rights principles have identified the link between GBV and human development.

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are essential global frameworks that guide global programming work. The project is fully in line with SDG 5, which calls for gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls. For the achievement of the goal, nine targets have been set. Target 5.2 is to "eliminate all forms of violence against all women and girls in the public and private spheres, including trafficking and sexual and other types of exploitation," and Target 5.3 is to "eliminate all harmful practices, such as child, early and forced marriage, and female genital mutilation."

At the pan-African level, the project is fully consistent with Goal 17-Full Gender Equality in All Areas, with a particular focus on violence and discrimination against women and girls. The project is fully consistent with Articles 20-25 of the SADC Gender and Development Protocol at the regional level.

#### 4.2.2. Relevance of the project to national priorities.

At the national level, the review noted that the program has made contributions to some national policies and strategies, such as the Malawi Constitution and the Malawi Growth and Development Strategy III, the Malawi National Gender Policy; the Gender Equality Act; the Trafficking in Persons Act; the Prevention of Domestic Violence Act, and National Action Plans on Combating TIP and Ending Gender Based Violence.

Malawi's Growth and Development Strategy III recognizes the role of gender in ensuring the country's socioeconomic development. Gender-related strategies are integrated into several pillars such as nutrition and health. One of the key strategic activities under Nutrition is to educate communities about the negative effects of gender-based violence on women's and children's health and nutrition outcomes. Another is to enforce laws and regulations to reduce violence against children, vulnerable people, youth and women, and the elderly. The project has greatly increased awareness of GBV and TIP, as well as their connections to other sectors such as nutrition and health, and its connections to law enforcement and social support officers. Furthermore, the project has increased the capacity of law enforcement and social support officers on TIP, thereby contributing to the enforcement of laws and regulations.

The project activities were in line with the National Plans on GBV and TIP. This was well expressed by one key informant, as shown below:

"NCA was successful in developing important partnerships with national partners from government and CSOs. The GBV and TIP project did an outstanding job of aligning itself with the national gender agenda, goals, plans, and priorities."

#### 4.2.3. Contextual Needs

NCA is well-versed in Malawi's development needs. Women's, men's, children's, and youths' needs formed the basis of the project. The program components address the major issues affecting Malawi's women, men, children, and youth. The project engaged with project participants during the monitoring visits-which some respondents indicated that they did not offer them adequate space to express themselves. **According to the project's implementing partners, there was no formal feedback and complaints mechanism**—a channel through which project participants could have channelled their concerns about how the project was being implemented. However, the review learnt that the project used the monitoring visits to receive feedback and complaints from the project participants. While this is commendable, there are also challenges for women to freely express themselves in such settings. Further, if there are any issues between monitoring visits; it means the project participants have to wait for the next monitoring visit.

Interviews with key informants at the local and district levels revealed that the project activities and strategies, for the most part, align with government priorities as well as the government's view of community priorities. Government respondents specifically assured the evaluation team that the program strategies and activities are highlighted in the District Development Plans, which articulate the aspirations and needs of the people in the district. While the project focused on the needs of violence survivors, key informants pointed out that it did not adequately address the needs of service providers.

#### 4.3. Effectiveness

# 4.3.1. Program Design

# 4.3.1.1. Theory of Change Review.

Forti (2012)<sup>6</sup> observes that a good theory of change should answer six big questions namely: *Who* are you seeking to influence or benefit (target population)? *What* benefits are you seeking to achieve (results)? *When* will you achieve them (time period)? *How* will you and others make this happen (activities, strategies, resources, etc.)? *Where* and under what circumstances will you do your work (context)? *Why* do you believe your theory will bear out (assumptions)? Using these guiding questions, the review makes the following observations on the outcomes of the project.

# Observations on Outcome 1: Dominant social norms protect girls and women from gender-based violence

To achieve this result, 8 activities were planned to be carried out. The activities primarily focus on building the capacity of FBOs, religious and traditional leaders, engaging boys and men, raising awareness through community level meetings, and publishing and distributing IEC materials. The planned activities are closely related to those outlined in the National Plan of Action to Combat Gender-Based Violence. However, one key activity in the NPA to Combat

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Forti, M. 2012. Six Theory of Change Pitfalls to Avoid, https://ssir.org/articles/entry/six theory of change pitfalls to avoid

Gender Based Violence, "Use of community dialogue, knowledge building, workshops, peer group discussions, and theatre for development to challenge gender inequalities through communication for development," was found to be lacking in the project, according to the review<sup>7</sup>. A review of the documentation and key informant interviews revealed little evidence of the project facilitating spaces for people to challenge or transform social norms, let alone gender conscious practices<sup>8</sup>. The project mostly relied on traditional methods of raising awareness e.g. general community meetings as compared to community dialogue sessions.

UNICEF (2019)<sup>9</sup> observes that "designing an effective programme to address normative behaviours is not possible without understanding how social norms fit within the larger set of factors that influence a person's action" and goes to recommend a detailed process which starts with defining the social norms. While the process is not prescriptive, the review team discovered that a lack of understanding of social norms leads to ineffective strategy design. A review of the documentation and interviews with implementing partners, for example, reveals that there was no agreed-upon definition of social norms, which resulted in some equating social norms with cultural practices. The baseline study should have defined social norms per geographical area of the project at the very least, but this was also missing.

# Observations to Outcome 2: Laws, policies and budgets to end gender-based violence improved and implemented

The majority of the key activities focused on developing the capacity of law enforcement and social support officers; engaging the private sector; advocacy initiatives, and publishing and disseminating gender-related laws. The proposed activities are **similar** to those proposed in the National Plans of Action to End Human Trafficking and Combat Gender-Based Violence.

During the project's implementation, for example, a number of Malawi Government strategic documents on gender-based violence were developed, including a national plan of action on rape and defilement, a national strategy for ending child marriage, and an adolescent girls and young women strategy, and key informant interviews revealed that NCA or its partners did not contribute to these processes<sup>10</sup>. In terms of budget advocacy, the review discovered that NCA partners advocated for specific budget lines for anti-trafficking initiatives. A review of the 2020/21 national budget especially the program-based budget and detailed budget documents, however, revealed that human trafficking is only mentioned in the program-based budget documents under achievements, and there is no specific budget line for human trafficking. Perhaps the Trafficking in Persons Fund is hidden in other budget lines, making it difficult to engage MPs who rely on the Detailed Budgets and Program Based Budgets documents for their lobbying in parliament.

# Observations to Outcome 3: Women and girls survivors safely accessed adequate and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The project used traditional awareness raising methods unlike the community dialogue and theatre for development which provides spaces for people to challenge social norms. The national plan of action is recommending that we should use strategies that facilitate dialogue at community level

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Processes that proactively address societal issues such as inequality, discrimination and challenge those restrictions that they encounter in their lives. GCP challenges the status quo and systems which undermine the role and position of males and females.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> UNICEF, 2019, Everybody Wants to Belong, A Practical Guide to Tackling and Leveraging Social Norms in Behaviour Change Programming. <a href="https://www.unicef.org/mena/media/4891/file/MENA-C4D-Report-May2019.pdf">https://www.unicef.org/mena/media/4891/file/MENA-C4D-Report-May2019.pdf</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> While NCA cannot be expected to be in all spaces, the project was focusing on GBV and as such the expectation was that the project should participate in all GBV related spaces for it to influence using learning from the project.

### appropriate support services

To achieve this result, seven key activities were planned to be carried out. The primary activities centred on the provision of pastoral and counselling services, the re-admission of survivors in schools, the support of GBV and child protection toll-free lines, and the support of survivors of violence. The proposed activities are similar to those proposed in the National Plans of Action to End Trafficking in Persons and Combat Gender-Based Violence.

Access to survivor-centred support services is critical to this outcome. Survivors of human trafficking and gender-based violence were consulted about the type of assistance they would have preferred. The review learnt that a number of trainings were designed by the technical skills provider and the survivors chose the skills they would under-go. This is commendable as the project addressed the needs of the survivors. However, due to budgetary constraints, not everyone was provided with starter kits. However, on starter kits, the review learnt that due to budgetary constraints as a result of the skyrocketing prices of the starter kits; not everyone was provided with starter kits. As a result a starter up kit was procured per technical skill advanced. This resulted in a couple of survivors being allocated one kit. An arrangement was made that the kit would be used as a group. However, with some group members relocating to other areas and others living at a distance, an arrangement was made that the kit would be passed on from survivor to another. However this had its own share of challenge;

"We thought that one survivor would use the kit for some time, say six months and pass it on to another. But some of the survivors moved to another place possibly in search of greener pastures. This meant someone has to travel with the machine or kit..... in some instances, the other person would wait long and ended up either giving up or grabbing the machine from another person ....."

Key Informant, Mangochi District

#### 4.3.1.2. Responsiveness to Emerging Issues.

The project was carried out during COVID-19, which significantly disrupted project implementation and had its own consequences, including gender implications. The Ministry of Gender, in collaboration with members of the Gender Technical Working Group, conducted a Rapid Gender Analysis (RGA) of COVID-19, which forecasted an increase in gender-based violence cases and challenges which survivors of violence would face in accessing services, among other things. The RGA also advocated for the re-engineering of GBV-related activities to ensure that survivors of GBV continue to have access to services. Apart from distributing PPEs, the review noted that the project did not conduct an analysis to understand the impact of COVID-19 on GBV and TIP programming, nor did it use the RGA to re-design its programming to ensure that survivors of violence access services even with the COVID-19 restrictions. Among others the project could have considered provision of mobile GBV services and promotion of toll-free lines.

## 4.3.1.3. Other Design Issues.

While the project generated demand, the review found that the institutional structure of the majority of GBV service providers is insufficient to meet the needs of the survivors of violence who were mobilized to access services. For example, most police victim support units and community victim support units fail to meet the minimum standards set by the police and community victim support units. According to McLean et al. (2016), the majority of VSUs and CVSUs are not in good enough condition to meet the minimum requirements and lack specialized personnel. Furthermore, key informants stated that the project's goal was to ensure that survivors of violence had access to services at one-stop centres. Most one-stop centres are

located at the district hospital, with only a few located at other health facilities. The program's design did not specify how such challenges would be addressed.

NCA and its partners did little to investigate the presence of other players in the impact area, particularly non-governmental organizations, resulting in duplication of activities, particularly for the impact population. The study also discovered collaboration with other players, particularly at the national level, but less collaboration at the implementation level. According to the evaluation, such national collaborative efforts were ad hoc and not very strategic.

## 4.3.2. Program Strategies

#### **4.3.2.1.** Faith Based Approach

The project main approach was the faith-based approach. The KII participants lauded the approach as key to addressing GBV and TIP. KIIs identified one of the key strengths of faith groups as being that they are present at grassroots level and everywhere; and are respected insiders within the communities they serve. Thus, in having them address TIP and GBV and introduce counter-cultural ways of seeing men and women, they are not ousted as 'outsiders' and ignored. They speak the language of the community, quite literally, but also in knowing which terms and issues are sensitive and stigmatised. Thus they know how to package and communicate the SGBV message - both in terms of prevention and response - without alienating the community. By being of the community, a faith group can impact and influence the entire community, for it is the community's own members who drive the intervention. This is coupled with the fact that faith leaders are seen as moral authorities, providers of spiritual guidance, and have legitimacy within communities. People thus expect them to guide their thinking, norms, and behaviour. In addition to engaging faith leaders and communities, the project supported a review of six theological institutions' curriculum to include GBV and TIP issues. This is critical for the formation of faith leaders because it allows them to internalize the issues at an early stage. As a result of this process, there is a growing demand for theological reflections on GBV and TIP in colleges and other faith community sectors.

However the project did not address the patriarchal nature of many faith groups and communities. Most of the faith leaders are male and their reading and interpretation of holy scriptures often carry a decidedly patriarchal bias. For instance, the implementing structure was the pastor's fraternal -which is male dominated. The project should have explored how to engage the female faith leaders. Further, the project did not fully engage other mother bodies hence failing to reach out to some faith communities with a large following and influence, for instance, ECM, QMAM and MAM.

## 4.3.2.2. Capacity Development

The review noted that capacity development of the different structures was one of the key strategies for implementation. One of the approach in the training was the cascading training approach- training key personnel and stakeholders who would in turn train the program participants and others.

# **4.3.2.3.** Advocacy

The study noted that one of the program strategies/approach was advocacy. Albeit these policy and practice influence interventions at various levels, the evaluation observed that the program did not have a clear advocacy objective or goal. Furthermore, the evaluation observed that there are opportunities, which the program could have explored on influencing policies at the district and national levels. At the district level, the program was being implemented when the district

councils have a councillor, which was an opportunity to push for district council commitments towards GBV services. The review did not find evidence of the program engaging with local councillors to push for formulation of district level by-laws or budgetary commitments on survivors' to GBV services in collaboration with other key stakeholders.

At the national level, the program was being implemented a time of an on-going policy discourse around financing for the gender sector; development of the national GBV strategies and action plans; development of GBV programming protocols and pathways in the context of COVID-19. NCA and partners have been lauded as being very key to TIP policy and legal discourse. The review occasioned evidence of influencing activities by NCA and its partners. However, the advocacy initiatives were not guided by a robust advocacy strategy. On other hand; NCA participated in Gender TWG and supported the 16 Days of activism. A similar observation on a lack of proper influencing strategy was noted on the GBV component.

# 4.3.2.4. Media Campaign

The project lacked a media campaigning strategy that included a strong condense blend of innovative media products and outlets. The review found no evidence of the project using Facebook, YouTube, Instagram, or Twitter to keep it visible throughout its lifespan. With community radio stations gaining prominence in Malawi, particularly in terms of reaching out to rural residents, the review found that they were not being used to disseminate messages.

The project supported the national launches of the 16 Days of activism against gender-based violence in all the 3 years. These events are covered by mainstream media and the project's earning substantial media coverage and putting energy into the existing discourse and shaping it

## 4.3.3. Partnership, Participation and Ownership

The review found that while NCA emphasizes on a partnership approach, there were variations on engagement of government stakeholders by the different partners. The review found that while the Ministry of Gender benefitted a lot from the project especially during the 16 Days of Activism and other support; on the other hand the project did not actively engage the Gender Unit of the Ministry of Gender in implementation of their activities. For instance, the review noted that the program planned annual learning events with very minimal engagement of the lead Ministry. Further, the review did not occasion of evidence of the project engaging the Ministry's Gender Unit in designing IEC materials or conducting monitoring visits of the project.

The study also observed that there were no formal mechanisms around collaboration and sharing of information with the district level partners at different levels.

According to the evaluation study, the structures established by the program are not fully integrated at the community level which could somehow impact sustainability. For example, when asked about reporting, the evaluation team discovered that the project's groups only report to the project team and not to any of the local governance structures e.g. ADC or VDC. NCA and partners should advocate for the recognition and integration of their structures with

formal local and sectoral structures at the community level in order to ensure their long-term viability.

# 4.3.4. Knowledge Management and Learning

NCA's development programming discourse, for example, focuses on learning—learning about both the context in which they work and the effectiveness of their intervention—as well as the interaction between the two over time. This necessitates that projects and programs learn by doing, establish strong feedback mechanisms, and challenge their own assumptions and worldviews. According to the evaluation, the program focused on 'doing' and provided few opportunities for reflection.

There were few documented reflections, but it was encouraging to see that learning events with communities were organized under Outcome 1. However they were not documented.

Transparency and accountability are two other important aspects of knowledge management. According to the evaluation, the project had an upward accountability system with little or no downward or horizontal accountability. During consultations, it became clear that communities could not demand accountability from implementing partners and duty bearers because there were no social accountability mechanisms in place for rights holders to use.

# 4.3.5. **Project Added Value**

Added value is defined as the extent to which a programme/project adds benefit to the results of other agencies. It is about unique contributions the project made bolstering multi-sectoral and partners' synergy. In this evaluation, it can be argued that the project added value is an exceptional achievement. Other players can invest in these achievements and build upon them to further relevant development priorities through their projects. Although the project added value is pretty broad and interconnected, key aspects where the project excelled at are in the areas of;

- Trafficking in persons programming-the project is lauded as a key project which put the issue of TIP onto the spotlight. It is one if not the only project funding TIP initiatives in Malawi.
- Working with the faith community-The project worked with the faith community and this brought out key lessons on engaging with the faith community on GBV and TIP programming.
- Strengthening civil society capacity especially in the area of TIP programming
- Partners capacity building

## 4.4. Efficiency

In this evaluation, efficiency is measured in terms of financial management, project delivery, collaboration and coordination, technical support, resource use, and monitoring and reporting quality.

#### 4.4.1. Value for Money

According to the evaluation, the program used a cascading training approach. They began by training community educators, who then trained program participants. This is admirable and

cost-effective. The project should have explored measures to monitor the quality of cascaded trainings.

Similarly, the evaluation discovered that some of the resources were managed centrally by NCA. Partners would simply submit a proposal for the activities' implementation. This was true of MCC and MNAT. This implies that the partners relied primarily on staff who travelled from the central office to the community. This was also true for EAM, which lacked field officers. This was less expensive, and administrative costs were diverted toward activity implementation.

The project's resources were used efficiently to produce specific targeted activities far in excess of the number specified in the project document. This fact demonstrates a high level of efficiency in the use of project resources. The project was able to produce more IEC materials, more community awareness sessions, and more support to survivors.

# **4.4.2.** Financial Management

The project was scheduled to last three years, from 2018 to 2021. In practice, it took two years to implement, with nearly half a year or a full year disrupted by the COVID-19 pandemic. The project was re-engineered for the COVID-19 pandemic measures. Additionally, there were cash flow delays: one key informant stated that an activity had to be postponed 5 times due to cash flow issues. Another informant stated that a large portion of the resources were distributed in the second half of the fiscal year due to funding delays.

NCA Malawi Country Office carried out project procurement and financial transactions in accordance with the globally monitored and mandatory NCA financial policies, procedures, and regulations. Project partners from the government and non-governmental organizations, on the other hand, confirmed their full adherence to open bidding systems in all subcontracted activities, and contracts between NCA and selected partners have been signed and executed.

Cost effectiveness is demonstrated, among other things, by the fact that project activities are carried out in the communities where the project was implemented.

# 4.4.3. Project Execution

The project design allowed for some implementation flexibility to fine-tune activities and bend them to fit the specificity of the local context. The review noted that there was flexibility with some partners, while other partners complained that the project was not flexible enough, particularly in addressing some emerging issues like social support to survivors of violence. The expectation from the partner was that the project would support survivors of violence and TIP once they have been identified. The partners did not explore proper linkages with and referrals to other agencies. A clear project referral and linkages systems would have aided project delivery and output optimization in a variety of ways.

In general, project implementation at NCA does not take place in silos, but rather in a complementary manner toward programmatic synergy. The centrality of the project subject area to the NCA mandate created a situation in which the project is particularly well positioned at the core of the mandate with tangible presence across all programmatic areas in this specific project. Given that NCA's available capacities are already fully equipped to actively support this project, this structural programmatic synergy served as an efficiency enhancer in this project. Qualified NCA staff with strong gender and human rights backgrounds, expertise, and

interest at NCA HQ contributed to the project by carrying out activities related to their program's theme.

#### 4.4.4. Collaboration and coordination

This is what the entire project is about, and it is one of its distinguishing points of strength: the project would have been a complete failure if collaboration and coordination had not been excelled at. The fact that the case was completely the opposite is evidence of how well the project team, head of programs, and partners worked together. For example, in order for the TIP act and action plan to be fully implemented, significant collaboration and coordination is required between partners who must jointly provide services to TIP survivors in one package as one system despite operating in different sectors, locations, and levels. The project made significant contributions to the development of a solid coherent coordination mechanism on TIP.

Furthermore, the review noted that the prompt response by the project to the needs of TIP and survivors of violence has a life-saving impact. The review discovered evidence of the project providing immediate assistance to TIP and GBV survivors in other cases. These extremely vulnerable population groups could only be reached by collaborating and coordinating with project partners, who had strong local roots in the communities and were equipped with unique instruments that served as enablers in project execution and accomplishments.

However, the review learnt there was very little collaboration at the district level. While NCA was collaborating with other like-minded institutions at the national level and being a member of key technical working groups; the review learnt of variations on membership to district level gender and GBV technical working groups. For instance, RAC was recognized as an active member of the Mangochi Gender TWG while MCC and EAM were not recognized as active members of the Dowa Gender TWG<sup>11</sup>.

# 4.4.5. Technical Assistance.

This project is part of a global NCA initiative to eliminate GBV. Within the scope of this innovation, NCA HO had dedicated staff in various fields to provide technical support, ensuring systematic and strategic support to field operations at the CO level.

Locally, a number of program and support staff were directly supporting the project in a variety of technical capacities. The review concludes that the project team's composition and size, as well as the other CO staff involved, are adequate for carrying out project activities, especially given the partnership structures and complementary forms on which the project is based.

## 4.4.6. Monitoring and reporting quality

The NCA team, including the Country Representative, conducted field visits and attended activities carried out by project partners, as well as reports on field visits for monitoring implementation quality and project progress. All project documents and reports created by implementing partners must be reviewed, commented on, and, if necessary, amended before being approved by NCA. If an implementing partner fails to meet the NCA standards, the country office, based on the technical team's recommendation, either re-allocates the funding

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> The reports could not be verified during the evaluation. However the team learnt that Pastor's Fraternal is based in the districts while the mother bodies are based in Lilongwe which may reflect why they are not well pronounced while RAC is based in the district.

or terminates the partnership with that partner. The review discovered that due to compliance issues, some partners withdrew from implementing the activity during the implementation period.

## 4.5. Sustainability

The project's long-term viability is dependent on a variety of factors. Throughout its lifespan, the project prioritized sustainability. However, more work needs to be done to ensure the long-term viability of Malawi's government and non-governmental organization programs.

Malawi has legal frameworks and national action plans in place to combat GBV and TIP. The project was synchronized with the identified needs and priorities were established. It should be noted that the operationalization of the GBV and TIP action plans necessitates, among other things, the publication and dissemination of the GBV and TIP legal frameworks, capacity development of law enforcement and support staff, and capacity building. These are examples of where system building through appropriate interventions was required and worked on under the project.

The capacity development of key TIP stakeholders has been one of the project's most significant achievements. Aside from this group, the project was successful in increasing the capacity of many stakeholders in GBV and TIP prevention and response. Many respondents believe that raising awareness of GBV and TIP will continue because the project has increased the capacity of many stakeholders.

The diversity of donors funding GBV initiatives in Malawi is an external factor that, on the one hand, has contributed to success and sustainability while, on the other hand, has caused confusion for some partners. Several projects are being carried out in some of the project's impact areas. The key flagship initiatives on GBV are the DFID Tithetse Nkhanza and the UN Spotlight Initiatives. Plan International and Oxfam, among others, have campaigns to end violence against women and girls. This was a chance for cross-cutting GBV collaboration and partnership development. While the project established some collaboration and partnerships with other GBV-focused initiatives, attribution and contribution to success issues, as well as a lack of coordination among donors and implementers, may jeopardize the project's long-term viability. This would be more noticeable in areas where the project was carried out in collaboration with other projects and institutions.

In terms of financial sustainability and country ownership, government officials in Malawi are now convinced that responding to TIP is a national priority. As a result, they are beginning to discuss, and have even begun to implement, the means and modalities for incorporating TIP prevention and response into their own planning, budgeting, and programming within existing budgets. GBV has already been incorporated into existing government budgets and sectoral budgets although the allocations are meagre. For instance, in the 2018/19 budgetary allocation, Gender Equality and Economic Empowerment which is responsible for the coordination of Gender mainstreaming across the sectors; ensuring proper response on gender-based violence, and also responsible for social and economic empowerment received a meagre 0.44% share Ministry of Gender budget. Despite current funding constraints, there has been progress in

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> UN Women, 2018, The 2018/19 National Budget Analysis Focusing on the Social & Community Affairs and Local Authorities & Rural development Sectors

advocating for GBV and TIP programming in government budgets. The TIP fund has been operationalized by the Malawi government in accordance with the TIP Act.

Long-term aspects of the project include volunteers, paralegals, faith community members, pastors, and youths trained through the project's various components. These volunteers will be kept on because they are associated with NCA's strategic partners or are part of local governance structures with strong political will and commitment. According to the project's implementing partners, these volunteers will continue to raise awareness and support survivors of violence using the same manuals and guidelines developed by the project, as well as other relevant training materials provided in workshops and other capacity building activities.

# 4.6. Impact

The assessment of the impact felt by beneficiaries was a key interest of stakeholders for this evaluation exercise (and a typical core task of evaluations in general). Given that the program under evaluation lasted three years but was disrupted during implementation due to COVID-19, as discussed below, measuring impact would be not only costly but also overly ambitious. The review survey inquired about people's perceptions of the kinds of changes the project is bringing about in their communities. In addition, the review considered personal testimonies and anecdotal stories to assess the impact of the interventions on the beneficiaries' lives. As a result, the study found that the program resulted in a number of notable positive changes, which are detailed below.

# 4.6.1. Program Outcomes

- 4.6.1.1. Increased demand for theological reflections on GBV and TIP: The Malawian government has helped to reduce GBV and TIP by enacting various legal instruments to end GBV. Faith communities have provided theological reflection, resulting in declarations that GBV is not a religious practice. There is a growing demand for consecutive intra and interfaith dialogue, as well as the institutionalization of GBV within faith-based communities and structures.
- 4.6.1.2. **Reduction in would-be trafficked persons:** TIP capacity has been increased for transporters from the project's impact areas. As a result, they have improved their traveller screening processes, which has contributed to a reduction in the number of potential trafficked individuals because those who do not qualify are turned away.
- 4.6.1.3. Enhanced Comprehension of the Legal Frameworks on Gender Based Violence. A majority of the survey respondents (64.9%) indicated that they heard about legal frameworks on GBV issues in Malawi. When asked about specific laws, the table below shows that a majority of them mentioned the Child Care, Protection and Justice Act and the Prevention of Domestic Violence Act.

**Table 6:** Survey respondents on knowledge of GBV and TIP related legal frameworks

Specific Act	Responses	
--------------	-----------	--

	N	Percent	Percent of Cases
Prevention of Domestic Violence Act	142	24.10%	39.10%
Gender Equality Act	77	13.10%	21.20%
Child Care, Protection and Justice Act	163	27.60%	44.90%
Marriage, Divorce and Family Relations Act	56	9.50%	15.40%
Wills and Inheritance Act (Deceased Estates)	24	4.10%	6.60%
Trafficking in Persons Act	39	6.60%	10.70%
Other	89	15.10%	24.50%

# 4.6.1.4. Transformed norms, attitudes, beliefs and practices which exacerbate gender-based violence, trafficking in persons and child labour

As a result of such capacity-building initiatives, traditional leaders and religious leaders have challenged some cultural and religious beliefs and taboos. This has contributed to shifts in attitudes toward GBV, TIP, and child labour. Further, majority of respondents reported positive trends in community perception towards GBV, TIP, and child labour as shown in the figure 1 below.

Proportion of survey respondents on community perceptions towards GBV, TIP and Child labour 64.3 70 60 45.3 50 40 30 17.818.119.7 16.2 20 9.2 9.6 8.7 10 0 Positive change Somehow Not changing Getting worse Don't know positive changing **■ TOWARDS GBV** TOWARDS CHILD LABOUR TOWARDS TIP

Figure 1: Proportion of survey respondents on trends on community perceptions

# **4.6.1.5.** Increased duty bearers responsiveness; detection, arrest and prosecution of TIP cases

The project increased the capacity of law enforcement and support officers in all districts where TIP-related interventions were implemented. As a result, law enforcement officers' ability to detect, arrest, and prosecute criminals has improved. According to national data, the Malawi Police Service (MPS) reported anti-trafficking law enforcement data from seven of Malawi's 34 district-level police stations in 2018. According to MPS, 32 suspects were apprehended, and at least 16 alleged traffickers were prosecuted. In 2019, the Malawi Police Service (MPS) reported anti-trafficking law enforcement data from 11 of Malawi's 34 district-level police stations, up from seven in the previous reporting period. In comparison, MPS reported that it

arrested 48 suspects, prosecuted 30 alleged traffickers, and convicted 30. There have been reports of improved detection, arrest, and prosecution of TIP cases at the district level where the project was implemented. For example, in Mchinji. As table 7 shows there has been an increase in reported cases and number of TIP survivors rescued from 2018 to 2020.

Table 7: Mchinji TIP Cases and Survivors Rescued

Year	Number of	Number of survivors rescued				
	cases	Male	Female	Boy	Girl	Total
	registered					
2018	14	36	4	15	6	61
2019	15	27	10	19	11	67
2020	34	76	16	45	10	147
Totals	63	139	30	79	27	275
	•	•	•	•		•

Source: Key Informant, Mchinji

In terms of success rate of prosecutions, as shown in the table below, Mchinji has maintained a 70% conviction rate over the period under review on matters that have been brought before the court.

Table 8: Mchinji TIP Prosecutions Details

Description of the cases	2018	2019	2020
Total number of cases registered	14	15	34
Number of cases still under investigations	0	0	7
Number of cases taken to court		15	27
Number of cases completed in court		15	26
Number of cases still under court		0	1
Number of cases where the State secured convictions	10	12	24
Number of cases where perpetrators were	4	3	2
discharged/acquitted			
Description of the perpetrators	2018	2019	2020
Number of perpetrators arrested	17	28	41
Number of perpetrators taken to court	17	28	32
Number of perpetrators convicted	12	22	29
Number of perpetrators discharged/acquitted	5	6	2
Number of perpetrators under court	0	0	1
Number of perpetrators under investigations	0	0	9

# 4.6.2. Assessment of Factors Contributing to Impact

# 4.6.2.1. The project's implementation time was limited

The project was scheduled to last three years. However, due to other factors discussed below, the majority of the activities were carried out over a two-year period. Despite this, even three years was insufficient to influence change in deeply ingrained gendered social norms and socialization processes that exacerbate gender-based violence and human trafficking.

# 4.6.2.2. **COVID-19 Restrictions**

The World Health Organization (WHO) declared the COVID-19 outbreak a pandemic on March 11, 2020, because it poses a serious public health risk worldwide. Despite the fact that Malawi did not have a confirmed case, the President declared a state of disaster on March 20, 2020, and this was followed by some restrictive measures, such as school closures, aimed at containing the spread of COVID-19. Malawi's first confirmed case of COVID-19 occurred on April 2nd in Lilongwe. The restrictive measures had an impact on project implementation because meetings were limited to a few people; there was a widespread fear among the population that attending a meeting would expose them to COVID-19.

School closures and the reversal of GBV programming gains Since March 23, 2020, nearly six million school-aged children in Malawi have been affected by the Government of Malawi's Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) prevention measures, which have forced schools to close in order to prevent the virus's spread. After nearly seven months, schools reopened. As a result, targeting in-school youths posed a challenge for some project activities. Teenage pregnancies and early marriages increased as youths were unable to access some GBV and SRHR support services. According to the Malawi Government Commissioned COVI-19 Rapid Assessment of Teenage Pregnancies and Child Marriages, the country recorded 13,000 cases of child marriages and over 40, 000 cases of teen pregnancies during the COVID-19 period, representing an 11% increase in teenage pregnancies compared to the same time last year. Mangochi, one of the project's impact districts, had the highest number of child marriages, with official records indicating 5941. Mangochi also recorded 5,901 cases of teenage pregnancies between March and July 2020 compared to 5,764 during the same period in the previous year, an increase of 137 cases or 2.4%. This effectively reversed the gains made in GBV programming.

# 4.6.2.3. General elections and Fresh Presidential Elections

Malawians voted on May 21, 2019, in a tripartite election to elect their President, Members of Parliament, and local government councillors. The outcome of the presidential election, as announced by the MEC, was challenged on the grounds that the election administration was marred by numerous irregularities, particularly during the counting phase. The Human Rights Defenders Coalition (HRDC) organized large-scale protests in major cities across the country. They demanded that Jane Ansah, the MEC chair, resign for alleged mismanagement. Violence, looting, and property destruction marred the protests. Massive weekly protests that lasted months until a court ruled against the sitting administration were unprecedented in Malawi, and they disrupted business, including project implementation. The court ordered fresh elections and the fresh campaign period impacted on implementation of activities.

#### 4.6.2.4. **Insufficient Supervision**

Because the project aimed to change deeply ingrained social norms that perpetuate GBV and TIP, it required a very strong community-based monitoring and supervision system, supported by project support facilitators based in the community. The evaluation found that monitoring and supervision were generally weak and skewed towards groups closer to and more accessible to the project operational offices. The difficulty was exacerbated by the project's small number of officers in each district.

# 4.6.2.5. **Strong Cultural Beliefs**

The project was carried out in conservative cultural and religious settings and contexts. As a result, breaking down cultural and religious barriers was difficult for the project, despite some positive changes among religious and traditional leaders.

## 5.0. LESSONS LEARNT

- **5.1.** Engaging faith leaders to address TIP and GBV yields additional benefits: Faith leaders speak the language of the community. They understand how to package and communicate GBV and TIP messages. They are regarded as moral authorities, spiritual advisors, and have legitimacy within communities.
- **5.2.** The involvement of traditional leaders and cultural custodians addresses the nuances surrounding gender-based violence and human trafficking, resulting in the removal of stigma and discriminatory attitudes that perpetuate gender-based violence.
- **5.3.** Partnerships between TIP service providers and community-level structures are critical for TIP success. The project facilitated the engagement of various stakeholders on TIP and GBV by emphasizing their respective roles and responsibilities, resulting in improved and successful detection and prosecution of TIP cases.

#### 6.0. RECOMMENDATIONS

In reference to key results of the study, the following recommendations have been formulated:

- **6.1.** This project should be extended because the TIP and GBV-related behavioral changes sought have begun but will take more than two or three years to complete.
- 6.2. The evaluation suggests an integrated approach to addressing individual, relational, community, and structural issues. The project aims to provide GBV and legal literacy knowledge and skills to women, men, boys, and girls. It should encourage the establishment of community-based safe spaces for women and girls. NCA and partners should make it possible for local women and girls to participate fully in the processes. In terms of legal literacy, the project should ensure that project participants understand their responsibilities, including their roles as witnesses, particularly during court litigation processes.
- **6.3.** The NCA and its partners must develop a strong advocacy strategy and engage in evidence-based advocacy on policy and legal frameworks.
- **6.4.** Gender transformative conscious practice tools and frameworks that challenge negative gender social norms, such as gender dialogue sessions and participatory gender analysis tools like the Venn diagram, should be used in the project.
- **6.5.** Advocate for the funding and implementation of GBV and TIP policy and legal frameworks that would allow survivors to access services and justice.
- **6.6.** The project should ensure that males are involved in all three components of ideal male involvement, so that men are involved as users of GBV services, actors in anti-GBV promotion and service delivery, understand the critical importance of men taking responsibility for GBV, and understand gender and gender-based violence.
- 6.7. NCA and partners should facilitate district-level coordination mechanisms, particularly in the areas of harmonization of GBV and TIP indicators, as well as the creation of spaces for GBV implementation learning, with a focus on sharing and documenting best practices and approaches, among other things.
- 6.8. NCA and partners should ensure that time is set aside for reflection and learning with stakeholders. The reflection and learning exercises should be carried out at various levels, beginning with the community and progressing to the district. Reflection and learning sessions at the community level can be done at each impact community or by combining several impact communities to enhance learning among and between communities.

## 7.0. REFERENCES

Forti, M. 2012. Six Theory of Change Pitfalls to Avoid, <a href="https://ssir.org/articles/entry/six">https://ssir.org/articles/entry/six</a> theory of change pitfalls to avoid

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/591797/A\_description\_of\_social\_action.pdf

Menocal A.R. 2014. What is political voice, why does it matter, and how can it bring about change? A Development Progress Discussion Paper. Overseas Development Institute

Malawi Government, National Plan of Action on Ending Gender Based Violence

Malawi Government, National Plan of Action on Combating Trafficking in Persons

NCA Annual Reports

Sonke Gender Justice Network, 2012. Building Male Involvement in SRHR: A Basic Model of Male Involvement in Sexual Reproductive Health and Rights. Cape Town. South Africa.

UNICEF, 2019, Everybody Wants to Belong, A Practical Guide to Tackling and Leveraging Social Norms in Behaviour Change Programming. https://www.unicef.org/mena/media/4891/file/MENA-C4D-Report-May2019.pdf.pdf