

## Comments on BWI LO Norway Qatar Project Evaluation (28 April 2018)

### Basic Points:

- Sports Ap is not a correct name. It is “ BWI CONNECT App”
- Liaison officers or organizers as label is dangerous for public label. We should call them “community coordinators”.
- Remove names of Marco and Prince for security and privacy.
- Labour Camps are called “Accommodation Facilities”.

Page No.	Section	Remarks
iii	BWI also concluded an agreement with Qatar Diar Vinci Construction, a French construction company engaged in building the metro in Doha, for the creation of Worker Welfare Committees that allow worker representatives to negotiate with the employer. The outcome has been increased wages for blue collar workers, improved safety measures and better living conditions. Two more such agreements have been signed with construction companies Salini Impreglio (Italy) and Besix (Belgium).	<p>To correct, the objective of the MoU is to ensure decent work, safe working conditions, and human rights of workers working in QDVC/VINCI projects in Qatar. <a href="https://www.bwint.org/cms/news-72/bwi-signs-an-agreement-with-qdvc-and-vinci-a-world-premiere-on-these-issues-in-qatar-871">https://www.bwint.org/cms/news-72/bwi-signs-an-agreement-with-qdvc-and-vinci-a-world-premiere-on-these-issues-in-qatar-871</a></p> <p>In addition, BWI has signed an IFA with BESIX that covers all projects globally and the Salini Impreglio Agreement predates our work in Qatar.</p>
iii	The complaint made to the ILO by the ITUC and BWI was closed in November 2017 following important changes in Qatari labour legislation that end the kafala....	To correct, the Commission of Inquiry was filed by the Workers’ Group of the ILO.
iii	The database for South Asia indicates that 853 new members joined the Indian and Nepali affiliates of BWI in 2016 and 2017, making the target of the project for new membership from South Asia well within reach.	Ending 2017, BMKQ membership stands at 134 regular members.
iii	The Charter of demands of BWI is relevant both to the needs expressed by workers and the Qatar context. Efficiency can be increased. If the status of liaison officers responsible.....	Please do not use “liaison officers”... instead use “community coordinators”. Efficiency has nothing to do with status and see subsequent comments.
1	BWI’s World Board endorsed the “No World Cup in Qatar without Workers Rights” Campaign and confronted FIFA by a demonstration outside their head office in Zurich on May 29, 2015 carrying black crosses representing workers who had died	<p>Rephrase to read: <i>BWI has staged die-in protest in Zurich on May 29, 2015...</i></p> <p>The May 29 mobilization was the culmination of a series of actions that included pressuring national football clubs and associations, fans’ clubs and corporate sponsors.</p>

Page No.	Section	Remarks
		In addition, it was not black crosses that were used. Please delete black.
1	BWI General Secretary, Mr. Ambet Yuson, is an active member of this oversight body.	Oversight is a heavier formal word for an advisory body. Ambet Yuson is a member of the FIFA Human Rights Advisory Board.
4	The use of the word "labour camps"	This is very subjective and we would prefer that "accommodation facilities" is used.
6	However, according to the leaders of these affiliates, many of them are not functioning satisfactorily. Construction workers in India are among the few that can access social security.	<p>Here the reference is being made to migrant resource centres established by the respective State Government in Uttar Pradesh and Tamil Nadu as these have not been able to address issues surrounding migration.</p> <p>This should be rephrased to read as "construction workers migrating from India have limited access to social security".</p> <p>Because when we talk of construction workers in India, the construction workers have far better access to social security vis-à-vis other sectors because of the Building and Other Construction Workers Welfare Board across different States and Union Territories in India.</p>
6	Efficiency LO's financial support to BWI for its work in South Asia and Qatar has been modest but much needed to support pre-departure training in India and Nepal and organizing on the ground in Qatar.	Maybe replace modest with "instrumental" in view of Norwegian contribution because in the complete picture the support/cooperation is substantial.
6	The work of BWI liaison officers is sometimes obstructed by their precarious status in Qatar. At present, only the Philippine organizer has a work visa, the Indian and Nepali liaison officers are there on free visas for which they pay the sponsor who is supposed to employ them. This makes their status very precarious and hampers adequate documentation of membership as well as of grievances.	<p>The reason of having BWI "community coordinators" into these arrangement is part of the approach to have them as volunteers.</p> <p>A possible solution would be to state that the strategy of the on-the ground coordination was utilized the existing systems of obtaining work visas for the community coordinators. Although the situation is not uniform or everyone and it is not the ideal situation; however, the very essence that they outreach to workers is an important step forward.</p>

Page No.	Section	Remarks
7	It also results in a high turnover of liaison officers.	<p>While there was replacement of community coordinators in recent years, it is not correct to state that there were no briefings made for the new community coordinators. They were thoroughly briefed and there was even a transition between former and current Filipino community coordinators.</p> <p>The link of the free visas and high turnover is incorrect.</p> <p>In addition, the turnover of organizers further supports the challenges that any coordinator will face but it would nevertheless be in correct to state high turnover.</p>
7	Weekly labour camp meetings are held in Al-Khor, Shahaniya, Bin Omran, Wukair and the Industrial Area. Stadium committee meetings and Core Committee meetings take place every quarter. Evidence of records of these meetings was not provided.	<p>In terms of evidence, by virtue of talking to the organizers and the workers living in these areas should be sufficient.</p> <p>We don't require minutes in this "private and informal" meetings.</p>
7	A worker representative on a WWF indicated that there was insufficient time to prepare for election to these bodies as information about them was shared only a few days in advance.	<p>The reference here is made to the initial phase of WWC and not WWF which is specific to the World Cup stadiums, when these were launched and with the partnership of the BWI – this process has improved. (Things are evolving quickly - catching up.)</p> <p>While this was true in the early stage of the WWC of the QDVC/VINCI, this has improved with the increase involvement and outreach of the community coordinators.</p>
7	Coordination between sporting event sites is ensured by the Global Adhoc Working Group. Some difficulty in coordination between liaison officers is due to the current reporting structure. The Philippine organizer reports to the office in Malaysia while the Indian and Nepal liaison officers report to Delhi.	<p><i>Please rephrase to read:</i> The monitoring and reporting system of the entire project is ensured from the World Board-created Global Adhoc Working Group on Migration and Sports as well as BWI Geneva, KL and ND offices. Regularly monitoring meetings are held in Qatar and online platforms.</p> <p>Again, this was discussed and we cannot accept the claim that there is difficulties in coordination between the organizers is due to reporting...It is due to issues of language. However, despite this we have a system in place where there is coordination and communication flow on the ground, regionally, and globally.</p> <p>In the same paragraph please revise organizer to community coordinator.</p>

Page No.	Section	Remarks
7	The creation of an evidence base has been hampered by the precarious status of the liaison officers and the high turnover of them.	We do not agree on this statement.
8	The data base at the South Asia office in Delhi does not provide information on the number of new South Asian members in 2015.	With regard to membership, as was also clarified earlier, that the membership data for 2015 was included in the annual report submitted to LO-Norway (consolidated figure for Qatar and Tajikistan). In the encoding of the figures into the database was delayed.
8	What is of concern is the declining trend between 2016 and 17, indicating the need for renewed efforts to register workers with whom the liaison officers are in contact.	Same as above. This study was conducted in October 2017 and this inference seems to have been drawn from the six-monthly report and not the year-end annual report for 2017 that exhibits an increase over 2016 (944 vs 689).
9	The Sports Ap which was designed with the help of FNV in 2015 has only been accessed by about 100 workers so far.	In addition, it is not "Sports Ap". It is called the "BWI Connect App".
9	The data base for South Asia shows that only one BWI member from this region has been elected so far to a WWF while many more are capable of assuming this role.	<p>To clarify, 1.) The evaluator is referring to the WWC of QDVC. 2.) For the elections we encouraged one of our migrant worker leader, Hussain to run for the WWC. He received the second largest number of votes and thus was elected as an alternate member of the WWC. As an alternate he can attend the WWC meetings. However, he successfully recruited the official WWC representative, Dharmendra Thota. Thus, we now have two South Asian leaders who are members of the QDVC WWC.</p> <p>In addition, Dharmendra recruited five other members of the QDVC WWC to participate in BWI organised trainings and meetings. We agree that because of the trainings and interventions there are many more capable of assuming this role but we have to respect the electoral process where a trained or non-trained person can get elected.</p>
12	In the absence of unions, the WWCs that big companies have set up allow workers to voice their concerns to the management.	What we can specify is that WWC is a vehicle for workers to express their concerns and can serve as a grievance mechanism, but it does not replace the establishment of independent trade unions.
11	The pressure exerted by BWI affiliates in France, Italy and Belgium resulted in three important agreements being signed in France....	Correction: We signed the agreement with QDVC/VINCI in 2017. The same with BESIX. In addition, Salini Impregilio IFA was signed much earlier.

Page No.	Section	Remarks
13	One of the demands put forward by BWI in Qatar is that of equal pay for equal work....	We suggest to delete the part of “based on adequate living wage.” Our position is clear, equal pay for equal work regardless of nationality.
13	As the last Congress decided to continue the “Red Card to FIFA Campaign.	Factually incorrect as there was never a discussion on this in the Durban Congress.
15	The Liaison Officers are insufficiently equipped to document violation of migrant worker rights.	<p>We don’t agree on this statement as evidenced of cases that we have already handled and resolved.</p> <p>Within the evaluation there are some case studies indicating the community coordinators can handle and work for resolution of cases.</p>