

Yanyuan County, Sichuan Province

**“Liangshan Health and Development
Project” of Norwegian Missionary
Alliance**

Final Evaluation Report

**Evaluation Agency: Regional Development Center of
Yunnan University**

Evaluators

Song Haokun (RDRC, Yunnan University)

Lucy Hobgood-Brown (Community Development Consultant from Australia)

Sun Dajiang (Yunnan Academy of Social Sciences)

Wang Jianping (Resources, Environment & Geosciences Institute, Yunnan University)

Chen Xing (Resources, Environment & Geosciences Institute, Yunnan University)

Gen Ying (Resources, Environment & Geosciences Institute, Yunnan University)

November 2012

Summary

Since 1999, NMA supported implementing the integrated “Liangshan Health and Development Project” in Yanyuan County, Sichuan Province, the content of which included such activities as schooling aid project, Ta’erti Village Leprosy Patent Recuperate and Community Development Project. The project activities started from Ta’erti Village, and gradually expanded the scope. Up to the end of 2011, the project covered 9 villages and 2 schools in seven towns and townships in Yanyuan County. RDRC of Yunnan University was entrusted by NMA to evaluate the overall project in Yanyuan in September – November 2011, mainly focusing the project effects and impacts.

In the evaluation, we mainly adopted participatory investigation and analysis approach, and invited community leaders, key figures, male villagers’ representatives and female villagers’ representatives to participate in evaluation. We took sustainable livelihood of the community as the main theoretical framework, selected critical indicators related to the project activities, and assisted the project beneficiary groups in analyzing and discussing all aspects of project effects and impacts.

The main conclusions of the evaluations are as follows:

Community Development Projects: the project activities implemented in the nine communities included building roads, bridges, clinics, schools and water ponds in the community, planting walnuts and medicinal herbs, as well as training on agricultural technologies. Most components played great roles in solving the specific difficulties of the community, such as access to potable water, seeing doctors, access to transportation and improving farmers’ incomes. Some projects had significant impacts, such as the integrated development component at Erdaogou, and the potable water component at Beishan. From the perspective at a higher level, or from the perspective of sustainable development of the community, the projects were sparsely spread out with poor synergy, and also lack of design for sustainable development. Therefore, the projects were insufficient in community capacity building and social assets construction. The community projects were generally close to the “blood-transmitting” means of poverty alleviation, i.e., mainly relying on outsiders to help solving the difficulties of the communities, with poor sustainability. However, the new project location of Erdaogou made great progress in project design and means of implementation, promoted improvement of the farmers’ autonomous development awareness and reinforced their abilities to autonomously organize the projects, which laid a solid foundation for sustainable development. On the other hand, the impacts of the community projects were limited to the communities, with limited impacts on the government, the society and the PMO.

Ta’erti Rehabilitation Project: Ta’erti Village was formerly a special area that

the government collected leprosy patients for treatments. The outsiders were afraid of and discriminated against the leprosy patients even if they had been cured, and refused to associate with them. As a result, the children could not have access to education, and the community also lacked of development opportunities. The NMA project started from improving all kinds of resources and rights, so that a group of people who had been isolated due to leprosy could have access to all kinds of resources or rights, become a normal community, and gradually join the normal society. The project enhanced awareness with the government to change policies, restored and established the society's acceptance of the local people and the villagers' self-confidence, and it was a very successful project. Simultaneously, reinforcement of the achievements to date need further supports from the government.

Girls, Orphaned and Handicapped Child School Aiding Project: This part of the project activity was mainly to financially support the deaf and dumb children's class at Yanyuan County's Primary School for Minority Nationalities and financially support girls from poor families to go to senior middle school. The project focused on the most disadvantageous orphaned and handicapped children and the most difficult senior middle school stage of poor girl students, which is highly oriented in project design. The project implementation effects were well accepted by the government, the school, the students and their parents. Fortunately, the project promoted the establishment of Yanyuan County Special Education Center, and also linked with the "state schooling aid" policy of the state for the poor senior middle school students. The government policies and actions provided guarantee for sustainable operation of the project in future.

Suggestions:

1. Erdaogou Community was a new village of immigrants, with rather poor conditions in all aspects. However, they had certain ground for autonomous development, community organization also need to be further reinforced through the project. It is suggested that NMA should continue supporting the Erdaogou Community Development Project, so that it could have abilities and conditions for autonomous sustainable development.
2. Presently, the education and community development issue of Ta'erti Village have been preliminarily solved. However, the livelihood of widowed elderly people and orphans of leprosy patients is still a big issue in the community. It is suggested to help constructing "Community Service Center for Orphaned and Handicapped People", and rely on the community to help these special groups of people solve the problem of means of livelihood.
3. Influenced by the project, Yanyuan Government constructed a building as the Special Education Center, which will enroll handicapped children from Yanyuan and neighboring counties. However, they presently have but two special education teachers, which could not possibly satisfy the needs once the center starts to enroll students. However, the number of special education teachers trained in the government system is too limited to meet the social needs, it is very hard for such a

poor county as Yanyuan to hire special education teachers. It is suggested that NMA should help the Special Education Center to train a few special education teachers by means of entrusted training as teachers for the Special Education Center.

Table of Contents

1	Brief Introduction about Project Background	<u>6</u>
2	Evaluation Process	<u>6</u>
3	Evaluation Purpose	<u>8</u>
4	Evaluation Framework	<u>8</u>
4.1	Effectiveness of and Satisfaction about the Project	<u>8</u>
4.2	Impacts of the Project on the Beneficiary Groups / Communities	10
4.3	Other Impacts of the Project.....	11
5	Evaluation Methods	11
6	Main Findings and Impacts Analysis	13
6.1	Project Effectiveness and Satisfaction Level	13
6.2	Project Impacts Level.....	22
6.3	Institutional Impacts Level.....	28
7	Analysis and Discussion about Defects of the Project.....	30
7.1	Project being Dispersed and with Poor Integrity.....	30
7.2	Insufficient Communication Affected Project Effects.....	32
7.3	Community Development Projects had Insufficient Care about Environmental Issues 32	32
7.4	Continuity and Expansion of Projects Aiding Handicapped People being Difficult...32	32
7.5	Lack of Means to Inspire Autonomous Development of Communities	33
7.6	Insufficient Summary and Publicity.....	33
8	Comprehensive Conclusions.....	34
8.1	Community Development Projects	34
8.2	Ta'erti Rehabilitation Project	34
8.3	Girls, Orphaned and Handicapped Child School Aiding Project	35
9	Suggestions	35
9.1	Suggestions for Norwegian Missionary Alliance	35
9.2	Suggestions for the Local Government	36

1 Brief Introduction about Project Background

Since Norwegian Missionary Alliance (abbreviated as NMA hereinafter) implemented leprosy rehabilitation aid project as from 1999, after two years of piloting, NMA officially determined to implement “Liangshan Health and Development Project” in Yanyuan County, and established a project management office in Yanyuan County (abbreviated as PMO hereinafter). Since 1999, NMA had successively implemented multiple types of components, which mainly involved the fields of education, public health and community development. The project activities covered nine administrative villages and two schools in two townships. The general description of the project activities may be referred to in Table 1.

Table 1 General Description of Project Activities in Yanyuan

Project Activities	Coverage
Building classrooms for primary schools in the village	3 villages, i.e., Erdaogou, Gelanghe and Tangniwan
Building village clinics	3 villages, Jiahua, Gelanghe and Tangniwan
Improving communication (building bridges and roads)	3 villages, built road at Erdaogou, and built bridges at Gelanghe and Tangniwan
Potable water (water tanks, ponds)	4 villages, i.e., Beishan, Erdaogou, Jiahua and Tangniwan
Building biogas tanks	4 villages, i.e., Beishan, Erdaogou, Gelanghe and Jiahua
Training farmers	3 villages, i.e., Beishan, Erdaogou and Jiahua
Planting walnut and medicinal herbs	2 villages, i.e., Erdaogou and Tangniwan
Financially supporting girl to go to senior middle school (from the entire county)	60 students / year * 6 years (Since 2006)
Supporting orphaned and handicapped children to go to school (from the entire county)	40 students / year * 4 years (Since 2008)

2 Evaluation Process

The entire evaluation process may be referred to in Table 2.

Table 1: Evaluation Process of Yanyuan Health and Development Project

Time	Evaluation Activities	Venue	Participants
September 20	Kickoff Meeting	Office of Buerconsult Company	Evaluation Group and PMO
October 10	Workshop	Office of Buerconsult	Evaluation Group, PMO and

		Company	Shincon Company
October 22	Kunming – Yanyuan	Jinhe Township, Yanyuan County	Evaluation Group, Buerconsult Company and Yanyuan County PMO
October 23-27	Visited 8 project villages including Ta’erti, and interviewed key figures and groups in each village (villagers’ group cadres, teachers, etc.), male villagers and female villagers Yanyuan County PMO staff conducted interviews and completed investigation tables.	8 project villages, including Ta’erti, Paoma, Tangniwan, Shanmenkou, Gelanghe, Jiahua, Beishan and Erdaogou, etc. Lived at Jinhe Town Seat and Yanyuan County Seat	Evaluation Group, Buerconsult Company, Yanyuan County PMO, relevant town and township leaders, key figures in the communities, male villagers and female villagers.
Morning of October 28	1. Held informal meetings with leaders and teachers of the girls’ class in Yanyuan No. 1 Middle School; 2. Interviewed some students of Yanyuan girls’ class; 3. Held informal meeting with leaders of Yanyuan Nationality Primary School and Teachers of the Class of Handicapped Students 4. Held informal meeting with some parents of handicapped children	Yanyuan No. 1 Middle School Yanyuan Nationality Primary School	Evaluation Group, Buerconsult Company and Yanyuan County PMO, leaders and teachers from No. 1 Middle School, students from girls’ class, leaders and teachers from Nationality Primary School, parents of handicapped children
Afternoon of October 28	Feedback of evaluation	Meeting room of Yanyuan County Government	Evaluation Group, Buerconsult Company, Yanyuan County PMO, deputy mayor of Yanyuan County and members of project leading group (leaders or representatives from such departments as public health and education of Yanyuan

			County)
October 29	Yanyuan – Kunming		Evaluation Group, Buerconsult Company
November 1-10	Discussion about initial draft of evaluation report	Office of Buerconsult Company	Evaluation Group, Buerconsult Company
November 11-30	Revising the report and translating it into English	Kunming	Evaluation Group
November 30	Submitting project evaluation report in Chinese and English versions	Kunming	Evaluation Group

3 Evaluation Purpose

The evaluation is aiming to give a conclusion on the project, i.e whether the project has achieved the project objectives in accordance with the project plan.

The purposes of the evaluation are i) to summarize the success and failure of the project; ii) to find out the impact of the project to the beneficiaries, project sites and local partners, and iii) to provide sustainability recommendations for local partners and governments.

In the actual course of evaluation, since we failed to find the original or specific project proposal, the specific objectives set by the project were unclear. Therefore, we cannot possibly answer if the project has met the set objectives. Instead, we put the focus of evaluation on the project effects and impacts.

4 Evaluation Framework

The entire evaluation process was conducted in the following three fields and levels:

4.1 Effectiveness of and Satisfaction about the Project

This level is mainly to evaluate if the project has been finished as per the original schedule, whether it is functioning. It is mainly to evaluate the project from the satisfaction of the project target group the specific evaluation indicators are as follows:

- a) Transparency: If the project process is transparent, if the project beneficiaries has knowledge about the project circumstances, collective projects of the communities are mainly focused on project funds, while household-specific

projects are mainly focused on whether the selection of beneficiary households are open and transparent.

- b) Service quality of project staff: The project staffs include PMO staffs and staffs of the project implementation agencies, and it is mainly to evaluate if the project staffs have provided the beneficiaries with good services, such as properly publicizing the project, and conducting effective communications and feedbacks while encountering problems, etc.
- c) Project (construction) quality: It is to evaluate the quality of the project itself, such as construction quality in the case of construction projects. For planting projects, it is mainly to evaluate the survival rate and growth of young trees or seedlings, while in the case of training projects, it is mainly to evaluate the levels of farmers' acceptance and understanding.
- d) Project roles / effects: It is to evaluate if the project has been functioning, if there are effects. In the case of construction projects, it is mainly to evaluate the conditions of putting into use and the benefits it produced, such as saving labors, economic returns and convenience for the beneficiaries, etc. In the case of planting projects, it is mainly to evaluate the economic returns produced, while in the case of training projects, it is mainly to evaluate the farmers' acceptance and use of training contents.
- e) Scope of coverage / beneficiary: How many beneficiaries does the project have? In case of public projects, it is to focus on the project implementation benefited how many villagers' groups or neighboring villages? In case of household-specific projects, it is to focus on percentage of beneficiary households in the total number of households in the project villages, and simultaneously, it is to focus on benefits of poor households among the beneficiary households.
- f) Sustainability (subsequent management, maintenance and use): It is to evaluate subsequent management and maintenance of the project after being put into use. In case of public facilities projects, it is focus on the management and maintenance conditions of the facilities and if there is a sustainable management and maintenance system in place, including definite managers and responsibilities, and sources of management and maintenance funds. In case of household-specific households, it is to focus on whether the farmers have the abilities to manage and maintain the facilities, or whether they could have convenient and fast access to technical support of management and maintenance.

Evaluation of project effects and satisfaction was conducted by means of classification and crediting, which is classified as five levels from the best to the worst. The farmers or village cadres give credits with articles according to the group discussion results. In actual practices, stones of different sizes were used to indicate different levels.

Based on scoring, it is to further discuss the different roles and effects of different

project activities.

(Refer to Annex 1: Evaluation Methods and Tools in Yanyuan Project).

4.2 Impacts of the Project on the Beneficiary Groups / Communities

Evaluation at this level is mainly to start from the perspective of sustainable development of communities, apply the community assets construction framework in the sustainable development theory (refer to Annex 2: General Description of Community Assets) to evaluate the changes or impacts the project brought to the communities and farmers.

Since all kinds of assets may include extensive contents, from the perspective of workability and practicability of evaluation, in light of contents of Yanyuan Project and characteristics of local communities, the evaluation group discussed and selected some representative aspects from all kinds of assets that are easy for the farmers to understand as evaluation indicators, which may be referred to in Table 3.

Table 3: Indicators for Evaluation of Impacts on Livelihood of Community in the Project

Assets	Evaluation Indicators for Community Collective / Leaders	Evaluation Indicators for Farmers
Natural Assets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Natural resources of the village (quantity of farmland and forests, quality and utilization levels) 	
Financial Assets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Collectively owned public funds 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Family incomes of the farmers
Material Assets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Infrastructures / public equipments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Level of convenience for schooling Level of convenience for going to a doctor Level of easy access to water supply Level of easy access to transportation
Human Assets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of labors in the entire village, production skills and health status Abilities of the village cadres to organize the farmers Abilities of the village cadres to manage public facilities Abilities of the village cadres to get external supports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of labors Production skills Financial management of the household Abilities to market products
Social Assets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organizations for managing public 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Participation in public

	affairs • Community management system	affairs • External contacts
--	--	--------------------------------

Since most indicators are for qualitative evaluation, to facilitate the farmers or village cadres to objectively express the changes before and after the project, trend change comparison method was used for comparative evaluation with most indicators, and then discuss about the causes of the changes and correlation with the project. For evaluation of social assets, it was mainly to use semi-structured interview for discussion. (Refer to Annex 1).

Simultaneously, in order to verify the impacts of the project on the communities, “Basic Needs Analysis Framework” was also used in the course of evaluation to analyze the changes to or impacts on the basic needs of the farmers in the community that the project brought about. Basic needs include food security, clean drinking water, fundamental education, fundamental Medicare and safe housing. Trend changes analysis method was also applied to evaluate the impacts in this aspect.

4.3 Other Impacts of the Project

It is mainly to analyze the following impacts of the project:

1. Impacts of the project on the implementation agencies and their staffs.
2. Impacts of the project on other agencies and their staffs (such as Yanyuan No. 1 Middle School, Yanyuan Nationality Primary School and other cooperation agencies).

Such impacts are mainly evaluated by adopting means of questionnaire, semi-structured interviews and group discussions.

5 Evaluation Methods

Group discussions serve as the main line of this evaluation, and each project villages organized three group discussions.

The first group includes people who have good knowledge about the project and the village conditions, such as village cadres and teachers. The theme for discussion in this group is impacts and roles of the project on the community and community leaders.

The second group includes 6 – 8 female villagers’ representatives from the project village, who discussed about the impacts and roles of the project on the farmers and the women from the women’s perspective. The women came from the villagers’ groups at the location of the project, some of them are beneficiaries of water ponds and school, and some are representatives other than project beneficiaries, such as

those who did not build biogas tanks or water pools.

The third group includes 6 – 8 male villagers’ representatives from the project village, who discussed about the impacts and roles of the project on the farmers and the individuals from the women’s perspective. Similar to the women’s group, the representatives participating in discussions include beneficiaries of collective projects or household-specific projects, and also include non-beneficiaries of household-specific projects.

In the group discussions, several participatory investigation tools were adopted for evaluation, gradual and profound investigation, discussion and analysis level by level. The specific evaluation methods may be referred to in Table 4.

Table 4: General Description of Methods and Tools Used in Evaluation and Investigation of Project Impacts

No.	Name of Tools	Purpose
1	Group Discussion	Selecting project beneficiaries or stakeholders, such as male and female farmers, village leaders, teachers, students of girls’ class, and parents of handicapped children, etc. Discussing about relevant issues by means of informal discussions, and obtaining information required for evaluation.
2	Semi-Structured Interview	It is to define key themes and secondary themes according to key points of project introduction, integrates into the entire evaluation process, and explores the critical information.
3	Problem Tree	The key point is to assist the community in explaining (analyzing) if the changes to the community assets have any correlations with the NMA project? What correlations? How?
4	Priority Method	Evaluating communities’ classification of options, such as classification and prioritization of livelihood changes and correlation with the project.
5	Community Credit Card (Satisfaction Level)	It is to understand about the farmers’ evaluations about the project activities (giving credits by 1 – 5). In actual practices, articles (such as stones) of different sizes are generally used to visually mark the scores.
6	Community / Poor Household Asset Change Table	It is to evaluate the farmers’ conditions of five livelihood assets in the past few years before the project and now, and compare the changes. How great are the changes? Correlations of the changes with the project.
7	Capacity Change Table	It is to separately evaluate all the abilities of the farmers and the village leaders before and after the project by means of trend analysis, the scores are 0-10, and discuss about the causes of changes.
8	Discussion	It is to discuss and list the difficulties and needs of the

	about Needs Prioritizing and Changes	communities, record and prioritize with cards, focus on discussing the changes of needs before and after the project, demonstrate if the project responds to or target at the priority needs of the community, and solve the key difficulties.
9	Changes of Basic Needs	It is to evaluate the changes to the basic needs of the communities by the trend changes of 1-10, and discuss about the causes of the changes and correlation with the project.
10	Field Observation Method	It is to observe the visual project services in field, particularly the status quo of the infrastructures, so as to demonstrate the results of group discussions or other interviews.
11	Case Interviews	Typical farmer investigation, reflecting the roles and impacts of the project by means of case study.
12	Questionnaire	It is to design specific questionnaire and investigate the impacts of the project on the county projects and PMO staffs.

6 Main Findings and Impacts Analysis

Since NMA implemented diversified projects at Yanyuan, the objectives, methods and objects of which are inconsistent, to facilitate analysis and narration, we classified the projects into three types for analysis and evaluation:

- (1) Community Development Projects
- (2) Rehabilitation Village Aid & Development Projects
- (3) Girl and Handicapped Children Schooling Aid Project

6.1 Project Effectiveness and Satisfaction Level

(1) Community Development Projects

The communities generally had high levels of satisfaction about the community development project, with significant effects. Except very few projects, most projects had good effects and well accepted by the villagers, village cadres and the government.

Of the community development project evaluation activities conducted in 8 villages, regarding the 6 evaluation indicators, there are three indicators with high comments, i.e., satisfaction about the services of project staffs, project quality and project effects. There are two indicators with moderate comments, i.e., project transparency and subsequent management and maintenance of the project. However, the evaluations of different groups are different: village cadres and men give high scores to transparency and subsequent management and maintenance, while women give low scores, which in a certain sense explained that women had lower participation in public affairs. In terms of subsequent management and maintenance of the project, the bio-gas

socialized service of Erdaogou was generally accepted, and all the groups gave very high remarks. Only the item of project coverage had generally poor remarks.

The detailed statistics of comments of different groups may be referred to in Table 5, and the details of comments by groups may be referred to in Annex 3.

Table 5: Statistics of Project Evaluation Results of Different Groups

Indicators	Project Transparency	Satisfaction about Services of Project Staffs	Project Quality	Project Effects / Roles	Coverage	Subsequent Management and Maintenance
Different Groups Average Score						
Village cadres	3.55	4.25	4.25	4.15	2.8	4.05
Female Villagers' Representatives	2.57	4.91	4.17	4.13	3.82	3.83
Male Villagers' Representatives	4.14	4.00	4.29	4.29	3.38	4.14

Source of Information: 8 project villages, village cadres, male and female villagers' groups conducted participatory scoring in the group discussions.

Note:

- 1. Each comment is to be scored by 1-5, in which 1 is the poorest, and 5 is the best.**
- 2. The scoring statistics of coverage did not include the projects extensively covered the entire village, such as education and public health, etc.**

Different project activities were implemented in different villages each had different effects. However, in general, all the project activities were effective. The project effects in all the villages may be referred to in Table 6.

Table 6: Roles and Effects of Project Activities in All the Villages

Village Name	Project Activities	Roles and Effects
Ta'erti	Building primary school and schooling aid	NMA provided schooling conditions, built classrooms, provided desks, chairs, text books and blackboards. The teaching environment was comfortable, with 4 teachers and 31 students, and all the children in the village could go to school. They could continue going to middle schools and collages after graduation from the primary school. Presently, there have been 3 people studying in polytechnic schools and 2 people studying at collage. However, before the project was implemented in 1999, there was no classroom or desk or blackboard, and they used an old and shabby house as classroom, and teachers from outsider refused to work here. Almost all the villagers were illiterate.
	Building clinic	It did not work well. The clinic was built, but the government was not cooperative. The medical conditions was not ideal, without

		medicine or doctor, and the clinic was not put into use, The villagers went to neighboring villages to see a doctor, and the near trip would take an hour (walking + taking boat).
	Potable water component	They were short of water supply in the past, with difficult access to potable water, and the water source was far away from the village. After the project was built, the water source was repaired, and the situation of difficult access to water supply improved. However, what made them unhappy was that the water quality was poor.
	Building flood control and irrigation ditch	It improved the irrigation conditions and improved yields of grains, and worked very well. Presently, almost no household was short of grains.
	Supporting purchase of farming tools (threshing machines, iron ploughs and plough ox)	It improved the production conditions, eased labor burdens, and worked particularly well to the families lack of labors.
	Training and exchanges	It worked very well. The project promoted the Rehabilitation Hospital being renamed as Ta'erti Village, which greatly lowered the discrimination levels of the outsiders. The young people became more adaptive to the outside world, without any obstacles to communicate with the outsiders, or any limit to go out. However, the outsiders normally did not come here, and they often called them once they had any business. In the past, nobody could go out working as migrant labor. Presently, about 1/3 of the farmers go out as migrant labors during the slash seasons.
	Planting walnut and green peppers	The walnut will bring incomes to them in future, and there would be people coming to their doors to purchase green peppers, which would increase the farmers' revenues.
Paomaping	Building primary school	The project activity somehow worked. It built a school and purchased desks, chairs and books. However, they were short of teachers. The school had but a headmaster and two substitute teachers, whose pays were as low as 500 RMB per month, and no teacher was willing to teach here. The students did not have access to boarding. Although they could go to school, the trip was long, and they had to walk 4 hours to the school, the conditions of which were rather poor. They hoped they could get assistance to build a complete primary school with 6 grades and boarding facilities.
	Building biogas tanks	They built but 20 biogas tanks and benefited 20 households, which were poorly used and managed, in which half were no longer useable. The vast majority used firewood as the fuel, and the entire village would burn about 10 tons of firewood a year.
	Training	They conducted trainings on planting and animal breeding, which were somehow helpful for the villagers to select seeds. It did not work well on improving the grain outputs.

Gelanghe	Building bridges	It worked very well. When there was not a bridge, the floods often washed away animals crossing the river, and it was very dangerous for old people and children to cross the river. The bridge had been built and put into use for 3 – 5 years, no more animals was flooded away, and motorcycles and cars could easily cross the bridge.
	Building primary school	It worked very well. After the school was built, the students increased year after year, and all the children of schooling age in the village have been enrolled.
	Building a clinic	It worked very well. In the past, if someone was sick, he would have to go to the township government to see a doctor, which was 16km or even 25km away. Presently, all the villagers could go to the clinic for normal illnesses.
	Building biogas tanks	It did not work much. Only 6 biogas tanks were built, which generated too limited biogas to light bulbs or cook.
Jiahua	Building a clinic	It worked very well. Presently, all the villagers went to the clinic for normal illnesses, and they only go to the county hospital when they had serious illnesses.
	Potable water	It worked very well, which solved their problem of potable water supply, with a little surplus water for irrigation. However, only a villagers' group benefited, and the neighboring villagers' groups were unhappy.
	Building biogas tanks	It worked well on the households with biogas tanks built. The construction quality was good, which was convenient and free to use, and they could spare time for other businesses. However, the number of biogas tanks built was limited, and only 28 households out of 149 households had access to it. It was too costly to build it with private investment, and nobody did that so far.
	Training on planting peppers	It did not work well. Of the famers interviewed, only one attended the training, and the teacher spoke Chinese, which was hard to understand, and he had already forgotten what was trained. They hoped there could be more training courses in the field.
Beishan	Building biogas tanks	It worked well. When there was no biogas, they would burn about 10 tons of firewood a year. Presently, they used biogas to cook and boil water, and could save about 2,000 kilos of firewood a year. However, only 16 households benefited, the coverage was limited for the entire village.
	Building potable water works	It worked very well, to be specific: In the past, they had to tap water 1km away all year round, and every family would need a full-time labor to tap water everyday. In total, about 86 labors could be saved a day. Presently, running water came to each door, which saved labors. Incomes increased by four times: ① Animal breeding: The number of pigs increased from 2 heads/household to 8 heads/household on average, and the annual income increased by 3,000 RMB/household;

		<p>② Planting Chinese prickly ash: The households who planted Chinese prickly ash before could earn more than 30,000 RMB/household. The households who planted Chinese prickly ash this year each planted 5mu, a total of 2 villagers' groups planted about 4,000mu, which were expected to bring incomes 5-8 years later, and bring incomes by 3,000RMB/household. ③ Planting corn: The planting area of each household increased from 2mu to 5mu, each increased income by 1,500 RMB. ④ Planting apple trees and walnut trees: They were going to plant 500mu apple trees this year, to be irrigated with water from the pond. They would also use the pond water for irrigating the 1,000mu walnut trees.</p> <p>The hygiene conditions improved. They did not bath in the past, but they could bath once a week now. They seldom did laundry in the past, but they could do laundry any time they wanted.</p> <p>It promoted everybody to discuss and decide a management and maintenance method, and they could solve the minor problems themselves. The potable water component had been used for 4 years, which was still normal.</p>
	Training activities	<p>It worked very well, as it inspired the villagers' awareness, so that they could accept new things (such as using biogas and manure piling technology, etc.) Village cadres went out for learning tours (Kunming, Xichang): 1. Teaching methods; 2. actual operations and demonstrations; training on animal breeding: answered specific questions about animal breeding at site; training on piling manure; training on safe use of biogas;</p> <p>After the irrigation conditions improved and manure piling technology was used, ① the corn output each household increased from 500kg/year to 1,000kg/year; ② the incomes from Chinese prickly ash increased from 1,000RMB/year to 30,000 – 40,000 RMB/year.</p>
Erdaogou	Building a small water pond	<p>The irrigation effects were fair, with limited coverage, and it could provide irrigation but to 20 households for one season. However, everybody was happy, since the construction process was open and transparent. They hired construction team themselves, supervised construction quality themselves, discussed and decided their own management and maintenance systems. They would implement projects by such practices in future.</p>
	Building primary school	<p>The project built good classrooms, including grade 1 – 6, all the children from 3 villages, totaling more than 900 students studied here. However, the teaching quality was fair, and they had more substitute teachers than official teachers.</p>
	Building water tanks	<p>It worked very well. In the past, they tapped water from the gully, which was seriously polluted. Presently, they could drink water from the water tanks, which were only slightly polluted. Simultaneously,</p>

		they could irrigate the vegetable fields around their houses with the surplus water, so that they could grow vegetables. When they were short of water supply in the past, they had to buy vegetables. The water tanks helped them get vegetables for 2-3 months.
	Planting walnuts and Chinese medicinal herbs	They just planted this year, without any products yet, and no effect was visible so far.
	Training and learning tours	The training effects were good. They did not plant the medicinal herbs or walnuts until after they had learnt experiences from the learning tours. They learnt not only the knowledge, but also the spirit of working together and helping each other. They hoped more training courses could be organized.
	Building biogas tanks	It worked well. It could save electricity bill by 200RMB/year, about 2,000kg firewood, and 50-60 labors. Simultaneously, it promoted the villagers to build biogas tanks themselves. The project built 225 biogas tanks, and the farmers built 100 biogas tanks. Presently, biogas tanks only covered 50% of households, and they would build more in future. The Township Biogas Station was responsible for maintaining the biogas tanks, and each household would pay 3 RMB/month as service charge, which was good.
	Road maintenance	It worked well, made transportation convenient. Moreover, it was built by themselves, without much investment, but the quality was good. They established a management and maintenance system after its completion, and conducted normal management and maintenance every year.
Tangniwan	Building bridge	It worked well, made it easy for students to go to school and farming vehicles to pass, especially in the rainy season. However, the quality was not good, and it had collapsed. They did not use rebar at the time of construction, and it was without handrail. It had safety perils. It had collapsed due to heavy load, and repaired later. They worried that it may not be used for long, and there might be nobody to take care of it after its completion.
	Building water tanks	It worked well. The villagers had to tap water from 9km away in the past. Now that the water tanks were built, each household could save a labor a day. The number of pigs raised increased from 1 head/household to 5 heads/household. The amount of water was too limited to be used for agricultural production. It was a pity that only about 100 households benefited, and 3 – 4 households shared a water tank on average, without enough water supply during the dry season.
	Building primary school	It worked very well in the beginning, which covered all the students in the village. However, due to water shortage, leprosy influences and lack of teachers as a result of low pay, and such other reasons as students going to schools of higher levels, dropped out of school or transferred to other schools, the school only had 5 students.

	Building a clinic	It worked very well in the beginning, but it is almost not working now. The house was about to collapse, the doctor was irresponsible and often absent, and the medicines were incomplete (only medicines for cold were available).
	Planting walnut trees	They just planted the walnut trees this year, which have not born fruits yet. However, it did not work well, and most young trees failed to survive due to water shortage. The farmers were unhappy about the way young trees were handed out, as they believed that the village cadres did it on their own, and those close to them got more young trees.
Shanmenkou	Building biogas tanks	A total of 16 biogas tanks were built, in which only 4 biogas tanks were being used, and the others were no longer in use. It was mainly because the villagers did not know how to manage or maintain them, and they could not find any people to help them once they had a problem.
	Building primary school	It was no longer used after the schools were merged.

Source of information: Interviewing key informants and group discussion in the project villages.

Summary of project activities:

1. All the project activities were needed by the villagers, which were targeted at the villager's difficulties. The project was highly oriented.
2. Water shortage was a critical and universal issue in the project areas. The farmers well accepted all the water-related project activities, such as water tanks, ponds and irrigation ditches, which were well managed and maintained, and worked well.
3. The villagers expected to have the schools built. However, due to the government policy of merging schools, many primary schools did not work as well as they were supposed to.
4. The villagers also needed to have the clinics built very badly, most of which worked. Two clinics did not work well because there was no paramedic or the paramedic was irresponsible, due to institutional and personal reasons.
5. The training activities improved the technical levels of the villagers, and promoted planting and animal husbandry. The languages used and the means of training were the main factors affecting the effects. It would be better if the local ethnic language could be used to conduct practical training in the field.
6. In general, except the new project location of Erdaogou, the villagers had low level of knowledge about the project. Simultaneously, the project was dominated by outsiders. Therefore, the villagers had poor sense of ownership over the project, they neither actively inputted in the project nor undertook the responsibilities of subsequent management and maintenance.
7. Except Erdaogou, the other project locations failed to cultivate the communities' abilities to manage the project and organize the communities. Once the project team was withdrawn, it would be very difficult for the communities to properly manage their public assets, and it would also be very difficult for them to plan and manage new projects, which was poorly sustainable.

(2) Rehabilitation Village Aid & Development Project

Although Ta’erti was also one of the projects implemented the development project, more activities for exchanges and creating opportunities were conducted there. Of the project activities conducted in the village, the most effective role was that the leprosy hospital enabled a the rehabilitation hospital to become Ta’erti Village, provided a special group of people in Ta’erti Village who had been isolated from the outside world a chance to access all kinds of resources or rights, so that they could join the normal communities, and gradually join the normal society. General description of chance or rights that Ta’erti obtained may be referred to in Table 7.

Table 7: General Description of Main Benefits of Rehabilitated Farmers in Ta’erti Village

Content of Benefits	Description
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chance to access education 	<p>Before the project was implemented, there was almost no chance for the descendents of leprosy patents to get education. The project built schools, supportive facilities and materials, the government arranged four teachers, so that the children from the entire village could go to school. After their graduation from primary school, with the promotion of the project, they also could continue to go to middle school and higher schools. Presently, three students have gone to polytechnic schools, and two students have gone to college.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chance to access employment 	<p>Attributable to improvement of such infrastructures as irrigation, supports for planting and training, the villagers gradually shake off dependence on external supports, and take the road of self-employment and self-development. Presently, they mainly depend on local employment, and mainly engage in planting and animal husbandry. Simultaneously, the villagers became more confident to leave the village. Previously, they were afraid of discrimination, and nobody go out as migrant labors, which has become a normal practice now. Presently, there have been two people leaving the village permanently as migrant labors, and one third of households having people leave the village as migrant labors during the off season. The cities the jobbers go include Shenzhen, Guangdong, Shanghai and Dechang, while the industries they engage include supermarkets, shoe factories, pencil factories, paper mills, manual labors (on job sites) and agricultural machinery factories, etc. Through internal development of the village and working as migrant labors, the villagers basically realized self-reliance.</p>

Source of information: Interviewing key figures in Ta’erti Village and group discussions.

(3) Girls, Orphaned and Handicapped Children Schooling Aid Project

Girls Schooling Aid Project: NMA’s schooling aid component at Yanyuan No. 1 Middle School targeted at poor female students. In the six years from 2004 to 2009,

NMA funded 60 students each year, totally for six years, in which a total of 360 girl students were financed. For the girls from poor households, the greatest difficulties of schooling come from two sides: firstly, financial burdens, and secondly, the traditional mentality of boy preference. When the girls go to senior middle school, these two factors will have the greatest influence. It is because that before junior middle school, it is the stage of free mandatory education by the state, which imposes limited burden on the family, the poor families are willing to and could afford the financial burden to send the girls to school. However, if the children go to college, it will be a pride for the family no matter they are boys or girls. Once they go to college, the possibilities of them leaving the countryside and be employed in cities will be high, and the families would be willing to bear greater burdens to support the girls to go to college. Even if the families have financial difficulties, they still could finish their schooling with grants or schooling loans after they go to college. Meanwhile, when the girls are at senior middle school, their families would have great financial pressures, and they have limited chance to get external supports. Simultaneously, they still have to return home for farming after graduation from senior middle school, and then marry someone. Therefore, investments in girls going to middle school are often regarded as “doing somebody else a favor.” The main role of the project is to fill in the gap of girls with potentials cannot continue schooling due to financial and mentality restrictions, so that they could get better education. The financially aided girls also cherish such opportunities, work very hard and achieve very good results. According to introduction of the school, of the 300 girls financially aided, only one girl dropped out of school, all the others graduated from senior middle school. Moreover, 80 – 90% of the girls graduated in four years went to college, which was higher than the other normal students. Although the policy of ethnic minority students having additional scores is a reason, the teachers still believe that the main reason is they “work very hard.”

Handicapped Children School Aid Project: Since 2008, 40 orphaned and handicapped children have been financially aided to go to school every year, including physically paralyzed, deaf and dumb children, and 160 children benefited from the project. The greatest and most fundamental role of the project is to give such children with special difficulties the right to education, so that they may have access to official education, and do not have to stay home to take care of animals. Simultaneously, the parents of these children believed that the project “eased the financial pressures of the family, and the parents do not have to pay for the children’s costs of living”, and they really liked that “the children not only learnt knowledge from the books, but also learnt to take care of themselves and become self-confident.” “In the past, the child had autism, and was unwilling to talk with other people. Since he went to school, he started to talk, and opened his mind. He is happier, and willing to talk with other people.” “The child’s living abilities improved, and he could take care of himself now. He could go shopping himself, and gradually learnt to melt into the society.”

The school leaders, students’ parents and the financially aided girls all thought highly

of the middle school minority nationality girl school aid project and the nationality primary school orphaned and handicapped children school aid project. Without the support of NMA projects, most of the beneficiary girls could hardly finish their senior middle school, and the handicapped children could hardly go to school.

6.2 Project Impacts Level

(1) Impacts of Community Development Projects

As to the impacts of the project on the community, it is mainly to evaluate the impacts that the project brought for all kinds of assets. The specific impacts are analyzed as follows:

- Natural assets

There is basically no change to natural assets. The project basically does not have activities specifically aimed at improving or effectively managing natural assets. The bio-gas project has certain effect on reducing logging forests, but the number of bio-gas tanks is limited, which has very limited impact on improving the forest resources.

- Financial assets
 1. There is no change to the public funds of the village. The collective does not have public funds before and after the project.
 2. The farmers' incomes increased significantly. The incomes per capita of all the project villages basically doubled in comparison with before the project. The villages with great increase in incomes per capita include Erdaogou, Beishan, Ta'erti and Jiahua. The farmers' income increase in these villages is closely related to the project, which may be referred to in Table 8.

Table 8: Income Increases of Some Project Villages

Village Name	Income Per Capita Before the Project (RMB/Capita)	Income Per Capita after the Project (RMB/Capita)	Increase (%)	Reason of Increase
Erdaogou	300	1,200	300%	1. Construction of roads, water tanks and electricity supply facilities saved a lot of labors, so that they could engage in production or work as migrant labors. 2. Improved transportation promoted development of animal husbandry and

				increased incomes.
Beishan	900	3,600	278%	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. While providing water supply for people and animals, the potable water system built by the project also provided water supply for irrigating film-covered corns, pepper and apple trees, which resulted in yield increase, and the number of pigs raised also increased (referred to the case in Annex 4). 2. After offering access to water supply, it liberated labors to be input in production. 3. After conducting training on production technology, the planting and raising skills improved.
Ta'erti	300	700	133%	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All kinds of investments eased farmers' burdens 2. Building irrigation embankments increased yields of crops 3. Newly increased planting walnuts and green peppers, and increased sources of income 4. Training and exchanges with the outside world improved planting and raising skills
Jiahua	Unclear	2,800	Very significant	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Construction of pumping station and water ponds provided part of the crops with irrigation water during the planting season, which increased the yields of crops. 2. While having access to water supply, labors are liberated to go out as migrant labors, and promoted increase of incomes. 3. Compost activities and training improved planting precision, and increased yields.

Note: The information about income increase came from estimated numbers of village cadres from all the villages after informal discussions between male and female villagers. The specific data may not necessarily be very accurate, but it could generally reflect the trend of changes in the increase.

Due to implementation of the project, the family incomes of some farmers increased significantly, and their production and living conditions also improved. For example, Lu Mingyou, group leader of the 3rd Villagers' Group in Beishan Village, was a typical of becoming better off through the potable water component, which may be referred to in Annex 4.

[\(Annex 4: Case of Project Promoting Farmers to Become Better Off\)](#)

However, some farmers still have great difficulties in increasing incomes. For example, Ta’erti Village still have some childless old people unmarried due to illness or handicap, who are difficult to generate incomes, nor do they have access to minimum social security.

- Material Assets

In general, the material assets of all the project villages, i.e. construction of infrastructures, all improved, and most of which are functioning and useable for the villagers. However, the improvement and utilization status of all the villages are different, with school and clinic construction being the components more often implemented. Increase of infrastructures and all kinds of facilities with easy access for the farmers may be referred to in Table 9 and Table 10.

Table 9: General Description about Improvement of Community Infrastructures in the Project Villages

Improvements of Infrastructures	Village Name	Main Improvements
• Villages with significant improvements	Ta’erti, Erdaogou (2 villages)	School, clinic, potable water system, irrigation ditch, bio-gas, water tank, village roads (multiple items)
• Villages with fair improvements	Tangniwan, Gelanghe, Jiahua, Paoma (4 villages)	School, clinic, potable water system, irrigation ditch, bio-gas, water tank (2-3 items each village)
• Villages with limited improvements	Shanmenkou, Beishan (2 villages)	Potable water or school, a few bio-gas tanks.

Source: Final Evaluation Report of “Liangshan Health & Development Project” by Yang Mingqing, deputy mayor of Yanyuan County, plus field observation.

Table 10: Easy Access to Use Facilities for the Farmers

Use of Facilities	Villages with Significant Changes	Villages with Insignificant Changes	Note
• Easy access to school	Ta’erti, Gelanghe, Paoma, Erdaogou (4 villages)	Tangniwan, Shanmenkou, Beishan, Jiahua (4 villages)	Tangniwan and Shanmenkou had schools built, but almost stopped using.
• Easy access to doctors	Ta’erti, Gelanghe, Jiahua (3 villages)	Paoma, Shanmenkou, Beishan, Erdaogou, Tangniwan (5 villages)	Some villages without significant improvements still do

			not have a clinic, while Tangniwan had a clinic built, but almost stopped using.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Easy access to potable water supply 	Ta'erti, Tangniwan, Jiahua, Beishan, Erdaogou (5 villages)	Gelanghe, Shanmenkou, Paoma (3 villages)	Domestic and production water supply is still the main difficulty for most villages.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Easy access to transportation 	Erdaogou, Tangniwan, Gelanghe (3 villages)	Ta'erti, Shanmenkou, Jiahua, Paoma, Beishan (5 villages)	The transportation conditions of the villages without significant changes are basically okay.

Source: Discussions and summaries of village cadres, male and female villagers' representatives from 8 project villages, plus field observation.

- Human Assets

From the general conditions of the communities, the labor skills and the villagers' status improved significantly. From the perspective of abilities of the community leaders, the village cadres' abilities to organize the farmers, manage public facilities and earn external supports improved significantly. To analyze the evaluation results, the men and village cadres benefited much greater than the women, the details of which may be referred to in [Annex 5: Analysis about improvement of human resources in the communities](#)).

- Social Assets

The project did not contribute much to the social assets of all the project villages.

From the perspective of community organizations, except that Erdaogou had a community development and management committee, none of the other villages had autonomous organization of the villagers. The development and management committee of Erdaogou was also established with the promotion of the project, which was mainly to respond to the project implementation. However, such a model of project implementation and management led by the farmers were accepted by the farmers. Under such a model, the farmers cared more about the project process and accept the project results, and simultaneously, they were more willing to input in the project, including inputting labors and actively participate in subsequent management and maintenance. To put it in a simple way, Erdaogou Community Development Committee was better accepted by the farmers in the village.

From the internal management system of the community, except Erdaogou, none of

the other villages had complete community management system in place to effectively manage public facilities or to coordinate community conflicts. Management and maintenance of public facilities mainly relied on temporary mobilization of the village cadres. Once there is a major problem with the facilities, there was no maintenance fund available. While in the case of Erdaogou, in the course of implementing the project, they established implementation management system, quality supervision system and subsequent management and maintenance system, and posted the project incomes and expenditures on walls. Therefore, the systems were accepted and implemented, and operated normally so far.

In terms of external communication, all the village cadres and villagers believed that “their abilities to earn external supports improved significantly.” However, after profound discussions, we found that most projects were not earned by their abilities, but more due to external supports to them. The villagers have significantly more chances to go out, and more external contacts. However, it could hardly be taken as attribution of the project.

(2) Impacts of Rehabilitation Project

In terms of influencing the government, implementation of the project promoted the government to change the name of the rehabilitation hospital to Ta’erti Village. It is not simply change of the name, but also indicated that the government confessed that they are not a group of sick people with potential social hazards, but a community unit instead. For the villagers, it is a great change, since the government has confessed that they are normal citizens, also poor villagers that need help, and opened a new road for their living and development.

In terms of influencing the society, the project staffs, including the county PMO staffs and NMA staffs often contact the villagers of Ta’erti Village, plus publicity in all aspects, which greatly promoted the society to know about and accept the healed patients. In the past, the villagers from other villages refused and discriminated against them, and kept them in an isolated state. However, their discrimination and refusal greatly reduced. Although few people from other villages actively visit Ta’erti Village nowadays, there is basically no obstacle for the villagers from Ta’erti Village to go out and deal with other people.

In terms of influencing the villagers, the project not only give them specific assistance, but also helped them establish self-confidence and development abilities, and laid a solid foundation for them to develop locally or go out for development.

(3) Influences of Schooling Aid Project

Senior Middle Girl Student Schooling Aid Project:

To solve the schooling difficulties of poor middle school students, since last year, the state provided regular supports, and granted each particularly poor senior middle school student with 1,500 RMB of state schooling grant. There have been hundreds of students from Yanyuan Middle School being granted every year. We may say that the government has basically solved this sharp problem in education field with policy. Except the state subsidizing the poor students, there are also some social donations. For example, the local employees of China Telecom donated to Yanyuan Middle School and granted 150 students from the three grades of senior middle school aids for schooling. Sichuan Provincial Government also released allowances to the ethnic minority students from remote areas lodging at the campus, which has presently covered more than 400 students from Yanyuan No. 1 Middle School. We can hardly tell how great the impacts of the project have on the government policies, but the project promotion is basically identical with the improvement of government policies in direction. With the schooling subsidy of the state and the lodging subsidies from Sichuan Province, the schooling issue of senior middle students, especially the poor girl students, have been generally and permanently solved.

The project also brought certain influences on the girl students' families. "The parents often had contradictions against the tuitions. With the financial aid from NMA, the parental relationship became more harmonious, and they no longer quarreled any more." "The parents bought TV sets with the money saved, which broadened their knowledge and opened their minds." After saying the girl students became successful with the project aids, "more parents changed their traditional mentality of boy preference, and they were more willing to send girls to school."

The project also created an air of transmitting love in Yanyuan No. 1 Middle School. Many students being financially aided and their students not only have the awareness of transmitting love, but also had specific actions. For example, after the great earthquake at Wenchuan, the students of the girls' class sponsored donation, which was warmly responded by the students in the entire school. The donation per capita in the girls' class was the highest in the school. Many girl students saved money from their limited allowances to help the earthquake-stricken victims.

Orphaned and handicapped children schooling aid project:

In terms of influencing the government, the project implementation promoted Yanyuan County to initiate and develop special education for the orphaned and handicapped children. Presently, the Yanyuan Nationality Primary School accepts handicapped children from all over the county, including deaf and dumb children, children with missing legs and arms, and orphans. Presently, the special education class has 11 deaf, dumb and slightly mentally retarded children, while the children with missing arms or legs are in the same classes as normal children. Simultaneously, due to promotion of the project, the school obtained 4.5 million RMB to construct the special education center, which further improved the teaching facilities of the school.

A new building will be put into use next February, by then, except Yanyuan County, the handicapped children from the neighboring counties will also study at Yanyuan Special Education Center.

In terms of influencing the society and the families, the parents did not care much about educating the handicapped children. Moreover, sending children to school in another place is burdensome, few orphaned and handicapped children could receive education. Now that there is project support, the family burdens eased, most handicapped children could go to school, and more families, including those from neighboring counties, also wished to send the orphaned children to school. This is promotional for the education rights of the orphaned and handicapped children. However, in the schools, tutored by the teachers, the normal children gradually turned from discriminating and excluding the handicapped children to accept and love them, and many of their behaviors moved the teachers. We may say that, after the Nationality Primary School has the class of orphaned and handicapped students, it well enhanced the loving education of the normal children. Moreover, the children influenced their parents and adults, the orphaned and handicapped children are better accepted by the society, and the phenomenon of discrimination and exclusion also greatly reduced. It in turn promoted the confidence of handicapped and disabled children to join the society. For example, many deaf and dumb children learn to write and dared to actively say hello to the teachers and other people by writing notes, and they could go shopping.

6.3 Institutional Impacts Level

The community development project has certain impacts on the development of all the communities, while the handicapped children schooling aid project and schooling aid project has certain impacts on the society and the government. However, from the perspective of the entire project, we failed to find that the project had any significant impacts on the cooperation agencies, the abilities and mentalities of the PMO staffs.

From the perspective of institutional management, the PMO is defined as an agency to implement the project instead of being a permanent organization. Therefore, we failed to see any vision, mission, strategic or any other long-term development plan of the organization. The management system is also worked out for project implementation, which is well operated and well accepted by PMO staffs, and the management is also effective. Capacity-building of the project staffs was mainly to conduct some training, learning tours and exchanges on the project, which had certain roles on improving awareness of the PMO staff and managing the project. However, we did not find any strategic plan or action for career development of the staff.

Mr. Gao, director of PMO believed that they had implemented projects before, the contents of which were almost the same as that of NMA, the working approaches were almost the same, too. The community working methods were slightly different,

with more chances to communicate closely with the villagers, but there was almost no influence on the organizations. Simultaneously, he believed that they had to submit proposals and budgets one to two years in advance in the NMA project, but the prices changed greatly, which was hardly controllable, resulting in great difficulties to implement some components. Moreover, the project application and implementation procedures were too complicated.

In the self-evaluation of the project staffs, although some people believed that their abilities somehow improved, while deeply discussing the specific improvements, they were mostly being “more familiar with” project procedures, cooperation agencies and management systems. They did not mention if there were any changes to their ways of doing things or thinking, or if there were any changes to the systems or operation of the PMO or other organizations.

In terms of financial management, due to limitation of time available, the evaluation group could not possibly conduct detailed investigation about the expenditures of the project activities. However, we had discussed with the PMO and checked their documents, and found that they had complete financial management system and operation procedures, and the application and use of funds were conducted as per the NMA requirements and budget. In the course of community investigation, we found that the community cadres were clear about the overall funds for the project activities, and acknowledged that such funds were used for project activities in the community. The evaluation group did not receive any complaint about the project funds not being put in place or being diverted to other purposes in the course of community investigation. We may say that the project funds arrived at the communities or used in project activities of the communities as scheduled. However, we also found in the course of evaluation that there were the following problems in the use of funds, mainly that the household-specific components were not totally aimed at the target groups. For example, most households with biogas tanks were not poor, and the village cadres willfully handed out the young walnut trees, some households got more, some got fewer. However, in general, the project funds were used in the corresponding project activities. The PMO honored the cooperation agreement with NMA on management of funds.

6.4 Impacts of the Project on Gender

1. Some project activities satisfied the actual needs of the women. For example, the construction of potable water components and water tanks not only met the domestic needs, but also liberated the women’s labors, since it was mostly the traditional responsibilities of the women to provide domestic water supply. The training component improved the technical skills of the women.
2. The girl schooling aid component not only provided the poor girl students with a chance to go to school, but also promoted the society and the government to care more about the girls’ education.

3. In terms of allocating and controlling the project resources, especially at the village level, it was mainly dominated by the village cadres, who were mostly male, and the women seldom had chance to participate in deciding public affairs. We failed to see significant effects of the project to this end. However, women from Erdaogou had significantly higher level of knowledge and care about the project. We may see that the community-oriented project process would be better for women to participate in community affairs.

7 Analysis and Discussion about Defects of the Project

7.1 Project being Dispersed and with Poor Integrity

- With many villages covered, mostly targeting at a few problems

Except Erdaogou Village implemented new components, all the other project villages implemented components against a few particular issues in the village, for example, going to doctors or schools. Or we may say that although the projects solved a few problems, the project villages still have many other problems, such as difficult access to potable water supply, irrigation and fuels, etc. Simultaneously, separately solving problems of different villages also increased the management and monitoring costs for the project.

- No comprehensive development ideas available for old project locations

This is due to the abovementioned components being disintegrated. Most project villages targeted at a few particular issues, and without overall considerations for the overall development of the project villages. Except Erdaogou, the other villages not only lacked of diversified projects, but more importantly, the project did not make sufficient investments in such “soft powers” as community capacity building and institutional construction of community, most of the training components targeted at technical needs, or stressing or promoting the farmers to improve their autonomous development awareness or abilities by adopting participatory approach. This resulted in that the communities still would have to rely on external supports and management for future development, without forming the functions of autonomous blood generation and autonomous development.

- Household-specific components had very low coverage

Except such components as education and public health with extensive coverage to

the farmers in the village, the components specific to villagers' groups or households had low coverage, which could solve the problems of but one or two villagers' groups or a few households. It is particularly noteworthy that the household-specific components, such as water ponds, bio-gas tank and planting walnuts, only covered a few households, without any arrangement for the households who intended to get such components. The early birds get the worm, the timid and watching people would not have a chance, and they were unfortunately the poorer and more advantageous farmers.

- Demonstrative components failed to be demonstrative

As an aid project of NGO, it is expected that the other farmers could also be brought to benefit through demonstration, or the government might be brought to invest resources in expanding the beneficiary coverage. However, it is one of the critical factors for achieving demonstrative effects to clarify who would be the demonstration objects.

Ought it to demonstrate to the government, the demonstration components must be somehow innovative, i.e., they must be components that the government had never implemented or the methods the government had never used before. Simultaneously, the components must be up to a certain scale, such as implementing in the entire village with good overall effects. Only by doing so could the government and the society pay attention to them, and only by doing so could it be possible to gradually change the government practices and play the demonstrative role. However, the components implemented by NMA were also implemented by the government before, such as the bio-gas component, water tank component and planting component. Moreover, the components implemented were small in scale, without innovation in approaches. Therefore, the components did not have demonstrative effect on the government.

Ought it to demonstrate to the farmers, except the orientation and applicability of the components, selection of demonstration households would be very important. The better-off farmers could easily accept and implement the components, and could succeed easily. However, the demonstrative effects would be limited, since the other farmers might believe that "he could do it because his family is better off". If the project starts from households with poorer conditions, once they succeed, it would be easy to demonstrate, and the other farmers may believe "his family could not, our family could also do it." Most of the demonstrative projects now are led by village cadres and capable people, and even if they are successful, they could hardly be demonstrative to others. Moreover, the farmers who did not get the components were unhappy with the village cadres, since the demonstrative components could bring them with more subsidies. If certain new components are implemented, most farmers would not dare to try due to insufficient understanding, and they would not be willing

to implement the components. Under such circumstances, it would be okay for the village cadres to start experimentation. However, there should be subsequent follow-up components, once more people are willing to try implementing the components, how to select more disadvantaged farmers and support them to implement the components. Otherwise, if it stays at the level of demonstrating by the village cadres, it would not work.

7.2 Insufficient Communication Affected Project Effects

Firstly, NMA did not have sufficient communication with the government. While implementing the school component, they did not well understand if some schools were canceled or not, which resulted in some schools being canceled and wasted. Of course, it might be caused by unforeseeable policies. However, merging schools had started ten years ago. Although there have always been different opinions on whether it is beneficial to merge schools, the government has never changed the practice of merging school. If NMA and the government communicated better, such circumstances could have been avoided.

Secondly, the villagers' group cadres had insufficient communication with the villagers. Transparency level of some information, such as how the project funds were spent, how the demonstrative households were selected, was not high, which resulted in the villagers did not understand the components or they had weak sense of ownership over the project.

7.3 Community Development Projects had Insufficient Care about Environmental Issues

Yanyuan County and even the entire Liangshan Region are environmentally fragile areas. The project is mainly aimed at community development, at the missing local environmental protection components. Although the bio-gas components could reduce forest logging, since the total number of bio-gas tanks is limited, the environmental protection effects are also limited.

7.4 Continuity and Expansion of Projects Aiding Handicapped People being Difficult

With the support of NMA, the special children's education component achieved very good effects and impacts, and the government also invested in building the special education center as the base for the handicapped children to study. However, there are still some difficulties for the center to be functional. Firstly, there were not enough teachers for special education. Except the existing teachers, no additional teacher has been hired, and it is hard attract such special education teachers to work here.

Secondly, after the financially aided primary school students graduate, they still could hardly melt into the society. It is still an issue for these special graduates who have finished primary school education to continue schooling and successfully melt into the society.

7.5 Lack of Means to Inspire Autonomous Development of Communities

The project was basically implemented by the traditional means of top downward in allocating resources, in which the farmers were passive beneficiaries, without sufficient actions of active participation. Simultaneously, the project designers failed to adequately consider the negative impacts of allocating the insufficient resources, which resulted in that the pilot components being fruitful and accepted by the farmers, there were no more continuous supports from the project. Moreover, in the household-specific components, the transparency level of selecting beneficiary households was not high. It was more often the village cadres or the people close to the village cadres (relatives or elites) had access to the components, without preference to the disadvantageous groups. It affected the equity of the project. Of course, most components were public ones benefiting the collective, so the overall equity was not affected.

On the other hand, subsequent management and maintenance of most components was not in place or sufficiently understood, and there was basically no complete subsequent management and maintenance plan. In terms of understanding, it is still mainly to rely on the village cadres to undertake the management and maintenance duties, while the funds for management and maintenance still rely on continuous supports from the outside world, which is manifested in the communities' poor sense of ownership.

7.6 Insufficient Summary and Publicity

Although the project has some defects, which are seen under high standards, it still achieved some very good experiences. Such experiences include “bring the poor to shake off poverty by grasping critical issues”, “socialized services for subsequent maintenance of bio-gas,” “help special groups to melt into the society”, etc. Any theme could be summarized and shared, but there was no systematic summary in the evaluation, and these good experiences were not publicized, which was truly a pity.

8 Comprehensive Conclusions

8.1 Community Development Projects

Except a few particular education components, most project activities played great roles on solving the specific difficulties of the community. The project is generally speaking effective, and some projects have significant effects, such as the comprehensive development component at Erdaogou, and the potable water component at Beishan. From the perspective of a higher level, or from the perspective of sustainable development of the community, the projects are sparsely spread out with poor synergy, and also lack of design for sustainable development. Therefore, the project was insufficient in capacity building and social assets construction of the communities. Most community project activities were generally close to the “blood-transmitting” means of poverty alleviation, with poor sustainability. Once the project was withdrawn, even if there were new investments, they still would rely on outsiders to organize the implementation.

However, the new project location of Erdaogou made great progress in project design and means of implementation, which laid primary foundation for sustainable development. The new project location of Erdaogou made great progress in project design and means of implementation, and the greatest change lied in that the farmers became the principal of the project process, who dominated the project direction and process. Simultaneously, they had higher sense of ownership over the project, the Community Development and Management Committee was better accepted by the farmers, and their organizational abilities were fostered. If there are new project activities, the communities will have the implementation abilities and coordination system in place, and such changes laid a preliminary foundation for sustainable development of the communities. Once the project is withdrawn, the community will still have a lot of needs and difficulties. However, if there are new investments, the community already has preliminary abilities to autonomously organize and manage the project activities, and they could plan and implement the project activities.

On the other hand, the impacts of the community projects are limited to the communities, with limited impacts on the government, the society and the PMO.

8.2 Ta’erti Rehabilitation Project

The project promoted a special group of people who had been sick and isolated from the world to have access to all kinds of resources or rights, so that they could join normal communities, and gradually join the normal society. The project promoted the government to change policies, restore and establish the society’s acceptance of the local people and the villagers’ self-confidence, and the project is very successful.

Simultaneously, reinforcement of the achievements need further supports from the government.

8.3 Girls, Orphaned and Handicapped Child School Aiding Project

The project focused on the most disadvantageous orphaned and handicapped children and the most difficult senior middle school stage of poor girl students, the project design is highly oriented. The project implementation effects were well accepted by the government, the school, the students and their parents. Fortunately, the project promoted the establishment of Yanyuan County Special Education Center, and also linked with the “state schooling aid” policy of the state for the poor senior middle school students. The government policies and actions provided guarantee for sustainable operation of the project in future.

9 Suggestions

9.1 Suggestions for Norwegian Missionary Alliance

- In terms of community development project, it is to consolidate and improve the achievements of project at Erdaogou, and extend the community project for 2 – 3 years. In terms of implementation means, it is to continue the mode of autonomous development led by the farmers, and improve the farmer’s autonomous development awareness and autonomous management abilities through participatory project process. Simultaneously, it is to lead the farmers to care about the environment and the poorest groups. This will be a good example for sustainability of the relocation settlement projects of the government.
- In terms of orphaned and handicapped children schooling aid project, the government has undertaken more responsibilities and obligations. It is suggested that the NMA to further support the special education center, mainly help the center train a few special education teachers.
- For Ta’erti Village, it is suggested to promote the establishment of “Community Service Center for Orphaned and Handicapped People” for widowed and orphaned people, which is to specially provide the widowed and disabled old people and orphans in the communities with nurse and human care services. The construction funds are to be supported by NMA, while the operation funds will be jointly born by the minimum social security funds and profits of village funds, and the insufficient funds will be supported by other projects. The project will support students to study

medicine and return to the village for operation of the center. Simultaneously, it is suggested to conduct leadership skill training to the community cadres of the village, and promote subsequent poverty alleviation resources (including government resources and other poverty alleviation resources) to enter the community, so that it could function more effectively.

- In the longer term, if NMA regards supporting the special groups as the strategic objective, it is suggested that NMA is to focus on linking fundamental education of these special groups to occupational education, help them successfully finish fundamental education, and then have access to occupational technical education. In this way, the handicapped children with potentials could become successful people instead of social burdens.
- In terms of sustainability of community development projects, we must establish the farmer-orientation awareness, and hand over the project orientation right to the community from project planning, together with project responsibilities. The responsibility of the PMO is to keep reminding and assisting the farmers and community organizations to finish the project works by themselves. The PMO still needed to promptly help the community analyze and finish the work difficulties and try to help the community improve their abilities. Based on improving the community abilities and completing the project work, it is to lay a sustainable foundation. This is a slow and repeated process, but it is necessary. On the other hand, if we plan and implement the projects on behalf of the communities, it would be efficient and quickly see the effects. However, it would make the communities mentally and physically depend on outsiders, and the communities will not have the abilities or awareness to sustain the project results.

9.2 Suggestions for the Local Government

- It is to summarize the experiences obtained from cooperation in the NMA projects, publicize project results, and serve as the foundation for implementing other poverty alleviation projects.
- The poor senior middle school students have presently been supported by the government and the society, which filled in a great education gap. However, there is not a complete system in place to guarantee transparent and open distribution of such resources. It is suggested that the government and the education department should promote establishment and improvement of such a system, which will not only guarantee that the

most needed poor students could be supported, but also promote social understandings and supports. Only in this way can we get more social supports for more poor students.

- Operation of the special education center mainly relies on the special teachers. It is to suggest the government to actively cooperate with NMA, the government will give jobs for the special teachers, while NMA provide supports for training, so that the special education centers will become functional, and benefit the special children in Yanyuan and the neighboring counties. Simultaneously, it is to keep Ta'erti Primary School, and lay a foundation for guaranteeing that the special students could successful transit to normal education.
- It is to realize full coverage of minimum social security for the widowed and disabled old people and children at such places as Ta'erti, and guarantee the basic living and service needs of such special groups.

—— End ——

Revised on January 20, 2012.