

# Country Report for Ethiopia

**Joint Evaluation of the Trust Fund for Environmentally  
and Socially Sustainable Development (TFESSD)**

**Evaluation report 2/2008**



**Norad**

*Norwegian Agency for  
Development Cooperation*  
P.O.Box 8034 Dep, NO-0030 Oslo  
Ruseløkkveien 26, Oslo, Norway

Phone: +47 22 24 20 30

Fax: +47 22 24 20 31

Layout and Print: Lobo Media AS, Oslo  
ISBN: 978-82-7548-288-2

**Department for Development Policy**

*Ministry for Foreign Affairs*  
Po Box 176, 00161 Helsinki

Visiting address:

Katajanokanlaituri 3, 00160 Helsinki

# **Country Report for Ethiopia**

**Joint Evaluation of the Trust Fund for Environmentally  
and Socially Sustainable Development (TFESSD)**

**Evaluation report 2/2008**

Dr. Tom Dahl-Østergaard

Dr. Maimuna Nalubega

COWI AS, Denmark



# Contents

<b>Abbreviations</b>	6
<b>Executive Summary</b>	7
<b>1 Introduction</b>	8
1.1 Objectives of the country case study	8
1.2 Methodology	8
1.3 Limitations	8
<b>2 Background</b>	9
2.1 Country context	9
2.2 Bank country programme / operations (environmental, poverty and social contexts)	10
2.3 Overview of in-country TFESSD activities / projects	12
<b>3 Assessment of TFESSD Influence</b>	14
3.1 Relevance of TF activities	14
3.2 Effectiveness of the TF activities	16
3.3 Results/influence from TF activities	18
<b>4 Conclusions and Lessons Learned</b>	21
4.1 Conclusions	21
4.2 Major lessons from Ethiopia case study	21

## Table of Appendices

<b>Appendix I: Programme of Meetings</b>	22
<b>Appendix II: List of References</b>	24

## Abbreviations

<b>Term</b>	<b>Meaning</b>
CAS	Country Assistance Strategy
SDPRP	Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Programme
IDA	International Development Association
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
DHS	Demographic and Health Survey
LSMS	Living Standards Measurement Study
GRM	Grant Reporting and Monitoring Report
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HDI	Human Development Index
IMF	International Monetary Fund
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
NGO	Non-governmental Organisations
PASDEP	Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty
DFID	Department for International Development
PSNP	Productive Safety Net Program
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
FY	Financial year
PSCAP	Public Sector Capacity Building Programme
SD	Social Development
SM	Sector Manager
TF	Trust Fund
TFESSD	Trust Fund for Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development
TM	Task Manager
TTL	Task Team Leader
UN	United Nations
USD	United States Dollar
WB	World Bank
WDR	World Development Report

## Executive Summary

This report presents the findings and conclusions of the TFESSD evaluation case study on Ethiopia. The case study seeks to assess the influence of trust fund activities in Ethiopia on World Bank products and country level policies and projects.

Two members of the evaluation team worked in Addis Ababa over the period 24-28 September 2007. Stakeholders from seven out of the total of thirteen TFESSD activities in Ethiopia were available for meetings. It turned out, however, that most of the seven activities that were discussed with stakeholders in Ethiopia had started implementation only recently and disbursements from the TFESSD were limited or had not yet commenced. To some extent, this was a limitation to what could be derived from this case study. In addition, the evaluation team interviewed TTLs and focal persons at the Country Office in Addis Ababa, government officials, donors, beneficiaries and consultants involved in the activities funded by the TFESSD.

It is the overall conclusion of the evaluation team that the TFESSD activities in Ethiopia have been relevant and that there are indications that they will achieve a reasonable degree of goal fulfilment. There are also several examples of influence from the TFESSD activities, especially on World Bank operations in the country and on the government sector development programmes they link into. Whether this also leads to influence on general World Bank policies and procedures is more uncertain, and beyond the scope of this country case study.

One of the major findings of the Ethiopia case study is the close linkage between many of the TFESSD activities and ongoing World Bank operations. This implies that the principal locus of influence of these activities is the Bank's own operations in Ethiopia (and other countries involved in those activities that have regional scope). And, since Bank operations are increasingly implemented as harmonised multi-donor activities in support of government sector development programmes, the potential influence is much broader.

Whether the influence at country-level is eventually scaled-up to become general World Bank policies or procedures depend on many factors that are beyond the power of the Trust Fund. Overall, given the time-lag involved in this and the complications in establishing causality, the real influence of the TFESSD on World Bank policies and procedures is extremely difficult to ascertain.

The Ethiopia case study raises the question of whether the work funded by several of the TFESSD activities could have been done by the stakeholders in the larger government sector development programmes that they are often linked to, without the contribution from the Trust Fund. In some cases, this might have been possible. However, the existence of the Trust Fund has allowed stakeholders to pursue innovative approaches and solutions that they might not have been able to in the absence of the TFESSD.

# 1 Introduction

This report presents the findings and conclusions of the evaluation of the Trust Fund for Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (TFESSD) country case study on Ethiopia. Ethiopia constitutes the second largest beneficiary country of TFESSD support for single and multi-country activities in Africa. No other country has been involved in as many (13) TFESSD activities as Ethiopia.

Two similar country case studies were undertaken on Indonesia and Zambia by other team members.

## 1.1 Objectives of the country case study

The Norwegian and Finnish governments have initiated an evaluation of the TFESSD to examine the influence of the trust fund on World Bank policies and procedures. The country case studies seek to assess the influence of the trust fund thematic activities on Bank products and at country level policies and projects. This entails determining *whether* TFESSD has achieved its objectives at the country level and *how* the influence was achieved or not.

## 1.2 Methodology

An evaluation team consisting of Dr. Tom Dahl-Østergaard (country team leader, COWI, Denmark) and Dr. Maimuna Nalubega (freelance consultant, Uganda) fielded a mission to Ethiopia over the period 24-28 September 2007. They conducted semi-structured interviews with World Bank Country Office TTLs and focal persons, government officials, beneficiaries and consultants involved in the activities funded by the TFESSD in Ethiopia, and had meetings with the embassies of Finland and Norway (see Appendix 1). Before departing from Ethiopia, an informal debriefing was made with the Lead Operations Officer in charge with the coordination of the TFESSD.

Prior to the mission to Ethiopia, the evaluation team examined the available documentation on the activities funded by the trust fund. After the mission, further analysis of the documentation was made.

Stakeholders from seven out of the total of thirteen TFESSD activities in Ethiopia were available for meetings with the evaluation team. This report is, therefore, based mainly on these activities (see Section 3.3 below).

## 1.3 Limitations

Very few meetings were held on each activity and there was little or no opportunity for follow up meetings (see programme of meetings, Appendix 1). Most respondents outside the Country Office found it difficult to separate the activities funded by the TFESSD from the larger programmatic contexts in which many of the activities are implemented. Furthermore, as most of the seven activities that were discussed with stakeholders in Ethiopia had started implementation only recently, disbursements from the TFESSD were limited or had not yet commenced (see table in Section 3.3). Consequently, the implementation of concrete activities under the TFESSD was also rather limited.

This led the evaluation team to conclude that the evidence basis on most of the individual trust funded activities was too limited to draw firm conclusions. Despite the above, when taken together as a whole, there are sufficient indications of both recorded and likely relevance, effectiveness and influence for the evaluation team to advance some well-founded observations.



## 2 Background

### 2.1 Country context

Ethiopia is the second most populous country in Sub-Saharan Africa. Its population is estimated at 76.5 million. One of the world's oldest continuous civilizations, Ethiopia is also one of the world's poorest. At USD160, Ethiopia's per capita GDP is less than quarter of the Sub-Sahara Africa average.<sup>1</sup>

#### 2.1.1 Economic background

In 2005/06, Ethiopia maintained a third consecutive year of high, broad-based growth, thanks to a combination of a sustained high agriculture performance and higher and more diversified exports. Government reported broad-based high real GDP growth of 9.6 percent, following 10.5 percent growth in 2004/05, and an 11.9 percent rebound in 2003/04 after a severe drought. The IMF expects GDP growth of about 10 percent in 2006/07.

With the boom has come inflation, which needs to be managed consistently with growth objectives. The official inflation rate reached 12.3% in 2006, up from 8.6% in 2005. Exports grew at a 21 percent rate in 2006, but imports increased 22 percent from a larger base, leading to a widening of the balance of payments deficit and a reduction in foreign reserves.

While public revenues have shown strong growth, expenditures rose faster, resulting in a small increase in the fiscal deficit (from 5% of GDP in 2004/05 to 5.3% of GDP in 2005/06). Fiscal policy in 2005/06 was marked by a rapid adjustment to two significant shocks: reduced budget support (slashing the expected US\$400 million to about US\$150 million) following the 2005 elections, and the shortage of foreign exchange, partly due to the high oil import bill. The share of pro-poor spending in the budget continued to rise, and in 2005/06 accounted for almost two-thirds of expenditure, while defence dropped from 3.1 to 2.6% of GDP.

#### 2.1.2 Political background

The federal constitution divides the country into nine states and two municipalities, primarily on the basis of ethnicity, although none of the regions is entirely homogenous and some have considerable diversity. The government recognises 64 distinct ethnic groups.<sup>2</sup>

The first openly contested elections in Ethiopia's history were held peacefully in May 2005. Official results showed a victory for the ruling party, but large gains for the opposition, especially in the capital of Addis Ababa. Observers noted electoral irregularities, while the opposition claimed victory. Large demonstrations in June and November 2005 resulted in loss of life and mass arrests of demonstrators, journalists, and opposition leaders. Leaders of the main opposition party, the Coalition for Unity and Democracy, as well as others detained in relations to the political unrest were released from prison in July 2007.

While the tensions that arose after the May 2005 elections have not disappeared, the government has been making steady progress on the governance agenda.

The government's recently completed second Poverty Reduction Strategy (called the Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty, or PASDEP) now includes enhanced plans over the medium-term to accelerate local empowerment and increase transparency and accountability.

With the support of the Protection of Basic Services Project, the government is following through on its commitment to avoid political bias in providing basic services, improve local accountability (e.g., posting local government budgets in public places, unprecedented

---

<sup>1</sup> Where no other source is indicated, this background section is based on *Country Brief on Ethiopia*: [www.worldbank.org](http://www.worldbank.org).

<sup>2</sup> *Ethiopia Country Profile 2007*, Economist Intelligence Unit, p.16.

disclosure of budget information on the government website, establishment of a Parliamentary Public Accounts Committee chaired by the Opposition); strengthen fiduciary standards (audits, procurement, financial management, and fiscal reporting); and continue to devote an increasing share of expenditures to pro-poor services.

### **2.1.3 Socio-economic context**

The population grew by 2.2% a year in 1990-2004, and is expected to grow by 2.9% a year in 2004-20. With 84% of the population living in rural areas, the provision of health services is a major challenge. Spending on health has picked up in absolute terms under the government's anti-poverty drive, but total annual health expenditure was only USD 5 per person in 2003, compared with an average of USD 36 per person for Sub-Saharan Africa as a whole. The poor level of health provision is reflected by the low life expectancy at birth at just 42 years in 2004.<sup>3</sup>

Since 1991, there has been significant progress in key human development indicators: Primary school enrolments have more than doubled, child mortality has almost been cut in half, and the number of people with access to clean water has nearly doubled. More recently, poverty reduction has accelerated. The poverty headcount, which stood at 46 percent in 1996 and 44 percent in 2000, fell to 39 percent in 2005.

These gains, together with more recent moves to strengthen the fight against malaria, paint a picture of improved well-being in Ethiopia. Notwithstanding the progress in critical aspects of human development, Ethiopia is a long way from achieving the MDGs by 2015, given the country's very low starting point.

Ethiopia's human development index (HDI) is 0.371, which gives Ethiopia a rank of 170th out of 177 countries with data.<sup>4</sup>

## **2.2 Bank country programme/operations (environmental, poverty and social contexts)**

Ethiopia is one of the largest beneficiaries of the World Bank's concessional lending program, the International Development Association (IDA). As of 30 June 2007 the portfolio comprised 22 active projects worth over USD 2.2 billion of which USD 1.5 billion is provided as Credit and the remaining 700 million is provided as Grant.

The World Bank Country Office in Addis Ababa is one of the largest in the continent of Africa with over 80 staff members.

The World Bank's Country Programme for Ethiopia is guided by the Country Assistance Strategy (CAS). The last CAS (FY03-FY05) was based on Ethiopia's Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Program (SDPRP as the PRSP is known). The overarching objective of the SDPRP was to reduce poverty by enhancing rapid economic growth while at the same time maintaining macro-economic stability. The SDPRP was built on four pillars: (i) *agricultural development-led industrialization (ADLI) and food security*, (ii) *governance, decentralization, and empowerment*, (iii) *reform of the justice system and the civil service*, and (iv) *capacity building*. In addition, key sectoral measures and cross-cutting issues in the areas of HIV/AIDS, private sector development and trade, education, health, roads, water and sanitation, and gender were included.

The CAS organized the World Bank's support to the four pillars in Ethiopia's SDPRP through three inter-related themes: (i) *enhancing pro-poor growth*, (ii) *enhancing human development outcomes by improving governance*, and (iii) *reducing vulnerability*. It is worth noting that the SDPRP pillars and the Bank's themes are related to the windows of the TFESSD.

The Bank is now implementing an Interim CAS (ICAS; FY06-FY07), based on Ethiopia's Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP; successor of SDPRP). The PASDEP reflects a consensus that pro-poor growth is a fundamental priority.

---

3 *Ethiopia Country Profile 2007*. Economist Intelligence Unit, p.17.

4 UNDP, Human Development Report 2006. *Human Development Indicators: Country Fact Sheets, Ethiopia*.

The Interim CAS focuses on both good governance and growth as the central underpinnings of the Bank’s support to Ethiopia. Working together with donor partners, the Bank’s overarching objective in the Interim CAS is to support Government in developing and implementing, in consultation with citizens, a strengthened program of institution building and governance reform that will help in its efforts to accelerate pro-poor growth. To achieve this objective, the Bank is supporting ways that strengthen good governance and growth in: (i) “core-governance” - public administration, decentralization, and public financial management, (ii) the provision of basic services in a fair and accountable way, (iii) the promotion of free enterprise, (iv) improved agricultural productivity, and (v) the development of infrastructure to nurture the growth of small towns and growth corridors.

In general, the CAS support draws on synergies from a blend of instruments: lending products, including budget support, sector programs and projects that provide crucial capital investment funds to federal, regional, and local governments for rehabilitating and creating new infrastructure and services; knowledge-based services, including World Bank Institute activities; and leveraging development partners in the context of harmonization.

The SDPRP and CAS goals, and their relevance to the environment (E), poverty (P) and social (S) windows of the TFESSD are presented in the following table:

<b>CAS Theme</b>	<b>SDPRP/CAS Goal</b>	<b>Window</b>
1. Enhancing Pro-Poor Growth	Accelerating rural growth	E, P, S
	Fostering Enabling Environment for urban growth	E, P, S
	Support development of financial markets	P
	Promoting rapid growth of exports	P
	Ensuring a continued stable macroeconomic framework	P
2. Enhancing Human Development Outcomes By Improving Governance	Improving delivery of health services	P, S
	Expand access to health services	P, S
	Improve access to clean water supply and sanitation	E, P, S,
	Supporting the reform of public sector systems	P
	Deepening and strengthening decentralization	P, S
	Empowering civil society	E, P, S
3. Reducing vulnerability	Improving food aid delivery and other safety net programs	P, S
	Reducing vulnerability to terms of trade shocks	P, S
	Mitigating and reducing risks in vulnerable areas	E, P, S
	Enhancing programs to fight against HIV/AIDS	P, S
	Increased attention to environmental issues	E

## 2.3 Overview of in-country TFESSD activities/projects

#	TF#	TTL/HQ	TTL/CO	Description	Amount of USD for entire TF activity including Ethiopia	Disbursed January 2007	Remark	Window	Typology
1	TF052779	Abel Lufafa	Jeeva P-Essex	ET - Soil Degradation Study	1.520.000	1.191.244	Completed	Environment	Regional macro
2	TF055675	William Wiseman	Trina Haque/ Endeshaw Tadesse	ET - Productive Safety Nets	153.000	25.191	Ongoing	Social Protection	Country macro
3	TF053858	Djordjija Petkoski		Mult-Stakeholder Partnership for Sustainable Development Program Staff Delivery	155.000	102.577	Ongoing	Environment	Country sector
4	TF055856	Nora Dudwick	Berhanu Legesse/ Elsa Araya	Making the Connection Poverty Reduction and Empowerment	298.040	14.656	Ongoing	Poverty	Global macro
5	TF057347	& Nicholas Perrin	Jeeva P-Essex	Mobilizing Rural Institution	600.000	-	Ongoing	Social Development	Global sector
6	TF057191	Carolyn Winter	Trina Haque/ Endeshaw Tadesse	Country to Country Technical Alliance on Social Accountability	200.000	-	No activity in Ethiopia	Social Development	Country sector
7	TF057147	Klaus Deininger	Jeeva P-Essex	Land Tenure	140.000	65.906	Ongoing	Environment	Country sector
8	TF057612	Magdi Amin	Menbere Taye	ET-Tourism	100.000	-	Forthcoming	Environment	Country sector
9	TF057289	Valerie Kozel/ Caterina L'Aderich	Jemal Mohammed	Destitution and Risk	267.000	-	Ongoing	Poverty	Global macro
10	TF057213	Ajay Kumar	Yoshimichi Kaeasumi	Complementary Support to CDD	300.000	25.991	Ongoing	Social Development	Regional sector
11	TF050420	Eyerusalem Fasika	Eyerusalem Fasika	Public Expenditure Review	60.000	53.091	Completed	Poverty	Country macro
12	TF090528	Chritope Crepin	Jeeva P-Essex	Institutional Preparedness for Managing Natural Hazards & Environment	-	-	Nothing happened	Environment	Regional sector
13	TF051976	Carolyn Winter		Empowering Civil Society	295.000	274.231	Completed	Poverty	Country sector
Total budget and disbursements					4.088.040	1.752.887			

The above table provides a comprehensive overview of the activities funded by the TFESSD in Ethiopia. A total of 13 separate activities have been initiated, although one of these (TF090528) was dropped since it did not take off and another (TF057191) ended up never having activities in Ethiopia. Of the remaining 11 activities, the status of implementation is the following: completed 3, ongoing 7, and forthcoming 1. The seven activities on which the evaluation team had meetings with stakeholders in Ethiopia are marked with grey background.

The following tables show the distribution of the 11 activities among the four windows of the Trust Fund and according to the typology devised by the evaluation team:

Window	Number of activities
Environment	4
Poverty	4
Social Development	2
Social Protection	1

<b>Typology<sup>5</sup></b>	<b>Number of activities</b>
Global macro	2
Global sector	1
Regional macro	1
Regional sector	1
Country macro	2
Country sector	4

The distribution of TFESSD activities among the four windows corresponds fairly well to the global shares going to each of the windows. The shares of activities categorised as respectively global, regional and country support one of the key findings of the evaluation team, namely that most activities are closely linked to ongoing World Bank supported programmes and projects in Ethiopia.

The overview table shows that although USD 4,088,040 has been allocated to TFESSD activities that include work in Ethiopia, only USD 1,752,887 had been disbursed to these activities by January 2007. As the budget amounts indicated in the overview table include funds to be spent in other countries (for global and regional activities), the real level of spending in Ethiopia is much less than USD 1.7 million. Moreover, as some of these activities go back several years, the annual level of spending by the TFESSD in Ethiopia is rather insignificant compared with the regular lending activities of the World Bank.

---

<sup>5</sup> For details on the typology of projects applied in the evaluation of the TFESSD, please see the main synthesis report.

## 3 Assessment of TFESSD Influence

### 3.1 Relevance of TF activities

According to the OECD/DAC evaluation criteria, relevance is defined as the extent to which activities are suited to the priorities and policies of the target group, recipient and the donor. The assessment of the relevance of the TFESSD activities therefore falls into several parts.

#### 3.1.1 Relevance to the World Bank

Since the entry point for the country case study is what happens in Ethiopia, the relevance at country level is more tangible than the relevance of the TFESSD activities to the World Bank's regional and global operations.

At the country level, one would expect that the TFESSD activities in Ethiopia are relevant to the objectives of the Country Assistance Strategy (CAS), or that TF activities will be mainstreamed into the CAS. The Grant Reporting and Monitoring Reports (GRM) that were available to the evaluation team for almost all of the TFESSD activities give an indication to what extent this is the case. The format of the GRM actually includes a specific question as to whether "activities will be mainstreamed into CAS, PRSP, sector strategies, etc." But, since this formulation lumps many issues into one question, only slightly less than half of the GRMs make explicit reference to the CAS (claiming to be supportive of or in line with this).

Another way to gauge the degree of relevance in relation to the CAS is to look at where the initiative to launch TFESSD activities comes from. All staff members at the Country Office who were interviewed by the evaluation team indicated that the initiative nearly always came from Washington. Some of the country based staff members actually argued for greater opportunities to make applications for TFESSD activities that were more specifically designed to support the CAS or to influence this in new directions. They felt that Washington had the upper hand in deciding what TFESSD activities should address, and that it was their demands that won the way.

It follows from the above, and it was the clear impression of the evaluation team, that there was limited ownership for the TFESSD activities among country based staff members. Prior to the first contacts with the Country Office concerning the present evaluation, it is doubtful that anyone at the World Bank in Addis Ababa had an exact overview of how many activities the trust fund had funded in Ethiopia and what they were. In fact, some of the staff members told the evaluation team that they did not have any lists of these activities before the evaluation. On the other hand, the limited ownership by the World Bank in Addis Ababa does not mean that the TFESSD activities are not relevant to its staff.

As shown above, the majority of TFESSD activities in Ethiopia are of the type "country sector" or "country macro." Intuitively, one would expect the country focused projects to be of higher relevance to country level World Bank operations than trust fund activities with a regional or global orientation. Thus, given the claim that most TFESSD activities are the result of demands from Washington, it is interesting that so many TF activities were closely linked to ongoing World Bank operations in Ethiopia. This, in turn, suggests a high degree of relevance between these TFESSD activities and the ongoing Bank operations in question.

One of the TFESSD activities, where the evaluation team found one of the highest degrees of relevance, may illustrate the point. Activities under TF055675 are developing "graduation benchmarks" to support the implementation of the *Productive Safety Net Program (PSNP)*. The PSNP aims to shift Ethiopia from dependence on food aid for humanitarian relief, towards a development-oriented largely cash-based safety net system that is both growth-enhancing and effective in the social protection of chronically food insecure households. The PSNP is supported by the World Bank (USD 220 millions) and five other donors, with total

annual funding in the region of USD 250 millions. With a budget of USD 153,000, TF05565 is small compared with the program to which it is linked. Nevertheless, according to one of the country based World Bank staff members, the research financed by the TFESSD is both strategic and timely. This assessment was echoed by other respondents consulted by the evaluation team. But this trust fund activity still appears essentially as an add-on to the larger engagement of the World Bank in the PSNP.

Overall, it is the assessment of the evaluation team that TFESSD activities that are closely linked to Bank operations in Ethiopia are principally relevant to these (and the World Bank staff members who are most directly involved), whereas TFESSD activities more of the “stand alone” type, i.e. without firm roots in a given country or without close operational links, tend to be more relevant to the staff members in Washington who promote such TFESSD activities.

### **3.1.2 Relevance to the Government of Ethiopia**

While the evaluation team had separate interviews with officials from three different federal government ministries, no one was in a position to assess the overall level of relevance to the Government of the TFESSD activities in Ethiopia. Their awareness of the TFESSD activities, and the difficulties involved in separating these from the larger (often multi-donor funded) programmes, whereto the TFESSD activities are often linked, makes this an impossible task.

Turning again to the GRM reports on the TFESSD activities in Ethiopia, the evaluation team found that more than half of them made explicit reference to how the activities linked up positively with the PRSP, or as it is called in Ethiopia, the Program for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP). Furthermore, all of the TFESSD activities reviewed by the evaluation team were in line with the broad objectives of the TFESSD.

Another indication of relevance to the Government of Ethiopia is the close linkage between many of the TFESSD activities and specific government sector development programmes. The following TFESSD activities all support, each in their own different ways, government sector development programmes of high priority:

- *TF055675 (Productive Safety Nets Program)*
- *TF055856 (Monitoring Empowerment in Four Countries/Woreda City Benchmarking Survey)*
- *TF057347 (Mobilizing Rural Institutions)*
- *TF057147 (Sustainable Land Management and Tenure Security).*

Altogether the evaluation team finds that most, if not all, the TFESSD activities are likely to be relevant to the Government of Ethiopia.

### **3.1.3 Relevance to beneficiaries**

Owing to the close linkage between some of the TFESSD activities, in particular the ones highlighted above, and government sector development programmes that are fully in line with the PASDEP, it is logical that a large number of citizens in Ethiopia stand to gain from the improvements the TFESSD activities can introduce to the respective sector development programmes.

Many of the TFESSD activities are also relevant to the research community, both within Ethiopia and beyond. *TF057289 (Addressing Extreme Poverty in Low Income Countries/ Destitution and Risk)* exemplifies a case where a “global macro” type TFESSD activity has plugged into a long-standing Ethiopia-based anthropological research project. This TFESSD activity also links up with similar research in Nicaragua and India. The TTL on this activity has managed to mobilize the interest and commitment of the national researchers in each of these countries to work towards the commonly defined objectives of the TFESSD activity. In Ethiopia, this involves developing a better understanding of factors causing destitution, its dynamics, as well as mechanism to cope with destitution and risk. There is no question that this TFESSD activity is highly relevant to all the researchers involved in each country.

### **3.1.4 Relevance to donors**

It was the expectation and hope when the TFESSD was established that it would also promote the involvement of research institutions in Norway (and later also Finland) in the activities financed by the trust fund. The evaluation team found evidence of such collaboration in two of the activities, namely *TF057147 (Sustainable Land Management and Tenure Security)*, which works closely with the Norwegian University of Life Sciences; and *TF057289 (Addressing Extreme Poverty in Low Income Countries/Destitution and Risk)*, which has some involvement of the University of Trondheim.

As mentioned earlier, some of the TFESSD activities link up with government sector development programmes that are jointly funded by several donors.

On the basis of the above, it can be concluded that some of the TFESSD activities have relevance both to the funding donors (Norway and Finland) and others operating in Ethiopia.

## **3.2 Effectiveness of the TF activities**

Effectiveness is defined as the extent to which a set of established objectives is achieved. In the context of this case study on Ethiopia, it makes sense to assess goal achievement at the level of the individual TFESSD activities and the degree of innovation overall. The larger trust fund objectives are examined in Section 4.3 below.

### **3.2.1 Effectiveness at the level of individual TFESSD activities**

A specific monitoring system has not been set up at the Country Office to monitor goal fulfilment of the individual TFESSD activities implemented in Ethiopia or the portfolio of TFESSD activities as a whole. The evaluation team examined the GRM Reports for all the TFESSD activities that was focused upon during the mission to Ethiopia (see table in Section 3.3). All the GRM Reports covered the period May 2006-January 2007.

Although the format of the GRM Report includes a section on “overall progress [over the reporting period] with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives,” none of the six reports assessed give a clear indication of the extent of goal fulfilment. This is probably due to the fact that only one of these six activities had been completed (*TF052779, Africa Strategic Environment and Poverty Program*) and just three activities had seen disbursements at the time of reporting. However, as a total of just around USD 100,000 (or 18% of the committed funds to these TFESSD activities) had been disbursed at the time of reporting, there cannot have been much by way of goal fulfilment on which to report by January 2007.

The evaluation team’s interviews with stakeholders provide a more up-dated but largely impressionistic assessment of goal fulfilment. Overall, the stakeholders’ observations indicate that goal fulfilment is likely in six out of seven TFESSD activities discussed with the evaluation team.<sup>6</sup>

Implementation of the TFESSD activities has largely followed the original objectives except in the case of *TF055675 (Productive Safety Nets)*. The evaluation team was informed that the original objectives were reviewed to focus on benchmarking graduation from the Productive Safety Nets Programme (PSNP) and impact evaluation to suit the emerging needs of the larger PSNP. This followed consultations with Government, donors and the TFESSD team. Although work is still in progress, there is a high likelihood of achieving the revised TFESSD activity goals. There is strong Government ownership for the activities, reported multi-donor interest and therefore potential for follow-up and high expectations by the World Bank Team for the outputs to influence future designs of Food Safety Net Programs.

The completed activity, *TF052779 (Africa Strategic Environment and Poverty Program)* was a multi-country activity with two activities in Ethiopia: a study on *household energy, environmental health, and poverty* using an analysis of household surveys (LSMS and DHS; carried out in Ethiopia and Zambia) as well as a study on the *linkages between soil fertility (nutrient degradation) and poverty*, using Ethiopia as a case study. Although no details were collected on the first study, the evaluation team had discussions with both government

---

<sup>6</sup> The interview with stakeholders concerning TF057612 (*Pro-poor Tourism in Zambia and Ethiopia*) did not provide a sufficient basis on which to assess whether goal fulfilment was likely or not.



officials (from the Ministry of Agriculture) and the consultancy team that carried out the second study. It was noted that the study was completed according to the set objectives and a product in the form of a joint Government of Ethiopia/World Bank publication with three papers (*Thematic Papers on Land Degradation in Ethiopia*) was produced.

The *Woreda City Benchmarking Survey (TF055856 Monitoring Empowerment in Four Countries)* is an add-on activity to the large multi-donor PSCAP program. The TFESSD is financing the demand side of the study co-financed by GTZ and CIDA. It is anticipated that this will increase empowerment of the communities, as well as enhance efficiency of service delivery and transparency. The survey is yet to be carried out, but the tools have been developed. However, both Government officials and World Bank staff interviewed showed enthusiasm in the survey and its outputs. It is also anticipated that since it is co-financed and also part of a larger program and with strong Government ownership, the objectives are likely to be achieved. This is based on evaluation team experience from similar projects.

The GRM reports that the objectives for *TF057347 (Mobilizing Rural Institutions)* are to help client countries to adapt and partner with pre-existing rural institutions as a resource, and build on their potential, to increase access to public and private services for the rural poor. The immediate outcome will be a series of country-specific recommendations and measures to increase the ability of clients to effectively utilize rural institutions through better access to information, technologies, services and markets. This global project has been contracted out to various consultants and most activities are underway or completed.

Another global and stand-alone activity is the *TF057289 (Addressing Extreme Poverty in Low Income countries/ Destitution and Risk)*. This aims to assess the household causes and triggers for extreme poverty and destitution, as well as household coping mechanisms and protection strategies. It is expected that findings will stimulate debate and discussion within case study countries as well as between policy makers, international organizations, and other stakeholders about the right mix of instruments to address (and prevent) extreme poverty and destitution. The study is still underway but from discussions with the Ethiopia-based researcher, most of the objectives are likely to be achieved in the four pilot countries. There appears to be no operational links with either government or other stakeholders at the country level.

Finally, the evaluation team also met with a representative of the Embassy of Finland and had a telephone conversation with one from the Embassy of Norway. This confirmed that the embassies do not engage in any monitoring of the TFESSD activities in Ethiopia.

### **3.2.2 Innovation**

The TFESSD was initiated as a new invention in the Norwegian (and later also the Finnish) bilateral co-operation with the World Bank focusing on innovative and catalytic activities and financing of non-core operations. The instruction to TFESSD reviewers in 2007 defined the concepts of *innovative* and *catalytic* as: “setting the stage for future operations, clearly indicating the linkages of the proposed activity with, and value added over, ongoing or planned regular Bank analytical, program or project activities.” Being a central feature of the Trust Fund it is appropriate to assess the degree of innovation as an element of goal fulfilment/effectiveness.

Overall, statements made by the stakeholders during interviews with the evaluation team suggest that five out of seven TFESSD activities are likely to produce innovative outcomes:

- *Productive Safety Nets (TF 055675)* is innovative in as far as it leads to a tool for defining graduation from the PSNP. The activity is also potentially catalytic since it is likely to inform future designs of World Bank Safety Net Programs elsewhere. Moreover, the PSNP involves five other donors and it was reported that some (specifically DFID) were considering whether lessons from the program (and by inference TF055675) could influence their policies on safety nets;
- *The Woreda City Benchmarking Survey (TF055856)* is likely to complement top-down reforms (in Ethiopia the PSCAP) by addressing the capacity of citizens to reinforce change by demanding better governance and holding officials to account. There have also been visits to other countries that are undergoing decentralisation (including Uganda). Lessons

from the survey and the process are therefore likely to be shared and replicated elsewhere, by the World Bank, donors and governments; see Section 4.3.1 below;

- *Mobilizing Rural Institutions (TF057347)* includes development of a benchmarking tool for agricultural innovation systems, which is innovative by its very design. The TFESSD activity is also likely to influence the World Bank to pay closer attention to informal community-based organizations, rather than mostly (as in the past) focusing on formal institutions or local organizations created by projects for particular purposes;
- *Sustainable Land Management and Tenure Security (TF057147)* aims to disseminate the innovative aspects of community-based land certification in Ethiopia, and there are already promising signs that this is going to work. Thus, lessons from the activity have already had an (innovative) influence on two land administration components in Tanzania and Uganda (respectively USD 30 million and USD 24 million) that the World Bank is currently supporting. It might be added that a box featuring a description of the land certification process in Ethiopia and a number of results will be included in the 2008 World Development Report.<sup>7</sup>
- *Addressing Extreme Poverty in Low Income Countries/Destitution and Risk (TF057289)* is innovative and catalytic, in that it seeks to identify and strengthen links between *ex ante* risk management and reducing destitution and extreme vulnerability, and highlights the importance of *ex ante* prevention in the development policy debate.

### 3.3 Results/influence from TF activities

The stated objective of the trust fund is to: "...act as a catalyst for the mainstreaming of environmental and social dimensions of sustainable development and for inclusion of these cross-cutting issues into the Bank's operations, both at headquarters and in the field." The evaluation team understands mainstreaming to occur when Bank policies and operations change as the result of influence from one or various TFESSD activities. Hence, influence is the power or capacity of causing an effect in indirect or tangible ways. This section examines how the TFESSD activities in Ethiopia have had, or are likely to have, such influence on the World Bank and the Government of Ethiopia.

#### 3.3.1 Influence on the World Bank

##### CAS

At the country level, it is logical to search for influence of the TFESSD on the Bank's operations by looking at the CAS. The CAS for Ethiopia (2003-2005) was finalised in March 2003, and an Interim CAS for 2006-2007 is currently in force. Seven of the TFESSD activities were approved in FY07, wherefore they cannot have influenced the preparation of either of the CAS. As already noted, most of the other TFESSD activities are very recent or with limited disbursements. In reality, only the completed activities may have influenced the CAS.

*TF051976 (Empowering Civil Society in Ethiopia)* stands out as one completed TFESSD activity (ended in 2005) that may have had influence on the CAS and subsequent Bank operations, as well as Government programmes in the country. According to the TFESSD Completion Report Form (September 2005), the major outputs include improved consensus and common understanding among Government, CSOs and other stakeholders regarding definitions, design and implementation of civil society empowerment programs. Based in part on the activities of TF051976, the Government has developed an overall program on civil society capacity building, which has allowed the World Bank and other donors to develop and implement specific interventions on civil society capacity building.

In Ethiopia, the overarching objective of the Bank (as part of the multi-donor effort) is: "to support Government in developing and implementing, in consultation with citizens, a strengthened program of institution building and governance reform that will help in its efforts to accelerate pro-poor growth."<sup>8</sup> Thus, although the evaluation team has not seen any direct reference to the influence of TF051976 on the CAS in any of the reports available, several World Bank staff members who were consulted by the evaluation team indicated that this activity had, in fact, influenced the CAS.

---

<sup>7</sup> GRM Report on TF057147, 16 April 2007, p. 3.

<sup>8</sup> Quoted from Interim CAS for Ethiopia 2006-2007.

*TF057612 (Pro-poor Tourism in Zambia and Ethiopia)* aims to develop an analytical framework to quantify the pro-poor impact of different kinds of tourism development facilities and interventions as well as highlighting the policies that may help to maximise positive impacts. This pilot methodology will contribute to the design of the Ethiopia Sustainable Development Tourism program. The GRM Report on TF057612 states that the objective is “to feed this pilot into the upcoming CAS and include findings from the pilot in a forthcoming IDA operation focused on maximising the pro-poor development impact of a tourism lending operation.” The evaluation team was told that Bank is considering an allocation on the order of USD 100 million. Although it is too early to conclude anything, this may turn out as an example of how TFESSD activities can have catalytic influence, at least at the level of the Bank’s country operations.

### *Specific Operations*

Section 4.1 discussed how several TFESSD activities were relevant to specific Bank operations in Ethiopia. One might observe that relevance is almost a prerequisite for influence to occur, but no guarantee. The following paragraphs give a few examples of how the TFESSD activities are, or have been, influencing specific Bank operations in Ethiopia.

*TF055675 (Productive Safety Nets)* is developing “graduation benchmarks” to support the implementation of the PSNP. This entails providing a quantifiable, evidence-based definition of graduation from food insecurity, which also leads to a better understanding of the dynamics behind the transition of households away from food insecurity. In the longer term, the application of graduation benchmarks may lead to efficiency gains to the (multi-donor funded) PSNP, which aims to cover a target group of 7 million people. The GRM Report states that the studies under this TFESSD activity “will have a direct impact on the design of the third phase of Bank support (APL III).” It goes on to say that “given the Bank’s role in leveraging its support to achieve policy reform, as well as bring on board other donors, the work will consequently also impact the Government’s overall strategy and donor support vis-à-vis the sector.” The evaluation team did not have sufficient time in Ethiopia to investigate this assertion, but representatives of the Government of Ethiopia who were interviewed by the evaluation team confirmed that the notion of “graduation benchmarks” had introduced a major innovation to the Productive Safety Nets programme, which is supported by many donors.

*TF055856 (Monitoring Empowerment in Four Countries/Woreda City Benchmarking Survey)* is closely linked to the large (multi-donor) Public Sector Capacity Building Programme (PSCAP). Although capacity building of the woredas (districts) constitutes a separate component of PSCAP, this TFESSD activity is intended to complement this by introducing a social accountability approach to service delivery at a critical point in the decentralization process. The TFESSD activity aims to contribute to making all stakeholders in the PSCAP better informed about the demand-side of public service delivery at the level of woredas. Both World Bank staff in Ethiopia and representatives of the Government of Ethiopia who were interviewed by the evaluation team believed that this could lead to improved resource allocation from the Government, the Bank and other donors working in the woredas.

*TF052779 (Africa Strategic Environment and Poverty Program)* included several countries and was completed in 2006. This activity aimed to build the analytical basis and the capacity of key stakeholders for improved understanding of the relationships between environmental improvements and poverty outcomes. In Ethiopia this included three deliverables: (i) a land management literature review, (ii) a stakeholder workshop in June 2005, and (iii) a study of the macro-economic costs of land degradation. According to some of the Ethiopian researchers who led the work in that country, this has alerted the government’s attention to land management issues in the so-called high potential areas, which had been neglected before. The same researchers mentioned that the PSNP (see above) now also comprises the high potential areas, and not just the areas with the most severe land management problems. Thus, since the Bank is a big contributor to the PSNP, the direction of its funding to the PSNP could also be influenced by this TFESSD activity.

### *Add-on versus stand alone*

Reference has already been made to the close linkage between many of the TFESSD activities and specific government sector development programmes/ Bank funded operations in

Ethiopia. Some of these, for example *TF055675 (Productive Safety Nets)* and *TF055856 (Monitoring Empowerment in Four Countries/Woreda City Benchmarking Survey)* are so closely linked to larger programmes that they may be regarded as “add-ons.” This raises the question of why these TFESSD activities were not simply included in the respective programmes (PSNP and PSCAP) to begin with. This would have been reasonable, given the large budgets and many donors involved in each of these programmes. But using the TFESSD for the add-on activities in question may have been less complicated.

There is nothing wrong, as such, in using the TFESSD for add-on type of activities, as long as the usual funding selection criteria are met. In fact, there are many indications to suggest that studies and other activities that are closely linked to operational activities have a greater likelihood of having influence. However, given the often narrower focus of add-on activities, such influence could be more limited in scope.

At the opposite end of the scale, some of the TFESSD activities are so detached from ongoing programmes that they may be regarded as “stand-alone.” While *TF057289 (Addressing Extreme Poverty in Low Income Countries/Destitution and Risk)* builds on existing and ongoing academic research in Ethiopia, it was not originally linked to operational or policy objectives. For the researchers involved in Ethiopia, this is a basic research activity. The TTL gave the Ethiopian researchers involved in this TFESSD activity a lot of leeway in their work. This was appreciated by these and has induced them to be more creative. Therefore, this kind of open-ended research, which spends a lot of effort in trying first to understand a given situation, may come up with innovative ideas that have the potential to be applied beyond the particular study areas.

### **3.3.2 Influence on the Government of Ethiopia**

The influence on the Government is implied in much of the foregoing analysis of influence on the World Bank, especially insofar as the TFESSD activities that are closely linked with government sector development programmes. Nevertheless, it is useful to highlight a few different dimensions of this.

Like relevance is necessary for influence to occur, so is ownership. Overall, the evaluation team found that government ownership of the TFESSD activities in Ethiopia was weak. There were some notable exceptions to this, namely *TF055675 (Productive Safety Nets)* and *TF055856 (Monitoring Empowerment in Four Countries/Woreda City Benchmarking Survey)*. In both of these cases, the government officials interviewed felt they had strong ownership of the TFESSD activities. But there is one caveat to this assessment: the ownership felt may be more to the larger government sector development programmes to which the TFESSD activities are linked than to the trust funded activities themselves. The general difficulty in separating TFESSD activities from the larger programmatic context introduces a significant margin of error to this assessment.

But, having stated the above, it is clear that a sense of ownership will fertilize the ground for a TFESSD activity to have influence on government officials.

### **3.3.3 Influence on other stakeholders**

The evaluation team noted that Ethiopian researchers or consultants were involved in almost all of the TFESSD activities. Depending on their degree and length of involvement, they are of course going to be influenced by this.

The evaluation team did not hear about or see evidence of mass dissemination of the results of TFESSD activities or press coverage of this.

## 4 Conclusions and Lessons Learned

### 4.1 Conclusions

Despite the limitations noted in Section 2.3 it can be concluded that the TFESSD activities in Ethiopia have been relevant and that there are indications that they will achieve a reasonable degree of goal fulfilment. There are also several examples of influence from the TFESSD activities, especially on World Bank operations in the country and on the government sector development programmes they link into. Whether this also leads to influence on general World Bank policies and procedures is more uncertain, and beyond the scope of this country case study.

### 4.2 Major lessons from Ethiopia case study

One of the major findings of the Ethiopia case study is the close linkage between many of the TFESSD activities and ongoing World Bank operations. This implies that the principal locus of influence is the Bank's own operations in Ethiopia (and other countries involved in the activities with regional scope). And, since Bank operations are increasingly implemented as harmonised multi-donor activities in support of government sector development programmes, the potential influence is much broader.

Whether the influence at country-level is eventually scaled-up to become general World Bank policies or procedures depend on many factors that are beyond the power of the Trust Fund. One of these is the success of government sector development programmes that the World Bank is supporting and to which the TFESSD activities have been linked. As this will take time to materialise and given the complications involved in establishing causality, the real influence of the TFESSD on World Bank policies and procedures is extremely difficult to ascertain.

The Ethiopia case study raises the question of whether the work funded by several of the TFESSD activities could have been done by the stakeholders in the larger government sector development programmes that they are often linked to, without the contribution from the Trust Fund. In some cases, this might have been possible. However, the existence of the Trust Fund has allowed stakeholders to pursue innovative approaches and solutions that they might not have been able to in the absence of the TFESSD. Moreover, having such work spearheaded by the World Bank provides credibility and the possibility that lessons learned through the implementation of specific TFESSD activities, in due course, could influence general World Bank policies and procedures.

## Appendix I: Programme of Meetings

DATE	TIME	MEETING WITH	Projects	Venue
<b>Monday September 24, 2007</b>	9:00 a.m	- Wolter Soer, Co-TTL, Coordinator Donor group - Jeeva Perumalpillai- Essex, Co-TTL - Berhanu Legesse/ Elsa Araya/Janelle Plummer- Governance Advisor	- Productive Safety Net Project - Rural Institutions - Woreda City Benchmark Study II	WB office 2nd floor
<b>Tuesday September 25, 2007</b>	11:00 a.m.	Food Security Project/ Productive Safety Net Project - Ato Berhane Gizaw, Head Food Security Bureau <i>client</i> 0115-520636	Productive Safety Nets	Food Security Project Office
	2:00 pm	Ministry of Capacity Building, client - Ato Tesfaye Atire and Ato Mequane Semachew - 0911 25 43 56 0111-239872/73	Woreda City Benchmark Study II	PPD office #33
	4:00 p.m.	Ministry of Culture & Tourism, client; recipient institution: Dr. Theodros Atlabachew, National Project Coordinator - 0911-224406	Tourism Project	Cultural Heritage Project Office
<b>Wednesday September 26, 2007</b>	9:00a.m.	Ministry of Agriculture & Rural Development, Client - (Ato Amare) 0911120426 Department Head	Soil Degradation Study & Land Tenure	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
	11:00am	- Dr. Alula Pankhurst , Lecturer in Anthropology 113-714669 or 119-144689	Destitution and Risk	Dr. Pankhurst office (Old Airport)
	3:00 p.m.	Finnish Embassy - Ms. Anna Koikkalainen, Second Secretary/Deputy Head of Mission - 0113-205917	TFESSD Projects in Ethiopia	Finnish Embassy
	4:30 p.m.	World Bank - Eyerusalem Fasika, Research Analyst	Public Expenditure Review	WB office 2nd floor

DATE	TIME	MEETING WITH	Projects	Venue
<b>Thursday September 27, 2007</b>	Morning 10:30 a.m.	Ethiopian Development Research Institute - Dr. Mahmud M. Yesuf and Dr. Menale Kassie- 0115-506066 9	Soil Degradation Study	EDRI Office Transport and Comm.
	12:30	- Meeting with Jeeva Perumalpillai-Essex, Co-TTL and Country TFESSD Portfolio Manager	Debriefing meeting	WB Office 2nd floor
	2:30 p.m.	IFPRI - Dr. David Spielman, Research Fellow	Mobilizing rural Institutions	IFPRI, Addis
	3.30 p.m.	Meeting (telephone) with Norwegian Embassy Ms. Bente Nielson 011 3 71 0799	TFESSD Projects in Ethiopia	Telephone conversation

**Scheduled but not available for meetings**

- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development Ato Ibrahim - 0115 157864/150478
- Ethiopian Roads Authority/ Yoshi/Mesfin, TTL & High way Engineer
- Meetings with UN agencies/bodies and other donors - Tsigereda Tafesse - GTZ for Woreda City Benchmark Study II

## Appendix II: List of References

- A brief History of the Ethiopian Cultural Heritage Project – From Dr. Theodoros Atlabachew, National Project Coordinator, 2007
- David J. Spielman and Regina Birner, IFPRI – *“How innovative is your Agriculture? Using innovation indicators and benchmarks to strengthen national agricultural innovation systems”* Draft Review Paper prepared for the World Bank TF057347- Project Component: *“Development of a Benchmarking Tool for Agricultural Innovation Systems- Pilot Study in Vietnam and Ethiopia”*
- David J. Spielman and Tanguy Bernard, International Food Policy Research Institute – Draft Inception Report, TF057347, Mobilizing Rural Institutions for Sustainable Livelihoods and Equitable Development, Ethiopia Country Case Study, May 2007
- David J. Spielman and Tanguy Bernard, International Food Policy Research Institute – First Progress Report, TF057347, Mobilizing Rural Institutions for Sustainable Livelihoods and Equitable Development, Ethiopia Country Case Study, August 2007
- Ethiopia Ministry of Agriculture and World Bank – Ethiopia: Thematic Papers on Land Degradation in Ethiopia, (a product of TF052779), June 2007
- World Bank - Completion report Form, TF050420, Public Expenditures and Poverty in Ethiopia, October 2004
- World Bank - Grant Completion report Form, TF051976, Empowering Civil Society in Ethiopia, October 2005
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF051976, Empowering Civil Society in Ethiopia, FY03
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF052779, Africa Strategic Environment and Poverty Program, FY04
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF053858, Implementing Environmental and Social Accountability and Governance in SMEs, FY05
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF055675, Ethiopia Productive Safety Nets, FY06
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF057147, Ethiopia Sustainable Land Management & Tenure Security, FY07
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF057213, Transport Sector: Social Inclusion: Ethiopia, Sierra Leone, FY07
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF057289, Addressing Extreme Poverty in Low Income Countries: Risks and Shocks, FY07
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF057347, Mobilizing Rural Institutions for Sustainable Livelihoods and Equitable Development, FY07
- World Bank - Grant Proposal, TF057612, Measuring and achieving pro-poor development impact from tourism activities through policy and institutional responses, FY07
- World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report, TF052779, Africa Strategic Environment and Poverty Program, January 2007
- World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report, TF053858, Implementing Environmental and Social Accountability and Governance in SMEs, January 2007
- World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report, TF055675, Ethiopia Productive Safety Nets, January 2007
- World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report, TF055856, Monitoring Empowerment in Four Countries, January 2007



World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report, TF057147, Ethiopia Sustainable Land Management & Tenure Security, January 2007

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report, TF057213, Transport Sector: Social Inclusion: Ethiopia, Sierra Leone, January 2007

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report, TF057347, Mobilizing Rural Institutions for Sustainable Livelihoods and Equitable Development, January 2007

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report, TF057612, Pro-Poor Tourism in Zambia and Ethiopia, January 2007

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF050420, Public Expenditures and Poverty in Ethiopia, November 2002

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF051976, Empowering Civil Society in Ethiopia, June 2003

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF052779, Africa Strategic Environment and Poverty Program

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF053858, Implementing Environmental and Social Accountability and Governance in SMEs,

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF055675, Ethiopia Productive Safety Nets

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF055856, Monitoring Empowerment in Four Countries, Nov 2005

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF057147, Ethiopia Sustainable Land Management & Tenure Security, April 2007

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF057213, Transport Sector: Social Inclusion: Ethiopia, Sierra Leone, January 2007

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF057289, Addressing Extreme Poverty in Low Income Countries: Risks and Shocks, April 2007

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF057347, Mobilizing Rural Institutions for Sustainable Livelihoods and Equitable Development, April 2007

World Bank - Grant Summary, TF057612, Pro-Poor Tourism in Zambia and Ethiopia, April 2007

World Bank - Semi-Annual reporting format, TF051976, Empowering Civil Society in Ethiopia, October 2004

World Bank – Untitled Document, TF055856, Measuring Empowerment in Four Countries

World Bank- Back to Office Report - 2<sup>nd</sup> WCBS II mission, 19 June 2007

World Bank- Back to Office Report - Poverty Action Network for Ethiopia (PANE) Citizens' Report Card (CRC) Mission, 30 April 2007

World Bank- Back to Office Report - Woreda City Benchmarking Survey (WCBS) Mission, 30 April 2007

World Bank, Ethiopia - Country Assistance Strategy for the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, March 2003

World Bank, Ethiopia – Interim Country Assistance Strategy for the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, May 2006



## EVALUATION REPORTS

- 3.93 Garantiordning for Investeringer i og Eksport til Utviklingsland  
4.93 Capacity-Building in Development Cooperation Towards Integration and Recipient Responsibility
- 1.94 Evaluation of World Food Programme  
2.94 Evaluation of the Norwegian Junior Expert Programme with UN Organisations
- 1.95 Technical Cooperation in Transition  
2.95 Evaluering av FN-sambandet i Norge  
3.95 NGOs as a Channel in Development aid  
3A.95 Rapport fra Presentasjonsmøte av «Evalueringen av de Frivillige Organisasjoner»
- 4.95 Rural Development and Local Government in Tanzania  
5.95 Integration of Environmental Concerns into Norwegian Bilateral Development Assistance: Policies and Performance
- 1.96 NORAD's Support of the Remote Area Development Programme (RADP) in Botswana  
2.96 Norwegian Development Aid Experiences. A Review of Evaluation Studies 1986–92  
3.96 The Norwegian People's Aid Mine Clearance Project in Cambodia  
4.96 Democratic Global Civil Governance Report of the 1995 Benchmark Survey of NGOs  
5.96 Evaluation of the Yearbook "Human Rights in Developing Countries"
- 1.97 Evaluation of Norwegian Assistance to Prevent and Control HIV/AIDS  
2.97 «Kultursjokk og Korrektiv» – Evaluering av UD/NORADs Studiereiser for Lærere  
3.97 Evaluation of Decentralisation and Development  
4.97 Evaluation of Norwegian Assistance to Peace, Reconciliation and Rehabilitation in Mozambique  
5.97 Aid to Basic Education in Africa – Opportunities and Constraints  
6.97 Norwegian Church Aid's Humanitarian and Peace-Making Work in Mali  
7.97 Aid as a Tool for Promotion of Human Rights and Democracy: What can Norway do?  
8.97 Evaluation of the Nordic Africa Institute, Uppsala  
9.97 Evaluation of Norwegian Assistance to Worldview International Foundation  
10.97 Review of Norwegian Assistance to IPS  
11.97 Evaluation of Norwegian Humanitarian Assistance to the Sudan  
12.97 Cooperation for Health Development WHO's Support to Programmes at Country Level
- 1.98 "Twinning for Development". Institutional Cooperation between Public Institutions in Norway and the South  
2.98 Institutional Cooperation between Sokoine and Norwegian Agricultural Universities  
3.98 Development through Institutions? Institutional Development Promoted by Norwegian Private Companies and Consulting Firms  
4.98 Development through Institutions? Institutional Development Promoted by Norwegian Non-Governmental Organisations  
5.98 Development through Institutions? Institutional Development in Norwegian Bilateral Assistance. Synthesis Report  
6.98 Managing Good Fortune – Macroeconomic Management and the Role of Aid in Botswana  
7.98 The World Bank and Poverty in Africa  
8.98 Evaluation of the Norwegian Program for Indigenous Peoples  
9.98 Evaluering av Informasjons støtten til RORGene  
10.98 Strategy for Assistance to Children in Norwegian Development Cooperation  
11.98 Norwegian Assistance to Countries in Conflict  
12.98 Evaluation of the Development Cooperation between Norway and Nicaragua  
13.98 UNICEF-komiteen i Norge  
14.98 Relief Work in Complex Emergencies
- 1.99 WID/Gender Units and the Experience of Gender Mainstreaming in Multilateral Organisations  
2.99 International Planned Parenthood Federation – Policy and Effectiveness at Country and Regional Levels  
3.99 Evaluation of Norwegian Support to Psycho-Social Projects in Bosnia-Herzegovina and the Caucasus  
4.99 Evaluation of the Tanzania-Norway Development Cooperation 1994–1997  
5.99 Building African Consulting Capacity  
6.99 Aid and Conditionality  
7.99 Policies and Strategies for Poverty Reduction in Norwegian Development Aid  
8.99 Aid Coordination and Aid Effectiveness  
9.99 Evaluation of the United Nations Capital Development Fund (UNCDF)  
10.99 Evaluation of AWEPA, The Association of European Parliamentarians for Africa, and AEI, The African European Institute  
1.00 Review of Norwegian Health-related Development Cooperation 1988–1997  
2.00 Norwegian Support to the Education Sector. Overview of Policies and Trends 1988–1998  
3.00 The Project "Training for Peace in Southern Africa"  
4.00 En kartlegging av erfaringer med norsk bistand gjennom frivillige organisasjoner 1987–1999  
5.00 Evaluation of the NUFU programme
- 6.00 Making Government Smaller and More Efficient. The Botswana Case  
7.00 Evaluation of the Norwegian Plan of Action for Nuclear Safety Priorities, Organisation, Implementation  
8.00 Evaluation of the Norwegian Mixed Credits Programme  
9.00 "Norwegians? Who needs Norwegians?" Explaining the Oslo Back Channel: Norway's Political Past in the Middle East  
10.00 Taken for Granted? An Evaluation of Norway's Special Grant for the Environment
- 1.01 Evaluation of the Norwegian Human Rights Fund  
2.01 Economic Impacts on the Least Developed Countries of the Elimination of Import Tariffs on their Products  
3.01 Evaluation of the Public Support to the Norwegian NGOs Working in Nicaragua 1994–1999  
3A.01 Evaluación del Apoyo Público a las ONGs Noruegas que Trabajan en Nicaragua 1994–1999  
4.01 The International Monetary Fund and the World Bank Cooperation on Poverty Reduction  
5.01 Evaluation of Development Co-operation between Bangladesh and Norway, 1995–2000  
6.01 Can democratisation prevent conflicts? Lessons from sub-Saharan Africa  
7.01 Reconciliation Among Young People in the Balkans An Evaluation of the Post Pessimist Network
- 1.02 Evaluation of the Norwegian Resource Bank for Democracy and Human Rights (NORDEM)  
2.02 Evaluation of the International Humanitarian Assistance of the Norwegian Red Cross  
3.02 Evaluation of ACOPAM An ILO program for "Cooperative and Organizational Support to Grassroots Initiatives" in Western Africa 1978 – 1999  
3A.02 Évaluation du programme ACOPAM Un programme du BIT sur l'« Appui associatif et coopératif aux Initiatives de Développement à la Base » en Afrique de l'Ouest de 1978 à 1999  
4.02 Legal Aid Against the Odds Evaluation of the Civil Rights Project (CRP) of the Norwegian Refugee Council in former Yugoslavia
- 1.03 Evaluation of the Norwegian Investment Fund for Developing Countries (Norfund)  
2.03 Evaluation of the Norwegian Education Trust Fund for Africa in the World Bank  
3.03 Evaluering av Bistandstorgets Evalueringsnettverk
- 1.04 Towards Strategic Framework for Peacebuilding: Getting Their Act Together. Overview Report of the Joint Utstein Study of the Peacebuilding.  
2.04 Norwegian peacebuilding policies: Lessons Learnt and Challenges Ahead  
3.04 Evaluation of CESAR's activities in the Middle East Funded by Norway  
4.04 Evaluering av ordningen med støtte gjennom paraplyorganisasjoner. Eksemplifisert ved støtte til Norsk Misjons Bistandsnemda og Atlas-alliansen  
5.04 Study of the impact of the work of FORUT in Sri Lanka: Building Civil Society  
6.04 Study of the impact of the work of Save the Children Norway in Ethiopia: Building Civil Society
- 1.05 –Study: Study of the impact of the work of FORUT in Sri Lanka and Save the Children Norway in Ethiopia: Building Civil Society  
1.05 –Evaluation: Evaluation of the Norad Fellowship Programme  
2.05 –Evaluation: Women Can Do It – an evaluation of the WCDI programme in the Western Balkans  
3.05 Gender and Development – a review of evaluation report 1997–2004  
4.05 Evaluation of the Framework Agreement between the Government of Norway and the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP)  
5.05 Evaluation of the "Strategy for Women and Gender Equality in Development Cooperation (1997–2005)"
- 1.06 Inter-Ministerial Cooperation. An Effective Model for Capacity Development?  
2.06 Evaluation of Fredskorpset  
1.06 – Synthesis Report: Lessons from Evaluations of Women and Gender Equality in Development Cooperation
- 1.07 Evaluation of the Norwegian Petroleum-Related Assistance  
1.07 – Synteserapport: Humanitær innsats ved naturkatastrofer: En syntese av evalueringsfunn  
1.07 – Study: The Norwegian International Effort against Female Genital Mutilation  
2.07 Evaluation of Norwegian Power-related Assistance  
2.07 – Study Development Cooperation through Norwegian NGOs in South America  
3.07 Evaluation of the Effects of the using M-621 Cargo Trucks in Humanitarian Transport Operations  
4.07 Evaluation of Norwegian Development Support to Zambia (1991 - 2005)  
5.07 Evaluation of the Development Cooperation to Norwegian NGOs in Guatemala  
1.08 Evaluations of the Norwegian Emergency Preparedness System (NOREPS)  
1.08 Study: The challenge of Assessing Aid Impact: A review of Norwegian Evaluation Practice

**Norad**

Norwegian Agency for  
Development Cooperation

P.O.Box 8034 Dep, NO-0030 Oslo  
Visiting address:  
Ruseløkkveien 26, Oslo, Norway

Telephone: +47 22 24 20 30  
Fax: +47 22 24 20 31  
Postmottak@norad.no  
www.norad.no

February 2008  
ISBN 978-82-7548-288-2

**Department for Development Policy**

Ministry for Foreign Affairs  
Po Box 176, 00161 Helsinki

Visiting address:  
Katajanokanlaituri 3,  
00160 Helsinki

