External Evaluation of

"Inclusive Quality Pre-Primary, Primary and Secondary Education for Roma and Egyptian children in Albania"

Evaluation Report (draft)

Ilir Gedeshi

Table of Content

Acknowledgment List of acronyms and abbreviations Executive Summary

1. Introduction

- 1.1. Purpose and approach of the Evaluation
- 1.2. Educational gaps
- 1.3. Indicators
- 1.4. Evaluation scope and criteria

2. Methodology

2.1. Major limitations of the evaluation

3. Findings

- 3.1. Relevance
- 3.2. Efficacy
- 3.3. Efficiency
- 3.4. Impact
- 3.5. Sustainability

4. Recommendations

Bibliography

- Annex A: List of respondents
- Annex B: Questionnaire with R/E parents
- Annex C: Questionnaire with representatives of education institutions
- Annex D: Questionnaire with R/E students
- Annex E: Semi-structured questions for interviews and FG
- Annex F: Results of questionnaire with R/E students
- Annex G: The SC project approach (model)

Acknowledgment

The evaluator would like to express gratitude to the SC project team for the excellent cooperation. A special thank go to team members that took the time for the meetings and responding to the questions.

Special thanks go to Ms. Arberesha Mushani who did a great effort to collect the data required to make this evaluation possible and who greatly facilitated the evaluation field work in Korça and Gjirokastra. I would like to also thank Mr. Refik Cela and Mr. Besnik Kadesha for their precious comments and opinions on the draft of this report.

Further, the evaluator would like to express his thanks to the dedicated local facilitators and SC employees in Korça and Gjirokastra for their support and facilitations of field assessment and logistics. The collaboration with such devoted personalities - i.e. Gerta Xega, Majko Majko, Vasjar Zijai, Donika Rrapushi etc. - was a special experience for me.

Lastly the evaluator would like to send his grateful appreciation to all participants and stakeholders, who kindly took their time to participate in the interviews, focus group discussions, workshops and meetings and to contribute to the information and data collection for this report. Also I wish to send my gratitude to the Roma/Egyptians and non-Roma/Egyptians parents and children who shared their opinions and personal experiences with the evaluator. I sincerely hope that the findings and recommendations of this report will contribute to ameliorate their situation.

List of acronyms and abbreviations

CESS Center for Economic and Social Studies

CG Children Governments

DAC Development Assistance Committee

EU European Union

FG Focus Group Discussion GDP Gross Domestic Product GoA Government of Albania

HH Household

IDE Institute of Development of Education
INSTAT Albanian National Institute of Statistics
MoES Ministry of Education and Science

MoFA Ministry of Foreign Affairs

MSWY Ministry for Social Welfare and Youth

NGO Non-governmental organization

NIPE National Inspectorate of Pre-university Education NSDI National Strategy for Development and Integration

OECD Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development

OSCE Organization for Security and Co-Operation

OSF Open Society Foundation R/E Roma and Egyptians

REA Regional Education Authority

REF Roma Education Fund

SC Save the Children in Albania

SDC Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation

ToR Terms of References

UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Program

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

WB World Bank

Executive Summary

Roma and Egyptian constitute a specific ethnic group that inhabits in the Albanian territory. During the post-socialist transition R/E passed from relative prosperity to extreme poverty. Currently they are the poorest and most marginalised ethnic groups in Albania. The education level of R/E deterriorated during post-socialist transition and the gap with the majority increased. Actually, 42% of Roma population and 14% of the Egyptian one - that belong to the age group 8-40 years old, - are illiterate. The biggest barrier to education is poverty.

In order to contribute in closing the educational gap between R/E and non-R/E, SC started in April 2008 the project "Inclusive Quality Pre-Primary, Primary and Secondary Education for Roma and Egyptian children in Albania", funded mainly by Medicor Foundation and REF. The project has two phases (April 2008 - March 2012 and April 2012 - 2015) and extends in four schools and four kindergartens, located in Korça and Gjirokastra.

The purpose of this evaluation is to measure progress, assess the performance of the project, the perception of stakeholders and beneficiaries, to document lessons learned and to provide practical recommendations for follow-up action. The evaluation aims to analyze: How effective and to what degree has SC project respond to the local needs of R/E communities in education? How and to what degree has SC project contributed to measurable, increased access to education or improved educational outcomes for R/E in reality? How effective and relevant has been SC project in furthering its objectives? How can SC maximize its positive impacts and minimize its negative ones? – and lastly, What practical recommendations can be formulated for SC? This evaluation is based on primary and secondary data analysis, gathered using quantitative and qualitative techniques.

The activities implemented by SC project are highly relevant with regards to national priorities and identified gaps. The project target different level of education, by prioritizing access and quality. It touches upon the main causes of problems and address real needs and aspirations of vulnerable people living in the edge of poverty. Project activities are distributed in an equilibrated way between rural and urban areas where live in difficult socio-economic conditions large R/E communities. According to the beneficiaries, SC project is delivering tangible results at beneficiary level.

The SC project has several objectives which are accompanied by indicators that would allow assessing effectiveness. From the analysis of the indicators the evaluator found that SC project is efficacy. It provides effective help to the R/E children, which is expressed in their increased access and school results. In addition, the project strengthens the R/E student identity, has increased the diversity and communication among children, and has created a comprehensive environment through different activities. Interviews and FG show that the best strategy to achieve these objectives is the inclusive one.

The opinion of the evaluator is that the SC project activities have been implemented in an efficient manner and the staffs working with beneficiaries have a high level of motivation and competence. Comparison with other similar projects shows that the SC project is more efficient concerning the results and number of beneficiaries. This happens because the SC project has

properly selected the most relevant areas for the introduction of the activities and has managed to reach a high number of beneficiaries by applying a concentrated effort.

SC project have produced a new model to support access and better educational outcomes for R/E children. Most of the beneficiaries unanimously agree that SC project has had a real and visible impact in improving the education status of R/E children. These project impacts can be seen in individual, middle and macro level.

The sustainability of the project can be seen in short term, mid-term and long term. In short term the socio-economic environment on which the SC project takes place is fluid and has an impact on the performance. However, these elements can be managed. In the mid and long term the situation is different if we suppose the cessation of financial support. In these conditions the activities of the SC can be continued by finding new alternatives. One of those is volunteerism. For examples, for the teachers that help R/E students after classes this can be resolved with students from the pedagogical faculty (Hungarian experience). Another alternative would be the local government taking over gradually the continuation of some services (food, transport, school equipment, etc). The third alternative is the government or the REA to take over and generalize this model, successfully experimented by the SC. Finally, the SC should lobby to find new funding resources which would enable the continuation and expansion of its activities.

SC project has managed to create within a short period of time a new and successful model of education, which has had, especially at micro and mezzo level, a very positive impact. The majority of the respondents (in the interviews and FG) were of the opinion that without SC project, the situation of R/E in Korça and Gjirokastra would be worse. The evaluator think that it is necessary the consolidation for some years of this established model and its dissemination (if extra financial resources are provided) in other schools/kindergartens.

The SC project should shift from micro to mezzo and macro level. The model should gradually be included into the education system and positive experiences should be disseminated. This requires the construction of functional relations with REA, MoES and other education institutes.

During post-socialist transition some of the projects funded by international donors have unintended influenced in the increase in number of R/E children in some schools and kindergartens. Therefore increase in number of R/E children in schools or kindergartens brought in the phenomenon of creation of "R/E schools". This phenomenon seems to have started even during implementation of SC project. There are some solutions to eliminate this phenomenon: The first among them is the dissemination of the model – if financial possibilities are provided – in all the schools/kindergartens of the city. In absence to this initiative, SC project should cooperate more with the parents of the students of the majority population, so that they do not "migrate" from schools. Lastly, SC project should contribute to the awareness rising of education institutions on the negative consequences of segregation.

The SC project should pay more attention to the vocational program for R/E. These vocational programs should be anticipated by an analysis of the local labor market demand for skills. Meanwhile, links of the R/E education with the vocational training programs would be another achievement of the project. Employment of some R/E would be a good motivation for the

children that go to school, and their parents as well, who could thus observe the long-term benefits of education.

In the future SC can take into consideration the possibility of supporting R/E community in the creation of social businesses linking employment of R/E with their children's education. Such businesses can be created with straw products (for example, the Roma in Gjirokastra have traditions with this), the collection and sale of scrap metal, paper or glass recycling, collection and sale of medicinal plants, etc. In this case the SC may initially perform research and conduct social business project. Through this project (which, obviously would require a prerequisite the education of children), SC can provide better living conditions and education of children by increasing motivation of R/E families. By offering support to social business, SC also can close the cycle of education, employment and vocational training for R/E children.

1. Introduction

Roma and Egyptian constitute a specific ethnic group that inhabits in the Albanian territory starting from the XIV-th century. Through the centuries they have managed to maintain their language, tradition and culture. During the post-socialist transition period the R/E – as a consequence of the collapse and closure of state enterprises, their unilateral professional character, low level of education, and discrimination – passed from a relative prosperity to extreme poverty. Currently they are the poorest and marginalized ethnic groups in Albania and their poverty level is much higher than that of the majority.

The education level of R/E has deteriorated during the post-communist transition and the gap with the majority has increased. Actually, 41.8 percent of the Roma population and 13.5 percent of the Egyptian one - that belong to the age group 8-40 years old - are illiterate. Meanwhile the average education years amount to 5.2 years for the Roma and 6.7 years for the Egyptians¹. The biggest barrier to education is poverty. Along this, there exist also additional barriers to education, including institutional issues, culture, low perceptions of educational benefits, and parents' education levels.

In order to contribute in closing the educational gap between R/E and non-R/E, Save the Children started in April 2008 the project "Inclusive Quality Pre-Primary, Primary and Secondary Education for Roma and Egyptian children in Albania", funded mainly by Medicor Foundation and Roma Education Fund. The project has two phases (April 2008 - March 2012 and April 2012 - 2015) and extends in four schools and four kindergartens, located in Korça and Gjirokastra. The project has implemented a holistic approach to provide quality inclusive education for all children in schools and kindergartens, making changes at the level of education and social inclusion for R/E children and supporting the direct involvement and active participation of their communities. Its main focus is inclusion, non-discrimination and equal opportunities for all children.

1.1. Purpose and approach of the evaluation

The objective of this evaluation, as specified in the ToR, was to measure progress, assess the performance of the project (in terms of efficiency, effectiveness, relevance, sustainability and outcome), the perception of stakeholders and beneficiaries, to document lessons learned and to provide practical recommendations for follow-up action.

The main questions of interests of this evaluation are:

- How effective and to what degree has SC project respond to the local needs of R/E communities in education?
- How and to what degree has SC project contributed to measurable, increased access to education or improved educational outcomes for R/E in reality?
- How effective and relevant has been SC project in furthering its objectives?
- How can SC maximize its positive impacts and minimize its negative ones? and lastly,

¹ Gëdeshi I., Miluka J., Needs Assessment Study on Roma and Egyptians Communities in Albania, UNDP, 2012.

• What practical recommendations can be formulated for SC, project stakeholders and partners in order to improve practice, develop and document replicable, innovative solutions to the problems facing R/E children in education?

This evaluation covers SC work in four schools and four kindergartens in two regions of Albania: Korça and Gjirokastra. In these schools and kindergartens, the SC has applied a new model, definitely innovative for Albania, which aims to create an inclusive environment in order for the R/E students to progress from the educational point of view same as their peers.

1.2. Educational gaps

In Albania there are no detailed data on the education of Roma and Egyptian children. However the studies and analyses performed by researchers and some international organizations², which we consulted for this evaluation, show that there is an educational gap - which has increased especially during the first decade of post-socialist transition – between the R/E and non-R/E. Some of these educational gaps are presented in the following table (table 1).

Table 1. Educational gaps between Roma/Egyptians and non- Roma/Egyptians

Nr	Educational gaps between R/E and non R/E
1.	Preschool coverage for R/E children in Albania is lower than for the non-R/E population.
	Only 26 percent of Roma children (3-6 years old) participate in preschool education ³ ,
	compared to less than 50 percent of the children for the majority population ⁴ .
2.	Primary school enrolment rate for Roma children and to a certain extent for Egyptian
	children are lower than for non-R/E children. 34 percent of Roma children aged 7 to 16 do
	not attend schools ⁵ .
3.	R/E children participation in high school is much lower than that of majority population.
4.	Less than 1 percent of Roma children continue university education.
5.	Drop-out for R/E children is much higher than for the non-R/E. In some districts this
	phenomenon is mainly noticed in the R/E^6 pupils.
6.	There is also a gender dimension. Due to cultural factors, many Roma (but also Egyptian)
	girls - drop school before the age of 12 years old.
7.	Educational achievement among R/E is lower than for non-R/E students coming from
	similar socio-economic situation.
8.	R/E children often sit in the last desks and the teachers do not activate them during the
	lessons. About 8 percent of Roma children and about 5 percent of Egyptian children
	complain that teachers and other pupils treat them unfairly ⁷ .
9.	Compared to the children from the majority population, the R/E children have no

² See for example: **De Soto H., Beddies S., Gëdeshi I.**, Roma and Egyptians in Albania: From social exclusion to social inclusion, The World Bank, Washington D.C., 2005; **Gëdeshi I., Jorgoni E.**, Mapping Roma Children in Albania, UNICEF, 2012; **Gëdeshi I., Miluka J.**, Needs Assessment Study on Roma and Egyptians Communities in Albania, UNDP, 2012; **Sinani Gj., Taho B.** Country Assessment Albania, Roma Education Fund, 2011; **Tamo, A.**, **Karaj, Th.**, Educational Situation for Roma Children in Albania, Tirana 2007.

³ Gëdeshi I., Jorgoni E., Mapping Roma Children in Albania, UNICEF, 2012.

⁴ Observatory for Children's Rights., Child Poverty in Albania. Report Card 1, June 2013.

⁵ **Gëdeshi I., Jorgoni E.**, Mapping Roma Children in Albania, UNICEF, 2012.

⁶ **UNICEF**., "No to School Dropout", Causes, Recommendations. Korça, January 2008.

⁷ **Gëdeshi I., Miluka J.**, Needs Assessment Study on Roma and Egyptians Communities in Albania, UNDP, 2012.

	conditions in their homes (21 percent of Roma HH and 11 percent of Egyptian HH live in shacks ⁸) and receive less support (due to the low educational level of their parents) in their homework.
10.	Almost 80 percent of the R/E families live in poverty, which impedes their children from
	education ⁹ . This is manifested in their difficulty to buy school books and items, lack of
	appropriate clothing, difficult living conditions and lack of infrastructure, contribute the
	children should give in providing income for the family etc.

Hence, as noticed in Table No. 2, the R/E education level is much lower than the one of the majority population.

Table 2. Roma and Egyptian Education Level

Nr	Category	Roma (8 years and above)	Egyptians (8 years and above)	Population of Albania (2001)**
1	Illiterate*	40.3	12.7	1,6
2	Literate (knows how to write/read)	41.2	38.4	14,8
3	Completed primary school	16.1	41.5	57,0
4	Completed secondary school	2.1	6.4	21,7
5	University education	0.3	0.9	4,9
6	Average schooling years (males)	5.6	6.8	n.a
7	Average schooling years (females)	5.3	6.9	n.a

Source: UNDP, 2012; **INSTAT, Population of Albania, 2001

Note: *People who cannot read or write because they have never been to school

1.3. Indicators

SC assesses its performance by using some groups of indicators, such as:

- 1. Participation in pre-school education (children 3-6 years old);
- 2. Enrollment and participation in primary and secondary education;
- 3. Prevention of early school leaving;
- 4. Completion of secondary education;
- 5. Participation in high school education;
- 6. Teacher training;
- 7. Training and participation of parents in children education;
- 8. Participation in vocational training.

Each of these groups of indicators has been divided into components on order to assess the achievements and impacts of SC project objectively (table 3). However, some indicators are abstract and need to be converted to quantitative ones in order to measure the SC project results accurately.

Table 3. SC Objectives and Indicators

I UD	tuble 2. Be objectives und indicators							
Nr	Objectives	Indicators						
1.	Establish quality inclusive	a) Pre-school education						
	education in four schools and	- Number of R/E children enrolled in project kindergartens;						

⁸ Gëdeshi I., Miluka J., Needs Assessment Study on Roma and Egyptians Communities in Albania, UNDP, 2012.

⁹ Gëdeshi I., Miluka J., Needs Assessment Study on Roma and Egyptians Communities in Albania, UNDP, 2012.

	6 1: 1	D		
	four kindergartens in two regions	- Percentage of children of R/E population age 3-6 participating in		
	of Albania (Korça and	project kindergartens;		
	Gjirokastra)	- Percentage of R/E children who are enrolled in compulsory education.		
		b) Compulsory education		
		- Number of R/E children enrolled in project schools;		
		- Percentage of children of R/E population age 7-14 participating in		
		project schools;		
		- Number and percentage of R/E children benefiting from quality inputs (afternoon classes in Math and Albanian language, etc.);		
		- Passing rate for R/E children in Math and Albanian Language		
		(increasing with 1%);		
		- Average mark for R/E children in Math and Albanian Language		
		(improvement with 0.2);		
		- Improvement of academic results (average mark improvement; average		
		mark improve compare with the children of majority);		
		- Level of social interaction between R/E and Albanian children in		
		school and out of school significantly improved (number of activities,		
		etc.);		
		- Regular attendance is improved (with 10%);		
		- Number of R/E children who finish compulsory education;		
		- Percentage of R/E children who finish compulsory education;		
		- Transition rates to high school (62 % by June 2012).		
2.	Transfer experience and lessons	- Number of references of SC model or experiences in education policies		
	learned to the Ministry of	and strategies;		
	Education and Sciences, Regional	- SC inputs to regional policy development;		
	Education Authority (REA) and	- Number of teachers from project schools and non-project schools		
	School Administrators	trained and type of training;		
3.	Increase parent's involvement in	- Number of R/E parents trained and type of training;		
	- and support to inclusive	- Number of R/E parents that participate in meetings;		
	education.	- Number of R/E parents that participate in school boards.		

1.4. Evaluation scope and criteria

The ToR indicated that the evaluation of the Roma education project in Albania will cover the period from April 2012 until now.

The evaluation criteria by Organization for Economic Cooperation/Development Assistance Committee (OECD/DAC) were used as a general framework for this evaluation. These criteria are relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability. The evaluation criteria and questions are presented in the table below (table 4).

Table 4. Evaluation criteria and evaluation questions

Tuble II Biulu	tuble 4. Evaluation effects and evaluation questions				
Criteria Definition		Questions			
Relevance	The extent to which the intervention is suited to the priorities and policies of the target group, recipient and donor.	Is the project and intervention in tune with education, social and Roma policies in Albania? What are the education gaps and actual needs of the beneficiaries? Are			
		interventions selected to address those needs and gaps? Do they address and eliminate the main causes of the problem?			
Effectiveness	A measure of the extent to which an aid activity attains its objectives.	To what extent have the stated objectives of the project been achieved, or what progress was			

		made toward achieving these objectives? What are the contributing factors and reasons for the achievement or non-achievement of objectives? What have been the most effective strategies for achieving real results?
Efficiency	Efficiency measures the outputs – qualitative and quantitative – in relations to the inputs.	To what extent is the project delivering its activities cost-effectively in comparison with alternatives? Is there any evidence whether the same or better results might have been achieved through different means?
Impact	The positive and negatives changes produces by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended.	What impacts (positive and negative, intended and unintended) the project has made? To what extent can identified impacts and changes be attributed to the intervention? What capacities SC has improved and where? What would have occurred without the intervention?
Sustainability	Sustainability is concerned with measuring whether the benefits of an activity are likely to continue after donor funding has been withdrawn.	On what conditions will the benefits produced by the Roma education project be maintained after the cessation of external support? (institutional, financial, social, environmental sustainability) What is the risk, at the time of evaluation, that the expected outcomes of the project will not be realized?

2. Methodology

This evaluation is based on primary and secondary data analysis. The data was gathered using quantitative and qualitative techniques that include:

- 1) A desktop review of relevant literature (SC documents, project-proposal, reports, publications, external evaluation documents, data base on scholarships, official data, etc.);
- 2) Three different questionnaires with: a) R/E and non-R/E parents; b) R/E students; and c) representatives from educational institutions in Korça and Gjirokastra;
- c) Semi-structured interviews with representatives of R/E NGO, public institutions, implementers and beneficiaries of the project;
- d) FG with R/E and non-R/E parents and children in Korça and Gjirokastra; and
- e) Two workshops in Korça and Gjirokastra and one workshop in Tirana.

The process and methodology was agreed with the SC project team and the evaluator worked in close collaboration with them.

The stakeholders to be consulted were grouped into:

- Project implementing partners (REA, schools, kindergartens, and universities of Korça and Gjirokastra; Institute of Development of Education, and National Inspectorate of Pre-university Education);
- Direct beneficiaries (R/E and non-R/E children and their parents, teachers from the schools and kindergartens, representatives of R/E NGO-s);
- SC project team and coordinators in Tirana, Korça and Gjirokastra.

Findings and recommendations of this evaluation are the result of information gathered through quantitative and qualitative methods. The list of interviewed persons and analyzed material are presented in Annex A.

Field Research

The field research was carried out during the period from 12 to 20 November 2013 in Korça and Gjirokastra (3 days in each region) and in Tirana. The field research was facilitated by the SC project team, which coordinated well the meetings for surveys, interviews and FGs with different stakeholders.

During the field research were realized:

- 80 survey with R/E and non-R/E parents in Korça and Gjirokastra¹⁰. The survey contained 17 questions and was balanced in terms of ethnicity and gender. It provided quantitative information on the assessment of the impact produced by the SC project. All the surveys were put in and processed in the SPSS program.
- 70 survey with R/E students in Korça and Gjirokastra¹¹. The survey contained 14 questions and provided quantitative information on the behavior of teachers and students from the majority population towards the R/E students. The respondents were randomly selected from various school classes. All the surveys were put in and processed in the SPSS program.
- 31 survey with representatives of educational institutions in Korça, Gjirokastra and Tirana¹². The survey contained 17 questions and provided quantitative information on the impact and results of the SC project. The respondents were randomly selected from the pedagogical staff of schools/kindergartens and other educational institutions. All the surveys were put in and processed in the SPSS program.
- 69 semi-structured interviews with project beneficiaries and key stakeholders (R/E and non-R/E students and parents, representatives of R/E community and NGO, SC project team, teachers of schools/kindergarten, representatives of REA-s and local universities in Korça and Gjirokastra, officials of local and national government, representatives of IDE, representatives of NIPE, etc.) with special focus on a) the impact of SC project in reducing the educational gap of R/E children; b) impact of the project on qualitative education of R/E children; and c) explore ways how the project can strengthen its impact. Some questions were related to the sustainability, effectiveness and efficacy of the SC Project.
- 10 focus group discussions with beneficiaries (R/E and non-R/E children and parents, community representatives, and teachers) in the two project regions. In each of these FGs participated 7-12 individuals with various age, gender and socio economic background. These discussions allowed a broader and more open-ended discussions and insight in a) the problems of R/E education and the support provided by the SC project in overcoming them; b) assessment of the impact of the project at individual level; and c) the

¹⁰ Model of the survey used can be seen in Annex B.

¹¹ Model of the survey used can be seen in Annex C.

¹² Model of the survey used can be seen in Annex D.

sustainability of the project outcomes. The consultant facilitated focus group discussions and interviews using semi-structured questions. All focus group discussions and interviews are recorded, and a verbatim transcription is prepared. All names cited in the report are fictitious.

- The evaluator collected quantitative data in all four schools and kindergartens for school year 2008-2009 as a baseline and for 2012-2013 and 2013-2014. This information was used to construct the indicators and to see the progress of the project. Some of these data were compared even with the other schools that were not involved in the project. However gathering the data was a difficult task, as the schools that were not involved in the project did not keep detailed statistics for the R/E students.
- At the conclusion of the field work two workshops are organized in Korça and Gjirokastra. Participants included officials from REA, teachers from the schools and kindergartens, representatives from universities (faculties of teaching), parents and representatives from R/E community. The preliminary findings from the field work were discussed with the participants. Comments and input from the participants in the workshops are reflected in the draft report.
- **Stakeholder workshop** in Tirana. The preliminary finding of the consultant are discussed in a stakeholder workshop with the SC project team in Tirana, researchers from the IDE, representatives of NIPE, etc. Comments and input from the participants in the stakeholder workshop are reflected in the final report.

2.1. Major limitations of the evaluation

In Albania the education authorities do not collect ethnically disaggregated data making it difficult to compare the results of schools/kindergartens involved in the project and to those of other schools not involved in the project. The limited time for the evaluation of this project did not allow the survey and interview of a larger beneficiaries and partners. Also the timing was not appropriate since the new Government was just established after the new elections and the changes in the public administration were still on-going.

3. Findings

This chapter presents the findings for the SC project in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability. These terms correspond to the OECD-DAC evaluation criteria and constitute the framework of the evaluation.

3.1. Relevance

The activities implemented by SC project are highly relevant with regards to national priorities and identified gaps. These national priorities are expressed in different policy documents, sectoral strategies and primary or secondary legislation in Albania. The most important of these documents are ranked below:

- National Strategy for Improving the Roma Living Conditions 2003-2015;
- Roma Decade National Action Plan 2010-2015;
- National Strategy for Development and Integration (NSDI) 2007-2013; and
- National Strategy for Social Inclusion 2007-2013.

In the same time the SC project is relevant to EU strategies and policies. The protection of R/E is an integral part of the EU political criteria for accession. This is expressed even in the 'Opinion on Albania's membership request' and the 'Stabilization and Association Agreement', which include reference to the situation of marginalized and vulnerable groups, human rights, education and good governance. The SC project is also in line with different UN Conventions¹³ and OSCE 'Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti within the OSCE Area'.

SC project is implementing its activities in two regions of Albania (Korça and Gjirokastra) where a considerable number of R/E people live in difficult socio-economic conditions¹⁴. The project target pre-school and basic education, by prioritizing access and quality. It touches upon the main causes of problems and address real needs and aspirations of vulnerable people living in the edge of poverty. Project activities are distributed in an equilibrated way between rural and urban areas. According to the beneficiaries and Roma NGO, SC project is delivering tangible results at beneficiary level.

According to the survey, around 81 percent of the representatives from the educational institutions highlighted that the project is "very much" compliant with the national policy and strategy, while 50 percent highlighted that it is "very much" compliant with the local needs. Besides this, 82 percent of the respondents evaluate that the SC project is addressed "very well" to the educational needs of the R/E children.

In perspective, the activities of the project need to include also "pockets" or the small and remote R/E communities that are totally out of the system. For instance, in Gjirokastra SC project works mainly with the Roma community of Zinxhiraj. Apart from it there exists also a smaller community (about 23 households) that lives in shelters and where 2/3 of children do not attend school.

Another problem is also children of Roma families which stay several months in another city during school period by dropping out the school. Therefore, at the time of this evaluation, tens of Roma families in Gjirokastra were migrants (mainly from Berat, Rrapishta - Elbasan, Driza - Fier, Korça etc.). According to a respondent: "There are dozens of Roma families coming to Gjirokastra for seasonal jobs, in the informal sector in September and leave by the end of December. While their children do not attend school at all". Although this is a new phenomenon, observed during the last 2 years, the goal should be to register the Roma children temporarily in the schools of Gjirokastra city in order for them to not lose the academic year when they return to their place.

Lastly, the SC project to R/E education (mainly in Korça) is complemented with the activities of other international organizations, like UNICEF, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC), Terre des Hommes, etc¹⁵.

3.2. Efficacy

 $^{^{13}}$ Rights of the Child, Elimination of Racial Discrimination and Discrimination of Women

¹⁴ A study commissioned by UNICEF (2012) showed that about 12% of Roma population in Albania lived in Korça and Giirokastra.

¹⁵ For example, the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) is implementing with NPF in Korça the project 'Alternated Education and Vocational Education Project'.

The SC project has several objectives which are accompanied by indicators that would allow assessing efficacy. From the analysis of the indicators the evaluator found that SC project is efficient, although any of its elements can be improved.

The First objective, - 'establish quality inclusive education in four schools and four kindergartens in two regions of Albania', - there is a range of quantitative indicators and it is easier to evaluate. These indicators proved that there is a tangible and stable progress in realizing the objective. The SC project provides effective help to the R/E children, which is expressed in their increased access and school results. Kujtimja, a Roma mother from Zinxhiraj, Gjirokastra states: "All our children attend the school and kindergarten. SC has worked a lot with the mediators and has done a lot for the children. Before the intervention we did not know the school or the kindergarten. No child used to go, while during the four years of the SC project, all the children attend the kindergarten and the school". In addition, the project strengthens the R/E student identity, has increased the diversity and communication among children, and has created a comprehensive environment through different activities.

The efficacy of the second objective, - 'transfer experience and lessons learned to the MoES, REA and School Administrators', - is more difficult to assess. There are fewer indicators compared to 1st objective and it appears to be more difficult in data collection to measure them. Some evaluations, especially on the macro aspect of this objective, will be given in the recommendations of this report.

Meanwhile, it is evident that SC project has contributed and is contributing in capacity building. The training of the REA experts and school teachers marks progress, which is emphasized by all the respondents. Almost 94 percent of the respondents from the educational institutions emphasize that the SC project has increased the institutional capacities. This institutional aspect is not noticed only in the didactic capabilities, but also in the behaviors of the teachers towards the R/E students, inside and outside the school. Most R/E students state in their answers that teachers behave friendly with them inside and outside the classes; they help them when they need help, encourage them to speak during lessons and do not exclude them from the majority students. In interviews and FGs, the R/E students express positive evaluations for their teachers. Luani, a Roma student from Korça states: "The teachers behave very well; create a warm atmosphere during the lessons so we can feel at ease. (...) They behave the same way with us as with the other students". This evaluation of the R/E students is noticed even in the survey results. (see Annex 3).

The parent involvement in support to inclusive education is obviously a success. The R/E parents participate in the organized trainings on various topics; they are part of the boards and parents' councils, attend the parents' meetings and have changed their attitude towards the children's education. This is emphasized also during an interview by Vjollca, a teacher in Korça, who says: "Through discussions and trainings, we have progressively transformed the R/E parents in supporters of their children's education." Meanwhile Avdija, a Roma mother from Gjirokaster, says that: "We are pleased with our children frequenting kindergartens and schools. (...) In kindergartens the children have secured food and parents do not have to worry. (...) There is also training in schools, we discuss about different issues, ask about our behaviors in families towards children, on hygiene and cleaning etc."

Interviews and FG show that the best strategy to achieve these objectives is the inclusive one (providing after-school support, raise awareness among R/E parents about the importance of their children's education, intercultural education, etc.).

3.3. Efficiency

According to the opinion of the respondents the SC project and activities have been generally implemented in an efficient manner and the staffs working with beneficiaries has a high level of motivation and competence. The evaluator thinks that the quality of the services rendered by the project is evaluated to be high compared to local standards. The project did not experience delays that would have had negative consequences on its performance.

Comparison with other similar projects shows that the SC project is more efficient concerning the results and number of beneficiaries. This is expressed in the survey conducted with representatives of REA-s and others educational institutions¹⁶. Thus, 93 percent of the representatives of surveyed educational institutions think that the SC project is more efficient compared to similar projects of other organizations/institutions¹⁷. Besides this, around 71 percent of them state that the SC project is efficient and no better results (or similar results with fewer expenses) could be achieved. This happens because the SC project has properly selected the most relevant areas for the introduction of the activities and has managed to reach a high number of beneficiaries by applying a concentrated effort.

Several factors contributed to this result. The first among them is that SC project has found the right way to join/mobilize other donors' funds (Medicor, REF) to achieve the objectives. Another factor is that SC project has properly cooperated with the public education institutions (kindergartens/schools, REAs, universities, official education institutions, etc.) reducing therefore the cost. The third factor is the dedicated and motivated staff of the SC project, some of whom are ethnic Roma. Almost in all interviews and FG conducted with Roma NGO, Roma parents and SC partners it was stated the dedication, communication and good cooperation among them.

Also some elements in the project need to be more efficient. For instance activities related to conduct of professional course for R/E youth could have been more efficient if followed by a labor market research, which in fact did not take place. Though successful completion of such professional courses are considered (long term) assets to the youth who got those courses, they didn't result in any immediate employment or opportunity to get employed.

3.4. Impact

SC project have produced a new model to support access and better educational outcomes for R/E children. During the interviews and FGs, most of the beneficiaries unanimously agree that SC project has had a real and visible impact in improving the education status of R/E children in Korça and Gjirokastra. These project impacts can be seen in individual, middle and macro level.

¹⁶The question in the survey was: Compared to the projects of other organizations, how efficient has been the SC project? The respondents had several alternatives to answer: More; the same; less; and don't know.

17 Different international organizations, like UNICEF, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation, Terre des

Hommes, etc. are working in Korca.

The impacts in individual level are visible. The R/E children attend kindergarten, are enrolled to and attend school, the school abandonment that has been an 'exclusive phenomenon for R/E students' is now at minimal level, the school outcomes are tangible etc (see tables 5 and 6). What is more important is that these impacts affect both genders. This is also emphasized in an interview by Mira, a Roma SC project coordinator: "Usually, starting from grade VI or VII, the Roma girls drop out of school. Before this phenomenon was more significant, while today it has started to change. The 12-13 years old girls attend up to 9th grade and pas that phase. But even the parents are different now (...) Last year we did not have any school dropout from Roma girls."

What is important is that SC project has undertaken several measures to overcome obstacles in education of RE children. Consequently, many children in need receive assistance in school materials, children at kindergarten are granted free food, transport for children residing far from school is guaranteed, pupils that do not perform well with lessons participate in Albanian language courses and math courses, many of them prepare homework at class under R/E parents supervision etc. Moreover, SC project organized part time education for R/E children never been in school and vocational training for young Roma (table 5).

Table 5. Activities for R/E children

Activities	2012-2013	2013-2014
Number of R/E children enrolled and attending schools/kindergarten	606	622
Number of R/E children benefiting educational materials	421 ¹⁹	445
Number of R/E children participating in the catch up classes in Math and Albanian	145^{20}	134
Language		
Number of R/E children supporting with home works	81 ²¹	81
Number of R/E children benefiting transportation to reach the schools and	21	17
kindergartens		
Number of R/E children benefiting food service in pilot kindergartens	38	60
Number of R/E children never been in school benefiting part time education for	22	16
Number of young Roma benefiting vocational training	22	26

Source: Save the Children, 2013

Alongside increased access, their education has become more qualitative. The strengthening of identity of R/E students, training of parents and teachers, the participation of R/E parents in school councils, the help that teachers provide to R/E students in classes after school, participation in school activities and the increasing integration have made school more friendly. Comparing two schools in Korça, one part of the SC project and the other not, Mimoza, a teacher participating in a FG, says: "I have been also to another school where there were Roma and Egyptian students but there the phenomena of abandonment was present and the treatment of R/E students needs improvement".

This more qualitative education can be measured through student success and learning outcomes. Therefore data show that absences have diminished and the rate of R/E students who successfully complete the year has increased. The average mark especially in Albanian language

¹⁸ UNICEF., "No to School Dropout", Causes, Recommendations. Korça, January 2008.

¹⁹ Narrative report, July-September 2012.

²⁰ Narrative report, July-September 2012.

²¹ Narrative report, July-September 2012.

and mathematics has increased from one year to the other while the gap with the majority has decreased²². The table below shows the results of four schools in the cities of Korça and Gjirokastër where SC project has intervened (table 6).

Table 6. The dynamics of some qualitative indicators for R/E students in four schools of SC

project

Indicators	Asdreni		Pojan		Cajupi		Koto Hoxhi	
	11/12	12/13	11/12	12/13	11/12	12/13	11/12	12/13
Average grade in Math	6.62	6.74	5.63	5.78	6.38	6.41	5.73	5.42
Average grade in Albanian Language	6.45	6.5	5.53	6.07	7.04	7.20	6	6.31
Average number of absences	64.9	59.3	25.6	18.9	5.79	59.84	51.8	38.3
Passing rate in Math	96.76	97.08	77.5	84.44	88.66	92.73	59.1	65.38
Passing rate in Albanian Language	91.2	94.58	90.0	95.56	96.9	99.1	63.64	76.92

Source: Save the Children, Schools statistics, 2013

Also the number of R/E students that continue their studies in high school has increased. Therefore, from 35 R/E children in all SC project schools in Korça and Gjirokastra that completed the 9th grade in June 2011, 54 percent have continued in high school. In June 2012, out of 37 R/E children that completed school, 67.5 percent of them have continued in professional high school. In the FG organized with the teachers of "Asdreni" school in Korça, a director says: "Many girls from R/E community started high schools both general and professional ones such as foreign languages and economics. Compared to the period prior to the project this means that a taboo was broken. There is progress and moving forward".

Even in middle levels these impacts are significant. The illiteracy level in the R/E community has decreased, and the educational gap with the majority population is reduced²³. An REA inspector in Gjirokaster tells her experience: "The number of R/E students is increasing. In the academic year 2008 - 2009 we had only 18 R/E children enrolled in the project's kindergartens or schools. While now their number is multiplied several times. This required obviously a radical change of the R/E parents and community mentality, as well as other actors. (...) When the project started, we had many Roma parents taking their children out to beg. The other children used to collect cans in the recycle bins, while the girls were kept at home as it was a shame for them to attend school after the age of 10 years old. Differently from other projects we have realized with the SC, this one faced a very difficult community, a community that had survival as a primary need. When you are hungry, for sure the risk is much higher and the interlocutor does not understand when you talk about the importance of education. (...) While today the Roma parents tell us "I want to give my child a better life as I don't know how to read and write".

Besides this, the SC cooperates closely with the municipalities and REAs to build capacities and to improve their local education plans. Almost 94 percent of the representatives of surveyed educational institutions state that the SC project has built the institutional capacities of the

²² A comparison of the average grade during school year 2012/2013 with the year 2011/2012 of R/E pupils and majority ones shows the gap of average grade between them has been decreased by 0.2 in Albanian Language and 0.15 in math.

²³ Increase in number of R/E pupils that register and frequent school, reduction or elimination of school dropout, increase of passing rate and of average grade, increase of number of pupils that register in high school, courses against illiteracy etc show that the educational gap with the majority population is reduced.

educational institutions. Therefore the number of teachers who have benefited from training has increased up to 180 in SC project. The SC has also been an active part of the organized roundtables where it has provided its ideas to improve the education situation of R/E.

While in macro level, the SC project is a new model for the educational system, which needs to be replicated and spread in all the schools of the country. SC has established close cooperation with Institute of Development of Education and National Inspectorate of Pre-university Education which is concretized in the exchange of information, experience and ideas. At the national level according to the interviews SC project has helped to draft 3 modules for the training of teachers on Roma history and culture which have been included into trainings²⁴.

Besides the positive impacts, the SC project has also any negative unintended impact which should be minimized in the coming years. Therefore increase in number of R/E children in any school or kindergarten brings in the phenomenon of creation of "R/E schools", which was not a typical feature (even vaguely) of the Albanian education system. For example, statistics show that in "Asdreni" school in Korça the percentage of R/E students is increasing. Therefore in the academic year 2008-2009 R/E students represented 33.5 percent of the schools' population, in 2011-2012 they reached 41.8 percent, while in 2013-2014 they reached 54 percent. This is stated also by a former school director: "In 2005-2006 the number of R/E students was small, and then it has increased. (...) They have found a warm environment in our school..." This unwanted trend seems to continue in the future, as for the academic year 2013 - 2014 the percentage of R/E students in the elementary school (grades I - V) is 57 percent out of 49 percent in the secondary school (grades VI-IX)²⁵. This phenomenon occurs on one hand due to the increasing enrollment of R/E students in the school, and on the other hand due to the dropout (or non - enrollment) of students from the majority population. According to interviews some parents from the majority due to pre-judgments think that increase of the number of R/E students in class will have negative effects in the quality of education. Miranda, a primary school teacher tells: "I have 4 Roma students and 6 Egyptians from 17 students in total in the class so it is more than half of the class and the same occurs almost in all the school. (...) In this school I have 10 years that teach. If before R/E students could be counted with the fingers of one hand actually they are more than half of class. This is explained by the selection of the school by this community (...) For instance they do not want to go to "Naim Frasheri" school since the lower group of R/E frequent that school while in our school a more elite group of them is coming. They feel more - praised here. (...) While students from majority are leaving. Their number is decreasing. They tend to go to schools nearer the center of the town, and better off. In these schools of the center at the first grade there are 35 students, so there is more flow of students in best schools. So the children from the majority of this neighborhood go to other schools."

3.5. Sustainability

²⁴ **IKAP & Save the Children,.** Një shkollë për të gjithë. (Broshurë për përfshirjen e fëmijëve romë/egjiptianë dhe me vështirësi të tjera në edukim), Tiranë 2013.

²⁵ In kindergarten 7 and 8 in Korça the number of R/E children is respectively 78.9 percent and 58 percent of the total number of children in these kindergartens. While in kindergarten 5 and 6 in Gjirokastra R/E children constitute 49.5 percent and 30.9 percent of the children in these kindergartens.

The sustainability of the project can be seen in short term, mid-term and long term. In short term the socio-economic environment on which the SC project takes place is fluid and has an impact on the performance accelerating or limiting the progress that can be accomplished. The slow down of economic development in Albania, budgetary shrinkages, increase of poverty – mostly for R/E families – and migration of population of course impact the results of education. Also during the field-work in Korça and Gjirokastër it was observed that almost all the directors of educational institutions with which the team project cooperates were replaced. However, these elements do not substantially influence the results of the project and can be managed²⁶.

In the mid and long term the situation is different if we suppose the cessation of financial support, which is a concern for all the participants of interviews and FGs. In the survey with the representatives of educational institutions, almost 71 percent of the respondents stated they want "more financial support". In a FG with teachers in Korça it was stated that: "cessation of funding would also bring the end of activities". While in an interview, one school director in Gjirokastra emphasized that "The chances are very scarce, if not zero as these R/E pupils await for September for us to give them books, bags, notebooks and provide them transport. The first days of school they wait for us and ask if the school items came. (...)". Consequently, there are no signs that the SC activities as a whole would be continued at the same service quality if there is no external financing and as long as the Government do not contribute to them.

Meanwhile, some elements of the SC project are sustainable. For examples, in the SC project's schools teachers and parents were trained, in classes they talk about R/E culture and history, the classes for extra hours are available, many R/E parents understand the importance of education for their children, R/E students are part of the "Children Government" and the school environment is friendly. All these elements are gained by now.

The other activities which depend or are fully dynamized by external funds can be continued by finding new alternatives. One of those alternatives is volunteerism. For examples, for the teachers that help R/E students after classes this can be resolved with students from the pedagogical faculty of Korça and Gjirokastra universities (hungarian experience). The magistral students in the University of Korça and Gjirokastra can take under their patronage (even for a small reward) the R/E students as per the Tanoda experience in other European countries (Hungary, Bulgaria, etc.). In an interview, a pedagogy professor at the University of Gjirokastra said: "In both the elementary and the preschool level we have students that are diligent and responsible and can do this". The parents of non - R/E students can also contribute in used clothes or books for the R/E children. To achieve this, the SC project team should discuss more with the parents' committees and the pupils' governments in order to get iniatives and new forms of collaboration.

Another alternative would be the Municipality²⁷ taking over gradually the free meal for the R/E children (as well as part of the majority population families with low incomes) in the city kindergartens. The municipality could do the same for the school equipments for the R/E

²⁶ Replacement of directors and staff of educational institutions is a repetitive phenomenon. This was addressed by the project team through new trainings, workshops, contacts etc.

²⁷ Under the current legislation Municipalities have the possibilities to co-fund service delivery by NGOs

22

students, whose families have big economic difficulties. For this the SC should establish a partnership and lobby with the local governance regarding the dynamism or the continuation of some services (food, transport, school equipment, etc) after the end of the project.

The third alternative is the Government or the REA to take over and generalize this model (or its main elements), successfully experimented for several years by the SC in Korça and Gjirokastra. For example, the teachers with less teaching load can assist the R/E students in preparing their homework and in the subjects they need the most. Luljeta, a REA representative in Gjirokastra underlined in an interview: "on the legal, institutional context, we are obliged to do this". For this purpose SC project team need to cooperate more with the national and local media in order to promote its activities and the results of this project.

Finally, the SC should lobby to find new funding resources which would enable the continuation and expansion of its activities.

4. Recommendations

Based on the evaluation findings and to strengthen the SC project impact we make the following recommendations:

1. SC project has managed to create within a short period of time a new and successful model of education, which has had, especially at micro and mezzo level, a very positive impact. The surveys, interviewes and FG conducted during this assessment indicate that achievements to create access to education and the impact on education quality are highly valued. The majority of the respondents (in the interviews and FG) were of the opinion that without SC project, the situation of R/E in Korça and Gjirokastra would be worse²⁸.

Meanwhile, in perspective the SC project – due to the fluid socio-economic environment – will continue to face new challenges (poverty, internal migration, the return of Roma migrants etc.) which should be carefully managed. That is why it is necessary the consolidation for some years of this established model and its dissemination (if extra financial resources are provided) in other schools/kindergartens.

2. The SC project should shift from micro to mezzo and macro level. The model should gradually be included into the education system and positive experiences should be disseminated. This requires the construction of functional relations with REA, MoES and other education institutes.

For the evaluator it is clear that the changes in educational policies are not an attribute of one single institution or organization. Despite this fact, the role of SC in the promotion of the successful model should be increased. Through its representatives, SC should promote dialogue with policy makers in order that the results, practices and elements of its model become visible. SC should also increase the cooperation with the local and international organizations in order to strengthen the advocacy and to gradually impose, in the educational policies, elements of its model.

²⁸ This is expressed in the interview of a REA representative in Gjirokastra that says: "We have our duties, our working plans, Roma decade plans (...) SC project has helped us to achieve our objectives".

3. The successful experiences and positive practices, established by SC project, should be better disseminated to education institutions and R/E NGOs. This would not only ensure information but would also provide new alternatives for solving similar problems. Meanwhile this would increase even the visibility of SC model.

23

- 4. During the next phase, it will be important:
 - The organization of a training/workshop of local media regarding the educational needs of the R/E communities;
 - Furthermore the publication of articles and documentaries that talk about the positive aspects (the work of the SC project, mediators, teachers in the schools/kindergartens, the achievements of some individuals that can serve as an example for the others, etc) and promote the values of R/E community.
- 5. During post-socialist transition some of the projects funded by international donors have unintended influenced in the increase in number of R/E children in some schools and kindergartens. Therefore increase in number of R/E children in schools or kindergartens brought in the phenomenon of creation of "R/E schools". This phenomenon seems to have started even during implementation of SC project. There are some solutions to eliminate this phenomenon: to distance
 - The first among them is the dissemination of the project (or of some its important elements) if financial possibilities are provided in all the schools/kindergartens of the city. This would stop the actual "*migration*" of R/E children from schools/kindergartens that are not included in the SC project towards those that are included.
 - In absence to this initiative, SC project should cooperate more (through trainings, workshops, individual discussions etc.) with the parents of the students of the majority population, ²⁹ so that they do not "*migrate*" (in oposite direction) from schools.
 - Lastly, SC project should contribute to the awareness rising of education institutions (REA, schools/kindergartens, universities, etc) on the negative long term consequences of segregation. It should disseminate some of the successful desegregation experiences realized by some of the countries of Roma decade, so that this sporadic phenomena does not become sustainable in Albania.
- 6. Based on quantitative and qualitative data gathered by the evaluator, it results that the educational gap between R/E and non-R/E has been narrowed, but there are still some concerns here. The first among them is that there still exist some "pockets" or small R/E communities that are not included at the desired level in the education system. To ilustrate this, in Gjirokastër the

²⁹ This cooperation does exist and has had some results, but it needs to be deeper in order to minimize the getting away of the children from the majority from the schools/kindergartens included in SC project. During an interview, Pranvera, an experienced kindergarten educator, underlines that: "When SC project started, I recall very well a discussion held during a meeting with a mother from the majority population. She said that "she could not leave her child get some kind of infection from the Roma", "I do not want that my child be part of this group". These were huge challenges for us. With the passing of time, due to the trainings that were organized by the directory and educators of the kindergartens, due to the meetings organized in the homes of the children from the majority, the situation started to gradually change".

24

level of illiteracy among the Roma children in the area called "Tregu i shumicës" continuous to be high³⁰. Secondly, as above described, the seasonal migration during the last two years in Gjirokastër, especially during the period September – December, is higher. As a consequence many Roma children, who do not have the possibility to get registered, lose the school year. In this case, SC might provide support to REA so that these children get registered in the schools of Gjirokastër city and than they should be facilitated to be transferred to the schools nearby their living places.

7. The SC project should pay more attention to the vocational program for R/E over 16 years old. These vocational programs should be anticipated by an analysis of the local labor market demand for skills. Meanwhile, links of the R/E education with the vocational training programs would be another achievement of the project. In this case, it would be useful that a synergy between the local government, private enterprises and other agencies of interest be created in order to facilitate the R/E employment that would complete the vocational training. Employment of some R/E would be a good motivation for the children that go to school, and their parents as well, who could thus observe the long-term benefits of education.

Meanwhile, the investment in the profession that are not in line with the demands and the requests of the local labor market, or that do not produce employment for the R/E youngsters, would be ineffective and apart from this would demotivate the training of the others.

8. In the future SC can take into consideration the possibility of supporting R/E community in the creation of social businesses linking employment of R/E with their children's education. Such businesses can be created with straw products (for example, the Roma in Gjirokastra have traditions with this), the collection and sale of scrap metal, paper or glass recycling, collection and sale of medicinal plants, etc. In this case the SC may initially perform research and conduct social business project. Through this project (which, obviously would require a prerequisite the education of children), SC can provide better living conditions and education of children by increasing motivation of R/E families. By offering support to social business, SC also can close the cycle of education, employment and vocational training for R/E children.

_

³⁰Gëdeshi I., Jorgoni E., Mapping Roma Children in Albania, UNICEF, 2012.

Bibliography

- **De Soto H., Beddies S., Gëdeshi I.**, Roma and Egyptians in Albania: From social exclusion to social inclusion, The World Bank, Washington D.C., 2005.
- **Dudwick N., Shahriari H.**, Education in Albania: Changing Attitudes and Expectations, Washington D.C., The World Bank, 2000.
- **ERRC**., No Record of the Case: Roma in Albania, Country Report Series N. 5, June1997, Budapest.
- Gëdeshi I., Jorgoni E., Mapping Roma Children in Albania, UNICEF, 2012.
- **Gëdeshi I., Miluka J.**, Needs Assessment Study on Roma and Egyptians Communities in Albania, UNDP, 2012.
- **Government of Albania**., National Strategy for improving Roma living conditions, 2003.
- **INSTAT**, Population of Albania, 2001
- **INSTAT.**, Shqipëria. Rezultatet Paraprake të Censusit të Popullsisë dhe Banesave 2011, Dhjetor 2011.
- **IKAP & Save the Childre,.** Një shkollë për të gjithë. (Broshurë për përfshirjen e fëmijëve romë/egjiptianë dhe me vështirësi të tjera në edukim), Tiranë 2013.
- **Komiteti Shqiptar i Helsinkit**., Studim i politikave për minoritetet dhe strategjitë e financimit në Shqipëri, Tiranë 2007.
- Mid-term evaluation Report of the "Inclusive Quality Pre-Primary and Primary Education for Roma/Egyptian Children" project -2011.
- National Strategy for Development and Integration (2007-2013)
- National Strategy for Social Inclusion (2007-2013)
- National Education Strategy (2004-2015)
- Observatory for Children's Rights., Child Poverty in Albania. Report Card 1, June 2013.
- Sinani Gj., Taho B. Country Assessment Albania, Roma Eduction Fund, 2011.
- **Tamo, A.**, **Karaj, Th.**, Situata Arsimore e Fëmijëve Romë në Shqipëri, UNICEF, Tiranë 2007.
- **UNDP**., The socio-economic situation of Roma in Albania, 2005.
- UNICEF., "No to School Dropout", Causes, Recommendations. Korça, January 2008.

Annex A

List of respondents

List	of respondents			
Nr	Emri i personit të	Institution	Pozicioni	Vendi
	intervistuar			
1	Ilir Bozdo	University "Eqrem Cabej"	Head of Department	Gjirokastër
2	Naxhi Mamani	University "Eqrem Cabej"	Professor	Gjirokastër
3	Shaze Shehu	Regional Education Authority	Inspector	Gjirokastër
4	Majko Majko	Save the Children project	Coordinator	Gjirokastër
5	Anila Coni	Kindergarten Nr. 5, Zinxhiraj	Director	Gjirokastër
6	Sarantina Lamaj	School "Andon Zako Cajupi"	Director	Gjirokastër
7	Blerta Novi	School "Andon Zako Cajupi"	Deputy Director	Gjirokastër
8	Mirjeta Kuka	School "Andon Zako Cajupi"	School teacher	Gjirokastër
9	FG with R/E parents	School "Andon Zako Cajupi"	R/E parent	Gjirokastër
10	FG with R/E students	School "Andon Zako Cajupi"	R/E Students	Gjirokastër
11	Eva Korkuti	School "Koto Hoxhi"	School teacher	Gjirokastër
12	Vasjar Zijai	Save the Children project	School teacher	Gjirokastër
13	Gerta Xega	Save the Children project	Coordinator	Gjirokastër
14	Thanas Ajdini	Roma Association	President	Gjirokastër
15	Valbona Sulejmani	Save the Children project	R/E Prindëreshë	Gjirokastër
16	Imiska Ajdini	Save the Children project	R/E Prindëreshë	Gjirokastër
17	Luljeta Ajazi	Save the Children project	R/E Prindëreshë	Gjirokastër
18	FG with R/E students	School "Andon Zako Cajupi"	R/E Students	Gjirokastër
19	Arberesha Mushani	Save the Children in Albania		Tiranë
20	Refik Cela	Save the Children in Albania	Program Implementation Manager	Tiranë
21	Besnik Kadesha	Save the Children in Albania	PDQ and Program Quality	Tiranë
22	Blerina Tepelena	Ministry for Social Welfare and Youth	Expert	Tiranë
23	Arben Rexha	School "Andon Zako Cajupi"	Deputy Director	Gjirokastër
24	Afërdita Dhori	School "Asdreni"	Director	Korçë
25	Migena Mecollari	School "Asdreni"	School teacher	Korçë
26	Focus Group	School "Asdreni"	R/E Students	Korçë
27	Focus Group	School "Asdreni"	R/E Students	Korçë
28	Focus Group	School "Asdreni"	Qeveria e nxënësve	Korçë
29	Monika Nure	School "Asdreni"	R/E parent	Korçë
30	Rabjan Rushiti	School "Asdreni"	R/E parent	Korçë
31	Gjergj Pendavinji	University "Fan Noli"	Professor	Korçë
32	Arben Kosturi	Roma Association "Disutni Albania"	President	Korçë
33	Donika Rrapushi	Kindergarten	Edukatore	Korçë
34	Roma parent	School "Asdreni"	R/E parent	Korçë
35	Gramoz Bregu	Ministry of Education and Science	Education Expert	Tiranë
36	Mirjeta Ramizi	OSCE	Expert	Tiranë

Annex B

Anketë me prindërit romë dhe egjiptianë

Qëllimi i kësaj ankete është vlerësimi i projektit të Save the Children "Inclusive Quality Pre-
Primary, Primary and Secondary Education for Roma and Egyptian Children in Albania".
Anketa shpreh mendimet tuaja dhe ka rëndësi për vlerësimin dhe përmirësimin e punës së
projektit. Anketa është anonime.

Rrethi _	Qyteti Fs	hati		
1. I	Mosha 2. Gjinia 3. Etnia: a) Shqiptare	ia: a) Shqiptare; b) Egjiptiane; c) Rome		
a) i	iveli juaj arsimor (vetëm një përgjigje): pa arsimuar; b) arsim fillor; c) arsim 8/9 vjecar; d) arsin esional; e) arsim universitar.	m i mesëm i përgjithshëm ose		
5. N	umri i fëmijëve 3 deri 18 vjec?			
	umri i fëmijëve që ndjekin shkollën/kopshtin? a) Shkoll roblemet kryesore që ndesh fëmija juaj në lidhje me ara			
Nr	Disa nga problemet	Klikoni një ose më shumë		
1	Kopshti/shkolla është larg vendbanimit			
2	Nxënësit romë kanë vështirësi në gjuhën shqipe			
3	Mësuesit i trajtojnë keq			
4	Nxënësit e tjerë nuk i pranojnë midis tyre			
5	Mësuesit nuk kanë kohë për tu shpjeguar			
6	Mungesa e rrobave të përshtatshme			
7	Nuk kemi para per tu blerë libra, material shkollore, etj			
8	Fëmijët nuk mësojnë për historinë/kulturën rome në shkollë			
9	Askush në shtëpi nuk mund ti ndihmojë në bërjen e detyrave të shtëpisë			
10	Fëmijët duhet të kujdesen për familjet e tyre			
11	Martesat në moshë të hershme (sidomos për vaizat)			

8. Si ju ka ndihmuar projekti i Save the Children në kapërcimin e tyre?

Nr	Ndihma	Klikoni një ose më shumë
1	Identifikimi i fëmijëve romë/egjiptianë jashtë sistemit	
	arsimor dhe ndihmë për tu regjistruar	
2	Transport falas për në kopsht/shkollë	
3	Materiale shkollore falas	
4	Ndihmë në veshmbathje	
5	Kurse të gjuhës shqipe për fëmijët romë	
6	Në orët e mësimit diskutohet për historinë/kulturën	
	rome	

7	I ndihmon në shkollë në bërjen e d	etyrave të shtëpisë				
8	Kurse të matematikës për fëmijët					
9	Punon me prindërit lidhur me rënd	ësinë e shkollimit				
10	Krijon një mjedis miqsor në shkoll	lë				
11	Trainim profesional					
12	Tjetër (specifikoje)					
a) S	9. A jeni të kënaqur nga zhvillimi i këtyre aktiviteteve?a) Shumë i kënaqur; b) Disi i kënaqur; c) As i kënaqur, as i pakënaqur; d) Aspak i kënaqur					
	Kë krahasim me vitet e mëparshm humë më miqsor; b) Miqsor; c) i nj	•	ë për fëmijën tuaj është:			
a) I	 11. A vëreni ndonjë progress në arsimimin e fëmijës suaj në shkollë në krahasim me periudhën e mëparshme? a) PO, ka progresuar shumë; b) Po, ka progres; c) Është e njëjta gjendje përsa i përket rezultateve arsimore; d) Jo, fëmija ka rënje në rezultatet arsimore 					
12. (Cfarë do të kishte ndodhur nëse p	rojekti i Save the Children	n nuk do ju ndihmonte?			
b) (b) Gjendja arsimore e fëmijëve romë/egjiptianë do të ishte e njëjtë					
	13. Si i vlerësoni rezultatet e projektit të Save the Children në raport me progresin e fëmijës/fëmijve tuaj?					
a) Shumë të mira b) të mira	c) as të mira as të këqia	d) jo të mira			
14. <i>A</i>	14. A mendoni se aktivitetet e projektit do të vazhdojnë pas përfundimit të tij?					
a) Po b) Jo c) Pjes	ërisht d) Nuk e di	i			
15. N	15. Në vendbanimin tuaj ka projekte të tjera për arsimimin e romëve/egjiptianëve?					
a) Po b) Jo c) Nuk	e di				
16. N	16. Nqse Po, këto projekte a janë më efikase se ai i Save the Children?					
a) Më efikas b) I njëjtë	c) Më pak efikas	d) Nuk e di			
17. Cfarë ndihme tjetër do të dëshironit të kishit për arsimimin e fëmijëve tuaj? Pershkruani						

Ju falëminderit për pjesmarrjen.

Annex C

Anketë me përfaqësues të institucioneve arsimore

Seksioni A. Karakteristikat socio-demogr	afike të të	anketuarit			
1. Mosha vjec 2. Gjinia : 2. M	Mashkull () 2. Fe	mër ()	
3. Vendbanimi: (Ju lutem specifikoni) Rret	hi	Q:	yteti/fshati		
4. Cfarë institucioni përfaqësoni? (Ju lute	m zgjidhni	një)			
a) Ministri b) DAR c) Shkollë e) Qeveria lokale (Ju lutem përcaktoni drejte) Tjetër (sp	ecifikoni)
5. Sa vjet keni që punoni në këtë instituci	on? () v	/jet			
6. Cili është pozicioni juaj në këtë instituc	cion? (një j	përgjigje)			
a) Drejtues () b) Drejtues i mesëm (d) Mësues/Edukatore e) Tjetër (specifikoni					
7. Në cfarë mase mendoni se projekti i Sa				~	l
Nr Delicition the state in its least its	Shumë	Deri në një	farë mase	Aspak	Nuk e di
1 Politikën dhe strategjinë kombëtare2 Nevojat lokale					
8. A po i adresohet sic duhet projekt romëve/egjiptianëve në rrethin tuaj?			_		amore te
a) Shumë mirë b) Deri diku	ŕ	Aspak	ŕ	Nuk e di	
9. Si ka kontribuar projekti i Save tharsimimin e romëve/egjiptianëve?	ne Childr	en në shpër	ndarjen e	shërbii	neve për
 Ka rritur aksesin në arsim; Ka përmirësuar cilësinë e ars Ka ulur segregimin; Ka pilotuar, testuar dhe nder Ka rritur ndërgjegjësimin për Ka mobilizuar fonde shtesë p Tjetër (ju lutem përshkruaj Nuk e di 	marrë shër r nevojat d për arsimin	he përfitimet nin e romëve/	egjiptianëv		
10. Si ka kontribuar projekti i Save the ndërhyrjen më të rëndësishme)	Children	në zhvillim	in e kapad	citeteve?	(zgjidhni

- Ka rritur kapacitetet institucionale të institucioneve qeveritare;
- Ka rritur kapacitetet institucionale të institucioneve arsimore;
- Ka rritur kapacitetet institucionale të shoqërisë civile;

•	Tjetër (përshkruaje)_ Nuk e di		
Children ka p	oatur në nivele të ndry		dikimin që projekti i Save the comëve? (vlerësoni me notë nga 1, di")
•	Arsim parashkollor (nata) _ Arsimi fillor (nota) _ Arsimi 9 vjecar (nota Trainimi profesional		
		e Children ka qenë ba ë ardhmen në këtë dre	shkëpunues me institucionin tuaj jtim? (jep pergjigje)
romëve/egjipt	ianëve në fushat e më	1 9	ave the Children në arsimimin e eriencës suaj? (vlerësoni me notë 'nuk e di")
•	Ka përmirësuar cilësi	rsim të romëve/egjiptian në e arsimimit të romëv tatet mësimore të romëv	
_	omandimet tuaja se si p ë se një përgjigje)	projekti i Save the Chi	ldren mund të forcojë ndikimin e
•	Më shumë mbështetje Më shumë lobim në r Të punojë më shumë Të punojë më shumë Tjetër	nivel politik	izatat lokale)
_	•	_	se më të mira mund të arriheshin rejtim më të mirë? (një përgjigje)
Po ()	Jo ()	Nuk e di ()	
16. Krahasuai	r me projektet e organ	izatave të tjera, sa efik	as ka qënë SCA? (një përgjigje)
Më shumë ()	Njësoj ()	Më pak ()	Nuk e di ()
	2 0	a politika/fonde që m raktikat e promovuara	bështesin në mënyrë të pavarur nga projekti.
Ju falëminderit	për pjesmarrjen.		

Annex D

Anketa me nxënësit romë/egjiptianë

I dashur nxënës/nxënëse,

Ky pyetësor kërkon nga ju që të përshkruani sjelljen e mësuesve dhe të shokëve tuaj të mazhorancës. Përgjigjet që do të jepni nuk do të lexohen nga mësuesit tuaj dhe kjo nuk do të ndikojë në notat tuaja. MOS E SHKRUANI EMRIN TUAJ MBI KËTË PYETËSOR. Ne na intereson ç'mendojnë nxënësit në përgjithësi dhe jo ju si individ. Ju lutem, plotësojeni këtë pyetësor në mënyrë sa më të sinqertë pasi informacioni do të mbetet anonim dhe do të përpunohet në mënyrë konfidenciale.

Thënie/Pohime				
1 Mësuesit tanë sillen në mënyrë miqësore me ne si	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
1 Mësuesit tanë sillen në mënyrë miqësore me ne si brenda mësimit ashtu edhe jashtë tij	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
brenda mesmin asntu edne jasnte tij	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
2 Mësuesit tanë na vendosin në bankat në fund të	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
klasës	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
Kiases	(1)	(2)	shpesh (2) (3) Ndodh Ndodh Ndodh shpesh (2) (3) Ndodh Ndodh Ndodh shpesh (2) (3) Ndodh Ndodh Ndodh shpesh (2) (3)	(4)
3. Mësuesit tanë na vendosin në bankë vetëm me	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
nxënës të komunitetit rom/egjiptian	gjithmonë	shpesh		asnjëherë
nxenes te komunitetit font/egjiptian	(1)			(4)
4. Mësuesit tanë na aktivizojnë në orën e mësimit	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
njësoj si dhe nxënësit e tjerë	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
njesoj si dne nxenesit e tjere	(1)			(4)
5. Ne mund t'u drejtohemi për ndihmë mësuesve kur	Ndodh	Ndodh		Nuk ndodh
kemi nevojë	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
kemi nevoje	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
6. Mësuesit na ndihmojnë kur kemi nevojë	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
7. Mësuesit na ndëshkojnë më shumë ne se nxënësit	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
7. Mësuesit na ndëshkojnë më shumë ne se nxënësit e tjerë për sjellje të ngjashme	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
e tjere per sjenje te ngjasime	gjithmonë shpesh rrall (1) (2) (3) kënësit Ndodh Ndodh Ndodh gjithmonë shpesh rrall (1) (2) (3) me ata Ndodh Ndodh Ndodh gjithmonë shpesh rrall (1) (2) (3)	(3)	(4)	
Nägyagit sillan niällai si ma na ashtu adha ma ata	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
8. Mësuesit sillen njëlloj si me ne ashtu edhe me ata	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
të mazhorancës	(1) Ndodh gjithmonë (1) Ndodh gjithmonë (1) Sit Sit Sit Sit Sit Sit Sit Sit Sit Si	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
9. Ne kemi frikë nga mësuesit tanë	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
_		(2)	(3)	(4)
10. Mësuesit janë të gatshëm që ta shpjegojnë përsëri	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
mësimin nëse nuk e kemi kuptuar atë.	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
mesimii nese nuk e kemi kuptuai ate.	(1)		(3)	(4)
	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
 Mësuesit na ofendojnë/shajnë 	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
12. Nxënësit e mazhorancës na ofendojnë/shajnë për	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
shkak të përkatësisë sonë etnike	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
12 Nyönösit a magharanasa shaqsinahan	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
13. Nxënësit e mazhorancës shoqërohen me ne,	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
brenda dhe jashtë shkollës	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
14. Nyönösit a mazharanaña na ftainñ na claisitata	Ndodh	Ndodh	Ndodh	Nuk ndodh
14. Nxënësit e mazhorancës na ftojnë në aktivitete	gjithmonë	shpesh	rrallë	asnjëherë
jashtë shkollore	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)

Annex E

Pyetje të strukturuara për përfaqësues të DAR dhe institucioneve arsimore

Relevance

- Në cfarë mase projekti i Save the Children u përgjigjet nevojave arsimore të fëmijëve romë/egjiptianë?
- Cilat janë politikat ekzistuese lidhur me përfshirjen e romëve/egjiptianëve?

Effectiveness

- Në cfarë mase janë arritur objektivat e projektit?
- Cilat janë sipas jush arritjet kryesore të projektit?
- Në cilat drejtime/fusha ka qënë më i sukseshëm projekti?

Impakti

- Ka prodhuar ndonjë impact negativ ose të padëshiruar projekti?
- Si ka kontribuar projekti për rritjen e aksesit në arsim të fëmijëve romë/egjiptianë?
- Si ka kontribuar projekti për rritjen e cilësisë së arsimit? Cfarë ndryshimesh keni vërejtur si rezultat i këtyre impakteve?
- Cilat janë kapacitetet që janë përmirësuar?
- Si mund të përmirësohet më tej impakti i projektit?

Qëndrueshmëria

- Cfarë mendoni se nevojitet për të ruajtur aktivitetet dhe arritjet e projektit të Save the Children pas përfundimit të financimit?
- Cfarë duhet bërë që ky projekt të shtrihet edhe në shkollat e tjera?

Efficiency

- A mund të arriheshin këto rezultate ose rezultate më të mira me këto mjete?
- A mund të arriheshin këto rezultate me shpenzime më të vogla?
- Krahasuar me projekte të tjera, sipas jush sa efektiv ka qënë projekti i Save the Children?

Annex F

Table 6. Rezultatet e anketës me nxënësit R/E (në %)

Theniet	Ndodh gjithmonë	Ndodh shpesh	Ndodh rrallë	Nuk ndodh asnjëherë
Mësuesit tanë sillen në mënyrë	67	21	12	()
miqësore me ne si brenda mësimit	07	21	12	O
ashtu edhe jashtë tij				
Mësuesit tanë na vendosin në bankat në	5	10	43	43
fund të klasës				
Mësuesit tanë na vendosin në bankë	7	2	12	79
vetëm me nxënës të komunitetit R/E	,	_		
Mësuesit tanë na aktivizojnë në orën e	74	19	2	5
mësimit njësoj si dhe nxënësit e tjerë		-		
Ne mund t'u drejtohemi për ndihmë	50	29	9	12
mësuesve kur kemi nevojë		-		
Mësuesit na ndihmojnë kur kemi	62	26	10	2
nevojë				
Mësuesit na ndëshkojnë më shumë ne	5	9	12	74
se nxënësit e tjerë për sjellje të				
ngjashme				
Mësuesit sillen njëlloj si me ne ashtu	73	13	7	7
edhe me ata të mazhorancës				
Ne kemi frikë nga mësuesit tanë	5	2	26	67
Mësuesit janë të gatshëm që ta	64	22	7	7
shpjegojnë përsëri mësimin nëse nuk e				
kemi kuptuar atë				
Mësuesit na ofendojnë/shajnë	5	12	12	71
Nxënësit e mazhorancës na	0	5	24	71
ofendojnë/shajnë për shkak të				
përkatësisë sonë etnike				
Nxënësit e mazhorancës shoqërohen	54	24	10	12
me ne, brenda dhe jashtë shkollës				
Nxënësit e mazhorancës na ftojnë në	50	31	12	7
aktivitete jashtë shkollore				

Annex G

The SC project approach (model)

In the course of its implementation the SC project developed a series of interventions to support the beneficiaries. This approach, which we call the SC model, includes the following activities:

- To strengthen the identity of R/E students and increase their association with students of the majority in extracurricular hours talking about history, culture and traditions of the R/E community;
- Students who lag in school are supported through additional hours in mathematics and Albanian languages, as supported by teachers and R/E mothers in conducting home works;
- An inclusive environment is created within the school:
- Diverse recreational activities are organized (social, cultural, sports, education, etc.) so that children may develop greater self confidence, learn new things and get socialized;
- R/E children are part of Children Governments. This has increased the diversity and communication between children, and give a stronger voice to R/E children;
- For children who have not attended school before, a Literacy class is created in Gjirokastra, which provides part time education;
- Trainings are organized on monthly basis with R/E parents on the importance of education for their children;
- The parents of the R/E children are part of Parents' Class Boards and in the round tables discussed problems related to education and non-discrimination;
- School and kindergarten teachers have been trained through trainings and workshops in order to improve their skills on working in a multicultural environment;
- Infrastructure of the schools and kindergartens are improved to create a child friendly environment and create some facilities lacked there. Schools/kindergarten are equipped with teaching and didactic materials in order to create the facilities for an inclusive environment there:
- Children without differences are equipped every September with learning materials in order to ease the educational process. Provision of food and transportation for vulnerable children, as an important approach.
- Awareness raising activities with non-Roma parents, as an important barrier of inclusion of R/E children; etc.