



NORAD COLLECTED REVIEWS

14/2023

Meda Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project (MWCCEP)

The report is presented in a series, compiled by Norad to disseminate and share analyses of development cooperation. The views and interpretations are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of the Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation.

Live International Development Consultant

Norad





Norad

**Meda Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement
Project (MWCCEP)**

ISBN: 978-82-8369-165-8

ISSN: 1894-518x

Published: 11.08.2023

Cover Photo: Ken Opprann

norad.no



**Ethiopian Evangelical Church-
DASSC**



**Norwegian Lutheran Mission
(NLM)**



**Final Evaluation of “Meda Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project
(MWCCEP)” in Bale Zone, Oromia National Regional State (2018- 2022)**

Final REPORT

**Submitted by: - Live International Development Consultant (LID-Consult)
Kirkos Sub-city, Keble 01 H.N 186
Infront of Urael church
P.O.Box 1258 code 198
Tel: +251911048025
Email: lidconsult@yahoo.com
Contact Person: Mr. Gari Duguma
Addis Ababa, Ethiopia**

**Feb, 2023
Addis Ababa**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF FIGURES	III
LISTS OF TABLES <i>III</i>	
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	IV
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
1. INTRODUCTION	3
2. OBJECTIVE OF THE STUDY	3
2.1 GENERAL OBJECTIVE.....	3
2.2 SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES.....	3
3. METHODOLOGY OF THE EVALUATION	4
3.1 DOCUMENT REVIEW.....	4
3.2 DEVELOPMENT OF DATA COLLECTION TOOLS.....	4
3.3 MEETING WITH PROJECT SECTORAL STAKEHOLDERS.....	4
3.4 KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW (KII).....	4
3.5 FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION.....	5
3.6 FIELD OBSERVATION AND VERIFICATION.....	5
3.7 PRESENTATION OF PRELIMINARY FINDINGS.....	5
3.8 DATA ANALYSIS AND REPORTING.....	6
3.9 SAMPLE SELECTION	6
4. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION PERFORMANCE	7
4.2. EDUCATION.....	10
Source: compiled from End line reports, 2022.....	10
5 MECCEP PROJECTS AS JUDGED AGAINST EVALUATION CRITERIA	12
5.1 RELEVANCE OR APPROPRIATENESS.....	12
5.1.1 Relevance or Appropriateness at Tiered Levels.....	12
5.2 EFFECTIVENESS AND EFFICIENCY.....	14
5.2.1 Costs Incurred to Implement Activities and Outputs.....	14
5.2.2 Timely Provision of Inputs.....	14
5.2.3 Level of Respecting Planned Implementation Schedule.....	14
5.2.4 Comparison of Costs and Benefits and financial utilization.....	15
5.2.5 Extent of Benefits Delivered and Received.....	15
5.2.6 Degree of Satisfaction of the Beneficiaries and Local Government Stakeholders.....	15
5.2.7 The Extent that Project Results/Outputs used by Beneficiaries.....	16
5.2.8 Degree of Appropriation of Roles and Responsibilities.....	16
5.3 IMPACT.....	16
5.3.1 Improved Gender Equality and Women Empowerment.....	16
5.3.2 Attitude on Girls Education enhanced.....	16
5.3.3 Household Nutrition Improved.....	17
5.3.4 Diversified Livelihoods for Women.....	17
POULTRY PRODUCTION: PRODUCTION OF POULTRY AND CONSUMING AND SELLING OF HEN AND EGG IS BEING REPLICATED IN RURAL AREAS BY OTHER PEOPLES FROM THE MODEL FARMERS IN THE PROJECT AREA.	18
5.4 SUSTAINABILITY.....	18
6. DOCUMENTATION OF GOOD PRACTICES AND LEARNING OF THE PROJECT	19
6.1. DOCUMENTATION OF SUCCESS STORIES.....	19
7. EMPOWERMENT ASSESSMENT	23
7.1 STRENGTHEN CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATION.....	23
7.2 HEALTH.....	23
7.3 EDUCATION.....	23
7.4 ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT.....	23
7.5 WOMEN’S RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY.....	24
8. CHALLENGES AND DURING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROJECT	24
9. LESSONS LEARNT	25
10. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	25
10.1 CONCLUSIONS.....	25
10.2 RECOMMENDATIONS AND THE WAY FOREWORD.....	26

ANNEXES 28

ANNEX 2: CHECKLISTS37
ANNEX 3: LISTS OF PERSONNEL CONTACTED45

Table of Figures

Figure 1. Focus group Discussants at Ela Bidire kebele 5
Figure 2. Observation at Medel Farmers Field, Ela Bidire..... 5
Figure 3. Debriefing and feedback collection from DASSC MW field office 6
Figure 4: Sample Kebeles with interventions Visited 6
Figure 5. Activities and Performance of Women Empowerment Activities 7
Figure 6: *Vegetable Seeds Provision, Horticultural Production, Woreda Steering Committee* 9
Figure 7 Women's economic transformation and Project intervention impacts photos 9
Figure 8. *Girls education enhancement Physical Plan vs Achievement* 10
Figure 9. *Adult Education and girls club members at school* 11
Figure 10. *Zero class Students supported with a children's seat* 12
Figure 12. Financial utilization of the project..... 15

Lists of Tables

Table 1: Sample Kebeles with interventions Visited..... 6
Table 2. Activities and Performance of Women Empowerment Activities..... 7
Table 3. Financial utilization of the project 15

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ABECs	Alternative basic education centers
AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
BO	Branch Office
MWCCEP	Mada Walabu community empowerment project
CSA	Central Statistics Agency
CVs	Curriculum Vitae
DASSC	Development and Social Service Commission
EECMY	Ethiopian Evangelical Church of Mekane Yesus
ETB	Ethiopian Birr
FDRE	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GoE	Government of Ethiopia
GTP II	Growth and Transformation Plan phase 2
GTP	Growth and Transformation Plan
HHs	Households
HIV	Human immunodeficiency virus
HTPs	Harmful Traditional Practices
KA(s)	Kebele Administration(s)
KIIs	Key Informant Interviewee(s)
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
NFAE	Non-formal Adult Education
NGOs	Non Governmental Organizations
NLM	Norwegian Lutheran Mission
PA	Peasant Association
PAs	Peasant Associations
PCDP	Pastoral community development project
PME	Planning, monitoring and evaluation
PSNP-III	Productive Safety-net Program Phase three
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
TOR	Terms of Reference
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene

IWU Irrigation water users

Wks Weeks

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This document is an independent DRAFT evaluation report prepared in line with the shared Terms of Reference and contract agreement signed between Live International Development Consultant (the consultant) and Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM)/Ethiopia (the client) as one of the main deliverables. Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus Development and Social Services Commission WBS BO (EECMY DASSC WBS BO) is implementing this Meda-Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project (MWCCEP) Year (2018 – 2022). The objectives of the evaluation include evaluating the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, sustainability and documentation of achievements.

The evaluation consists of three phases: the preparatory office works, field exercise and synthesis phases. The first-round office works were devoted to collection and review of secondary data sources. The field exercise phase was used for consultations with project beneficiaries and wider communities; a consultation of Government stakeholders, FGDs, KIIs at woreda and community levels; and physical visits to the project outputs. The second-round office work/synthesis phase was utilized for data organization, manipulations and analyses. After first round office works field exercise was conducted to Mede Walabu with randomly selected Kebeles as well as woreda level project stakeholders. Finally, a debriefing was done at woreda, as reflection of the field work and collection of feedbacks and comments. These methodologies are substantiated by capturing and documenting case studies as success stories.

Meda-Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project (MWCCEP) of EECMY-DASSC WBS BO was started in 2018 and had been under implementation for four years. Meda-Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project was designed based on the initiation of the local community and Government in considering the pressing problems of the community in the local area. During the project planning; the project being with stakeholders has made base line survey to identify and measure the current socio-economic status of community's particularly women economic enhancement and Girl Education enhancement before commencing its interventions. Through the need identification, lack of capacity of women to organize in cooperatives, low enrolment rate of girls for schooling, limitation of household economy, less awareness of the local community on education as well as strategies to improve livelihood are the main issues raised by the community. And in return these problems have significantly hampered the economic improvement of the rural people in general and women and girls in particular in the areas which were became rationale for the initiation of the project.

MWCCEP started operation in January 2018 and served four progressive years in the first phase, (January 2018 to December 2021). The project has also continued as a bridging phase in FY 2022. It has been reached more than 5,000 communities in five kebeles of Meda Wolabu Woreda such as Berisa, Ela Bidire, Hara Haji, Hora Kore and Nano Bidire. Women in the target areas are devoid of the right to access decision-making over household properties and engagement in the development activities. Early marriage and school dropout of girl students is also the other main problem of the target area. MWCCEP has been working to benefit 5000 people (3200 female and 1800 male beneficiaries) from target groups of the project such as women -those economically less empowered and girls those lack to attend school through its intervention.

The general objective of the project is to contribute to improved living conditions of women and girls in the target communities. It aims to enhance Women economic empowerment through increased income and Girls in target communities attend school with improved ratio of boys to girls in schools

The project brought significant impact in changing the attitude of local community towards education and improved school enrolment at target schools, reduced dropouts, and HTPs. In target kebeles were improved due to girls conversation and Womens empowerment.

Development of modern way of crop production using small scale irrigation service, introduction of high value and drought tolerant crop varieties, and improved way of crop management practices helped Women agro-pastorals to ensure their food security situation at household and improved income. It created model farmers who are producing and supply these crops for local market besides household food consumption.

As judged from many angles like policy support, satisfaction of beneficiaries, needs and priorities at local grassroots level, regional /national and international levels the project is relevant and appropriate. From all points of view like timely input and outputs in quality and quantity, resources utilization and respect of implementation schedule, in meeting project objectives, the project is said to be effective and efficient. The project brought substantial impact on outlooks of the direct and indirect beneficiaries. Specifically, the project contributed to livelihood improvement, education and women's equality and empowerment.

On the other hand, the project contributed significantly in enrolment of children's and improved literacy rate. There is a great improvement of womens empowerment in social, economic and managerial aspects in the community. Attitude of the household and community towards gender has improved MWCCEP project worked towards women empowerment in terms of economic and relief from cultural stresses and thus, demonstrated women have an immense role in socio-economic development.

Targeted communities were benefited through the intervention of the project contributed to living condition of the target community improvement. The project contributed to the target community livelihood resilience strengthening/building not only at the household level, but through implementing the project, improvements to the traditional management of livestock and crop in the target areas, and was practiced by the individuals learning from the project and to replication.

MWCCEP is sustainable in that local government stakeholders took part in the project planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. Government and community members, takeover and continued working on the outputs of the project. The government showed strong commitment keeping forward the outputs of the project. Moreover, capacity building played a vital role in ensuring sustainability. The consultant further noticed that Community Conversation is an approach established at grass root level to sustain project outputs and help in ensuring health services.

From the success stories we have learnt that there are Women model farmers who were practically implementing the agro-pastoral development in production of high yielding varieties of onion, paper and sweet potato, helped to secure their family food security and beyond. They were using irrigation at micro scale and gaining significant amount of money to construct houses, educating their children and volunteering other fellow persons to follow their path.

Finally, the consultant recommended experience sharing of best practices from best Performing sites and Model farmers, expand small scale irrigation development and improved agronomic practices to places in the Woreda, expand services on women's economic empowerment, education development and livelihood promotions, as well as strengthening participation of the community in the project. Moreover, it needs woreda level Government sectoral experts follow up the implementation of the projects is a good approach and needs to be promoted.

1. Introduction

Meda Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project (MWCCEP) started operation in January 2018 and served four progressive years in the first phase, (January 2018 to December 2021). The project has also continued as a bridging phase in FY 2022. It has been reached more than 5,000 communities in five kebeles of Meda Wolabu Woreda these are Berisa, Ela Bidire, Hara Haji, Hora Kore and Nano Bidire. Women in the target areas are devoid of the right to access decision-making over household properties and engagement in the development activities. Early marriage and school dropout of girl students is also the other main problem of the target area. MWCCEP has been working to benefit 5000 people (3200 female and 1800 male beneficiaries) from target groups of the project such as women -those economically less empowered and girls those lack to attend school through its intervention.

MedaWolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project was designed based on the initiation of the local community and Government in considering the pressing problems of the community in the local area. During the project planning; the project being with stakeholders has made base line survey to identify and measure the current socio-economic status of community's particularly women economic enhancement and Girl Education enhancement before commencing its interventions. Through the need identification, lack of capacity of women to organize in cooperatives, low enrolment rate of girls for schooling, limitation of household economy, less awareness of the local community on education as well as strategies to improve livelihood are the main issues raised by the community. And in return these problems have significantly hampered the economic improvement of the rural people in general and women and girls in particular in the areas which were became rationale for the initiation of the project. Participatory approach was employed to attain set of project objectives through building sense of ownership that gears towards achieving impact on the lives of target community.

As the project implementation was found complete, NLM/E commissioned Live International Development Consultants to conduct the evaluation of MWCCEP implementation and assess the performance of the interventions over the strategic period. Thus, the consultant undertook MWCCEP final term evaluation that encompasses project performance against plan, assess project result at outcomes and impact levels, institutional efficiency, effectiveness, financial utilization, impact sustainability, and encountered challenges for learning purpose. Thus, this draft report is prepared based on the information and data obtained during the field and desk analysis.

2. Objective of the Study

2.1 General Objective

The general objective of the assignment is to conduct Project End-term /Evaluation "Meda Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project (MWCCEP)" in Bale Zone, Oromia National Regional State (2018- 2022) and to determine the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact as well as sustainability of the project.

2.2 Specific Objectives

The specific objectives of the evaluation are:

- Review the relevance of the project and its approaches in the context of project responded to the priorities and needs of the target community, how activities and outputs of the project consistent with and relevant to the overall objective and expected accomplishments, what the government say about the changes.

- Verify the *Efficiency and Effectiveness* of the results achieved and trace the changes observed in increasing the capacity of the women and girls and improve their living condition, and education services improvement and income improvement,
- Critically examine the continuing validity of the assumptions on which the project's likely *Impact* was based
- Analyze *Sustainability* and Reliability of the project initiatives from the point of view of local stakeholders including target beneficiaries participation, institutional arrangements, compatibility of project objectives and target community need and attitudinal changes,
- Document the project achievements during the period
- Draw lessons and give respective recommendations having strategic significance for improvement in future similar actions.

3. Methodology of the Evaluation

3.1 Document Review

One of the first steps in this evaluation was conducting desk review and review of existing MWCCEP documents. Accordingly, the consultant reviewed baseline study, project proposal, progress reports, terminal evaluation reports, relevant government department reports and the internet browsing. In this review, the consultants obtained data of implementation performance, activity and budget utilizations, actions and process undertaken during the project period, and recommendations and suggestions during the project.

3.2 Development of Data Collection Tools

Data collection tools were designed to collect both quantitative and qualitative information. The data needed under each component was used to develop the data collection framework. It is from these that the consultant developed questionnaires. The tools developed include 1) Structured questionnaires which was used to collect quantitative data 2) Semi-structured questionnaires used to collect qualitative and qualitative data during key informants' interviews and Focus Group Discussions and 3) Quality checklists which was used during direct observations of infrastructures and practices (Annex2).

3.3 Meeting with Project Sectoral Stakeholders

The consultants met with the project stakeholders at Woreda and Kebele levels. The consultative meetings were held with the representative of the government stakeholders like Education office, Livestock Woreda Cooperative office as well as Womens and youth affairs and Woreda planning and Economic development Offices. Discussion was also made with EEMCY/DASSC at Bidire project Branch office. During this consultative meeting, the general overview of the project, overall performance of the project, project overall achievements, stakeholders' contribution during the implementation of the projects, challenges encountered during the implementation, how each stakeholders executed their roles responsibilities in implementation of the project were discussed.

3.4 Key Informant Interview (KII)

Interview to key informants at various levels were held which helped in exploring the basic data and other important issues to get sufficient information for the evaluation. The consultant conducted an interview to key informants such as MWCCEP project staffs at branch office and project office, Livestock and crop experts, Womens cooperative representatives, teachers, community leaders, elders, religious leaders, development agents, local administrators and other stakeholders in order to have a well-defined analysis.

3.5 Focus Group Discussion

Focus group discussions (FGD) with community members/government representatives were conducted to generate qualitative and quantitative data on MWCCEP from small focus groups. Focus groups were organized from a group of women and girls. In addition, consultants coordinated FGD which includes beneficiaries, community leaders, group leaders, religious leaders, local administrators in the process of focus groups organization in order to have a well consolidated and reliable data and information.



Figure 1. Focus group discussants at Ela Bidire kebele

3.6 Field Observation and Verification

Observation was used to obtain some qualitative data which was obviously supplementing the quantitative data collected by other tools. Field observation and verification was conducted through random sampling methods. The assets created during the course of project implementation and others. The data and information collected through these methods was used for supplementing and complimenting quantitative and qualitative data collected through aforementioned methods.



Figure 2. Observation at Medel Farmers Field, Nanno Bidire

3.7 Presentation of preliminary findings

During the finalization of the field work, the consultant provides a brief presentation of preliminary findings, conclusion and recommendations to Woreda stakeholders including DASSC project staffs. Feedbacks, comments and suggestions were collected during the meeting and carefully incorporated in the report.



Figure 3. Debriefing and feedback collection from DASSC MW field office

3.8 Data analysis and reporting

All data and information collected through aforementioned methods were made readily manageable for easily operation of data analysis. The readily manageable data was analyzed using appropriate statistical data analyzing tools likes descriptive statistics, tables, graphs and maps. The Consultants compiled this draft report which will be presented to NLM/E for comments and feedback. The draft report will be presented using power point to NLM staff for comments. Based on this, the final report will be prepared after the feedbacks provided on the draft reports will be incorporated.

3.9 Sample selection

The consultant selected sample Kebeles from the Meda Walabu Woreda project implemented Kebeles. Accordingly, the following issues were taken into consideration during the sample selection:

- The composition of the selected Kebeles should comprise at least either of the of the project components and major activities of the project will be included at least in one of the sample Kebeles which include saving groups, education development and gender empowerment and equity.
- Best performing and least performing Kebeles were also taken in to account

Accordingly the following Kebeles were selected for representative sample for data collection and visited.

Figure 4: Sample Kebeles with interventions Visited

S/n	Name Of the Kebele	Distance from The Woreda Capital	Intervention activities/components
1	Nano Bidire	5	Education development School girls club Womens economic Empowerment
2	Ela Bidire	10	Education Women economic Empowerment Saving groups

4. Project Implementation Performance

4.1 Women's Economic Empowerment

Maximizing the impact of agricultural development on food security entails enhancing women's roles as agricultural producers as well as the primary takers of their families. The women which are significant proportion of the community in Meda walabu had been limited from engagement in vegetable production due to lack of information and technology of the vegetable production system. In addition to this productive role, women were busy with domestic chores. Despite of all these active involvement in household economy, Meda walabu women were highly marginalized to have control over the household resource and being deprived of having right on making decision on household assets.

In order to empower women and enable them to claim for their strategic right, the project has planned to organize self-help groups of women to generate household income through getting water pump engines that would use for irrigating their own farm and contract out for others and improved seeds of vegetables and chickens, and building their capacity. Accordingly, the consultant revealed through project reports review and field observation that the project accomplished the activities like organizing five self-help women group and trained 49 group members, conducted 12 experience sharing on self-help group approaches (to others development actors) and provided technical follow up during the implementation of the project. Moreover, the project undertook community dialogues on gender empowerment, trained on IGA and resource management, provision of poultry and vegetable seeds and tree seedlings as well as seed money for saving and credit groups. The project trained intervention groups' leaders, groups' members, target kebele leaders, target kebeles' development agents, and stakeholders on the enactment of groups' bylaws and the mitigation of miss-utilization of groups' resources, corruption and project accountability twice each year. The performance report shows that most of the activities under this category is performed 100% and above. Table 2 shows the activities and performance of project activities.

Figure 5. Activities and Performance of Women Empowerment Activities

Women Empowerment Activity	unit	plan (2018-2022)	Accomplishment	
			Qty	%
Facilitating discussion and dialogue for different community members (men ,women, elders, religious leaders, youth, etc)	Person	800	758	94.75
Training for women on IGAs and resource management	No	300	522	174.00
Poultry provision	Person	300	289	96.33
Improved vegetable seed, fruits and tree seedling provision	No	Various	various	
Support for established cooperatives	No	5	5	100.00
Women group establishment and strengthening	No	5	11	220.00
Strengthening saving and credit groups	Group	2	11	550.00
Training to program workers at woreda level	Person	70	60	85.71
Experience sharing for community and project staffs	Person	61	61	100.00
Kebele level program workers awareness raising training	Person	94	69	73.40
Train and strengthen women irrigation groups on irrigation practices	Person	80	180	225.00

Women Empowerment Activity	unit	plan (2018- 2022)	Accomplishment	
			Qty	%
Train on the enactment of groups' bylaws and the mitigation of miss-utilization of groups' resources and corruption and project accountability twice a year	Person	120	339	282.50

Women irrigation groups established in three kebeles (Ela Bidire, Nano Bidire and Hara Haji) by the project have been functioning well and they have gained important knowledge on how to exercise the irrigation development activities and it was confirmed during the field visit that members of the groups have much benefited from practiced irrigation. The KII and FGD discussants revealed that women's irrigation groups have improved their household nutrition status with good results. They have also used irrigation development to earn income from agricultural products. In addition, the women's they have set a good example for the communities living in their areas. Eighty (80) women planned to reach as they benefit from irrigation practice and 180 women benefited from this activity by earning awareness on irrigation work and it is achieved more than expected.



Figure 1: Photos show women harvesting vegetables that worked by irrigation in 2022

Facilitating dialogue and discussion for the different community members was one of the strategies to address the problems of gender inequality, patriarchal thinking of male on household property control and discrimination of women from public decision making and their participation in economic development. Frequent dialogues and discussions were undertaken with different social segments at grass root levels, together with the awareness-raising of the community, as well as with the specific target groups, highly contributed to serving more beneficiaries from new economic activities under the implementation. The project was set target to address 800 community members and able to achieve 758 (95%) within the during the project period. The reason for achieving below the set target was due to the banned of public gathering in 2020 because of the outbreak of COVID_19 and budget limitation. Those community members have been participated in dialogue and discussion sessions were sensitized and convinced about women rights that allows women to engage in different economic activities after awareness rising, able to discuss on issues regarding household properties and also involved women in public decision making and training for peace and security in their vicinity.

In addition, specific training was given to 374 women on income-generated activities (IGAs) and involvement in different activities 1445 chickens were distributed to 289 women at the ratio of 1 to 5 package, and about 217 women were involved in saving and credit groups and 11 groups have been revolving more than 338,200 ETB and 110,000 ETB were supported as starting capital from project, and about 98 women involved in irrigation to produce horticultural products but, some of them disorganized due to elongated drought.

Regarding with supporting women irrigation group and provision of irrigation inputs, the project purchased and distributed vegetable seeds, pesticide chemicals, and agricultural tools and give training on how to utilize the inputs properly. The irrigation groups have also been able to produce

horticultural products and supply them to local market to generate group revenues and to increase group members' annual income.



Figure 6: Vegetable Seeds Provision, Horticultural Production

Stakeholder involvement in the implementation processes of the project intervention is a central part of the sustainability of the project impacts after the exit of the project. Before the handover of the project interventions to the concerned line sector, skill gaps identification and capacity-building training has been conducted at both Woreda and grassroots levels. These training have been given to the staff every quarter based on the skill gaps identified.

It is evident that the income generated from the sales of eggs and horticultural products, and loans provided via savings and credit has transformed the livelihood of the target groups. As depicted by the pictures below, these women who were dependent on their husbands were able to contribute to the wellbeings of their families. By selling eggs, some women were able to buy a goat, began petty trade and open kiyoksi, and were also able to construct additional living rooms and also construct a new house in Bidire town.



Figure 7 Women's economic transformation and Project intervention impacts photos

During the field visits and discussions with focus group and key informants we have learnt that the project have created a good ground for empowering women as a group or individually through skill transfer, provision essential inputs for production and access to financial resource by organizing self-help groups. Visited individual women farmers and irrigation groups were visited producing different variety of horticultural crops onions hot papers potato, sweat potato, beans and maize which are a major source of nutrition reach crops. In general the consultant recognized that the outputs gained from the project intervention is in line with the set log frame and the performance quality of the project is appreciated.

However, in the course of the project implementation there is a fear that the level of confidence created by the irrigation groups and saving and credit groups are minimal due to the fact that there is less support from the agricultural extension service to strengthen and transform these women irrigation groups. This could be attributed to the design problem where the agricultural/pastoral development office of the woreda was not part of steering committee member. In addition the support provided to the project beneficiaries with respect to livestock health specially chicken was

found in adequate. On top of that the seed money provided to each of the women group is too small (10000 Birr per group) with current inflation rate and forced the groups to limit the ceilings of credit for members which is not impactful as member and individual borrower.

4.2. Education

Education plays significant role in the development of any society and the reduction of poverty especially for such pastoral and agro pastoral communities like Meda Walabu where there is huge gap in the education access and quality at the schools with high gender gap. There had been low awareness for the girls' education so that the girls school age children were not well sent to school. Recognizing these facts MWCCEP planned to enhance girls education at school. The consultant confirmed that the project undertook activities such as facilitating discussions and dialogues to different community groups (parents, religious leaders, elders, kebele leaders, Strengthening the established schools clubs; establish and strengthen committees to mobilize community members for girls education at kebele level, establish and strengthen of steering committee, provide training for program workers at woreda and kebele level, conduct experience sharing visits, award outstanding girls– every year in the project periods, provide IEC materials production and distribution, arrange committee and community consultation events, arrange practical workshop for technical staffs with partners, support zero class education for children, support Adult Education and COVID_ Fighting Campaign (Table 4). Almost all of the planned activities during the project were accomplished successfully as per the planned schedule.

Figure 8. Girls education enhancement physical plan vs achievement

Girls Education Enhancement Activities	Unit	Plan (2018-2022)	Achievement	
			Qty	%
Facilitated discussions and dialogues to different community groups	Person	720	473	65.69
Strengthening the established schools clubs	Club	5	10	200.00
Establish and strengthen committees to mobilize community members for girls education at kebele level	Committee	5	5	100.00
Establish and strengthen of steering committee	Committee	1	1	100.00
Training for program workers at woreda level	Person	70	72	102.86
Training to program workers at kebele level	Person	70	80	114.29
Experience sharing	Person	150	130	86.67
Award Outstanding girls– every year in the project periods	Person	40	42	105.00
IEC materials production and distribution	No	Various	various	
Committee and community consultation events	Committee	16	16	100.00
Support zero class Education for children	Child	250	236	94.40
Support Adult Education	Person	815	1213	148.83
COVID_ Fighting Campaign		Various		

Source: compiled from End line reports, 2022

In order to achieve the project objective in this regard community dialogue and discussion were taken place with different community representatives mainly focusing on harmful traditional practices, early marriage, and girls' education. Community mobilization events were also undertaken through the establishment and support of school clubs, distribution of information education

materials, experience sharing events, and awarding of outstanding girl students and their families (mothers).

Apart from community dialogues and discussion, the project has also been establishing five school clubs regarding the theme of girls' education enhancement. The establishment of school clubs is aimed at conveying messages via poems, dramas, and folklore to the community to excavate the traditional thought that hinders girls from schooling. School clubs training and strengthening activities had been implemented every year providing the clubs with information education communication –IEC materials with different mottos that awaken and encourage the community to send daughters to school.

The project document also discloses that the attention that was given to girl children as compared to boys is very less, and subsequently, girl children's school enrolment and retention in school was very low. In addition, Harmful Traditional Practices (HTP) such as early marriage, female genital mutilation, and polygamy widely challenge the well-being of women and girls in society. Therefore, discrimination against women is a long-standing tradition. For tackling these cultural and traditional traumas, girls' education enhancement was taken as a remedy. An emphasis was given to Woreda program workers' training enabling them to involve this group in community dialogues and discussions and community mobilizations in regard to girls' school enrolment, minimizing girls' school dropout, and finally increasing the Boy to Girl ratio in school.

In order to bring holistic attitudinal changes regarding sending children to school, informal education has also been supported within the target kebeles. School principals, Adult education focal persons, school supervisors, kebele leaders, Kebele women Child and Youth Affairs, and community representatives were trained to enhance adults' education as per the government policy. Education materials have also been purchased and supplied to the target schools' principals to support adults' education. Until the breakout of the COVID_19 pandemic about 764 people attended adult education in 5 target kebeles.



Figure 9. Adult Education and girls club members at school

The support of zero-class education has also given more emphasis to attracting daughters as early ages of 6-7 years to school to overcome the problems of schooling late after 10 years and school dropout of girls due to marriage even before reaching grade six. It was learnt that girls' early marriage and school dropout is due to the fact that girls attend school at adolescent ages, consequently, interest in marriage initiates when they reach 3 - 4th grade, and challenge their parents for marriage approval.



Figure 10. Zero class Students supported with a children's seat

The project intervention has also aimed at encouraging parents and girl students to increase girls' school enrolments and improve their educational performance. Practically, five outstanding girl students from all target education institutions were selected and awarded with the corresponding mothers annually. Until the end of 2022 fiscal year, 21 outstanding girl students and 21 their corresponding mothers have been total 42 individuals awarded.



Figure 11: Awarding ceremony of outstanding girls and mothers

The low local communities' perceptions towards girls' education coupled with the economic constraints, highly affect girls' enrolment in school. Community mobilization for enhancing girls' education through facilitating dialogues and discussions was planned and implemented at each target kebeles and each respective school. However, the joint plan to make a discussion with the community mobilization committee and steering committee together was successful to discuss the project's progress and challenges.

The consultants witnessed that the outputs from the intervention of girls education in target project area is well performed. The discussants during the school principals students, teachers and school club leaders we have recognized that, there is great attitudinal change at all levels to send girls to school and stop early marriage. Apart from the attitudinal changes of students and parents to send girls to school and minimize school drop outs the activities undertaken by the women economic empowerment under the other component of the project contributed a lot in tackling the economic problem which is the major factor impeding girls form achieving their education goals.

However, though the achievement in this regard is remarkable, still there is a demand to work more as challenge on girls education and harmful traditional practice needs coordinated and continuous effort to bring real change in the Woreda.

5 MECCEP Projects as Judged Against Evaluation Criteria

5.1 Relevance or Appropriateness

5.1.1 Relevance or Appropriateness at Tiered Levels

At national Level, the GTP-II¹ of the Ethiopian Government stated under Education, and women empowerment as a focus of strategic direction of major priorities of the country. Strengthening and implementing equity, access, and quality services for education besides livelihood enhancement and gender equality and womens empowerment are the strategic directions of the national Government. On the other hand, Ethiopia priorities the work to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG)² in which particular emphasis was on education, and gender equality. MWCCEP project design was relevant and appropriate in attaining national development strategies of education sectors improvement in the country. The project helped in capacitating of the necessary manpower and finance in education infrastructure which was the strategic directions of these sectors development.

¹ The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2015).The Second Growth and Transformation Plan (GTP II) (2015/16-2019/20), National Planning Commission, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

² United Nations (2017), Sustainable development Goals (SDG), Nework, USA.

The major objectives of MWCCEP which includes the livelihood improvement through enhancement of education and women economic empowerment coincides with priority areas of the education, sector improvement as set by GTP-II. Moreover, the gender equality and women's empowerment help to boost production and productivity and reduce gender gap among man and Women which is the core priority in GTP II.

The existing evidence show that limited livelihood opportunities, lack of awareness of the community (especially that of MWCCEP target areas) on income generating activities, limited livelihood options and poor girls participation in education services, and harmful traditional practices are the main challenges in the community. The mission of this theme is well aligned with the national priority of improving girls' participation in education services and WEE. The results of the KII and FGDs with community members (Women's groups, project beneficiaries and other key stakeholders) indicate that the provision, improved variety seeds, technical backstopping of irrigation development and VSLA are very crucial and contributes to the government strategy to improve livelihood of the households through economic empowerment and then reduce gender inequality at school. Moreover, this project focuses pastoralist and agro pastoralist households. It works with all levels of society to mobilize awareness and develop a good practice. It further contributed in the reduction of the economic effect on poor families (PSNP-V).

At regional levels the project aimed to contribute to improve livelihood and income through production and productivity enhancement as well as reduction in gender gap in Oromia region, Ethiopia. Each component under this project improve access to essential social services for pastoral and agro pastoral communities in these remote areas which complement the regional Gender/education/agricultural service plans.

At Woreda Levels as per the need assessment made by EECMY/DASSC during the MWCCEP project design, it was recognized that the project focuses pastoralist and agro-pastoralist communities. Discussion made with Woreda stakeholders during the evaluation of this program confirmed that the project was designed in line with the priority needs of the Woreda offices. The Woreda Sector staffs participated in FGD and KII revealed that the project is highly aligned with the Education/agriculture sector activities mainstreaming gender issues was undertaken by the government that they are fully confident that the output of the project can be easily sustained even with the absence of the coordination of the project staff.

On the other hand, MWCCEP work closely together with government sector office experts of Youth and job creation, Education and Women and children office at Woreda level focusing on essential training, equipping institutions and supervising the work of the project which created synergy in implementing the work of different activities of the project like promotion of girls club, agronomic practice training, small scale irrigation farming, training of other IGAs.

At grassroots community level during the FGDs target communities in project kebeles were asked to respond whether or not they were communicated before the MWCCEP started. The respondents replied positively that they were given a chance to identify their needs by setting priorities. The consulted groups attested that they identified and prioritized the project activities. Thus, the project implementation process was in line with the needs and priorities of the local community which they noted during the discussion that the MWCCEP is appropriate.

The quality of the problem analysis and the project's intervention logic and logical framework matrix, appropriateness of the objectively verifiable indicators are all found matching. The project was implemented in accordance with intervention logic, KPIs and assumed source of information gave positive results.

The evaluation team testified that the project implementation processes and procedures annexed some degree of flexibility/adaptability to facilitate responses to changes in circumstances and in accordance with the consensus reached among stakeholders. Starting from planning, management/ implementation/ monitoring of the project, the level of local ownership, absorption and implementation capacity was found reasonable.

The MWCCEP projects worked on decreasing incidences of HTPs, improved access to girls education services, decreasing womens' workload, and improve agricultural production and productivity of the Women farmers besides improved household food security. Therefore, all the above mentioned facts confirm that the MWCCEP project is need based at all levels leading to conclude that it is relevant or appropriate. **However, the consultant identified that some very relevant sectors like agricultural development office at Woreda level and Development agents at Kebele level were found passive in equally supporting farmers to smoothly sustain the project (irrigation farming).**

The project avoided duplication and resource mis-utilization through discussion with steering committees where the Woreda administration and relevant stake holders are member. There is TOR for the steering committee and regular meeting was in place for the progress and checking of any misuse and duplication of efforts.

5.2 Effectiveness and Efficiency

5.2.1 Costs Incurred to Implement Activities and Outputs

The efficiency criterion concerns how well the various activities of MWCCEP transformed the available resources into the intended results/outputs, in terms of quantity, quality and timeliness. Comparison was made against what was planned. The planned inputs have delivered the desired outputs as explained and witnessed by experts, entire communities around and Woreda line departments. For example the FGD discussants pointed out that the training costs for saving and credit groups and irrigation groups were very effective and efficient that the inputs used was very minimal and with that very few resources the fruitful attitudinal change on economic empowerment of Women and irrigation development was implemented. The inputs on womens education enhancement and womens economic empowerment activities were found very effective and efficient as witnessed by FGD discussants and school communities.

In general the human capacity building costs paid for the trainees and trainers with regards to peridium and other logistics was very minimum as compared to similar/the same training programs undertaken by other NGOs. All the trainees and trainers were paid minimum rate which was by far less than other NGOs are paying. The government and local project beneficiaries were recognized that all the procedures were optimal and can be continued with minor external assistance.

5.2.2 Timely Provision of Inputs

It was learned during the evaluation that the project has one project coordinator and seven other staffs. The has no vehicle. But, EECMY/DASS has been assigned one old vehicle as its own contribution which have high fuel and maintenance cost .The project was implemented by DASSC with budget support from NLM/E. Budget disbursement was doing as per the schedule and as requested. There was no report indicating delay in budget release during each phase of the project implementation. Generators, water pumps, improved variety seeds, and other equipments were also purchased and supplied to the project sites during the project time period.

5.2.3 Level of Respecting Planned Implementation Schedule

The implementations of the planned activities of MWCCEP were done with the time frame of project life in general. The major activities planned were implemented within planned time frame with minor flexibility with regards to external effects.

5.2.4 Comparison of Costs and Benefits and financial utilization

This is the examination of the extent to which the costs of the project have been justified by the benefits whether or not expressed in monetary terms in comparison with similar projects or known alternative approaches, taking account of contextual differences and eliminating market distortions. The MWCCEP had accomplished the activities/outputs in economical ways. The effectiveness of MWCCEP projects can be justified by looking at the activity and financial performances evaluated as can be seen from above implementation performance topic.

During our analysis the consultant understand that there were more benefits obtained when compared to the original design of the MWCCEP as well as in comparison with similar projects in the area. In our view the cost incurred is very minimal in obtaining the results of increasing access to agriculture, education and gender services in the project implementation sites.

There is progress that the project increased the capacity of the target community in – PAs/Kebeles to improve their living condition. Moreover, the education component of the project contributed to the learning process, particularly for girl’s education. We learnt that the community use community dialogue methods to explain the cause of their problems and use their knowledge to solve /make decision. This approach was also found effective in identifying problems and suing local solutions.

The financial utilization for the project was found to be accomplished as per the budget line with minor flexibility. The report from the project performance indicates that all the activities and project components were utilized as per the plan and the utilization performance are almost 99.5%. However we found that the administration cost accomplished 21% above its plan and the project cost performed bellow its plan by 12%.

Figure 11. Financial utilization of the project

Component	Plan	Performance	%
Women Economic Empowerment	2838234.72	2314664.92	81.55
Girls Education Enhancement	2962234.61	2774758.37	93.67
Total Cost	5800469.33	5089423.29	87.74
Total Admin Cost+ Staff salary	3120902.15	3786237.68 ³	121.32
Grand Total	8921371.48	8875660.97	99.49

Thus, the financial utilization of the project was reasonable as however the high transportation cost associated with old car assigned for the project rise some maintenance costs above the plan. However, we confirmed that the physical performance of the project is successfully performed to its target.

5.2.5 Extent of Benefits Delivered and Received

The various consultations and field observations made showed the planned project benefits have been delivered and received, as perceived by all key stakeholders (including women and men and government staffs). Among the benefits the attitudinal change in Community groups and confidence built in experiencing the service helped the benefits very acceptable and receivable. The experience of the agro-pastoralists in adopting new irrigation development in diversifying their livelihoods and improvement of agro-pastoral communities is a good example.

5.2.6 Degree of Satisfaction of the Beneficiaries and Local Government Stakeholders

The same field observation and judgment shows that the beneficiaries of the project are very much satisfied. Especially, the Irrigation development, saving and credit groups, girls education have succeeded in maintain girls education enhancement service and improvement of income and

³ Staff salary is included which is programme cost

livelihoods. The beneficiary communities have witnessed that the economic empowerment of women and enhancement of girls education has helped to improve challenges HTPs, gender based violence's, early marriage and food insecurity. Satisfaction of the beneficiaries and local government stakeholders in terms of timely availability and quality of project inputs (materials, finance, and human resources); quality of results (respect for standards) is found real during our field visit to sample project areas.

5.2.7 The Extent that Project Results/Outputs used by Beneficiaries

Irrigations developed were very important project output which was observed that the farm households were actively engaging on the activity. In Most of the sample kebeles visited, there are a lot of Womens farmers practicing different income generating activities such as poultry, home gardening, vegetable production in which otherwise they practice limited means of livelihood that is mainly livestock rearing. To this extent the beneficiaries were very much satisfied. Moreover, the irrigation schemes and ICT materials were well used by the beneficiaries. Thus, we have observed, the beneficiaries are making wise use of all project outputs. Moreover, the improved variety seeds of grain, fruits seedlings and irrigation development using pumps were well adopted and they are practicing accordingly specially during our visit.

5.2.8 Degree of Appropriation of Roles and Responsibilities

Right from the very beginning the project well identified its stakeholders at local/woreda/zonal levels. The stakeholders consulted underlined that the DASSC has had good communications with those stakeholders through regularly periodic project progress reports. Therefore, the balance of responsibilities between the various stakeholders was appropriate and acceptable. However, during the change of the project staffs as well as the reshuffling government secotoral focal persons, there was found a gap in coping up and effectively following up project activities, reporting, and timely corrections.

We found the project staff are competent and able to provide the required services however it would have been more impactful had gender expert is available in the team and women staff also assigned at the project kebeles to empower the community. At this stage the capacity of the staff to mobilize community was good and encouraging.

5.3 Impact

5.3.1 Improved Gender Equality and Women Empowerment

Discussion with different groups revealed that Womens are more economically and socially empowered. They increased awareness on gender equality and able to work equally with men. The project helped women to engage in income generating activities and women agro-pastoralists practically applying vegetable production on their respective farm plots. This enabled Womens to create their own assets and enabled them to equally engage in agricultural activities.

The base assessment made DASSC before the intervention of the project show that the the annual income of target women's were Birr 2848 per annum. However the data from the final assessment from the project report shows that the annual income of the women were more than doubled and now earning Birr 5696 per year.

The FGD discussion shows that harmful Traditional Practicing and under marriage has been gradually decreased due to awareness raising trainings and tackling the economic constraints why the families push early marriage in the woreda.

5.3.2. Attitude on Girls Education enhanced

Discussants revealed that the project brought attitudinal change among farm/pastoral households on attitude of families to send girls to school to attend basic and alternative

education program. The project helped children's and girls to be able to attentively follow school. During the field visit the consultant understood that the number of households sending girls to school increased significantly.

Data from the Woreda education office and schools visited shows that school dropout was decreased with the intervention of the project. During inception of the project the ratio of girl students to boys in schools was 32:68. With project intervention the ratio of girls to boys in school changed to 45:55 at end of project period. Moreover the project reduced number of early marriages (under the age of 18) from 41/year to 15/year in the Woreda. According to the data obtained from Mada walabu woreda the girls dropout rate was decreased 33% during inception of the project to 15% at the end of the project period. During the discussion with the community we have learnt that the attitude of the target community towards girls education was also changed. According to the assessment by DASSC about 70 of parents were unhappy to send their girls children to school before the project the project reduced the rate to 35%.

Moreover, the project also avail education materials for school and this is very much encouraged and motivated to serve and smoothen the teaching and learning processes.

5.3.3 Household Nutrition Improved

The project brought impact on household nutrition. This was witnessed during the field visit and discussion with project target groups. The saving and Credit groups able to access the credit from their group and produce poultry and able to feed their families with nutrition food. In addition, women able to produce different vegetables on their farm as discussed some model farmers in the area they produce onions, red papper, carrot, barley, sorghum, maize, potato and others which they are being feeding their families where specially their children have being getting nutrition foods from their produce.

6.3.4 Diversified Livelihoods for Women

Before the project intervention women farmers not well enaged in agricultural production and as a result the livelihood options of their family were limited to traditional livestock rearing which most of the time suffer with recurrent drought.

During the field visit we realized that model agro-pastoralists were producing the vegetables through irrigation and as result of getting the supports from project and experts, they increased their income from selling onion, hot paper, and tomato produced. They also supplied their product to local market besides improved their food diets. They also able to cover the bills for children education, improved health services and purchased agricultural inputs. The women farmers started saving some money and built their physical assets. Moreover, they are becoming more aware of the development activities taking place in their Kebele and national level and sharing their experience learnt from their production in their own small farmland with their communities through allowing them visit their sites. These model women farmers are also selling vegetables to their community and local market. They are now the key actors in expanding extension activities to others in their Kebele and neighboring Kebeles.

Mrs Ashu was a farmer in Nanno Bidire Keble with 5 family members. She produced onion, sweet potato, potato, red paper and tomato. She was explaining that the project helped her to get additional income through production of irrigation crops which she never tried before, Now she is also fattening cattle and her income is diversified

5.3.5 Improved Adult Literacy

The consultant revealed that Adults in Mada walabu community acquire basic literacy and numeracy. Thus, FGD discussants said there is increased awareness of the benefits of adult learning. Adults

(specially women) have acquired basic literacy skills a number of adults were able to reading and writing.

5.3.6 Irrigation Practice Skill Promoted

Before the project the practice of irrigation farming was not familiar in project area. The target beneficiaries explained during the evaluation that though we have all the resources for irrigation development in our area, due to lack of skill and knowledge of irrigation agriculture we have been suffering of food insecurity for long period. The project opened their eyes to observe opportunities around them and utilize with the skill they gained from the project intervention.

Finally, the change of the results of the impact indicators before and after the project based on the final report of the project is summarized on annex 3. The consultant cross-checked through different sample respondents and the change obtained was truly visible in the community.

Replicable

Agricultural production: these activities were replicated by Community and Government in many areas that shows the project has positive impact in the community and Local government.

Community Dialogue: community conversation is being replicated by other community and kebeles and widely applied in the Woreda

Poultry production: production of poultry and consuming and selling of hen and egg is being replicated in rural areas by other peoples from the Model farmers in the project area.

5.4 Sustainability

The sustainability criterion relates to whether the positive outcomes of the project and the flow of benefits are likely to continue after the project. The final evaluation made on assessment of the projects for the sustainability of benefits on basis of the following aspects:-

MWCCEP has an experience of working with stakeholders in every stage of the project cycle. Based on this fact, as all the local government stakeholders took part in the project planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation, they feel that outputs of the project are their own. In this regards, at the end of the project the local government and community members' handover and continue with the activities of the project. Capacity building through training played a vital role in ensuring sustainability. Stakeholders, government development and extension workers worked jointly with project staff and increased their skills through various trainings.

As most activities of gender and girls education capacity building component were training related, this was implemented in close cooperation with the concerned government sectors and linked activities with them. The government showed the high commitment of sustaining the outputs of the MWCCEP project.

4.4.1 Policy Support – Existing policies and programs of FDRE is serious about gender, education and agriculture. These policies and programs strongly support the MWCCEP project objectives and outputs. There are strong sentences in SDG (2016) and GTPI and GTPII about agricultural development, access to education, and womens empowerment.

4.4.2 Institutional dimension – The MWCCEPs implementation and management arrangements were well suited with the government gender, agriculture, and Education sectors institutional arrangements. The Woreda, Womens and children's affairs, agriculture and education offices were cooperating and managing the implementation of the projects. As a result the institution dimension of the project testifies the sustainability of the project outputs/services.

On the other hand, the knowledge and skill gained was remaining in the community to find solution to their problems. Finally, production of high yielding varieties of maize, fruit trees and forest plants were being produced by model farmers.

4.4.3 Socio-Cultural Dimensions – Due to its varied advantages demonstrated, the project is attracting/pulling local attentions in changing local perceptions the community in gender, agriculture

and Education services and needs and ways of producing and sharing benefits of the project as beliefs in rather modern ways.

4.4.4 Financial Sustainability – MWCCEP project is running aligned with in the framework of government structures and the Woreda governments have shown their commitment to continue the output of the projects even after the phase-out of the project.

4.4.5 Technical Sustainability: - Most of the purchased and delivered service equipments demand easy operation and maintenance systems. The Woreda agriculture office will provide periodical training of cropping season for the community as well as for the committee who represent the target groups.

The Woreda sector office experts and extension agents got training to improve their skills in agricultural techniques to enable them to assist the farmers.

6. Documentation of good practices and learning of the project

6.1. Documentation of success stories

1. Improved Girls education and attitudinal change on Ealy marriage

Best practice

Woreda: Mada Walabu

Keble: Ela Badire

Name: Istanbul Abdurhaman

Age : 22



Mrs Istanbul Abdurhman is married and have 4 children 2 male and 2 female. She is 22 years old. She now lives in Mada Walabu woreda Ela Bidire Kebele. Her story goes to one of these early married children in Meda Walabu

Worea. When her age was 14 years she was attending seventh grade class from Badirie junior secondary school. She then requested to be married by her parents as the families of her husband came with traditional/cultural way of requesting a girl for their sun. So her mother refused to accept their request of marrying Istanbul quieting her education, Her father accepted and agreed. As her mother has no more influence on childrens marriage compelled to accept married their 14 year child Istanbul as per their culture.

Istabil then then discontinued her education and went to another Keble



where her husband live to be a house wife. After a year at age of 15 Istanbul give birth to baby boy, in which time she was explaining the hardest time in her time where she suffers during birth. She was delivered through traditional birth attendents. Then after she took the responsibility of motherness and continously giving birth with in two years of interval. Now she has four children's. The elder child was 8 years old and the latest was 6months of age.

When Medawelabu community capacity enhancement project (MWCCEP) introduced in the Woreda, Mrs Istanbul heard and became the member of the Ela Badire Kebele Roba Saving and Credit Group. She opened bank account at Badire town and continued saving her money. Finally, she decided to continue her education apart from involving in women economic empowerment. She now reached grade 10th and attending regular education at Bidire. She is also the secretary of the saving and credit association. Now she is happy that she have income and attaining her vision of continuing her education. She was explaining that, early marriage is a very bad culture, and now she is awaring and telling girls in her community to resist early marriage and as a result she was education empowering a lot girl children's in her community and school.

2. Improved and diversified income and livelihood of a household

Best Practices

Woreda: Meda Walabu

Keble: Nano Bidire

Name: *Ayshu Abdullahi*

Age: 42



in-service training. They started irrigation on a small farm arranged by the kebele administration, during which time she received extensive training and experience in the field from the project staff. Encouraged by the provided training and professional support, Ashu decided to start work on her private farm and brought her husband to the project staff for more clarifications. In the past, the project distributed the best breeds of chickens to

Ashu Abdullahi is a resident of Nano Bidre Kebele in Medawalabu Woreda of Bale Zone. Ashu is married and has seven children from her husband. Ashu and her husband have four hectares of farmland, but she used only half of the area, due to the cut of rains before the crops mature. The produce from this land was not enough to feed her family even if the crops successfully matured. She had enough land to cultivate, but she was in trouble with the absence or the shortage of rain for the regular production season. She had no idea that water could be used for irrigation, even though there was a spring near her fields. She did not have the training and technical assistance in irrigation. Like any other pastoralist, Ashu family was dependent on safety nets and food aid.

Ashu was one of the beneficiaries of the project who joined the Women's Savings Association and the Women's Irrigation group and received various



poor women, so Ashu bought many eggs and raised many local chickens. She decided to sell the chickens to buy a water pump. She could not afford to buy a water pump, so she consulted with her husband and agreed to sell the goats and other household items, so she could buy a water pump for Birr 30,000 and started irrigation and hired three experienced day laborers.

Using a water pump, Ashu divided one hectare of farmland for planting the first round of onions, garlic, potatoes, peppers, beans, and chickpeas. Five months later, she produced 15 quintals of onions, 7 quintals of garlic, 3 quintals of pepper, 10 quintals of beans, and 7 quintals of chickpeas. She took the product to market and earned Birr 60,000 from onions, Birr 56,000 from garlic, Birr 4,000 from pepper, Birr 42,000 from chickpeas, and Birr 30,000 from beans; and a total of Birr 194,000. The cost of production was Birr 91,500 for seed and other inputs, for day laborers, and for transportation. She earned Birr 102,500 net in the first round of production.



In the second round of production, she sewed onions, garlic, tomatoes, and after five months, she earned 32 quintals of onion, sold for Birr 128,000, garlic, 3 quintals, sold for Birr 21,000, tomatoes, 38 boxes, sold for Birr 30,400 and a total of Birr 179,400 was earned by the second production season. The total cost of producing the product for inputs, day laborers, and transportation was estimated to be Birr 81,000 and the net income was 98,400. In general, Ashu was able to earn Birr 200,900 from irrigation only in a year. By now, onions, garlic, red roots, carrots, tomatoes, peppers, and cabbage are planted in the fields for the third time. Ashu has also a member and has chaired women saving groups in her village.



In 3rd round she gained income from following vegetables: From Onion she has earned 15,000 ETB; from Beetroot she has got 20,000ETB; from Cabbage she has gained 1300ETB; from Tomatoes she has earned 8,500; from Chickpeas she has got 12Quantals and sold it to 72,000 ETB; from Beans she has sold 20,000ETB; from Pepper she has got 4,000ETB; from Garlic she has gained 32,000ETB and totally she has earned 172,800 ETB within five months.

Ashu says that now she has a good income that able her to provide sufficient food for her family and improve her life. She has also been able to build a house of 40 corrugated Iron sheets and 20 corrugated Iron sheets house in her irrigation garden as to daily laborers and recruited workers may rest there after their



work. She planned to own 1,000M² of land to build a commercial and residential building in Bidire town and has completed preparations for construction.

She says she has over 75,000 birr in her bank account. “My husband and I are still uneducated, so we are sending our school-age six children to school. I sent my son to Robe, where he received a better education, and he is still in 11th grade”, said Ashu. “The coming of the project benefits us and has taught us to open our eyes, observe around and use the natural resources around us to change our lives”. Ashu now bought two oxes and fattening for market, she is expecting 160,000.00 birr from the fatening. Ashu concluded that the project has played a significant role in changing her life and other community members in the



target area.

3. Improved production and productivity of agro-pastoral Women Farmer

Best practice

Woreda: Mada Walabu

Keble: Ela Badire

Name: Fenusa Kemer

Age : 35



Mrs. Fenusa Kemer is one of the beneficiaries of MWCCEP. She lives in Mada walabu Woreda Ela Bidire Keble at a place called Golo. She has 7 children 2 male and 5 female. She first became a member of Roba Jirru irrigation development group. Then after she got skill

and knowledge how to use irrigation water for crop production, she decided to start her own irrigation farm and the project supported in improved seeds and encouragement to proceed. Then she continued irrigation farming and able to produce different variety of horticultural crops on her farm. Mrs Fenus then harvested the



production of onions, red pappers, tomato, sweet potato, potato, haricot bean and maize. She now using these products from their farm to feed her family and gain income to children education health and other social commitments. Mrs

Fenus explain the situation that before the project we have all the resources in our vicinity however due to the lack of knowledge we have not utilizing these opportunities. She said before she expects only the income her husband

brought to home which was in adequate and that she was not control over it. Currently Mrs Funus economically empowered besides nourishing her families with different types of foods.

She further explained that the cheken supplies by the project were laying eggs which was used in some as food consumption and others used as income sources. She now created bank account and regularly saving from income she earning from her products. Recently, with the savings she able to purchase breeder goat and expecting birth in recent months. She has good hope and sharing her experience to fellow women farmers in her area.



7. Empowerment Assessment

7.1 Strengthen Civil Society Organization

The project has contributed to strengthen the WBS BO via transferring skills and capacity building as civil society actor for further project designing, planning and implementation as well as engaging in different programmatic pillars. The guidelines for financial management, project design and planning, gender equality guidelines and risk analysis strategies are the contribution the implementing organization EECMY-DASSC-WBS BO and the project staff.

The project has also contributed to the other civil society partners in capacity building, awareness creation on cross cutting issues, the ways of discharging their responsibility for the community wellbeing and their involvement in solving the community socio-economic problems by their own initiatives.

The project cooperated with a consortium NGO jointly implemented by DASSC-WBS BO, HUNDE and Cordaid on women empowerment work and girls right protection. The projects worked in different interventions, women economic empowerment, and entrepreneurship/ capacity building and there was smooth cooperation with those projects to share good examples from each other's.

7.2 Health

The project contributed to the improvement of health of the households and community through better and improved food and nutrition through increased income and production of different nutrition dense crops.

7.3 Education

The project contributed to education enhancement through empowering and promoting girls education and convincing parents to send their girls to school. Thus, it contributed in education quality to education and communication materials, chairs for students and awarding outstanding girls with highest achievements.

7.4 Economic empowerment

Households and individuals have empowered economically through improved saving and credit services, by improving saving culture and improved income generating activities, production of different vegetables through group and individual irrigation production system and production system and improved skills on economic empowerment.

7.5 Women’s rights and gender equality

Community dialogues and discussion on gender equality and women and girls’ rights protection was the main strategy to persuade the community and encourage the involvement of women in decision making process at each level. In fact, this issue is also the government attention from federal government level down to the local. However, the involvement of women in a decision making process decrease due to literacy factors particularly in pastoralist community. Thus the project has also given due attention to increase girls school enrolment and decreasing school dropout as well as encouraging women attending of adult education. As a result, all women, child and youth affairs offices heads of target kebeles have been attending regular education.

The woreda education office and women and child affairs office promoted those married students to attract many students who dropped out of school and engaged in marriage. In addition, the representative of woreda security office, education office, Women and children affairs office and Social affairs office form a team to investigate early marriage in the woreda. The advocacy drama and poem presented by school clubs on different ceremony and media promotion which visit each target community was raised the awareness of the community regarding the gender empowerment.

Table 1 Empowerment Assessment

		Degree and Level of empowerment				
THEMATIC AREAS OF RESULT		Level 1: Output Individual or community	Level 2: Output Individual or community	Level 3: Outcome Individual or Community	Level 4: Outcome Community and/or Society	Level 5: Impact Community/ Society/ Structural
	Strengthening Civil Society (mandatory)			X		
	Education					x
	Economic Empowerment					x
	Gender Equality (mandatory)					X
	Total assessment of project				X	

8. Challenges and during the implementation of the project

During the implementation of the project there are different challenges. During the field work different group of discussants revealed major challenges encountered in implementation of MWCCEP projects.

COVID-19 was one of the challenges encountered during the implementation of the project. Recurrent drought and water sources drying up and Some groups are not functioning as much as possible. In addition vegetable pest and poultry diseases and unavailability of sufficient

common land for production except current Roba Jiru women irrigation group are major constraints

There was a general price rise in the project area which made expensive some of the project inputs so that it challenged the smooth project implementations.

9. Lessons Learnt

- Intervention made in community dialogue in areas like Meda Walabu can bring tremendous impact on other sectors like enrollment increase and dropout reduction in education sector, as well as increased production and productivity in agricultural sector.
- The participation of community can be ensured to the highest level when the project was done according to the needs and the priorities of the community besides high community awareness done on the importance of the project outputs for the beneficiary communities.
- Involvement of project stakeholders at the Woreda level from the very beginning is a great impact in the performance of the project implementation and sustainability of the project outputs. The using of woreda experts at Woreda level was found to be the best approach in strengthening the services and providing sustainable services.
- Using Model farmers and women groups as an approach to promote the project outputs good practice that leads to replicate the project output to other indirect beneficiaries.
- Unlearned Irrigation Practice is introduced and untrained members of community have started the irrigation practice by observing and motivating to groups action surround them.
- It is possible to change community attitude toward economic development through women participation in households. As a result, the Women Saving and Credit Group revolving more than 338,200 ETB participating in different petty trade.
- Awarding outstanding girl students have being an all school concern and promising to continue this practice by being with education office for this practice was highly pleased to this practice that motivate all community members.
- Community Mobilization is very important method for the sustainability of the change.

10. Conclusion and Recommendations

10.1 Conclusions

The evaluation assessment of the MWCCEP revealed that the project has brought tremendous change in the lives and livelihoods of women farm households of in project Kebeles of Meda Walabu Woreda. The changes were mainly observed in terms of girl's education and women's economic empowerment activities.

The project main area of success was the women economic empowerment and attitudinal changes towards girls education which encouraged girls and married women to return to school and reduced school dropout significantly. Currently the attitude of families refusing to send their girls children has changed and the boys to girls ratio at school significantly reduced.

During the assessment we have learnt that the project has vital contribution in reducing HTP like early marriage, improved awareness and decreased incidences GBVs.

The project contributed to women's economic empowerment through irrigation group contributed to the introduction and development of modern way of crop production using small scale irrigation service, introduction of high value and tolerant crop varieties, and improved way of crop management practices at agro-pastoralist areas like that of Ela bidire kebeles, helped agro-pastoral households to ensure their food security situation at household levels. Some Model female farmers at Ela bidire and Nanno Bidere expressed that they are now extensively producing annual and perennial crops which have proven their capacity to supply these crops for local community and Bidire market.

The saving and credit group organized by MWCCEP are highly contributed to the women's empowerment through access to financial resources, improved saving culture of female farmers and empower women decision making at household level on resource utilization and marketing of agricultural products.

As can also be recognized from previous sections it is evident that MWCCEP projects had satisfied the selected evaluation criteria, relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. Hence, the specific objectives are met.

The trainings provided by woreda experts made at Woreda and kebele levels were found to be the best approach in strengthening the services improve ownership and sustainability of stakeholders. This helped the enhancement of the participation of all stakeholders with great responsibility. The project was well coordinated where Government sectoral offices (at Woreda Level), Education, cooperative promotion and women affairs offices taking part irrespective of the efforts are being made by MWCCEP. However the support of the woreda agricultural office and livestock health in supporting project results sustaining was found in adequate as observed during the project evaluation.

From the success stories we learned that there are individual model farmers who were practically implementing the agro-pastoral development in production of high yielding varieties of vegetables and fruit trees were helped to secure their family food security and beyond. Farmers interviewed witnessed they were changed their life in getting significant income to transform their family in social advancement such as education and health and economic improvement like constructing houses at Bidire, improving their living room and involving cattle fattening.

Sustainability is ensured as judged from all limiting factors; from the ownership created by beneficiaries, project outputs being handed over and recognition of the entire communities. However, all stakeholders at Woreda levels have recommended that the MWCCEP will be expanding to non- project sites as required.

10.2 Recommendations and the Way forward

MWCCEP is well working in improving livelihoods of the community and being successfully implemented. The activities of the major components under the Education, agriculture and women's empowerment were brought an integrated result in attaining the project objectives. The Consultant recommended and put the way forward on the following major points:

For the project

- a. The lesson learnt from systematic experience sharing mechanisms from best performing sites and Model farmers during the implementation of MWCCEP projects should be adopted as best lessons for future designing similar projects,
- b. The activities of the project are handover to the government and are being operational. However, in order to disseminate and circulate the project lessons and

findings among relevant government sectors, the project should need work on in future designing of projects.

- c. The community participation in the project was good since once convinced and thus, it was found there was a high commitment of the community in project implementation. And this was found good in ownership and management of the projects and need to be strengthened,
- d. Using Government sectoral office experts to closely follow up the implementation of the projects like education, agriculture and gender experts are great experience for effective and efficient implementation of the physical implantation of the projects and contributed for sustainability of the project,
- e. The consultant highly appreciated the works done on women economic empowerment and girls education empowerment which was the pressing problem of women and girls in the woreda, however, the project/the organization need to design a more broad gender equality and empowerment project which
 - a. Complete and sustain the works started on irrigation groups and private model farmers
 - b. More meaningful impact on women saving and credit groups through transforming their livelihoods and ensuring their family food security
 - c. Intensify women focused gender activities like poultry production, goat and sheep production, dairy production, small/petty trading and horticultural production and marketing
 - d. Enhancement of girls education, school gender club, reduction of HTP like gender based violence's and early marriage

For Government/Community

- a. The agricultural sector office of the woreda should expand the activities such as small scale irrigation development and improved agronomic practices and upgrade these agricultural activities on favorable places in other kebeles of the Woreda
- b. The Woreda need to expand services on women's economic empowerment, girls education enhancement and livelihood promotions. School clubs should be more strengthened with sanitary pads and other gender activities
- c. Community dialogue was found as a good approach to bring impact in girls education improvement and the project needs to promote in the future with more structural form

Annexes

Annex 1: Empowerment Assessment Tool

1: Empowerment Assessment Table:

DEGREE AND LEVEL OF EMPOWERMENT							
THEMATIC AREAS OF RESULT		Level 1: Output	Level 2: Output	Level 3: Outcome	Level 4: Outcome	Level 5: Impact	
		Individual or community	Individual or community	Individual or Community	Community and/or Society	Community/ Society/ Structural	
	Strengthening Civil Society (mandatory)				X		
	Health	X					
	Education					x	
	Economic Empowerment					x	
	Gender Equality (mandatory)					X	
	Total assessment of project					X	

Annex 2: Terms of Reference of MWCCEP Evaluation

Terms of Reference (ToR) for Project End Term Evaluation

Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) and its Back Donor Supported Project “**Meda Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project (MWCCEP)**” in Bale Zone, Oromia National Regional State.

Terms of Reference (ToR) for Project End-term /Evaluation Project period
(2018- 2022)

1. General information

Digni no.:10785

Norad no.: To be filled in by NLM/N development section

Project name: MedaWolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project (MWCCEP)

Country: Ethiopia

1.1. Project Background

The project which entitled as “MedaWolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project” is one of the projects supporting by Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) its back donor. MWCCEP has been working in MedaWolabuWoreda, Bale Zone, Oromia Regional state, Ethiopia through technical support of partner organization termed as Ethiopian Evangelical Church MekaneYesus Development and Social Services Commission WabeBatu Synod Branch Office (EECMY-DASSC-WBS-BO).

Helping "the whole person", meaning both physically and spiritually, is an important aim for both EECMY and the Norwegian Lutheran Mission. Meda Wolabu Woreda is one of the rural Districts in Bale Zone, Oromia Region, located at 630 km southeast of Addis Ababa, the capital city of Ethiopia and center for African Union and 210 km from Robe the capital city of the Bale zone.

MWCCEP started operation in January 2018 and served four progressive years in the first phase, (January 2018 to December 2021). The project has also continued as a bridging phase in FY 2022. It has been reached more than 5,000 communities in five Districts of Meda Wolabu Woreda such as Berisa, Ela Bidire, Hara Haji, Hora Kore and Nano Bidire. Women in the target areas are devoid of the right to access decision-making over household properties and engagement in the development activities. Early marriage and school dropout of girl students is also the other main problem of the target area.

MWCCEP has been working to benefit 5000 people (3200 female and 1800 male beneficiaries) from target groups of the project such as women -those economically less empowered and girls those lack to attend school through its intervention. Currently, the project has a plan to conduct final evaluation from Nov.10th -5th, December 2022.

Hence, this TOR is prepared to be approved by NLM prior to submit to National office.

2. Initiative: -

To improve planned project activities implementation during the last project phase and for learning purpose, Norwegian Lutheran Mission – Ethiopia (NLM/E) initiated the intended project outputs end-term evaluation by the consultant to take place starting from 10th November 2022.

3. Purpose of the evaluation:

The purpose of this evaluation is to review the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency impact sustainability of the project implemented in the last progressive years and help to decide on the continuation of the project.

4. Scope of the evaluation

This end-term evaluation has planned to measure the track of the project in regards to achieving the objective of the project, plan versus achievement, challenges encountered, lessons learned, the relevance of the strategies used and the relation and coordination the project had with its stakeholders. The evaluation shall be advisable to go through based on the basic principles of the project i.e., relevancy, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, sustainability and target-actual comparison scenarios. Hence, the feedback and recommendations gained from the evaluation shall be a corner stone for it will be a road map for future project implementation and intervention.

During the evaluation, the evaluators shall be collected the data from all project operating or targeting area or Kebeles and need to be evaluated; namely **Berisa, Ela Bidire, Hora Kore, Hara Haji, Nano Bidire.**

Regarding women economic enhancement and girl education, observation and field visit need to be made at five target kebeles. Consequently, interview and discussion can be hold with different community groups who have benefited from the established cooperatives, Education clubs, Focal person, trained local community, women and other stakeholders like government water office personnel, kebele manager and teachers etc.

The consultant is expected to carry out a deep analysis on the main components of the project such as: enhancing women economic and girl education to clearly identify the degree of the achievements of the intended results and changes on the beneficiaries. And also it is basic issue to analyze the progress made or brought in the community on the importance of educated the girl and handicapped as well as sustainability of these activities. Hence, in all project sites, it is better to observe, number of enrolled girls, quality of education, initiative of the community to towards education and the status of women economy at present time after the intervention. Interview and discussion with all community groups and referring the system for monitoring result indicators shall be the prior tools to realize the practically implementation of the planned activities.

5. Project presentation

MedaWolabu Community Capacity Enhancement Project was designed based on the initiation of the local community and Government in considering the pressing problems of the community in the local area. During the project planning; the project being with stakeholders has made base line survey to identify and measure the current socio-economic status of

community’s particularly women economic enhancement and Girl Education enhancement before commencing its interventions. Through the need identification, lack of capacity of women to organize in cooperatives, low enrolment rate of girls for schooling, limitation of household economy, less awareness of the local community on education as well as strategies to improve livelihood are the main issues raised by the community. And in return these problems have significantly hampered the economic improvement of the rural people in general and women and girls in particular in the areas which were became rationale for the initiation of the project.

The general objective of the project is to contribute to improved living conditions of women and girls in the target communities.

The project has the following general objectives and indicators

- Obj. 1: Women are economically empowered
 - Indicator 1.1: Women's average annual income
- Obj. 2: Girls in target communities attend school.
 - Indicator 2.1: Ratio of boys to girls in schools

Expected Results	Indicators
E.R. 1.1: Opportunities for women to take part in new economic activities is increased	I. 1.1.1: Number of new cooperatives established.
E.R. 1.2: Women’s participation in economic activities is increased.	I. 1.2.1: Number of women active in new cooperatives.
E.R. 1.3: Women’s financial management skills are improved.	I. 1.2.2: Number of women participating in IGA
E.R. 2.1: 45 percent of students in schools are girls.	I. 1.3.1: Number of women with bank accounts
E.R. 2.2: Parents are more willing to send their girl children to school	I. 2.1.1: Percentage of girls who drop out of school
E.R. 2.3: Fewer girls get married under the age of 18	I. 2.1.2: Percentage of school aged girls enrolled in school
	I. 2.2.1: Percentage of parents who indicate they are unhappy to send their children to school because of economic constraint
	I. 2.2.3: Number of early marriages among girls

Figure 2

Having the above general objective and specific objectives, the project has targeted 5000 people of which (3200 female and 1800 male). In course of implementation, the project has been employing various strategies such as: Children and youth involvement; Cooperation and consultation with local government; Encouraging participation of community in all project cycle management (PCM); Networking and linkage with various stakeholders.

6. Questions to be answered

An evaluation can only answer a limited number of questions. Therefore, it is important to be realistic and focused. It might also be helpful to mention what are the questions with highest priority to guide the evaluators if there are many evaluation questions. Hence based on the objective of the project the following specific questions shall be raised and expected to be answered by the evaluation:

6.1 Impact

- Identify and analyses the significant changes that the project has brought in target communities' lives. What real difference has the intervention made in the lives of the beneficiaries?
- Assess the progress towards the actual project impact.
- Document any evidence of practical success (case stories).
- What can now be seen in the villages where the project has previously worked, but now finished?
- How has the project affected those who were not direct beneficiaries?
- What do people see as the biggest changes the project brought to the community?

6.2 Sustainability and Replicability

6.2.1. Sustainability

- What are potential for the continuation of the outputs achieved and of the delivery mechanisms, following the external support termination?
- How the benefits of the project being sustained after the external funding termination?
- How has/could collaboration, networking and influencing of opinion support sustainability?
- How was the exit strategy defined and how is this managed at the end of the funding period?
- To what extent do the partners and beneficiaries 'own' the outcomes of the project?
- What were the major factors which influenced the achievement or non-achievement of project sustainability?

6.2.2. Replicability

- How replicable are project outputs like literacy program, income generating, etc. process that introduced the changes/had impact?
- Among project outputs, what aspects of the project are replicable elsewhere?
- Under what circumstances or contexts would the project be replicable?
- To what extent are the outputs of the project be replicated in other contexts
- How has the project affected those who were not direct beneficiaries?

6.3 Recommendations:

Recommendations for improvements based on observations during the evaluation process (e.g., for sustainability impact, future project design and management, encountered challenges, etc.).

7 Lessons:

- Identify key lessons that can be used to guide future strategies, projects or organization working in development. These should be divided into project, sector and broader development lessons.
- Were there any significant changes in the project design or project context? What are the reasons for these and can any useful lessons be learned from this for application elsewhere?
- How did the project engage with poor and marginalized groups and support their empowerment most effectively?
- For whom can these lessons have relevance?
- How has the design of the project been amended as a result of lessons learned during implementation period?

8 Empowerment Assessment Tool

A. Fill in the appropriate project thematic areas.

Figure 2: Empowerment Assessment Table:

DEGREE AND LEVEL OF EMPOWERMENT						
THEMATIC AREAS OF RESULT		Level 1: Output Individual or community	Level 2: Output Individual or community	Level 3: Outcome Individual or Community	Level 4: Outcome Community and/or Society	Level 5: Impact Community/ Society/ Structural
	Strengthening Civil Society (mandatory)					
	Economic Empowerment					
	Education Enhancement					
	Gender Equality (mandatory)					
	Total assessment of project					

9. Methods

Meda Wolabu Community Capacity Enhancement project end-term evaluation will be carried out by consultants and project staff. The evaluation team shall discuss on the techniques and

approaches used during the evaluation accordingly. However, the evaluation team shall follow/use the following methods as first choice:

- ❖ Discussion with the project staffs
- ❖ Discussion with the target people/the community
- ❖ Available project document review
- ❖ Key informants' interviews
- ❖ Discussion with woreda level concerned duty bearers
- ❖ Refer the project documents (annual plans, progress and financial reports);
- ❖ Discussion with EECMY- DASSC /WBS-Branch Office and MWCCEP staff:
- ❖ Observation of what has been achieved by the project/project outputs at grassroots level.

10. Sampling and limitations/delimitations

- ❖ Ahead of project sites visit commencement, there is a need for consultant jointly with project staff to identify at least one Kebele from each target KA for each project period to be visited during the evaluation for required data or necessary information collection related to MadaWalabu intervention end-term evaluation by consultant.

11. Expected product presentations

- ❖ The output of the mission will be the evaluation report that involves debriefing discussion submission and presentation. The structure and content of the report should meet the requirements of the EECMY-DASSC, NLM and its back donor and evaluation report standard. The outcome of the evaluation will be used for learning purpose and similar projects intervention in the future.

12. The utilization of the evaluation findings

The project stakeholders and Donor will learn from the project final evaluation findings. This learning process will serve as an input resource for implementing partner's and Donor's strategic future planning and development interventions. The final evaluation report will be used for any development organizations that are willing to implement activities in the area as input resource for effective implementation and as the same time it will be a learning point.

13. Timeframe for evaluation and reporting

Figure 2: Indicative Evaluation program schedule (depending on coronavirus pandemic situation)

Dates	Activities	Outputs
10 th - 11 nd Nov.	Initial document review, technical proposal preparation and submission	-Finalized ToR - Finalized work plan -Technical proposal submission
12 th Nov.	NLM/E and EECMY-DASSC discuss on the technical proposal submitted from consultant	Decision made on the consultant technical proposal
13 th & 14 th Nov.	Trip to Meda Wolabu Woreda	Arrival in Meda Wolabu
15 th Nov.	Desk review (all necessary project document review) at MWCCEP base level	Complete Assessment/survey tools
16 th Nov-21 Nov.	Field work primary data collection	Relevant primary data collected from project target PAs/Kebeles
22 th November	Debriefing Woreda and Zone officials including project staff	Presentation of report/note
23 -24 th Nov.	Back from Meda Wolabu	Arrival to the destination
25 th Nov.	Presentation initial findings to EECMY-DASSC and NLM/E	Presentation of Note/report
26 th – 30 th Nov.	Work on draft report and analysis	Evaluation draft report
1 th Dec.	NM/E and EECMY-DASSC review the draft evaluation report	Written feedback to consultant
2 rd -5 th Dec.	Revision and finalization of MWCCEP evaluation report	Final Evaluation Report Presentation

14. Report format

The evaluation final report should include the following sections:

- Cover page
- Table of content
- Executive summary
- Body of the report:
 - Introduction
 - Purpose and specific objectives for the final evaluation

- Methodology employed
- Findings
- Analysis/discussions
- Conclusion and recommendations
- Supporting data should be included in appendices.

15. Consultant

The Consultancy firm/consultant will be composed of experts with the following essential and desirable profiles and qualifications as indicated below.

15.1 Profile of Consultant

Essential

The consultant must possess the following minimum qualifications:

- MA/BA degree or above in Economics, Rural Community development, or other relevant development field of study;
- Demonstrable experience minimum 8 years in conducting project/program Impact sustainability assessment/evaluations, with proven analytical skills;
- Experience of participatory development project approach;
- Experience of socio-economic advocacy tools and approaches;
- Experience of working with local communities and non-governmental organizations;
- Experience in designing and use of participatory based methods for project assessment;
- Fluency in English;
- Experience on Ethiopia civil society and economic context;

Desirable

- Desirable knowledge in None Governmental Organizations work and Result Based Monitoring approaches.

16. Facilitator

The Ethiopian Evangelical church Mekane Yesus –Development and Social Services Commission (EECMY-DASSC) shall assign's an expert with relevant education background and experience will facilitate MWCCEP End-term evaluation by the consultant. Besides, he/she is responsible during field work traveling with consultant.

17 Consultant requirement procedures

The technical proposal should contain: (1) A letter of interest addressed to the NLM Ethiopia Country Representative; (2) A Technical offer showing the interpretation of the ToR indicating a detailed proposed methodology for the work demanded; (3) Curriculum Vita (CV) of the consultant or CVs of consultancy team in case of a firm, showing previous relevant experiences; (4) A detailed financial offer (expressed in Ethiopian Birr indicating the cost required for the End-term evaluation work, estimated to take 25 days). Attachment of his/her renewed business license, VAT and TIN registration licenses.

18. Budget

Apart from consultancy professional fee, NLM/E shall cover the travel costs of facilitators from WBS/DASSC-BO to and from Meda Wolabu and costs related to the fieldwork,

18.1 Evaluation fees and modalities of remuneration

This would be according to contract signed between NLM/E and the consulting firm and information shared with WBS/DASSC-BO.

1) 19. Attachments

- People interviewed
- Evaluation ToR
- Other necessary documents

Annex 3: Changes on Impact indicators before and after the project

S/n	Indicators	Before the project	After the project	%change
1	Increase women annual income	2848	5696	100%
2	Increase the ratio of girl students in schools from at	32:68	45:55	-19%
3	Reduce number of early merrriage (under the age of 18) per year	41	15	-63%
4	Decrease the % of girls school dropout	33%	15%	-55%
5	Reduce number of parents those are unhappy to send their girl children to school	70%	35%	-50%

Source: MWCCEP Final report, 2022

Annex 4: Checklists

**Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) in Ethiopia
Live International Development (LID) Consultants
Information (data) collection format
(To be completed for each Woreda by project focal person)**

Checklist # 1

1. Name of the MWCCEP focal person _____ Tel. _____
2. Provide brief overview of MWCCEP in terms of planned and achieved performance

S/N	List of project activates	UOM	Planned	Achieved	%
1					
2					
3					
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					

3. Project beneficiaries

S/N	List of project components	Male	Female	Total
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				

4. Financial Performance /Planned versus Accomplishment

S/N	List of project components	Planned	Actual	%
1				
2				
3				

4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				

5. Did MWCCEP achieve its objectives? Why? How? Give measurable indicator?

6. Main challenges encountered the project?

7. Mention the Strategies /opportunities used/ adopted to overcome those challenges?

8. Draw your overall conclusion and lessons learned?

9. Draw your recommendation?

10. The way forward?

11. Consultant's Summary

**Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) in Ethiopia
Live International Development (LID) Consultants
Information (data) collection format**

(To be completed for each Woreda by sectoral government stakeholders)

Checklist # 2

1. Name of the person consulted _____ position _____ Telephone _____

2. Do you know MWCCEP s? Yes No; if yes since when?

3. What do you know about MWCCEP s?
4. Your level of collaboration /cooperation?
5. How do you rate the level of transparency of the project with your office?
6. What went wrong?
7. What went right/
8. What should have been done differently?
9. Does the project goes with woreda development plans? How?
10. How do you follow/ supervise the project?
11. Do you receive periodic progress reports from NLM?
12. How is (did) the MWCCEP support (ing) ed the community? In terms of what?
Give examples in you woreda context?
13. Your conclusions and lessons learned?
14. Your recommendation?
15. Consultant's Summary

**Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) in Ethiopia
Live International Development (LID) Consultants
Information (data) collection format
(To be completed for each woreda by other KIIs)**

Checklist # 3

1. Name of the KII _____ position _____ Telephone _____
2. Do you know IWSP? Yes No; if yes since when?

3. What do you know about MWCCEP s?
4. How do evaluate MWCCEP s? Mention your criteria?
5. What were the key challenges of the project? How overcame?
6. Your involvement in the project panning, implementation, supervision and monitoring?
7. MWCCEP resource utilization?
 - 7.1 Human resource utilization?
 - 7.2 Material resource utilization?
 - 7.3 Financial resource utilization?
8. Does the project facilitate stakeholders meeting? Yes _____ No _____ state why for both?
9. Rate level of transparency of the project with your organization?
Excellent ___ Very good ___ Good _____ Poor _____ Very Poor ___ Non-existent ___
10. How as the communication with the project /AFD?
11. Excellent ___ Very good ___ Good _____ Poor _____ Very Poor ___ Non-existent ___
12. Mention what main changes the IWSP brought about in your woreda context by giving examples?
13. What unique benefits/ packages the project made for community?
14. Your conclusions
15. Your recommendation?
16. Consultant's Summary

**Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) in Ethiopia
Live International Development (LID) Consultants
Information (data) collection format
(FGD guide questions)**

Checklist # 4

FGD center _____ Data _____ Time from _____ to _____
Woreda _____ Kebele _____ Goti _____

FGD Participants

S/N	Name of the participant	Sex			Remarks
		M	F	Total	

3. Guide Questions

- 3.1 Do you all know MWCCEP s?
- 3.2 When did it start?
- 3.3 Did NLM consult the community before the project was planned? Implemented?
Yes _____ No _____
- 3.4 Was the project planned and implemented at your will? Yes _____ No _____
- 3.5 Discuss the degree of community participation? Mention kind of participation?
Mention Type of participation?
- 3.6 Mention the strengths of the project? And weaknesses?
- 3.7 List what activates done/ executed by the project

S/N	Types of activities	UOM	Planned	Achieved	%	# of Beneficiaries

**Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) in Ethiopia
Live International Development (LID) Consultants
Information (data) collection format
(Documentation / Success/ Failure story)**

Checklist # 5



1. Name of the person interviewed _____ Age _____
Date of interview _____
2. Waoreda _____ Kebele _____ Village _____
3. Mention Major Measurable changes the project brought?
4. Compare your livelihood systems before and after the project? Assets created before and after the project?

S/N	List of Assets owned /created	UOM	Before the project	After the project
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				

5. Consultant's Summary

Annex 3: Lists of Personnel Contacted

S.No	Contact person	Institution	Location	Position	Telephone
1	Gutema Chomera	DASC-Site office	Bidire	Project Manager	0916666082
2	Badhdha Dabali	DASC -BO	Dodola	Program coordinator	
3	Tesfaye Cherto	DASC MWCCEP	Bidire	Women economic empowerment expert	0912097098
4	Gemeda Heseno	DASC MWCCCEP	Bidire	Girls education enancement	0909770341
5	Mulunesh Tukana	Meda Walabu education Office	Bidire	Represenatrtrive	0920943895
6	India Shanqo	Meda Walabu Women and children office	Bidire	Focal person	0947780117
7	Fenusa Kemer	Elabadire kebele	GOLO	Model Farmer	
8	Shukria Muktar	Ela Badire	Roba jiru, Lalistu Lalistu VSLA	VSLA member	
9	Mohiba Ali	Ela Badire	Roba	Chair person, VSLA	
10	Zara Aliyi	Ela Badire	Roba	Member	
11	Taiba Mohammed	Ela Badire	Roba	Cashier, VSLA	0909637371
12	Istambul Abduruman	Ela Badire	Roba	Secretary, VSLA	0991881667
13	Tukiya Abdi	Ela Badire	Roba	Member, VSLA	
	Radi Abdulahi	Nano Badire	Nano Bidire, Walmilkessu saving group	Cashier	
15	Zara Iske	Nano Badire		Secretary, VSLA	0994651194
16	Abdul Haki	Nano Badire		Chair person, VSLA	09352402081
17	Abdulahi Seleh	Nano Badire		Member VSLA	
18	Ashu Abdulahi	Nano Bidire		Model farmer	0941698355
19	Warkitu Mulisa	Kuari school		Teacher, School club coordinator	0919771149
20	Agita Aliyi	Kuari School		Teacher, School club coordinator	0989957940
21	Fate Umar	Kuari School		Students, Club members	
22	Safiya Hassen	Kuari School	Students	Students, Club members	
23	Radiya Abdulahi	Kuari School	Students	Students, Club members	
24	Husen Umar	Nano Badire		Students, Club members	09166855553

LID Consult Team-Evaluation Team Members

S/N	Name	Education level	Sex
1	Gari Duguma	PHD candidate, MSC in agricultural Economics	Male
2	Ayantu Eba	MA in Gender Studies	Female
3	Beyan Ahmed (PHD)	PHD in Agri. Economics	Male