

STROMME FOUNDATION (SF)

**MID-TERM EVALUATION REPORT
OF
NOTUN ALO PROJECT (NAP)**

April 2014

Evaluation Conducted by;

KHOKON MITRA, Freelance Consultant

59/B, Green Corner, Green Road, Dhanmondi, Dhaka -1205

Land Phone: 00-88-02-9613690

Cell Phone: 01715 409954

E-mail: khokon.rcbe@gmail.com

Contents

ACRONYMS & ABBREVIATIONS	3
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	4
Executive Summary	5-11
Section-1: Introduction, Background, Objectives	12-13
Section-2: Methodology used in this evaluation	14-15
Section-3: Observation & Analysis of the Objective-wise activities	16-36
<i>Objective 1: By the end of 2016, strong civil society mechanism functioning to address and advocate for social and economic rights of people</i>	
1. Project design in general	16
2. Mobilization of poor and marginalized community women	16-17
3. Meeting of small groups and its relevance	17-18
4. Development of community own fund	19-20
5. Promotion of People's organization (POs) / Ward Committee	20-22
6. Training offered by the NAP to small group members	22-23
<i>Objective 2: Improved Health and nutritional status of the 2,000 target families</i>	
1. Awareness raising on Basic Food and Nutrition	23-24
2. Installation of deep-tube wells and sanitary latrines	24-25
<i>Objective 3: Children of the 2000 target families have access to quality basic and functional education.</i>	
1. Early Child Development (ECD) or Pre-School	25
2. Non-formal primary (NFP)	25-26
3. Quality education to children	26-27
4. "Shonglap Program"	27-29
<i>Objective 4: 2,000 families have improved income generating opportunities</i>	
1. Family Development Plan (FDP)	30-33
2. Promote community service providers (CSP)	33-34
3. Facilitate small groups / POs and its members to evolve as group entrepreneur	34
<i>Objective 5: Target households have developed their resilient to natural disasters</i>	
1. Awareness and capacity of community members on DRR and CCA	35-36
2. Development of DRR fund	36
Section-4: Overall Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Partnership & Sustainability	37-40
Section-5: Overall project Monitoring, Supervision and Reporting	41
Section-6: Overall Recommendations and Conclusions	42-44
Annexure - I - TOR for NAP Mid-Term Evaluation	
Annexure - II - POPI- NAP FGD Participants	
Annexure - III - CODEC - NAP - FGD Participants	
Annexure - IV - POPI & CODEC-Evaluation Field Visit Schedule	
Annexure - V - Household Survey Result-Data Pack	
Annexure - VI - Capacity Measurement Indicators	
Annexure - VII - Names of Capacity Dev. Training	
Annexure - VII - Results of Matrices	
Annexure - IX - Social Sustainability Measurement Indicators	
Annexure - X - Suggested Role of PO / WC	
Annexure - XI - Outcomes of the Meeting with Govt. Officials & Civil Society Members	
Annexure - XII - Comparative Analysis of Evaluation & Baseline Survey Findings	

ACRONYMS & ABBREVIATIONS =====

BMI	Body Mass Index
CODEC	Community Development Centre
CSP	Community Service Provider
CRC	Community Resource Center
District	1 st Administrative Unit of Bangladesh Government
ECD	Early development Centre
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GO	Government Organization
HH	Household
IGA	Income Generating Activity
IT	Information Technology
LG	Local Government
LGI	Local Government Institution
LSP	Livestock Service Provider
MTE	Mid-Term Evaluation
MIS	Management Information System
MFI	Micro Finance Institution
NAP	Notun Alo Project
NGO	Non-government Organization
NFPE	Non-Formal Primary Education
PO / WC	People's Organization / Ward Committee
POPI	People's Oriented Project Implementation
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
RBM	Result Based Management
SG	Small Group
SF	Stromme Foundation
SG	Small Group
TOR	Terms of Reference
VGD	Vulnerable Group Development
VGf	Vulnerable Group Feeding
Upazila	The 2 nd Administrative Unit of Bangladesh Government
Union Parishad	Lowest local government unit

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The mid-term evaluation of the Notun Alo Project (NAP) has been conducted in April 2014 with the full participation of POPI and CODEC staff and project beneficiaries of both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. In fact, project beneficiaries and the project staffs had immense contribution to get done this evaluation process. All the participants of this evaluation did hard works that make the evaluation fruitful and accountable. The field activities like household survey, meetings, interviews, focus groups, family visits were smoothly organized by the project staffs in both the working Upazila. Project staff systematically organized the evaluation events. Beneficiaries were tremendous apply the PRA tools like wealth ranking matrix, activity performance matrix, family decision-making matrix, SWOT analysis, case studies etc. The Stromme Foundation (SF) officials also helped to organize the evaluation process. The evaluator expresses their sincere thanks to each of the participants for their great contributions to this evaluation process. Evaluator expresses special thanks to the Surveyors who collected household data in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas.

The evaluator thanks to each of the project staffs of POPI and CODC working in Madan and Mirzagonj Upazila for their great efforts and contributions to this evaluation. Special thanks to Md. Mizanur Rahman Khan, Assistant Director, Documentation and Communication-POPI and the focal person-NAP in Madan upazila and Mr. Didarul Alam Chowdhury, Director of Finance-CODEC. Both of them have participated in the evaluation process and gave valuable inputs to make this evaluation successful. The evaluator expresses sincere thanks to Mr. Subrata K. Basak, Coordinator-POPI-NAP in Madan upazila and Mr. Nurul Haque Bhuyan, Coordinator-CODEC-NAP in Mirzagonj upazila for their hard works to arrange the events of this evaluation and providing valuable project related information.

The evaluator is grateful for all the information gathered at first hand and for the many documents from the Stromme Foundation. In particular, the evaluator expresses sincere thanks to Mr. Osman Haruni, the Focal Person of the NAP (Program Coordinator) and Mr. Sanjit Leo Gomes, Senior Coordinator Program-SF. Both of them gave huge inputs to enrich this evaluation.

Finally, and most importantly, the Evaluator greatly appreciates the hospitality of POPI and CODEC staff in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. Evaluator expresses thanks to the civil society members and government officials for their kind participations in the FGD and meetings in both the upazila.

It is hoped that this report captures some of the successes of the NAP adequately and reflected the outcomes and impacts of the project. It is also hoped that this report will assists the implementing organization and the communities to move forward.

The Evaluator
Notun Alo Project (NAP)
April 2014

Executive Summary

Objective 1: By the end of 2016, strong civil society mechanism functioning to address and advocate for social and economic rights of people:

Talking to the evaluation participants it was evident that the project beneficiaries have some sort of involvement and participation in the project implementation process such as purchasing the inputs support / materials while they have less participation in project monitoring, supervision, indicator setting and internal evaluation process. The mindset and attitude and approaches of staff of both POPI and CODEC were found favorable for the community people. The evaluator found great participation and support of the Focal Person of Stromme Foundation (SF) in the Action-Reflection-Learning-Planning processes which eventually contributed to review the project time to time and simultaneously develop the capacity of both POPI and CODEC staffs.

The Notun Alo Project (NAP) was launched envisioning the development of livelihood of poor and marginalized households on Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. The project partners called POPI and CODEC successfully intervened in their respective working upazila. Project beneficiaries have tremendously responded the activities of NAP and they have been participating in the project implementation process such as purchasing the inputs support / materials. The mindset and attitude and approaches of staff of both POPI and CODEC were found favorable for the community people. The focal person of SF contributed significantly in order to build the capacity of staff of both POPI and CODEC. The focal person of NAP helped the project staff in the Action-Reflection-Learning-Planning processes.

Both POPI and CODEC have mobilized or organized women under small groups with the support of NAP. The organized women of SG have become the main strength and participants of the NAP. It was observed that the socio-economic situation of the partner households (HH) of Mirzagonj upazila has been found somehow better than the partner HHs of Madan upazila. However, the project has achieved the targets in bringing 1000 HHs under SG in each upazila. In Mirzagonj upazila some SGs were found having 6-7 members which seemed too little. It would be better to make the group size (15-16) for better monitoring and supervision as well as to reduce some incidental costs. In the SGs about 30% members were found weak (illiterate). The weaker members were found less vocal while the powerful (comparatively solvent & educated) members were found vocal and usually they take the decisions of SG.

The NAP has impacted developing the internal cooperation and social cohesion among the community people which eventually helped to develop the psychological strength and satisfaction of the poor and marginalized households. The cooperation among the community people has increased through the intervention of the NAP as well as joining in the primary and secondary groups. The intervention of NAP significantly improved the status of poor and marginalized household members. The role and voice of some women in the society have increased, as they are aware of their rights and empowered in their families. The level of awareness on women and child rights of project beneficiaries has increased through the activities of NAP. About 70% members were found aware about women and child rights protection and preservation. The rate of persecution and exploitation to the poor women has reduced, as because of the unity of women and simultaneously, the project activities have developed the capacity of some members individually to negotiate with service providers. Offered training helped members to understand the goal and objectives of the small groups which will have long term impact for making the group sustainable. The intervention of NAP has changed the attitude of men towards women.

Meeting has been playing important role to educate community women on different social and human issues specially education, livelihood, health, rights and justice. Community Facilitator (CF) and Field Mentor (FM) have been playing vital role in the groups for developing the capacity of members. Two meetings have been organized in a month. CF independently conducts one meeting and the respective FM conducts one meeting in each month. The idea of creating CF has been found relevant for the

sustainability of small groups after phase over of the project. But, it was felt that it was too early to assign CF for conducting the group meetings independently. The CFs were found still ineffectual to deliver the messages of development issues properly to the members. FM could continue their support to the small groups for first three years, and then CF could be assigned for taking the responsibility of the group activities such as meetings, discussions, collection savings, loan disbursement and reimbursement, training, liaising etc. Project arranged some basic training for CFs while they could be offered more capacity building training. It was felt that the small group members have still hesitation to identify the 'ownership' of group. It means group members were inappropriately educated about the ownership of group. The Chairman, Secretary and Cashier have to play their role in SGs. The evaluator recommends / suggests that NAP should organized the following leadership and capacity building training for SG members, CF and PO / WC in next two years: (a) Project goal and objective training, (b) Byelaw training to PO / WC, (c) Capacity building training to PO / WC, (d) Conflict resolution training to PO / WC, (e) Leadership and management training, (f) Accounts and record keeping training, (g) Loan disbursement and reimbursement training, (h) Information and Knowledge development training, (i) Communication, Networking, (j) Team Building, and Negotiating skill' training, (k) Need-based Rights and Empowerment training, (l) Child and women development training, (m) Empowerment and livelihood training, (n) Advocacy, lobby and networking training

Till March 2014, the average saving of each group would lie between 5,000/- to 7,000/- which reached to average 10,000/- accumulating the profit of group IGA. Project was late in motivating members to start saving. As a result, group savings didn't rise up to the satisfactory level. All the SGs in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas have opened Bank account in local Bank. This has been a success of the project. All the small groups have deposited their saving money in bank rather investing in IGA or disbursing as loan. Keeping money idle in Bank should not be encouraged. The saving money has to be revolved among members. NAP provided quite a large number of input / material supports to the SGs as collective IGA or group IGA in both working upazilas. (Duck, chicken, cow etc.). The collective IGA to small groups were found somehow less impactful and less income generating. In some SGs the collective IGAs inputs have been distributed among the members and these members didn't deposit any money in the group fund against receiving the inputs of the collective IGA. It was felt that it would be wise to provide revolving fund to SGs instead of giving collective or group IGA. It was apparently observed that about 30% members of small groups (both upazilas) have borrowed money from loan providing organizations like BRAC, ASA, CODEC etc. The evaluator feels that to some extent the allocation of revolving fund may help members reducing the trend of taking loan from other NGOs. The revolving fund would have impact making the small groups sustainable both economically and socially.

The People's Organization / WARD Committee (PO or WC) is the second tire. The sustainability of small groups after withdrawing of the Donor funding has become a great question. Project has made significant investment in the growth of small groups which eventually turned to the formation of People's Organization / WARD Committee (PO / WC). In each Upazila project has successfully brought all the SGs under PO / WC. It has been felt that inclusion of male members in PO / WC would hamper the empowerment of women. The formulation of PO / WC has come from the NAP, while it would be wise to come from the SGs. As a result, PO / WC were found growing slowly as self-sustaining grassroots organization. The confidence, capability and responsibility regard to deciding, planning, and initiating and implementing development activities by PO / WC was found feeble. Moreover, the Nap staff usually decide when, where, how and what activities will be implemented but, it should be participatory. The role of PO / WC is still phlegmatic in the community development activities. Still PO / WC are highly dependent on the NAP staff in project implementation. Therefore, for the sustainability of small groups as well as PO / WC the NAP staff should involve the PO / WC members in planning and implementing process. The NAP has to guide and nurture the PO / WC for next couple of years. NAP should emphasize developing the skill and capacity of PO / WC and should adopt a strategy that should guide the PO / WC through a systematic and need-base planning process leading from the "where we are now" to the

determination “*where we want to be*”, through identification of training programs, exposure visits etc. “*how to get there*” and finally to a sustainability position “*how to stay there*”.

With the support of small groups and PO / WC, project has successfully organized different community events like hand wash day, women’s day, vaccination camp etc. Quite a large number of community people participated in these events. Community people i.e., PO / WC members also resisted several early marriages. They have been working on eliminating dowry and trafficking. It was felt that with the support of the project staff, PO / WC have established linkage with different service providers i.e., the LTSs (Local Traditional Structure), School Management Committee (SMC), Union Disaster Management Committee (UDMC). They have established effectual Parents Teachers Association (PTA). With the support of project staff PO / WC mobilized safety net support from the duty bearers, repaired embankment, roads etc. But, still the PO / WC have to learn to do these sorts of works independently after phase over of the project.

The formation of PO / WC has created the opportunity for women in order to participate and talk in the wider forums. The level of awareness on legal, human and democratic rights of women has significantly increased through the formation of PO / WC. Through the formation of PO / WC the rate of exploitation to women has reduced remarkably. The advocacy program and livelihood support of NAP helped significantly to reduce the rate of displacement (migration) of poor households from their locality especially in Mirzagonj upazila which was high earlier. Women have now ability envisioning to establish their rights on the resources.

It has been recommended that at this stage the formation of the tertiary group (third tire) would not be feasible. In next couple of years the NAP should focus on developing the capacity of primary and secondary groups i.e., SG and the PO / WC. In the coming years the input / material support to the HHs should be distributed through PO/WC which will increase the authority and capacity of PO / WC. NAP should make a detail plan about the development of skill and capacity of the PO / WC as well as how it will disseminate responsibility to the PO / WC. All the PO / WC should have Vision, Mission, Goal, separate Bank Account, Yearly Plan and Updated Byelaw should mention role and responsibility of the PO / WC how it will accumulate resource for its day-to-day expenses.

In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP has offered different IGA and leadership and account training to some members of SGs. But, it was felt that the PO / WC members have less ability to use these training in their activities. They need some practical training which would help to develop their leadership and management skill to run the PO / WC activities. On the other hand, a considerable number of girls of ‘Shonglap Center’ in both the Upazilas have received skill training from the NAP. About 70% of these training receiving girls were found self-employed and working in their locality using the skill while a large number of training receiving girls were found unemployed and staying at home. These girls failed to utilize the skill. Majority of these girls said that they have shortage of capital to arrange equipments and raw materials for stating business.

Objective 2: Improved Health and nutritional status of the 2,000 target families (especially mothers and children).

The awareness program on community health and nutrition has been found going well in Madan Upazila while in Mirzagonj upazila the awareness program was found little slow. Mothers in Madan upazila were found conscious about the health and nutrition of children while in Mirzagonj upazila NAP has to accelerate this program. The achievement of developing knowledge, changing attitudes and bringing knowledge into practice of mothers in Madan upazila was found somehow satisfactory while in Mirzagonj upazila mothers have still to develop their knowledge on primary and nutrition issues. Almost 100% partner HH members in both upazilas have now access to three meals but, the quality of the food was found imbalanced.

Installing tubewells in different villages have created impacts. Almost 100% families in tubewell-installed villages have now access to safe drinking water which helped to reduce waterborne diseases like diarrhea and dysentery. These tubewells have changed the practice and attitude of community people especially in Mirzagonj Upazila. On the other hand, slab latrine support was found impactful among the partner HHs in both Madan and mirzagonj upazila. NAP supported latrines created impacts in changing the traditional practice of children. This practice would have long term impact in the community in order to reduce the waterborne diseases and air pollutions. About 100% latrine users found using soap or ash after coming from latrine which is a good practice and attitudinal change. Mothers were found aware about the waterborne diseases and they can take care to their children to some extent. On the other hand, both men and women of the community have poor knowledge on caring children with disabilities, pregnant and lactate women which the NAP could be addressed. Still ignorance and superstition exists among community people. The attitude of majority men towards pregnant and lactate women is still discouraging. Both men and women need awareness lessons and training on child and mother health.

Hand washing has been found very effective after defecation and before taking food and meal. It helped to reduce waterborne diseases. Community health and nutrition awareness support significantly increased the knowledge of mothers which eventually contributed reducing diseases of children. Change in attitude and behavior regarding primary health issues has contributed improving the health of children. Project supported deep tubewell created access to safe drinking water for families which reduced the trend of diseases. Mothers have knowledge cooking nutritious food at home and handling safe water use in cooking which have impacted positively in developing the health of children.

Objective 3: Children of the 2000 target families have access to quality basic and functional education.

ECD and NFP activities were relevant response specially in the Madan upazila (haor area) which created opportunity for poor children to be educated. The children of the ECD have been getting a life-long-learning foundation from the school curriculum. The preliminary aims and objective of ECD has been achieved successfully. The project has supplied the book, notebooks, and pencils to the children in time which helped attracting the guardians and children to come to the school regularly. The average age of the children in pre-school would lies between 4-7 years. The attendance rate of children in the pre-school has been found over 90% which is quite satisfactory. Children who have been graduated from the ECD merged to Non-formal primary school or mainstream government schools. NAP has been operating NFP only in Madan Upazila. The main objective of NFP is to bring back the drop out children to the school again. NFP has successfully achieved its objective.

Regarding ECD and NFP one of the critical findings by the evaluator was whether the ECD or NFP will get stipulated number of children every year. In some areas in Mirzagonj upazila and even in Madan upazila it was felt that there would not enough children to reach the target for an ECD and not sufficient drop out children to achieve the target of NFP. It would be difficult to get sufficient number of children every year as every year a large number of children are being getting admission to the local mainstream schools. This issue has to be considered by both POPI and CODEC and their Donor SF.

The NAP run ECD and NFP have strong parent-teacher cooperation. NAP has built better working relationship with Teachers, Parents and School Management Committees (SMC) at local level. Guardians received useful information about their children. The critical observation in ensuring the quality education to children that NAP provided teachers in some mainstream schools. These teachers are working under the direction of the mainstream school teachers. As a result, they have comparatively less scope to provide extra curricula education to students. It was felt that providing extra teachers in mainstream school wouldn't be wise to ensure quality education. But the coaching class to poor children would be more impactful for ensuring the quality education.

Facilitating school dropout adolescent girls of target families through the activities of “Shonglap” program has been found very significant thinking of NAP. In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas the NAP has successfully mobilized the adolescent girls under Shonglap centers. It has been a significant task and achievement of the NAP. Community people gladly appreciated the activities of the Shonglap centers. Shonglap programs significantly contributed developing the moral and ethical base of young girls. These girls spontaneously joined the rallies in order to celebrate the different national and international days. About 50% girls of Shonglap centers received skill training from the project and majority of them were found engaged in sewing and poultry rearing aside their study. Majority of them have multiplied the poultry and goats and earned quite a good amount of money. Some of them have saved the money in Bank and some of them gave it to their parents. The NAP input support to the Shonglap girls certainly increased their skill and capacity and they have been empowered to some extent. One of the critical observations was that the ‘Shonglap’ centers have been designed for the dropout adolescent girls. Question is why the ‘Shonglap’ center should be designed only for dropout girls? Why not for all level community girls (both dropout and school going girls)? Why it is designed only for one year? It has been felt that the organized young girls have potential. It has been suggested to continue the ‘Shonglap’ programs till the project life and it will be open for all level community girls.

In cooperation and association with the local communities and local institutions, the NAP can convert the Shonglap center into Community Resource Center (CRC) which will be providing multidimensional services to all level community people. This CRC will have library, computer and IT services and skills training materials. Community girls as well as PO / WC and all level community people should have access to use this center. Eventually, this center will be managed by the PO / WC and they will use it as their office as well. Empowerment of adolescents and youths through this CRC will be another aspect of raising community awareness. The establishment of multi-purpose community learning centers or CRC will develop the ownership of PO / WC as well.

Objective 4: 2,000 families have improved income generating opportunities

NAP has successfully introduced a new dimension in the arena of livelihood development which is called ‘Family Development Plan (FDP)’. In fact this is a new *Model of Development* to the Bangladeshi households. In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP has successfully motivated poor households to be visionary. Each of the target households has independently developed their ‘vision’ which in Bangla called ‘Shapna’ or ‘Dream’.

Majority households included assets like; (a) cow (b) goat (c) poultry (d) house (e) pond (f) tubewell and latrine (g) kitchen gardens (h) trees etc in their ‘Shapna’. Except house and pond, NAP provided majority of the assets (inputs / materials) of the household Shapna. In fact, NAP provided 27 items of IGA to individual households. In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP staff and the beneficiary jointly purchased the input / materials from local markets in a transparent way. It was apparently felt that 80% households have achieved about 50% of their Shapna. Project provided mainly; poultry (chicken and duck), livestock (goat and sheep), fruit saplings, grocery items for shop, boat and fishing net, fingerlings, seeds, etc. It has been calculated that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas each household individually received the input support about Tk. 4,500/- to 5,000/-. The critical observation was that the households achieved their ‘Shapna’ with the input / material support of the NAP while very few households acquired assets with their own efforts. At the same time, it was apparently felt that almost 80% households were able to multiply their assets like; ducks, goats, chicken and other assets. It was felt that none of the households have embezzled or destroyed their assets. The seed support was found excellent. After sufficient consumption each household earned average Tk. 1,200/- from selling the vegetables which was quite a good support to the rural poor household. The mortality rate of Duck in Madan upazila was very high while it was comparatively less in Mirzagonj upazila.

The NAP has incorporated the rights-based issues with the mainstreaming development activities. NAP followed the livelihood development approach and at the same time it could follow Rights-Based Approach (RBA). It would be wise to distribute the inputs through PO / WC which would capacitate the PO / WC and its acceptance and dignity in the community would be increased.

NAP has developed the sectoral service providers in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. The evaluator had scope to conduct FGD with the Health, Livestock, Agriculture and Disaster related service providers. The development of the sectoral service providers has been found a wise decision. The service to the poultry and livestock by the Livestock Service Providers (LSP) has been found very effective. It was evident that LSP service helped reducing the mortality rate of poultry especially in Mirzagonj upazila. The livestock and poultry camps in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas also impacted greatly to aware all level community people regarding the diseases of poultry and livestock. The govt. Upazila Livestock Officers of both upazilas attended these camps. NAP also organized eye camp that also helped the poor community people. It was understood that CSP and CF will have great role in order to make the SG and PO / WC sustainable because, they are local and they have influence on the community households. The NAP has established some sort of market linkage especially chicken in Madan upazila while in Mirzagonj the NAP has established egg value chain in some villages. It was evident that some SGs already got benefits by rearing broiler chicken with the support of local entrepreneurs in Madan upazila.

Objective 5: Target households have developed their resilient to natural disasters

The Community Based-Disaster Risk Reduction (CB-DRR) and Climate Change Adaptation (CCA) initiative by the NAP has been found relevant and time bound specially in the Mirzagonj upazila. In order to achieve this objective it can be mentioned that in Mirzagonj upazila quite a large number of households have been found taking a significant range of preparedness measures while in Madan upazila few households have taken some sorts of preparedness measures. NAP has established strong coordination between all working Union Parishads (UP) and local schools regarding DRR particularly at the pre-disaster stage. In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP has successfully established a strong rapport with the Union Disaster Management Committee (UDMC) and successfully revitalized the UDMC. The project also developed WARD-base Disaster Volunteers who have been keeping liaison with the UDMC. The Disaster Volunteers have been providing awareness lessons to the small group members which created impacts to develop the knowledge of members. About 80% members of small groups have knowledge about the functions of UDMC. The small group members in Mirzagonj upazila have knowledge about the location of nearby cyclone shelters.

Quality of partnerships: Added value

In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas the partnership between SF and the implementing organizations (POPI and CODEC) has added value to gear-up the poor and marginalized HHs toward their poverty reduction, revitalization of individual or community economic development process. The partnership also integrated the poor HHs and stimulated the local economy through increasing the income of the partner HHs. The long-standing partnership between SF and POPI and CODEC has allowed poor household members to increase their meal frequency and food diversity. The SF fund helped for adding value in changing the lifestyle of poor HH members. The increase of economy of poor HHs changed their attitude towards social stigmas as well.

Lesson Learned:

From the evaluator's point of view one of the significant lessons learned from the NAP that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas quite a large numbers of HHs received different livelihood support. In the community there have more poor and marginalized HHs. The livelihood receiving and non-receiving households live closely in the same village. Therefore, if the benefits of the project touch only a portion of the community, the other (larger) portion of the poor and marginalized HHs would suffer from inferior complex which may turn to social abhorrence.

Project Management

Periodic staff drop out has been a problem of both POPI and CODEC. In fact the turn over of staff somehow hampered the progress of the project. Also it was felt that sometimes new appointed staffs were not properly oriented on the project before sending to field. Probably there had no budget to provide training to new staff, as the drop out staffs were trained up with the stipulated budget. Both POPI and CODEC has to keep necessary budget provisions for new staff development for next couple of years.

The thematic, strategic, technical and monitoring support of the SF Focal Person helped the field staff of both POPI and CODEC to achieve the goal and objectives of the NAP. While the guidance and direction to implement the NAP activities should come from the Focal Person of POPI and CODEC. Both POPI and CODEC should make the Focal Person dynamic and field oriented. The Focal Person of both POPI and CODEC should maintain strong communication with the SF Focal Person.

Overall recommendations

1. **Staff Development:** It has been recommended that both POPI and CODEC have to develop a staff development plan so that staff can properly develop the capacity of small groups as well as PO / WC.
2. **Harness the potential of Community Service Providers (CSP):** It has been recommended that the potentials of the CSP should be harnessed through providing them advance training and allocate more works to them. NAP has to show the way of the income sources of CSP in the community.
3. **Developing the fund of small groups:** It has been recommended to provide revolving fund to small groups instead of providing collective or group IGA to small groups. The revolving fund will help the small groups to raise their fund to meet the demand of loan of individual members.
4. **Meeting Centre for PO / WC:** It has been recommended that with the support and participation of community NAP should develop a 'Community Resource Center (CRC) in each working WARD which will be used by PO / WC and adolescent girls as their learning center. The CRC may be equipped with modern facilities like computer, internet, mobile phone etc.
5. **Strengthen linkages of PO / WC outside:** It has been recommended that the NAP should give emphasis that the PO / WC members are capable to establish linkage independently. The NAP should include creating opportunities for the PO / WC members for exchange visits and share learning from different organizations inside the country.
6. **Mobilization of Adolescent Girls:** It has been recommended that the Shonglap girls should not be phased out. They should be griped in the NAP involving in different social and cultural activities like day observation, plantation, sport, cultural, debate program, writing and drawing competition etc.
7. **Household food Security:** The food security of poor HHs in both upazilas is a great concern. It was observed that in Mirzagonj upazila the land owners usually produce two crops and about four months their land remains almost empty. During this time the NAP could motivate the poor households to take lease of land and produce Rabi crops like cucumber, watermelon, sunflower, Soya beans etc. which will increase the food security of poor households.
8. **Ensure the inclusion of disability program:** The evaluation raised the exclusion of the children with disability in the target households. Therefore, it has been recommended that in next couple of years the NAP should design and develop a separate program exclusively for the children with disabilities in the target households and in the wider community.
9. **Enhance the role of POPI and CODEC in project policy making process:** It has been observed that both the partner organizations (POPI and CODEC) have comparatively less role in reviewing the project implementation process, policy making for NAP, monitoring and supervision process etc. Therefore, it has been recommended that the Focal Persons of both POPI and CODEC have to increase his / her role in all the sectors of the NAP.

Section-1: Introduction, Background, Objectives

1. Introduction

Bangladesh is overwhelmingly an agricultural country with about 80% of its population depends directly on agricultural products, but its natural agricultural potential is being rapidly eroded by population growth, increasing landlessness and environmental degradation. In rural areas, the burden of poverty falls disproportionately on women and children and the situation worsening gradually as the population growth is absolutely still high. Eventually, this entire phenomenon creates negative impacts on wage rates, access to gainful employment, nutritional intake, education and access to health services. Regardless of the reality that many steps have been taken towards improving the position of the poor people in rural Bangladesh, their problems, and particularly the livelihood of the poorest section (called the poorest of the poor) remain severe. Due to ignorance, many are not able to take advantage of government and non-government facilities when these are available. The poor and vulnerable people of the community belong to the poorest of the poor community. In fact community poor people are very scattered and disorganized. People's organization or institution is very important to address the need of the community poor people. The poor and destitute men and women need organizational or institutional support to strengthening their situation in order to avail the existing government and non-government services in the country. They have to be educated in bringing change in their thinking towards ownership, empowerment and rights.

In view of bringing change and developing the socioeconomic situation of the poor and marginalized households, in July 2011 Strømme Foundation (SF) launched the Notun Alo Project (NAP) in Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas through its two partner organizations called 'People's Oriented Project Implementation (POPI)' and 'Community Development Centre (CODEC)'. In June 2014, the project will complete its journey for a period of two and half years. In fact NAP is an integrated project centering family in the nucleus comprising of three wider components: Education, Economic Development and Health and Nutrition. The Project has also been addressing the protection of life and assets against natural disasters. The wider areas of the components are considered to be linking with the four MDG goals such as (a) Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger, (b) Achieve universal primary education, (c) Promote gender equality and empower women (d) Ensure environmental sustainability. The NAP has been designed with rights based programming principles in order to ensure community and other stakeholders' participation that leads to sustainability.

In each working upazila the NAP has been providing livelihood support to 1000 households. At the community level the project activities have been implementing through the small groups and consequently it developed the People's Organization / WARD Committee involving the small groups. The project has also been working closely with the individual households through developing the Family Development Plan (FDP). The NAP is mainly a gender sensitive interventions which contributing the empowerment of women and improving the situation of women through involving them in alternative Income generating Activities (IGA).

2. Background of this evaluation

Strømme Foundation implements programs through local partners. The NAP has been implementing through POPI and CODEC. It is one of the philosophies of SF to conduct external evaluation of its partner projects in between the life time of the project. The NAP was launched in July 2011 and it will complete its two and half years journey in June 2014. During this period the Notuna Alo project has implemented quite a large numbers of its activities mentioned in the project proposal and obviously these activities have created significant outcomes and impacts and brought changes among the project participants. However, both the SF and the Partner Organizations were interested to see the extent of achieving the goals and objectives of the project through an external evaluation.

In order to assess the impacts and changes, SF and the Partner Organizations decided to commission this evaluation in April 2014.

3. Purpose and objectives of this evaluation

SF and the Partner Organizations have jointly developed the purpose and objectives of this mid-term external evaluation of the NAP. SF provided the Terms of Reference (ToR) to the evaluator. The purpose and objectives of this evaluation have been expressed in the following ways:

1. The overall purpose of this mid-term evaluation is to assess to what extent NAP has contributed to get the poor and marginalized communities out of poverty and prepared them to address their own issues and lead a decent life.
2. Further, this evaluation will be considered as a process of *learning and improvement* of the project. SF anticipates that the outcomes of this mid-term evaluation will provide relevant information to the ongoing scope of work of the partners; explore why the interventions implemented by the program succeeded or not; and provide guidance for subsequent implementation of the program during the next three years.
3. The evaluation will make use of generic evaluation criteria—relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. Within this scope, the evaluation will look into the following aspects.
 - Assess the **efficiency** of program implementation, assessing whether or not the project plans were fulfilled and resources were used in a responsible and accountable way. Has the program approach been a cost-efficient way to implement development assistance? Assessing the M&E, project implementation, risk management and partnership strategy and their capacity and changes in program management
 - Assess the **effectiveness** of program implementation; how effective are the approaches and structures such as POs in delivering the desired results? How the POs are functioning? Their capacity and effectiveness in addressing community issues? To what extent the IGA component of the project contributing to address their household level income and result in overcoming poverty? How effectively community people are involved and have been prepared for disasters and what are the current results?
 - Determine the **relevance** of the program in relation to the existing needs of the stakeholders and environment. To what extent is the program strategy relevant to the need identified? Especially related to the target group and the poverty level in the given context? Whether or not the Family Development Plan (FDP) a good instrument for this target family and community?
 - Assess the **outcome and impact** of NAP in relation to the indicators specified in the log-frame. Are there any unintended results of the program? What sorts of spin over effect in the community are visible?
 - Assess the long term **sustainability** of program interventions. Are the benefits from the program, especially at community level likely to continue after the completion of the program? Especially, the likelihood of households to continue their IGAs at family level and the POs to function independently.
 - Identifying **lessons learned** on the strategic approaches and best practices and providing possible **recommendations** on how to improve the management of the project at different levels (short and long term) until its completion.
 - Mid-term evaluation (MTE) is expected to suggest if any adjustment needed in the log-frame to capture the changes as envisaged and indicate scale-up potential

Section-2: Methodology used in this evaluation

1. Methodology & Strategy undertaken by the evaluator

The evaluation was designed following a participatory approach ensuring the participation of the community people, key stakeholders and project staff. The evaluation matrices were developed by the evaluator in order to achieve the objectives using the required approaches. The evaluator has also applied other tools in the fields in view of gathering maximum information and data to make this evaluation a successful one. The evaluator tried to avoid duplication of information and error of information and data. Following methodological tools have been used by the evaluator in the NAP evaluation:

1.1 Study the secondary reports and documents

The SF management provided brief orientation to the evaluator regarding the NAP. At the same time, the SF management supplied copies of necessary and relevant reports and documents and secondary data related to the NAP. These reports and documents include project proposal, project annual report, RBM report, baseline survey report etc. The evaluator studied all these reports, documents and found these very supportive and useful. The evaluator took help from these reports and documents and inserted relevant data and information in this evaluation report.

1.2 Household Survey

The evaluator conducted HH survey with a prescribed questionnaire. The random sampling procedure was used for conducting this survey. In each Upazila 161 beneficiary HHs were surveyed to collect HH quantitative information. The outcomes of HH survey have been incorporated in this report.

Sample Size Determination:

Total beneficiaries are 2000 in two Upazila which is less than 10,000. The sample size has been determined to measure a given proportion with a given degree of accuracy at a given level of statistical significance by using the following formula:

$n = \frac{z^2 pq}{d^2}$, where; n is the estimated sample size, z is the standardized normal deviate considered at 95% confidence level p is the proportion of the target population, q = (1-p), d is the degree of accuracy level considered as 5%. Here, p = 0.5, q = 0.5, d = 0.05, z = 1.96

$$= \frac{(1.96)^2 \times 0.5 \times 0.5}{(0.05)^2} = 384.16 = 384$$

As the study population was <10,000, the required sample will be smaller. Calculate a final sample size by using the correction factor formula.

$$\text{Correction factors (n}_f\text{)} = \frac{n}{1 + \frac{n}{N}}$$

Where, n_f = the desired sample size (when population is less than 10,000), n = 384 that we found from previous formula. Our entire population is 2000 in two Upazila which is less than 10,000. N = 2000

$$= \frac{384}{1 + \frac{384}{2000}} = \frac{384}{1.192} = 366.41 = 322$$

Therefore, according to the formula we have to collect data from 162 from each upazila. Total 324 HHs have been surveyed. Before sending the Surveyors to the field, the evaluator conducted a half-day orientation or training session for the Surveyors in order to help them understanding the objective and goal of this survey. A pre-test session was also organized for the Surveyors in a nearby village. Both Madan and Mirzagonj upazila's Survey team members joined this training session at Madan POPI office.

1.3 Field visits by the evaluator:

The NAP has been implementing in two Upazillas. In view of collecting data and information, the evaluator visited all two working upazilas and applied different methodologies. The evaluator visited Madan upazila from 20th – 23rd April and Mirzagonj upazila from 27th–1st May, 2014. In order to gather data and information the evaluator applied a number of methods, techniques and tools. The evaluation has been carried out in such a way that the evaluation process and product would benefit all the stakeholders including SF, project direct and indirect beneficiaries and NAP staffs as well. The evaluator applied the following techniques for conducting the NAP mid-term evaluation:

1.3.1 Meetings with Govt. Officials & Civil Society Members in Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas

In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas the evaluator had scope to organize meeting with government officials. In Madan the evaluator conducted meeting with Md. Salahuddin, the Upazila Livestock officer. In Madan the evaluator went to the government Agriculture office, Cooperative office, Health office and youth development office. All these officers were out of the office.

The evaluator also conducted meetings with civil society members in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. Local people from different disciplines like local elites, school teachers, journalists, religious leaders, political leaders and freedom fighters, Union Parishad members joined these FGDs. (see the outcomes of the meetings with govt. officials and civil society members in annexure – XI).

1.3.2 FGD with CF, PO / WC and CSP & Meetings with Small group members

The evaluator separately conducted FGD with Community Facilitators (CF), People's Organization / WARD Committee members and Community Service Providers (CSP) in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. Quite a large numbers of CSP, CF and PO / WC members attended these FGD. The evaluator had scope to organize meetings with small groups in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. In Madan upazila evaluator organized meetings with the following small groups:

- (1) Beli small group in Bontriosree village-Madan
- (2) Prarthana small group in Balali uttarpar village- Madan
- (3) Bolo small group in Bagmara group-Madan

In Morzagonj upazila evaluator organized meetings with the following small groups:

- (1) Anarash small group in Mirzagonj village-Mirzagonj
- (2) Golap small group in Mirzagonj village-Mirzagonj
- (3) Bakul small group in Monoharkhali village-Mirzagonj

1.3.3 Household visit and Key Informant Interview (KII)

The evaluator visited five households in each upazila and took interview of the direct beneficiaries. Along with household visit the evaluator physically visited the tubewell and latrine sites also.

1.3.4 A SWOT Analysis among field staff

Evaluator conducted SWOT Analysis among the project implementing staff in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas.

1.3.5 Case Study

In each working upazila the evaluator collected two case studies from the project participants. These case studies have been incorporated in this report.

Limitations of this evaluation: As with any evaluation, there were particular limitations in the time and scope of the work. The main limitations faced were:

- Lack of observation of activities like training. During this evaluation no training was going in field.
- Scope of organizing meetings with Government Officials due to their absent in the offices.

Section-3: Observation & Analysis of the objective-wise activities of Notun Alo Project

Objective 1: By the end of 2016, strong civil society mechanism functioning to address and advocate for social and economic rights of people

1. Project design in general

Before designing the project a baseline survey was conducted by the partner organizations (POPI and CODEC) among the target households in their respective working upazila. The baseline survey provided necessary information and the project was designed on the basis of the baseline findings. But, at the same time it has been felt that partner organizations could apply PRA tools to ensure the greater participation of the community people in the project designing process. The SF provided data and documents were found helpful to conduct the mid-term evaluation of Notun Alo Project (NAP). The Project Proposal of NAP has been found informative with rational while it could be more participatory that would be more practical and need-based. For example, there have less trend of drop out girls in Mirzagonj upazila. Therefore, the 'Shonglap' center in this upazila could be organized for both drop out and school going girls (the primary criterion of 'Shonglap' center is to organize only with drop out school girls).

Discussing with the evaluation participants it was evident that the project beneficiaries have some sort of involvement and participation in the project implementation process such as purchasing the inputs support / materials while they have less participation in project monitoring, supervision, indicator setting and internal evaluation process.

On the other hand, the mindset and attitude and approaches of staff of both POPI and CODEC were found favorable for the community people. The evaluator found great participation and support of the focal person of SF in the Action-Reflection-Learning-Planning processes which eventually contributed to review the project time to time and simultaneously develop the capacity of both POPI and CODEC staffs.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended that along with the baseline survey Stromme Foundation should conduct PRA among the community people for designing its upcoming projects in view of greater participation of community people and identifying their actual need before designing the project.

2. Mobilization of poor and marginalized community women

In fact, in Bangladesh the rural poor men and women are not unified and organized. They usually do not have sufficient access to the institutional support in order to meet their basic needs and services. In this situation, organizing people especially poor women was very important to address the gap and imbalance in the society. Moreover, the poor men and women need organizational or institutional support to strengthening their position to avail the services and resources of the government and non-government organizations in the country. They have to be aware and empowered about their social, economic, legal and human rights. Both POPI and CODEC have been trying to ensure the basic services for the poor men and women through mobilizing or organizing women under small groups (SG) with the support of NAP. In fact the mobilized or organized women (family member) under Small Groups (SG) have become the main strength and participants of the NAP.

During field visit and talking to the evaluation participants in small groups it was felt that the socio-economic situation of the partner households (HH) of Mirzagonj upazila were somehow better than the partner HHs of Madan upazila. However, the project has achieved the targets in bringing 1000 poor and marginalized HHs under SGs in each upazila.

In regard to the organizing women under SGs, the critical observation was that in Madan upazila about 90% households were found belonging to the beneficiary selection criteria while in Mirzagonj upazila it

would be about 75% (source: evaluation survey result). Another observation was that in both the working upazilas the average size of the SG would be about 10. But, in Mirzagonj upazila some of the groups were found very small with 6-7 members. A group of 10 members would be considered small from the monitoring and supervision point of view.

During evaluation meetings with the SG members in both upazilas it was felt that about 30% members in SGs were weak (illiterate). The weaker members were found less vocal while the powerful (comparatively solvent and educated) members were found vocal and usually they take the decisions of SG. It would be a challenge for the NAP to bring the weaker women in front line of the leadership and to capacitate them. In fact, in presence of the powerful women the weaker members rarely give their opinion and speak out. The educational skills of weak members would help to be self reliant and even to make the group sustainable. The reading and writing skill of women should eventually reflect on the study of their children, because they will be able to provide support to their children in their study at home which will eventually help to ensure the quality education of children as well.

Impacts occurred through mobilization of poor and marginalized women

1. The NAP has impacted developing the internal integrity (cooperation) and social cohesion among the community people which eventually helped to develop the psychological strength and satisfaction of the poor and marginalized HHs. The psychological dimensions such as; dignity, security, peace of mind and happiness of poor and marginalized women has developed after joining the NAP.
2. The intervention of NAP significantly improved the status of poor and marginalized HH members. The role and voice of some women in the society have increased, as they are aware of their rights and empowered in their families.
3. The level of awareness of SG members on child and women rights has increased through the activities of NAP. About 70% members were found capable mentioning some of the rights.\
4. Offered training helped members to understand the goal and objectives of the small groups which will have long term impact for making the group sustainable.
5. The intervention of NAP has changed the attitude of men towards women.

Recommendations

1. A small group with 6-7 members was found too small. Therefore, in order to enlarge the small groups (15-16) it has been recommended to merge the nearby two small groups in the same village. It would be better to make the group size (15-16) for better monitoring and supervision as well as to reduce the incidental costs (management, monitoring and supervision cost).
2. It has been recommended to engage the 'Shonglap' girls to provide non-formal adult literacy and numeracy class to the illiterate members of small groups. In this regard, both POPI and CODEC should have to develop a detail plan. Developing the skill in literacy and numeracy will enable the weaker members to be skilled in participating project activities.
3. It has been recommended to develop the mental strength and capacity of weaker members by providing training, counseling, organizing seminars and workshops etc so that the weaker members can spontaneously and strongly participate in the project activities.

3. Meeting of small groups and its relevance

Meeting is very important to educate community women on different social and human issues specially education, livelihood, health, rights and justice. Meeting has been found the main source to gather small group members for discussing the development issues. Community Facilitator (CF) and Field Mentor (FM) have been playing vital role in the groups for developing the capacity of members. CF and FM have been equipped with necessary awareness materials which are being used in the group meetings. Two meetings have been organized in a month. The attendance of members in these meetings has been found more than 90% (source: group resolution book), but at the same time, the evaluation participants informed that sometimes 3-4 members out of 10-12 members attend the meeting which doesn't give fruitful result.

Each group has a Community Facilitator (CF) who has been selected from the group members. The CF independently conducts one meeting and the respective Field Mentor (FM) conducts one meeting in each month. The idea of creating CF has been found relevant for the sustainability of small groups after phase over of the project. But, it was felt that it was too early to assign CF for conducting the group meetings independently. The CFs were found still ineffectual to deliver the messages of development issues properly to the members. FM could continue their support to the small groups for first three years, and then CF could be assigned for taking the responsibility of the group activities such as meetings, discussions, collection savings, loan disbursement and reimbursement, training, liaising etc. Project arranged some basic training for CFs, but they need some advance training for conducting group meetings and other group activities.

The evaluator had scope to study and inspect the minute books and other different documents of the visited small groups in both working upazilas. The visited groups were found maintaining minute books and other important documents, while these documents were not managed and kept in safe places. It has been felt that these documents could be lost or damaged or destroyed by children or anybody else at any time. All the documents were found updated.

It was felt that the small group members have still hesitation to identify the 'ownership' of group. It means group members were inappropriately educated about the group ownership. In this regard, group 'Annual general Meeting (AGM)' is very necessary. SGs have been found organizing their AGM and they have developed their annual plan in the AGM but, still the SG members have to know their role and responsibility in the groups and in the society as well.

Impacts occurred through meetings of small groups

1. Fortnightly meetings impacted significantly to develop a habit and discipline of members to be sitting together and to discuss their problems. Meetings contributing developing a rapport among members as well as to avoid disputes and misunderstandings among members.
2. Fortnightly meetings also impacted significantly to develop unity and habit of members to deposit their stipulated saving.
3. Fortnightly meetings helped some members to develop their skills to write resolution, financial records and other related documents of groups.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended to introduce time bound new development issues for the small groups meeting. Along with other issues the development issues should include the followings:
 - a) Basic knowledge on education, livelihood, health, human rights and justice.
 - b) Services providing by the local government institutions (LGIs) and Upazila Parishads
2. It is suggested to help each of the small groups to manage and keep their documents in a safe and secured place. In this regard, NAP could provide a steel made trunk (box) or a file cabinet to each of the small groups for keeping their necessary agreements, materials and papers.
3. It has been recommended to review the job description of FM, and simultaneously it has been recommended to review the role of CF in the groups. FM should attend all the meetings of SG.
4. It has been recommended that the FM should monitor the resolutions of SG periodically and they should help the SG to take the specific, right and executable decisions instead of indistinct decisions.
5. It has recommended to measure the capacity of SGs. The following indicators have been suggested for measuring the capacity of SGs and accordingly the NAP can design the capacity training for SHGs. (The suggested capacity measurement indicators mentioned in Annexure - VI).
6. The evaluator recommends / suggests that NAP should organize leadership and capacity building training for SG members, CF and PO / WC in next two years. (Names of suggested capacity development training mentioned in Annexure - VII).

4. Development of community own fund

Small savings by the group members would play a vital role to develop own capital. Almost 100% members were found regular in depositing their monthly savings, but they were late in depositing saving. Till March 2014, the average saving of each group would lie between Tk. 5,000/- to Tk. 7,000/- which reached to average Tk. 10,000/- accumulating the profit of group IGA. Project was late in motivating members to start saving. As a result, group saving didn't rise up to the satisfactory level. In fact, at the initial stage, project gave less importance to develop the group saving while in last one and half years project motivated members for developing their saving. Every month each member deposit Tk. 40/- to their respective group. All the small groups in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas have opened Bank account in local Bank. This has been a success of the project. All the small groups have deposited their saving money in Bank rather investing in IGA or disbursing as loan.

NAP provided quite a large number of input support to the small groups as collective or group IGA in both working Upazilas. (Duck, chicken, cow etc.). The collective IGA to small groups were found somehow less impactful and less income generating. It was observed that in some small groups the collective IGA inputs have been distributed among the members and these members didn't deposit any money in the group fund against the received inputs of the collective IGA. For example, in Mirzagonj (vill-Monoharkhali) the small group named 'Bakul' received 100 ducks as collective or group IGA. Among these 4 ducks died. Due to rearing problem all these 96 ducks have been distributed among 12 members equally. But, the members didn't deposit the money against these 96 ducks to the group fund. It is important to mention here that each of the members individually received 14 ducks from the NAP as livelihood support. It has been calculated that 'Bakul' group could develop its capital about Tk. 20,000/- from the 96 ducks which it received as collective or group IGA.

It was felt that it would be wise to provide revolving fund to small groups instead of giving collective or group IGA. In first two years project could motivate members to deposit savings and in third year project could allow revolving fund of Tk. 20,000/- to each group. By this time project could develop the skill of members in loan disbursement and reimbursement process. Therefore, it could be expected that in third year the small group would have a fund of Tk. 35,000/-. It has been felt from the discussions with SG members in evaluation meetings that if, once a small group of 10-12 members can raise its fund up to Tk. 50,000/-, that particular group would not be dissolved and it will sustain for long time. Therefore, the idea of providing revolving fund to small groups would be more pragmatic rather providing collective IGA. The revolving fund would create scope for the members to take loan from their own group for starting individual IGA which would contribute to create outcome for developing their livelihood. The individual IGA will create self employment and the capacity of members would also be increased.

The evaluation survey result shows that in last six months in Madan upazila 12.4% HHs and in Mirzagonj upazila 33.3% HHs received loan from Govt. / Non-govt. On the other hand, in last six months in Madan upazila 26.7% HHs and in Mirzagonj upazila 6.8% HHs have received loan from moneylenders. The baseline survey result shows that in Madan upazila 71.0% HHs and in Mirzagonj upazila 72.5% HHs received loan from govt. and non-govt. organizations and moneylenders. The evaluation survey result indicates that the trend of taking loan by HHs in both upazilas has reduced.

During discussions with the SG members in evaluation meetings it was apparently felt that about 30% meetings participants have borrowed money from loan providing organizations (MFI) like BRAC, ASA, CODEC etc. The evaluator feels that to some extent the allocation of revolving fund may help members reducing the trend of taking loan from other NGOs and moneylenders. The revolving fund would have impact making the small groups sustainable both economically and socially. Sustainability of primary group to a great extent depends on its financial strength. Without own resource or fund, the small group wouldn't continue for the long run and would have no attraction to its members. Therefore, to attain the sustainability of the small groups, there should have strong own fund of the small groups.

Impacts occurred through developing community own fund

1. Depositing monthly saving by members has been found relevant and effective in order to make the group sustainable. In course of time, the saving money will access loan to members for starting small IGA which will eventually develop the livelihood of poor HHs.

Recommendations

1. It has been suggested to provide revolving money to the small groups instead of providing input support as collective or group IGA.
2. It is strongly recommended to use the saving money of small groups as loan among the members instead of keeping it idle in Bank. Keeping money idle in Bank should not be encouraged.
3. It has been suggested to develop a strong loan policy for the small group so that they could easily reimburse the loan money.

5. Promotion of People's organization (PO) / Ward Committee (WC)

There have evidences that the NAP in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazils has done well in mobilizing community poor and marginalized HH members. Project has made significant investment in the growth of small groups which eventually turned formation of People's Organization / WARD Committee (PO / WC). The PO / WC is the second tire where small group is the first tire. In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP has successfully brought all the small groups under PO / WC. All the PO / WC in both upazilas were found newly organized (last one year to six months). Each of the PO / WC is constituted with about 6-8 small groups and each small group sent two representatives to the PO / WC. Among these two representatives one member has been found male. It was observed that small group has been constituted with mainly women members (though it is called family) and women mainly participate in group meetings and other activities of NAP. As a result, male members of the family have very little updated knowledge of the small group. Therefore, it would be difficult for male PO / WC members to participate in the decision making process as well as sharing ideas in PO / WC meetings. The evaluator observed that in majority PO / WC the Chairperson of the Executive Committee (EC) has been selected from male persons. During discussions with the PO / WC members, it has been observed that a wrong perception still exists among the members that male Chairperson will be more capable to run the PO / WC activities and to communicate with outside matters. As a result, they chose the male Chairperson of the EC. But, it is not right and no evidences have been observed that male Chairperson is doing well than female Chairperson. It has been felt that inclusion of male members in PO / WC would hamper the empowerment of women.

“Putting the people first and let them speak, lead and be responsive” is the universally popular concept of people empowerment which was found partially followed in the current modality of the NAP. In fact the formulation of PO / WC has come from the NAP, while it would be wise, if the decision come from the small groups. As a result, PO / WC were found growing slowly as self-sustaining grassroots organization. The confidence, capability and responsibility regard to deciding, planning, and initiating and implementing development activities by PO / WC was found feeble. Moreover, the Nap staff usually decide when, where, how and what activities will be implemented but, it should be participatory. The PO / WC members were found just participating in the planned activities upon calls from the NAP staff. The role of PO / WC is still phlegmatic in the community development activities. Still PO / WC are highly dependent on the NAP staff in project implementation. For examples, in the current modality of the NAP, on the availability of budget, project mainly decides how many HHs will be supported by IGA and other inputs, how many households will be supported with latrines and saplings etc.? But, it would be wise that PO / WC should be involved in the planning process and it should have role in selecting HHs and distributing the input / materials. It was also felt that project could distribute the input / material support to HHs after formation of PO / WC. The involvement of PO / WC in distributing input / material support would empower the PO / WC and they will have scope to establish their ownership on the project as well. The evaluation mission suggested some of the roles of PO / WC (see annexure - X).

It is fact that no NGO / Institution can afford to nurture a certain community for an indefinite period of time. Moreover, this would be contrary to the principles of sustainability and process of development. As a part of the methodology of NAP, it has developed the concept of the PO / WC to ensure the sustainability of small groups. It is therefore, a bounden duty of NAP to develop the capacity of PO / WC and to deliver the responsibility of small groups to the PO / WC before phase over.

NAP has developed the byelaw for the PO / WC while it has not yet organized formal training among the PO / WC members on the byelaw which is very necessary. On the other hand, NAP has done some basic works related to lobbying and advocacy for establishing the rights of poor women. Moreover, NAP has also done basic works for the promotion of institutions (PO / WC), involving civil society members, establishing communication and networking in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. The evaluation mission found successful awareness campaign among the villagers which eventually helped to develop the knowledge of poor and vulnerable women. Project staff organized community meeting, lobbying with influential persons, LGI and other relevant stakeholders. Seminar / workshop, publications, media campaign, documentaries were done by the project very professionally. Project has made the existing public service delivery system more functional for the community people and also ensured best utilization of existing facilities. The sectoral need based services have been ensured by NAP for the livelihood and skill development of the poor women. In Madan upazila project has linked up the small groups with the markets and venders and in Mirzagonj upazila in some village project has established the egg value chain.

With the support of small groups and PO / WC, project has successfully organized different community events like hand wash day, women's day, vaccination camp etc. Quite a large number of community people participated in these events. Community people i.e., PO / WC members also resisted several early marriages. They have been working on eliminating dowry and trafficking. It was felt that with the support of the project staff, PO/WC have established linkage with different service providers i.e., the LTSs (Local Traditional Structure), School Management Committee (SMC), Union Disaster Management Committee (UDMC). They have established effectual Parents Teachers Association (PTA). With the support of NAP staff PO/WC mobilized safety net support from duty bearers, repaired embankment, roads etc. But, still PO/WC found weak in establishing linkage with service providers and doing social works independently.

Relevance of formation of People's Organization / WARD Committee

The sustainability of small groups after phase over of NAP withdrawing of the Donor funding has become a great question. Small groups have been gradually acquiring capacity and developing their own fund. For the longer term sustainability, the small groups will need to do two things. First, they need to revolve their saving among members. They also need to shift their focus on mobilizing local resource. As a result, the creation or formation of PO/WC by the NAP has been found very relevant and significant and an important step towards in order to ensure the services to the SGs after phase over of the NAP.

Impacts occurred through formation of PO / WC

1. The formation of PO / WC has created opportunity for women in order to participate and talk in the wider forums. The level of awareness on legal, human and democratic rights of women has significantly increased through the formation of PO / WC.
2. Evaluation meeting participants informed that the formation of PO / WC helped reducing the trend of women persecution and exploitation in the community.
3. It was also apparently seemed that the advocacy program and livelihood support of NAP helped significantly to reduce the rate of displacement (migration) of poor HHs from their locality especially in Mirzagonj upazila which was high earlier.
4. The activities like training, workshop, seminar, day observation rallies etc. significantly contributed to increase the awareness of the women in order to understand the situation of poor women in the society. Government officials also participated in some of these activities as guests which helped to establish linkage with government offices.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended that at this stage the formation of the tertiary group (third tire) would not be feasible. In next couple of years the NAP should focus on developing the capacity of primary and secondary groups.
2. It has been recommended that in the coming years the input / material support to the HHs should be distributed through PO / WC which will increase the authority and capacity of PO / WC.
3. It has been recommended that the NAP in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas should make a detail plan about the development of skill and capacity of the PO / WC as well as how it will disseminate responsibility to the PO / WC. All the PO / WC should have Vision, Mission, Goal, separate Bank Account, Yearly Plan and Updated Byelaw should mention role and responsibility of the PO / WC how it will accumulate resource for its day-to-day expenses.
4. It has been recommended that NAP should guide and nurture the PO / WC for next couple of years. NAP should adopt a strategy that should guide PO / WC through a systematic and need-base planning process leading from the “*where we are now*” to the determination “*where we want to be*”, through identification of training programs, exposure visits etc. “*how to get there*” and finally to a sustainability position “*how to stay there*”.
5. It has been recommended that NAP should involve PO / WC in developing livestock and poultry firm, nursery, compost pits, seed stock, grain and pulse storage bank etc. Simultaneously, project could allow PO / WC rickshaw/van, power tiller and agricultural planting & harvesting technologies.
6. It has been recommended that PO / WC members should go for exposure visit and also they should periodically monitor and supervise the works of affiliated small groups.
7. It has been recommended that NAP should assign some responsibility to PO / WC members for organizing training, seminars / workshops and other project related events.
8. Expenses of the PO / WC have been a big concern. Accordingly this evaluation explored the following possible options and strategies for developing PO / WC fund and its expenses:

Possible options & strategies for developing PO / WC fund	Possible PO / WC expenses areas
(a) PO / WC members subscription (b) subscription of affiliated small groups (c) collective IGA of PO / WC (d) keeping a percentage of the interest of SG loan (e) mobilizing local resources (f) donation of the local elites / civil society members (g) donation of the local NGOs (h) provisioning endowment fund for the PO / WC from the donor	(a) establish networking and communication (b) Organize seminars/ workshops (c) Undertake social activities like road / embankment repair, treatment support to persons with disabilities, maintenance of the Community Resource Center (CRC), tree plantation etc (d) Operate satellite clinics, camps, day observation rallies etc. (e) Maintain liaison & linkage with different govt. and non-govt. organizations

6. Training offered by the NAP to small group members

The evaluation survey result shows that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazila 100% SG members received poultry and livestock rearing training from NAP. Almost 100% SG members also received homestead gardening, health and nutrition and disaster risk reduction (DRR) training from NAP. In Madan upazila 29.8% and in Mirzagonj upazila 47.5% members received leadership development training. In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP offered different IGA and leadership and account training to members. These training helped the groups to run their IGAs. It was felt that it is relatively easy to organize and conduct training in order to fulfill the minimum requirements of a project statement or report.

However, it is much more difficult to ensure that the training have effectively built up the capacity of the recipients in terms of their knowledge, skills and resources, to enable them to better carry out their development activities, resulting in measurable improvement in the lives of the project participant / beneficiaries. Of course, it was acknowledged that there was not enough time and resources to do everything ‘properly’ as described in the project statement. However, the evaluator tried looking into the gradual improvement and outcomes of the training conducted by NAP.

In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas a considerable numbers of girls of ‘Shonglap Centers’ received skill training from the project. Among the evaluation meeting participants it was found that about 50% of the sewing training receivers do work after coming from school while a large number of training receivers were found don’t have scope to work. Majority of these girls said that they have shortage of capital to purchase equipments and raw materials for stating business (mainly sewing machine and cloths).

Relevance & effectiveness of the offered training

The leadership and accounting training were found relevant and effective in view of developing the capacity of small groups. Other training such as (a) disaster risk reduction (DRR) (b) different IGA training (livestock, poultry, fishery etc.) were also found effective. It was apparently felt that the quality of each of the training was good. Learners learnt new issues from the training. It was felt that some of the outcomes of these training will sustain for long time. Majority women participants showed their interest in getting technical and skill training from the NAP.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended that the NAP organized and conducted training should be SMART-specific, measurable (not limited to numeric measurement), achievable, relevant and time bound. There should be a monitoring and evaluation system with indicators to assess the ‘actual training outcomes’ compared with ‘intended training objectives’.
2. It has been suggested that NAP should provide practical training to small group as well as PO / WC members that will help to develop the leadership and management capacity and skill to run the SG and PO / WC activities. It has been felt that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP could provide good governance, advocacy, gender development, livelihood, human rights and justice training to members.

Objective 2: Improved Health and nutritional status of the 2,000 target families (especially mothers and children)

1. Awareness raising on Basic Food and Nutrition

The awareness program on community health and nutrition has been found going well in Madan Upazila while in Mirzagonj upazila the awareness program was found little slow. The achievement of developing knowledge, changing attitudes and bringing knowledge into practice of mothers in Madan upazila was found somehow satisfactory while in Mirzagonj upazila mothers have still to develop their knowledge on primary health and nutrition issues. Mothers of partner HHs were found giving necessary food to children at home while no supplementary food has been given to children in a systemic way. The evaluation survey result shows that 100% partners HHs in both upazilas have access to three meals but, the quality of the food was found imbalanced. In Madan upazila few mothers informed that they prepare and intake “Pusti powder” (may be called Unimix) at home while in Mirzagonj upazila mothers have no idea about ‘Pusti Powder’. The evaluator didn’t conduct anthropological survey among the children and mothers of partner HHs. Therefore, it wouldn’t possible to comment of the malnutrition status of children and women of the partner HHs.

Health Service Volunteers (HSV) were found providing health and nutrition messages among the SG members. It was felt that the awareness and motivation activities by the HSV resulted stopping open defecation in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazila. The increase of using hygienic sanitation, washing hand before eating and after toileting has contributed reducing waterborne diseases. It was also observed that the attitude of mothers towards dealing and behaving with children has changed. They are softer to children now and they have learnt it from the health volunteers and project staff. In-taking periodical de-worming medicine by children was found satisfactory. Mothers have knowledge about the period of in-taking de-worming medicine, EPI and Vitamin-A supplement to children.

2. Installation of deep-tube wells and sanitary latrines

Tubewell: Within two and half years time NAP has installed quite a large number of deep tubewells in both Madan and Mirzagonj Upazila. Community households have also contributed with making cement basements of the tubewell. All the NAP installed tubewells were found functioning well. Installing tubewells in different villages have created impacts. The evaluation survey result shows that 100% families have access to safe drinking water. The NAP supported tubewell contrinuted accessing safe drinking water in some villages in both the working upazilas which eventually helped to reduce waterborne diseases like diarrhea, dysentery and typhoid. These tubewells have changed the practice and attitude of community people especially in Mirzagonj upazila. People in this area have scarcity of drinking water and long ago they were compelled to drink pond or river water. Women were found washing utensils and even taking bath with the NAP supported tubewell water which could also be mentioned as behavioral change. The evaluator physically visited three tubewells in each working upazila. It was found that on average about 20 households have been using each deep tubewell and they are maintaining these tubewell satisfactorily.

Latrine: Slab latrine support was found impactful among the partner HHs in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazila. Several sites of these latrines were visited by the evaluator. The visited latrines were found in good conditions and have been using properly. These latrines have fabricated habituation to the household members indeed. It is a reality that children seldom used latrine before. They were habituated to go to open places for leaving excreta. But, NAP supported latrines created impacts in changing the traditional practice of children. This practice would have long term impact in the community in order to reduce the waterborne diseases and air pollutions. The evaluation survey result shows that in both the upazilas more than 90% households have access to hygienic latrine facility and about 80% evaluation meeting participants informed that they wash hand with soap after toileting.

The level of awareness and knowledge of mothers towards water and sanitation and hygiene practice has developed sufficiently. On the other hand, both men and women of the community in both upazilas have poor knowledge on caring children with disabilities, pregnant and lactate women which the NAP could be addressed. Still ignorance and superstition exists among community people. The attitude of majority men towards pregnant and lactate women is still discouraging.

Impacts occurred through awareness and installing deep tubewell and latrines

1. Community health and nutrition awareness support significantly increased the knowledge of mothers which eventually contributed reducing diseases of children. Change in attitude and behavior regarding primary health issues has contributed improving the health of children. Mothers have knowledge cooking nutritious food at home and using safe water in cooking which have impacted positively in developing the health of children.
2. Mothers were found capable identifying health and environmental hazards due to open defecation which will have long term impact in the community.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended to conduct periodical anthropometric survey among the children of partner HHs and monitor the Z-scores of children. Simultaneously, measure the body Mass Index (BMI) of women for monitoring their nutritional progress.
2. It has been recommended to introduce and educate mothers about Unimix. Unimix is a supplementary food contains powder of rice, mususr dal (lentil), little Soya bean oil, and molasses or sugar (details of Unimix can be collected from different sources). NAP can organize demonstration program for preparing Unimix. The Unimix would be a good supplementary food for the pregnant women and (3-10) years old children.
3. It has been recommended to expand the service of HSV among non-beneficiary households and even in neighboring Unions by developing new HSV in non-working Unions.

Objective 3: Children of the 2000 target families have access to quality basic and functional education.

1. Early Child Development (ECD) or Pre-School:

The ECD or pre-school program was launched with the aim of ‘providing good educational start laying a life-long-learning foundation and it was observed that children of ECD are getting a life-long-learning foundation. Therefore, it could be said that the preliminary aims and objective of this program has been achieved successfully. The project has supplied the book, notebooks, and pencils to the children in time which helped attracting the guardians and children to come to the school regularly. The average age of the children in pre-school would lies between 4-7 years. The attendance rate of children in the pre-school has been found over 90% which is quite satisfactory (source: ECD attendance registers).

Children who have been graduated from the ECD have merged to Non-formal primary school or mainstream schools in the locality. The project field staff and the ECD teachers visit the local primary schools quite periodically and insist teachers to take care of the ECD graduated children so that no drop out would occur. Till the evaluation no drop out case of graduated children occurred from the mainstream schools (source: statement of field staff at evaluation time).

Developing quality of teachers has been found one of the important components of the ECD program. The project provided several training to teachers. The approach of the teachers in teaching children was found participatory and practicing activity based teaching.

2. Non-formal primary (NFP)

NAP has been operating NFP only in Madan Upazila. The main objective of NFP is to bring back the drop out children to the school. NFP has successfully achieved its objective. Through the NFP the NAP has readmitted quite a large number of children to school. All the NFP graduated children have been successfully merged to local mainstream schools (POPI and CODEC office records). The baseline result shows that in Madan upazila 7.2% and in Mirzagonj upazila 10.5% children were dropped out from the mainstream schools. The baseline result mentioned that poverty was the main cause for the drop out.

Community people were found happy with the inception of NFP in Madan upazila. Quite a large number of drop out children have re-admitted in the NAP. Comparing to the baseline result with the evaluation survey result, it could be said that the NAP has changed the scenario of the child education by incepting the pre-school and NFP. In fact, within the two and half years of time the NAP has tremendously developed the knowledge of parents and changed their attitude towards sending their children to school rather sending to work.

Regarding ECD and NFP one of the critical findings by the evaluator was whether the ECD or NFP will get stipulated number of children every year. In some areas in Mirzagonj upazila and even in Madan

upazila it was felt that there would have problem to get enough children to reach the target for an ECD and NAP because, every year a large number of children are being getting admission to the local mainstream schools. This issue has to be considered mainly by POPI and the Donor SF for Madan upazila.

3. Quality education to children

The concept of working with School Management Committee (SMC) in order to activate the SMC members was found quite impressive. The capacity building of SMC members by the NAP staffs was found very impactful. In fact, many functions of a school depend on the capacity and motivation of the School Management Committee (SMC). Where SMC are strong and effective, quality education to children are ensured. In both upazilas project staffs have established a good rapport with the SMC.

It was evident that the NAP staffs pay a periodical visit to the SMC members and teachers and take information about the progress of students and about the dropout cases. The initiative of the project to arrange meeting with SMC and teachers helped significantly to reduce the dropout cases and it also helped to increase the responsibility of SMC members and teachers as well. The evaluator felt that some sort of pressures has been created on to the SMC members as well as on teachers by the NAP staff to ensure quality education to students.

Teacher-Parents Association (PAT) is very important. Developing the relationship with the parents is a duty of the teachers. During discussions with the local community people it was felt that the parent-teacher cooperation in the mainstream schools has increased. Regular meetings with guardians have been taking place. Guardians received useful information about their children; such as attendance of children, govt. sub-stipend distribution, hygiene education and textbook care etc. In fact, the visitations of project staff to SMC members and mainstream schools have established two-way communication where parents receive information and also have a voice in the way a school operates. This idea of activating the SMC may be transformed in the society which would have long term impact in the community.

The critical observation in ensuring the quality education to children was that the NAP provided teachers in some mainstream schools. These teachers are working under the direction of the mainstream school teachers. As a result, they have comparatively less scope to provide extra curricula education to students. It was felt that providing extra teachers in mainstream school wouldn't be wise to ensure quality education. Community people and mothers informed that they have almost no ability to provide private teacher to their children at home. They suggested for coaching support for children at evening.

Impacts occurred through ECD and NFP

1. ECD and NFP activities were relevant response specially in the Madan upazila (haor area) which created opportunity for poor children to be educated.
2. NAP has built better working relationship with Teachers, Parents and School Management Committees (SMC) at local level. SMC as well as teachers in the mainstream schools are functioning well which helped to ensure quality education to children.
3. ECD and NFP activities have produced an effective start to a quality education, with a stronger possibility of longer education.
4. Parents become more concerned about their children's education than before. The consciousness of parents will definitely develop the morality of children for doing higher education which will have long term impact in the community.
5. The project has established the right to education for poor children and ensured the enrolment of the pre-school children in local government schools.
6. The ECD program has helped developing the relationship between NAP, civil society and the partner HHs in Madan upazila.

Sustainability of ECD and NFP

It was felt that ECD and NFP support will be continued in Madan upazila (haor area) after the phase over of the NAP. In Mirzagonj this support would have less impact. Talking to the civil society members in Madan upazila it was felt that they want to continue the ECD and NFP activities with the support of the PO / WC. POPI has to consider this issue to develop the capacity of PO / WC as well as community volunteers (teachers) in such a way that they can take over ECD and NFP after phase over of the project.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended that the ECD and NFP should be continued in Madan Upazila while it would have little impact in Mirzagonj upazila. POPI should organize refresher training for the teachers of ECD and NDP.
2. It has been recommended that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP could organize training for mainstream schoolteachers for ensuring quality education.
3. It has been recommended that POPI should start medium to long-term planning and management of the ECD and NFP for its sustainability after phase over of the project.
4. It has been recommended that NAP should include issues of attracting ECD and NFP as well as mainstream school children by providing sports materials.
5. It has been recommended that NAP in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas should organize periodic training / seminars / workshops inviting mainstream school teachers, parents, education officials and civil society people for ensuring the quality education to children.
6. It has been recommended that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas instead of providing teacher and logistic support to the mainstream schools, NAP should arrange **Coaching Class** for poor children students studying in the mainstream schools which will be effective for ensuring quality education.
7. It has been recommended that NAP should include cultural events and sports in ECD and NFP and even it could provide support to the mainstream schools for organizing cultural and sports programs.
8. It is recommended to encourage SMC members, PTA members, Teachers, government education officers and civil society members to participate in exposure visit to the best schools in the locality.
9. It has been recommended to start advocacy and lobbying program for strengthening the capacity of the Union education standing committee and motivate the Union Parishad Chairman and members to ensure better infrastructural facilities in the schools; including sitting arrangements, sufficient passage for passing air and light, water and sanitation etc. Also encourage the local government to give award to the best parents, best students and best schools considering their yearly performance.

4. “Shonglap Program”

Facilitating school dropout adolescent girls of target families through the activities of “Shonglap” program has been found very significant thinking of NAP. In both upazilas NAP has successfully motivated and organized the adolescent girls under Shonglap centers. It has been a significant task and achievement of the NAP. Community people gladly appreciated the activities of the ‘Shonglap’ centers.

The involvement of young and adolescent girls in the project is very significant and well planned. It was felt that in future these girls will be the asset of the society to shoulder the responsibility of the community and they will be working as the social Catalysts. Majority of the evaluation participated young Shonglap girls in both upazilas were found studying in schools and colleges. These young girls would be the key factor of the society in maintaining peace and harmony. Developing the knowledge of these young girls can be considered as an important work because, they would be capable to wage struggle to uphold the basic rights of poor people. The young girls were found very spontaneous, enthusiastic and courageous. These young forces could be the major actor in different development endeavour and awareness raising activities in the society.

Developing the capacity of Shonglap girls on different aspects of life has also been found satisfactory. Shonglap centers educated girls on social, rights and health issues. More than 70% girls among the

evaluation meeting participants were found conversant on life skill issues and they have also capacity to participate in family decision making process. Majority of the evaluation participating girls were found knowledgeable about rights, reproductive health, HIV / AIDS, personal hygiene etc. Out of 10 learning issues majority girls were found capable explaining 4-5 issues clearly. The activities of Shonglap centers significantly contributed to change their attitude towards traditional thinking. For example, in regard to dowry, one of the Shonglap girls in East Subedkhili village of Mirzagonj upazila uttered that *'we ourselves are the dowry, why there should be separate dowry'*?

Shonglap programs significantly contributed developing the moral and ethical base of young girls. These girls spontaneously joined the rallies in order to celebrate the different national and international days. Among the evaluation participants about 50% girls of Shonglap centers received skill training from NAP and majority of them were found engaged in sewing and poultry rearing aside their study. The poultry and livestock (mainly goat) receiving girls have successfully raised their poultry and livestock. Majority of them have multiplied the poultry and goats and earned quite a good amount of money. Some of them have saved small money in Bank and some of them gave money to their parents. The training and input support to Shonglap girls certainly increased their skill & capacity and they have been empowered to some extent.

Another aspect which was found critical that in Madan upazila a large number of girls received one time grant from the project (probably from another Donor, but distributed through NAP). It would be Tk. 15,000/- to Tk. 17,000/- to each girl. With this money almost 100% girls purchased cow. The cow is now rearing by parents. From the discussion with the parents it was felt that parents may sell the cow any time to meet the needs of the HH. The objective of providing this grant for continuing the study of girl may not be achieved. This issue has to be monitored by POPI very strongly.

One of the critical observations was that the 'Shonglap' centers have been designed for the dropout adolescent girls. In Mirzagonj upazila and even in Madan upazila it would be difficult to get sufficient dropout girls to form a 'Shonglap' center. Question is why the 'Shonglap' center should be designed only for dropout girls? Why not for all level community girls (both dropout and school going girls)? Why it is designed only for one year? It has been felt that the organized young girls have potential. Once they have been graduated from the 'Shonglap' center, they would overlook or forget their learning. For example, Jesmin Akhter is a follow up Shonglap girl lives in Bagmara village of Madan upazila. She received a grant of Tk. 15,000/-. With this money her parents purchased cows and her mother mainly looks after these cows. Jesmin is doing nothing at this moment except going to school. But, she enjoyed the Shonglap programs and passed a very suitable time with other Shonglap girls.

In this regard, one promising initiative would be in expanding access to information and learning opportunities for the young girls by converting the Shonglap center into multi-purpose community learning centers. In cooperation and association with the local communities and local institutions, the NAP can convert the Shonglap center into Community Resource Center (CRC) which will be providing multidimensional services to all level community people. This CRC will have library, computer and IT services and skills training materials. Community girls as well as PO / WC and all level community people should have access to use this center. Eventually, this center will be managed by the PO / WC and they will use it as their office as well. This CRC will be providing direct benefits to school and college going students with access to non-academic books and newspapers. Empowerment of adolescents and youths through this CRC will be another aspect of raising community awareness. The initiatives to empower adolescents as well as other community people are simultaneously important. The effort of empowering will enable the adolescents and youths to become better caregivers, and create positive changes in the communities in the long run in order to establish the rights of poor people living in the remote areas. The establishment of multi-purpose community learning centers or CRC will develop the ownership of PO / WC as well.

Impacts occurred through ‘Shonglap’ program

1. The Shonglap program significantly reduced the rate of dropout in the community.
2. The Shonglap program increased the knowledge of girls regarding rights and life related issues which will have long term impact to establish women rights.
3. Shonglap centers helped the dropout girls to be re-admitted in schools and developed an association of girls. The association of young girls helped significantly in resisting early marriage and dowry.

Recommendations

1. It has been suggested to continue the ‘Shonglap programs till the project life and it will be open for all level community girls. The graduated girls should have to be appended with the NAP activities. The NAP should involve the Shonglap girls in operating Adult Functional Education (AFL) to illiterate members of SGs, motivating dropout girls to be re-admitted, organize dialogue with local UP Chairmen and Members about the government facilities, organize programs for children etc.
2. It has been recommended that NAP should convert the Shonglap centers into Community Resource Center (CRC) where the dropout and school going girls will have scope to develop an association of ‘study circle’ and they would have scope to learn Computer, IT, Games, Songs, Arts etc. NAP should supply old newspaper, periodicals & magazines to the Shonglap centers or to the suggested CRC. NAP should ensure the participation and contribution of community people in converting ‘Shonglap’ centre into Community Resource Centre (CRC).

Madan upazila: Case study of a Shonglap Girl

Sabina (13) is a name of an adolescent girl. She lives in Deoshaila village under Madan upazila. Her father Md. Solaiman passed away several years ago. She lives with her mother Mina Begum. She is the youngest among her two other sisters and two brothers. Two of her sisters got married in early ages. Sabina has come from a landless family. Her brothers are agriculture labours. Her mother works to other’s house as day labour. Overall she was living in poverty.

In Deoshaila village the NAP established a ‘Shonglap Center’ in 2012. At that time Sabina was dropout from her school at class five. She joined the ‘Shonglap center’ with other dropout girls. The NAP Field Mentor (FM) and the Facilitator of Shonglap center motivated Sabina and her mother to send back her to school. Sabina remains dropout for one year and after joining the Shonglap she re-admitted in the nearby high school with other dropout girls. She is now regular in the school.

Several changes occurred among Sabina after joining the Shonglap center. Sabina was found capable explaining five issues of the life skill education such as; (a) reproductive health (b) hygiene (c) HIV / AIDS (d) rights of a girl (e) early marriage and dowry (f) trafficking etc. She can now understand the advantages of education and she is determined to complete at least the secondary course (SSC). She maintains the personal hygiene and study at home regularly. She demanded coaching support after school because her mother can’t afford the tuition fee of the coaching teacher.

Sabina received Tk. 2,500/- as one time grant from the NAP. She purchased a second hand sewing machine with Tk. 5,000/-. Her brothers provided her extra Tk. 2,500/- for purchasing the machine. NAP organized sewing training in her Shonglap center. It was a course of 21 days. Sabina also attended this course along with other girls. She can now operate the sewing machine. She gets sewing cloths from the villagers. After coming from school she eats and takes little rest and then sits on the machine for stitching clothes. Everyday she doesn’t get cloths but, at least three days she gets cloths from the villages. Every week she earns about Tk. 300/- which is satisfactory for her. Meanwhile, she saved Tk. 2,000/- and purchased a goat with that money. But, she is unlucky that her goat died. She has a plan to purchase goat again with her own income. Sabina can now purchase her necessary items from her income. She has now access to three meals with her mother and brothers. She started rearing chicken. She also gets some income from the chicken. In fact, the Shonglap center showed ways to this poor girl to be involved in IGA like livestock and poultry rearing and sewing to meet her necessities. Sabina is now happy coming back to her school.

Objective 4: 2,000 families have improved income generating opportunities

1. Family Development Plan (FDP)

It is one of the main priorities of NAP to develop the livelihood of the target households in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. NAP has successfully introduced a new dimension in the arena of livelihood development which is called 'Family Development Plan (FDP)'. In fact this is a new *Model of Development* to the households of Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. NAP has successfully motivated poor households of these two upazilas to be visionary. Each of the partners HH has developed their 'vision' which in Bangla called 'Shapna' and in English it is called 'Dream'. During visit to the HHs and also meeting with small groups it was observed that each of the HHs have their Shapna and it is developed on a large brown sheet. The dream of the households was found somehow realistic and achievable.

In the 'Shapna' majority households included achieving the same sorts of assets. These were (a) cow (b) goat (c) poultry (d) house (e) pond (f) tubewell and latrine (g) kitchen gardens (h) trees etc. Except house and pond, NAP provided majority of the inputs / materials to the households to achieve their Shapna. In fact, NAP provided 27 items input / materials to individual households. It was understood that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP staff and the beneficiary jointly purchased the inputs / materials from the local markets in a transparent way.

It was apparently felt from the discussions with the evaluation participants that about 80% households have achieved about 50% of their Shapna. Project mainly provided poultry (chicken and duck), livestock (goat and sheep), fruit saplings, grocery items for shop, boat and net (mainly in Mirzagonj upazila), fingerlings, seeds, etc. It has been calculated that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas each household individually received the input support about Tk. 4,500/- to 5,000/-. Along with the input support NAP has provided necessary IGA training to the input receivers such as; (a) poultry training (b) livestock training, (c) fishery training (d) homestead gardening (e) small business training etc. On the other hand, no evidence was observed that the NAP has facilitated PO / WC to access the public resources like khas land, water bodies and ponds while in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas the PO / WC have scopes to establish rights on khas land and khas ponds.

The critical observation was that the almost none of the households have included social activities like helping disabled children and helpless widows in their Shapna. Majority households achieved their 'Shapna' with the input / material support of the NAP while very few households acquired assets of their 'Shapna' with their own efforts. Similarly, it was NAP who decided to provide input / material support to the households while it would be outstanding if, the request comes from the target households. From the discussions with the evaluation participants it was felt that almost 80% households were able to multiply their assets like ducks, goats, chicken and other assets. It was felt that none of the households have embezzled or destroyed NAP provided assets. Some households have diverted sheep to goat and chicken to duck etc. The seed support by NAP was found excellent. After sufficient consumption each household earned average Tk. 1,200/- from selling the vegetables which has been quite a good support to the rural poor household. The mortality rate of Duck in Madan upazila was found very high while it was less in Mirzagonj upazila. For example, in two visited villages of Madan upazila the evaluator found that NAP provided 250 and 181 ducks (in Bagmara village) to two small groups. All these ducks died due to unknown causes. It was felt that providing 'Sonaly variety of chicken' to the households of Madan upazila was somehow irrelevant decision as well. The mortality rate of this variety was found very high. At the same time, the Livestock Service Provider (LSP) has been found very active in both upazilas.

Another observation was that the SF mission is to eradicate poverty, and the organization is motivated with a deep respect for human dignity regardless of social situation. Through equitable partnership, using a rights-based approach, SF empowers the poor to take charge of their own lives and communities (see the proposal). The NAP has incorporated the rights-based issues with the mainstreaming development

activities while it followed the livelihood development approach. It was felt that project could provide input support to the households after formation of PO / WC and distributing the inputs through PO / WC would be effective to capacitate the PO / WC which would increase the acceptance and dignity of PO / WC in the community.

However, NAP support showed significant improvements in people's lives, directly related to the work of the project in terms of the capacity of constituent groups to accumulate assets (economic, environmental, physical etc.) The NAP intervention in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas enabled the poor households to reduce their socioeconomic vulnerabilities to a certain degree. Within a period of two and half years, the NAP has created multidimensional impacts in the communities and simultaneously brought changes in the socio-economic arenas of community people in many aspects. The project participants specially women have established their rights on the resources. There were evidences that women have strong participation in family decision making process and some women have participation in community decision making process as well. Project provided livelihood training to women helped to increase their life skills and awareness on many social issues. The participation of women in the project activities mainly in livelihood and life skill training encouraged them in raising their voice at different level. The input support of the project definitely helped reducing the extreme poverty and hunger of vulnerable women and simultaneously helped to promote gender equality and accelerated women empowerment. Nevertheless, Family Development Plan (FDP) of Notun Alo Project (NAP) has contributed in developing the social, economic and moral strength of the poor and vulnerable households.

Impacts occurred through the FDP

1. The NAP helped the poor household members to be visionary which will have long term impact in the society to increase their assets in a planned way. The increase of family income through project provided inputs contributed reducing the malnutrition of children and increased the enrolment of children in school specially in Madan upazila. Also the increase of family income contributed increasing the number of meals and diversified food items.
2. The NAP input support for achieving the household 'Dream' significantly reduced the trend of borrowing money by the households from money lenders with high interest rate and even from NGOs.
3. The preservation of seeds by the households from their produced vegetables will have long term impact in order to be self supported in vegetable seeds.
4. The input support of NAP created alternative livelihood for women which eventually impacted reducing the migration of poor household members specially in Mirzagonj upazila.
5. The economic progress of poor households through the input support of NAP made substantial efforts in capacitating the primary as well as secondary groups who have strengthening the partnership with civil society, local government institutions (LGIs), Government sectors and local NGOs. The project beneficiaries have been getting benefits from these sources in order to establish their rights as well as moving forward toward their empowerment.
6. The NAP interventions have eventually helped the household members to some extent to be aware about right to self-determination (such as political, economic and cultural rights), right to freedom of speech, right to freedom of thought, right to freedom of movement and right to social security etc.
7. The increase of awareness and income of poor households consequently helped reducing the discrimination, violence, cruelty, torture, and inhuman or degrading / shameful treatment against women and children. All these have been very significant achievements of the NAP in both upazilas.

Relevance & Effectiveness of the FDP

All the input support of NAP to the poor households have been found sustainable in terms of multiplying the inputs like poultry, livestock, seeds, fingerlings, saplings etc. Except the mortality rate of duck and chicken in Madan upazila all other inputs contributed increasing the household income. In fact gradually the mortality rate of duck and chicken has reduced in Madan upazila with the support of Livestock Support Providers (LSP). The project taught the poor women how better they could live in the society

with dignity through increased income in a planned way. From the discussions with the evaluation participants it was apparently felt that with the input support some poor households have increased their income up to 60%. Therefore, FDP has been found very relevant and very effective in developing the family assets though it was too early to distribute the inputs / materials among the households. Within short period of time the NAP has successfully demonstrated the way to increase the household wealth. The staffs of both POPI and CODEC in Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas have successfully demonstrated the FDP. At the same time, it is a question whether this income will be sustained after stopping the NAP input / material support? NAP has to think about this issue.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended that NAP should give emphasis to follow the Right Based Approach (RBA) in the coming years. It has also been recommended that in the coming years all the offered inputs / materials to the households should be distributed through respective PO / WC.
2. It has been recommended that NAP should give emphasis for the 'food security' of the households taking land as lease by the small groups from the landlords. Specially, it will be feasible in Mirzagonj upazila. It is also suggested that NAP may organize agriculture fare in Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas.
3. It has been proposed that a portion of the household income from the NAP input support (say 10%) may be given to the respective PO / WC for developing the fund of PO / WC which they can use for social and community development activities.
4. It has been recommended that NAP should conduct a study whether the input support to the household or the Family Asset Development has created any discrimination or wrong perception among the other neighbouring poor households (non-beneficiaries).
5. It has been recommended that the NAP should encourage and promote the community households in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas to re-excavate their silted ponds and cultivate fish which has been found very profitable.
6. It has been recommended that NAP should promote sustainable agriculture (home gardening) through small groups. Sustainable home gardening has three main goals--environmental health, economic profitability, and social and economic equity.
7. It has been recommended that NAP should give emphasize on compost fertilizer and herbal pesticide and help the PO / WC to develop nurseries at WARD level.
8. The indigenous Hazzel (Incubator) has been found very effective in Mirzagonh upazila. Therefore, it has been recommended to introduce this hazzel in Madan upazila.

Women entrepreneurship: A Case study from Madan upazila

Mrs. Rina Akhter (34) lives in the village named Biashi under Madan upazila. She established a small grocery shop at her house. Her husband Md. Wasik Mia is a day labour. This couple has two sons and four daughters. Rina Akhter is a member of small group named 'Shapla'. She has deposited Tk. 1,250/- in her group. Before joining the group she was a house wife and had no income at all. Her family doesn't have cultivable land but, have a small piece of homestead land. Rina Akhter had to pass her life with hardship with her husband and children. She had no ability to send children to school. Now, she earns about Tk. 200/- daily from her shop which she can spend for the education of her children. Two of her daughters and one son are now going to NAP run NFP School. Rina Akhter was found very conscious about the education of her children. Her attitude towards child education has changed. She has been attending group meetings regularly and received different awareness lessons from CSP.

Rina Akhter received different inputs from the NAP. She took a piece of cultivable land as lease from a landlord with the project support. She planted potato seeds which she received from the project and harvested about 200 kg potatoes. The potatoes gave her a good income which she invested in her small shop. She also received Tk. 1,000/- from the project for purchasing items for her shop. Her shop has different grocery items which would have value of Tk. 5,000/-. With the income of shop and other input support of the project Rina Akhter purchased chicks & ducklings. She is a successful asset developer.

Rina Akhter also received vegetable seeds, six fruit saplings and toilet from the NAP for developing the livelihood of her family. She earned Tk. 2,000/- selling vegetables which she also invested in her small shop. In Shapla group NAP provided two cows as collective IGA. With resolution the Shapla group gave responsibility of these two cows to Rina Akhter for rearing. She has been found professional livestock and poultry raiser. It has been estimated that she would be benefited Tk. 10,000/- from these two cows after one year.

Rina Akhter and her family members have now access to eat three meals in a day while it was difficult for her to manage two meals for children. Rina Akhter mentioned that her participation in family decision making process has increased. She also added that her dignity in the family as well as in the community has increased. She was found knowledgeable about women and child rights. Now she enjoys freedom of movement, freedom of speech and freedom of spending family money. Mrs. Rina Akhter has been found happy with the support of the NAP.

Successful Asset Developer: A Case study from Mirzagonj upazila

Mrs. Rabia Khatun (28) lives in the village named Uttar Ranipur under Deuli-Subidkhali Union of Mirzagonj upazila. She is an example of successful asset developer. Her husband Md. Mamun Howlader is a labour. This couple has two sons and a daughter. Sons are going to school. Rabia is a member of 'Jhumka' small group.

NAP distributed 14 ducks, 6 fruit saplings, 2 small goats and vegetable seeds to Rabia. She was lucky to get eggs from her ducks in a regular basis. Continually she has been hatching eggs and selling ducks after rearing about six months. Each duck she sells Tk. 300/-. In this way she saved Tk. 30,000/- from sekki8ng ducks. With this money she purchased a cow and that cow gave a calf after couple of months. Now she has two cows. She also sells milk. Meanwhile, her goats gave calves. She has now 4 goats. With the income of milk, eggs, ducks and goats she took mortgage a piece of land. In this land she cultivated crops. The crops will give her a good income. Now, she is planning to purchase a piece of land for making a house. In fact all the family money is spent by her and she has freedom to move and freedom to take family decision.

Rabia received poultry and livestock rearing and disaster training from the NAP. She successfully applied the learning in her IGA. Her children have now access to get three meals with diversified items. She is very happy. Rabia eas found as a successful asset developer.

2. Promote community service providers (CSP)

NAP has developed the sectoral community service providers (CSP) in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas the evaluator had scope to conduct FGD with the Health, Livestock, Agriculture, Disaster related service providers. The development of the sectoral service providers has been found a wise decision. The CSP received some basic training from the NAP, while the time has arrived to provide them some Advance Training (AT) in their related fields so that they can provide service more effectively. The CSP have been playing the substantial role in the community in order to implement the activities of NAP. The CSP have been providing issue-based sessions to the small group members. They were found as 'social catalysts' to make small group members and all level community people aware, active and responsive. No doubt, CSP provided sessions have created impacts to develop the knowledge of the members but, at the same time, it was felt that the CSP have been repeating same lessons in the groups. NAP has to include now lessons on new issues such as environment, climate change etc.

The service to the poultry and livestock by the Livestock Service Providers (LSP) has been found very effective. It was evident that LSP service helped reducing the mortality rate of poultry specially in

Mirzagonj upazila. The livestock and poultry camps in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas also impacted greatly to aware all level community people regarding the diseases of poultry and livestock. The govt. Upazila Livestock Officers of both upazilas attended these camps. NAP also organized eye camp that helped the poor community people.

It has been understood that the sustainability of small groups as well as PO / WC is somehow dependent on the support of CSP and CF because, they are local and they have influence on the community households. It has been experienced by the evaluator while visiting the small groups and individual households that where the CSP and CF are inactive, in fact, that particular small group was found slow or inactive as well. It means, if the CSP and CF works actively for the small groups and individual households, that particular group would survive for long time and that will benefit the community people. It is obvious that one has to take the main responsibility of the small group as well as PO / WC after phasing over of the NAP. On the other hand, the CSP in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas formed 'Service Providers Association (SPA)' which will have impact in the locality to provide better services to the households. During discussion with the CSP it was felt that each of them have a good income from the community and the project as well. Specially, the LSP, HSV and ASP have been found self employed in the community. The good income of the CSP will ensure their existence in the community and that will influence the small groups and PO / WC to be sustained as well. Therefore, before phasing over of NAP, the honorarium for the respective CSP has to be ensured from the community for the sustainability of the small groups and PO / WC.

Impacts occurred through CSP

1. CSP contributed increasing the knowledge of community people and also contributed changing the traditional attitude of community people towards health, hygiene, nutrition and kitchen gardening.
2. The service of DRR volunteers increased the resilient capacity of community people.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended that with the NAP support the DRR Volunteers can collect large earthen pots (matir Kola) from different places and put these pots inside the ground of home which can be used as disaster resilient purpose.
2. It has been recommended to arrange advance training for the CSP so that they can provide better service to the community households.

3. Facilitate entrepreneur groups to establish functional linkage with potential market actors

The NAP has established some sort of market linkage especially chicken in Madan upazila while in Mirzagonj upazila the NAP has established egg value chain in some villages. It was evident that some small groups have been benefited from rearing broiler chicken with the support of local entrepreneurs in Madan upazila. For example, in Balali village of Madan upazila one of the small groups named 'Prarthana' is operating a broiler farm with the support of a local entrepreneur. One of the members named Mrs. Hafeza Begum is looking after this farm. She is getting Tk. 2,000/- per month from the entrepreneur. In each circle this farm raised 400 broiler chicks. After 30 days the entrepreneur takes back all the chickens. The entrepreneur supplied all the food and other logistics to the farm. All together this farm has completed eight circles. From each circle Prarthana group earned about Tk. 7,000/-. The Prarthana group has successfully established functional linkage with local entrepreneur. Similarly, the small egg producing households in Mirzagonj upazila have also getting benefits by establishing market value chain with the local market actors. The NAP has scope to work on establishing agriculture value chain especially vegetable value chain in Madan upazila and in Mirzagonj upazila NAP can try to establish fish value chain.

Objective 5: Target households have developed their resilient to natural disasters

1. Awareness and capacity of community members on DRR and CCA

The Community Based-Disaster Risk Reduction (CB-DRR) and Climate Change Adaptation (CCA) initiative by the NAP has been found relevant and time bound specially in the Mirzagonj upazila. The overall objective of this program is to achieve a ‘Sustainable decrease of the negative impact of natural disasters in the partner HHs with the specific objective that communities are practicing standard CB-DRR Model in the targeted working upazilas against multiple natural hazards’. In order to achieve the objective it can be mentioned that in Mirzagonj upazila quite a large number of households have been found taking a significant range of preparedness measures while in Madan upazila few households have taken some sorts of preparedness measures. But, the project has established a strong coordination between all working Union Parishads (UP) and local schools regarding DRR particularly at the pre-disaster stage.

One of the main findings of the evaluation is that even though very little institutional knowledge on CB-DRR had reached the targeted communities, people in the area specially in the Mirzagonj upazila have gained empirical knowledge through their experience over time facing disasters of various types. Knowledge levels and understanding of risk, hazards and vulnerability were found to be high amongst the project beneficiaries in both upazilas. In Mirzagonj upazila quite a large number of partner HHs have developed some mechanisms to cope with and mitigate the losses due to disasters such as; preserving dry food, movable oven, stock seeds, and fire woods, saving money, keeping important documents in safe places, and becoming familiar with the nearest safe shelters while none of the households in Madan and Mirzagonj upazillas have raised homestead ground for the safety of livestock and poultry or developed disaster resilient constructions for livestock and poultry. In Madan upazila project has done an excellent job by developing a reforestation in the hoar to protect the erosion by the strong wave of haor water. From the discussions with the evaluation participants it was felt that about 100% small group members in Madan upazila have knowledge about the consequences of flash flood. Meanwhile, some HHs have taken precautions by raising homestead land, fastened strong fence surrounding the homestead and planted trees to protect the waves of the haor.

The cyclone Sidr in 2007, people in Mirzagonj area become more responsive towards DRR issues and some of the members explained that they have taken responsibility to raise community awareness on preparedness, prevention of losses, coping mechanisms, and warning signals. Awareness on the necessity to take shelter during disasters was also widespread amongst the community people in Mirzagonj area while in Madan area community people were found knowledgeable on DRR, but few families were found taken practical pre-disaster measures.

On the other hand, none of the members of partner HHs in both upazilas have received formal training on climate change. It appeared clearly from the discussions that knowledge gaps remained extremely high, in particular in the area of climate change among the SG members in both upazilas. Knowledge levels of community people on climate change were also found to be partial and incomplete and no member was able, for example, to define climate change or mention causes of climate change. Some of the community people have heard about this issue from different sources. From the discussions it was felt that community people have following lacking:

- (a) Lack of knowledge about the causes behind climate change.
- (b) Lack of knowledge about the consequence of climate change.
- (c) Lack of knowledge about the measures of climate change

In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas NAP has successfully established a strong rapport with the Union Disaster Management Committee (UDMC). It was apparently felt that the UDMC in all working Unions had little risk reduction plans and they didn’t share the plans with the community stakeholders. In fact UDMC were somehow dormant in normal times and would only be activated during an impending disaster. The NAP has successfully revitalized the UDMC. The project also developed WARD-base Disaster Volunteers who have been keeping liaison with the UDMC. The Disaster Volunteers have been

providing awareness lessons to the small group members which created impacts to develop the knowledge of members. From the discussion with the evaluation participants it was felt that about 80% members of small groups have knowledge about the functions of UDMC. Almost 100% small group members in Mirzagonj upazila have knowledge about the location of nearby cyclone shelters.

In Mirzagonj NAP also organized several mock drills in the mainstream schools. Quite a large number of students and teachers participated in these drills. School teachers in Mirzagonj appreciated the mock drills that helped students to be familiar to their responsibility at disaster period. NAP helped 100% partner HHs to develop a community-based DRR plan while PO / WC have not yet been involved in DRR plan. It has been felt that the community-based DRR plan has to be reviewed time to time.

Project has developed and distributed different posters and installed billboards in different public places in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. All these posters and billboards were found realistic. It was felt that quite a large number of community people acquired knowledge through these posters and billboards. NAP organized cultural events helped the community people to be aware on DRR. The civil society members appreciated the endeavours of the NAP towards making people aware on DRR.

2. Development of DRR fund

Every month small groups are depositing a small amount of money to the DRR fund. In both upazilas NAP categorized the small groups such as (a) high risk groups (b) medium risk groups and (c) low risk groups. The high risk groups received Tk. 5,500/-, medium risk groups received Tk. 4,000/- and the low risk groups received Tk. 3,290/- from NAP. Similarly, in Madan upazila NAP provided Tk. 4,850/-, Tk. 4,500/- and Tk. 3,500/- to the small groups considering their risks to disaster. The SGs deposited this money in Bank. The allocation of DRR fund to SGs has been found insignificant, as this money is staying idle in Bank and this small amount of money would not serve the purpose at the disaster period. NAP could allocate this money to PO/WC for developing its fund for increasing capacity on disaster resilient.

Impacts occurred through DRR awareness program

1. The DRR plan at HH level and awareness program significantly increased the knowledge of community people about the consequences of the pollution of water sources, air, public places etc. In Mirzagonj upazila NAP has established early warning mechanism that impacted reducing casualties.
2. The project activities certainly developed the knowledge of civil society members, teachers, students, UP members and community people which will have impact to help the poor people during at disaster.

Recommendations

1. It has been recommended that NAP should involve community people through PRA process in order to establish community risk assessment process in both Madan & Mirzagonj upazila. The involvement of the people in risk mapping process would help to minimize the losses.
2. It has been recommended that NAP should emphasize the climate change issue in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. The community people should be trained up on the consequences of climate changes and develops knowledge about their role and responsibilities to cope with climate change.
3. It has been recommended to organize mock drills and cultural events among maximum schools and colleges located in the working Unions of working upazilas.
4. It has been recommended that DRR and climate change efforts should be made towards complementing and institutionalizing the existing community knowledge and creating strong and inclusive mechanisms for dissemination and information-sharing amongst all level community stakeholders. In that process, meaningful identification and participation of youth, women and people with disability is a pre-requisite to address some of the current gaps and weaknesses in the coordination system. Project should take special attention for the vulnerable groups.
5. It is suggested that NAP in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas should take strong measures to motivate SG members for raising their Homestead land, disaster resilient constructions, reforestation and protecting water resources.

Section-4: Overall Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Partnership and Sustainability

1. Overall relevance / appropriateness of the NAP

The relevance and appropriateness of the NAP has been found satisfactory in order to meet some of the basic needs of the direct beneficiaries and country priorities. It was evident that women got emphasis in livelihood development as well as capacity development. At the same time, it was also observed that the project gave less priority for the children with disabilities which need be included.

The objectives, goals and outcomes of the project have been found consistent. The relevance of the training, service and supports for improving socio-economic situation delivered to the immediate beneficiaries have been found relevant and that have produced impacts and outcomes. At the same time, project could include activities for the capacity development of PO / WC. It could emphasize the development of skill of women to create more self employment opportunity for women. The NAP activities contributed to increase the income of poor and marginalized HHs which eventually develop the mental strength of direct as well as targeted community people. It was also observed that due to the input support of the NAP the trend of exploiting the women people by powerful people has significantly reduced. It was also observed that the powerful people and government officials have changed their attitude and outlook to the poor community people.

The evaluator found the project highly relevant in order to bring poor community women under a common platform. Due to social abhorrence poor women were losing their access to the local resources, but the NAP has significantly minimized this situation. Gradually the situation of poor women is improving and they are getting access to the local resources and power system. The project has already addressed some of these problems and still it has been trying to solve other problems. The project has been well accepted by all level community people as well as government officials of Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas and local Union Parishad members. The achievements of the quantitative targets of NAP have been found satisfactory.

It was quite appropriate and relevant decision by the POPI and CODEC management launching the NAP for aiming uplifting the social and human rights of the vulnerable community women. The project has created several impacts and successfully brought all poor women under the same objectives. Therefore, in achieving the ultimate objective the NAP was found very much relevant and appropriate considering the socioeconomic context of the poor HHs. In the mean time, this project has developed some sort of knowledge of women about their rights. The knowledge about primary health and hygiene has also increased. The selection of project participants, (e.g., the poor and marginalized HHs, dropout girls, children etc.) was found unique.

The evaluator feels that the NAP has achieved some of its desired results within two and half years time. The investment of money, labour, and time has produced impacts in the communities as desired. The NAP needs to continue its support among the poor HHs who have already been brought under the project in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. At the same time, it has been felt that it would be relevant and cost-effective to expand the activities of NAP in the neighboring Unions of Madan upazila while expansion of NAP activities in other Unions of Mirzagonj upazila would comparatively be less relevant.

2. Overall efficiency of the NAP

Optimal resources, time, inputs and outputs could be defined as the efficiency of a project. It was apparently seemed that the NAP has used its resources, inputs and time properly in order to achieve the desired results. Project has offered training, organized seminars / workshops and day observing rallies which significantly produced the impacts and outputs. The project budget contributed increasing the knowledge, capacity and awareness of women about health, hygiene, rights, empowerment etc. At the same time project money contributed to increase the HH income and united the community people under

the small groups. Project money also contributed developing the networking and communications with local GO and NGO and other service providers. Apart from these issues the project money also contributed developing the mental peace of women through involving them in income generating activities (IGA) which contributing increasing their HH income. The increase of HH income contributed increasing frequency of meals and diversified foods. The NAP has achieved its primary objective and produced results and impacts. The community people find the NAP favorable and friendly for them. The geographical and population coverage didn't affect the progress and efficiency of the NAP.

On the other hand, POPI and CODEC have to minimize the staff turn over rate and to develop the capacity of staff. In some areas newly appointed FM has been sent to the field without providing project related basic training. For example, Mr. M. A. Mannan has been posted in Fatepur Union of Madan upazila just few days ago. He didn't get necessary training related to NAP activities.

On the other hand, FMs are habituated operating activities in small groups while they were found operating activities among the large group called PO / WC. As a result, it becomes intricate to FM to develop the capacity of PO /WC. POPI and CODEC have to consider this issue in the following years. The human resources of the project should have to be at optimum and satisfactory level to make the PO / WC capable and sustainable. It has been suggested to increase the budget for staff as well as beneficiary capacity development in the following years. The human quality, knowledge, information and skills of staffs and the project beneficiaries will have long term impacts in the in community to eliminate their socioeconomic vulnerabilities. The ownership of beneficiaries on the project as well as leadership among the small groups and PO /WC has to develop.

3. Overall effectiveness of the NAP

The effectiveness of a project usually focused in terms of the extent by which a project / program is doing the right activities to accomplish its objectives. The NAP has achieved some of its objectives and eventually the project is running towards reaching its goal. The effectiveness of the NAP has been found satisfactory. In realism, it has been experienced that the project intervention was found effective in order to develop the livelihood of poor HHs and to bring change in their traditional thinking towards child education, health, hygiene, nutrition, rights and empowerment. The project has already created several impacts towards developing the knowledge of members about their rights. It has been developing the scope and opportunity for the target women to work together to establish their rights under the same platform. In both upazilas the project has build the confidence of women and increased their participation in the project activities which will eventually help make the small group as well as PO / WC sustainable.

5. Overall Sustainability of the NAP

At present small group has become the principal hub of implementing the activities of NAP. Sustainability of small groups has become the principal question beyond the donor's funding? The evaluator tried to find out the answer of this question through discussing with different stakeholders. The small group members were found united and they have strong commitment to continue their activities. After formation of PO / WC the confidence of small group members has increased and they are optimistic that PO / WC will be capable to take the responsibility of small groups after the phase over of the NAP. The small savings plus the donation of the project to the collective IGA can satisfy the members to develop a satisfactory fund which would allow members to take loan for starting new IGA. At the same time, NAP may allow seed money to each of the small groups in order to develop their fund. Members monthly savings, income from collective IGA (already provided by NAP) and the project provided seed money (if) would develop the group fund to a certain level which would help the small group to be sustained. Group members would not need to take loan from other NGO or moneylenders if, they can raise their fund up to Tk. 50,000/-. Therefore, it is expected that each of the small groups will be economically solvent and sustain with a capital of Tk. 50,000/-. Therefore, the NAP has to emphasize to increase the fund of small groups for its economic sustainability. The NAP has incorporated several

strategies for promoting sustainability of community poor HHs: such as promoting human rights of women, increase HH income, promote education, develop health and nutritional situation etc. All these support has helped the poor HHs tremendously to be rehabilitated in their localities. The increase of HH income will ensure the active role and contribution of members to the small groups which will eventually help the small groups to be sustained.

The capacity of the PO / WC is very crucial element in the success and sustainability of development activities of the NAP. Therefore, it is important to strengthen the capacity of PO / WC to provide support to the small groups for its sustainability. Currently, the PO / WC were found somehow incapable to take responsibility of small groups. But, the NAP has still two and half years time in hand to develop the capacity of PO /WC. In next tow years the NAP has to deliver responsibility to the capable PO / WC to prove their competency towards sustainability. The impacts of the NAP in the next couple of years on individual, family and at community level can also help to sustain the project in the long-run. If, the PO / WC can advance forward in a systematic way, the evaluator believes that there would have wider impact in the community and the project activities will sustain for long time. In the next couple of years, the project staffs have to work closely with the project beneficiaries, CF, CSP, civil society members and community people to prepare them in such a way that they would be capable to take the responsibility of the small groups as well as the responsibility of some of the components of the project. In the next couple of years the project staffs have to develop the PO / WC in such a way they are capable to establish a strong network and relationship with govt. and non-government offices in the locality and they would be capable to mobilize the local resources in fovour of their respective small groups. Therefore, next couple of years of the NAP will be very crucial for ensuring the sustainability of the small groups.

6. Quality of partnerships: Added value

In both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas the partnership between SF and the implementing organizations (POPI and CODEC) has added value to gear-up the poor and marginalized HHs toward their poverty reduction, revitalization of individual or community economic development process. The partnership also integrated the poor HHs and stimulated the local economy through increasing the income of the partner HHs. The long-standing partnership between SF and POPI and CODEC has allowed poor household members to increase their meal frequency and food diversity. The partnership also added value to establish value chain in some villages and linking the small groups with the potential market actors which will have long term impact in the community to get good price of their products. The partnership also helped reducing waterborne diseases through installing tubewells and hygienic latrines.

The SF fund helped for adding value in changing the lifestyle of poor HH members. The increase of economy of poor HHs changed their attitude towards social stigmas. The involvement of poor women in the project activities added value in establishing child and women rights, dignity and freedom at different aspects of life like; freedom of speech, freedom of movement, freedom of participation in family matters etc. The partnership between Stromme Foundation (SF) and POPI and CODEC has been found an ideal example for non-profit, but, for the livelihood development of poor HHs as well as building capacity of poor women towards sustainability.

The partnership between SF and POPI and CODEC added value for developing relationship and linking up the poor people with government line departments through developing the Community Service Providers (CSP). The partnership also added value in spreading the relationship with different stakeholders in the development sector like–NGOs and government bodies, UP members, LGIs, Civil Society Members like; Journalists, Advocates, School and College Teachers, Religious and Political Leaders, Freedom Fighters etc. All these added values through the partnership between SF and POPI and CODEC will have long-term impacts in the community.

7. Lesson Learned through implementing the Notun Alo Project (NAP): sdvbsdb

From the evaluator's point of view one of the significant lessons learned from the NAP that in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas quite a large numbers of households received different livelihood support (e.g., duck, chick, goat / sheep, cow, sapling, support for establishing shop, boat, net etc.). In the community there have more poor and marginalized households. The livelihood receiving and non-receiving households live closely in the same village. Therefore, if the benefits of the project touch only a portion of the community, the other (larger) portion of the poor and marginalized households would suffer from inferior complex which may turn to social abhorrence. Therefore, the project has to be designed in such way that all the community people should have participation in common activities of the project.

Other learning have mentioned in the analysis of field observations and recommendations chapters.

8. Best practice:

Project has done well practicing effective communication with different stakeholders and used the resources properly. Also project has done well capacitating the partner organizations. Both POPI and CODEC have reviewed the project implementation process time to time with the support of SF Focal Person. Project has done well practicing monitoring and supervising of the consistency of project outputs and outcomes.

9. Project Management:

Periodic staff drop out has been a problem of both POPI and CODEC. Since the beginning of NAP several staff left the project and new staff have been appointed by both POPI and CODEC. In fact the turn over of staff somehow hampered the progress of the project. Both POPI and CODEC management have to take this problem into consideration. Also it was felt that sometimes new appointed staffs were not properly oriented on the project before sending to field. Probably there had no budget to provide training to new staff, as the drop out staffs were trained up with the stipulated budget. This issue has to be reviewed and necessary budget provisions have to be kept for new staff development for next couple of years. Developing the capacity of small groups and PO / WC mostly depend on the field staffs as, because they nurture the small groups and PO / WC at field level. Therefore, the capacity development of field staff is very important. At the same time, the new field staffs have to understand the processes and systems of the project. They have to gain knowledge about the relationship between a smooth 'support partner' and 'implementation partner'. They have to gain organizing capacity e.g., awareness, motivation, knowledge, skills, mobilization of local resources in order to ensure better development, project management & reporting at all stages of the project.

The SF Focal Person paid regular visit to the project at the grassroots level periodically in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas while the Focal Persons of POPI and COEDC have to increase their visit to the project sites. The SF Focal Person significantly contributed to develop the NAP staff in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. SF Focal Person holds discussions with project staff members and gave feedbacks with proper analysis. The visit of SF Focal Person to the project sites helped the field staffs to implement the activities according to the plan. The thematic, strategic, technical and monitoring support of the SF Focal Person helped the field staff to achieve the goal and objectives of the NAP. While the guidance and direction to implement the NAP activities should come from the Focal Person of POPI and CODEC. Therefore, both POPI and CODEC should make the Focal Person of the NAP dynamic and field oriented. The Focal Person of both POPI and CODEC should maintain strong communication with the SF Focal Person and accordingly he / she should guide the field staff.

Section-5: Overall Project Monitoring, Supervision and Reporting

1. Project monitoring, supervision and reporting system

Monitoring has been found as the integral and on going process of the NAP. Monitoring report has been found integrated with the management reporting system. NAP in both upazilas produced MIS (RBM), annual report, quarterly and six-monthly reports in time. Both quantitative and qualitative changes have been reflected in the monitoring and other reports. Sufficient case studies and photographs have been included in these reports. The monitoring process of the NAP in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas has been found systematic and computerized and managed by assigned staff at field level. The monitoring staff collects data and information from fields through the FM. It was observed that some indicators have been monitored monthly, some are quarterly and some are yearly. For example, output level monitoring is done quarterly and goal and objective level monitoring is done half yearly and yearly. The indicators of the project have been monitored by the POPI and CODEC assigned staff at family, small group and community level. Goal, objective and activity wise and also output and outcome level monitoring was also observed. SF focal person has been helping the POPI and CODEC monitoring staff to develop their capacity in this regard.

In regard to NAP monitoring, one of the critical observations was that NAP monitoring indicators were too large and repetitive (about 78 indicators have been selected for monitoring the NAP activities). In fact, the participation of the project beneficiaries in setting monitoring indicators would help to select the necessary indicators. The POPI and CODEC assigned staff have still to comprehend with all these indicators. In fact, SF has been playing imperative role in monitoring and supervision of the NAP activities while the partner organizations have relatively passive role in this regard. From the SF point of view the Result Based Monitoring (RBM) has been found effective while the POPI and CODEC assigned monitoring staff has still hesitation using the RBM system because they are new in their position.

The monitoring staffs in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas were found new, but they are trying hard to be acquainted with the RBM system. It was felt that the monitoring staffs of both upazilas need the following training to develop their M&E capabilities:

- (a) Research methodology
- (b) Fundamental M&E course
- (c) Approach of RBM system
- (d) PRA training
- (e) Project design and development training

Section-6: Overall Recommendations and Conclusions

Overall recommendations

Observing the NAP activities at field level and considering the facts findings in the fields, the evaluator recommends the following major issues to be considered by POPI and CODEC in the next couple of years (within the lifetime of the NAP):

1. **Staff Development:** It has been recommended that FM should attend all the meetings of small group for at least one more year. It has been recommended that both POPI and CODEC have to develop a staff development plan so that staff can develop the capacity of small groups as well as PO / WC.
2. **Harness the potential of Community Service Providers (CSP):** The evaluation exposed the relevance and effectiveness of the CSP. It has been recommended that the potentials of the CSP should be harnessed through providing them advance training and allocate more works to them. The involvement of CSP in the NAP activities will help to sustain the project activities. In order to provide service to the community people in non-working unions, it is also recommended to create CSP in non-working unions in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. The CSP in non-working unions will be self employed. NAP has to show the way of their income sources in the community.
3. **Continue to build the capacity of small groups and PO / WC towards sustainability:** The capacity of the small groups and PO / WC is a crucial element in the success of the empowerment and sustainability of small groups, hence it is recommended that the NAP should consider the social as well as economic sustainability of small groups. It is recommended that the NAP should facilitate a capacity self-assessment process for all the small groups as capacity assessment baseline. The results of the self-assessment should also guide the capacity building plan of small groups as well as PO / WC for the next couple of years. The NAP should ensure that the self-assessment plans have improved the capacity of SG and PO / WC though setting different capacity measurement indicators.
4. **Development of weak members:** The civil society members, social activists, government officials and local elites are now somehow aware and concerned about the rights of the poor women which were seldom seen earlier. At the same time, in essence, it has been noticed that the all members of small groups were not equally developed. Still about 30% women in the small groups were found lagging behind and the level of their development was found not up to the mark. The depth of their sensitivity regarding rights and dignity were found insufficient. The civil society members, social activists, government officials and local elites also stressed on the social and economic development of these poor women. Therefore, the evaluator recommends that the NAP should have to uplift these weaker women by offering more training and other development packages including IGA.
5. **Developing the fund of small groups:** Considering the age of the small groups, it was found that all the small groups have been organized within last two years. But, the small groups didn't raise satisfactory amount of fund considering their age. In the mean time, the NAP provided input support to individual members as individual IGA and small groups as collective IGA. The collective IGAs were found somehow irrelevant in order to raise the group fund. Therefore, it has been recommended to provide revolving fund to small groups instead of providing collective IGA. The revolving fund will help the small groups to raise their fund to meet the demand of loan of individual members.
6. **Meeting Centre for PO / WC:** One of the issues rose during the FGD with PO / WC members that the need for a training / meeting center for PO / WC. All the visited PO / WC were found having no meetings / training place. They demanded an office cum training cum meeting center for the PO / WC. The evaluator found the logic very reasonable and feasible. On the other hand, the adolescent girls of 'Shonglap Centers' need a place to be associated after coming from school. Therefore, it has been recommended that the NAP should develop a 'Community Resource Center (CRC) in each working WARD which will be used by PO / WC and adolescent girls as their learning center. The CRC may be equipped with modern facilities like computer, internet, mobile phone etc. Shonglap girls showed their interest in getting computer training.

7. ***Strengthen linkages of PO / WC outside:*** The NAP should facilitate PO / WC establishing external linkages which is very important to make the small groups sustainable. It was observed that the NAP staff have established linkages with GO / NGO while PO / WC have still lack of capacity to establish linkage with outside sources independently. Therefore, it has been recommended that the NAP should give emphasis that the PO / WC members are capable to establish linkage independently. The NAP should include creating opportunities for the PO / WC members for exchange visits and share learning from different organizations inside the country.
8. ***Mobilization of Adolescent Girls:*** The NAP has successfully mobilized adolescent girls under the Shonglap centers. These girls have acquired knowledge on life skill issues. The adolescent girls can also be mobilized with the aim of creating forum or association for the improvement of their social and emotional well being and access to local resources. A ‘study circle’ can be developed with the mobilized adolescents. These girls can then be aiming for the sustainability of small groups and PO / WC. Therefore, it has been recommended that the Shonglap girls should not be phased out. They should be griped in the NAP involving in different social and cultural activities like day observation, plantation, sport, cultural program, debate program, writing and drawing competition etc.
9. ***Suggested social sustainability assessment indicators for PO / WC:*** In order to assessing the capacity of the PO / WC and its social sustainability, the evaluator recommends capacity self-assessment tool with indicators. The NAP could introduce this tool among the PO / WC. (The social sustainability measurement indicators have been given in Annexure – IX).
10. ***Household food Security:*** The food security of poor HHs in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas is a great concern. It was observed that in Mirzagonj upazila the land owners usually produce two crops and about four months their land remains almost empty. During this time the NAP could motivate the poor HHs to take lease of land and produce Rabi crops like cucumber, watermelon, sunflower, Soya beans etc. which will increase the food security of poor HHs.
11. ***Agricultural support:*** The agriculture related technical support includes quality seeds, power tiller and other agricultural machines, and marketing support for selling their agriculture products have been found feasible in the livelihood development of the households. It is important to mention here that poor and marginalized households in both Madan and Morzagonj almost depend on the agricultural activities. Therefore, it has been recommended to involve PO / WC in getting / collect power tiller and other agricultural machines as their income source.
12. ***Right Based Approach (RBA) and non-RBA:*** It has been recommended that the NAP should involve a broad comparison of RBA and non-RBA approaches (livelihood approach) and include the approach which is most likely to have a long-term positive effect in the community.
13. ***Ensure the inclusion of disability program:*** The evaluation raised the exclusion of the children with disability in the target households. Therefore, it has been recommended that in next couple of years the NAP should design and develop a separate program exclusively for the children with disabilities in the target households and in the wider community.
14. ***Enhance the role of POPI and CODEC in project policy making process:*** It has been observed that both the partner organizations (POPI and CODEC) have comparatively less role in reviewing the project implementation process, policy making for NAP, monitoring and supervision process etc. Therefore, it has been recommended that the Focal Persons of both POPI and CODEC have to increase his / her role in all the sectors of the NAP.

Conclusions

The evaluator conducted the mid-term evaluation of the NAP in a participatory approach. The evaluator tried to cover the issues mentioned in the Terms of Reference (ToR). All level community people had high amount of participation in the evaluation process which significantly helped the evaluator to collect data and information for the evaluation and to produce this report.

The NAP has been found relevant and effective in meeting some of the basic needs of the poor households in both Madan and Mirzagonj upazilas. The project has developed the moral courage of poor women through its activities and also helped to establish the rights of women in the family and to some extent in the community. The NAP has successfully integrated the community people under common platform. Project also created positive impact specially in developing knowledge of women and adolescent girls about their rights and life skills. Project also ensured the government safety net services and facilities for some poor women. Project has been educating children of Haor areas which will have long term impacts in the community. The NAP educated parents specially mothers about the importance of child education and negative impacts of child labour, early marriage, trafficking, etc. The NAP has created significant impacts in the lives of poor and marginalized women, but the Right Based Approach (RBA) could be followed. The implementing process of the NAP has been found appropriate while the capacity and strength of small groups and PO /WC has to be developed for the sustainability of small groups. The capacity of the small groups and PO /WC is the crucial element in order to empowering the women and the sustainability of small groups. The POPI and the CODED have to facilitate capacity self-assessment process for developing the capacity of small groups and PO/WC which will help for the sustainability of small groups and NAP activities.

Annexure – I: Terms of reference (TOR)

MID-TERM EVALUATION

NOTUN ALO PROJECT (NAP)

Stromme Foundation

1. Background

Strømme Foundation (SF) has launched a sustainable livelihood project named “*Notun Alo*” (New Light) for the indigene and marginalized communities of Bangladesh who are mostly vulnerable to natural hazards. With the financial assistance from ERIKS Development Partner the project started its journey in July 2011 and planned to continue till June 2016. The major thrust of this project is to improve the economic and social status of 2000 identified households. The project has been designed with rights based programming principles in order to ensure community and other stakeholders’ participation that leads to sustainability.

Strømme Foundation implements programmes through local partners. This project too implemented through two local partners; POPI works with 1,000 households at Madan, Netrokona District and CODEC works with 1,000 households at Mirjagonj, Patuakhali District.

The specific **objectives** of the project are:

By end of 2016,

1. Strong civil society mechanism functioning to address and advocate for social and economic rights of people
2. Improved health and nutritional status of the 2,000 target families (especially mothers and children)
3. Children of the 2000 target families have access to quality basic and functional education
4. 2,000 families have improved income generating opportunities
5. Target households have developed their resilient to natural disasters.

As a results focused development organization, this project is guided by Results Based Management and thus as a precondition it has conducted a baseline survey too. Since learning is decisive in RBM through reviews and evolutions, SF has decided to undertake a midterm evaluation of this project.

2. Purpose and scope of the evaluation

The overall purpose of this midterm evaluation is to assess to what extent *Notun Alo* has contributed to get the poor and marginalized communities out of poverty and prepared them to address their own issues and lead a decent life.

Further, this evaluation will be considered as a process of **learning and improvement** of the project. SF BGD anticipates that the outcomes of this midterm evaluation will provide relevant information to the ongoing scope of work of the partners; explore why the interventions implemented by the programme succeeded or not; and provide guidance for subsequent implementation of the programme during the next three years.

The evaluation will make use of generic evaluation criteria – relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. Within this scope, the evaluation will look into the following aspects.

- Assess the **efficiency** of programme implementation, assessing whether or not the project plans were fulfilled and resources were used in a responsible and accountable way. Has the programme approach been a cost-efficient way to implement development assistance? Assessing the M&E, project implementation, risk management and partnership strategy and their capacity and changes in programme management
- Assess the **effectiveness** of programme implementation; how effective are the approaches and structures such as POs in delivering the desired results? How the POs are functioning? Their capacity and effectiveness in addressing community issues? To what extent the IGA component of the project contributing to address their household level income and result in overcoming poverty? How effectively community people are involved and have been prepared for disasters and what are the current results?
- Determine the **relevance** of the programme in relation to the existing needs of the stakeholders and environment. To what extent is the programme strategy relevant to the need identified? Especially related to the target group and the poverty level in the given context? Whether or not the Family Development Plan (FDP) a good instrument for this target family and community?
- Assess the **outcome and impact** of *Notun Alo* in relation to the indicators specified in the logframe. Are there any unintended results of the programme? What sorts of spin over effect in the community are visible?
- Assess the long term **sustainability** of programme interventions. Are the benefits from the programme, especially at community level likely to continue after the completion of the programme? Especially, the likelihood of households to continue their IGAs at family level and the POs to function independently.
- Identifying **lessons learned** on the strategic approaches and best practices and providing possible **recommendations** on how to improve the management of the project at different levels (short and long term) until its completion.
- MTE is expected to suggest if any adjustment needed in the log-frame to capture the changes as envisaged and indicate scale-up potential

3. Method

The MTE will be carried out in the locations of two partners. The study will include qualitative and quantitative approaches with a variety of primary and secondary data sources including participatory methods. The data sources could include questionnaire survey, key informant interviews, focus groups and meeting with stakeholders and project staff to cover all dimensions of the project's logframe and M&E Plan. The quality of data with respect to accuracy, reliability and validity is crucial to the study.

The consultant will develop the methodology and an action plan in consultation with SF and will share it before implementation. Briefly, the following methods can be used.

- Study the project documents
- Discussions with SF staff on facilitation, implementation and monitoring procedure of the project
- Interview with project field staff, management of partner organization and analyze strengths and weaknesses of project management by each partner
- Key informant interviews and Focused Group Discussions with a range of stakeholders
- Structured direct observations
- Households surveys and/or application of PRA tools
- In the case of special issues, in-depth case studies of a family to assess impact of the programme.
- Time line analysis of sample families and group

4. Team Composition

SF promotes stakeholder participation in its evaluations. Hence, the consultant is expected to conduct a participatory evaluation to ensure meaningful involvement of the partners, beneficiaries and other

interested parties. Especially, SF would like to get SF Programme Staff involved in the evaluation process in order to internalize the lessons learned and to build their capacity on evaluation methodologies as well.

Hence, the evaluation team will consist of external consultant/s and a representative/s of SF's Programme staff. The consultant is expected to plan the methodology and guide SF staff in evaluating the project; however, s/he is responsible for writing the final report.

5. Specific tasks to be accomplished by the Consultant

- Submit an Evaluation Scope of Work (SoW) with target dates to start, complete & milestones and budgets
- Design the survey methodology along with SF Staff
- Conduct the mission at field, partners and SF levels and hold discussions/exit meetings
- Analyze the data gathered from the survey in relation to the objectives specified in the project
- Submit a draft evaluation report to SF and discuss it with relevant staff
- Submit the final report to SF after incorporating any comments made by SF

6. Deliverables

The expected outputs are:

- A comprehensive MTE study design and plan outlining the execution phase with clear time-frames
- A comprehensive MTE study report both hard copy (6 copies) and soft copy which should include:
 - The data collection plan, methodologies utilized during the study; and research tools; research risks and limitations
 - An analysis of the collected data (with relevant disaggregation) in relation to the LFA and M&E plan
 - Presentation of findings both in general and partner-wise
 - Presentation of recommendations and lessons learned.
- An accessible (electronic and hardcopy) database with all the data collected during the study
- Seminar for dissemination of the final report (This will be organized by SF, if required)

7. Evaluator Qualifications

The evaluation will be carried out by a consultant who meets the following criteria:

- Relevant educational qualifications
- Development expertise and experience
- Relevant quantitative and qualitative research skills
- Proven expertise on subject matters of Sustainable Livelihood Approach, RBA, Family Development, Economic & Social Empowerment process, Asset-based approach etc.
- Proven evaluation skills such as sampling, participatory evaluation methodology, appreciative enquiry methods, focus group interviews, etc.
- Proven team leader and report writing skills
- A history of performing similar evaluation/s
- High standard of professionalism

8. Period of Contract

SF envisages that the MTE could be completed within a period of 15 consulting days and expects the assignment to be completed by end March 2014. The assignment should be completed within a month after the contract with SF has been signed.

9. Method of Proposal

Consultants/firms are expected to send their proposals (SoW) directly to Stromme Foundation Asia Regional Office, Colombo, Sri Lanka addressing Mr. R. Ravi Shankar, Regional Advisor Quality Assurance & Research ravi.shankar@stromme.org and copying to Regional Manager Programmes Ms. Dharshini Croos dharshini.croos@stromme.org and Mr. Sonjit Leo Gomes, Acting Country Coordinator/ Senior Coordinator Programme sonjitleo.gomes@stromme.org.

SF will procure the services of consultancy firm/consultant for this assignment as per its own organizational policy. All terms and conditions will be included in the consultancy agreement. SF deserves the right to select or reject any SoW with its own judgment as well as cancel/terminate at any stage if situation arisen.

Annexure – II: FGD participants, POPI

**People’s Oriented Program Implementation (POPI)
Madan Upazila– Netrokona**

Mid-Term evaluation of Natun Alo Project (NAP)

FGD Participants (Civil Society member)

Date: 23rd April 2014

Sl	Name	Designation	Name of Union
1	Tofajjol hosain	Journalist	Tioshree
2	Habibur Rahman	Politician	Tioshree
3	Md. Abdul Latif	Elite person	Tioshree
4	Amirul Hasan Khokon	Politician	Tioshree
5	Sirajul Islam	Elite person	Tioshree
6	Asma Begum	UP- Member	Tioshree
7	Babul Das	In charge of UP information centre	Tioshree
8	Subrata Hasan Turjo	Business man	Tioshree
9	Ajmol Hasain	Panel chairman	Tioshree
10	Monjurul Haque	Teacher	Tioshree
11	Golap Chowduary	UP- Member	Tioshree
12	Abu Touhid bhoian	Elite person	Tioshree

FGD Participants (People’s Organization)

Date: 23rd April 2014

Sl	Name	Designation	Village/ PO	Name of Union
1	Md. Abul Hossain	Chairman	Balali	Tioshree
2	Ajuda Akter	Member	Lasar kanda	Fatepur
3	Hafeja Akter	Vice-Chairman	Balali	Tioshree
4	Sahana Akter	Chairman	Bagmara	Tioshree
5	Farida Akter	Member	Dhobawala	Tioshree
6	Sufia Akter	Secretary	Dhobawala	Tioshree
7	Punju mia	Member	Lasar kanda	Fatepur
8	Hadis Mia	Vice-Chairman	Bagmara	Tioshree
9	Kanchan Rani	Cashier	Fatepur	Fatepur
10	Nadira Akter	Cashier	Rudrashree	Fatepur
11	Islam Uddin	Chairman	Rudrashree	Fatepur
12	Jabed Iqbal	Chairman	Dhobawala	Tioshree

FGD Participants (Community Facilitator (CF))**Date: 23rd April 2014**

SI	Name	Designation	Village/ PO	Name of Union
1	Ramin Akter	Community Facilitator	Balali	Tioshree
2	Salma	Community facilitator	Balali	Tioshree
3	Hosna Akter	Community facilitator	Bontioshree	Fatepur
4	Josna Akter	Community facilitator	Bontioshree	Fatepur
5	Jinuk Akter	Community facilitator	Baghmara	Tioshree
6	Amena Begum	Community facilitator	Deosohila	Fatepur

FGD Participants (Community Service provider (CSP))**Date: 23rd April 2014**

SI	Name	Designation	Village	Union
1	Seuli Talukder	Agriculture Volunteer	Dhobawala	Tioshree
2	Riva Akter	Disaster Volunteer	Balali	Tioshree
3	Md. Jakaria	Agriculture Volunteer	Balali	Tioshree
4	Hafsa Akter	Health Volunteer	Dhobawala	Tioshree
5	Jahanara	Agriculture Volunteer	Baghmara	Tioshree
6	Hopen Khan	Live stock Volunteer	Lasar kanda	Fatepur
7	Rownok Jahan	Disaster Volunteer	Deosohila	Fatepur
8	Sammi Chowduary	Animator	Deosohila	Fatepur
9	Maksuda begum	Health Volunteer	Balali	Tioshree
10	Md. Samad	Disaster Volunteer	Rudrashree	Fatepur
11	Rojina Akter	Community facilitator	Rudrashree	Fatepur
12	Najma Begum	Community facilitator	Krisno pore	Tioshree
13	Jakia Begum	Community facilitator	Rudrashree	Fatepur
14	Hasna Begum	Health Volunteer	Bontioshree	Fatepur

SWOT Analysis Participants (NAP Staff)**Date: 23rd April 2014**

SI	Name of staff	Designation	Union
1	ATM Abdur Rouf	Field Mentor (FM) - NAP	Tioshree
2	Saiful Islam	Field Mentor (FM) - NAP	Fatepur
3	Sagor Kumar Debnath	Field Mentor (FM) - NAP	Fatepur
4	M.A Mannan	Field Mentor (FM) - NAP	Fatepur
5	Nargis Ara	School Supervisor – NAP	Tioshree
6	Moniruzzaman	Songlap Supervisor - NAP	Tioshree

7	Topy Ara	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP	Fatepore
8	Anisur Rahman	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP	Tioshree
9	Najibur Rahman	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP	Tioshree
10	Luthfounnehar	Project Officer (PO) (H&E) – NAP	Madan
11	Bimal Chandro Das	Project Officer (PO) (IGA & DRR) – NAP	Madan
12	Harunur Rasid Hira	Project Officer (PO) (M&E) - NAP	Madan

Annexure – III, FGD participants, CODEC
Community Development Center (CODEC)
Mirzagonj upazila, Patuakhali
Natun Alo Project (NAP)

Meeting with Government Line Agency Staff

Date: 30th April 2014

SL #	Name	Designation
1	Dr. Rabindranath Hawlader	Upazila Livestock Officer (ULO)
2	Md. Riaz Uddin	Upazila Agriculture Extension Officer (UAEO)
3	Khokon Mitra	Consultant
4	Nurul Hoque Bhuiyan	Program Coordinator (PC), NAP
5	Ajit Kumar Chakraborty	Program Officer (PO) IGA & DRR-NAP
6	Masum Billah	Field Mentor (FM)-NAP
7	Abdul Latif	Field Mentor (FM)-NAP
8	Motiur Rahman	Field Mentor (FM)-NAP
9	Shahidul Islam	Field Mentor (FM)-NAP
10	Jebon Kumar Mondol	Field Mentor (FM)-NAP
11	Kamruzzaman	Program officer (PO)-H&E-NAP

FGD with Civil Society Members

Date: 29th April – 2014

SL #	Name	Designation
1	Didarul Alam Chowdhury	Director Finance - CODEC
2	Khokon Mitra	Consultant
3	Nurul Hoque Bhuiyan	Program Coordinator – NAP
4	Yusuf Ali Mridha	Ex-Thana Education officer (TEO)
5	Abdul Karim	Union Disaster Management Committee Members (UDMC) /

		Union Parishad (UP) Member
6	Habibur Rahman	Union Disaster Management Committee Members (UDMC) / Union Parishad (UP) Member
7	Shefali Akter	Union Disaster Management Committee Members (UDMC)
8	Semala Begum	UDMC Member
9	Hosneara	UDMC Member
10	Jalilur Rahman	UDMC Member
11	Salim Sikder	Teacher
12	Shameem Reza	Political Leader
13	Salim Khan	UDMC Member
14	Biren Chandra Shill	Head teacher
15	Nazmul Hoque Sikder	Principal
16	Ruhul Amin	UDMC Member

FGD with Ward Committee (WC)

Date: 30th April 2014

SL #	Name	Designation	Ward No.	Union
1	Amena	Member	4	Mirzagonj
2	Shahanaz	Cashier	5	Mirzagonj
3	Lucky	Secretary	9	D. Subidkhali
4	Rina	Member	3	D. Subidkhali
5	Jalil Sikder	President	7	Mirzagonj
6	Majed	Member	2	Mirzagonj
7	Maksuda	President	8	Mirzagonj
8	Ashrab Molla	President	9	Mirzagonj
9	Anser	Member	8	D. Subidkhali
10	Amena	Cashier	3	Mirzagonj
11	Rokeya	President	2	D. Subidkhali
12	Monju	President	1	D. Subidkhali
13	Ayesha	President	6	Mirzagonj
14	Nelufa	President	4	D. Subidkhali
15	Salma Begum	Secretary	7	D. Subidkhali
16	Rahima	Secretary	1	Mirzagonj
17	Rashid	President	3	Mirzagonj
18	Salim	Secretary	6	D. Subidkhali
19	Razzaq	Member	5	D. Subidkhali

Meeting with ECD & School Management Committee Members

Venue: Gotoker Andua Community School, Mirzagonj Date: 29th April- 2014

SL #	Name	Designation
1	Khokon Mitra	Consultant

2	Alhaj Moslem Hawlader	President
3	Nurul Hoque Bhuiyan	PC CNAP
4	Habibur Rahman	Head teacher
5	Arati Rani	Member
6	Latif Hawlader	Member
7	Nasima	Member
8	Shahida	Member
9	Dolly	Member
10	Sabina Yasmin	Member
11	Nasrin Sultana	Teacher
12	Mojobur Rahman	Member
13	Fatima	Teacher

FGD with Community Service Providers (CSP)

Date: 30th April 2014

SL #	Name	Designation
1	Marzia Mitu	CSP (Live stock)
2	Beauty	CSP (Live stock)
3	Ronjunnaher	Community Health Volunteer (CHV)
4	Razia Sultana	Community Health Volunteer (CHV)
5	Salma Begum	Community Disaster Volunteer (CDV)
6	Deloara Dulu	Community Disaster Volunteer (CDV)
7	Ripon Das	CSP (Agriculture)
8	Jahirul Islam	CSP (Fisheries)
9	Dolly Begum	CSP (Fisheries)
10	Nurnahar	CSP (Agriculture)
11	Sadia Afrin	CSP (Agriculture)

SWOT Analysis among staff

Date: 01st May

2014

SL #	Name of Staff	Designation
1	Khokon Mitra	Consultant

2	Sonjit Leo Gomej	Senior Coordinator - SF
3	Didarul Alam Chowdhury	Director Finance - CODEC
4	Nurul Hoque Bhuiyan	Program Coordinator – NAP
5	Ajit Kumar Chakraborti	Program Officer (PO) - IGA & DRR - NAP
6	Jahidul Islam	Field Mentor (FM) - NAP
7	Hasi Rani	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP
8	Maksuda Akter	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP
9	Masum Billah	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP
10	Abdul Latif	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP
11	Motiur Rahman	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP
12	Shahidul Islam	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP
13	Jebon Kumar Mondol	Field Mentor (FM) – NAP
14	Nasima Sultana	Supervisor (Education) – NAP
15	Kamruzzaman	Project Officer (PO)- H&E - NAP

FGD with Community Facilitator (CF)

Date: 30th April 2014

SL #	Name	Designation
1	Nupur	Community Facilitator (CF)
2	Afsana	Community Facilitator (CF)
3	Parvin	Community Facilitator (CF)
4	Jhumur	Community Facilitator (CF)
5	Dipika Rani	Community Facilitator (CF)
6	Rehena	Community Facilitator (CF)
7	Neeru	Community Facilitator (CF)
8	Laily	Community Facilitator (CF)
9	Hosneara	Community Facilitator (CF)
10	Shilpi	Community Facilitator (CF)