

POLICY

RESEARCH INSTITUTE

FINAL REPORT

Programme evaluation – Education and training on
the rights of indigenous youth in Bolivia

Authors:

Ananda S. Millard, PhD, Team Leader

Gonzalo Gutiérrez, MA, Evaluator

Ivan Lima, LLM, Evaluator

Vania Martinez, Quality Control

This document is based on information collected during the evaluation process. The information reflects the ideas and perspectives of the evaluators and not necessarily those of the client, SAIH.

Index

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
Glossary	6
Chapter 1: Introduction	7
1.1 Context	7
1.2 Programme under evaluation	8
1.3 Methodology and focus.....	10
1.4 How to use this document.....	11
Chapter 2: SAIH	12
Chapter 3: Integral Training Centre of the Aymara Women – Centro de Desarrollo Integral de la Mujer Aymara- CDIMA	13
3.1 Introduction	13
3.2 Projects under evaluation.....	13
3.3. Findings relative to CDIMA’s work.....	14
3.4 Conclusions on CDIMA projects	15
3.5 Lessons learned and recommendations.....	16
Chapter 4: Senior-Level Training Centre on Intercultural Bilingual Education Escoma – Centro de Formación Superior en Educación Intercultural y Bilingüe Escoma- CEFOS EIB Escoma	18
4.1 Introduction	18
4.2 Project under evaluation	18
4.3. Findings relative to CEFOS EIB Escoma’s work.....	18
4.4 Conclusions on CEFOS EIB Escoma projects	19
4.5 Lessons learned	20
Chapter 5: Centre for Studies and Support for Local Development – Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local- CEADL	21
5.1 Introduction	21
5.2 Projects under evaluation.....	21
5.3. Findings relative to CEADL’s work	22
5.4 Conclusions on CEADL projects	24
5.5 Lessons learned and recommendations.....	24
Chapter 6: National Federation of Salaried Domestic Workers of Bolivia – Federación Nacional de Trabajadoras Asalariadas del Hogar de Bolivia- FENATRAHOB	26
6.1 Introduction	26
6.2 Projects under evaluation.....	27
6.3. Findings relative to FENATRAHOB’s work	27
6.4 Conclusions on FENATRAHOB projects	30
6.5 Lessons learned and recommendations.....	30

Chapter 7: Fe y Alegría	32
7.1 Introduction	32
7.2 Projects under evaluation.....	32
7.3. Findings relative to Fe y Alegría’s work.....	32
7.4 Conclusions on Fe y Alegría’s projects	34
7.5 Lessons learned and recommendations.....	34
Chapter 8: Foundation for Education in the Contexts of Multilingualism and Multiculturalism – Fundación para la Educación en Contextos de Multilingüismo y Pluriculturalidad - FUNPROEIB Andes	35
8.1 Introduction	35
8.2 Projects under evaluation.....	35
8.3. Findings relative to FUNPROEIB Andes’ work.....	36
8.4 Conclusions on FUNPROEIB Andes projects	38
8.5 Lessons learned and recommendations.....	38
Chapter 9: Institute of Therapy and Research on Effects of Torture and State Violence – Instituto de Terapia e Investigación sobre las Secuelas de la Tortura y la Violencia Estatal- ITEI	40
9.1 Introduction	40
9.2 Projects under evaluation.....	40
9.3. Findings relative to ITEI’s work.....	41
9.4 Conclusions on ITEI projects	42
Chapter 10: General conclusions and recommendations	43
10.1 Introduction	43
10.2 Future working opportunities for SAIH	43
10.3 General conclusions and recommendations	45
Annex 1: ToR (original)	47
Annex 2: Original methodological and data collection tools	54
Annex 3: List of Interviewees	55
Annex 4-11	65

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This document presents the findings of the evaluation of the SAIH programme **‘Education and training on the rights of indigenous youth in Bolivia’** from 2009 until the present. The evaluation also includes findings for 2009-2012 period for some efforts conducted by CEFOS EIB Escoma and FUNPROEIB Andes. The evaluation has a summative as well as a formative objective and includes the following organizations.

Institution

Integral Training Centre of the Aymara Women – Centro de Desarrollo Integral de la Mujer Aymara – Amuyt’a (CDIMA)

Senior-Level Training Centre on Intercultural Bilingual Education Escoma – Centro de Formación Superior en Educación Intercultural Bilingüe Escoma (CEFOS EIB Escoma)

Centre for Studies and Support for Local Development – Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local (CEADL)

National Federation of Salaried Domestic Workers of Bolivia – Federación Nacional de las Trabajadoras Asalariadas del Hogar de Bolivia (FENATRAHOB)

Fe y Alegría Bolivia

Foundation for Education in the Contexts of Multilingualism and Multiculturalism – Fundación para la Educación en Contextos de Multilingüismo y Pluriculturalidad (FUNPROEIB Andes)

Institute of Therapy and Research on Effects of Torture and State Violence – Instituto de Terapia e Investigación sobre Secuelas de la Tortura y la Violencia Estatal (ITEI)

The evaluation was conducted between March and August 2016 by four independent consultants. A participatory and inclusive methodology was used throughout the evaluation process. This report includes all relevant comments and responses to concerns raised by all evaluated parties and SAIH.

The document includes analysis and recommendations for each institution in separate sections and also general observations and recommendations for SAIH. These include:

- The organizations funded meet the strategic objectives of SAIH, principally as concerns work with indigenous populations.
- Sustainability is generally good, with the exception of CEFOS EIB Escoma and ITEI. Neither organization will be funded by SAIH in the future.
- All organizations met almost all or all their contractual obligations and have a positive impact in their areas of work.
- All organizations that will continue being funded by SAIH work in areas that no other organization works in. The only exception is CEADL. Therefore, it is recommended that CEADL spend more time framing their work more carefully.
- The majority of recommendations made in previous evaluations have been met
- Impact maximising and coverage are two areas that require attention
- There are many opportunities for synergies between the different organizations. This could enable organizations to improve their work, expand their coverage and have a greater impact.

Glossary

CDIMA	Integral Training Centre of the Aymara Women – Centro de Desarrollo Integral de la Mujer Aymara – Amuyt’a
CEADL	Centre for Studies and Support for Local Development – Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local
CEFOS EIB Escoma	Senior-Level Training Centre on Intercultural Bilingual Education Escoma – Centro de Formación Superior en Educación Intercultural Bilingüe Escoma
CUB	Bolivian University Confederation, which is part of the Executive Committee of the Bolivian University (CEUB)
CEUB	Confederación Universitaria Boliviana, la cual es parte del Comité Ejecutivo de la Universidad Boliviana
FENATRAHOB	National Federation of Salaried Domestic Workers of Bolivia – Federación Nacional de las Trabajadoras Asalariadas del Hogar de Bolivia
FUNPROEIB Andes	Foundation for Education in the Contexts of Multilingualism and Multiculturalism – Fundación para la Educación en Contextos de Multilingüismo y Pluriculturalidad
ITEI	Institute of Therapy and Research on Effects of Torture and State Violence – Instituto de Terapia e Investigación sobre Secuelas de la Tortura y la Violencia Estatal
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
SIN	National Tax Service – Servicio de Impuestos Nacionales
TAH	Domestic workers- Trabajadoras del Hogar

Chapter 1: Introduction

This document presents the findings of the evaluation of the SAIH programme ‘Education and training on the rights of indigenous youth in Bolivia’. The evaluation has a summative as well as a formative objective. The summative component of the evaluation explores the work conducted by the seven funded organisations and the training that these organisations have carried out. The formative components correspond directly to the five organisations that will continue to receive funding. The organisations that are part of this evaluation include:

Institution	Summative	Formative
Integral Training Centre of the Aymara Women – Centro de Desarrollo Integral de la Mujer Aymara – Amuyt’a (CDIMA)	x	X
Senior-Level Training Centre on Intercultural Bilingual Education Escoma – Centro de Formación Superior en Educación Intercultural Bilingüe Escoma (CEFOS EIB Escoma)	x	Financing ended in 2016
Centre for Studies and Support for Local Development – Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local (CEADL)	x	X
National Federation of Salaried Domestic Workers of Bolivia – Federación Nacional de las Trabajadoras Asalariadas del Hogar de Bolivia (FENATRAHOB)	x	X
Fe y Alegría Bolivia	x	X
Foundation for Education in the Contexts of Multilingualism and Multiculturalism – Fundación para la Educación en Contextos de Multilingüismo y Pluriculturalidad (FUNPROEIB Andes)	x	X
Institute of Therapy and Research on Effects of Torture and State Violence – Instituto de Terapia e Investigación sobre Secuelas de la Tortura y la Violencia Estatal (ITEI)	x	Financing ended

1.1 Context

In February 2009, the Constitution of the Plurinational State of Bolivia came into effect. This document includes a wide range of principles and rights that aim to benefit vulnerable groups. President Evo Morales Ayma y his party have made their intention of staying in government until 2025 known, this is an important date because the country will celebrate 200 years of Independence. To achieve this objective a “National Development Plan” was introduced in 2008. This plan was translated into law No. 786 on March 10th 2016. Article 4º of this law denotes that: ‘funding coming from international donors will be used in a manner that is aligned with the National

Plan'.¹

Moreover, the government has approved Law No. 351, which requires that all associations, foundations, and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) working on issues related to social development undergo a verification and approval procedure. Article 13 of this law further requires NGOs and foundations to meet some basic standards when receiving external funding. This process serves to record the funds allocated to local NGOs, which in turn requires reporting on the use of funds, i.e., essentially forcing a two-track control system for funds.

Bolivian associations question the aforementioned procedures, as they infringe on the right of association given the practical limits that the Ministry of Autonomy imposes on organisations during the registration and approval process. Given that very few civil society organisations have thus far been able to successfully complete the registration process, the former ombudsman submitted a constitutional motion to examine the process. Overall, this situation makes organisations vulnerable; indeed the Morales presidency has already expelled certain donors, including USAID and IBIS of Denmark. Both entities worked on projects similar to those funded by SAIH. Under the current government's logic, civil society entities must adhere to the National Development Plan and cannot engage in projects or activities that may serve to question, criticise, or in any way contravene the plan.

The situation faced by civil society is critical because most entities work with staff on a 'fixed-term' basis that is tied to projects, with salaries being project-dependent. This presents some challenges because the current labour law does not allow this type of contract for time periods exceeding three months. Overall this means that securing skilled staff for the time required becomes problematic.

One final important issue is tax legislation – the National Tax Service (SIN) is not granting tax exemption, for utilities, to organization even in these has enjoyed such exemptions in the past. Tax rules substantially affect project design because civil society organisations do not have the capacity to design processes akin to the private sector. Currently, filing tax forms is a 'formality' for these organisations and does not reflect the actual management of organisations. Overall this generates a limited degree of transparency since all transactions are made to lead to a zero balance in order to reduce tax burdens.

1.2 Programme under evaluation

As mentioned previously, SAIH funded seven organisations in Bolivia. All of the organisations work on issues related to training on the rights of indigenous youth in Bolivia. The funded efforts are not part of a collective collaboration among organisations. On the contrary, all projects and activities in the programme sought to contribute toward SAIH's common goal, but not toward a shared goal among the funded organisations. Therefore, for this evaluation, each project is examined and analysed independently.

The evaluation focuses on the period between 2013 and present, but in two cases (CEFOS EIB Escoma and FUNPROEIB Andes) efforts made in the previous period (2009-2012) that did not benefit

¹ Visit page http://www.planificacion.gob.bo/uploads/PDES_INGLES.pdf. Ver. Página 88.

from the preliminary assessment have been included here.

While the funded activities follow a common theme in terms of both topic and audience, each effort is an independent one. To this end, the analysis has explored which efforts have been most useful for what and when. In addition, although each effort is independent, possible synergies have been explored.

This assessment has three overall objectives:

- a) Observe the achievements of the programme: See if they have created the expected results, and if the programme meets the requirements of SAIH's strategy of solidarity.
- b) Learn from the work done: See if the working models used are relevant, which working models are best when, and which should continue to be used in the future.
- c) Decide the way forward: See the type of actions/activities for a new programme period from 2018. Explore opportunities for synergy among Bolivia, Nicaragua, and Colombia.

Overall, the assessment can be described as a task that is both summative and formative, whose more specific objectives include:

- a) Interpret, analyse, and evaluate the progress of the 'Education and information on the rights of indigenous youth in Bolivia'.
- b) Assess the relevance of the projects that are part of the programme in relation to obtaining the expected results in the current Bolivian context.
- c) Learn which working models function well to improve the work in the future.
- d) Assess the sustainability of the programme.
- e) Suggest how to develop the programme in the future (focus, counterparts, working models).

In terms of scope, the evaluation focused on the programme in Bolivia, but also explored opportunities for synergies with Colombia and Nicaragua, where SAIH currently has programmes.

The key questions this assessment attempted to answer are:

- Are the projects on track to achieve the objectives of the programme?
- Has the programme had an impact on education policy and other relevant policies in Bolivia?
- What is the impact of educational processes on the transformation of participants in relation to their practices?
- What is the impact of educational processes on the advocacy capacity of participants in the fields in which they operate?
- What multiplier effects were achieved from participation in organised training programmes and the publication of research?
- Are the effects and impacts attained sustainable?

- How are cross-cutting themes such as gender and the environment addressed by the projects?
- Is youth participation included at different stages of the process?
- How is the quality of cooperation? What is the added value for partners in being participating agencies in the SAIH programme?
- Does the programme have an added value for SAIH? How can the work and experiences in Bolivia best be used in the work of SAIH in Norway?
- Can there be an added value in supporting collaborations among Bolivia, Colombia, and Nicaragua (countries in Latin America where SAIH works)?
- There have been many changes in Bolivia over the past ten years; given these changes, is the programme relevant in the current Bolivian context?
- Are the partner organisations relevant in the current Bolivian context?
- How relevant to target groups is the work done?
- Does the programme address SAIH's solidarity strategy?
- What works or does not work well in the programme?
- What can be improved in the short-term programme?
- For the new strategic and programmatic period starting in 2018, what should be changed/modified?

1.3 Methodology and focus

A number of complementary methodological approaches were chosen that aligned with the purpose of the evaluation and the spirit of the work of SAIH/the programme under evaluation.

First, the assessment was anchored in the utilisation-focused evaluation approach. To this end, the evaluation process was designed to maximise the use of evaluation results. To meet this requirement, the evaluation process included an open and on-going dialogue with the organisations under evaluation.

The results-based management framework informed the evaluation's analysis. Using this approach allowed us to evaluate the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and impact of the activities conducted, which in turn covered the majority of the questions outlined in the terms of reference. However, the presentation of findings has not followed the results-based management framework in an effort to ensure that the information was accessible to the reader/user.

The tools used for the data collection in this evaluation included:

Review of documentation: All relevant materials, both from SAIH headquarters and documentation for corresponding projects in the country (all partners), which includes all relevant project materials as well as external materials, including previous evaluations. In addition, we also reviewed materials from other countries.

Key informant interviews: Interviews with staff were held at SAIH headquarters, partner

organisations, and relevant parties in Norway and Bolivia. A limited number of interviews took place with SAIH counterparts in Nicaragua and Colombia in order to address issues relating to opportunities for collaboration and synergies.

Interviews with experts: A limited number of interviews were performed with experts in Bolivia who could comment on the work funded by SAIH and how this work fit into the overall context of the institution.

Focus groups and group interviews: These were conducted with members of the target groups.

The number of beneficiaries interviewed was limited and hence is not statistically representative of beneficiaries as a whole. However, the experience of the beneficiaries interviewed is believed to provide a good indication of the overall experience.

1.4 How to use this document

This document presents an overview of the SAIH programme in Bolivia and then moves to a presentation on each institution that received funding. The report provides findings, and recommendations are given at the end of the document. It is worth noting that there are several common issues – for example, the type of organisations that fit into SAIH’s strategic plan. Therefore it is recommended that although each chapter can be read independently, the sections with overarching information should also subsequently be read. It is noteworthy that the presentation of the material was guided by the discussion with end users. While the concepts of results-based management were used to analyse results, including relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact, the narrative of this report has taken a more straightforward approach to responding to the questions.

This document has 10 sections: first an introduction, followed by an overview of SAIH, then seven chapters (one for each institution), and finally general conclusions and recommendations. It is recommended that at least chapters 1, 2, and 10 are read accompanying each institutional chapter.

Chapter 2: SAIH

Overall, there are some issues that are important to address and that concern all organisations included in the evaluation. First, organisations are evaluated in connection to their individual role within the Bolivian context. Importantly, all organisations that continue to be funded by SAIH (i.e., not CEFOS EIB Escoma or ITEI) except for CEADL work on issues and areas that are not addressed by any other actor in the Bolivian context. CDIMA, Fe y Alegría, FUNPROEIB Andes, and FENATRAHOB play an essential role in the Bolivian reality. For its part, CEADL works on important issues, but it should be noted that there are other local institutions working on very similar topics; this refers to both the work of the observatory, as well as the training activities. In addition, it is worth noting that Bolivian organisations play an important and necessary role in the current development of the country, because although many things have improved, the efforts of different organisations remain relevant.

SAIH's Bolivia counterparts are a variety of NGOs that provide services and support focused mainly on indigenous youth and women. Importantly, SAIH has experience supporting organisations such as those in Bolivia (non-university institutions), in addition to its experience working with higher education institutions (teachers and/or students). Efforts to support the exchange of experiences between higher education institutions and NGOs that focus on target groups that are not part of the 'classic participants' in higher education (university students and teachers), as is the case in Bolivia, can be more complex. At the same time, interviews with institutions in Nicaragua and Colombia showed willingness to explore possibilities for collaboration. It also noted that the modalities of work with youth outside of university students, particularly working with indigenous populations – as is the experience in Bolivia – can serve as an example for how to reach population groups that are not part of the student body and support them to create impact through alternative activities. Clearly a review of institutions working with SAIH shows an experience base that can serve as an example for efforts elsewhere.

The work in Bolivia meets SAIS's general requirements, i.e., it falls within SAIH's strategy parameters by focusing on indigenous population as a key group promoting the concept of 'youth as agents of liberation'. From this point of view, we can say that the programme in Bolivia meets the minimum requirements set by *The Solidarity Strategy 2012-2017 de SAIH*.

Regarding interactions between SAIH and local institutions: In all cases, the relationship is cordial and pursues mutual respect. Generally SAIH has worked as an external donor and has not had an intense involvement with each institution. In some cases SAIH has been able to facilitate participation in meetings at the regional or global level, or has facilitated the participation of people from the partner institutions in relevant meetings in Oslo, for example. Mainly, SAIH's added value is linked to its financing agreement.

Chapter 3: Integral Training Centre of the Aymara Women – Centro de Desarrollo Integral de la Mujer Aymara- CDIMA

3.1 Introduction

CDIMA was founded on September 5, 1989. It is a non-profit organisation of Aymara women. The aim of the institution is promoting the empowerment of Aymara women to exercise their rights, reaffirming their cultural identity, and generating proposals for social, political, and economic structural transformation of the country. CDIMA pursues these efforts through the active participation of Aymara youth in support of their public empowerment at the local, municipal, and departmental levels. Its main objectives are:

- Systematically improve the understanding of, and value given to, the thinking of Aymara women and achieve greater participation of women in political, social, and cultural public life.
- Strengthen Aymara women's organisations, as well as those of other indigenous groups, through a strategic plan to train them on their political, economic, social, and cultural rights.
- Disseminate its own understanding of Aymara women through the media and supporting coordination among organisations with an active participation of women and men.
- Value and strengthen the practical sociocultural, spiritual, ideological, philosophical, political, and economic life of nations and indigenous peoples; fight for the respect and full exercise of the fundamental rights of individuals recognizing their duality (woman-man) CHACHA- WARMÍ.

3.2 Projects under evaluation

The working relationship between CDIMA and SAIH began in 1993, with more recent projects launched from 2009 to 2012 through the implementation of the project 'Aymara women in the new millennium'. The project's aim was to promote the participation of Aymara women in positions of power and decision-making, communal and supra communal level, by introducing proposals for social transformation and political, economic, and cultural development. This was to be achieved through the strengthening of women's knowledge of how to exercise their individual and collective rights under the universal principles of duality, reciprocity, and complementarity.

This evaluation focuses on two projects financed by SAIH. The first project, entitled 'Training of young and indigenous women in social leadership' was divided into two phases. The first covered the period from 2013 to 2015, and the second started in 2016 and runs until the end of 2017. The objective of this project is to contribute to the social development and intercultural participation of youth and indigenous women as 'agents of change'. The efforts target policy decisions at the community and municipal levels through a 'liberating education', strengthening beneficiaries' knowledge to enable them to exercise their rights under the principles of gender equality; duality, reciprocity, and complementarity; and ecological harmony with nature. The budget approved by SAIH for the implementation of this project in the first stage (2013-2015) was US\$466,879 and was intended primarily to cover staff costs (operational and administrative), educational and training activities, and some dissemination and communication expenses.

The second project, entitled 'Young actors in mitigating climate change risks in Wilaqala', was short-lived (July to December 2014, with total funding of US\$5,000) and aimed to contribute to social development and environmental care support to the residents of Marka Wilaqala. The project focused on developing educational activities on environmental pollution and their consequences for the population of this region. The main achievement of this project was the signing of an interagency agreement and an agreement with the students, parents, principal, and teachers of San Luis de Wilaqala College and the neighbourhood governing the recycling of PET bottles within the area. The funds provided to this project were limited.

3.3. Findings relative to CDIMA's work

First, it is important to stress that CDIMA's work fills a gap within the framework of NGOs in Bolivia. Comparing the activities planned and conducted (see annex 4) highlights that CDIMA has not only fulfilled its targets for activities, but in some cases exceeded them. However, it is worth noting that in discussions with CDIMA, their focus was aimed largely at compliance with the number of activities rather than the effect/impact of the activities undertaken. This limits the perceived impact of work conducted by CDIMA. Discussions with beneficiaries, on the other hand, clearly highlighted the level of impact of the work carried out by the organisation. This dynamic between how the organisation's staff presents its work and how beneficiaries demonstrate the effects/impact, clearly reflecting everything that the organisation has managed, is notable. CDIMA could benefit from an internal effort to improve their perception and presentation of achievements.

Regarding cross-cutting issues and youth, CDIMA focuses its efforts on supporting indigenous women. Hence, for them, gender is not a transversal matter, but a central point of their work. In this context it is important to note that CDIMA seems to play an important role on gender equity issues within the Bolivian context, particularly the Indian community. The projects aim to create a women's empowerment process in which women can develop their leadership skills. Examples from interviews show that there are several cases of women who have, based on their work with CDIMA, been able to develop their individual capacities and even hold leadership positions and government posts.

In addition, the project has a clear focus on youth training. Here the focus is not only on women, but young men as well as young women. In this context, the project aims to create spaces that challenge the traditional gender roles found within Bolivian indigenous society. Interviews with young respondents demonstrated the ability that participants have to operate openly, and in some cases, include their ethnicity through traditional dress. These gestures can serve to demonstrate pride and respect for their indigenous heritage.

CDIMA represents a social group in Bolivia that lacks a strong and established position. However, its work empowering women and highlighting the importance of not only being proud of, but also learning and highlighting, indigenous heritage is very important in the Bolivian context. Indeed, a key element in social change is the role played by indigenous groups. Thus one cannot say that the work of CDIMA is divorced from SAIH's goals; on the contrary, SAIH has been flexible to respond to local needs.

From the point of view of project efficiency and effectiveness, it is important to note that CDIMA not

only met, but in many cases surpassed, the planned work objectives. Most of the activities have been completed. In terms of impact, it should be emphasised that as part of the evaluation, staff and beneficiaries were interviewed. The educational project clearly showed that the beneficiaries interviewed today have a greater ability to function and participate more actively in local political processes. For women, there are good examples of leaders who emerged from the CDIMA training process. Similarly, young people who participated in the training demonstrate greater development, and there are even several examples of organisations created as a result of the work of these young people.

For the project on risk mitigation for climate change, attitudinal change is less pronounced. It is apparent that although the work had substantial local support at the beginning, this support depended on key people from the local government. When these people were transferred, so did the support for the project. CDIMA clearly said it has been a good lesson for them as an organisation to see that these changes can have substantial impact on the effort – hence, a broader level of support and interest are important to securing sustainability. This experience reveals that changes at the individual level are easier to make than changes at the collective level.

The multiplier effect is difficult to quantify. We know based on information provided by CDIMA and based on interviews conducted that many of the women beneficiaries began to work in leadership positions, as previously mentioned, which in turn serves as an example for other indigenous women. Youth, also coordinated as part of new groups, have organised themselves around a variety of goals and visions, but these are consistently complementary to those of CDIMA. These efforts serve as multipliers. Generally CDIMA has a multiplier potential through its training efforts.

CDIMA projects show different experiences on sustainability. On one hand, work with women and youth leadership demonstrates high levels of sustainability, as the trained individuals seem to expand their levels of collective participation. But the environmental project 'Young actors in mitigating climate change risk in Wilaqala, July-December 2014' experienced more difficulties. The project shows that changing thinking on issues such as climate change, in this case on waste management, necessitates a level of support and consistency that transcends the time and capacity provided for this project. Basically, the project worked for a short time, but the moment the local leadership changed into new people that lacked the same commitment to the effort, the gains made were halted. The impact of the projects is clear, particularly the project 'Training young Indian woman in social leadership (2013-2015; 2016-2017)'. As mentioned previously, this project clearly demonstrates that participants gain the ability to function, lead, and be full-scale representatives of the population. Moreover, in doing so, they are able to integrate their indigenous cultural heritage into their activities.

3.4 Conclusions on CDIMA projects

The principal accomplishments noted in the final report submitted by CDIMA for the period 2013-2015 include: conducting six social leadership training efforts, which included the participation of representatives from 14 provinces of the department of La Paz and two provinces from the department of Oruro; developing a baseline on the level of training amongst young beneficiaries; and developing three teaching plans and the corresponding educational curricula for nine modules on leadership. In quantitative terms, the work enabled the training of 224 young indigenous leaders

and provided trainees with certified academic hours valid at the Salesiana University of Bolivia.

The approach used by CDIMA to work on the empowerment of women and youth appears to function well and generate good results in the Bolivian context. Similarly, its training curriculum and support system appears to work well within the context. Overall the project training women leaders appears to have generated notable success. CDIMA has been responsible for training a number of people, including the former president of the Judicial Council, as well as municipal councillors and union leaders. Interviews with the aforementioned show a high degree of commitment to their tasks and the high value they place on the support received through CDIMA training. CDIMA supports beneficiaries through the conceptualisation and development of their own projects until their envisioned efforts have materialised. The same spirit of excellence and support marks the work with youth.

The organisation has managed to generate a process whereby the indigenous identity of both youth and women involved in the projects is valued. The institutional leadership is composed of Aymara women and youth, who not only teach inclusion but live by these principles and hence serve as an example to all participants as well as more broadly. The production of materials, books, magazines, videos, and other audiovisual items further demonstrates the solid commitment to the goals of the institution as felt by the beneficiaries.

CDIMA's work on the environment and climate change does not have the same history, experience, or results as its other initiatives. Although the project started well and developed as planned, achieving sustainable results proved more difficult than expected. The reasons for this are varied, chief among them that the project model requires a high level of collective commitment at the community level. Over time, it proved difficult to retain this level of commitment from local authorities. However, it is noteworthy that the aim of the project was initial implementation and this was achieved, and that from a financial point of view this project was very small. Therefore, the principal gain from this project, keeping in mind the financial investment made, was to explore how such a project could be executed and the lessons that could be learned from the experience.

One of CDIMA's major weaknesses is in its ability to present its successes and results. Indeed, the approach they take to present what they have done can easily lead to the wrong conclusion. We found that a project with this level of success and overall potential should be presented in a manner that better highlights this. Indeed, CDIMA lacks a mechanism to actively disseminate results in a manner that is true to their achievements.

Overall, the project shows solid results. The work focuses on the department of La Paz (the city of El Alto and the corresponding province), which means it is excluded from the controls imposed by the Ministry of Autonomy. Administratively, the organisation is well established and maintains all relevant records.

3.5 Lessons learned and recommendations

Developing training materials takes time and dedication; CDIMA's work on leadership training has been noted. At the same time, CDIMA requires more attention for the development of activities on issues related to the environment. In this field, a shift in how people see the problem is required, and this in turn means there is a need for changes in how authorities see the problem and hence use

their influence in relation to project outcomes.

Developing high-quality training materials is a time-consuming process. Therefore, it could be useful to maximise existing capacities within the programme.

While development work is a key element, presentation is also important – not only in relation to the identification of new funds, but also in relation to work with other institutions (synergies).

Recommendations for CDIMA:

- The project complies with the ideology of SAIH, and the resources invested are used coherently and in line with the scope of the project. It is advisable to continue, and if possible increase, financial support for this institution. This may in turn increase the opportunities for collaboration and synergies, and in turn allow for greater impact.
- Regional growth (in the country) and the ability to replicate the results attained in Bolivia in Nicaragua or Colombia are recommended. The organisation has a lot of material and resources that it can share. Opportunities to share experiences can be very rich, too. From this point of view, opportunities for the exchange of experience, for example with the Regional Indigenous Council of Cauca, could be explored.
- Identify ways to work with others to make greater use of the material already created for leadership training – for example, working with training institutions that require training on empowerment and leadership.
- Re-evaluate its approach to environmental issues to ensure a higher level of sustained local commitment. This may include, for example, a much larger collective commitment, which includes current and future political actors as well as private actors.

Chapter 4: Senior-Level Training Centre on Intercultural Bilingual Education Escoma – Centro de Formación Superior en Educación Intercultural y Bilingüe Escoma- CEFOS EIB Escoma

4.1 Introduction

CEFOS EIB Escoma is an organisation associated with the Salesian order of Bolivia. Originally the institution focused primarily on working with teachers. In 2012, the responsibility for training teachers in Bolivia was transferred to the central government. Due to this shift, the organisation has lost much of its value. This shift in responsibilities within Bolivia explains some of the changes made to the SAIH funded project which are noted below. In SAIH documentation, the commitment by the church group (the Salesians) is questioned, but not the role or commitment of the individuals directly involved in project activities.

As a result of an analysis of institutional added value and opportunities for long-term achievements, SAIH decided to suspend funding to this organisation. This does not mean that the work conducted has no value, but rather that it was not clear how SAIH's funding could lead to a catalytic change or impact.

4.2 Project under evaluation

During the period 2009-2012, SAIH funded the project 'Training-level degree in intercultural and bilingual education' implemented by CEFOS EIB Escoma. The objective of the project was to improve the quality of education in the districts of Mocomoco, Carabuco, and Puerto Acosta through the implementation of intercultural bilingual education methodologies (see annex 5).

4.3. Findings relative to CEFOS EIB Escoma's work

The project expected to train 200 teachers at the undergraduate level; however, only 86 teachers (30 women and 56 men) were trained (see annex 5). This was because during the 2012 project period, the government started training its own teachers at the undergraduate level. Therefore, CEFOS EIB Escoma decided to suspend its programme and focus its work on assisting the ministry in the implementation of the new Education Act.

Another project objective included the provision of leadership training to 150 young indigenous people, with a priority focus on women. As was the case with the other project objective, the target set could not be reached here either. In this case, CEFOS EIB Escoma notes that only 60 indigenous leaders could be supported due to a number of administrative challenges. These included problems with signing cooperation agreements with both the University of San Simón (Cochabamba) and the Universidad Mayor de San Andrés.

Despite the issues faced by the organisation, mainly its reduced relevance, SAIH continued funding CEFOS EIB Escoma. Thus during the 2013-2015 period, the project 'Intercultural training for communities to implement the socio-productive community model' was funded with the aim of improving the quality of education of students of the three school districts through the implementation of the educational law Avelino Sinani and Elizardo Pérez. The approach proposed for this new project by CEFOS EIB Escoma aimed to strengthen the capacity of district directors,

directors of educational units, teachers, students, and parents in relation to the new educational model formulated in the new law.

Moreover, the cooperation agreement for the training of leaders with the Universidad Mayor de San Andrés and later with the Salesian University, achieved better qualitative results. In addition to the aforementioned, other components of the project included strengthening the productive capacities of women in the region, including through sewing and weaving workshops.

Based on the documents reviewed and interviews conducted, it appears apparent that CEFOS EIB Escoma has made significant efforts to adapt its work to the changes outlined in the new education law (enacted in late 2010). However, a number of adjustments that took place during the project period, in the opinion of the evaluation team, highlight technical weaknesses in the formulation of the project. This makes it difficult to compare the results achieved with those planned.

It is important to note that in addition to the aforementioned, the project also faced a number of problems when implementing gender policies in the training process that contravened local customs. CEFOS EIB Escoma emphasises that its efforts focused on creating opportunities for women to perform better financially, but in discussions we found that the work did little to question local gender structures. That is to say, the organisation accepted that the 'reality' was gender inequality and did not speak out against the local position. While we recognise that difficulties were encountered, it is also important to note that such difficulties could be overcome. This is an example of how an organisation within the SAIH programme could have benefitted from communicating with another SAIH-funded organisation to discuss and evaluate their respective experiences with gender issues. This could have provided the parties with new ways of working. In short, the organisation appears to have made no substantial effort to overcome the challenges they faced.

It is worth noting that the cross-cutting issues figure little in the work conducted by the organisation. Youth, one of the organisation's key target groups, were a key beneficiary of the work undertaken.

In the case of CEFOS EIB Escoma, opportunities to interview beneficiaries were very limited, so there is little experience on which to base the evaluation team's findings. Despite this, interviews, discussions with staff, and document review suggest that the project had impact on the individuals supported. It was difficult to establish if there was a multiplier effect and, if so, what this may have been because the project focused primarily on individuals as targets and not on how it could have a broader impact. Linked to this, the sustainability of the work is limited to individuals who received support. That is to say, it is assumed that people who counted on support and training could make use of the capacity they received. From the point of view of the organisation, the level of sustainability is low.

Evidently, this impact was minimised after the aforementioned national law rendered the project a duplication of national efforts. From this point of view, it is important to note that one of the main SAIH strategic guidelines state that work funded by SAIH should not duplicate other work. Therefore, the closing of the joint effort (CEFOS EIB Escoma-SAIH) is evaluated as appropriate.

4.4 Conclusions on CEFOS EIB Escoma projects

In terms of general conclusions, the following is worth noting: First, the evaluation team agrees with

the decision to stop funding of the project. Although the project had an impact on the capacities of direct beneficiaries, it is also true that based on legal and structural changes in Bolivia the work of CEFOS EIB Escoma became a duplication of work carried out by the government. This made distinguishing between the government responsibilities and the responsibilities of CEFOS EIB Escoma difficult.

Moreover, on gender issues, it was evident that CEFOS EIB Escoma did not take a stance to support cultural changes. On the contrary, the organisation supported women without further questioning structural views that allow discrimination. From this point of view, the organisation does not align well with SAIH's institutional position on the issue. However, it is important to note that the funded work did have a positive impact on supporting the government, as well as for the individuals who were direct beneficiaries.

4.5 Lessons learned

Organisations should have a clear vision of the work they want to do and how it can be sustainable in the long term. Another key issue is gender; there is a very thin line between influencing change, not participating, and supporting local customs. From that point of view, it is important that SAIH clearly consider how the issue should be handled by the organisations they fund.

Generally, and particularly in Bolivia, SAIH funds a number of programmes that address this issue, including CDIMA. Hence it may have been appropriate to discuss with these organisations the gender challenges faced by CEFOS EIB Escoma in order to identify a mechanism for how best to respond to the challenges presented by the local culture.

Chapter 5: Centre for Studies and Support for Local Development – Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local- CEADL

5.1 Introduction

CEADL was founded in the city of El Alto in June 1997 and began activities in January 1999. As stated on its website, CEADL was the result of the initiative of a collective of several young people, youth groups, and parties interested in placing at the centre of discussion the issue of human rights and active participation in social movements in both the city of El Alto and nationally.

CEADL is defined as a ‘civil non-profit association’. CEADL was created to defend and promote human rights, particularly those of young people; however, over time, it was clear that the most important task the organisation could fulfil was to promote and support individuals to exercise their citizenship fully. Exercising full citizenship was something that needed concrete support, concrete historical follow-up, and from there the organisation developed into one that promoted human rights, advocacy, the practice of citizenship, and power in several municipalities in Bolivia.

5.2 Projects under evaluation

SAIH and CEADL established a joint working relationship in 2000. In 2009, the two institutions entered into a cooperation agreement for the project ‘Capacity building for advocacy of youth leaders in Bolivia’, which aimed to strengthen the role of adolescents and youth through supporting a participatory, open, and transparent political process.

In 2007,² the ‘Observatory of Natural Resources’ was born. This project was followed by another project in 2010. The effort evolved into the signing of a new agreement in 2010 for a project entitled ‘Education programme for the participation of indigenous youth in Bolivia’. This project sought to promote the participation of civil society in the administration of hydrocarbon in Bolivia, as a means to strengthening democracy. The project ‘Bolivian Observatory of Natural Resources’ allowed for the establishment of an interagency platform from which various institutions working in the areas of control, transparency of oil revenues, and citizen participation were able to share their perspectives. This platform included the following national organisations: Ideas Foundation, Foundation Earth, CEADL, Jubilee Foundation, Transparency Bolivia, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés, and University of San Francisco Xavier.

SAIH funded CEADL as a way to provide continuity to previously funded projects. With this in mind, SAIH and CEADL signed agreements for the following projects: ‘The interconnected Bolivian youth for democracy, human rights, citizen participation, development, and citizen control through information and communication technologies’ (2013- 2015), ‘Bolivian Observatory of Natural Resources’ (2013-2015), and the ‘Young civil society organisations for participation, democracy, and citizen control’ (2016-2017). This latest project brings together the activities and results of the two previous undertakings.

² The initial project was funded by SAIH and Norad.

5.3. Findings relative to CEADL's work

The organisation has a clear and solid commitment to the work it does. CEADL carries out a variety of activities within its area of interest. Organisational management has strengthened over the years. This strength, however, is not a clear added value in terms of results. The organisation has a number of donors who fund both separate and complementary activities, which makes measuring attributable achievements difficult. It is also important to note that there are numerous organisations that carry out similar work in Bolivia; hence it is difficult to attribute achievements to this organisation in particular.

It is clear that the issues on which CEADL works are important within the Bolivian context. It is also clear that the organisation works with groups that can benefit from the support provided to them. As it is shown in annex 7, the links between what they intended to do and what they did cannot be easily determined. Discussions with CEADL staff and its beneficiaries showed that the process of project development was not linear. This is not a criticism of progress, but rather an observation of how the organisation works. Most likely, it is a challenge CEADL dealt with based on the ample and multifaceted needs it faces. In short, from time to time, the projects split and began to expand from the topics they initially set out to cover. It may also be the case that the staff require support in order to be able to express their activities and actions in a linear manner.³

Overall we found that it is difficult to measure the work conducted with social networks, blogs, and other efforts involving the use of technological tools for young people. The impact CEADL has had through its publications and the degree to which it is recognised by experts and authorities in the hydrocarbon sector appear limited. Few people know of CEADL's work.

While the current legal framework does not promote access to information in Bolivia, there are public information data sources and numerous civil society organisations that analyse and question public policies, including the Jubilee Foundation (created by the Catholic Church). This institution conducts investigations in the same areas as CEADL. Within the government there are also efforts being conducted on hydrocarbon, including initiatives led by Manuel Morales Olivera, Jorge Alvarado Rivas, and other former presidents of the of the Yacimientos Petrolíferos Fiscales Bolivianos corporation (public oil company).⁴ None of these actors claimed to know the work of CEADL. The debate on Hydrocarbons is part of the regional agenda, however neither those in charge of the debate nor the municipal or departmental level recognized CEADL as an active member of the discussion.

The information that CEADL provides is already available to the public, thus a key question is: To what degree is CEADL able to make information available to populations that would otherwise not have access to information? Regarding the observatory, discussions with beneficiary organisations

³ CEADL mantiene que la duración de la evaluación perjudicó los hallazgos, pero vale recalcar que CEADL conto con el mismo nivel de atención otorgado a otras instituciones.

⁴ Yacimientos Petrolíferos Fiscales Bolivianos-Corporación (YPFB), es una corporación pública boliviana, es la principal empresa y genera la mayor parte de los recursos del dedicada a la exploración, explotación, refinación, industrialización, distribución y venta del petróleo y sus productos derivados.

showed that beneficiaries are not entirely clear on what is done or why, but they do feel that the support they receive from CEADL is valuable to them. That is, they are unclear on how areas of work are identified or the basis for said identification. CEADL maintains that its target population is youth and women in urban areas who cannot easily access the information made available by the municipal or departmental authorities/bodies; in rural areas, the main target groups are indigenous populations. Also noteworthy is the approach taken by CEADL to disseminate information. Indeed, there may be other approaches that are more efficient for targeting their key beneficiary population.

Regarding leadership training for youth, beneficiaries had a positive view of the work carried out by CEADL. However beneficiaries also noted that in future it might be beneficial to explore other training subjects/skills – for example, training on public management. CEADL maintains that it undergoes an annual participatory planning process. However, the beneficiary group did not mention this process to the evaluation team. On the contrary, it was stressed that CEADL should be more proactive in identifying areas in which beneficiaries need support rather than generating products based on its own areas of competence.

During focus group discussions with beneficiary groups, beneficiaries stressed that CEADL has lots of information in its library, but access to the materials by the general public is minimal. Thus the idea of using social networks as a way to disseminate information could be a positive one. However, such an effort would require a clear strategy that focuses on how these tools can be used to incentivise social change. None of the respondents interviewed could give us any information on the social networking tools used, including addresses, names, or any other information that could enable us to find sites that CEADL is currently using or has helped start.⁵

Cross-cutting issues are addressed in relation to the beneficiaries targeted by each project that is to say, gender issues are included in youth work, and environmental issues are tied to the work by the observatory.

As mentioned previously, from the information provided to the evaluation team, it is hard to establish precisely what activities were or were not carried out by CEADL (see annex 6). That does not mean they have not been active, but it does show the conceptual design and management of projects is not linear and hence it is difficult to see what was done and how individual activities corresponded to specific objectives. In fact some activities, although complementary, do not seem to perfectly align with the project objectives.

Discussions with beneficiaries revealed the observatory's work supported its ability to identify and expand into new areas of work. For example, to participate in discussions about new nuclear plants, CEADL provided beneficiaries with information in the form of pamphlets and brochures that they could then share with their respective beneficiary groups (local communities). The work of the observatory also supported indigenous groups by providing information they may have needed to

⁵ El equipo de evaluación no pudo visitar ningún blog o dirección de red social pues ningún participante de grupo focal o personal del equipo de CEADL pudo dar la información necesaria para poder acceder.

support their own activities/efforts in relation to environmental questions. According to beneficiaries, the scope of work is very wide and there is no clear definition on what should or should not be included in the scope of work, how, or why.

Individuals, who represent beneficiary organisations, note that through them CEADL activities have a multiplier effect. Basically, the information they get from CEADL is in turn used to support their own beneficiaries. However, the degree of change generated by the multiplier effect is not known. This is both because the work conducted by CEADL is difficult to trace and because the beneficiary organisations work is also done by other entities.

CEADL maintains that the success of its work is further evidenced by the fact that youth who have received training from CEADL currently hold government positions at both at the municipal and departmental levels.

Most beneficiaries noted that the training imparted by CEADL, and having the opportunity to be part of the First Summit of Youth, allowed them to play a leading role in drafting local normative documents, such as laws for youth at the municipal and departmental levels.

Among issues that could be improved, beneficiaries noted the need for other topics to be included in the CEADL training packages, such as public management tools, formulation and implementation of projects, and formulation, monitoring, and evaluation of operational plans at both the municipal and departmental levels, to name a few options.⁶

5.4 Conclusions on CEADL projects

The CEADL programme clearly provides a benefit to its beneficiaries, but also faces several challenges. First, it is not the only institution doing this kind of work in the Bolivian context. Therefore, it is difficult to know to what extent CEADL has influenced beneficiaries and to what degree the most influential institutions in their respective fields have made these impacts. Based on a series of interviews with key individuals in the hydrocarbon sector, we know that CEADL is not generally recognised as a key player on environmental issues, particularly oil. It is, however, recognised as an organisation that works on issues of youth and capacity development.

Second, based on the interviews conducted, two issues emerge as relevant. Mainly, while CEADL has added value for its beneficiaries, there is a need to clearly identify the key issues that beneficiaries find important. CEADL should respond to beneficiaries' needs and not base its work on the areas in which it has competence.

Third, CEADL should consider limiting its areas of intervention and further delineate how individual goals will be achieved. The work, for example, on social networks is important, but requires a clear vision of what will be done, for what purpose, and what the overall objectives are.

5.5 Lessons learned and recommendations

The work on the Observatory of Natural Resources generates a limited amount of information

⁶ CEADL nota que su organización ha cambiado en tiempos recientes por causa de disminución de fondos.

through its research and subsequent dissemination. The work conducted by CEADL on this issue does not reach the institutions that are designing public policy. Therefore, it is suggested that CEADL clearly define what it wants to achieve with its work on environmental issues. This means limiting the scope of its work and finding an area in which it can make a clear contribution.

On the subject of youth, it is suggested that CEADL carefully explore beneficiary needs and its ability to capitalise on its previous experience to meet emerging needs b for example, management training. That issue was one of the topics highlighted by the youth interviewed.

While it is recommended that SAIH continue to support CEADL, it is essential that CEADL be much more careful in how it designs its projects and be careful to ensure that there is a direct line between the relevance and impact of the activities it proposes. To this end, CEADL should use a result-based management model. CEADL's exploration into areas of future work should be clearly defined by its capacity and areas of competence (for Bolivia and for other countries). Areas of work could, for example, include training on how to use social networking platforms as tools for mobilisation and information. Any effort, however, should result in clear and tangible outcomes, which goes far beyond how to technically use the tools.

CEADL should also explore opportunities for joint work with other entities that are involved in similar topics in Bolivia. This would increase its ability to be both a strong and an active voice within the Bolivian context.

Finally, CEADL should identify opportunities for collaboration with other organisations that are also part of the SAIH programme. It is difficult to make suggestions at this time because any such effort must be aligned with CEADL's future work, but overall synergies could be an important tool for strengthening the organisation.

Chapter 6: National Federation of Salaried Domestic Workers of Bolivia – Federación Nacional de Trabajadoras Asalariadas del Hogar de Bolivia- FENATRAHOB

6.1 Introduction

The National Federation of Salaried Domestic Workers of Bolivia (FENATRAHOB) is a trade union-based organisation. It was founded on March 27, 1993, in the city of Cochabamba during the First National Congress of Domestic Workers. Its mission is to unionise domestic workers in order to fight for their rights, address collective needs, and resolve issues that pertain to them as employees. Hence the institution focuses primarily on collective, rather than individual, concerns.

FENATRAHOB represents all unions from each department in Bolivia. Its board is elected every two years and gains its legitimacy through the election process. The role of the board is to defend the human and labour rights of its members. The executive committee consists of five union members who are collectively responsible for operational and management responsibilities.

The objective of the support extended to FENATRAHOB is to improve the living and work conditions and wages for salaried domestic workers in Bolivia. In doing so, the organisation defends both the human and labour rights of its members.

In order to strengthen FENATRAHOB by supporting the visibility of its union activities and its influence on public policy, SAIH signed a financing agreement with FENATRAHOB in 2009 for a three-year project entitled 'Capacity building for political participation: institutional consolidation of FEBATRAHOB and its syndicates'.

Although domestic workers have limited education and few middle and long term management skills, a challenge that was recognised by the domestic workers themselves, this project did achieve a number of notable results:

- Activities by the executive committee supported the attainment of a declaration that established March 30 as the 'National Day of Working and Salaried Domestic Worker' under Law 181 of the Plurinational State of Bolivia (issued on Oct. 25, 2011).
- Ratification of the Convention 189 of the International Labour Organisation (November 20, 2012) was achieved after the completion of an intense advocacy campaign at the national level, which involved the invaluable support of the steering committee for the implementation of Law 2450 and Convention 189.
- Establishment of the Information Office of the Salaried Domestic Worker (TAH) (toll-free), which in 2012 responded to around 1,000 inquiries from both affiliated and unaffiliated domestic workers, as well as employers and other individuals. The office provides information, as well as guides and advises callers on the best way to resolve their labour-related issues – for example, guidance on the calculation of compensation in cases of labour disputes. It also opens up the possibility of continuing providing advice either by telephone or in person through participation in union events.
- A legal clinic that provides the professional advice of a full-time lawyer supplements the

work conducted by the hotline. In this way, both efforts contribute greatly to strengthen FENATRAHOB and the individual unions. The legal clinic is based at the headquarters in La Paz and is funded by SAIH and FOS. The goal of this office is to monitor legal labour-related demands. This practice is complementary to the legal advice offered to TAH through all unions.

- The publication of the Journal of Union Training is an important trade union instrument that supports the organisational and educational work of union leaders. These documents are the result of training conducted through the unions.

As a result of achieving good outcomes through its previous agreements, SAIH extended its financial support for an additional three years (2013-2015). The organisation benefits 2,000 salaried domestic workers (young women, adults and some adolescents, migrants from rural areas and of diverse cultural backgrounds between 14 and 50 with a level of schooling between the 1st and 3rd grades) directly.

6.2 Projects under evaluation

During the period under evaluation, SAIH has funded two projects. These are:

- Training for participation and advocacy (2013-2015)
- Training for participation and advocacy for gender equality (2016-2017)

In this evaluation we will focus primarily on the implementation of projects from 2013 to 2015, as the current project is too new to see results. However, it can be noted that based on the information acquired for implementation during the 2013 to 2015 period, it can be expected that outcomes during the current period will be similar.

6.3 Findings relative to FENATRAHOB's work

FENATRAHOB's work is very relevant to the needs identified locally. First of all, it is the only organisation targeting this particular beneficiary group. Unlike other organisations funded under this programme, this is the only one working for domestic workers. Most beneficiaries, although not all, are women. They are a group of people who generally earn very low wages and have few rights. The law gives them minimal protection, and the cultural norms regarding domestic workers do not promote their ability to access their rights. As noted, they have a very low income and hence their low economic status further limits their ability to improve their economic standing longer term.

Therefore, it is clear that the organisation undertakes important work. From the point of view of SAIH, funding for this organisation can be framed within the institutional objectives, as most of the beneficiaries are young and education is being provided to a group that has few, if any, similar opportunities. This funding is tied to activities in which the impact is visible. At the same time, it is worth noting that FENATRAHOB is not the usual SAIH beneficiary organisation, and the target group is not the classic SAIH target group either. Hence the flexibility of SAIH as a donor institution should be commended. Although at first glance it is not immediately evident how the support for this organisation fits within SAIH's strategic objectives, the funding does support education and legal advocacy by ensuring that the rights of a target group, household workers (a sizable target group), are defended.

FENATRAHOB works directly on gender issues, as its main target group is women who lack the education or other means to empower themselves. The organisation supports them both with education and with other empowerment tools/approaches. Basically, this is a female empowerment effort. Environmental and youth issues are not directly addressed by FENATRAHOB. While many beneficiaries are young, it would be incorrect to conclude that this organisation focuses on youth issues specifically.

In the short term, there is a clear need to strengthen the organisation, that is, its management and overall organisational sustainability. The institution currently depends heavily on the manager, who knows and understands the organisation, institutional history, and projects, and can ensure continuity between executive secretaries when they change. While the institution tries to follow an alternate elections system to ensure that the board is not all new at one time and thus maintains a level of continuity, overall continuity is reliant on the administrator. In short, the current system is not sustainable as it is heavily reliant on a single person.

A review of annex 7 shows that the planned activities were carried out, but it is also worth noting that some activities are not described in detail and hence it is difficult to know exactly what they entailed. For example, what is meant by 'empowerment'? While work was done to try to strengthen unions and it can be assumed that these had an impact, it is not necessarily clear from the project documentation what was planned or if changes were made to the plans (and if so, why) that is, although the goal was reached, it is unclear if the planned approach was the most appropriate. This is not a criticism of the work conducted, but rather the way it is presented.

At the national level, the work has not impacted educational policies, but it has impacted labour policies. Indeed, the organisation is working directly to ensure the implementation of existing laws, but unfortunately it does not yet have broad support in the population. In the field of education, FENATRAHOB has successfully persuaded the Ministry of Education to adopt a ministerial resolution governing the Accelerated Education System for Adults that is cognizant of the availability and needs of domestic workers, but this has been limited to the city of La Paz. In 2014, this system was first implemented. The programme to follow the literacy effort was also able to garner the support of the Ministry of Education. The success of these experiences will serve as a platform from which this type of effort could be extended to other regions of the country.

Regarding multipliers, the unions themselves act as multipliers, but the overall structure is weak because there is a general reluctance related to what the organisation is trying to address. This means that only a small proportion of domestic workers are union members. This does not mean that the institution is failing, but that the road ahead is very long and that the organisation does not have a strong basis from which to promote and pursue its goals. Therefore the organisation could be much more efficient if it focused its time on pursuing synergies with other like-minded organisations. For example, leadership and individual development work only reaches a very limited portion of the target group (only about 10% of Bolivian domestic workers are part of unions according to the information shared by FENATRAHOB). The number of beneficiaries could perhaps grow if FENATRAHOB worked with organisations that focus on gender and personal development more broadly.

FENATRAHOB is a sustainable organisation because it is union-based, but its ability to support its members is dependent on external financial support. That means that while the structure of the organisation is sustainable, the work being done with SAIH funding is not. In addition, it can be said that the training work is sustainable, but only in regards to the benefits gained by the direct beneficiaries (mainly the knowledge gained by beneficiaries). It is possible that the trainees will have the opportunity to share their newfound knowledge with colleagues and this has a multiplier quality, but this cannot be guaranteed. Disseminating information at educational fairs, through the publication of the bulletin 'Equity and justice' – as well as the production of brochures, posters, flyers, radio spots, and television commercials – have a multiplier capacity, but these tools, as highlighted previously, are dependent on external funding.

The impact of FENATRAHOB's work is directly reflected by its beneficiaries (union members). Simultaneously, the institution devotes attention to prompting changes at the sociocultural level, but this is not conducted with SAIH funding. The principal impact of the organisation is to call attention to the problems faced by domestic workers.

The results noted in the 2013-2015 report are significant. The principal ones are highlighted here:

- FENATRAHOB ensured that most unions operate Monday through Friday, participating in meetings, expanded workshops, etc. It has also managed to have a presence/position at meetings and events organised by other institutions.
- It has conducted workshops in Potosi, Sucre, Oruro, Trinidad, San Ignacio de Moxos, Province of Beni, Trinidad, Cobija, Santa Cruz, Cochabamba, and Tarija. The workshops to train on unionising are conducted during the weekend.
- FENATRAHOB approved the Organic Congress (January 2013), a regulation that governs and guides how general assemblies, congresses, and debates are organised by the institution.
- The International Meeting on Social Security for Domestic Workers – with the aim of achieving social security for said workers – was conducted in La Paz, from November 18 to 20, 2015.
- The government approved both the Instructions of Convention 189, which delineate more favourable rules for domestic workers (2015), as well as the Supreme Decree No. 110, which concerns the right to compensation.
- One of the ways that the organisation gains new members is through the toll-free 0-800-10-0069 number that offers general and legal advice on labour issues.
- Through educational fairs, new members are also targeted. At the end of 2015, the organisation had 8,773 members.
- Implementation of an on-going awareness campaign on the problem faced by domestic workers using a variety of means (radio programmes, television commercials, radio spots).

While these results received financial and technical support from other institutions, SAIH support is crucial to strengthening FENATRAHOB as an institution. It is important to highlight that

FENATRAHOB has multiple donors and that often funds are brought together towards single project goals.

6.4 Conclusions on FENATRAHOB projects

FENATRAHOB has made remarkable headway through the work carried out, but much remains to be done. In the short term, there is a clear need to establish a stronger institution from an organisational point of view – that is, administration, organisational sustainability, etc. The institution currently depends heavily on the manager who knows and understands the institution, institutional history, and projects, and can ensure continuity between executive secretaries when these change. Although the directive committee is elected in a manner that ensures that only some members of the committee are new at any one time, the issue of organisational sustainability remains a concern. Thus it would be worthwhile to carry out an internal organisational analysis that highlights which areas need the most support and how these could be supported within the existing structures, as well as ensures that there are mechanisms in place to ensure that the institutional memory is not lost.

The organisation could also be strengthened through working with other institutions. To this end, one could propose that activities carried out by FENATRAHOB fall into three different areas:

- a) The legal political arena in which the organisation ensures the rights of domestic workers within the Bolivian context.
- b) Individual empowerment, which includes the support of its members through the provision of training, education, and information.
- c) The sociocultural environment in which a change in how Bolivian society treats its domestic workers is sought.

Each of these areas requires a broad and constant stream of activities. Considering that FENATRAHOB is a small organisation, it is worth exploring how it accesses support from other institutions within and outside of the SAIH programme to increase its ability to impact these areas.

6.5 Lessons learned and recommendations

FENATRAHOB's work shows that effectively supporting domestic workers is not a simple or linear undertaking. On the contrary, it involves legal issues, empowerment, and also knowledge of the Bolivian cultural understanding and regard for domestic workers, among other things. Therefore, it is important to note that the work done by FENATRAHOB is not just efforts to support its members, but also efforts to make social change. Recognising this means that plans for change must include a long-term plan and an understanding that achievements will not be visible immediately.

The work of the organisation is very valuable; there is a lack of organisations that address the problems FENATRAHOB deals with, and the goals of the organisation are important ones. Unfortunately, administrative capacity, management, and content generation are limited by a lack of resources and lack of access to a stable team that could provide technical assistance to the organisation. Therefore, it is suggested that a skills analysis and work plan be conducted so that a work plan can be designed that responds to the realities the organisation faces.

At the same time, FENATRAHOB could clearly benefit from other forms of support and synergies with other organisations. For example, a synergy with CDIMA could support its efforts on empowerment, and a link with Fe y Alegría could support its efforts on adult education. At the same time, FENATRAHOB could form an important part of the work done by Fe y Alegría as part of student workshops. This could support the sociocultural efforts that aim to change the way that domestic workers are seen and treated by society.

Chapter 7: Fe y Alegría

7.1 Introduction

Fe y Alegría is a 'movement that supports integral popular education and social change'; its activities target impoverished and excluded groups within society with the aim of enhancing their personal development and participation.

The movement aims to bring together individuals who believe in growth and constructive self-critique and who search for answers to the challenges/needs faced by humans. Through education it promotes the development of individuals who are both aware of their potential and cognizant of reality, support concepts of freedom and solidarity, and are open to transcending their context and being protagonists in their own development. It considers itself a popular movement because it is based on the premise that education is a political foundation for the transformation of communities from within. It is based on a holistic approach that understands education as a central aspect of all parts of a person's life. Additionally, it is a movement supporting social awareness insofar as it is committed to identifying and overcoming social injustice and to building a just, collaborative, democratic, and participatory society.

The movement was born in Caracas, Venezuela, in 1955 in an effort to develop educational services in marginalised areas. The bold vision of its founder, a Jesuit priest named José María Vélaz, materialised through collaboration by many individual organisations. Over time the organisation emerged as one that has a rich history and a solid, stable future.

7.2 Projects under evaluation

In April 2013, Fe y Alegría Bolivia and SAIH signed an agreement for the implementation of the project 'Training of school pupils in intra- and intercultural education and gender equity in public high schools in Bolivia'. The aim of the project is to strengthen the capacities of educators and pupils as agents of transformation within secondary education with an intra- and intercultural approach in urban municipalities of Bolivia. The total project budget was US\$70,000, of which SAIH contributed US\$40,000.

Fe y Alegría Bolivia has a strong track record in bilingual education, in complicated contexts, and in rural areas in primary schools. Thus the main feature of this project was to bring its experiences, skills, and expertise to secondary schools in urban environments. To this end, the project focused its activities on four main elements:

- Teacher training: Capacity building, methodologies, and educational strategies with cross cutting approaches on gender, intercultural and intraculturality.
- Research.
- Work with school communities.
- Development of educational materials using teacher experiences.

7.3. Findings relative to Fe y Alegría's work

Most of the goals of the Fe y Alegría project were met as planned. This is highlighted in annex 8, which describes in tabular form the work done by the organisation. Fe y Alegría has a well-

established organisational capacity. Of the organisations, it is the only one that has been legally established within the new legal framework governing Bolivia NGOs. Additionally it is not financially dependent on SAIH funds, as it has other reliable forms of income. Overall the institution is very sustainable.

The impact of the work conducted by Fe y Alegría is clear; however, it is hard to attribute the impact to the work funded by SAIH. This is because there are a number of efforts by the organisation with various donors that have similar aims.

Fe y Alegría has clearly identified the needs it wants to respond to. This is clearly highlighted by the overall educational approach it supports. The organisation seeks funding from donors to support efforts responding to the needs it has identified. In short, Fe y Alegría does not carry out projects requested by donors. Hence it is pre-identified needs, not offers of funding, that determine what type of work is conducted when.

Fe y Alegría focuses primarily on working with youth. Its efforts include both gender and the environment as cross-cutting issues that are part of the educational process. The work conducted with SAIH funding falls within the current educational framework in Bolivia. Although it would be incorrect to say that all graduates from Fe y Alegría schools are politically active, it is fair to say that children and youth educated at Fe y Alegría schools have the foundation that will permit them to be politically active and socially engaged if they choose.

Moreover, it is also important to note that the work conducted by Fe y Alegría has an impact that extends beyond the schoolyard walls. Fe y Alegría anchors its academic and pedagogical approach on aspects of indigenous culture and society, as well as gender foundations and environmental questions. The method it uses is aimed at changing the perspective that children and youth have of their own society and heritage. It educates pupils to have a different perspective on their own culture and to value it, as well as their role as individuals. Interviewed young beneficiaries emphasised that although they had been to Fe y Alegría schools throughout their education they all knew someone from their family or close friend network that had not attended Fe y Alegría schools. The interviewees then said that in discussions with their peer group, they had consistently found that their own experiences with teachers regarding both how lessons were taught and the treatment of students (boys and girls) were totally different from other schools. They also shared concrete examples of how their education was influencing how they envisaged their own role in society as they became adults.

Fe y Alegría's work does not incorporate a multiplier activity per se. However, it trains young people and imparts tools and values that can enable them to be more active and informed citizens while conserving and valuing their culture. Its efforts are highly sustainable, as they focus on long-term education aiming to change the way their pupils envisage their role in society. Fe y Alegría starts from the premise that if young people value their indigenous cultural heritage, this value will accompany them into adulthood and positively influence their development as adults.

Changes that have affected Bolivia have not had a direct impact on the way Fe y Alegría works. Indeed, changes in the country continue to highlight the need for considerable efforts to highlight the value of the country's indigenous heritage. The work Fe y Alegría maintains an important role in

Bolivian society as an educational alternative for Bolivian pupils.

Taking into account all of the organisation's achievements, one that is worth highlighting is the gender policy, designed to be a cross-cutting policy that is applied to all activities carried out. This policy has included operational variations that permit it to be implemented in both rural and urban areas. The achievements made should not overshadow the challenges that lay ahead, however. A clear challenge was highlighted by principals and teachers. They noted that while they strove to adapt their curriculum to address regional variations and both intra- and intercultural aspects, the reality is that higher education institutions do not value these components. Hence parents felt that their own children were at a disadvantage when compared with children from other schools because ultimately universities value subjects such as mathematics, physics, and chemistry far more than cultural and ancestral knowledge. The Fe y Fe y Alegría programme staff noted that there is a clear 'divorce' between the new primary and secondary educational model and higher education; however, they also noted that since the majority of pupils do not go on to university, the more important aspect of their education is having some marketable technical skills.

This shows that while there is progress towards a more holistic and inclusive perspective of multiculturalism, there are still major challenges that prevent its full implementation in Bolivia.

7.4 Conclusions on Fe y Alegría's projects

There is no doubt that the SAIH funding has expanded the opportunities for additional work on multiculturalism for Bolivian youth. Moreover, it is evident that Fe y Alegría schools support a redefinition of gender roles, re-examination of the relationship with the environment, and questioning of the role of pupils in society. All of this is positive. However, these efforts may be divorced from other efforts in the country. This does not mean that the type of work is not important, but rather that the development of synergies with other organisations might be a key to ensuring that progress made is supported by other entities.

7.5 Lessons learned and recommendations

Fe y Alegría's experience shows that changes in social attitudes require numerous complementary interventions. Therefore, it is suggested that Fe y Alegría attitudes require numerous complementary inter like-minded organisations – for example, other organisations funded by SAIH. By doing this, it could expand its reach beyond the confines of the schoolyard and target other key areas within the community.

In the long term, partnerships between Fe y Alegría and universities, for example, may enable a more holistic view of what types of skills and knowledge are important for university students.

Fe y Alegría has five agreements with public and private universities and three international agreements with foreign universities (in Spain and the United States). These agreements are primarily aimed at building the capacity of its own teachers and supporting infrastructural development. Therefore, it could also be interesting to explore opportunities with other universities in Latin America – for example, universities that focus on and/or support the study of plurality and the value of indigenous culture. The University of the Autonomous Regions of the Nicaraguan Caribbean Coast (URACCAN) in Nicaragua and the CRIC University in Colombia are two examples of this type of organisation. In short, expanding the focus to include support to students.

Chapter 8: Foundation for Education in the Contexts of Multilingualism and Multiculturalism – Fundación para la Educación en Contextos de Multilingüismo y Pluriculturalidad - FUNPROEIB Andes

8.1 Introduction

FUNPROEIB Andes was created with a number of objectives, a key one being supporting the PROEIB University programme. The foundation's eight goals are:

- Serve as a meeting point for organisations working with Indigenous people, universities, states, and international agencies. The main goal of this is to enable intercultural dialogue and expand the focus on multi-ethnic contacts and multicultural and multilingual education.
- Securing membership to networks of institutions, organisations, and specialists involved in quality education in the multilingual and multi-ethnic context.
- Contribute to the institutional interculturalisation of higher education. This means the recognition and acceptance of multi-ethnicity, multiculturalism, and intercultural citizenship.
- Provide specialised consulting services and education.
- Improve and contribute to the quality of education in the participating countries, paying special attention to needs arising from multilingual, multicultural, and multi-ethnic training through postgraduate training and other training efforts.
- Promote culturally appropriate and socially relevant models and strategies for education in Latin America and the Caribbean, which can contribute to the development of identity for indigenous peoples.
- Promote the exchange of knowledge, expertise, information, and technology used in education in multi-ethnic contexts that target indigenous and non-indigenous populations, including community leaders. These efforts should include the dissemination of success stories in education, training, technical assistance, research, and development at the national and international levels.
- Promote the training of indigenous leaders to strengthen their participation and inclusion into the political community.
- Encourage the participation of both the private and public sectors in activities carried out by the foundation.

8.2 Projects under evaluation

During the period from 2009 to 2012, SAIH funded the project 'Participation of indigenous youth in educational aspects focused on bilingual intercultural education'. This project was designed with the aim of training indigenous youth and promoting their active participation in the development of training tools that were culturally and linguistically appropriate to the local context. The implementation of this project enabled the development of two curricula, the first for the Commonwealth of New Galilee (Yurakaré village) and the second for the Community of Luqhusqa

(Quechua people). These documents were well received by the Consejo Educativo del Pueblo Yurakaré (CEPY) and el Consejo Educativo de la Nación Quechua (CENAQ).

Moreover, during the same period and as part of the Higher Education Programme Indian Youth, FUNPROEIB Andes implemented the project 'Higher education of indigenous youth in intercultural bilingual education' with SAIH funding. This project aimed to provide capacity and support to youth who were part of developing educational material for indigenous groups. Through this project, the following key achievements were met: 115 young Indians were provided with medium-level technical training in education/pedagogy with a focus on intercultural bilingual education, 12 young indigenous people attained a master's degree in intercultural bilingual education, and 365 indigenous youth were trained in reading and in the production of texts in Quechua and Aymara.

Based on previous successes, FUNPROEIB Andes received SAIH support for the implementation of the project 'Higher education and youth participation in intercultural bilingual education', which was implemented between 2013 and 2015. This project aimed to contribute to the design and implementation of an education effort that supports intracultural, intercultural, social, and community participation in education in the plurinational context of Bolivia.

8.3. Findings relative to FUNPROEIB Andes' work

The objectives of each of the projects were generally achieved. This is highlighted in the annex 9. While there were some limited changes from the planned activities, there are no major gaps between planned and achieved results. The recent completion of the master's project by 10 students is a visible success. Of the 10 master's students, five were Bolivian, three Peruvian, one Ecuadorian, and one Mexican. Eight were indigenous, and two were mestizos. In all cases, the master's students were endorsed by indigenous organisations. According to FUNPROEIB Andes' December 2015 report, only 30% of the master's students completed their thesis and hence were able to receive the title of master's.⁷

Ninety-seven participants (47 women and 50 men) were enrolled in either the diploma programme on reading and text production in the Moxos language or the diploma on reading and text production in the Bésiro language. Of these students, 88% graduated successfully. In parallel, and as a result of the implementation of the two graduate programmes, two books containing best practices on curriculum development in two Moxos dialects (mojeña ignaciana and mojeña trinitaria) were produced. For chiquitano, a research book was published using participants' experiences as a tool for teaching the indigenous language as a second language.

In addition to the above, FUNPROEIB Andes also works with two key marginalised and indigenous peoples. These are the Afroboliviano (CONAFRO) and Uru. Discussions with these two groups served to highlight some very important issues.

The Uru Nation initiated contact with FUNPROEIB Andes in 2013. At first, approaching FUNPROEIB

⁷ Notablemente el informe a abril de 2016 destaca que el 70% de los maestrantes lograron sustentar una tesis que les habilitó para acceder al título de magister correspondiente.

Andes was not easy since the organisation had a history of only working with people from the lowland. Currently, the support provided to the Uru people by FUNPROEIB Andes is primarily focused on institutional strengthening. SAIH resources to FUNPROEIB Andes have allowed for the opening and equipping of a coordination office for the Uru Nation in the departments of La Paz and Oruro.

The main achievements of this work include:

- Planning activities for the implementation of a regionalised curriculum.
- Leadership workshops for young leaders of the Uru Nation.
- Sociolinguistic study on the three dialectal variants of the Uru language.
- Development of training materials on the Uru language.
- International meeting of Uru Nation in which knowledge and experiences from different regions were shared.
- Workshops to support the revitalisation of the Uru language.
- Workshops to exchange experiences with Yuracarrent region.
- Beneficiaries feel that the support from FUNPROEIB Andes, has allowed them to fill a gap in work by the Ministry of Education, particularly with regard to the implementation of a regionalised curriculum. FUNPROEIB Andes has provided technical support to develop said curricula.
- FUNPROEIB Andes has supported the establishment of the Institute of Language and Culture, which has enabled the generation of educational material.

The work by FUNPROEIB Andes and CONAFRO began in 2011. At that time, CONAFRO was becoming established and required institutional strengthening, particularly administrative support. Their joint work has been mainly focused on:

- Strengthening administration and providing equipment.
- Research support. It has prepared a document entitled 'From home'; according to CONAFRO, this is the main body of research on the Afro population of Bolivia. This document has also been produced in a summarised version for wider dissemination.
- Work on the development of children's texts, which have not been published due to budgetary constraints.
- Generation of five documentaries in coordination with the Plurinational Institute of Language and Culture.
- Technical exchanges abroad.
- Supporting the development of a regionalised curriculum, which was used in over 30 educational units of the Yungas of La Paz.
- Training technicians at the Institute of Language.
- Creating a website for CONAFRO (www.conafro.org).

At this time, CONAFRO no longer receives support from FUNPROEIB Andes. Despite this, they continue to maintain their headquarters in a sustainable manner. CONAFRO is grateful for the support provided by SAIH through FUNPROEIB Andes, and stresses that there are further areas that require support. They emphasise the need for further research.

Overall, FUNPROEIB Andes is known for the high level of professionalism and high quality of the work it undertakes and for filling a gap that is not addressed by anyone else. Perhaps the only work that seems to have limited impact is the support provided to master's students. While individual scholarships are an important asset to individuals, this kind of support has limited multiplier value. This does not mean that master does not m are not important, because clearly the issues in question here requires academic support/follow-up, but the support for individuals students is questioned. Focusing the master's students on only indigenous pupils is also questioned. While scholarships only for indigenous individuals can be justified, there appears to be no reason for why the programme on the whole targets only indigenous participants. On the contrary, it can be argued that this kind of information is important to all and that having individuals who do not self-identify as indigenous is an important step in sharing and expanding the knowledge base.

In general, the institution appears to fill an important role in the development of curriculum materials and in research. It clearly plays an important role within the Bolivian arena on pluralism, multiculturalism, etc. In addition, since the entity is well recognised, it has an impact that extends beyond Bolivia to the wider region.

Several multipliers exist, mainly concerning conducting research and providing direct support to indigenous groups (e.g., Urus). Cross-cutting issues such as gender, the environment, and youth are addressed through the development of varied curricula. Notably, the majority of the direct beneficiaries are youth.

8.4 Conclusions on FUNPROEIB Andes projects

FUNPROEIB Andes is a well-established institution that operates in direct collaboration with PROEIB Andes (university). The institution was created to respond to legal requirements and hence provide a mechanism for the university to access foreign funds. Thus, it is important to note that there is a close relationship between the two entities and a system of mutual support that serves both parties.

The work done by the foundation is relevant and important. The only work funded by SAIH that is questioned is the provision of scholarships for master's students. The number of students that receive scholarships is very small and hence the multiplier effect is minimal. It was also noted that there are several versions of how the scholarship process is administered. In short, the process that was used to select scholarship beneficiaries was recounted in different ways by different beneficiaries.

The institution itself seems to be both stable and sustainable, but funding for the university is precarious. Indeed, it is possible that the masters programme will close down due to lack of funds. This calls into question the level of commitment to this work by the government of Bolivia.

8.5 Lessons learned and recommendations

Overall the organisation is well established and has a well-defined, complementary role relative to the work of the university. While there are multiple areas requiring support, the foundation is best positioned to conduct research and develop educational material. The foundation is a good platform for this kind of work and brings the opportunity to share its work widely. Its work with vulnerable groups is also notable.

In the short term, opportunities for synergies among organisations funded by SAIH should be explored. This could lead to much broader learning and wider use of the material it produces. Currently the materials it produces could be of considerable assistance to other SAIH-funded entities.

In the long term, the foundation could consider engaging in long-term projects based on the work it has done and which have a wider reaching multiplier effect. There are interesting opportunities for collaboration and exchanging experience with other higher education institutions such as, for example, CRIC and the University of the URACCAN. These exchanges can be based on formal links or on less-structured ties that allow for an exchange of experiences on issues, such as assessing the process of intercultural education at both the university and pre-university level.

Chapter 9: Institute of Therapy and Research on Effects of Torture and State Violence – Instituto de Terapia e Investigación sobre las Secuelas de la Tortura y la Violencia Estatal- ITEI

9.1 Introduction

ITEI is an interdisciplinary institute intended to provide services to individuals directly or indirectly affected by torture and violence through processes that facilitate their reintegration. Its mission is to support those affected by torture and state violence through a personal rehabilitation process. Its work expands from the individual and includes the family and the community. Moreover, ITEI conducts research and denounces state violence, including its causes, motives, instruments, and individual and collective effects. It offers interdisciplinary training for those affected by state violence.

ITEI was created in 2001, during the turbulent Sánchez de Lozada government. The specific purpose of the organisation was: a) to provide comprehensive assistance (psychotherapeutic, medical, social, and judicial) to victims of torture and their families, to promote social and labour reintegration, and to contribute to the prevention of family breakdown caused by torture and political violence; b) to provide training in public health services to help people affected by torture; and c) to investigate the impact of state terror in areas that were directly affected by state-led violence. The work with youth came about from a request made to ITEI by adults from the areas in which the organisation worked.

9.2 Projects under evaluation

The working relationship between ITEI and SAIH dates back to the period from 2009 to 2012, during the implementation of the project entitled 'Training of young community leaders who have political advocacy opportunities'. The objective of the project was training young female and male leaders in the Achacachi and Huanuni areas in order to increase the organised political participation of youth.

According to the final report issued by ITEI, several results were achieved in the period from 2009 to 2012. Among these, 4,211 young men and women in the two municipalities were trained, which led to their increased knowledge on human rights, youth, leadership, women's rights, the environment, indigenous rights, self-esteem, self-awareness, family relationships, relationships between young people, and local and national realities. Moreover, it was possible to establish an outreach group of 32 youth in the municipality of Achacachi who worked on promoting youth participation and the rights of youth. These individuals worked to increase awareness through outreach and training activities.

Towards the end of the project, in 2012, SAIH commissioned an evaluation of some of the projects they funded.⁸ The evaluation concluded that it was not advisable for SAIH to continue funding ITEI.

According to the director of ITEI, the organisation responded to the evaluation team's conclusions by calling them unfair and biased since in its view the evaluation failed to consider key contextual

⁸ Se excluyeron los proyectos con enfoque a educaciude this ac.

factors. The organisation further noted that in its view there had not been sufficient time for ITEI to respond to claims made and furthermore one of the team members was a former ITEI staff member and hence lacked impartiality.

In response to ITEI's concerns, SAIH conducted an internal evaluation of the ITEI project and concluded that there were several issues that hampered the continuation of funding. The main issues that supported halting funding included: a) staff retention problems made it difficult for the project to be stable and b) it being an institution that is too dependent on two people, the founder and director, and therefore very weak in terms of long-term institutional sustainability.

Despite the aforementioned findings SAIH decided to continue funding the project for a final phase (2013-2015). During this period, ITEI (supported by SAIH) provided continuity for its work with the project 'Formation of young leaders, women and men, as drivers for youth political participation'. The objective of this project was to develop capacity and participation mechanisms within local youth organisations at the local, municipal, and national level to support the protection of youth rights.

9.3. Findings relative to ITEI's work

The main achievements of the project include:

- Organisations have a management mechanism that enables them to implement their activities and collaborate with numerous institutions such as the educational units, the autonomous municipal government, NGOs and the District Directorate of Education.
- There are some organisations that have offices and are supported by the sub-interior as is the case in the town of Achacachi.
- Municipal authorities recognise youth organisations and take them into account in civic activities and institutional fairs organised by the different directorates of the municipality.
- There are four youth organisations that are legally recognised by the governorates of La Paz and Oruro.

As for the advocacy component, the project enabled claims made by youth to influence the distribution of municipal resources. Similarly, in the case of Huanuni, the draft Municipal Charter of Huanuni included the support of the project. Youth were recognised as assemblypeople in the process of drafting the aforementioned law. Unfortunately, the bill was not approved in the referendum, which means there is still a need for a mechanism that ensures youth participation as highlighted in the proposed law.

In general, it seems that the ITEI programme met its obligations, although it is difficult to establish with certainty if its goals were met because the documentation does not clearly detail how many activities should be conducted in relation to which objective (see annex 10). But there are no major problems in this area. Their goals were met despite having encountered multiple staff problems; indeed most of the staff positions changed at least once. This had a negative impact not only on project management, but also on beneficiaries, as beneficiaries had to form new relationships with staff every time they changed.

Despite this, the project was both relevant and had an impact on youth. Unfortunately, the

evaluation team did not have the opportunity to talk with multiple beneficiaries, but the beneficiary interviewed did have ample examples of how the project had influenced him and his peers.

Gender, youth, the environment, and other cross-cutting issues were included in the workshops held by ITEI. In this way, the work had an information dissemination feature. From this perspective, the project played a formative role – that is, it was able to provide key information to its target group.

As previously mentioned, in relation to the key findings, ITEI's work seems to have had an impact with its target group: youth. It allowed them to identify ways to work more openly, as well as develop organisations/groups to work together and thus participate more actively in the local community. It is notable that there are examples of political participation that can be linked to the training provided by ITEI. From this point of view, we can say that the impact of the work done is sustainable. That is to say, individuals who received training are now able to use the knowledge they gained and continue participating actively within their communities. From this perspective, the work by ITEI added value.

9.4 Conclusions on ITEI projects

The project was both relevant and had an impact. There is no doubt that people who were direct participants in the training benefited from the project. Still, taking into account SAIH's long-term impact and institutional sustainability requirements, two concerns arise:

1) Unfortunately, ITEI could not ensure stable staffing that had the capacity to do the job and stayed with the organisation. Although ITEI will no longer be financed by SAIH, it is worth recommending that in future ITEI evaluate the reasons behind the staff loss and develop a strategy to minimise staff changes. ITEI maintains that the problem of stability of personnel is understandable noting a number of contextual concerns. They also note that there is a key difference between administrative staff, psychotherapist and training staff. Here we have focused our observations on the staff issues that pertained to the project funded by SAIH only.

2) The fact that the organisation is so dependent on the founders is also a concern for donors. The institution has two founders, one who served as director for the first 13 years and another who has served as director for the last few years. While it is understandable that people with such a personal commitment have a clear impact on the institution and maintain their roles, this does open the institution to risks. That is to say, if for any reason one of the two founders could not serve as a director, the institution would find itself in a very weak position and potentially unable to continue. Therefore, it is suggested that ITEI consider establishing an institutional development plan that allows an administrative and management system that is not based on the two founders and to ensure that the institution has the ability to adapt over time. ITEI notes that it tried to implement a horizontal management system, but that this effort did not succeed. An organisation such as ITEI might, however, consider having a board of directors that could ensure the longevity of the institution is no longer dependent on the founders.

Chapter 10: General conclusions and recommendations

10.1 Introduction

SAIH's work in Bolivia is not framed as work with universities, for which SAIH is recognised (i.e., it does not focus on students and teachers), but it does fall within the type of work carried out by SAIH with partner NGOs. In Bolivia, SAIH works with a broad group of actors who are neither Organizations focusing on students or teachers. This approach is valued, as it clearly recognises that the Bolivian context is different. Notably, the financial support provided to Bolivia is the smallest in Latin America. In 2015, the total amount allocated to Bolivia was NOK6,951,000. Recognising that the investment is proportionally small is important in relation to the challenges faced and achievements made. At the same time, there may also be opportunities for collaboration that have the characteristics of standard collaborations with students and teachers. This is highlighted later in this chapter.

10.2 Future working opportunities for SAIH⁹

The National Population and Housing Census conducted in 2012 presents important figures regarding the education of young people under 35 years old in Bolivia. In 1992, 20% of the population was illiterate; by 2012, this figure had decreased to 5.09%. (In urban areas, 2.67% of the population is illiterate; in rural areas, 10.35% is.) The government has undertaken a series of programmes to eradicate illiteracy and campaigns were successful thanks to the support from the Cuban brigades and the commitment of teachers in rural areas of the country. Thus it is expected that illiteracy will continue to decline until it has been fully eradicated.

Bolivia is a young country with a large percentage of the population age 19 or younger. The population aged above 19 in 2014 was 6,274,642 people (4.3 million in urban areas and 1.9 million in rural areas); their educational level is improving every year. Levels of school dropouts and children who cannot go to school have also decreased steadily, and currently is 8.21%. This figure is also decreasing as a result of high-impact measures, such as the voucher 'Juancito Pinto'. This voucher is awarded annually to all children who attend school regularly. Furthermore, municipalities are required to provide school breakfast and school supplies to all pupils.

	TOTAL %	URBAN	RURAL
None	8.21	3.59	18.76
Primary	28.82	20.15	48.63
Secondary	36.66	40.85	27.1
Higher	25.74	34.82	5.01
Other	0.56	0.58	0.5

Finally, the population enrolled in any form of study between 5 and 39 years old is equal to

⁹ La fuente de los datos para la informcion en esta seccion proviene de el INE. ver: ine.gob.bo

3,614,853 people, distributed amongst different educational levels. The National Development Plan is seeking to transform the educational model to a community social model, which includes alternatives to university education.

BOLIVIA	3,614,853
Course in literacy	0.01
Pre-school	6.73
Primary	39.4
Secondary	33.47
Adult education	1.07
Normal	0.46
University (bachelor's and post-graduate)	14.63
Technical (middle and superior)	1.92
Military school and police academy	0.06
Other courses ¹⁰	2.26

Thousands of students in Bolivia are affiliated with the Central Obrera Boliviana. At the secondary school level, students are members of the Confederation of Secondary Students (CES), which is a union formed to organise all students across the country.¹¹ The participation of students is not significant, and few students actively take part. They lack resources and rely almost exclusively on the contributions authorised by the Ministry of Education, which limits their independence.

At the university level, Bolivia allows constitutional autonomy for public universities. This means that all schools are completely autonomous from any other public body in the administrative and academic sense. Autonomy also generated a co-government process, in which students are part of the universities' governing bodies, which is being questioned. The organisation that brings together the university students is the Bolivian University Confederation (CUB), which is part of the Executive Committee of Bolivian Universities (CEUB).¹² In recent years, the increase in subjects and provision of high budgets has led to growth in infrastructure and equipment. However, research and social interaction are continually questioned and criticised for the lack of visible results.

Youth social service in Bolivia has generated a movement that led to the adoption of a law on volunteering (Law No. 3314). Universities generate as part of the training process opportunities for social service/volunteering with vulnerable sectors/groups of society. To this end, the Catholic

¹⁰ This category is equal to the 93986 that take courses such as those provided by organizations such CDIMA, CEADL.

¹¹ Ver: <https://www.facebook.com/ces.bolivia#>

¹² Ver, <http://www.ceub.edu.bo>

Church is the body that has developed the principal networks and strongest institutional mechanisms. The work by teachers who have founded NGOs that conduct research and with which students can volunteer also deserves mention. Currently, however, there is no mechanism to measure the work that has been conducted by these entities, the results achieved, or the efficiency of their efforts. Some organisations that should be mentioned because their work has a national coverage, including Caritas, the Social Ministry, which includes a Prison Ministry effort, the Ministry of Health, and the Ministry of Education, among others. These organisations recruit volunteers among students from different universities around the country. Smaller projects that have supported the work by youth are conglomerated in the Community Human Rights and Civic Platform for Justice.

The development of norms in Bolivia is overarching. The Constitution establishes a series of rights and norms, including with the Youth Law (Law No. 342). These policies aim to achieve the active political participation of young people. The law authorises individuals 18 or older to run for municipal councillor or parliamentarian, and from the age of 30 they can be candidates for president of the state or justice of the Supreme Court. This possibility has not been delineated in the law. The Bolivia Assembly, besides having a greater number of women than men, has members that average 42 years of age. (39.19% of the Assembly members were between 19 and 40 years old when the 2014 mandate was enacted.)

Under these conditions, SAIH should seek organisations working in the rural sector and in the cities of El Alto and Santa Cruz, where most of the migrants are concentrated. The model generated by CDIMA has proven successful and should be replicated. The youth from these areas need opportunities for improvement and examples of people who can help them overcome the conflict generated by the clash between the values of the city and the indigenous world to which they belong. The working alliance with the CES, the Bolivian University Confederation (CUB), and NGOs who work with young volunteers urgently needs to build a network that integrates all their complementary efforts and maps how and where they may collaborate. This mapping could take into account the work of current beneficiaries and maximise the resources currently available. The remaining challenge is that it is difficult to measure their impact in an objective way.

10.3 General conclusions and recommendations

As noted here, funded organisations generally comply with SAIH's strategic objectives, mainly on the issue of working with indigenous people. The institutional sustainability of the different entities is generally good, with the exceptions of CEFOS EIB Escoma and ITEI, as both institutions are highly dependent on individuals and at any rate will not continue to receive funding.

All organisations met most of their contractual obligations and usually had a very positive impact on their beneficiary groups. There are some exceptions, however. FENATRAHOB is a sustainable institution composed of trade unions, but is weak in that it does not have a solid organisational structure. As seen with ITEI, but for other reasons, there is a heavy reliance on one individual. Making changes could prevent future problems if the person could no longer continue with the institution.

Additionally, all organisations that will continue with SAIH funding carry out work that is not conducted by other entities. The only exception is CEADL. Therefore, it is necessary that CEADL invest time in defining its work more clearly. This would allow for more clarity on how, where, and why it works in a particular subject area and would also help it identify its expected impact. At the moment, it would be difficult for it to delineate the parameters of its work because it is not the only institution with their areas of focus.

It was also noted, as shown in annex 11, that most of recommendations of previous evaluations have been responded to. Generally we found that the funded organisations are well established and work well in their areas of competence. The only area that needs attention is the issue of maximising impact and coverage. It was evident that there are many opportunities for synergies among the different institutions and that these could improve their work, expand coverage, and generally enable them to have a much greater impact.

While there are several ways by which the different organisations can work together, we suggest the following:

1. It is noted that CDIMA, Fe y Alegría, FUNPROEIB Andes, and FENATRAHOB work very specific issues with a clear targets. It can be said that their particular capabilities include:
 - a. CDIMA – works with leaders and women.
 - b. FUNPROEIB Andes – works in research and curriculum development.
 - c. FENATRAHOB – works with female domestic workers and also provides capacity.
 - d. Fe y Alegría- works in pre-university education of children and adults.

Taking into account these key capabilities, a link could (for example) be created between FENATRAHOB and Fe y Alegría. Fe y Alegría could support issues of educational training for adults for members of FENATRAHOB, while FENATRAHOB could provide support to Fe y Alegría by raising awareness on laws (including state laws) and unions, thus having an impact on youth and facilitating change in how domestic workers are viewed by wider society.

For its part, Fe y Alegría could work directly with FUNPROEIB Andes in two ways: first by sharing the research they have conducted, sharing training and studies that both develop, and perhaps more importantly by creating a link with the university to discuss and validate the importance of the educational system that is supported by Fe y Alegría. This type of link could be a key to overriding the current problem experienced by Fe y Alegría: mainly that the approaches to teaching it uses are not valued at the university level. At the same time, the material created by FUNPROEIB Andes could be used by Fe y Alegría to demonstrate more widely to their students the value of a pluralistic vision.

2) In addition, you could say that CEADL works in areas of social networking and these can be very important and powerful tools. However, as previously discussed, any future project must be first defined clearly. Based on what is ultimately decided, several opportunities for synergies with the different partners in which CEADL's role is to expand and support the use of social networks – for example, as a way of highlighting the positions of the other institutions – could be explored.

What is generally suggested is that the gains made are more widely used by different entities to ensure that their impact does not exist in silos.

Annex 1: ToR (original)

ToR (original)ns made are more widely use programa

“rograma)ns made are more widely used los/as j)ns made are m Bolivia)gAntecedentes

Contexto del panteDurante la lltima d la l Bolivia ha experimentado more widely used by different entities to ensure that their impact does notLas transiciones implican importantes procesos de insercintities to en Estos procesos resultan en una ampliaciocesosla democracia, lo cual significa que los/las ciudadanos/as tienen mayores posibilidades de actuar en la sociedad y la política, y existen leyes que aseguran el derecho a la participacies (por ejemplo la ley de juventud). Sin embargo, la implementaci cual sas leyes va de manera lenta, y el tema de la formacicirgo, la implementaci cual sas leyes que los/las ciudadanos/as tienen mayores posibilidades de actuar en la sociedad y la política, y existen leyes que aseguran el derecho a la oung and education is beinn intra e intercultural, pero la implementación es lenta.

Contexto organizacional

El fondo de asistencia internacional de los estudiantes y acadici cual sas leyes que los/las ciudadanos/as tienen mayores posibilidades de actuar en la sociedad y la política, de los estudiantes y académicos en Noruega. Con el lema "Educacia internacional de los estudiantes y acadici cual sas leyes que los/las ciudadanos/as t social y cultural, y fortalecer la solidaridad internacional entre estudiantes y acadslas ciudadanos/as en países en el Sur. SAIH apoya proyectos educativos en Bolivia, Nicaragua, Colombia, Sudáfrica, Zambia, Zimbabue y Suazilandia. La organización también realiza campañas informativas y de cabildeo en Noruega, sobre la educación global (problemas Norte-Sur) y política noruega de desarrollo. La Declaración Universal de los Derechos Humanos constituye la base de este trabajo. La educaciacitalecer la solidaridad internacional entre estudiantes y acadslas ciudadanoSAIH es una organizacitalecer la solidaridadilaciones a partidos políticos. La estrategia de Solidaridad 2012-2017 guidadilaciones a partidos polít SAIH.

SAIH iniciiega de Solidaridad 2012-2017 guidadilaciones a partidos políticos. y acadslas ciudadanos/as Desde entonces, el enfoque de la cooperación con las contrapartes bolivianas ha sido fortalecer los derechos de los pueblos indígenas a través de educación formal y capacitación de liderazgo y educación informal para jóvenes, muchos de estos jóvenes indígenas. En el periodo 2003-2017 SAIH está siguiendo la misma línea de trabajo, y al mismo tiempo, el trabajo se ha ajustado a los procesos de cambio que se está viviendo en Bolivia.

La evaluacinces, el enfoque de la cooperación con las contrapartes bolivianas ha sido fortalecer los derechos de lo/as jóvenes indígenas en Bolivia". El programa está financiado con fondos de la Agencia Noruega de Cooperación al Desarrollo (Norad), como parte de un acuerdo marco para el mismo per pern las contrapartes boliviun total de ocho proyectos gestionados por siete contrapartes bolivianas:

Centro de Formacioyoyectos gestionados por siete contrapartesapartes bolivianas ha sido fortaymaras de funcie funciioyoyectos gestionados por siete contrapartesapartes bolivianas ha sido fortalecer los derechos de lo/as jóvenes indobtener esto la organización enfoca su trabajo en la reafirmación de la identidad cultural de las mujeres aymaras, y desde esta perspectiva generar propuestas para

transformaciones de las estructuras sociales, poles, polos de lo/as jóvenes indobtener esto lleva adelante con activa participación de mujeres aymaras y jras y jsta perspectiva generar propuestas para transformaciones de las estructuras sociales, poles, polos de lo/as jóvenes indobtener esto lleva adelante con activa participde La Paz.

Centro de Formación Superior en Educación Intercultural Bilingüe Escoma (CEFOS EIB Escoma)

CEFOS EIB Escoma se maneja por el orden catntercultural Bilingüe Escoma (CEFOS EIBBuras sociales, poles, polos de lo/as jóvenes indobtener esto lleva adelante CEFOS EIB Escoma trabaja en la parte norte del departamento de La Paz, y se especializa en programas de liderazgo para jóvenes y mujeres, y en educación para maestros. Escoma queda en una zona rural del Altiplano boliviano, donde hay pocas posibilidades para los jóvenes de educarse. La cooperación con SAIH se inició con UAC Escoma, también de los Salesianos. En 2015 SAIH toma trabaja en la parte norte del departamento de La Paz, y se espe 2016.

Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local (CEADL)

El Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local (CEADL) es una organización no-gubernamental de carácter educativo que fortalece preferentemente a organizaciones juveniles, así como a j a jo de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local (CEADL) es una organización no-gubernamental de ganizaciones de carácter general del país. El CEADL busca ser una organizaciDesarrollo Local (CEADL) es una organización no-gubernamental de ganizaciones de carác La organizaci ser una organizaciDesarrollo Local (CEADL) es una organización no-gubernamental través de la transformación de las estructuras de injusticia e inequidad sociopolítica, económica, y cultural.

CEADL ha trabajado dos proyectos con el apoyo de SAIH, uno financiado por fondos de Sociedad Civil, el otro por Petrción de las estructuras de inj Norad e incluidos en el marco lógico del programa. El programa Petróleo para Desarrollo a partir de 2016 no financia el trabajo en Bolivia, y esto lleva a que CEADL junta su trabajo en un solo proyecto a partir de este a an CEADL tiene oficinas en La Paz/El Alto y en Sucre.

Federaciene oficinas en La Paz/El Alto y enyo de SAIH, uno financiado por fondos de SoFENATRAHOB es una organizaciaz/El Alto y enyo de SAIH, uno financiadoEl objetivo general de la organizacito y enyo de SAIH, uno financiado por fondos o y salario de las trabajadoras del hogar de Bolivia. Esta federaciner al de la organizacito y enyo de SAIH, uno financiado por fondos o y salario de las trabajadoras del hogar de Bolivia.turas de inj Norad e incluidos en el marco lógico del progSu oficina principal está en La Paz.

Fe y Alegr p Bolivia

Fe y Alegr princun movimiento social para una educacicio y enyo de SAIH, uno financiado por fondos o y salario de las trabajadoras del hogar de Bolivia.turas de inj Norad e incluidos en el marco lógico del prTrabaja con alumnos de sectores discriminados y con pocos recursos en la sociedad boliviana. Desarrolla su propia pedagogges discriminados y con pocos recursos en la sociedad bcultural bilingrop Fe y Alegrlingropia pedagogges discriminados y con pocos recur, que tiene presencia en 20 países en América, Asia y Europa. La oficina nacional está en La Paz.

Fundacilegrlingropia pedagogges discriminados y con pocos recur, que tiene presencia en 2 Andes)

La Fundación Lingüística Pedagógica Discriminados y con Pocos Recursos y Pluriculturalidad (FUNPROEIB ANDES) es una organización civil internacional, con base en Bolivia. La organización implementa proyectos socioeducativos en beneficio de los pueblos y organizaciones indígenas. La finalidad de la FUNPROEIB Andes es contribuir al mejoramiento de la calidad de vida de los pueblos indígenas. Esto se hace facilitando su desarrollo humano sostenible con identidad y su acceso al ejercicio de sus derechos ciudadanos. Al mismo tiempo, la organización civil internacional, con base teórica de interculturalidad, con equidad de género, y sin exclusiones. En el periodo 2009- 2012 FUNPROEIB Andes llevó a cabo dos sub-proyectos con el apoyo de SAIH, y solo uno de estos fue evaluado en 2012. FUNPROEIB Andes tiene su oficina en Cochabamba.

Instituto de terapia e investigación sobre secuelas de la tortura y la violencia estatal (ITEI)

Instituto de terapia e investigación sobre secuelas de la tortura y la violencia estatal mismo tiempo, la organización civil internacional, con base teórica de El Trabajo del ITEI se basa en un compromiso político. ITEI se basa en investigación sobre secuelas de la tortura y la violencia estatal mismo tiempo, la organización civil este contexto, la organización civil en investigación sobre secuelas de la tortura y la violencia estatal mismo tiempo de Bolivia. En 2013 SAIH financió la investigación sobre secuelas de la tortura y la violencia ITEI tiene su oficina en La Paz.

La historia de cooperación de las organizaciones sobre secuelas de la tortura y la violencia estatal mismo tiempo

Organización de cooperación	Período de evaluación	Año de evaluación
CDIMA	1993 -	2012
CEADL	2000 -	2011, 2012
CEADL Observatorio de Recursos Naturales (parte de Programa de la tortura y la violencia) 2007-2015	2009	
CEFOS EIB Escoma	2003-2016	2008 (UAC Escoma)
FENATRAHOB	2007 -	2012
Ferrocarril y Alegria 2013 -	-	
FUNPROEIB Andes	2008 -	2012
ITEI	2009-2015	2012

Objetivos del programa

En el presente programa se ha formulado un objetivo principal (a nivel "outcome") con cinco objetivos (a nivel "output"):

Los y las participantes en el programa están cinco objetivos/as para hacer trabajo de incidencia política. Los y las participantes en el programa están cinco objetivos/as para un nivel de incidencia política en el programa.

mujeres.

Mujeres indígenas han recibido formación en el programa en cinco niveles de cambios políticos en el programa local y nacional.

Organizaciones de jóvenes en el programa como interlocutores activos con las autoridades y la sociedad civil boliviana, especialmente sobre temas de importancia para la juventud, mujeres y pueblos indígenas, Bolivia.

Organizaciones de jóvenes indígenas han fortalecido sus derechos a la información, especialmente sobre temas de importancia.

Directores de distritos educativos, rectores de escuelas, maestros y jóvenes han sido capacitados/as en educación, rectores de plurilingüe.

Contrapartes han llevado a cabo y publicado investigación, maestros y jóvenes de importancia para la juventud, mujeres y pueblos.

Los siguientes proyectos que forman parte del programa en el periodo 2013-2017:

“2013-2017: de Jóvenes y Mujeres Indígenas en Liderazgo Social” - Centro de Formación Integral de la Mujer Aymara – Amuyt’a (CDIMA).

“CDIMA). Juventud boliviana Interconectada para la Democracia, los Derechos Humanos, la participación Aymara – Amuyt’a juventud, mujeres y pueblos indígenas, además de las tecnologías de Información y comunicación. Sub-proyecto uno

bajo el proyecto Interconectada para la Democracia, los Derechos Humanos, la participación Aymara – Amuyt’a juventud, mujeres y pueblos indígenas, además de las tecnologías (CEADL).

“CEADL). Torio Boliviano de los Recursos Naturales.” Sub-proyecto dos bajo el proyecto “Desarrollo de capacidades para la participación y el control social de jóvenes líderes de Bolivia.” - Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local (CEADL).

“Torio Boliviano de los recursos educativos interculturales para implementar el modelo socio comunitario productivo” - Centro de Formación Superior en Educación Intercultural Bilingüe Escoma (CEFOS EIB Escoma).

“Escoma). Formación para la participación de los recursos educativos interculturales Consolidación Organizacional de la FENATRAHOB y sus Sindicatos Afiliados” - Federación Nacional de las Trabajadoras Asalariadas del Hogar de Bolivia (FENATRAHOB).

“Consolidación Organizacional de la FENATRAHOB y sus Sindicatos Afiliados” - Federación Nacional de las Docentes públicas de secundaria de Bolivia” - Fe y Alegría Bolivia.

“Bolivia. Formación y participación organizacional de la FENATRAHOB y sus Sindicatos Afiliados” - Federación de Docentes de la FENATRAHOB y sus Sindicatos Afiliados” Andes).

“Andes). Formación de jóvenes líderes y lideresas como interlocutores para la participación política juvenil” - Instituto de terapia e investigación sobre secuelas de la tortura y la violencia estatal (ITEI).

Objetivos, alcances y alcance de la evaluación Justificación y Ver los logros del programa:

Despuama:oghaber pasado mado m delnce de laes y lideresas como interlocutores para la participación política juvenil” - Instituto de terapia e investigación sobre secuelas de la tortura y la viol SAIH.

Aprender del trabajo realizado

Una evaluaci trabajoe de laes y lideresas como interlocutores para la participación política juvenil” - Instituto de terapia e investigación sobre secuelas de la tortura y la viusar en el futuro.

c) Decidir el camino a seguir:

Esto para planificar el camino a seguir en un nuevo pereranicar el camino a seguir en omo interlocutores para la participación pohaber sinergias con el trabajo de SAIH en Nicaragua y Colombia.

Objetivos de la evaluacis dInterpretar, analizar y evaluar el avance del programa utorcación y formación para los derechos de los/as jóvenes indígenas en Boliviaaet

Evaluar la pertinencia de los proyectos que forman parte del programa, para obtener los resultados esperados, y en el actual contexto actual boliviano.

Aprender de los modelos de trabajo que funcionan bien para mejorar el trabajo en el futuro.

Evaluar la sostenibilidad del programa.

Sugerir como desarrollar el programa para el futuro (enfoque, contrapartes, modelos de trabajo).

Preguntas claves

Las siguientes preguntas no representan una lista completa de preguntas consideradas como pertinentes, sino pueden contribuir para comenzar el trabajo. El/la consultor(a) puede incluir otras preguntas, y dejar algunas de las preguntas abajo.

Elmentos para preparar la evaluaciaraEstrategia de solidaridad de SAIH “Educación para la Liberación” 2012-2017

Solicitud de SAIH a Norad

Marco lud de SAI programa

Informes anuales de SAIH a Norad

Documentos de planificaciade S proyectos

Marco losico de proyectos

Reportes anuales de proyectos

Evaluaciones anteriores

Informes internos SAIH, si pertinente (en noruego)

MetodologintRevisiloginternos SAIH, si pertinente (enión para la Liberación”as preguntator(a) puede incluir otras preguntas, y dejar algunas de las pregu aDonantes, planes operativos anuales, y material

elaborado en el proyecto.

Entrevistas con representantes de las contrapartes, SAIH, y otros actores pertinentes.

Entrevistas individuales con informantes claves de organizaciones sociales y del grupo meta (incluyendo funcionarios pos pformantes nisterio de educación, universidades, institutos normales, IPELC, Institutos de lengua y Cultura).

Entrevistas de grupos, con representantes del grupo meta.

Observaciones de reuniones.

Fases/calendario (tentativo, se puede ajustar un poco)

La evaluación tendrá las siguientes fases en el período: Marzo – julio 2016

Selección tendrá las siguientes fases en el marzo

Preparación tendrá las siguientes fa marzo

Presentación tendrá las siguientes fases en abril

Trabajo de campo - aproximadamente abril-mayo

Escribir informe preliminar - mayo

Entregar informe preliminar a SAIH y contrapartes - 1 de junio

Revisar informe preliminar a SAIH y contrapartes - 1 de M junio

Integrar informe preliminar a SAIH y contrapartes - 1 de junio

Entrega del informe final en español - 1 de julio

Entrega de informe final en inglés - 1 agosto

Presentación informe final en inglés - 1 de agosto - agosto-octubre

Requisitos de la evaluadora/el evaluador, o el equipo de evaluadores, en orden de importancia

Profesional(es) con experiencia como evaluador/a(s) de proyectos de cooperación internacional, con un enfoque en métodos participativos, y con un grado universitario.

Dominio fluido del español evaluador/a(s) de proyectos Es también fluido del español evaluador/a(s) de proyectos de cooperación en inglés o noruego.

Buen conocimiento de la realidad actual y la sociedad civil en Bolivia.

Conocimiento de la realidad actual y la sociedad civil en inglés o internacional, con un enfoque en métodos participativos, y conocimiento

Conocimiento de la cooperación internacional y el contexto noruego.

SAIH y las contrapartes queremos usar la evaluación en el contexto de cooperación internacional, con un enfoque en métodos participativos. Ninguna persona del equipo de evaluadores debe tener un interés personal en el proyecto.

evaluación del equipo de evaluadores debe tener texto en inglés o internacional, con un enfoque en métodos participativos, y con las preguntas del equipo de evaluadores de diferentes sexos.

El líder del equipo debe desarrollar evaluadores de diferentes idiomas o internacional, con un enfoque en métodos participativos, y con las preguntas de los diferentes miembros del equipo.

Especificar informe

El informe se debe escribir en español y se debe traducir a inglés. El informe se entregará como un documento electrónico en español y se debe traducir al inglés o internacional contenido:

Lista de contenido.

Un resumen que se puede leer independiente, donde se incluye los principales hallazgos, las principales conclusiones y recomendaciones.

El objetivo de la evaluación

Las principales preguntas de investigación

Una justificación de preguntas de independiente, donde se incluye los principales hallazgos, la evaluación

Una presentación de los hallazgos y una presentación de los hallazgos y dando ejemplos concretos.

Recomendaciones deben de ser claramente relacionadas de las conclusiones, y presentadas por separado.

Recomendaciones deben de ser claramente relacionadas de las conclusiones de diferentes actores.

Los siguientes deben de ser claramente relacionadas de las conclusiones de diferentes actores. r principales conclusiones y temas, y con las preguntas de

preguntas), lista de abreviaciones, bibliografía de las conclusiones de evaluadores (si es un equipo).

Annex 2: Original methodological and data collection tools

This annex exists in Spanish and can be found in the Spanish version of the document. It includes the questions that were asked of Key informants, experts, focus groups discussions, observations as well as a short questionnaire. The objective of this annex has been to delineate the questions that were asked in relation to the terms of reference.

Annex 3: List of Interviewees

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - CEADL

Date	Type of Meeting	Name	Sex		Organization	Position
			M	F		
09/05/2016	Entrevista con Funcionarios de CEADL	Juan Carlos Balderas	X		CEADL	Director CEADL
		José A. Miranda	X		CEADL	Presidente del Directorio
		Gonzalo Huananca	X		CEADL	Responsable CEADL - El Alto
		Alejandro Landivar	X		CEADL	Responsable Observatorio de RRNN
		Eliza Quispe		X	CEADL	Responsable de Capacitación La Paz
		Fabiola Orante		X	CEADL	Responsable CEADI - Sucre
		Rosmery Quispe Condori		X	CEADL	Responsable de Género
		Victor Alanoca Osco	X		CEADL	Contador
		Joel Ibarra	X		CEADL	Técnico Tarija
		Orlando Barrera	X		CEADL	CEADL - Sucre
		Juan Pablo Flores	X		CEADL	CEADL
		Marcelo Higuera	X		CEADL	CEADL
Edwin Chura	X		CEADL	CEADL		
09/05/2016	Grupo Focal Organizaciones	Felix tapia	X		CODEPANAL	Vicepresidente
		Fanny Cornejo Rivera		X	CODEPANAL	Presidente

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - CEADL

Beneficiarias					
09/05/2016	Grupo Focal Jóvenes Beneficiarios (Liderazgo)	Ana María Vargas Salazar	X	CODEPANAL	Responsable de Actas
		Mario Salazar	X	CODEPANAL	Chuquisaca
		Jimena Llave	X	CODEPANAL	Chuquisaca
		Lizbeth Cervantes	X	ASE	Representante
		Beymar Flores	X	Carrera de Derecho	Representante
		Rene Vargas	X	Nación Originaria Yamparaes	Representante
		Elba Tola Colque	X	Unidad Educativa España	Representante
		Alejandro Miguel Poma Bautista	X	Unidad Educativa España	Representante
		Edwin Siñani Aruquipa	X	Concejo Municipal El Alto	Representante
		Jhovana Velasco Mamani	X	Unidad de la Juventud	Representante
Rodrigo Paredes Chipana	X	Siempre Latente	Representante		
Juan Carlos Mita Nina	X	Siempre Latente	Representante		
José Marcelo Ortega	X	Siempre Latente	Representante		
Luis Eloy Bravo	X	CMJS-RJS	Representante		
Felicidad Ibarra Bejarano	X	Nación Qhara Qhara	Representante		
Gladys Deisy Fernández Suxo	X	Siempre Latente	Representante		
Paola Ruth Rodríguez Mamani	X	Siempre Latente	Representante		
Yerko Huanaco	X	Siempre Latente	Representante		
Alfredo Huallpa Machaca	X		Representante		

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - CEADL

Lucia María Flores	X	Siempre Latente	Representante
Lesli Choque Limachi	X	Siempre Latente	Representante
Elba Tola Colque	X	Unidad Educativa España	Representante
Alejandro Miguel Poma Bautista	X	Unidad Educativa España	Representante
Efrain Huallpa	X	Nación Qhara Qhara	Representante
Gerardo García	X	Nación Qhara Qhara	Representante
Francisco López Garnica	X	Nación Qhara Qhara	Representante
María Vanesa Sánchez	X	Concejo Mun. Juventud Sucre	Representante
Ángeles Mamani Rocha	X	Cambio Climático USFX	Representante

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - Fe y Alegría

Date	Type of Meeting	Name	Sex		Organization	Position
			M	F		
10/05/2016	Entrevista con Funcionarios de Fe y Alegría	Yerko Camacho Girona	X		Fe y Alegría	Sub Director Nacional
		Miguel Marca	X		Fe y Alegría	Asesor Nacional
		Antonio Cortez Flores	X		Fe y Alegría	Administrador Nacional
		Edwin Mamani	X		Fe y Alegría	Coordinador de Proyecto
10/05/2016	Grupo Focal	Catalina Paco Chiara		X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Docente

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - Fe y Alegría

Date	Type of Meeting	Name	Sex	Organization	Position
10/05/2016	Docentes de Unidades Educativas Beneficiarias	Nady Alave Ticona	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Directora Turno Mañana
		Juan Carlos Ramos Mamani	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Docente
		Hernan Pablo Quispe Quispe	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Directora Turno Tarde
		María Magdalena Ramos Ichula	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Docente
		Yuri Iván Huayta Chuquimia	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Docente
	Grupo Focal Alumnos de Unidades Educativas Beneficiarias	Waldo Quispe Corazón	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Alumno
		Yesica Plata Plata	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Alumna
		Kevin Roel Choque Choque	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Alumno
		Rosa Elizabeth Callizaya Flores	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Alumna
		Gabriela Condori Choquehuanca	X	Unidad Educativa Yunguyo	Alumna

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS – FENATRAHOB

Date	Type of Meeting	Name	Sex		Organization	Position
			M	F		
10/05/2016	Entrevista con Funcionarios FENATRAHOB	Gregoria Gabriel	X		FENATRAHOB	Secretaria Ejecutiva
		Prima Ocsa	X		FENATRAHOB	Secretaria de Relaciones
		Graciela Choque	X		FENATRAHOB	Secretaria de Hacienda
		Lucy Arce	X		FENATRAHOB	Secretaria Organización

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - FUNPROEIB ANDES

Date	Type of Meeting	Name	Sex		Organization	Position
			M	F		
11/05/2016	Entrevista con Funcionarios de FUNPROEIB Andes	Guido Machhaca	X		FUNPROEIB ANDES	Director Ejecutivo
		Nohemi Mengoa		X	FUNPROEIB ANDES	Administradora
		José Luis Chuñagua	X		FUNPROEIB ANDES	Contador
		Carlos Callapa	X		FUNPROEIB ANDES	Tecnico de Proyectos
		Cinthias Duran		X	FUNPROEIB ANDES	Asistente Ejecutiva
		Mónica Navarro		X	FUNPROEIB ANDES	Coordinadora de Proyectos
		Mayra Ponce		X	FUNPROEIB ANDES	Coordinadora de Proyectos
11/05/2016	Grupo Focal Beneficiarios de Maestría	Epifanya Guara Guara Wilca	X		Beneficiario Maestría	Beneficiaria
		Rosario Saavedra Saravia	X		Beneficiario Maestría	Beneficiaria
		Miguel Adonay Soria Guerra	X		Beneficiario Maestría	Beneficiario
11/05/2016	Grupo Focal Beneficiarios Nación Yuracaré	Miguel Núñez	X		Nación Yuracaré	Dirigente de Concejo Educativo
		Mercy Noe		X	Nación Yuracaré	Comunicación Plurilingüe
11/05/2016	Entrevista PROEIB - Universidad Mayor de San Simón	Marina Arratia		X	PROEIB ANDES	Coordinadora MEI - PROEIB Andes Facultad de Humanidades
		Francisco Javier Baya	X		UMSS	Director Académico Facultad de

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - FUNPROEIB ANDES

Humanidades					
18/05/2016	Grupo Focal Nación Urus	Nilto Chino Copa	X	Nación Urus	Uruchipaya Provincia Sabaya Oruro - Secretario de Proyectos
		Ciriaco Inda Colque	X	Nación Urus	Responsable Proyecto
		Marcos Condori Mollo	X	Nación Urus	Coordinación EBI Uru
18/05/2016	Grupo Focal CONAFRO	Juan Carlos Ballivián	X	CONAFRO	Ejecutivo CONAFRO
		Hector Paez	X	CONAFRO	Secretario de Comunicación
		Zenaida Pérez	X	CONAFRO	Técnico
		Dino Luque Arrascaita	X	CONAFRO	Técnico
11/05/2016	Grupo Focal Diplomados Gestión Educativa Intercultural	Milka Mamani	X		Beneficiaria
		María Boliviar	X		Beneficiaria
		Amilcar Cano	X		Beneficiaria
11/05/2016	Grupo Focal Lenguas Indígenas	Simón Choque	X		Beneficiaria
		Nohemí Flores	X		Beneficiaria

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - CDIMA

Fecha	Tipo de Reunión	Nombre	Sexo	Organización	Cargo
			M F		

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - CDIMA

12/05/2016	Entrevista con Funcionarios de CDIMA	Rosa Jalja	X	CDIMA	Directora
		Teresa Condori	X	CDIMA	Coordinadora General
		Ricardo Mendoza	X	CDIMA	Técnico
		Maritza Cahuapasa	X	CDIMA	Técnico
		Gabriel Tenorio	X	CDIMA	Comunicación
12/05/2016	Grupo Focal Beneficiarios Liderazgo (Jóvenes)	Gladys Cahuana Núñez	X	Población Totora	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2014
		Josué René Yujra Cutila	X	Provincia Camacho	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2014
		Gladys Mamani Tambo	X	Provincia Murillo	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2015
		Francisca Cori	X	Moco Moco	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2013
		Vanesa Cerda	X	Municipio Desaguadero	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2013
		Roxana Blanco Yujra	X	Ciudad de El Alto	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2013
		Julio Choquehuanca Triguero	X	Población Jesus de Machaca	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2013
		Eugenio Fernández Huanca	X	Provincia Aroma	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2013
		Wilder Colque Chipana	X	Provincia Omasuyos	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2014
		Julia Choquehuanca Cerezo	X	Ciudad de El Alto	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2015
Gonzalo Chavez Siñani	X	Población Batallas	Beneficiario Liderazgo 2015		
12/05/2016	Grupo Focal Beneficiarios Liderazgo (Mujeres)	Reyna Felisa Limachi Quispe	X	Municipio de Copacabana	Presidenta de la Junta Escolar
		Filomena Mamani Zabala	X	Alcaldia de Santiago de Machaca	Concejal Municipal

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - CDIMA

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - CEFOS ESCOMA

Date	Type of Meeting	Name	Sex		Organization	Position
			M	F		
13/05/2016	Entrevista con Funcionarios de CEFOS Escoma	Ascencio Cahuaya	X		CEFOS ESCOMA	Coordinador de Proyecto
		Orlando Astorga	X		CEFOS ESCOMA	Director General de la Obra en Escoma
		Boris Rodríguez	X		CEFOS ESCOMA	Contador
13/05/2016	Grupo Focal Beneficiarios	Lucia Cochi Turco		X	Unidad Educativa Escoma	Directora
		Nieves Quispe Calcina	X		Provincia Omasuyos	Ejecutiva Provincial

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS - ITEI

Date	Type of Meeting	Name	Sex		Organization	Position
			M	F		
13/05/2016	Entrevista con Funcionarios de ITEI	Emma Bolshia Bravo		x	ITEI	Directora
		Federico Chipana	X		ITEI	Coordinador de Proyecto
13/05/2016	Grupo Focal Beneficiarios	Rodrigo Poma Charca		x	Población Achacachi	Beneficiario

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS-GENERAL


Date	Name	Organization
13/06/2016	Luis Fernando Sarango	Pushak, Pluriversidad, Ecuador
13/06/2016	Leticia Castillo	Uracan, Nicargua
13/06/2016	Rasalba Ipia	CRIC
13/06/2016	Jose Saballos	Uracan, Nicargua

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS-GENERAL

20/05/2016	Eva Maria Fjellheim	Programme advisor, Colombia and Nicaragua, SAIH
19/05/2016	Live Bjorge	Programe Advisor, SAIH
19/05/2016	Kari Lindemann	Programe Advisor, SAIH
24/05/2016	Nicklas Poulsen	SAIH Board

Annex 4-11

Annexes 4-11 consist of supporting documentation for the claims made here in. They are lengthy detailed descriptions of all activities conducted, the status of each as well as the responses to each and every recommendation made in previous evaluations. Since this information comes directly from documentation that has been provided to SAIH or organizational document, as may be relevant, this has not been translated. Hence the original version can be found in the Spanish version of this report.

 +41 78 790 9311 info@policyresearchinstitute.org

Registration #: CHF-467.113.214

POLICY
RESEARCH INSTITUTE

www.policyresearchinstitute.org