

**THE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM OF THE REGION OF
MOPTI (PDRM)**

Mission Evangélique Luthérienne au Mali (MELM)



FINAL EVALUATION

By

Hilde Nielszen

&

Saliki Coulibaly

Sévaré, Mali

December, 2014

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements.....	2
List of abbreviations used	3
Preface	4
Executive Summary.....	7
1. Background to the Assignment	11
1.1. Background to the PDRM Programme	11
1.2. Summary of Terms of References for the Review	13
1.3. Methods and Program for the Review	13
2. The PDRM-MELM Programme	16
2.1. Objectives	16
2.2. Strategic Partnerships and Political Priorities.....	17
2.3. MELMs Engagement within the Development Sector	18
2.4. Summary of the Programme Period 2012-2015	19
2.5. Summary.....	21
3. Response to the Terms of Reference.....	22
3.1. The PDRM Programme and its Organization	22
3.2. Project Implementation.....	23
3.3. A Note on Female Circumcision, the Victims, and Training.....	31
3.4. Handling Tensions and Conflicts.....	32
3.5. Strategic Planning, Monitoring and Reporting	33
3.6. Programme Management.....	34
3.7. Human Resources.....	36
3.8. The Making of Project Documents and Communication of Results.....	37
3.9. Cooperation with Other Partners.....	38
3.10. The Relationship between PDRM and MELM, NMS and DIGNI.....	39
3.11. Summary	39
4. Conclusions and Recommendations: General and Specific.....	41
4.1. General Recommendations.....	41
4.2. Recommendations for NMS and DIGNI	41
4.3. Recommendations for PDRM, MELM & NMS	41
4.4. Summary.....	44
5. Annexures.....	45
Annex 5.1. Terms of Reference.....	45
Annex 5.2. Communities and Municipalities Visited.....	48
Annex 5.3. List of Interlocutors	48
Annex 5.4. List of Documents Consulted	53
Annex 5.5. Itinerary for Field Trip	54

Acknowledgements

The Review Team wishes to thank all the people who have contributed to this report. First of all we would like to express our gratitude to Mr. Ngayap Moïse, Director of MELM, Mr. Helge Vatne, Head of the Department of Deaconry, MELM, Mr. Samuel Gouda, Head of the Department of Evangelization and Christian Education, MELM, and Mrs Else Storaas Vatne, the Head Representative of the Norwegian Missionary Society (NMS) in Mali who generously shared with us their views and concerns. We would also like to express our gratitude to the staffs of PDRM for organizing the field trip and facilitating this joint exercise. In particular, we wish to record our appreciation for discussions with Mr. Alahidy Barry (Programme Coordinator), Hamadoun Tamboura (Assistant Coordinator), Mrs Kone Gabdo Cisse (responsible for monitoring the programme), Mr Souleymane Diamoye (Supervisor Borondougou), Mr. Moussa Diabate, (Supervisor Fatoma and Kounari) and Mrs. Dakoua Rosalie Dembele (Supervisor Konna) for their clarifications and willingness to discuss every aspect of their work. We would like to thank Mr Allaye Dicko, Mr Hamadoun Cisse, Mr Brahim Arou, Mrs Adame Maiga, Mr Mathia Bocoum, and Mrs Bagayogo Oumou Baya, for discussions and for accompanying us in the field.

We will also express our gratitude to the various representatives from the government administration on regional, district and municipal levels, in particular Mr Modibo Kane Togo, Sous-prefet of Fatoma, Mr Zédyol Dougnon, Sous-préfet of Konna, Mrs Diallo Mama Diarra, Directrice Régionale de la Femme de l'Enfant et de la Famille, and Mr Madougou Aklini, Chef de la division de la femme. Furthermore, we wish to thank all the voluntary animators and committee members we have met within the programme on the municipal and village level. They all generously shared their experiences and information (see annexure of the list of people met for details). We wish to thank all members of the local communities we visited who were willing to spend time with us to share their experiences of the Programme, and show us the results of the work. In particular we express our gratitude to the Village Chiefs, religious leaders and the many other resource persons we met. Valuable contributions have also been provided by Ragnhild Mestad from the Program Department in NMS Head Office, Norway.

Overall our experience of the work of the review has been both rewarding and enjoyable. The team has been privileged to have worked with so many dedicated Malian colleagues.

The views expressed in this Report are those of the consultancy team and do not necessarily represent the positions of DIGNI, NMS, MELM, or other groups or individuals interviewed by the Review Team.

Hilde Nielssen & Saliki Coulibaly

Sévaré, December, 2014

List of abbreviations used

Set of initials : Development

AGR or IGA	: Incomes Generating Activities
ATR or RBA	: Retrained traditional village midwives
ADL or LDA	: Local Development Agent
APECF	: Association Of Peer Educators of the Commune of Fatoma
BD	: Board of Directors
CAP	: Knowledge Attitudes and Practices
CCAPN	: Municipal Action Committee for the Abandonment of Harmful Practices
CNAPN:	: National Committee for the Abandonment of Harmful
CVAPN	: Practices Village Action Committee for the Abandonment of Harmful Practices
CIP	: Interpersonal Communication
CRC	: Convention on the Rights of Children
DRPFEF	: Regional Office for the Promotion of Women, Children and Family.
EDSM-IV	: Health Forth Demographic Survey in Mali
FGM	: Female Genital Mutilation
IEC	: Information Education and Communication
MELM	: Lutheran Evangelical Mission in Mali
MGF or FGM	: Female Genital Mutilation (female circumcision)
NMS	: The Norwegian Mission Society
ONG or NGO	: Non-Governmental Organization
ORTM	: Mali Radio and TV Office
MELM	: Project for the Development of Mopti Region- Lutheran Evangelical Mission in Mali
PDESC	: Municipal (Commune) Economic, Social and Cultural Development Plan
PNLE	: National Program for the Fight against the practice of the Female Genital Mutilation
PSI/Mali	: Population Service International Mali
URTEL	: <i>Malian Union of Free Radio and Television Broadcasters</i>
VAD	: Home visits

Preface

The work against female genital mutilation (FGM) and the promotion of women is an important area of support in Norwegian development aid to Mali. The current support to development work from Norway to Mali is today mainly channelled through NGOs. Among these are the Norwegian Missionary Society (NMS).

FGM or female circumcision constitutes a considerable health problem in Mali. Mali is also a country where the majority of the population have limited access to health care institutions. Life expectancy is short, child mortality high. Malaria and infectious diseases are the most important causes of child mortality. For women, pregnancy and birth are major causes of death.

The intervention zone is located in the Sahel belt, a marginal area both in terms of ecology, economy and politics. Livelihood is dominated by subsistence farming, animal husbandry and pastoralism. Food is often scarce in periods before harvest, and malnutrition is a vast problem. And while the Mopti region in later years has seen a certain progress in terms of improved infrastructure and general development, the political crisis and violent conflict have implied a serious drawback. The intervention zone was situated in the middle of the combat zone in 2012, when Islamist rebels occupied the area. As always in war, violence also affected the local population. In addition, the war had consequences for the subsistence production and economic activities in general. Fields were left unattended and harvests lost because of the conflict. Income generating activities stopped. The population still suffers from the consequences.

Many children in in the intervention zone lack access to schools, and among those who attend schooling, the dropout rates are very high. Consequently, a large proportion of the adult population is illiterate. While literacy has a value in itself, it is also important for the ability to engage in the public arena of a modern society. It is for instance an important tool for the local population to communicate and cooperate with the government or NGO's. Literacy is therefore essential for the empowerment of the population.

An important asset of the Programme for the Development of the Mopti Region (PDRM) is its particular innovative holistic development approach which aims to build upon local initiatives and local decision making. Local ownership, participation and relevance are important key-words. This approach aims to bridge the gap between a traditional intervention approach (where projects intervene in a way that tends to make people into passive recipients) and local ownership and participation. By initiating processes of change, the Programme seeks to induce a long term and sustainable process of self-development. Equally important, Programme intervention is made in close cooperation with the local authorities. The Programme's integrated cooperation with the Malian government and its structures and agents on regional and local level represents a pioneer effort in the context of development work

PRDM has in spite of a relatively short timeline and difficult working conditions achieved impressive results: In general terms, the outcome of the Programme has, together with its added value, clearly benefitted the Malian society and women in particular in the intervention zone. In more specific terms, The Review Team would like to emphasize the following: The way the Programme has

succeeded in establishing a discourse on FMG in a setting where the subject has been highly tabooed, represents a significant outcome. Furthermore, sensitization and training have resulted in a new awareness and knowledge of the consequences and dangers of the practice. Entire communities have now officially declared the abandonment of the practice of FGM as a consequence of the Programme. 2/3 of the villages involved in the Programme had by the time of this evaluation made a collective stand against FGM by signing a declaration witnessed by local authorities. The Programme has also affected living conditions in a broad sense, in terms of improving women's role and position in society, improved health conditions, increased income, nutrition, literacy and environmental protection. The Programme has managed to mobilize local communities, local leaders, and local and regional governmental administration to engage in the cause (by participating in planning, organization and monitoring activities). In each community involved, voluntaries has been mobilized and trained as voluntary animators engaged in sensitization. Religious leaders have been mobilized to engage. The Programme has contributed to the establishment and vitalization of local organizations engaging in the fight against FMG as well as local development in general. Such women's and village organizations not only stimulate women's participation in decision making, but engage the village population in new ways, and thus in a broader perspective contribute to the enforcement of village democracy. People have become more able to take responsibility for the development of their local communities. Thus, empowerment of women in particular, but also of the local communities as a whole is a significant result.

The innovative holistic development approach applied in the fight against FMG has been an important key to the Programme's success. This particular approach largely explains the level of motivation, engagement and local ownership that the Review Team observed in the visited communities. Importantly, in the local communities engaged by the Programme, the abandonment of FMG is to a large degree seen as an integrated part of the process of local development. Local mobilization also contributes to the cost efficiency of the Programme, enabling it to reach a large area and a large number of villages with relatively limited means.

The methods of work by the Review Team have been mainly qualitative. Given the focus upon evaluating the operational aspects of the program, a significant amount of time was spent visiting villages and interviewing a representative selection of key stakeholders and beneficiaries.

In assessing the operational aspects of the Programme, the Review team has paid particular attention to the following key issues: the cooperation with local authorities (and other agents/partners/structures); the level of local participation and contribution, training and sensitization; sustainability in all level and all senses; and the relations between the various components of the Programme (in particular between the fight against FGM and accompanying activities)

The Programme is one of several agents of change within the field of women's reproductive health in Mali. It affects, but is also affected by, larger cultural, social and political processes, both at a local and national level. It has therefore been important to ground the review within the social and cultural realities, both from a local and national perspective.

Although the time for the review and was short, the Review Team considers the information gathered and analysis presented here are sufficiently clear with precise conclusions and recommendations. We have therefore endeavoured to phrase the recommendations as concrete and as useful a way as possible.

A Mid-Term Review of the PDRM Programme was conducted in 2011. From 2009 to 2012, PDRM coordinated two different projects in separate geographical locations: an integrated rural development project with a focus on the management of natural resources (NRM) in the southern parts of the rural municipalities in the Seeno area, and a project dedicated to the fight against FGM, accompanied by development projects in the municipality of Konna. The invasion by Islamist rebels in early 2012 forced the Programme to abandon the Seeno-based project and relocate its resources to the other project, which were subsequently expanded to four other municipalities. Thus, a large proportion of the Programme now in function was initiated as late as in 2012. The last of municipalities involved in the Programme was implemented in May 2014. The scope of this Review will therefore the period between 2012 and 2015.



The women’s group in Time performs a dance.

Executive Summary

This Review was conducted by Dr. Hilde Nielsen (Senior Researcher, University of Bergen, Norway), and Saliki Coulibaly (Assistant Medical, Chargé de Suivi Evaluation, Secretariat Exécutif, Haut Conseil de la Lutte contre le SIDA, Mali). The Review required the team to assess the operational aspects of the programme, its progress and results as compared to the plans established by the MELM and NMS. The Terms of Reference required the Team to assess the structure, functioning, efficiency and impact of the programme. The review also required assessment of the achievements in terms of relevance, results, design, implementation, impact and sustainability. Other aspects to be considered by the Team included assessing the accompanying activities of the Programme's main goal of fighting against FGM, the relationship with MELM and NMS and the programme's relation to MELM and NMS goals and strategies.

The methods adopted by the Review Team included an extensive field trip, interviews with staffs, relevant organisations and institutions, volunteer workers, and representatives of beneficiaries of the program, as well as documentary analysis. The assignment was carried out smoothly with excellent cooperation from the MELM and NMS and its staff and institutions.

The Review Team concluded that PDRM is a well-conceived, strategic and innovative programme which represents a significant contribution to the fight for the abandonment of FGM, to women empowerment, to the enforcement of local democracy and civil society, to rural development and improved living conditions in the intervention zone. The Programme has established effective administrative and financial procedures, and innovative and successful working methods. It is well lead and the management team has responded to challenges in a timely, creative and constructive manner. The main recommendations arising from the appraisal are as follows:

- The work initiated by PDRM needs to be continued, and should be supported by Norway as it has an important contribution to the fight against FGM, and to improved reproductive health and life conditions for women in Mali. Experiences gained through its innovative holistic approach have potentials to benefit efforts also in a larger national context.
- DIGNI should continue to support its Strategic Partnership with the MELM and NMS in Mali. At the conclusion of the current contract in 2015, DIGNI should give serious consideration to a new programme.
- MELM and NMS should seek to find ways to continue and secure the sustainability of the work established through the PDRM Programme.
- Further pursue and elaborate the participative approach, so that not only local initiative, mobilization and participation are secured, but also local ownership. Work to solidify established structures (CVAPN etc.) and prioritize capacity building (not least volunteers, resource persons, and leaders).

- Sensitization needs to be pursued and followed up in all communities involved, to secure real and future abandonment of FGM. However, it would be wise for the future to consider a system of gradual reduction of the frequency of sensitization activities, in accordance with the results and progress achieved. Secure that the volunteers maintain a reasonable work load. Engage men in the sensitization of men (peer communication).
- The strategy of cooperation with religious leaders should be pursued and followed up.
- The circumcisers represent one of the Programme's key target groups, and developing a clearer strategy Vis à Vis this group should therefore be considered. How may ex-circumcisers become key resource persons? How can the loss of social standing and income following the abandonment of FGM be dealt with?
- The Programme should build on experiences made so far to systematically develop methods for how traditional, cultural and experiential knowledge may be transformed into a resource for development. Working through existing cultural systems may facilitate social change.
- Define the role and position of voluntary animators within the work force structure and planning in a more long term perspective. Take into account local variations of competence and skills when defining role and activities. Consider to offer a form of compensation for an initial period. Consider offering a certificate (or similar) as a honorary sign of the position, as well as forms of attestation that may document training completed as well as the experienced-based knowledge obtained through the work.
- Further elaborate the programme's approach in terms of social and cultural sensitivity and adaption of work strategies and methods to local variations, as well as local reluctance, resistance and social tensions. Pursue and further elaborate the sensitization approach, which focusses on a dialogue that rests on the reasons behind the practice, along with its pros and cons, and that these are dissected and debated in light of both traditional values and universal principles of human rights.
- Develop systems of sharing models of good practice (ideas, competence, cooperation) both between the different municipalities in the Programme, and between the different local communities within a municipality.
- Consider to adjust the level of support of accompanying activities in accordance with village size.
- Maintain IGAs as a significant part of the Programme's profile. However, for a new programme, consider to integrate such activities as part of a holistic integrated development approach.
- Continue to develop strategies for systematizing and organizing exchange of experience, ideas and competence among the PDRM field teams.

- Organize competitions i.e. the introduction of a PDRM prize which might be awarded to the most improved village, most innovative project. Such prizes would both motivate and reward; and also reinforce a sense of common identity across the intervention zone.
- For the future, and for a new programme: consider to integrate a stronger emphasis on the following up of the victims of circumcision.
- For a future programme, the Team advises MELM to concentrate further geographical expansion to areas in proximity with those already involved. This is vital both to the impact of the programme and sustainability of the abandonment. The aim should be to create a strong enclave within the Mopti region – an FGM free zone.
- Include in training of project staff: Cultural sensitivity approach, communication, negotiation, advocacy, techniques for establishing partnerships, conflict management and conflict prevention.
- For a next programme, produce a Strategic Plan that includes a more long-term perspective with milestones related not only to level of project implementation, output/outcome/impact, but also for stepwise withdrawal from villages and further expansion to others. Such an overall strategic plan should function as point of reference for annual plans and reports. The challenges are similar to those faced elsewhere: the balance needs to be kept between quantity and quality when managing expansion. Plan for the sustainability should be implemented in the programme's strategic plan.
- The Team advises NMS and the Programme to evaluate and revise the procedures of budget planning and management. Budget planning and management should take into account eventualities such as currency fluctuation and salary adjustments, in order to prevent budget cuts in the middle of a budget period. The Programme should aim at avoiding delays of disbursements.
- Develop a Crises Manual, with procedures for crisis management and communication.
- The Team advises NMS, Digni and MELM to contribute to secure professionalism in all senses; that terms of employment and work conditions are just and adequate. The Programme should strive to maintain the principle of good governance in a manner that makes the programme worthy of support by the Norwegian government. Transparency and professionalism should be maintained in personnel management. The Team also advises the Programme to review the work conditions, and secure that the staff's work load is adequate (the LDA in particular).
- Develop a strategy for continuous capacity building and additional training of staff, in order for the programme to be able to renew it self and maintain creativity and innovation. Consider to offer complementary training to that already offered, such as computer skills, and management of personnel and conflicts.

- For a next programme, consider to develop a Human Resource Development Plan (with emphasis on capacity building and training), in order to secure a coherent and coordinated approach.
- Serious attention be given to improving and rationalizing the production of program documents (plans and reports), by: Evaluating established systems and routines for planning, reporting and monitoring, and make sure that they are rational and not too and time-consuming. Improve the efficiency of the process of writing and approval. Improve the quality of project documents by using clear standards and a descriptive mode with examples. Include in reports of activities the contributions of all counterparts, the local communities included. Evaluate the system of indicators and significantly reduce their number.
- Taking the 'PDRM-MELM' message' to a larger audience: Make a determined effort to publicize successes and experiences. Develop "marketing strategies". For a next programme consider to set aside funds to use the internet and other forms of communication to inform the wider world of the programme's successes.
- Pursue and further elaborate strategies of mass communication (for instance film projections, conferences, theatre etc.) and develop communication strategies and other aspects of the approach to social, ethnic and cultural variations.
- Consider networking and the establishment of cooperative links with other NGOs. For a new programme: Consider setting aside funds for staff visiting exchanges with other projects in Mali or elsewhere.
- The role, position and organization of development work within MELM should be clarified before initiating a new development programme.

1. Background to the Assignment

1.1. Background to the PDRM Programme

PDRM-MELM was developed by *The Evangelical Lutheran Mission in Mali* (MELM) in cooperation with *The Norwegian Missionary Society* (NMS), and established in 2009 as a coordinating programme that embraced two different projects situated in separate geographical locations in the northern part of the Mopti region: One project was dedicated to integrated rural development with an emphasis on natural resource management. This project involved 30 villages and camps, and was situated in the southern parts of the rural municipalities of Dallah, Kerena, and Haire (the Seeno area). The second project had a main emphasis on the fight against Female Genital Mutilation (FGM), accompanied by development activities aimed at supporting the project's main objective. The project was carried out in 16 villages in the northern and eastern part of the municipality of Konna. From 2009 to spring 2012, the Programme management was based in the town Douentza. Three field teams were attached to the Programme; one in Konna and two in Seeno.

A Mid-Term Review (MTR) was conducted in 2011 and focused in particular on the progress of the operational aspects of PDRM, its achievements in terms of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability and adherence to the original plans. Potential areas for improvement were identified, lessons learned and risk assessment addressed. The MTR concluded that PDRM was a well-conceived and strategic programme with the potential to make a significant contribution to sustainable development, environmental protection, the fight against FGM and empowerment of women in Mali. The MTR also provided a series of recommendations for the improvement of the Programme (including the need to improve the principles and management of the activities accompanying the fight against FGM, the need to consolidate the assets of current activities and to develop a clearer strategy for the activities involved in both a short-term and long-term perspective). In this Review many of the issues and concerns expressed in the MTR are taken up again.

While the Programme is supported by the Norwegian Missionary Society (NMS), the main financial partner is the Norwegian Government through NORAD (The Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation), channelled through Digni, which is an umbrella organization for several Norwegian church and missionary associations. Support was first granted for a five-year period between 2009 and 2013, but the support has received prolonged funding for 2014 and 2015, due to the events in 2012.

The political crisis and violent events of 2012 necessitated drastic changes of the Programme in its second and final phase. In early 2012, Islamist rebels from the north occupied the areas of programme intervention, which subsequently became a combat zone. The situation seriously affected all communities involved in the Programme. Even after the Islamists were forced back by Malian and French forces, the security situation in Seeno remained critical, and it was therefore decided to withdraw the project from the area. The resources connected to this project were instead relocated to the second project within the programme. While maintaining activity in Konna, the intervention zone was

further expanded in May 2012 by including the three municipalities Kounari, Fatouma and Borondougou. In April 2014 the programme also initiated work in a fifth municipality: Bassiro. Thus, since 2012, the entire Programme has focussed its efforts on the promotion of women and the fight for the abandonment of FGM, supported by accompanying activities, based on the model initiated in Konna in 2009. The main scope of this Review will therefore be the period between 2012 and 2015.

The Final Review is conducted at a point where the Programme is about to enter its final phase of Norwegian support (2009-2015). The Review will serve as a point of departure for decision making within MELM and NMS concerning further development work in Mali. The Review Team bear this in mind when writing its recommendations.



The CCAPN in Fatouma demonstrating sensitization tools

1.2. Summary of Terms of References for the Review

The two main purposes of the Review are: 1) The Review should be a learning process for programme management and staffs, MELM and NMS. 2) The Review should serve as a preparation for future decisions, and the Report will serve as a foundation for decisions by MELM and NMS concerning future development work in Mali. A full version of the Terms of Reference can be found as an annexure to this Report, but to summarize their requirements it can be stated that the Review required a focus on the following:

1. Evaluate the relevance of the programme in the intervention zone (both the main objective and the accompanying activities).
2. Identify the results (at output and outcome level) with a focus on both successes and limitations. This includes assessing the
 - a) programme design: Is the current approach effective?
 - b) programme implementation: Are plans carried out correctly in terms of effectiveness and efficiency?
3. Assess the impact and sustainability of the project work.
4. Assess the role of the accompanying activities as an instrument for accomplishing the general objective of the project.
5. Examine if the recommendations from the Mid-Term Review have been followed-up.
6. Identify NMS and MELM's impact on the result.
7. Evaluate to what extent the programme contributes to achieve the main goals of MELM, and assess its relevance and coherence with MELM's priorities and work methods.
8. Evaluate to what degree the programme supports the goals and strategies of NMS.
9. Assess the quality of interaction and cooperation at the superior level (decision making, management and interaction between the bodies involved, PDRM-MELM, MELM, NMS and Digni).

1.3. Methods and Program for the Review

The methods of work used by the Review Team were largely qualitative involving in-depth interviews with key informants, group interviews and observations in the field. The ambition was to invite the target groups as well as Programme employees and partners to actively contribute to the initial analysis of the findings, and together with the Team determine the achievements, strengths and weaknesses of the PDRM programme's implementation. This approach permits the various actors to draw their own conclusions and reflect upon lessons learned, which is important for the continuation and next phases of the Programme. The Team's work in Mali was concentrated to 14 days, between the 17th to 30th November. There were 5 phases of work:

The first phase involved documentary analysis. A comprehensive set of documents was provided in advance of the field visit to Mali including Annual Reports, the original Programme Document of 2009 and the Mid-Term Review of 2011. On the team's arrival in Mali additional files on PDRM and other documents relevant to PDRMs work, were made available to the Team. A number of other

documents dealing with financial matters were also analysed by the team. A full list of documents consulted is found as an annexure to this Report.

The second phase was focussed upon initial meetings, discussions and interviews with key members of the PDRM staff in Sévaré.

The third phase was the six days field trip to villages and municipal centres engaged in the programme. The itinerary is also found as an annexure. The field visits allowed the team to travel quite extensively and to visit all the five municipalities in the area of intervention. The team was able to visit 11 different communities. The villages visited represented a broad variety both in terms of stages of project implementation and local receptivity to the project. Starting with analysing the broad picture of environments of the regional organisations and local target groups, community organizations and the beneficiary villages, the Team proceeded with studying the project implementation carried out by the various involved actors, the activities involved, their efficiency and effectivity, and results obtained.

Those interviewed were, five committees on the village level (CVAPN) and five committees on the municipal level (CCAPN), volunteers, village chiefs, women's associations, religious leaders, members of village communities,) responsible people in some institutions and organizations, and PDRM staffs (the supervisors and local development agents (LDA)). Interviews with the CCAPN always included meeting the mayor, and these encounters took place at the local municipality office. The team also interviewed the *Sous-Préfets* (administrative leader of the district authority) in the district centres Konna and Fatouma, and the *Adjoint Préfet* in Mopti. A list of interlocutors is included in the annexures. The team were able to observe irrigated vegetable gardens and several cereal banks that were completed or under construction. In Konna we also observed a sensitization session involving drama performed by a group of young girls.

With few exceptions, interviews were carried out in Bambara or Fulfulde (Peul). Members of the local communities helped translating from Peul to Bambara, and Team member Saliki Coulibaly translated from Bambara into French. The aim was to make people able to express their ideas in their own language.

It is the team's view that we were able to get a good overview of the PDRM activities in their proper contexts. The team was able to observe project methods, activities, facilities and results within all working areas of the programme. Visiting all five municipalities meant that we were able to observe the results of programme implementation in various stages, and in various socio-cultural settings.

The fourth phase of the Review was conducted in Sévaré/Mopti. The team interviewed the Chef Médecin in the Mopti district, and the leader of the Regional office for the promotion of women, children and family (DRPFEF). The leadership of MELM, and representatives from the NMS were also interviewed. The team gave a presentation of preliminary results during a workshop in Sévaré with participants from the MELM, programme staffs, partners, and representatives of the volunteers and beneficiaries etc.

The fifth phase consisted of analyses of data and other sources of information, and the writing of the Report, and was initiated in Sévaré and completed in Norway/Bamako.

Methods used were both interactive and comparative. The approaches taken towards the Review, the analysis of documents, assessment of field visits and the structuring of interviews were all based around the key concepts found in the Terms of Reference - relevance, results (outputs and outcomes), impact, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, quality of interaction and cooperation, and above all the added value which the PDRM programme contributes to improve women's situation, both socially and in terms of health in rural Mali.



Women in Sama showing their irrigated vegetable garden

2. The PDRM-MELM Programme

2.1. Objectives¹

In general terms, the main goal of the Development Programme of the Region of Mopti (PDRM) is to contribute to the improvement of the social and health situation of women in the intervention zone in Mali. The Programme specifically targets the practice of female genital mutilation (FGM) and aims to contribute to the abandonment of this practice, as well as a general improvement of living conditions (health, social position, economy, nutrition, education) for women and their households. The Programme was initiated and developed by *The Lutheran Evangelical Church in Mali* (MELM), in line with the line with the goals stated in the Constitution of MELM, which also expresses the ethical foundation and moral responsibility of the Church and its mission within society.

The PDRM programme focuses on the empowerment of women, women's health, reproductive health, and in a larger perspective the empowerment of people living in a marginalized area. Local empowerment lies at the centre of the programme and is sought through working methods based on local mobilization, participation and ownership. These objectives mirror the direction that MELM has set for itself, and which all the stakeholders should strive to attain. The main challenges listed in the Programme Application for 2014 - 2015 are:

1. FGM affects most women in Mali. 85.2% of the women between the age of 15-45 are circumcised, and in the Mopti region 75.4%, according to the national survey of 2009. Thus most women in Mali suffer from physiological as well as psychological effects of circumcision. There is a general lack of knowledge of the consequences of this practice.
2. The socio-economic infrastructure is poor, and leads to seasonal scarcity of food and malnutrition. Schools coverage is poor, and illiteracy a problem. Few centres of health care and lack of access to pure water create serious health problems. Deforestation has led to a shortage of firewood.

As stated in the Programme Application for 2014 and 2015, the Programme's main objective is the improvement of the social and health situation of women in the intervention zone, by:

1. Harmonizing interventions and reinforcing the synergy of action of all the actors intervening in the field,
2. Contributing to a local understanding of FGM as a harmful practice, and inspire the local population to abandon the practice,
3. Mobilizing leaders (community leaders, religious leaders, opinion leaders etc.) to support the fight against FGM,
4. mobilizing the community to engage in the fight for the abandonment of the FGM, and by
5. Making sure that the effects of the accompanying activities are in accordance with the project goals.

¹ This description of the objectives of the Programme is adapted from the project documents made available to the Team, and listed in the Annexures.

The Programme offers training and sensitization to local communities on the issue of FGM and its consequences for women's health and the way it influences women's and family life. Accompanying activities includes adult literacy training, economic support and training for the establishment of IGA for women (petty trade), cereal banks, irrigated vegetable gardens (subsistence and cash crops), and environmental friendly stoves (to reduce consumption of firewood). The aim is to mobilize the local population through a participative approach, contribute to capacity building in a broad sense, and make to population take charge of the development of their own community. And although working methods as lined out in the project documents are standardized to be used in all localities, it is also emphasized that the intervention zone hosts a multi-ethnic population with varieties in culture and social conditions, and that the Programme aims to take such conditions into account in their approach.

2.2. Strategic Partnerships and Political Priorities

2.2.1 Relationships between the PDRM Program and Government Policies

The PDRM programme has cooperated with various offices and levels of the Malian government administration since the start in 2009. The Programme is in line with the Malian Government policies which aims at promoting gender equality, the abandonment of FGM, and reduce mother and child mortality. The Programme is also relevant in connection with the Malian Government's commitment to international conventions (such as *The Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, *The Convention on the Rights of the children*, *The Millennium Development Goals*, *The African Charter of Human and Peoples' Rights* with its adjacent protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa). The national policy developed by the government serves as a frame of reference for the PDRM programme. In 1996, the Malian government established a National Committee for the Abandonment of Harmful Practices (CNAPN), female circumcision included.² In 2002 the government adopted a National Programme for the Abandonment of Female Circumcision (PNLE).³ The national programme involved the implementation of a decentralized structure to operationalize action within this field, and committees for the abandonment of harmful practice were established at regional level. The plan was to form corresponding structures at district, municipal and village level, although so far such structures are by large still not in place. Thus, the initial phases of the implementation of the PDRM programme in the intervention zone have involved taking the initiative to, and support the establishment of Municipal Committees for the Abandonment of Harmful Practices (CCAPN) and Village Committees for the Abandonment of Harmful Practices (CVAPN), in cooperation with the local authorities. It is within this institutional frame that PDRM has initiated the fight against FGM.

² The decree n°99-157/PM-RM.

³ L'ordonnance n°02-053/P-RM du 04 juin 2002.

2.2.2 The PDRM Programme and Norwegian Development Policy

The cooperation between Norway and Mali dates back to the 1970s. Central areas of support has been conflict prevention, management of natural resources, human rights, democracy and good governance, and the situation of women and children. The political crisis in 2012 made cooperation difficult, and Norway froze most of the aid, until after the elections in 2013. Most of the support is today channelled through multilateral organizations, mainly UNDP (United Nations Development Programme); and Norwegian organizations such as Norwegian Church Aid, Strømmestiftelsen, Care and Digni (an umbrella organization controlling and coordinating the development work of 19 churches and mission societies receiving support from the Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation (Norad)). Norway also supports Mali through cooperation between Noragric (UMB) and the Malian governmental Institut d'Economie Rurale (IER). Digni channels its support through the organizations Normisjon and the Norwegian Missionary Society (NMS) and its Malian partner the Lutheran Evangelical Mission in Mali (MELM). The Norwegian support through NMS allocated to PDRM has been 1 874 607 NOK in 2012, and in 2013 1 814 362 NOK. Between 2009 and 2015 the work against FGM has received 1 mill NOK each year through Digni from the 'Regional funding' (*Regionbevilgning*), in addition to ordinary Digni funds from the 'Civil Society funding' (*Siv.sambevilgningen*). As for Norway's political priorities, its development cooperation policy and human rights foci are clearly in line with the priorities and the principles that underpin PDRM. As formulated in the political platform of the current Norwegian government, and of particular relevance to PDRM, Norway's engagement in development work should promote poverty reduction, democratization, education for girls/women, and universal human rights.⁴

2.3. MELMs Engagement within the Development Sector

The Norwegian Missionary Society (NMS) established work in Mali in 1986. The organization *The Evangelical Lutheran Mission in Mali* (MELM) was founded the same year as a mission co-operative, involving several Mission Partners. Initially a partnership *between the Norwegian Mission Society (NMS) and the Evangelical Lutheran Free Church Norway (ELFCN)*, it now embraces several other partners: Département d'Évangélisation et Action Missionnaire (DEAM) of Union des Eglises Evangéliques du Bénin (*UEEB*), the Evangelical Mission Society (EMS) of *Evangelical Church Winning All (ECWA)* of Nigeria, the Global Mission Board (GMB) of *Nigerian Baptist Convention (NBC)*, *Eglise Evangélique Luthérienne au Cameroun (EELC)*, and the *Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane Yesu (EECMY)*.

MELM has engaged with development work for more than twenty years. MELM's engagement in development work has a particular focus upon areas which are hard to reach, such as rural and marginalized areas. Furthermore, the MELM gives emphasis to the weak, the poor and marginalized groups, including women. An Integrated Development Programme (PDI-MELM) was initiated in 1992 in the northern areas of the Mopti region, with a focus on access to pure

⁴ http://www.regjeringen.no/en/dep/ud/selected-topics/development_cooperation.html?id=1159

water of quality, maternal and children's health, HIV/AIDS and adult literacy. Other activities were added as the Programme moved into new phases following a series of prolongations, such as the establishment of cereal banks and micro-credit, as well as capacity building involving training within a variety of issues, ranging from hygiene to accountancy.

A participative approach has characterized the development activity of MELM from the start. Equally important, since the beginning in 1992, MELM's engagement with development work has shown a capability to adapt to changes and crisis, as well as the ability to renew project strategies and activities, both as a consequence of increased experience and in response to local needs.

The PDRM-MELM Programme represents both a continuation and renewal of the work established through PDI-MELM, both in terms of project activities and work methods. While the PDRM in its current form represents a new turn by its stronger focus on women and female genital mutilation (FGM), continuities are maintained through a focus on integrated development and the participatory approach.

The PDRM programme is developed by MELM and is part of MELM's development activities. It is run with a partnership between MELM and NMS, and supported economically by the Norwegian government via DIGNI. The PDRM headquarter is located within the Head Administration buildings of MELM in Sévaré. The Programme is based on a 5-year contract (2009–2013) with prolongations (-2015) between DIGNI and the NMS, as well as a contract between NMS and MELM.

2.4. Summary of the Programme Period 2012-2015⁵

By 2012, PRDMs FGM-project was already well established in Konna municipality. Local government administrators had been mobilized. Committees working towards the abandonment of harmful practices were in place both on municipal level (CCAPN) and CVAPN). On PDRMs initiative, a committee (CLAPN) had also been formed at the district level (*cercle de Konna*). The fight against FGM had by then been inscribed in the municipal action plan for socio-economic development (PDESEC), and an action plan for the fight had been developed and approved (as a result of PDRMs initiative). Voluntary animators/contact persons (*relais*) had been mobilized in all communities. A great effort had been put in network building and the creation of alliances and lines of cooperation between many different partners and organizations. Existing women organizations had been mobilized and new formed as a result of the project intervention. Religious leaders had been approached and mobilized for the cause.

Routines for sensitization had been established on various levels and settings (school settings included) and training/capacity building of local actors (such as committee members, members of the municipal council, municipal technical personnel, school teachers, voluntary animators, school teachers etc.). Circumcisers had been particularly targeted and trained. Several larger events (ex. Football cup, film performances and public meetings) for mobilization and promotion of the cause had been organized. Importantly, the taboo against

⁵ Adapted from the project documents and reports 2009-2014.

speaking of the subject had been broken, and local leaders (political, administrative and traditional) have been mobilized to support and monitor the work. Alongside, accompanying activities followed, such as training and equipping of traditional midwives, organization of alphabetization courses, support and training connected to the establishment of cereal banks, support to create irrigated vegetable gardens, distribution of environmental-friendly ovens, and funding for the establishment of village-based and microcredit organisations aimed to support the creation of income-generating activities (IGA) for women.

PDRMs engagement in the municipality of Konna has been marked by continuity and growth, in spite of the crisis in 2012. The number of actors engaged for the cause has increased considerably. The knowledge and competence of community volunteers (committee members and voluntary animators) have noticeably improved. By the end of 2013, the Programme's Annual Report notes a significant increase of women participation in municipal councils, in community organization and decision making in general.

However, for the Programme as a whole, the years between 2012 and 2015 have in many ways been dominated by restructuration and initiation of work in new communities. While the FGM-project established in Konna municipality in 2009, most of the work in the current intervention zone (the work in Konna municipality extended by four new municipalities) has been established during and after 2012. During the crisis in 2012, a courageous staff showed great dedication in their efforts to maintaining the project in spite of a very difficult situation. The staffs revealed both decisiveness and inventiveness in midst of a violent crisis.

The fact that PDRM relocated its resources from the Seeno district to other municipalities further south has implied that a major part of the staff not only had to move to other places and initiate projects in new communities, but also had to learn and adjust to a project with a different focus. Staffs coming from a project focussing on the management of natural resources were suddenly engaged in sensitization connected to the fight against FGM, and simultaneously had to learn and teach about FGM and women's health. While relocated staffs were able to draw on their previous experiences when engaging in integrated development activities, the new focus on FGM was a great challenge. Thus, this phase has been a process of learning for all involved and at all levels.

Despite these challenges, PDRM has succeeded to establish work in four new municipalities since 2012, and the intervention zone now includes 41 villages from five municipalities in close proximity. In Konna, 16 villages are involved, in Fatouma 4 villages, in Kounari 11 villages, in Borondougou 5 villages and in Bassiro, where work was established in May 2014, 5 villages (the entire municipality) are involved. It should be noted that the villages vary considerable in size, between approximately 200 and 2000 inhabitants. Project intervention in these municipalities has followed the main procedures and work methods as those applied in Konna.

Since 2012 much emphasis has been placed upon the development of effective and appropriate professional administrative procedures, included planning and reporting on all levels. Much has been achieved in this regard. Key staff is in place, training has been provided for staff on administrative routines and

procedures, as well as project related matters such as FGM, children’s rights, women’s rights, communication strategy, advocacy and lobbying. The merging of individual projects into one program was also a challenge in terms of management, and effort has been put into standardizing management and administrative routines.

2.5. Summary

The PDRM Programme has managed to establish a well-organized operational structure in spite of the unforeseen changes made necessary by the political crisis and violence in the region in 2012. The Programme then abandoned the area of Seenouba and installed in four new municipalities in the areas around Konna, where work was already established. On the operational level the administration in place and effective, with a focus upon transparency and participation. The Programme is both timely and well suited to Malian socio-cultural realities and contexts.



Villagers in Sampare showing the Team a cereal bank

3. Response to the Terms of Reference

In the ToR for this review a number of key indicators of program quality are identified: relevance, results in terms of outputs and inputs, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability. The Team has also been asked to review the programme design and evaluation, as well as the relations with the various partners. Although not explicitly stated in ToR, the Team has chosen to interpret programme design in a wide sense, and included assessment of some important aspects of the programme organization and management.

Challenges include:

1. to stimulate the transformation from mere knowledge of the dangers of FGM to actual abandonment among groups and communities still reticent to the idea.
2. to handle local reluctance, resistance and social tensions
3. to adapt communication strategies to the particular socio-cultural setting
4. to stimulate empowerment and ability to self-development instead of dependency within the local communities,
5. to make short-term results into long-term change.

The field visits indicate promising evidence of relevance and sustainability. The local motivation and enthusiasm is high, and the communities involved show promising results when it comes to the level of local participation, appropriation, ownership and empowerment.

3.1. The PDRM Programme and its Organization

The organizational structure of MELM places the PDRM programme under the administration of the Department of Deaconry, which in turn answers directly to the MELM Head Office by the Director of MELM. The staffs at the administrative centre in Sévaré consist of ten persons. Ten staff members are divided into three field teams based outside Sévaré, in, or in proximity with, the field locations. The field teams consist of together (three supervisors and seven local development agents (LDA). NMS serves as a link between PDRM/MELM and Digni/NORAD.

An Administrative Council is attached to the programme, which also serves as a link between the Programme and the municipalities, local government agencies, MELM and NMS. The Administrative Council is formed by a president (council leader), representatives from NMS and MELM, the head of the Department of Deaconry, MELM, representatives from the five municipalities, the government administration (the Direction of the Promotion of Women, Children and Family, The local government agency for production and industry, and the Authority of Technical Services). PDRM is represented by the programme coordinator and a representative of the staffs. Council meetings may also be supplied by resource persons depending on the subjects discussed. The Council monitors the Programme, examines and verifies results, and has a corrective, advisory and approving function. Meetings are held twice a year (including one field visit). Plans and reports are discussed and approved.

On the operational level, PDRM is an autonomous entity. However, all initiatives have to be approved by MELM. The Programme administration and supervisors

have a monthly coordinating reunion in Sévaré where plans are made, and reports discussed and approved. A trimestral meeting also includes the LDAs. The field teams each have monthly meetings before and after the coordinating meeting in Sévaré, where reports and program are made and discussed.

Thus, the Team concludes that the programme organization is well structured with clear procedures. This facilitates not only the organisation of activities. The meeting points are important venues for discussion, exchange of experiences, ideas and competence, and, in a broader perspective, they are vital to the sustainability of the Programme.

3.2. Project Implementation

3.2.1. Strategy

The PRDM programme implies a realization of Malian governmental policy; in that the units created through the national action plan (PNLE) with branches at regional and district level have been completed with committees at municipal and village level. These structures not only facilitate the spread of information, but also secure a participative development process. As one of the sous-préfets we talked to phrased it: "If not for the PDRM Programme, we would never have arrived to reach the community level, because the structures in place lacked the means to reach the target group". The establishment of district, municipal and village committees dedicated to the fight for the abandonment of harmful practices (CLAPN, CCAPN, and CVAPN) enforce the capacity of the Programme and the communities involved, and they are of vital importance both in terms of efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability. As a result of PDRM's initiative, 1 CLAPN has been formed, 5 CCPNs and 46 CVAPNs. This way of working with governmental structures represents a pioneer effort in the context of development work. Programme staffs tells that the method has inspired other NGOs to work in similar ways, as the local population asks them to "work the way PDRM do".

The committees function as the main work partners of the Programme and serve as key points of connections with the local communities and government administration. This structure has been well received by all actors involved. All representatives of the government administration, as well as the representatives of the Regional Direction of the Promotion of Women, Children and Family (DRPFEF) saw PDRM as their main partner in the fight against FGM.

PDRM uses a threefold strategy in its approach, which combines sensitization at ground level, with a realization of structures developed in PLNE together with accompanying activities. This strategy both facilitates sensitization and training, and stimulates the social and economic self-development of communities. This threefold strategy represents an important key to success; a strategy that has stimulated activities on the local level, has established a local discourse on FGM, and has led 2/3 of the communities involved to officially declare their abandonment of FGM, that is, they have signed an official declaration. The strategy relies on a participative approach with emphasis of local initiatives, mobilization, participation and ownership, and which involves the actors on all levels and stages (planning, execution, follow-up and evaluation).

By providing information, and facilitating dissemination of knowledge through systems of sharing (through local leaders, resource persons, peer communication) through organizing and mobilizing the population, the goal is to inspire the villages to make a collective stand against FGM by signing a declaration witnessed by local authorities. In this respects, PDRM follows international recommendations for this line of work. The declarations are publicly announced through a public ceremony at the municipal level. Such ceremonies are planned to be performed during 2015.

The Review Team regards the emphasis on local participation as indispensable both for the success of the Programme and its sustainability in a long-term perspective. This was also confirmed by the experiences of the project staffs. It is the Team’s impression that PDRM’s participative approach also has further elaborated along the way, for instance through a gradually closer cooperation (and integration) with the government administration, local organizations and religious leaders. However, we also noted that the task of mobilizing the population and stimulate participation and ownership were more difficult in some areas than others. This may in part be explained with reference to former development aid practice which often has tended to make people into passive recipients of aid from the outside.

The good relations and synergies with Government policies and plans, and the cooperation with a multitude of actors and groups create a powerful synergy that is an important key to the Programme’s success.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Work with strategies to solve the dilemma of being seen as a donor while aiming to stimulate peoples’ capacity of self-development. Clearly define the programme’s role and function within the area they serve. Further pursue and elaborate the participative approach, so that not only local initiative, mobilization and participation is secured, but also local ownership</i> • <i>For a new programme: consider to develop a long-term strategy, which involves mobilizing the population, train and support them to initiate activities, and then a procedure for phasing out and move on to new villages</i>

3.2.2 Sensitization

PDRM’s threefold strategy corresponds to a set of interrelated activities: sensitization, capacity building and the support of development activities based on needs identified by the local communities themselves. Various activities related to sensitization take place on all levels, and are directed to all actors involved. Furthermore, more specific training and sensitization are directed towards particular actors: voluntary animators (*relais*), circumcisers, traditional midwives, religious leaders, community leaders (such as village chiefs, traditional communicators (griots), and other resource persons). At district (*cercle*) and municipal (*commune*) level training/sensitization are offered to teachers, health workers, local administration, elected members of municipal councils, and

representatives of the civil society, notably women organizations. Accompanying activities (integrated development) is carried out among women groups in particular, as well as involving whole communities, and include the creation of funds supporting income generating activities (IGA) for women (mostly petty trade), irrigated vegetable gardens, support to establish community cereal banks and alphabetization courses. During the field visits, villagers pointed to the following challenges in relation to the realization of activities:

- Pressure of religion and religious leaders
- Persistent reluctance among parents to the abandonment of FGM
- The challenge of attracting the male audience to sessions of sensitization
- Inappropriate timing of sensitization meetings (disturbing work etc.)
- Stigmatization and negative perceptions of animators
- Insufficient means to cover all needs

Approaches made by PDRM in an initial phase towards the leading imams of the grand mosques in Mopti and Konna have clearly given results. The leading imam in Konna explained to the Team how he had gathered all the imams in his area in a workshop, where they together had studied the Koran and other holy scriptures in order to discuss the relationship between Islam and FGM, a meeting that concluded that FGM is not a religious obligation. All the imams the Team encountered during the field trip had participated in this or similar meetings. Although some religious leaders still are reluctant, the Team encountered several imams who were actively engaged, for instance as committee members at municipal and village level. As the imam in Konna explained: "In the beginning we did not understand the message, but when we understood that the sensitization was not a religious critique, we started to listen. Now we acknowledge that it is for the best of our community and our girls, something that resonates well with Islam". The reluctance among some of the religious leaders may be influenced by the fact that the Islamic High Council of Mali has still not agreed on a common policy on the subject. Still, it is the Team's impression that much has already been achieved in this field, although the strategy of cooperation with religious leaders should be pursued and followed up.

Sensitization in the local villages follows a strict schedule created by the PDRM Programme, is and implemented and followed up by the LDA. This schedule and the way it is organized are demanding, both for project workers and the volunteers. The Team would therefore advice PDRM to consider a system of gradual reduction of the frequency, in accordance with the results and progress achieved, in order to economize work, avoid putting too much strain on the volunteers and avoid tiring out the village audience.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Sensitization needs to be pursued and followed up in all communities involved, to secure real and future abandonment of FGM. However, it would be wise for the future to consider a system of gradual reduction of the frequency of sensitization activities, in accordance with the results and progress achieved. Also secure that volunteers have a reasonable work load.</i> • <i>The strategy of cooperation with religious leaders should be pursued and followed up.</i>

3.2.3 The Circumcisers

In all communities the Team visited, all claimed that they no longer had practicing circumcisers in their village. In several of the villages we encountered ex-circumcisers, who now function as voluntary animators or active members of the CVAPN as well as women's associations. The circumcisers, women and others explained how the information on FGM that they had received resonated with their own experiences, and that it had made them realize the connections between the practice of FGM and many of the women ailments and other problems. However, both circumcisers and villagers worried about the loss of standing and income on the part of the circumcisers as a result of the abandonment of FGM.

Thus, PDRM sees not only circumcised women but also the circumcisers as victims. While former circumcisers in some cases are able to maintain parts of their traditional role, for instance as chanters in weddings and naming ceremonies, abandoning circumcision implies in any case a loss in terms of both economy and social standing. As gate-keepers and key persons in the maintenance of the practice of circumcision, the circumcisers represent an important target group, and should be approached with a clear strategy. This was a recurrent concern of many people we met, who urged PDRM to reinforce the efforts to both strengthen their role and position and help finding alternative revenues of income. Circumcisers are potential resource persons who may serve as counselors for women in the community, as well as become important assets for the sensitization, due to their profound and intimate knowledge of women matters, if they receive additional training in issues related to circumcision and reproductive health.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS

- *The circumcisers represent one of the Programme's key target groups, and developing a clearer strategy vis à vis this group should therefore be considered. How may ex-circumcisers become key resource persons? How can the loss of social standing and income be dealt with?*
- *The Programme should build on experiences made so far to systematically develop methods for how traditional, cultural and experiential knowledge may be transformed into a resource for development. Working through existing cultural systems may facilitate social change.*

3.2.4. The Volunteers and Agents on the Ground

FGM is a difficult subject to talk about in the Malian context, and is rarely an issue in public discourse. Thus, a main challenge in the initial phase of project implementation in a particular community has been to establish a public discourse around the practice. Project workers (in particular the LDAs) described

this as a very difficult phase, where they struggled to be accepted by the local communities. They have encountered resistance and even hostility, and have experienced public menace, insults and even death threats. This phase has demanded both great patience and the ability to adjust the Programme's approaches to the local situations.

Also actors engaged on a voluntary basis, such as the voluntary animators and committee members, underlined the great difficulties connected to this line of work, even after an open discourse on the subject of FGM has been established. Thus, voluntary work that involves sensitization about FGM is in many ways different from sensitization in other areas of development work, and implies other kinds of burdens, such as stigmatization and hostility. This is hard, demanding, and difficult work. While the Team observed much engagement and will, there were also much insecurity related to the role and function of the voluntary workers. Are the difficulties that the volunteers encounter sufficiently accounted for within the frames of the PDRM Programme? Should certain compensation be considered, at least for an initial phase? For how long should a volunteer be burdened with this kind of work? As one of the volunteers exclaimed: "I work very hard, but I receive nothing, not even a piece of paper that shows who I am and what I do".

It is the village community who appoints the voluntary animators, in general one man and one woman per village. However, they report to PDRM through the LDAs who also assigns work, and supervise them. Thus, who are responsible for the voluntary animators? What role and position do they have, both now and in the future? The Team observed that in some villages, the volunteers were both educated and experienced, and often served as volunteers for several NGOs, while in other villages they had little or no education and relevant experience at all. Such variations should be accounted for, and integrated as part of the local adjustments of project implementation.

<i>MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><i>Define the role and position of volunteers within the work force structure and planning in a more long term perspective. Take into account local variations of competence and skills when defining role and activities. Consider to offer a form of compensation for an initial period. Consider offering a certificate (or similar) as a honorary sign of the position, as well as forms of attestation that may document training completed as well as the experienced-based knowledge obtained through the work.</i>

3.2.5. Local Variations

The field visits confirmed that sensitization and training about FGM had been well conceived and shared in most settings involved in the Programme. In all villages the Team visited except one, people were able to talk freely and informed about the subject of FGM. However, the Team noticed that when talking about the subject, people seemed most concerned about the physical consequences of

FGM, and less occupied with issues such as violations of human, women's and children's rights. Nevertheless, the Team was able to observe an impressive level of support and engagement which are encouraging for the future. This shows that the process of dialogue initiated by PDRM, involving everyone in the community, has had clear results.

Still, while knowledge of the negative consequences of FGM seemed well conceived, local perceptions varied. In some localities, people appeared less convinced than others. For instance, in the village of Bogu, people explained to us that they had received the information about the negative consequences of FGM, but that this was not their experience. The Team observed that such variations did not necessarily correspond with the amount of time that the Programme had been active in the community. In Bogu, for example, work was initiated in 2012, like the majority of the villages involved in the Programme.

Some communities are more receptive than others, a fact that can be related to multiple factors, such as the level of education, the available resource persons, the level cooperation with local and religious leaders, the level of commitment and engagement of local government officials, earlier experiences from working with NGOs, and social and cultural differences. Such variations also affect the functioning of the volunteers, local committees (CVAPN), and local groups and organizations. Thus, all these variables should be taken into account when measuring progress, both in terms of efficacy, efficiency and impact. In Konna, for instance, the town of Konna (*Konna ville*) has an educated elite that actively engage in the FGM cause. The leading imam has publicly declared that FGM is not a religious obligation. The population in the Konna area is also familiar with groups coming from the northern part of Mali who have never practiced FGM. This situation contrasts with that of the village of Bogu, where people belong to the marginalized minority of Bozo, a population that inhabits the shores of Niger and whose livelihood is connected to fishing. Marginalized groups in general tend to develop protective strategies against political and cultural pressures and influences from the outside world. In such environments, it is only to be expected that change comes more slowly. The situation in Bogu was very different from the two villages visited in the municipality of Bassiro, Pathya and Sampara, where the Team could observe impressive results even though the Programme had only been active in the area a few months, since May 2014. In this case, the municipality profited from a very engaged municipal leadership, as well as long-term experience with multiple NGOs.

Although programme documents states that the Programme aims at employing an approach that is sensitive to social and cultural variation, it is the Teams impression that the Programme largely follows standardized procedures, both in terms of communication strategies and distribution of resources in the various communities involved. The amount of work force, for instance, seems rather equally distributed, even though some settings clearly demand more time and effort on the part of the field teams than others. The Team would strongly advise to further elaborate the approach in a way that even better takes into account local variations.

Lessons from elsewhere show how a cultural-sensitive approach may bear significant results. One example is the Senegalese NGO *Tostan*, which developed a highly interactive methodology that relies on Senegal's oral tradition—including

songs, dance, poetry and theatre—while conferring knowledge about FGM, hygiene, health, literacy, problem-solving and project management. The method shares similarities with the PDRM approach in that it promotes empowering training that stimulates in-depth dialogue, organizes diffusion of information by participants to their social networks, and thus induces a process that culminates with collective public declarations. The Tostan methodology has proved to be very successful and has become a model for similar projects in Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Djibouti, Mauritania and Somalia.⁶

The Team observed inventiveness, good ideas and accomplishments in all of the local communities. In the future it will be important to both draw on, and further develop existing competence and ideas. How may good ideas/methods developed locally be forwarded and shared? How may also different local communities exchange experiences and draw on each other’s competence and join forces?

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Further elaborate the programme’s approach in terms of social and cultural sensitivity and adaption of work strategies and methods to local variations, as well as local reluctance, resistance and social tensions.</i> • <i>Pursue and further elaborate the sensitization approach, which instead of a blanket condemnation of FGM, focusses on a dialogue that rests on the reasons behind the practice, along with its pros and cons, and that these are dissected and debated in light of both traditional values and universal principles of human rights.</i> • <i>Develop systems of sharing models of good practice (ideas, competence, cooperation) both between the different projects in the Program, and between the different local communities in a municipality.</i> • <i>Continue to develop strategies for systematizing and organizing exchange of experience, ideas and competence among the PDRM field teams.</i> • <i>Organize competitions i.e. the introduction of a PDRM prize which might be awarded to the most improved village, most innovative project. Such prizes would both motivate and reward; and also reinforce a sense of common identity across the intervention zone.</i>

⁶ UNICEF/UNFPA: *Aligning with Local Cultures to end Female Genital Mutilation/Cutting* 2013. <http://wcaro.unfpa.org/webdav/site/wcaro/users/wcaroadmin/public/UNFPA%20Booklet%20Culture%20FR.pdf>

3.2.6. The Accompanying Activities

In a number of environments the Review Team was able to observe the levels of local engagement, effort and results which are very encouraging for the future. All villages visited had initiated development activities as a result of PDRMs program of accompanying activities, and this part of the Programme appears to be much appreciated and generates considerable activity and effort on the behalf of the villagers. Villagers emphasized the way these project contributed to food security and better nutrition; helped covering life expenses connected to health care and schooling; made it possible for young women to make a living locally instead of desperate searches for work in the cities; and also that the joint activities enforced social cohesion. Villagers contribute to all activities supported by PDRM, such as the cereal banks where the villagers contribute with the materials and build the walls and roof, while PDRM supplies the door and shutters. Even the village where PDRM started work in May 2014, the villagers had already build the store house for the cereal bank (this they did already in June), and they now only waited for the PDRM contribution (door and window shutters). Sometimes villagers initiate additional projects and activities on their own initiative, such as in Sambere, where they had built a community hall for common activities, training of traditional midwives etc. However, the Team noticed that the program for the PDRM initiated activities follows a rather standardized pattern, where a certain amount of support is offered each village regardless of its size. For instance: PDRM offers support to one cereal bank per village, whether the village has 200 or 2000 inhabitants. This is a clear weakness which creates a potential for tensions and conflicts within the communities.

In all villages the Team visited, the women (and men) emphasized the importance of income generating activities (IGA) for women. Together with the increased participation in public life, the improved economic situation of women also leads to more participation and influence in decision processes. Women are more heard than before as a result of the programme. As one woman phrased it: "Now the men say: we have to ask the women too." And as another said: "We use this opportunity to influence our own destiny and prosperity." Women also explained to the Team that they feel more valued than before because of their increased economic contribution.

Women carry much of the weight of the family. The IGAs helps reducing this weight, many women emphasized, as well as improving life conditions for the family as a whole, as women uses the money gained to improve the diet and care for the needs of their children in terms of health issues, clothes, school equipment etc.

An important corner stone in the implementation of activities is the building on existing women's associations, as well as the incitement to form new associations. Women associations enable women to partake in public life in new ways. This is also a consequence of the Programme's conscious approach of including women as members of all committees and as volunteers. Women frequently told us how the women associations contributed to strengthen social cohesion among the women in the village. The gatherings connected to the various activities provide a space to discussing and exchanging experiences related to women and family matters, as well as the various problems of daily life. And, as one women said, "in cases of disagreement with men, we can now

refer to the decisions of the women’s group.” Women associations are important for women’s participation in public space. Besides, the gatherings in connection with development activities also provide important venues for sensitization, and for the exchange and discussion of experiences and problems related to FGM as well as other matters.

IGAs contribute significantly to the empowerment of women. They are also important to the fight against FGM, as the social gatherings connected to the activities are important venues for sensitization. It is the Team’s view that the accompanying activities in reality do much more than just accompany the Programme’s main objectives. Together with the participative approach, the inclusion of the so-called accompanying activities is the most important key to success, because of the synergy created between the various types of activity. Importantly, this holistic approach makes the abandonment of FGM into an integrated part of local development.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Consider to adjust the level of support of accompanying activities in accordance with village size.</i> • <i>Maintain IGAs as a significant part of the programme’s profile. However, for a new programme, consider to integrate such activities as part of a holistic integrated development approach.</i>

3.3. A Note on Female Circumcision, the Victims, and Training

FGM is a cultural practice tied to core values and social institutions. The circumcised body confirms to aesthetic ideals and true femininity. The uncircumcised body is incomplete and even defect. Only a circumcised woman is capable of representing the family in marital relations with other families. The circumcised female body is the carrier, not only of female virtues, but also of male virtue and honour.⁷ Circumcision creates moral persons capable of joining the community of adults. Thus, circumcision is vital to the constitution and reproduction of society. In this light, the fight against circumcision not only concerns a singular practice but affects fundamental cultural values, social norms and social structures.

Throughout the history of development aid in Africa, there have been countless efforts to campaign the elimination of FGM. However, despite the severe consequences of the practice, the results have been limited. The most successful approaches to FGM use facts and human rights principles to empower communities to decide for themselves to abandon the practice. This creates a sense of autonomy and avoids the perception that people are being coerced or judged. Furthermore, considering the way FGM is grounded in fundamental values, a cultural sensitive approach is indispensable. To quote Nafissatou J. Diop, coordinator of the UNFPA-UNICEF Joint Programme on FGM/C: “So what we

⁷ Aud Talle. “But it is mutilation”. Antropologi og vanskelige tema. I *Norsk Antropologisk Tidsskrift* 2001, vol. 12, 1-2, p. 29.

try to do is to develop strategies that draw from the positive aspects of culture and encourage new values and practices to replace old ones.”⁸

As experiences from other parts of Africa have shown, the key to success is also to stimulate a shift in the social norms of a community as a whole, and in networks of intra-marrying communities. For a future programme, the Team therefore strongly advises to focus further geographical expansion to areas in proximity with those already involved. This is vital both to the impact of the programme and sustainability of the abandonment. The aim should be to create a strong enclave within the Mopti region – a FGM free zone.

Pregnancy and birth are among the most important causes of death for women in Mali. The Programme offers training and a medical kit to traditional midwives. This training includes, at least to some degree, the following up of consequences and complications following circumcision. Still, while the Programme’s main emphasis has been on the abandonment of female circumcision, both members of the field teams and many of the women – and men- we encountered argued for the necessity of increasing the emphasis on the follow-up of the victims of circumcision.

Training in issues such as family planning, prenatal and birth care, as well as child nutrition and hygiene, affects women’s lives in tangible ways. Young women in particular expressed to the Team the need for more training, also in other fields. Some had completed courses in alphabetization, but wanted follow-ups and courses in accountancy and more. As one young woman responded, when the Team asked her to specify what kind of training she wanted, she answered: “Everything!”

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>For the future, and for a new programme: consider to integrate a stronger emphasis on the following up of the victims of circumcision.</i> • <i>Pursue and broaden capacity building of villagers such as alphabetization and other issues.</i> • <i>For a future programme, the Team advises MELM to concentrate further geographical expansion to areas in proximity with those already involved. This is vital both to the impact of the programme and sustainability of the abandonment. The aim should be to create a strong enclave within the Mopti region – an FGM free zone.</i>

3.4. Handling Tensions and Conflicts

Social and cultural change is bound to bring forth tensions within the local communities. Interviews with project staffs and beneficiaries, as well as the reading of project reports, reveal that tensions and conflicts occasionally arise. The volunteers are particularly vulnerable in such situations. One of the volunteers told us how she for a long time felt stigmatized in the village and that

⁸ Cited in UNICEF/UNFPA: *Aligning with Local Cultures*, p.20.

even her closest relatives refused to talk with her. Tensions and conflicts may arise between those who actively engage in the fight against FGM, such as members of the villages committees (CVAPN) or the volunteers, and the community. Conflict management is thus something both the supervisors and the local development agents (LDA) are involved with on a regular basis. Conflicts in relation to circumcision, as well as other types of tensions and conflicts that may arise in relation to activities involving so many different partners, put great demands on the project leadership and staff’s diplomatic and communicative skills. Besides, cultural sensitivity and a good knowledge of the local society are important. Communicative skills, capability of negotiation and advocacy, and techniques for establishing partnerships are necessary for both staff and voluntary workers. Such subjects, together with conflict management and conflict prevention should be included in staff training for all projects.

<p>MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Include in training of project staff and volunteers: Cultural sensitivity approach, communication, negotiation, advocacy, techniques for establishing partnerships, conflict management and conflict prevention.</i>
--

3.5. Strategic Planning, Monitoring and Reporting

Important groundwork has been done during the programme period in relation to strategic planning. Systems of planning on all levels have been developed and are now implemented and carried out on a monthly, trimestral, bi-annual and yearly basis, with subsequent routines for monitoring and reporting. Plans and reports now operate with a clear differentiation between project outputs and outcomes, and with distinct indicators. And while planning during the first phase was rather centralized, the planning process is now carried out from base to top level with a high degree of participation by the various parts involved.

For a next programme, planning should also include a more long-term perspective, with milestones related to expected changes and project implementation observed at the project centres and among the project stakeholders, *and* plans for the next steps. Procedures to identify desired changes (e.g. problems and needs that are not addressed, improved level of participation/ownership, renewal of work methods etc.) should also be included. Such an activity, which is central to the management of planned change, will contribute to the vitality and renewal as well as the sustainability of the programme.

A strategic plan for a next programme should answer the following question: Where will the Programme’s concept be in 5 to 10 years’ time, how will it get there, what will its activities be and what resources will be needed to achieve its goals and purposes? In concrete terms this means for instance: What will the next phase be when a village officially has sanctioned the abandonment of FGM, and programme development activities and IGA are implemented and well-functioning? The Team acknowledge that villages require monitoring way beyond this stage. However, the programme should consider scaling down the monitoring and sensitization in order to liberate the programme’s work force to

move into new villages. Project staffs, municipal and village committee members and volunteers underlined to us the difficulties for a village to maintain abandonment of FGM if surrounded by villages that still maintain the practice. The Team would therefore advice the programme to expand within the nearby areas, and prioritize villages with relations (in terms of for instance marriage exchange) to those where programme activities are well in place.

PDRM is currently due to end in 2015 and so it is important that PDRM leadership discusses and plans for the sustainability of the Programme at every stage of its implementation. A concern for sustainability in all its forms (financial, professional, practical, community) must also remain a priority for a next programme. While MELM currently prepare the PD for a new period of support post 2015, sustainability in all senses should be implemented as part of its overall strategic plan.

Sustainability is also related to the concepts of monitoring and evaluation, as the measurement of progress and outputs will contribute to decisions regarding sustainability. Good governance and transparency should continue to be an important theme for the Programme, and it should further develop experiences and routines established so far.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>For a next programme, strategic planning should include a more long-term perspective with milestones related not only to level of project implementation, output/outcome/impact, but also for stepwise withdrawal from villages and further expansion to others. Such an overall strategic plan should function as point of reference for annual plans and reports. The challenges are similar to those faced elsewhere: the balance needs to be kept between quantity and quality when managing expansion.</i> • <i>Plan for the sustainability should be implemented in the programme’s strategic plans.</i> • <i>If the programme moves to a next phase: Plan for gradual withdrawal and expansion to other villages. This should include a stepwise reduction of monitoring procedures by LDA and supervisors.</i>
-

3.6. Programme Management

The Team’s impression is that the Programme is on the whole well managed with a competent staff. Transparency and a high level of participation are qualities that run through many aspects of the organization and programme activities. The Team still wishes to emphasize that transparency in addition together with participative governance are among the main attributes of ‘good governance’, which is an important priority of the Norwegian development policy. A programme supported by the Norwegian government should therefore strive to be a model of good governance. This implies participative leadership and transparency on all levels of organization. Participative leadership implies

devolution of power. Leaders should be servants rather than lords, and be able to listen to their staffs. The effective functioning of the organizational body rests on the optimal functioning of each of its multiple parts. Thus a leader should focus on identifying, nurturing, and exploiting people’s potentials. A leader should provide space for manifest natural and acquired abilities to be optimally utilized for the organization and the communities served.

The political crisis and the violent conflict in 2012 represented a great challenge to the Programme. Decisions had to be made fast, and communication was difficult. Staff members told the Team about a very dramatic time where they in some cases were forced to live separately from their families. The coordinator told us that he for a period had to hide with relatives in the countryside. During the occupation by Islamist rebels it could be dangerous to be associated with a Western organization.

On the whole, financial management seems well structured and conforms to requirements in the agreement. Reporting on results (outputs) is substantial and concrete. Nevertheless, the Team would like to make the following points on the disbursement procedures: On the project level, disbursement takes place at two levels: The supervisor manages the pay-outs to minor activities on the municipal/village level, while the Programme administration handles larger disbursements to the accompanying activities, such as micro-credit, cereal banks etc. Still, the Team noted several complaints about delays of payments, as one LDA said “The disbursements are always too late, and this is very difficult for us”. Disbursement procedures represent a risk factor, as delays may affect the work situation of the field teams and the credibility of the Programme.

Budget instability has been a problem during the programme period. Budget cuts have been caused by for instance currency fluctuations, or adjustments of salaries. The repeated budget cuts create unpredictability for both staffs and beneficiaries. The Team therefore advises NMS to review the procedures of budget planning and management together with the programme management in order to prevent budget cuts in the middle of a budget period.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• <i>Transparency and professionalism should be maintained in personnel management.</i>• <i>The Team advises NMS and the Programme to evaluate and revise the procedures of budget planning and management. Budget planning and management should take into account eventualities such as currency fluctuation and salary adjustments, in order to prevent budget cuts in the middle of a budget period. Furthermore, the Programme should aim at avoiding delays of disbursements.</i>• <i>Include in reports of activities the contributions of all counterparts, the local communities included.</i>• <i>Develop a Crises Manual, with procedures for crisis management and communication.</i>

3.7. Human Resources

Human resources represent the Programme’s most important assets. Recruiting skilled manpower with adequate and sufficient experience is a challenge. An overall concern for sustainability should also include strategies to ensuring professional continuity. Good governance not only implies participative leadership and transparency, but also professional standards in all senses, such as for instance proper terms of employment and proper working conditions. Work load must be manageable and salaries adequate. This is of vital importance to the sustainability of the Programme. The danger of losing experienced and skilled work force makes the Programme very vulnerable. Also, because of the crisis in 2012, the staffs have experienced a time marked insecurity and difficult work conditions, in addition to comprehensive readjustments and reorganization. MELM and the PDRM management should bear in mind that the staffs have been through a tough period, and consider whether it would be wise to take some measures in this regard.

For a next programme: The Programme should have a Human Resource Policy Manual. This should contain regulations on establishing staff positions, job descriptions, job grading and salary structure, recruitment and deployment procedures, terms and conditions of service, staff development, grievance lodgement and disciplinary procedures, management of volunteers and consultants, etc.

The PDRM administration has organized training for the staffs about issues such as FGM, children’s rights, women’s rights, communication strategy, advocacy and lobbying, administrative routines and work contracts. The Programme has also developed good strategies for systematizing and organizing exchange of experience, ideas and competence within the Programme. Importantly, capacity building needs continuous follow-up and renewal. Experienced staffs need refill and renewed inspiration, and new staffs need sufficient and adequate training. This is essential for the Programme to be able to renew itself and maintain creativity and innovation. The Programme should also consider training on subjects that has not been provided, such as computer skills, and personnel and conflict management.

A strategy for human resource development; capacity building and additional training, is of vital importance also for the sustainability of the programme. For a next programme it would be wise to consider developing a coherent Human Resource Development Plan, in order to secure a coherent and coordinated approach.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• <i>The Team advices the Programme to review the work conditions and secure that the work load is adequate.</i>• <i>The Team advices NMS, Digni and MELM to contribute to secure professionalism in all senses; that terms of employment and work conditions are just and adequate. The Programme should strive to maintain the principle of good governance in a manner that makes it</i>

worthy of support by the Norwegian government.

- *Develop a strategy for continuous capacity building and additional training of staff, in order for the programme to be able to renew it self and maintain creativity and innovation.*
- *Consider to offer complementary training to that already offered, such as computer skills, and management of personnel and conflicts.*
- *For a next programme, consider to develop a Human Resource Development Plan (with emphasis on capacity building and training), in order to secure a coherent and coordinated approach.*

3.8. The Making of Project Documents and Communication of Results

From reading the programme documents (Programme Plans and Reports), it is clear that the Programme has put significant effort in establishing suitable and satisfactory forms. Much progress has been made in developing clear indicators for measuring output, outcome and impact. However several of the LDA told us about a considerable increased work load, and how administration now takes much of their time. The Team would therefore advice MELM to evaluate the routines for planning and reporting if entering a new programme, not only to ensure that they function as intended, but also to make sure that the procedures are not too time-consuming. It is also important to evaluate the systems of monitoring, in order to avoid that monitoring are reduced to be a simple method of control. In particular, The Team advices NMS and PDRM to evaluate the fruitfulness of the indicators used in programme documents, in order to simplify and significantly reduce the number of indicators. When making the account of a project activity, it would be appropriate to value any contribution of all the counterparts, and not reporting just the direct costs. This may include the value of the people's contribution according to their time and expertise involved.

It is important that the reports provide a good picture of the activities performed and the results and impact on a short and long-term basis. Thus, reporting should also involve descriptions and examples, for instance in the form of short case-studies. Importantly, improvement of project documents does not necessarily mean that they should become more complicated. A direct and simple approach is often the best. All monitoring and evaluation should be based on the following questions: Who will benefit from this activity? How shall we know they have actually benefited? See also the recommendations in section 3.6. on strategic planning, and how strategic plans should be used as points of reference for planning documents and reports.

MELM has now gained considerable experience with integrated rural development in Mali, and together with the particular participative approach this has value potential also for others. Thus, MELM should be concerned with how to reach a larger audience with their "message". The Team notes that PDRM has produced information bulletins that have been broadcasted by the local radio station, but that this lately has had to stop due to budget cuts. The Team would strongly advice the Programme to use as many communication channels as possible.

MELM needs to make a determined effort to publicize its successes and its experiences, so that track record could be made available to a wide audience of professionals and policy makers. If MELM decides to initiate a new programme after the closure of PDRM, "marketing strategies" should be developed for their particular forms of knowledge, experience, and approaches, and make them known to a larger audience. Consider to set aside funds to use the internet (for instance programme web site or blog) and other forms of communication to inform the wider world of the programme's successes. MELM's own channels of communication also represent a significant potential in this respect.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Serious attention be given to improving and rationalizing the production of program documents (plans and reports), by: Evaluating established systems and routines for planning, reporting and monitoring, and make sure that they are rational and not too and time-consuming. Improve the efficiency of the process of writing and approval. Improve the quality of project documents by using clear standards and a descriptive mode with examples.' Evaluate the system of indicators and significantly reduce their number. • Taking the 'PDRM-MELM' message' to a larger audience: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Make a determined effort to publicize successes and experiences. Develop "marketing strategies". - For the next programme consider to set aside funds to use the internet and other forms of communication to inform the wider world of its successes: The target groups should also include other development agents.

3.9. Cooperation with Other Partners

The Review Team observes that cooperation with the government at the local level is close and well integrated. Apart from the government, PDRM is currently the sole agent working against FGM in the intervention zone. However, despite the fact that many NGOs have disappeared from the area as a result of the conflict in 2012, there are still NGOs active in the area, working within related fields. Furthermore, several other actors are engaged in the fight against FGM in other parts of Mali. For a future Programme, the Team advises MELM to establish cooperative links with relevant and like-minded NGOs. As a pioneer agent in the Mopti area, MELM has much to share, but has also a lot to gain from cooperation and exchange with similar agents.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Consider networking and the establishment of cooperative links with other NGOs. For a new programme: Consider setting aside funds for staff visiting exchanges with other projects in Mali or elsewhere.</i>

3.10. The Relationship between PDRM and MELM, NMS and DIGNI

PDRM-MELM was initiated and developed by The Lutheran Evangelical Church in Mali (MELM). While MELM is a missionary organization aiming to establish a church among the Fulfulde-speaking population in Mali, it also has as one of its main goals “to improve people’s living conditions in our zone of intervention”. The development activity is based on the idea of holistic ministry, and the principle of equality and dignity of all human beings. MELM also states that it aims to support “the official authorities in an effort to promote a just, peaceful and prosperous united Mali for the welfare of the people” and cooperate with other stakeholders in the field. MELM’s engagement in development work has a particular focus upon marginalized areas in Mali. This is also in accordance with MELM’s Constitution which particularly emphasizes the needs of the weak, poor and marginalized groups. This also includes women, mirrored in PDRM’s focal core: the promotion of reproductive health and women empowerment.

While the objectives of PDRM are clearly in line with MELM’s goals as stated in the Constitution, interviews with representatives of MELM leadership uncovered that internal discussions between the various partners within MELM are currently taking place. These discussions relate to what role and position that development activities should have within the frame of MELM. Some also expressed their worries about the fact that almost all of the PDRM staffs are Muslims, and thus do not share the same religious visions as the organization to which they belong. Considering the internal discussions, the Team advises MELM to clarify its development policy before initiating a new programme.

The Team nevertheless strongly recommends MELM to find ways to continue the work already established through PDRM. As the work is quite recently established in most of the intervention zone (2012 onwards), there is a significant risk that much of what is gained so far will be lost without a follow-up.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS
To MELM and NMS:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> MELM and NMS should seek to find ways to continue the work established through the PDRM Programme.
To MELM:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The role, position and organization of development work within MELM should be clarified before initiating a new development programme.

3.11. Summary

This section has responded to the Terms of Reference and has identified the qualitative aspects of the program: its relevance, effectiveness, impact and sustainability in a holistic manner. Particular attention has been given to strengths and weaknesses; opportunities and challenges within the operational aspects of the PDRM Programme. Altering a practice like FGM, which is

fundamentally tied to cultural values, social norms and social institutions, is a difficult and long-term process. Results should therefore be considered in both a short-term and long-term perspective. As a villager pointed out to the Team: “We will not see the real results from this project before our little girls have grown up”. Nevertheless, the Programme shows impressive and significant results. It has developed an innovative holistic and participative approach to the fight against FGM. Through this approach it has gained impressive results in a short time, and in a cost-effective manner.

The main themes to emerge may be summarized as follows:

1. Effective administrative and financial procedures are in place. Impressive results have been achieved in a relatively short time in a large number of local communities. However, not least considering the fact that much of the work was initiated during and after 2012, the situation is vulnerable and measures to secure sustainability should be taken.
2. It is now important that the leadership reflect upon what has been achieved and develop a new programme with a set of institutional strategic plans. These plans will need to include yearly milestones in relation to expected inputs, processes and outputs. A central focus of these plans must be measures to monitor and evaluate the project outcomes.
3. The PDRM Programme has succeeded in establishing good linkages and forms of integrated cooperation with its Government partners (local municipality and district offices). Its integrated form of cooperation with the government is a pioneer effort in the context of development work. However forms of collaboration with other development agents or NGOs should be pursued and further developed. The Programme should also work with developing systematic and more formal strategies for the sharing of models of good practice.
4. The sustainability of the Programme needs to be borne in mind as it now enters its last phase, and a new programme is in planning. The MELM/NMS leadership will need to consider a variety of strategies to enhance sustainability of the work initiated and established so far.
5. Risks are balanced by benefits, and it is clear to the Review Team that PDRM is an innovative programme within the field of FGM and integrated development, which delivers quality results in a cost-effective and well managed manner.

4. Conclusions and Recommendations: General and Specific

4.1. General Recommendations

The Review team acknowledges PDRM as a well-conceived, strategic and innovative programme which significantly contributes to the fight for the abandonment of FMG, women empowerment, local democracy and rural development in the intervention zone. The Programme has established effective administrative and financial procedures, and innovative and successful working methods. It is well lead and the management team has responded to challenges in a timely, creative and constructive manner.

4.2. Recommendations for NMS and DIGNI

1. The work initiated by PDRM needs to be continued, and should be supported by Norway as it has an important contribution to the fight against FGM, and to improved reproductive health and life conditions for women in Mali.
2. DIGNI should continue to support its Strategic Partnership with the MELM and NMS in Mali. At the conclusion of the current contract in 2015, DIGNI should give serious consideration to a new programme.

4.3. Recommendations for PDRM, MELM & NMS

1. *MELM and NMS should seek to find ways to continue and secure the sustainability of the work established through PDRM.*
2. *Further pursue and elaborate the participative approach, so that not only local initiative, mobilization and participation are secured, but also local ownership. Work to solidify established structures (CVAPN etc.) and prioritize capacity building (not least volunteers, resource persons, leaders)*
3. *Sensitization needs to be pursued and followed up in all communities involved, to secure real and future abandonment of FGM. However, it would be wise for the future to consider a system of gradual reduction of the frequency of sensitization activities, in accordance with the results and progress achieved. Secure that the volunteers maintain a reasonable work load. Engage men in the sensitization of men (peer communication).*
4. *The strategy of cooperation with religious leaders should be pursued and followed up.*
5. *The circumcisers represent one of the Programme's key target groups, and developing a clearer strategy vis à vis this group should therefore be considered. How may ex-circumcisers become key resource persons? How can their loss of social standing and income be dealt with?*
6. *The Programme should build on experiences made so far to systematically develop methods for how traditional, cultural and experiential knowledge*

may be transformed into a resource for development. Working through existing cultural systems may facilitate social change.

- 7. Define the role and position of voluntary animators within the work force structure and planning in a more long term perspective. Take into account local variations of competence and skills when defining role and activities. Consider to offer a form of compensation for an initial period. Consider offering a certificate (or similar) as a honorary sign of the position, as well as forms of attestation that may document training completed as well as the experienced-based knowledge obtained through the work.*
- 8. Further elaborate the Programme's approach in terms of social and cultural sensitivity and adaption of work strategies and methods to local variations, as well as local reluctance, resistance and social tensions. Pursue and further elaborate the sensitization approach, which focusses on a dialogue that rests on the reasons behind the practice, along with its pros and cons, and that these are dissected and debated in light of both traditional values and universal principles of human rights.*
- 9. Develop systems of sharing models of good practice (ideas, competence, cooperation) both between the different municipalities in the Programme, and between the different local communities in a municipality.*
- 10. Consider to adjust the level of support of accompanying activities in accordance with village size.*
- 11. Pursue and broaden capacity building of villagers such as alphabetization and other issues.*
- 12. Maintain IGAs as a significant part of the Programme's profile. However, for a new programme, consider to integrate such activities as part of a holistic integrated development approach.*
- 13. Continue to develop strategies for systematizing and organizing exchange of experience, ideas and competence among the PDRM field teams.*
- 14. Organize competitions i.e. the introduction of a PDRM prize which might be awarded to the most improved village, most innovative project. Such prizes would both motivate and reward; and also reinforce a sense of common identity across the intervention zone.*
- 15. For the future, and for a new programme: consider to integrate a stronger emphasis on the following up of the victims of circumcision.*
- 16. For a future programme, the Team advises MELM to concentrate further geographical expansion to areas in proximity with those already involved. This is vital both to the impact of the programme and sustainability of the abandonment. The aim should be to create a strong enclave within the Mopti region – an FGM free zone.*

17. *Include in training of project staff: Cultural sensitivity approach, communication, negotiation, advocacy, techniques for establishing partnerships, conflict management and conflict prevention.*
18. *For a next programme, produce a Strategic Plan that includes a more long-term perspective with milestones related not only to level of project implementation, output/outcome/impact, but also for stepwise withdrawal from villages and further expansion to others (progressive expansion) Such an overall strategic plan should function as point of reference for annual plans and reports. The challenges are similar to those faced elsewhere: the balance needs to be kept between quantity and quality when managing expansion. Plan for the sustainability should be implemented in the programme's strategic plan.*
19. *The Team advises NMS and the Programme to evaluate and revise the procedures of budget planning and management. Budget planning and management should take into account eventualities such as currency fluctuation and salary adjustments, in order to prevent budget cuts in the middle of a budget period. The Programme should aim at avoiding delays of disbursements.*
20. *Develop a Crises Manual, with procedures for crisis management and communication.*
21. *The Team advises NMS, Digni and MELM to contribute to secure professionalism in all senses; that terms of employment and work conditions are just and adequate. The Programme should strive to maintain the principle of good governance in a manner that makes it worthy of support by the Norwegian government. Transparency and professionalism should be maintained in personnel management. The Team also advises the Programme to review the work conditions, and to secure that the staff's work load is adequate (the LDA in particular).*
22. *Develop a strategy for continuous capacity building and additional training of staff, in order for the program to be able to renew it self and maintain creativity and innovation. Consider to offer complementary training to that already offered, such as computer skills, and management of personnel and conflicts.*
23. *For a next programme, consider to develop a Human Resource Development Plan (with emphasis on capacity building and training), in order to secure a coherent and coordinated approach.*
24. *Serious attention be given to improving and rationalizing the production of program documents (plans and reports), by: Evaluating established systems and routines for planning, reporting and monitoring, and make sure that they are rational and not too and time-consuming. Improve the efficiency of the process of writing and approval. Improve the quality of project documents by using clear standards and a descriptive mode with examples. Include in reports of activities the contributions of all counterparts, the local communities included. Evaluate the system of indicators and significantly reduce their number.*

25. *Taking the 'PDRM-MELM' message' to a larger audience: Make a determined effort to publicize successes and experiences. Develop "marketing strategies". For the next phase consider to set aside funds to use the internet and other forms of communication to inform the wider world of PDRM's successes.*
26. *Pursue and further elaborate strategies of mass communication (for instance film projections, conferences, theatre etc.) and develop communication strategies and other aspects of the approach to social, ethnic and cultural variations.*
27. *Consider networking and establishing cooperative links with other NGOs. For a new programme: Consider setting aside funds for staff visiting exchanges with other projects in Mali or elsewhere.*
28. *The role, position and organization of development work within MELM should be clarified before initiating a new development programme.*

4.4. Summary

The Review Team concludes that PDRM has established a programme with strong administrative and financial bases. The benefits of the PDRM programme are considerable. The holistic perspective implied in the participative approach and inclusion of development activities in a programme targeting the practice of FGM and life conditions of women, and the integrated cooperation with government structures makes PDRM a pioneer programme in the context of development work. However, while significant results have been achieved during a short time period, the achieved results are also vulnerable, and needs following up. The Team also advises the Programme to reinforce the capacity building of central local actors (such as committees (CVAPNs in particular), voluntary animators, and ex-circumcisers). Furthermore, the Team recommends the Programme to refine and further develop the way it works through existing cultural systems, and use local knowledge and values as a resource (cultural sensitive approach).

In order to achieve its goals, it will be essential that a new programme development acts upon the recommendations made particularly with regard to the development of a strategic plan (which includes strategies with regard to financial sustainability). The Review Team was impressed by the quality of leadership available to MELM and recommends that this is built upon and strengthened. Continued networking with GoM and the NGO community will also be a source of strategic strength. The review team wishes PDRM, its leaders and practitioners all the very best in their important work.

5. Annexures

Annex 5.1. Terms of Reference

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Final evaluation

The Development Program of the Region of Mopti (), MELM (Mission Evangélique Luthérienne au Mali.

Preamble

The Development Project of the Region of Mopti () was initiated in 2009 by MELM ((Lutheran Evangelical Mission in Mali), which is a confessional organization. The project was at first approved for a 5 years period by NMS (The Norwegian Mission Society) and Digni, which is the umbrella organization for managing financial support from the Norwegian Government to the development work carried out by mission organizations.

At the start in 2009 had two parts: A. Natural Resources Management. B. The Fight for the Abandonment of Excision and the Promotion of Woman. In April 2012 the A part was closed down because of the occupation of the northern part of Mali, and since June 2012 all resources has been allocated to the B (gender) part. In 2013 this new version of the project was assigned a prolongation for the years 2014 and 2015.

The organisational structure called -MELM which administers the project is composed by an administration team based in Sévaré and three field teams. The intervention zone consists of 46 villages in 5 municipalities situated along the road from Sévaré to Konna in the Mopti region.

1.1 General objective

The general objective for the project is to improve the social and health situation of women in the intervention zone. Mainly it deals with the abandon of female circumcision (FGM) and other harmful practices and a general improvement of living conditions for women and the households.

1.2 Main strategies

- Collaboration with services at a national and regional level and with local and regional authorities, in accordance with the national politics.
- Establishment and empowerment of action comities in villages and at municipality level.
- Carrying out accompanying activities to establish a platform for the communication concerning FGM and other harmful practices.
- Large involvement of the community and enabling the key participants, including traditional, religious, political leaders, the local administration and the educational sector.
- Educational causeries, sensitizing gatherings, home visits etc.
- Broadcast of radio programmes

Purpose of the evaluation

NMS asks for and owns this final evaluation of the project. There are two main reasons for having an evaluation:

1. Learning. The evaluation process is by itself expected to be seen as a learning tool for the project workers, MELM and NMS. The levels above NMS (refer to 1.1) also benefit from the evaluation.

2. Prepare decisions. The evaluation report will serve as a foundation for making decisions in MELM and NMS concerning further project work in Mali.

The specific objectives of this evaluation are:

1. Evaluate the relevance of the project in the project area (both the main theme and the accompanying activities).
2. Identify the results (at output and outcome level), success and limitations of the project according to the indicators set out in project documents. This includes studies of the
 - a) design; - is the actual approach effective?
 - b) implementation; - are the plans carried out correctly in an effective and efficient way?
3. Analyse the role of the accompanying activities as an instrument for attaining the general objective of the project.
4. Examine if the recommendations from the mid-term review are followed-up.
5. Assess the impact and sustainability of the project work.
6. Identify NMS and MELM's impact on the result.
7. Evaluate to what extent the project is contributing to attain the main goals of MELM and assess relevance and coherence with MELM's priorities and work methods
8. Evaluate to what degree the project is supporting the goals and strategies of NMS.
9. Assess the quality of interaction and cooperation at the superior level (decision making, management and interaction between the bodies involved, -MELM, MELM, NMS and Digni).

Methodology

The team is expected to use a participative and gender-sensitive approach as the evaluation method.

The evaluation should be carried out through

- Document studies (applications and reports)
- Observation of activities and assets in the field
- Interviews of beneficiaries, project workers, local administration and authorities, MELM leaders, NMS representative and other relevant bodies.
- A workshop should be held for stakeholders (including MELM leaders, project staff, the board and if possible some other representatives from the local communities).

Reporting

All final reporting is to be made in English. The team may choose to elaborate the report in French and have this version translated into English.

A draft report should be presented both to MELM and NMS to enable at least a two weeks period for comments on the draft from MELM and NMS. This report may be written in French.

A final report in English with findings, conclusions and recommendations is to be presented both in a written and an electronic version. The report will have a summary of about two pages.

It is expected that the work of the evaluation team should conclude in recommendations about eventually creating a new project from 2016.

The evaluation team

The evaluation team will consist of 3 external consultants.

During the field work the team will be installed at a hotel in Sévaré. The -MELM organizes the logistics, the transport to the sites of interest for the team and the meetings as wished by the evaluation team. An office in Sévaré can be used by the team.

Time Schedule

Date	Tasks	Observations
October/November 2014	Preparation work	Study the documents
From 17 th to 28 th of Nov.	Field work	In Sévaré and the intervention zone.
27 th -28 th of November	Workshop	For stakeholders, project workers etc.
14 th of December	Delivery of draft report	
15 th of January 2015	Delivery of final report	

* * * * * * * * * *

Annex 5.2. Communities and Municipalities Visited

	Municipality	Number of communities visited	Village	Observations
1	Kounari	3	Sambare	Start 2012
			Sare Hamadi	
			Manaco	
2	Fatouma	1	Fatouma	Fatouma is the centre of the municipality Start 2012
3	Konna	3	Konna ville	Two villages and Konna Town Start 2009
			Time	
			Sama	
4	Borondougou	2	Diambacourou	Diambacourou is the centre of the municipality 2012
			Bogo	
5	Bassiro	2	Sampara	Start 2014
			Pathia	

Annex 5.3. List of Interlocutors

People interviewed from MELM head office and NMS staff

1. Ngayap Moïse, Director of MELM
2. Samuel Gouda, Head of the Department of Evangelization and Christian
3. Helge Vatne, Head of the Department of Deaconry, MELM
5. Else Vatne, NMS representative in Mali
6. Ragnhild Mestad, NMS, Norway

People interviewed from PDRM administration and staff

1. Mr Alahidi Barry, Coordinator
2. Mr Hamadoun Tamboura, Assistant Coordinator
3. Mme Kone Gabdo Cisse, Chargé suivi projet
4. Mr Souleymane Diamoye, Supervisor Borondougou
5. Mr Moussa Diabate, Superviseur Fatoma & Kounari
6. Mme Dakoua Rosalie Dembele, Superviseur Konna
7. Mr Mawdo Gouda, Stagiaire
8. Mr Daniel Ogosabou Doumbo, Président du Conseil d'Administration (CA) du PDRM

People interviewed from the government administration

1. Mr Modibo Kane TOGO, Sous-prefet de Fatoma
2. Mr Zédyol DOUGNON, Sous-préfet de Konna
3. Mme Diallo, Mama DIARRA, Directrice régionale de la femme de l'enfant et de la famille

4. Mr Madougou Aklini, Chef de la division de la femme
5. Mr Abdoulaye GUINDO, Adjoint au Préfet de Mopti central
6. Dr NAJIM Oura DIALLO, Medecin chef du centre de santé de référence de Mopti

People interviewed in the intervention zone

1. Mr Allaye DICKO, ADL, SAMBERE, Commune de Kounari
2. Mr Hamadoun CISSE, ADL, commune de Kounari
3. Mr Brahima AROU, ADL, Pathia et Sampara, Commune de Manaco
4. Mme Adame MAIGA, ADL, de Diambacourou et Bogo, Commune de Borondougou
5. Mr Mathia BOCOUM, ADL de Timé, Commune de Konna
6. Mme Bagayogo Oumou BAYA, ADL de Sama, Commune de Konna

Meeting with CVAPN, Sambere, 19.11.2012, participants list

1. Mr Hamadoun Tamboura
2. Mr Hamadoun Guindo
3. Mme Aissata Sidibé
4. Mr Moaibo Sidibé
5. Mr Samba Tamboura
6. Mme Ramatou Tamboura
7. Mr Tindo Tamboura
8. Mme Aminata Diallo
9. Mme Djidy Guindo
10. Mme Hawa Sow
11. Mr Amadi Kaoudo Tamboura
12. Mr Mamoudou Tamboura
13. Mme Djouldé Guindo
14. Mr Bonka Maïga, Infirmier chef de poste médical

Meeting with women's group, Sambere 19.11.2014, participants' list

1. Aisata Sidibé
2. Aminata Jallo
3. Yeeyuande Sankare
4. Dikel Sankare
5. Guede Giondo
6. Fatumata Diku
7. Yiidi Ginnda
8. Ramatu Tamboura
9. Takko Mepenta
10. Haana So
11. Bonko Maiga
12. Modjére Sidibé
13. Dado Sidibé

Meeting with CCPN, Manaco, 20.11.2014, participants list

1. Alphonse Somboro, Imam
2. Allaye Korobaro, ASACO
3. Oumar Sidibé, Chef de village

4. Bouo Pléah, Ecole Fatoma
5. Dr. Bakary Kamaté, ATC Fatoma
6. Moussa Tamboura, APE
7. Bara Siarra, Jeunesse
8. Nana Diawara, President
9. Oumar Niang, RECOTRADE
10. Hawa Coulibaly, Animatrice
11. Oumar Maiga, Director d'école

Meeting with representatives from women's group, Manaco, 20.11.2014, Participants list

1. Dikel Tamboura
2. Fatouma Kamia
3. Fanta Yattara
4. Anta Bah
5. Djeneba Allaye Diarra
6. Fanta Cisse

Meeting with CCAPN ,Kounari, 20.11.2014, participants list

1. Allaye Dicko, 1 adjoint Maire
2. Bara Touma Sidibé, Youth representative
3. Penda Bara Sidibé, Women's leader
4. Aissata Sidibé,
5. Boubacar Kampo, Traditional communicator (griot)
6. Samba Diarra, A.P.E
7. Fanta Cisse, Women's network Kounari
8. Mr Guoro Bocoum, Head teacher, 1 cycle (primary school)
9. MBoye Kampo, Village chief
10. Wahab Diallo, Head teacher 2 cycle (primary school)
11. Amadou Djoum
12. Tiemoko Touré, ACPF

Meeting with women's group in Konna, 21.11.2014, list of participants

1. Lamine Kampo, Representative of the Municipality of Konna, CA PDR
2. Boubacar Diallo, relai
3. Fatoumata Komota
4. Mme Guitteye Korotimi Kampo
5. Fatoumata Kampo
6. Fanta Kampo
7. NDaki Soufoulhera
8. Koumba Boré
9. Awa Plea
10. Sétou Bathieli
11. Baro Coulibaly
12. Té Napo
13. Goumba Kebé
14. Tata Kampo
15. Bintou Kémesso
16. Marietou Diara

17. Aïssa Guindo
18. Touré Aïssata Dio, Pormotion Feminine au CA
19. Ami Haidara
20. Mariam Niafo

Meeting with CCAPN Konna, 21.11.2014, list of participants

1. Amadou Ali Guindo, 3ème adjoint Maire, vice président du CCAPN
2. Mamadou Bocoum, Directeur Coordinateur des Ecoles
3. Mme Guitteye Korotimi
4. Boubocar Diallo, animateur, relai
5. Asilamone Djoum, griot
6. Abdoulaye Boeh, representative of the child government
7. Diomsoli Komou, works at the local radio station
8. Ibrahimia Kampo, Village Chief, Konna, president of CVAPN
9. Zyédol Dougnon, Sous-préfet, president du CCAPN
10. Fatoumata Traoré, representative of the parents of school pupils

Meeting with CVAPN Time, 22.11.2014, list of participants

1. Hamadou Barry, Village Chief
2. Hama Barry, Conseiller, vice president du CVAPN
3. Bocar Kounta, Conseiller,
4. Aïssa Bah, Accoucheuse traditionnelle
5. Meloure Bah
6. Oumar Diallo
7. Yeo Coulibaly
8. Welo Diallo
9. Bella Kida
10. Yeyaade Youndo
11. Yode Diarra, voluntary animator
12. Oumar Malick, voluntary animator
13. Hamadoun Traoré, youth representative
14. Sona Tamboura, youth representative
15. Koumba Sané
16. Hama Diarra, religios leader
17. Hamadoun Barry, repr. Education, Secretary
18. Haouwa Souko, repr. Medial Centre
19. Boula Yattere
20. Hamadou Barry

Meeting with CVAPN Sama, 23.11.2014

1. Abdoulaye Diarra, president
2. Moussa Diarra, vice president
3. Batoma Diarra, administrative secretary
4. Sala Tangara, Accountant
5. Aly Diarra, secondary accountant
6. Fatoumata Gabe,
7. Awa Katilé
8. Dicko Boré secretary of information and organization
9. Adjaratou Traoré, 2nd secretary of information

10. Adama Katilé, Health and child protection.
11. Anta Katilé, Health and child protection
12. Ali Kassambara, Health and child protection
13. Amadi Diarra, Health and child protection
14. Mamadou Diarra, Economic development
15. Paté Diarra, Economic development
16. Fati Diarra, Economic development
17. Harouna Diarra, Environment
18. Kadia Diarra, Environment
19. Dicko Bouaré, secretary of organization

Meeting with CCAPN Diambacourou 23.11.2014

1. Abdoul Karin Timbo, Maire
2. Mama Django Timbo, 2e Maire
3. Mamadou Timbo, Village councillor
4. Adama Bimbelé, regisseur
5. Nouhoum També, DTC CSCOM
6. Abdou K Timbo
7. Sekou Timbo
8. Souleymane Timbo
9. Aly Timbo
10. Fatoumata Soumaré
11. Soumatila Diamkaba
12. Bocar Sarro
13. Korotimi Izebé
14. Ousmane Timbo

Meeting with village chief and women's group Bogo 23.11.2014

1. Kaboro Timbo
2. Fatoumata Timbo, leader of women's group
3. Pa Timbo, voluntary animator
4. Negue Timbo, voluntary animator
5. Boye Nadio
6. Dicko Kolibala
7. Dado Sidibé
8. Kadia Tangara

Meeting with CVAPN Pathia, 24.11.2014, list of participants

1. Adou Sangaré, President
2. Amadi Bara, councillor
3. Alhadji Bilali
4. Hamadi Amadou Sangaré
5. Belco Sangaré, secretary
6. Kadidia Boucari, repr young women
7. Mamou Koné 2 repr young women
8. Gueda Sangaré
9. Amadou Timou Sangaré
10. Hamadi Gagni Sidibé
11. Boukou Belcorou Sangaré
12. Komba Coulibaly

13. Alhadj Baba Sangaré, vice president
14. Fatoumata Diarre, voluntary animator
15. Hamadi Houréwo, controller
16. Dicko Bilali 2nd controller
17. Dicko Korobara repr women's organization
18. Adama Guindo, repr. men's organization
19. Ajinguy Sangaré, host
20. Koumbel Sangaré, host women
21. Koulé Coulibaly, Women's health
22. Barietou Sangaré, Women's health
23. Afou Gaïno Sangaré, voluntary animator
24. Babo Boukari Sangaré, Environment
25. Hamadi Oumarou Sangaré, Environment
26. Fatoumata Condé, Environment

Annex 5.4. List of Documents Consulted

DEMANDE DE SOUTIEN DU -MELM 2014-2015
 DEMANDE DE SOUTIEN D'UN NOUVEAU PROGRAMME 2009-2013
 Det Norske Misjonsselskaps strategiplan 2015-2017
 Diakoni og bistand, Programprofilokument 2011
 DOCUMENTATION DES INDICATEURS DU PROJET PDRM-MELM
 Mission Évangélique Luthérienne in Mali, LONG TERM PLAN 2013-2017
 MANUEL DE SUIVI EVALUATION DES PROJETS DE DEVELOPPEMENT DE LA MELM 2014
 MOPTI REGION DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM MID-TERM EVALUATION REPORT 2011
 Plan for Diakoni og bistand Mali 2012 – 2014
 Plan d'activités PDRM-MELM 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015
 RAPPORT D'ACTIVITES ANNUEL 2013
 RAPPORT D'ACTIVITES ANNUEL 2012
 RAPPORT ANNUEL DES ACTIVITES 2011
 RAPPORT ANNUEL DES ACTIVITES 2010
 RAPPORT ANNUEL DES ACTIVITES 2009
 REVIEW OF THE ACTIVITIES RELATED TO THE FIGHT AGAINST FEMALE GENITAL MUTILATION 2009-2012
 RAPPORT D'EVALUATION A MI-PARCOURS DU PROGRAMME DE DEVELOPPEMENT INTEGRE DU HAÏRE ET DE KONNA 2007 PDIHK-MELM
 Supplement to the request for prolongation 2009-2012
 THE CONSTITUTION AND BYLAWS OF THE MISSION EVANGELIQUE LUTHERIENNE AU MALI (MELM) 2012
 Version provisoire du rapport d'activités du 1er semestre 2014
 Financial report 2013
 Financial report 2012
 Financial report 2011
 Financial report 2010

Annex 5.5. Itinerary for Field Trip

DATES	MUNICIPALITY	VILLAGES	ACTORS INVOLVED
18/11/2014	SEVARE	COORDINATION PDRM	EQUIPE COORDINATION, PRESIDENT CA
19/11/2014	KOUNARI	SARE HAMADI, SAMBERE	SUPERVISEUR, ADL, IMAM, CHEF DE VILLAGE, CCAPN, CVAPN, REPRESENTANT CA, RELAI, SOUS PREFET, GROUPEMENT DE FEMMES
20/11/2014	KOUNARI & FATOMA	MANACO, FATOMA	SUPERVISEUR, ADL, IMAM, CHEF DE VILLAGE, CCAPN, CVAPN, REPRESENTANT CA, RELAI, SOUS PREFET, GROUPEMENT DE FEMMES
21/11/2014	KONNA	KONNA VILLE	SUPERVISEUR, ADL, IMAM, CHEF DE VILLAGE, CCAPN, CVAPN, REPRESENTANT CA, RELAI, SOUS PREFET, GROUPEMENT DE FEMMES
22/11/2014	KONNA	SAMA, TIME	SUPERVISEUR, ADL, IMAM, CHEF DE VILLAGE, CCAPN, CVAPN, REPRESENTANT CA, RELAI, SOUS PREFET, GROUPEMENT DE FEMMES
23/11/2014	BORONDOUGOU	DIAMBACOUROU, BOGO	SUPERVISEUR, ADL, IMAM, CHEF DE VILLAGE, CCAPN, CVAPN, REPRESENTANT CA, RELAI, SOUS PREFET, GROUPEMENT DE FEMMES
24/11/2014	BASSIRO	SAMPARA, PATHIA	SUPERVISEUR, ADL, IMAM, CHEF DE VILLAGE, CCAPN, CVAPN, REPRESENTANT CA, RELAI, SOUS PREFET, GROUPEMENT DE FEMMES
25/11/2014	SEVARE	SERVICES TECHNIQUES & PARTENAIRES ADMINISTRATIFS	SERVICES TECHNIQUES & PARTENAIRES ADMINISTRATIFS