



上海映绿公益事业发展中心
NPO Development Center, Shanghai

**Mid-Term Evaluation Report on the Longchuan
Development Project (2007-2011)**

BN no.:10596 no.:GLO-07/107-227-229

Sponsored By Norwegian Mission Alliance

Evaluated By: NPO Development Center Shanghai

Dec.2 – 6, 2009

Longchuan County, Yunnan Province, China

Contents

Part One:	Background.....	3
Part Two:	Review Processes	4
Part Three:	Methods of Evaluation.....	4
Part Four:	Acknowledgements.....	5
Part Five:	Executive summary.....	6
Part Six:	Review Findings	7
Part Seven:	Recommendations	255
Part Eight:	Agenda for Long Chuan evaluation	288
Part Nine:	Participants of Interviewees in Lvliang Village (Chinese).....	30
Part Ten	Participants of Interviewees in Mu Shui Village (Chinese).....	31
Part Eleven:	Terms of Reference	322

Mid-Term Evaluation Report

For Longchuan Development Project in China 2007—2011

Part One: Background

I. Purpose and main goals of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation: It should give all implementing partners (NMA's head office in Norway, Shincon, local project office and Long chuan government) the feedback they need to secure the best possible result of the resources invested in the project, both considering what the main goals **are** for the project and also how the recent development in China may influence these goals. The other purpose is to learn from experiences made within the project context and make the steps necessary in order to improve the quality of the project and ensure that main objectives will be met.

The main goals for the evaluation are:

- To evaluate the effect, the efficiency and the sustainability of the main investments done in the project during the second project period, and to give relevant advices for the future the Longchuan project is still in its first period!!!
- To evaluate and give advice on the implemented and ongoing capacity building programs in the project
- To evaluate the effect, efficiency and sustainability of the capacity building programs

II. Scope of the evaluation

The evaluation is a mid-term evaluation and will have its main focus on the activities implemented in the project period (2007-2011). The evaluation team should understand how the framework conditions for the project have changed during the last years and is welcomed to give their reflections on how these may have affected the project implementation.

III. Project presentation

The Norwegian government requests all development project supported by NORAD to be within the three sectors of Gender, Environment and Human Rights. NMA decided to apply for NORAD funding for the parts of the project that fell under NORAD's requirements. The project was approved for funding by the BN in 2008. The project period is from 2008 to 2011.

The overall project goal is to facilitate sustainable development in Longchuan County through developing our target group's own resources in order to give them the opportunity and motivation to take responsibility for their own and family's lives, and in this way build their own future and their communities future.

The project is located in two townships. There is one model village in each township. The term «Model village» means that the villages develop an independent motive power in their own development through running their own development projects, and that the government sees the value of these skills and develops a wish to transfer this to other villages. The main objectives in the Longchuan Development Project are:

- **Objective 1 (Community Organizing):** Work out a participatory and sustainable model for community based development among minority people in Longchuan.
- **Objective 2 (Gender):** Support processes to improve the overall situation for girls and women, with a special focus on education, the economic situation, health and women's rights.
- **Objective 3 (Environment):** Initiate and support activities to develop sustainable agriculture in Longchuan.
- **Objective 4 (Education):** Reduce school dropouts and improve the educational infrastructure.
- **Objective 5 (Income generation):** Support activities that will create new income generating opportunities.
- **Objective 6 (Health):** Improve the health and hygiene standard through preventive activities.

Part Two: Review Processes

The evaluation team consists of three members/consultants: Ms. Jin Zhaomin, the Executive Director of NDC Shanghai, Ms. Guo Jing, the independent consultant, and Mr. Yang Haiyu, the independent consultant. The evaluation team was accompanied by Ms. Jean from the Shincon Company in Kunming throughout the three day evaluation, and joined by Mr. Per-Olav for the first day activities on December 3 2009.

The evaluation team arrived in Kunming on December 1, 2009. On December 2 the evaluation team flew to Mangshi with Ms. Jean and Mr. Per-Olav, where they were picked up and driven to Longchuan, after a 3 hour drive. The team spent three days from Dec.2 to 5 in Longchuan County, making field visits to the two model villages of Lvliang and Mushui in Mengba and Chengzi Townships respectively.

Part Three: Methods of Evaluation

The evaluation team adopted a variety of methods in the process of evaluation, including literature review, focus group interviews with local community leaders, parents, children, county officials, local partners, Shincon and NMA staff, individual household visits, as well as observations. During the focus group

interviews/discussions, the evaluation consultants took the lead role in facilitating presentation and sharing with above mentioned interviewees, with the presence of the NMA project coordinator and Shincon staff. The evaluation team opened all the group interviews by introducing the tasks of the evaluation, as well as the background of three evaluation members. All efforts were made to ensure the transparency of and the participation of local partners in the evaluation processes.

The length of most group interviews is around 1.5-2 hours, varying from one place to another. All the interviews/discussions were carried out in Mandarin, and local dialect, whenever needed.

A total of 33 adults (officials, head teachers, teachers, village leaders, and parents) were interviewed, as well as 12 school students for the mid-term evaluation.

On December the 5th, the evaluation team presented the preliminary evaluation findings in Chinese to the FAO staff members, which confirmed the key findings contained here within. Appreciation was expressed at the presentation meeting.

Part Four: Acknowledgements

The smooth implementation of the project review would not have been completed without the full support of a number of organizations and individuals. These are: Norwegian Mission Alliance, Shincon Consulting and Trade, Longchuan County Government, Longchuan Foreign Aid Office, relevant project townships and schools, Mr. Per-Olav, Ms. Jean Qin, Ms. Zhang Fuluan, Ms. Yang Dafen, Mr. Li Cong, and Mr. Liao Yong Chao. The evaluation team would like to express their heart-felt appreciation for the invaluable assistance and generous support provided by the above mentioned organizations and individuals throughout the evaluation processes.

Our gratitude also goes to those who helped facilitate the review. These are: Ms. Jean Qin, Ms. Yang Dafen, Mr. Li Cong, Mr. Liang Yongchao and local project coordinators. Your diligence and collective wisdom are prerequisite to the successful completion of this evaluation.

To those respondents who have kindly agreed to take time to participant in the evaluation, the team members of the evaluation team would say that without your support and efforts this mid-term evaluation would not have been possible. We would like to extend our appreciation to all those leaders, teachers, and parents and in particular students from the project schools and communities, for your consent to participate in this activity. We have learned much from you.

Part Five: Executive Summary

In the four-day evaluation, the evaluation team has adopted a variety of methods including literature review, focus group interviews with project main stakeholders in Longchuan County and local communities, and Shincon and NMA staff, making individual household visits and observations, and got a holistic impression of the whole project. Here is the executive summary of the main achievements made by the project in 2007 and 2009 and recommendations for the further improvement in carrying the project in 2010 and 2011:

1. The main achievements have been made by the project

Generally speaking, the project has properly met the needs of the local villagers in Longchuan and positive changes in health have taken place in the villages significantly which are in the right direction of achieving the project goal.

- The health awareness and level of primary care have been much improved with 1) the construction and operation of the public latrines, rubbish pits, more drinking water facilities and the village clinic; 2) the health training which has enabled the village doctor to provide better and more primary health care to villagers and increase the villagers' awareness of HIV/AIDs; and 3) health of women which has improved their health awareness and status.
- The condition and level of education has also been improved with the construction of the new school, the food subsidies to students from poorer families and the financial sponsorship to minority girls;
- The production of farming has been improved with the introduction of composting and the construction of the grain-sunning ground which have reduced the utilization of fertilizers, cost of grain production and quality of grain.
- The traditional leadership has been transformed significantly with the capacity building workshop. Participatory decision making knowledge and skills has not opened their eyes to new way of leadership, but also enabled them to use it in both daily village affairs management and project planning and management. Most important, it initiated a democratic participation in the PLG decision making.
- The above achievements mainly contribute to the following elements: 1) FAO, the responsible local partner: FAO which leads the role of coordination and management of the project; 2) The FAO tries hard to mobilize the local resources through effective collaboration with different parties to make the project successful; 3) Longchuan Government has rendered strong support; 4)

Shincon and NMA team has established very good relation with local government and communities;

- The last but not the least, the FAO has made strict control of fund utilization and monitoring.

2. Recommendations

- **Project budget:** To make the project sustainable and maintain high level of quality, some necessary cost should be included as the monitoring and evaluation allowance for the project staff.
- **Capacity building:** FAO and PLG core members should be given more opportunities of training and exchange visits to understand and grasp skills in participatory development approaches, rights protection, environmental which will help enhance their capacity to facilitate training sessions themselves. Writing skills is also needed for good project documentation. The principles and operational procedures of NMA should be stressed in training for the smooth handover of the project to the local partners.
- **Project management:** 1) More exchange visits and interactions including village to village visits and exchange, seminars, meetings, or study visits to good community development sites in and out of Longchuan County shall be organized between the two model villages and townships to enhance sharing and inspirations amongst different communities. (This was proposed strongly by the local PLG members to be a valuable means of capacity building for them to widen their visions and broaden their scope of work.) 2) Careful consideration and actions need to be taken to enable a smooth transition of project coordination and management from Shincon to the New Consulting Company in 2010. 3) The funds transfer mechanism including the correspondence, the funds transfer procedures, and frequency of transfer shall be reviewed and improved for more effective project management at county level.
- **New project initiatives:** 1) Children's participation in the project activities shall be explored and strengthened; 2) Education of English for the village schools should be enhanced to reduce the educational gap between rural and urban. Some additional resources should be identified to meet the urgent needs of local villages in primary English education; 3)
- **Project duplication:** Bio-gas project and project documentation are strongly recommended to be enhanced for future implementation.

Part Six: Review Findings

Against the overall project goal of the Longchuan Development Project:

...to facilitate sustainable development in Longchuan County through developing our target group's own resources in order to give them the opportunity and motivation to take responsibility for their own and family's lives, and in this way build their own future and their communities future.

The mid-term evaluation team concludes, based on the information and observation done in the evaluation in Longchuan, that the Longchuan Development Project is making positive progress towards achieving the above project goal. The Longchuan Development Project (hereafter referred to as the Project) has been able to facilitate a participatory development process in the two model villages through the operation of the Village Development Committees in implementation of a series of community-based initiatives including community participatory assessments and planning, water, sanitation and health facilities, sponsorship program for school students, composting and environmental waste disposal activities, and capacity building for community members/leaders and the project office. The Project Office (Foreign Aid Office) is proven to be a capable facilitating body leading the pilot communities in mobilizing and organizing the local resources to take responsibility for their own and family's wellbeing, and assisting in building the community's future in a better way.

The following paragraphs elaborate the key results of the evaluation, through analysis of effects and efficiency, the constraints and challenges, and recommendations for future.

- **Objective 1 (Community Organizing)** Work out a participatory and sustainable model for community based development among minority people in Longchuan.
- **Objective 2 (Gender)** Support processes to improve the overall situation for girls and women, with a special focus on education, the economic situation, health and women's rights.
- **Objective 3 (Environment)** Initiate and support activities to develop sustainable agriculture in Longchuan.
- **Objective 4 (Education)** Reduce school dropouts and improve the educational infrastructure.
- **Objective 5 (Income generation)** Support activities that will create new income generating opportunities.

- **Objective 6 (Health)** Improve the health and hygiene standard through preventive activities.

One cross-cutting issue of interests: There features a Myanmar connection throughout the NMA mid term evaluation. The key project activities in Lvliang and Mushui villages are benefiting both Chinese and Burmese. The public latrine, the drinking water, the health clinic, the school project, the health training all have a bearing on the interests of Burmese women married to Chinese husbands, and Burmese who move across the borders of China and Myanmar for business and private purposes. At boarder towns, as a result of the shared cultural and geographical traditions and occupancies, cross-boarder migration, moving and interaction is part of local daily lives.

1. Project results

As the activities implemented in the two model villages of Lvliang and Mushui were at different stages and not necessarily easily comparable, the evaluation findings will be presented by villages.

Lvliang Village, Mengba Township, Longchuan County

The construction of public latrines, the drinking water facilities, the grain-sunning ground, and the village clinic have been initiated as part of the community planning facilitated by the Village Development Committee (VDC), and resulted in positive changes in improvement of health status of villagers.

■ **Public Latrines**

Before the public latrines were constructed, villagers of Lvliang, and villagers from Myanmar across the boarder would just find any place in the wilderness, in the field, along the rivers for natures' calling, which was termed as *Latrines with Sceneries* by the locals. As a result, the rivers and streams were at higher risk of contaminations from human excrements. An example of the damaging effects was illustrated by a villager who developed polio as a result of the contaminated drinking water from the river that also serves as the natural border between China and Myanmar. He died a few years ago after suffering from Polio for two decades. (Polio is not necessarily connected with contaminated water)The practice of using Latrine with Sceneries also created rather dirty and messy environment for the village, in particular for important conventional village trade fair once every five days, when local villagers, traders from afar and Myanmar villagers congregate for economic exchange activities.

The construction of a public latrine at the verge of the village market where the trade fair takes place created convenience for fair goers when they receive the nature's calling. As a result, the health environment of the village has improved significantly.

It was also reported by the deputy village party secretary, a member of the VDC, that they received a lot of complaints from the villagers and traders who attend the trade fair on lack of access to public latrine facilities, and after the construction and utilization of the project latrine, great convenience has been provided for these villagers and traders, saving their time, as well as the environment from being contaminated.

With the construction of public latrines, the village doctors were able to advocate for change of behaviors of the villagers from using tree sticks to using toilet paper. The change of behavior will also ‘benefit’ villagers in improving their health, as the Director of the Mengba Township Hospital commented during the interview.

■ Construction of Village Clinics and village doctor training

The support to the construction and equipping of the village clinic has received positive welcome and made significant improvement to the health of villagers. There was a village clinic before the project support arrived. However, the clinic was not functioning normally due to lack of necessary medical equipments and facilities. As a result, local villagers in Lvliang village had to go to the Mengba Township Clinic, located 25 kilometers away from Lvliang village, to access medical services when the village clinic could not handle their cases, causing significant challenge to the health and economic viabilities of local villagers.

With the support from the project, the village clinic was equipped with essential medical facilities including a refrigerator and a high-temperature sterilizer for needles. The drugs are now able to be kept for longer period of time, saving the operating costs of the clinic while ensuring a better availability of a variety of drugs for villager patients, in particular those HIV positive patients taking Anti-retroviral drugs. The sterilizer ensures that all the needles are now sterilized, effectively tackling the risks of transmission of HIV through un-sterilized needles, one of a key obstacle in preventing local villagers to access the village clinic in the past.

At present, an average of 40 people access the clinic for medical services every day, seeking help to treat cold and Gynecological infections. The township project leading group member expressed that the village clinic is functioning well, as the government-funded New Rural Cooperative Medical Aid Mechanism is in place and encourages local villagers to access health services at the village clinic, at a lower and subsidized costs.¹ Villagers from 6 villages across the boarder in Myanmar also make visits to the clinic nowadays. The clinic also helps deliver mosquito nets, contraceptive devices such as condoms, and collect blood samples and CD4 for test purposes for people infected/affected by HIV/AIDS.

¹ That being said, it was also reported that due to the extreme poverty, some villagers would still find it difficult to meet the minimum personal expenses of 80 yuan that has to be paid by themselves.

Through a series of village doctor training workshops, including the doctor training by the Singaporean doctors, the NMA project has enabled the village doctor to be able to master the most up to date medical knowledge regarding the women and children's health. The village doctor has also arranged village level health awareness raising initiatives in the village for women. Local women, in particular Myanmar women who married Chinese men in the village, were able to learn knowledge and skills in women's health and nutritional health for children at these training events. During the interviews with some of these women, it was reported that they now know how to treat the diarrhea of their children with home made salted water. Village doctor also informed the evaluation team that since the construction of village clinic is complete, the incidences of diarrhea, including child diarrhea, has dropped. With the construction and use of public latrines, the village doctor were able to combine the health awareness raising with the habit building in using toilet paper, rather than sticks and tree branches, ensuring that the awareness raising activities are grounded on daily practices.

Interestingly, as reported by the Director of Mengba Township Clinic, the support to the clinic, and the establishment and operation of the project leading group (see more details in the following paragraphs), have also contributed to the increased rate of birth delivery in the hospitals in Lvliang village (over 70%), and dropped fatality rate of mothers and children in the village. In one incidence, the clinic, backed by the strong leadership of the project leading group at village and township level, successfully transferred a pregnant woman for timely medical help, saving two lives.

In the words of Mr. Dong, the deputy Township governor, the clinics and health components of the NMA project is of "significant help" to the village and township.

■ **Drinking Water Facilities**

Construction of drinking water facilities proves to be an important initiative to improving the health of villagers in Xin Zhai natural village, Lvliang Village. Mr. Dong, the deputy governor of Mengba Township made it clear in his presentation that the drinking water facilities ensures villagers drink safe and clean water. A field visit to a water tank gave the evaluation members a chance to drop by a family near the tank. The feedback from the man indicates that he liked the drinking water facilities, which "made life easier and health of family members better". It was observed during the family visit that there are basins of clothes waiting to be washed and a set of tooth brushing gears including tooth paste and brushes, right by the water tap. He told the evaluation team that before the drinking water facilities were in place, he had to go to the river to wash clothes and fetch water for drinking. "Since the water facilities were in place, we experienced fewer incidences of diarrhea."

Traditionally, fetching of drinking water is a female-oriented choir for many rural

households in Long Chuan. A few interviewed village women informed the evaluation team that they used to travel quite a distance to fetch water, which is not very clean. The construction of safe drinking water facilities ensured that clean drinking water reaches the household and saves the physical labor, as well as time needed for water fetching from a distance. As a result, the construction of water facilities relieves many women in the villages from water fetching choir, creating more time and space for women in daily lives. It also improves the quality of drinking water, and the physical health of villagers.²

The concern over the environmental health of rural areas in China has featured prominently in the Chinese mainstream media on December 25th, pointing to the escalating scale of the pollution in countryside, and the heightened level of care and concern from the senior policy makers in China. To an extent, the efforts made by the NMA projects in both Lvliang and Mushui Villages to improve the drinking water facilities and construct the public latrines represents positive moves combating the decaying environmental pollution in rural areas in one boarder county at the southwestern tip of China.

As an indication of the positive effects of above mentioned project activities, it was reported that the incidents of cases of diarrhea by villagers have dropped significantly since the use of the latrines.

■ Grain-sunning Ground

A total of 2 grain-sunning ground was constructed in Lvliang village. As one villager made it clear that the construction and use of the grain-sunning ground created convenience for villagers, who are rather pleased to have such facility in their village. Before the ground was in place, villagers struggled to find venue for sunning their grains. They had to take turns to use the limited spaces available in the village, or drive the grains to empty spaces quite far away for sunning. Thus the sunning of grain incurred economic costs and took time for each and every household. Some villagers had complained about losses of grain due to difficulty in finding the sunning ground, which accounted for a good proportion of their economic incomes. With the construction and use of the grain-sunning ground, villagers are now able to access ground for sunning of grains when needed, enjoying easy access, saved transportation and rent costs, as well as the economic losses caused by decaying grain due to lack of sunning. Household visits and interviews also confirmed that the construction of grain-sunning ground is ‘welcomed’.

² It shall be noted that the construction of water facilities predated the project support of NMA, as the evaluation team found out that some other villages in Mengba Township had constructed safe drinking water facilities using government funding. However, the evaluation team was informed by the township leaders that a number of these government supported drinking water facilities have been worn and out of function, needing further input and support, in particular in the maintenance and sustainability of the facilities.

■ School building and support

Before the support of NMA to the school was in place, the Lvliang Primary School had only an earthen playground and limited amount of students, as reported by Mr. Dong, the deputy Governor of Mengba Township. The wall encircling the school was broken, making it easy for buffalos to intrude into the campus. There was no library for students either. The support from the NMA project helped fix the wall, ensuring the safety of students, improve the playground, build up and equip a library so that students are able to do sports, reading and recreational activities.

In addition, the project funding support on the food subsidies and the salary of one cook for the school has yielded positive results too. The food subsidies lasted for over 2 years, and benefited a total of 200 children/times. As informed by the Head teacher of the school that the annual physical check of students' health indicated that students' health status are rather good.

The field visit to the school confirms that the students at the school appear to be in good health and mental state. Students interviewed³ shared that they liked playing basketball, badmintons, as well as reading. The favorite books are story books, and they preferred to use the library and watch TV. These students were pro-active, responsive, dynamic and innovative, with positive attitudes to life. When asked, these students told one of the evaluation team members that they were aware of the NMA support to the food subsidies for them and appreciated the support in a sincere manner.

As a result, the school has not experienced any drop-out in the past year. Moreover, a number of children from Myanmar are now enrolled in the Lvliang Primary school as it provides quality boarding life and teaching, which has been highly regarded as one of the key prides of the Chinese Government. Concerns over the reshuffling of the school, as part of the national trend to consolidate rural primary schools and middle schools were raised over the future of the school. The response from the accompanying Education Bureau official was that due to the special feature of the school as being the border school covering both Chinese and Burmese students, the school will continue its operation as an independent school, and not be merged with other schools, in the name of consolidation.

■ Sponsorship program for minority girls at the center school in Longchuan:

The sponsorship program accommodated 50 girl children in 2009. According to Mr. Huang, the President of the Labor Union of Longchuan Education Bureau, a long-time partner of the FAO, the sponsorship program has seen positive improvements of academic performances of participating girl children, and

³ Before and after lunch, a group interview and one individual interview were carried out with 16 students (14 girls and 2 boys), where games were used to help facilitate the communication process.

strengthened adapting capability of these girl children to the society. To him, the sponsorship program has also raised the general social awareness on the importance of girl's education, through the sponsorship action itself, and the information that these girl children have taken back to their families and communities.

From a strategic perspective of the County Government, Mr. Huang stressed that the implementation of the sponsorship program is in line with the government policy directions to support education for girl children, in particular those girl children from ethnic minority groups such as Dai and Jin Po. It was also reported that the first year of sponsorship has also been welcomed by the community people, and there have been a great many of inquiries received by the Education Bureau this year on the possibility of continued sponsorship program for 2010.

■ **Community Mobilization and Project Leading Group**

A participatory and sustainable model for community based development among minority people in Lvliang is in the forming. The effects and impacts of the above mentioned project activities achieved what they have achieved exactly because of the strong managerial support delivered by the Project Leading Group⁴. The Project Leading Group (PLG) consists of 11 members including Mr. Dong, the Deputy Governor of Mengba Township, headteacher of the Primary School, Director of the Township Clinic, Teacher, head of villager's group and members of the Villagers Committee and ordinary villager. The composition of the group members reflects the interests of different groups of the village and facilitates the smooth implementation of project activities. Member who's the coordinator of women's affairs in the village will take charge in adocating for women's support, while head of the youth group will lead youth in implmenting project related activities, so on and so forth.

There are three female members, representing mainly the health sector (township and village doctors). During the group interview, the female members were relatively more silent than their male counterpart (with the exception of the Director of the Township Clinic) .

As reported by the Township Clinic Director, the PLG serves as the center of solidarity for the village development as none-other bodies have done so. A case in point is that one pregnant woman was found to be in medical emergency, and the PLG members coordinated in a timely and effective manner to have the woman delivered to the hospital for treatment that saved her life and the life of her unborn baby. In her words, "without the PLG, there is no such solidarity" to act in the best interest of the pregnant woman. This same point on the importance of the PLG was echoed by Ms. Yang Dafen, the Director of the Project Office, who reiterated that the project has brought about solidarity to Lvliang Village, which would not be there without the

⁴ The Project Leading Group (PLG) is referred to as the Village Development Committee (VDC) in the English version of the Terms of Reference for the Mid-term Evaluation. As the local project partners and community members refer to the VDC as the Project Leading Group, we will use the PLG instead throughout the report.

PLG.

The PLG holds meetings on a regular basis to discuss on key matters regarding village development such as drinking water, health, education, construction of the grain-drying ground. The PLG would also consult with the Project Office on the key village development matters, which usually provides general comments and directions to the PLG, leaving the implementation of key activities to the PLG. A series of procedures in management of the drinking water facilities, the grain-drying ground were produced and put in place through the PLG meetings and follow up support by the PLG.

There is not a written Management Rules for the PLG regarding the mandate, the division of labor, the coordination mechanism in terms of frequency of meetings and decision making processes. When questioned about the lack of such Rules, both the Project Office and the PLG members explained that the oral agreement on the management rules suffice at the moment for the smooth operation of the PLG, and the project in general. One case in point was that conventionally, the culture of the Jin Po and Dai people has been largely passed on verbally through generations.

In conclusion, the PLG serves as the hub for participatory and sustainable community development, through the NMA supported project. Its functions are increasingly being recognized by the local government and community members, possessing the potential to develop into a driving force for future development initiatives in Lvliang village.

Mu Shui Village, Chengzi Township, Longchuan County

Mushui Village has 1,288 villagers, of which 814 are Jinpo, 141 are Dai, and 315 are Han, respectively accounting for 63.19%, 10.94% and 24.46% of the total population. Project had only started in 2009, with the initial implementation of four main activities of construction of public latrines and rubbish pits, the composting, health training for women and capacity building training for the PLG members.

■ Public Latrines and Rubbish Pits

As the construction work is still underway, the evaluation team made field visits to the latrine and rubbish pits construction sites and saw the progress of construction work. The public latrines and rubbish pits are new for the villagers and meeting their needs. During interviews with villagers and the PLG members, it was discovered that local villagers had long been complaining about the difficulty of accessing toilets during key public events, and the random-less peeing and shitting that adds to the environmental health of the village, and that the worsening village environment due to increasing amount of white rubbish, the initiative of construction of public latrines are in their best interests. Local villagers interviewed reported positive attitudes towards

the idea of constructing the public latrines and rubbish pits, because they do contribute to improving the environment and health of local villagers. In fact, construction of latrines and rubbish pits featured as the top two most-concerned issues by villagers through participatory assessment meetings.

The question remains about how to change people's health behavior in order for them to adapt to the new public latrines and rubbish pits. Discussions have already taken place for villagers to raise their awareness and knowledge, with the support from the PLG. In these occasions, participatory methods such as role plays were used to facilitate discussions on the management of public latrines.

■ **Composting**

Before the NMA project introduced composting training, local villagers had done composting by piling up the pig excrements and let it be trodden by cows. As the training on composting took place, local villagers trained learned to add in leaves and vegetables for fermentation(发酵)during composting, which helped them reduce the consumption of fertilizers, thus the production costs. As the female village specialist on animal husbandry reported that by composting she has saved 7 bags of fertilizer (70-80 Yuan/bag), reducing the production costs by 500 Yuan in 2009.

Another PLG member confirmed the cost saving feature of composting by citing his experience in planting sugar cane. In the past, he would spend 3000 Yuan worth of fertilizers for sugar cane planting. He did three pile of composting this year, and as a result the costs for fertilizer purchase dropped to 2000 Yuan, making a saving of 1,000 Yuan. Moreover, he reported that the use of eco-friendly bio-fertilizer improved the growth of the sugar cane. Similar improvements in quality and tastes also were reported with potatoes planted with composting. One of the villagers even did comparative tests between sugar canes fed by chemical fertilizer and sugar canes sprayed with composted excrements. The results suggest that the two lots of sugar canes grew to the same height, while those fed by composted excrements grew to be bigger than those applied with chemical fertilizer.

The use of human excrements for composting has also contributed positively to the environmental health status of the village by reducing the rubbish and excrements in the communities.

■ **Health Training for Women**

The health training for women is welcomed by local villagers. It was reported that women participants could recall the training contents easily because the trainers used demonstration in training to better teach women on making of the salt syrup for babies suffering from diarrhea, as well as breastfeeding through demonstration using a doll, which were never used in the government-supported health training. It was also

discovered that the trainers have used local dialect and ethnic minority language in communicating the training message to local women, which proved to be very effective in achieving the purpose of training. Some older ladies who could not speak or understand Han Chinese were able to learn health knowledge during the training workshop as the female trainer spoke in local dialect and ethnic minority language during the sessions. The group interview with PLG members provided an opportunity for the evaluation team to witness the pro-active participation of and articulate sharing by the village specialist in family planning, who has facilitated the health training, and is also a PLG member.

■ Capacity Building for PLG members

The capacity building workshops held in Kunming for the PLG members were mentioned rather frequently during the interview with PLG members, indicating the impacts and impression of the workshop on PLG members. For both the Director and the Deputy Director of the Villagers Committee, the participatory approaches they have learnt during the Kunming workshop proves to be of significant value to the community organizing by the PLG.

Upon returning from Kunming, the PLG members, led by Ms. Pai, the Deputy Director of the Villagers Committee carried out a series of participatory community meetings and workshops with villagers to assess their needs and prioritize key issues needing solutions, building up a strong and solid basis on which the following project activities were designed and implemented. Through Ms. Pai's introduction, it is obvious that she is a strong supporter of the participatory approach. She told the evaluation team that games were used in their meetings with villagers to break ice, and every participant can speak out their minds, "breaking the sense of hierarchy". Despite the discomfort some village cadres felt at the beginning of the participatory meetings, the PLG members applied a series of participatory approaches they've mastered from Kunming workshop such as role plays, warm-up games and brain storming in discussing project-related topics including management of public latrines.

Mr. Shang, the Director of the Villagers Committee echoed Ms. Pai on the transformative impacts of the participatory approaches from the Kunming Workshop, "We used to sit at the Chairperson's place at villagers meetings, now I would just sit with villagers in a circle, removing all the desks." He confirmed that PLG members, after the Kunming capacity building workshop, picked up the participatory approaches and applied them in their village development matters, such as brain storming. Ms. Pai and other PLG members also reported frequent use of participatory techniques including village mapping and priority ranking, which take advantage of locally available ranking materials.

In the past, villager meetings were usually held in compulsory manner, while now "games were used by us to help reach common understanding and agreements", as Ms.

Pai put it, “people here are increasingly realizing the fact that we can not rely upon others to help us with money, we must not live on crotch. We must stand on our own.”

The capacity building workshop has effectively transformed the way the PLG members think and act in their village development matters.

■ **Community Mobilizing and Project Leading Group**

Following on the transformative impacts of the Participatory Capacity Building for PLG, the promising and evolving potential of PLG in facilitating community mobilization is a highlight of the Mu Shui Project.

The PLG consists of 10 members, who were selected from a wide and representative pool, including the Director of the Villagers Committee, Deputy Director of the Villagers Committee, the School Head teacher, the Village Specialist in health promotion and family planning, the village specialist in women’s affairs, the village specialist in youth affairs and the village specialist in elderly people’s affairs. The PLG has also built its development initiatives on the basis of the existing innovative governance structure of hamlets, which comprises 40 households or so, and serves as the governance intermediary between the Villagers Committee and the villagers. The key PLG members are also the key elected officials from the Villagers Committee, combining the elected power with the participatory facilitating functions that they play in different incarnations. There may be different interpretations on the overlapping of memberships for these key PLG members, though it is clearly a contextually rooted practice that contributes to the sustainable community development, from the one year operation in Mushui Village.

The PLG functions in an effective way. Throughout the evaluation, the evaluation team members witnessed the solidarity and excellent team work demonstrated by the PLG members. With a written Management Responsibility Rules, the PLG members have had their key responsibilities hammered out clearly. The PLG managed to call upon the great majority of PLG members, as well as some key officials and villagers who have been involved in the NMA project to different degrees for the group interview, where all the participants talked and shared on the project implementation in a pro-active and open manner. The principles of PLG operation is, as Mr. Shang, the Party Secretary of Mushui Village puts it, “Solidarity First, Implementation Second.” The progress of the project in 2009 proves that solidarity and team work brings about concrete implementation of activities that meet the needs of local villagers.

The construction of the public latrines and the rubbish pits were the top priority needs identified by local villagers through participatory planning meetings facilitated by the PLG. Using participatory approaches, PLG members facilitated needs assessment and planning meetings with head of different hamlets and in some occasion, all villagers,

where head of hamlets and villagers were encouraged to speak out their minds and discuss the priority challenges needing support from the PLG. Based on the proposed activities, PLG continued engaging with villagers using participatory methods, by facilitating discussions and planning on the management of the latrines and rubbish pits. At one point during the construction planning, one villager dissented on the positioning of the entrance to the rubbish pit as it faced his house. The PLG chipped in and coordinated the change of the entrance location. Then some villagers brought up the issue of wanting to charge land appropriation fee for construction of the latrine. PLG, again, with support from the heads of hamlets, made efforts to coordinate with relevant villagers and solved the disputes. Through these coordination efforts, a management method for use of public latrines and rubbish pits were in place. Throughout the planning, construction and management processes, the PLG played a key coordinating role in mobilizing community people and ensuring smooth implementation of project activities.

There was a strong sense of democratic participation amongst the PLG members, with friendly and mutually respecting interactions. The composition of members also reflects a balanced gender makeup, with 5 female members who freely and enthusiastically shared their views and suggestions on the project activities. Ms. Pai, the deputy Director of the Mu Shui Village led women's participation in the NMA project with much passion and energy. In an informal occasion of working dinner, she diplomatically challenged Mr. Shang's gender-biased opinion that women should be family-oriented. As a young woman, she has worked in Kunming for a famous dance troupe for a couple of years, being open-minded and enthusiastic about local development. Her insightful understanding and energetic application of participatory development theories and approaches in the project implementation paves the way for solid community mobilization, with a balanced gender perspective.

PLG in Mushui maintained a constructive and collaborative relationship with both the township government and influencing villagers who are not members of the PLG. At the evaluation interview, Mr. Shao, Deputy Director of Chengzi Township was present throughout and made constructive comments and sharing, on an equal basis with PLG Members. At present was also the Township Government Communication staff, who contributed to the video documentation of the Mushui Project activities. During the interview, it also turned out that a number of invited villagers, e.g. the influential animal farmers, demonstrated their interests and insights in contributing to the village development initiatives, by making comments and proposals for future activities.

With all above being said, it shall be noted that the Villager Committee election is scheduled for 2010, when the key Village Committee elected officials including Mr. Shang and Ms. Pai would have to go through election processes. There may be change of elected members that would exert impact on the operation of the PLG and the project activities.

As Mr. Yang Dafeng, the Director of the Project Office puts it, “the successful implementation of the project activities in Mu Shui so far can’t be achieved without the support of the PLG.” The highlight of the Mu Shui project is a strong and united PLG leading a bottom up participatory development process.

2. Achievements and weaknesses in regard to the project organizing and local project management

I. Achievements

■ Good local partner: FAO

The achievements of the project results in Lvliang Village, Mengba Township and Mushui Village, Chengzi Township depend primarily on the effective project management and coordination carried out by the Longchuan County Foreign Aid Office (FAO).

The Foreign Aid Office (FAO) has 5 project staff, headed by Ms. Yang Dafeng, the President of the Longchuan County Red Cross. Mr. Liang Yongchao is the designated project officer in charge of the NMA project, and receives support from other three members of the office in detailed project management. Except Ms. Yang, the other 4 project staffs are all male, of which three have been transferred from teaching posts in middle and primary schools, and one is a civil servant designated for the work of Longchuan Red Cross. The evaluation findings suggest that the setup of the FAO ensures that there is sufficient staffing to follow up and manage the project, with the existing staffing, as well as the strong managerial role played by PLGs in the model villages and townships.

■ Collaboration and coordination with different parties

The FAO shares the same staff team with the Longchuan County Red Cross. In this way, the FAO is able to enjoy some authoritative power, while maintain its flexibility as a mass organization. All five staff members are paid by the government and work in the FAO as fulltime employees.

It is observed that the key staff of the FAO, in particular Ms. Yang Dafeng and Mr. Li Cong (who has very recently transferred to the County People’s Political Consultative Conference) are capable of effective leadership and coordination in the project implementation and management. Through years of international cooperative experiences, they are highly sensitized on participatory development that advocates a bottom-up approach, and put theories into practices through their strong and effective support to the PLGs and local community members in daily project management. As Mr. Li said at the end of the evaluation interview with PLG members in Mushui Village, that “the development initiatives shall come from us, as it is us who need to develop our village, not the project/donor”.

The FAO, since its inception, has managed a series of international cooperative

projects in the field of HIV/AIDS prevention and treatment, children's welfare, poverty alleviation, micro-credit, community development, with a number of key international NGOs including Salvation Army, Save the Children UK, NMA, Ricci Matteo Social Services and Global Fund. The FAO has functioned as the primary liaison unit for all international cooperation projects carried out in Longchuan County. FAO, in its official mandate, aims to serve as the county government representative organization in management, coordination and implementation of foreign aid projects in Longchuan County. Its main responsibilities include the planning and implementation of foreign aid projects; the designing of project implementation plans in accordance with the project agreements and the expectations of the county government, coordination and organization of project construction by relevant government departments; taking charge in the allocation, distribution and application of project funds, equipments and supplies; managing all the fixed assets and investments of foreign aid projects, and making the best out of these assets.

It was also found out that the FAO does coordinate other international cooperation projects by other NGOs in Mushui Village. World Vision was working with Chengzi Township to implement micro-credit project to support local villagers increase their economic viability, and Mushui Village is one of the project villages. The FAO and Township governor frankly shared this information and proposed to strengthen the synchronization of different project supports in the same project villages.

■ **Skills and experiences of project management improved through capacity building training**

Key project staff members of FAO have been trained through a series of capacity training initiatives organized by Shincon in the past two years, on key development issues including participatory approaches in community development. In addition, they have also attended a series of training workshops organized and delivered by other International NGOs. Mr. Li, for example, was in charge of the project cooperation with Save the Children for a while and received a series of training through that project cooperation. Mr. Liang went through a similar set of project cooperation and accumulated a good deal of experiences and capacity in managing development projects.

Throughout the evaluation, we were able to feel and observe the skillful liaison and coordination by Ms. Yang, Mr. Li and Mr. Liang. The evaluation also suggests that these key staff members of the FAO have good understanding and grasp of the key project principles and project goals. One obvious indicator is the above-mentioned PLG members' grasp and application of the participatory approaches in project implementation, which was clearly a result of the coaching and support provided by the FAO staff members. Ms. Yang concluded the evaluation interview by sharing her views, "the NMA project is different from others in that it has an overall framework centering on the environment and the protection of the rights for community people, in particular women and children." This understanding of project principles was

echoed by Mr. Li and Mr. Liang several times during the interview processes. It is fair to say that the leaders of FAO have a good understanding of the principles and goals of the project.

As Ms. Zhang, the Vice Governor of Longchuan County Government commented, FAO takes charge in coordinating the implementation of foreign aid projects and enhanced the effectiveness and efficiency of these projects, which are important supplements to the government's efforts to develop local communities. To her, the FAO does not function in a hegemonic and controlling way in managing foreign aid, but rather serves as a coordinator between different government departments and governments at different levels. The evaluation findings confirm her comments. The FAO has developed and maintained a positive relationship with key government departments such as Education Bureau, Water and Agriculture Bureau, Health Bureau, as well as township government, and Villagers Committees. There are still some foreign aid projects that were channeled into the county and implemented by other agencies, such as the County Political Consultative Conference.

■ **Strong government support**

The FAO has been able to call on the support from relevant government departments in implementation of project activities, given its official status endorsed by the County Government, as well as its incarnation as long-standing mass organization (Red Cross). In the school reconstruction and scholarship projects, the FAO coordinated closely with Education Bureau in the design, planning and implementation processes. The Director of the Labor Union of County Education Bureau was invited to accompany the evaluation team during our visit to Lvliang, and gave valuable insights and contribution to the evaluation. He commented positively on the smooth cooperative relationship between FAO and the Education Bureau. In the drinking water facilities project, local Water and Agriculture Bureau were invited to provide technical support in construction and maintenance of the facilities. Village Doctor training initiative required liaison between the FAO and Health Bureau. The evaluation findings prove that the FAO has achieved an effective cooperative relationship with relevant government departments in the project implementation.

■ **Good relation with local government and communities**

The field evaluation indicates that the FAO has also maintained a constructive and friendly cooperative relationship with relevant townships, model village's PLGs and community members. In both model villages, the deputy township governors of Mengba and Chengzi Townships were both present and made valuable contribution to the interviews. It was clear that they were dedicated to the project activities described above, believing in the value of the NMA supported project activities for their townships. They all made verbal commitments to lend their full report in the future implementation of the NMA projects, based on their understanding of the project principles and interests in governance of the townships. According to the interviews with FAO staff and township governors, the FAO made sure that the township

government was kept in the loop of communication and involved in all the key planning and implementation stages of the project.

■ **Strict control of fund utilization and monitoring**

In order to make sure that all the project funds are used for their intended purposes and monitored on a regular basis, the FAO arranges one audit per year for every project, to ensure that the expenditure follows the principle of thrift, and the saved funds to be invested into the project community. Correspondingly, a designated account and bookkeeping system was put in place, under the direct management of the county government finance bureau. Therefore the FAO will not have any direct cash transactions on this account. It must first pay for project activities and then get re-imburement from the County Government Finance Bureau, which follows a strict procedure of review, authorization and approval. At the village level, the finances of villages are managed by the Township Finance Station (in particular cash-related matters), while every village would have their own finance group taking care of the finance related matters. These system functions to ensure that the finances, in particular the use of project funds, are monitored and misuse of funds avoided.

The NMA project holds its strength in having a strong partner – FAO, which is equipped with full-fledged staffing that have been built up through years of involvement in managing a variety of international development projects, receives the support endorsed by the county government, and possesses capacity to coordinate activities amongst a diversity of government departments, mass organizations, township governments, villagers committees, and local communities. Most importantly, as Ms. Yang of the FAO puts it, “the project’s key strength is that it plans annual work together with local partners, enabling the project activities to be contextually appropriate.” Also, according to the FAO staff members, the NMA project delivers funding support to both hardware and software input, representing a balanced approach.

It was also reported that NMA project provides due flexibility in adjustment of project activities and funding budget in August every year, which facilitates changes necessary for the changing local contexts and circumstances.

II. Rooms to improve

■ **Stability of the FAO team**

The most critical weakness of the project, according to the staffs, is the incredibly high rate of staff turnover and changes in the NMA and FAO, affecting the continuity and effectiveness of the project implementation. Per-olav is the third project officer of NMA in charge of Longchuan Development project in the past two years. The frequent change of NMA project officer made it hard for the FAO and Shincon in maintaining a long term steady relationship with NMA officers, and much time was spent on handing over and familiarization. On the side of FAO, as mentioned above,

there have been three project officers in charge of the NMA project in two years time. Firstly it was Mr. Huo, who was later promoted to another government department, and then it was Mr. Li, who was just transferred to the County Political Consultative Conference in November 2009. Now Mr. Liang is the current project officer in charge of the NMA project. The change of staff means disruption in project implementation and re-orientation of partnerships between FAO and relevant stakeholders. Despite the fact that Ms. Yang the head of the FAO remained on her post and Mr. Liang being a capable project person from his involvement in other international projects, the high rate of staff turn over still exerted impacts on the smooth operation of the project⁵.

The recent news on the change of project implementing agency from Shincon to another consulting firm was also raised as a key concern and potential blow to the project implementation by the FAO and local community partners. Interviewed project personnel expressed their appreciation of the valuable support Shincon staff has granted them throughout the years, and were concerned that the smooth communication and effective support they have had may experience hurdles as they would need to handle the handover period with the new coordinating consulting firm. A sense of insecurity was present amongst the FAO staff and local partners.

■ **Documentation of projects and summary of project experiences**

Another weakness of the NMA project, according to the FAO staff and PLG members in the two model villages, lays in the weak documentation and summary of the project experiences. Project has progressed in the past one and two years, good practices and results have been gained. However, there is little good documentation of the project available. The evaluation team finds that some of the community based participatory development approaches piloted in these two model villages, including the needs assessment, participatory planning, operation of the PLG, and the liaison and coordination played by FAO at County, Township and Village levels, could be better documented and summarized, for future sharing and project replication purposes. In this regard, the FAO staff admitted that they found it difficult to summarize and document project experiences, and to form project proposal and reports.

⁵ The weakness of the FAO is that three of its project staffs do not have a secure employment status, as the FAO is not yet a permanent department that enjoys the government financing support, like any other functional departments such as Education and Health Bureau. The other weakness is the high mobility rate of the staff members. Since the FAO was up and running, two of the project staff members, including Mr. Li Cong, have been identified by other County agencies for their outstanding performances and capacities, and transferred out of the FAO. For the project, and FAO, this counts as a weakening factor, in fact, this could also be viewed more as a strength because it indicate the importance of the FAO as a talents training school, and the conducive environment for staff members to build up their capacity and move on to other important positions. As a result, the NMA project faces the challenges in the staff turnover of the FAO staff, as well as potential change of the PLG members, two levels of key implementing actors of the project.

■ Funds transfer mechanism

The FAO staff and PLG members also listed a flawed funds transfer mechanism as an area needing further improvement in the NMA project implementation. Previous cases of difficulties in funds transfer have caused some major disruptions to the project operation. The transfer of funds were delayed seriously as a result of lack of effective communication and response mechanism on the NMA side, causing economic costs and staff time and energy on the side of FAO and PLG.

The FAO has played a key role in linking up the policy directions of the County Government and the grassroots community interests, through its management of NMA project. Its function as both the managing and coordinating department for foreign aid, and implementer of NMA project at county level enabled the FAO to be able to combine and synchronize the directions of the county government and needs from grassroots villages. The above mentioned project achievements through participatory processes are clear indications of sufficient attention given to the needs and interests of local villagers, while the full government support provided by leaders from both county and township levels signal that these development initiatives are in line with the policy directions. It shall be emphasized that the overall policy direction of the county government are people-centered and development oriented.

To quote Ms. Zhang, the Deputy County Governor who is in charge of the FAO work, that the county government “recognizes the promising development of the project, and places due trust in the FAO team”, as the FAO “is a great team”, led by Ms. Yang, who “is doing very well”.

Part Seven: Recommendations

- FAO plays a critical role in the implementation of the overall project activities in Longchuan. It was recommended by a number of key informants of the evaluation for the NMA to consider supporting some project-related staffing costs for the Project Office staff members. The staff costs may come in the form of monitoring and evaluation allowances.
- Capacity building activities such as training workshops and exchange visits for both FAO and PLG members shall be strengthened in the coming years of project cooperation. Training support shall aim to deepen their understanding and skills in participatory development approaches, as well as rights protection, and environmental issues, so that the FAO and PLG core members will be able to facilitate training sessions on their own. Capacity building shall also aim to enhance their abilities in summarizing and documentation of project progress and experiences, and writing skills for proposal and reports preparation. Particular efforts shall be made to ensure the new officer in charge of the NMA project, and

his supporting officers of the FAO, raise their awareness and understanding of the principles and operational procedures of NMA, in order to achieve smooth handover of project management.

- More exchange visits and interactions shall be organized between the two model villages and townships to enhance sharing and inspirations amongst different communities. These may include village to village visits and exchange, seminars, meetings, or study visits to good community development sites in and out of Longchuan County. This was proposed strongly by the local PLG members to be a valuable means of capacity building for them to widen their visions and broaden their scope of work.
- Careful consideration and actions need to be taken to enable a smooth transition of project coordination and management from Shincon to the New Consulting Company. Given the critical role played by Shincon in the past years, it is essential for the NMA project to plan carefully the handover and transition period from Jan 2010. It is proposed that the new Consulting Company shall work closely with Shincon staff for a period of time (1-3 months) to ensure smooth handover and transition. The fact that the change takes place at the end of 2009 also makes it critical for the smooth transition as this is an important time when the annual work plan for 2010 needs to be finalized. A strong sense of urgency is felt by the FAO and local partners.
- Children's participation in the project activities shall be explored and strengthened. Building on the school hardware initiatives, the evaluation team proposes to the FAO and PLGs to consider involving children to engage meaningfully in school and community based activities, such as community healthy and hygiene awareness raising, peer to peer communication, and participation in community actions. These are important means for the project to support the realization of the rights and best interests of children living in the model communities.
- Following on from the children's participation, it was also proposed that the project may link up with NDC Shanghai on possible initiative to strengthen English education for the project schools. NDC Shanghai has had a long term partnership with some English education institution, which can be applied for rural schools in Longchuan.
- The funds transfer mechanism shall be reviewed and improved to meet the practical needs of the project implementation at county level. A quick response and funds transfer procedures shall be established to ensure timely payment of project funds. It was proposed for the project funds to be transferred for once annually, in RMB (to reduce the variance caused as a result of fluctuating exchange rates).

- The Project shall consider its duration for longer, so that the impacts of participatory community development centered on the rights protection, gender, and environment can be best achieved. It was proposed by local partners that the continuity and sustained support for a steady period is the key to long term effects and sustainability.
- In the long run, the Project Office, along with the PLG, shall summarize and document the smooth running of participatory and sustainable community development experiences, including a management model for Project Leading Group, so that the best practices of the project can be shared and replicated wherever and whenever possible.
- In term of the project activities, it is suggested the project to give more attention to the promotion of bio-gas in rural areas. Longchuan is a place that has rich natural resources and beautiful landscapes. Its natural condition is quite favorable for the promotion of bio-gas project in rural areas. The use of bio-gas can not only protect the environment, save the labor of firewood picking, but also improve the health situation of villagers, improve the effectiveness of composting and as a result, increase the income of villagers from agriculture and animal husbandry production. During the evaluation, questions related to bio-gas was frequently asked and the reflection of the villagers and village leaders showed that there is big demands for bio-gas with a pre-condition that the post-construction technical support of bio-gas usage can be guaranteed. There was a government-mobilized bio-gas project conducted before in Mushui village with a failure caused by unknown reasons. Some villagers, however, build bio-gas units by themselves, which work very well. The project villages need a successful bio-gas project to strengthen their confidence on bio-gas. The essence of success depends on the quality control and post-construction support. These two issues are however the strength of foreign aid project.

The End.

Part Eight: Agenda for Long Chuan evaluation

December 1, Tuesday

The evaluation team arrive Kunming Stay at Pankun Hotel

December 2, Wednesday

10:40am Take flight to Mangshi MU5973 10:40-45mins

11:40am Take car to Long chuan 3 hours

3:00pm Check-in

3:30-4:30pm Pre-meeting between Shincon and evaluation team

- To confirm the local agenda for the 3 day evaluation
- To answer the questions from the team on detailed arrangement

5:00-5:30pm Visit the office of local partner (Foreign Aid Office)

- To get a visual idea of the office
- To introduce to each other

6:00-8:00pm Dinner and back to hotel Stay at the down town

December 3, Thursday

8:00-8:30am Breakfast with local partner

8:30-10:00am Drive to Lvliang village

10:00am-4:00pm Evaluate at Lvliang

- To have meeting with the local project personnel
 - Township leader
 - Village leaders
 - Village Development Committee members
- To see the projects
 - Water
 - School
 - Toilet
 - Community Development Trainings
- To have interview and home visit in the project village

4:00-5:30pm Drive back to the downtown

5:30-6:30pm Dinner

December 4, Friday

8:00-8:30am Breakfast with local partner

8:30-9:30am Drive to Mushui village

9:30am-4:00pm Evaluate at Mushui

- To have meeting with the local project personnel
 - Township leader
 - Village leaders
 - Village Development Committee members
 - To see the projects
 - Toilet
 - Community Development Trainings
 - Composting
 - To have interview and home visit in the project village
- 4:00-5:00pm Drive back to the downtown Stay at the downtown
- 5:00-6:00pm Dinner

December 5, Saturday

- 8:00-8:30am Breakfast with local partner
- 9:00am-12:00pm Evaluate at FAO
- 12:00pm Lunch
- 1:00pm-3:00pm Evaluate at FAO
- 3:00pm Leave Long chuan to Mangshi
- 6:00pm Arrive Mangshi airport
- 7:20-8:00pm Take flight to Kunming MU5974 19:20
- Stay at Pankun Hotel

Dec 6, Sunday

Free time, and leaving Kunming

Contact person: Jean Qin (秦苑秋) Long chuan project officer
 131 0871 3219
qin.jean@gmail.com

Part Nine: Participants of Interviewees in Lvliang Village

(Chinese)

吕良参加评估名单

外援办：主任：杨大芬

工作人员：李冲、梁勇超、庾川盈、尹兴存

专家组：杨海宇、郭静、金昭敏

欣康公司：秦苑秋、熊伟

教育局：工会主席：黄宗帮

陇把镇：副镇长：董桥相 杨旭

卫生院院长：杨波

吕良村委会：吕良村委会支书兼主任：何元庄

吕良村委会副主任：雍英顶

吕良村委会副主任：瞿忠万

吕良小学校长：杨清刚

吕良村卫生室村医：黄国萍

吕良村吕笼村小组：马勒弄、木如腊

吕良村中寨村小组：董绍科

吕良村曼崩村小组：雍昌科

吕良村新寨村小组：赵早年

吕良村芒线村小组：杨新全

Part Ten: Participants of Interviewees in Mu Shui Village

(Chinese)

磨水参加评估人员名单

外援办：主任：杨大芬；

工作人员：李冲、梁勇超、庾川盈、尹兴存；

专家组：杨海宇、郭静、金昭敏；

欣康公司：秦苑秋

城子镇：副镇长：邵山；

宣传干事：花晓波；

磨水村委会：磨水村委会支书兼主任：尚明峰；

磨水村委会副主任：排扎对；

磨水小学校长：彭武忠；

老寨村小组妇女组长：董木图；

芒冒村小组妇女组长：曹召妹；

弄弄村小组组长：雷小宝；

南田村小组组长：排腊拥；

南田村小组村民：刘丽、岳洁。

Part Eleven: Terms of Reference

Mid- term Evaluation of Long chuan Development project

October 2009

1. General information

BN no.:10596 Norad no.: GLO-07/107-227-229

Project name: Longchuan Development Project

Country: China

2. Initiative

The Norwegian Mission Alliance, Norway

3. Purpose of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation is twofold: It should give all implementing partners (NMA's head office in Norway, Shincon, local project office and Long chuan government) the feedback they need to secure the best possible result of the resources invested in the project, both considering what are the main goals for the project and also how the recent development in China may influence these goals. The other purpose is to learn from experiences made within the project context and make the steps necessary in order to improve the quality of the project and ensure that main objectives will be met.

The main goals for the evaluation are:

- IV. to evaluate the effect, the efficiency and the sustainability of the main investments done in the project during the second project period, and to give relevant advices for the future
- V. to evaluate and give advice on the implemented and ongoing capacity building programs in the project
- VI. To evaluate the effect, efficiency and sustainability of the capacity building programs

4. Scope of the evaluation

The evaluation is a mid-term evaluation and will have its main focus on the activities implemented in the project period (2007-2011). The evaluation team should understand how the framework conditions for the project have changed during the last years and is welcomed to give their reflections on how these may have affected the project implementation.

5. Project presentation

The Norwegian government requests all development project supported by NORAD to be within the three sectors of Gender, Environment and Human Rights. NMA decided to apply for NORAD funding for the parts of the project that fell under Norad's requirements. The project was approved for funding by the BN in 2008. The project period is from 2008 to 2011.

The overall project goal is:

...to facilitate sustainable development in Long chuan county through developing our target group's own resources in order to give them the opportunity and motivation to take responsibility for their own and family's lives, and in this way build their own future and their communities future.

The project is located in two townships. There is one model village in each township. The term «Model village» means that the villages develop an independent motive power in their own development through running their own development projects, and that the government sees the value of these skills and develops a wish to transfer this to other villages. The main objectives in the Longchuan Development Project are:

Objective 1 (Community Organizing)

Work out a participatory and sustainable model for community based development among minority people in Longchuan.

Objective 2 (Gender)

Support processes to improve the overall situation for girls and women, with a special focus on education, the economic situation, health and women's rights.

Objective 3 (Environment)

Initiate and support activities to develop sustainable agriculture in Longchuan.

Objective 4 (Education)

Reduce school dropouts and improve the educational infrastructure.

Objective 5 (Income generation)

Support activities that will create new income generating opportunities.

Objective 6 (Health)

Improve the health and hygiene standard through preventive activities.

The information that you give about project development is useful, but you should consider the following when it comes to including it or not in the ToR:

6. Questions to be answered

1. Capacity Building and Community Organizing, in Mushui

- VII. What is the VDC members understanding of their own role and responsibilities in the project?
- VIII. How has the village leaders' interaction with the villagers changed during the last year? (Ask both village leaders and the villagers)
- IX. In what ways do the VDC members believe that this project will improve the villagers' possibility to develop their own local society?
- X. In what ways have the VDC members interaction with leaders outside their village changed as a consequence of this project?
- XI. In what degree do the villagers think they have been able to influence the decision process for, and the implementation of, the project related activities in the village?
- XII. What is the villagers overall attitude towards the VDC?

2. Gender

- 1. How many female villagers have participated in specific trainings for women and what has been the main impact of this training?
- 2. In what way has the project influenced women's position in the villages?
- 3. In what ways has the village doctor training influenced the work of the village doctors in Luliang and Mushui, related to women and children?

Sponsorship program for minority girls at the center school in Longchuan:

- 4. How many minority girls have dropped out of the program last school year?
- 5. In what ways do the school leaders use the sponsorship program to promote education for girls in poor areas?
- 6. What do the school leaders think are the main challenges for the students participating in this sponsorship program, and how are these challenges met by the school?

3. Environment / Composting

- 2. How many farmers have attended the composting training program?
- 3. How many farmers have started doing composting after the composting program started?

4. How many farmers started doing composting and then stopped doing it?
5. To what degree have the farmers been able to reduce their overall use of chemical fertilizers?
6. How many farmers from the composting training program have support how many other farmers to start doing composting?

4. Education in Lvliang

2. What was the completion rate for the graduate students at Luliang primary school in 2009?
3. Are there any changes in the completion rate during the last three years? (Please specify)
4. If any significant changes in the question above: What is the school leaders' opinion about the main reason for these changes?
5. How big is the drop out rate among the children in primary school?
6. How many children in the area are not attending school and what may be the main reasons for them not going to school?
7. Has there been any change in the rate of children continuing to Jr. High? What is the rate of girls from Luliang attending Jr. High?

5. Health in Lvliang

3. How many villagers in Lüliang have gained access to clean water after building the water pipeline?
4. In what way has this water pipeline influenced the daily life, and health, of these villagers? (ask villagers)
5. What has been the effect/impact of building toilets in Luliang?
6. In what ways has the village doctor training program influenced the work of the local village doctor, in general?

6. Project organizing and local project management

3. How much resources are available at the Foreign Aid Office (implementing partner) to follow up and manage this project?
4. Among the resources available at the FAO for this project, what kind of experience and competence do they have?
5. In what ways do the FAO cooperate with other government bodies in Longchuan
6. In what ways are FAO influenced by government's interests/policy?

7. What are the FAO leaders understanding of the main principles and goals for this development project?
8. How is FAO cooperating with the relevant township leaders (in Luliang and Mushui)
9. What measures have been implemented by FAO to reduce the risk of hidden “payback deals” or any other misuse of funds?
10. Does FAO coordinate any work of any other NGO in the same project area as where Shincon/NMA has been involved?
11. What are, according to the FAO members, the strengths and weaknesses of this project?
12. How is infrastructure investments maintained?

7. Methods

- Meetings and interviews with relevant personnel /organizations
 - Shincon personnel
 - Local project office personnel
 - Representatives from Longchuan government
 - Relevant leaders at township level
 - Villagers and village leaders
- Collecting relevant quantitative data (school completion rate etc)
- Study the most relevant documents

8. Sampling and limitations/delimitations

The villages Luliang and Mushui are the only two villages Shincon has project work in Longchuan. The villages are situated about half an hour to three quarter by car from each other. The evaluation team will stay in Mangshe during the nights. There is about a three quarter drive from Mangshe to Luliang and about one hour to Mushui from Mangshe.

9. Expected product presentations

The findings of the evaluation should be presented in a report according to the report format outlined in paragraph 12 below.

10. The utilization of the evaluation findings

We want the evaluation team to arrange a workshop for the relevant Shincon personnel where they present the result of the evaluation and also facilitate discussions on how to adjust and follow up the project.

A summary of the evaluation report should be worked out by project leader and sent to local partner (Longchuan government) finally a workshop should be arranged

with the local project office to discuss the findings and the further implementation of the project.

11. Timeframe for evaluation and reporting

The field work is planned to be carried out from the 19th to the 23rd of October. In addition we suggest that the evaluation team, before the field trip, will arrange a workshop in Kunming with relevant Shincon personnel to discuss details about how to carry out the evaluation.

The draft report should be handed in within four weeks after the field trip and the final report before the end of the year.

12. Report format

The final report should include the following sections:

- Cover page
- Table of content
- Executive summary
- Body of the report:
 - Introduction
 - Purpose and specific objectives for the final evaluation
 - Methodology employed
 - Findings
 - Analysis/discussions
 - Conclusion and recommendations
- Supporting data should be included in appendices.

13. Evaluation team

The evaluation team will have the following members;
Yang Haiyu, Jin Zhaomin and Guo Jing

14. Facilitator

The facilitator for the evaluation will be Per-Olav Bjørnstad

15. Budget

NOK 57 000