



NORAD COLLECTED REVIEWS

17/2023

## LO's Global Programme on Trade Union efforts to combat Modern Slavery in Ethiopia and Ghana

The report is presented in a series, compiled by Norad to disseminate and share analyses of development cooperation. The views and interpretations are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of the Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation.

Mid Term Review  
Dr. Michael Karanja, PhD and Angela Lomosi

**Norad**





**Norad**

**LO's Global Programme on Trade Union efforts to  
combat Modern Slavery in Ethiopia and Ghana**

ISBN: 978-82-8369-168-9

ISSN: 1894-518x

Published: 11.08.2023

Cover Photo: Ken Opprann

**[norad.no](http://norad.no)**

## REPORT

### MID TERM EVALUATION OF LO'S GLOBAL PROGRAMME ON TRADE UNION EFFORTS TO COMBAT MODERN SLAVERY IN ETHIOPIA AND GHANA

**Submitted by:** *Dr. Michael Karanja, PhD: Monitoring and Evaluation (Lead Consultant)*  
*Angela Lomosi, (Associate Consultant)*

**Submitted to:** LO Norway

**Contact Email and phone:** [michael.karanja@gmail.com](mailto:michael.karanja@gmail.com); +254 722896249.

**Date of Submission:** April 2023.

## Executive Summary

The LO-Norway global Program on trade union efforts to combat modern slavery in Ethiopia and Ghana is a three-year programme that aims to reinforce the legal instruments and policies on child labour, forced labour and trafficking; mobilize trade unions to be a constructive partner for companies in preventing child labour and forced labour, and protect vulnerable groups against modern forms of slavery.

The program commenced in March 2020, and this mid-term evaluation of the programme was carried out during December 2022 with the shared desire to review the overall implementation of the programme and evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of the cooperation. It was an evaluation of the programme to learn and improve conditions for enhanced implementation during the remaining programme period. The review process was guided by questions focusing on the relevance, efficiency, challenges, and sustainability of the cooperation.

It was noted that there is a discrepancy between the planned results and the budgeted activities in Ethiopia. The CMS project was supposed to leverage on the Decent Work Program but the coordination between the two projects has been weak yet crucial for success as per the theory of change. In Ghana, there is good collaboration with the Decent work program and the results framework and targets are well elaborated and feasible.

The key results or contributions of the LO funded programme to the status of child labour, forced labour and trafficking in Ethiopia and Ghana include among others;

**Behavioural change among communities:** Communities previously hotspots of child labour such as fisher folks are ending a tradition that had been done for many generations and taking children to school. In Ethiopia, child labour in the agricultural sector especially the weaving industry has drastically reduced. Enhanced **collaboration** between stakeholders to tackle issues of child and forced labour and trafficking has created more interest among informal groups who are expressing interest to organize for legal protection.

**Increased visibility:** The programme has made the trade unions more visible to stakeholders and added new knowledge. The role of the trade union is better understood in the rural communities and informal sectors, that they have trained and interacted with. Government is recognizing the role of trade unions. They have become key partners in combating modern slavery, and are being consulted on issues of modern slavery, child trafficking, forced labour and child labour.

**Enhanced awareness and advocacy on modern slavery:** The programme is contributing to raising awareness and advocacy on issues of modern slavery labour in the communities and among beneficiaries of the trainings.

**Enhanced collaboration among actors.** There is concerted action for collaboration with other actors in the field of child labour, forced labour and human trafficking particularly employers, non-governmental organizations, the ILO, government officers to influence policy are very commendable and steps in the right direction in influencing policy. Formation/membership of coalitions and consortiums to influence policy are applauded as the magnitude of the problem requires collaboration.

**Lobbying employers** for inclusion of issues of modern slavery in workplace policies is a good practice in ensuring sustainability of results achieved so far.

**Evidence based programming.** Studies on modern slavery components i.e. human trafficking, child labour and child labour has been conducted in both Ghana and Ethiopia and the reports used in programming. The messages sourced from the studies have been used in training facilitation, awareness meetings and programmes such as radio, in advocacy meetings and to develop IEC materials.

**Improved legislation:** There is a lot of improvement in the policy development and legislation in this area. The CETU and TUC are part of the process, and being in the legislation committee, it makes it is easier to make their contribution as well as to follow up.

## Recommendations

### Ethiopia

- Given its **comparative advantage as a convener** CETU should operate at a higher level as a main convener for stakeholders including Government, policy makers, CSOs and employers or create awareness on interventions that should primarily focus on and be designed to reach higher level for policy influencing on modern slavery
- In the next phase, the project needs to strengthen the linkages with the Modern Slavery Project leverages more on the Decent Work Project's work around policy advocacy, CBAs, gender and social dialogue. These linkages need to be mainstreamed in the CMS **results framework** for clarity. Follow up on the MOUs signed to transit them to CBAs.
- The project should **support child protection stakeholders in coalition building** and strengthening - CSOs, development partners and unions to enhance the voice and strengthen advocacy efforts to Government policy makers and employers
- Enhance **follow-up** after training, awareness activities, action planning to identify and document results at the community level.
- Support **informal workers to register as associations** to enable them fight for their rights and contribute to the war against modern slavery.

### Ghana

- Integrate modern slavery activities into the main LO **Global decent work project** when it ends. This will ensure continuity of the work and not to lose the gains that have already been made.
- Lobby the Government to **employ more labour inspectors**, provide them with resources and means of transport, more rescue centres for trafficked persons/children. Also advocate for **ratification of the UN CRC Optional Protocol on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography** Follow up on action plans made by participants during the training to measure results and program impact.
- Translate the training manual and sensitization materials into some **local languages and include pictures**.
- Facilitate the proposed **exchange, learning and networking visit between Ghana and Ethiopia**. This is a practical tool to foster knowledge exchange, across learning and to improve on performance.

## Contents

Executive Summary.....	ii
1.0 Introduction .....	1
1.1 Expected Project Results .....	2
1.2 Methodology .....	2
1.2.1 Evaluation Design.....	2
1.2.2 OECD DAC Criteria Approach.....	3
1.2.3 Expected Results and indicators.....	3
2.0 REPORT FOR ETHIOPIA.....	3
2.1 Introduction .....	3
2.2 Projected Results .....	4
2.3 Progress of Results .....	5
2.4 Results by DAC Criteria.....	13
3.0 REPORT FOR GHANA .....	21
3.1 Introduction .....	21
3.2 The Trades Union Congress Ghana.....	22
3.3 Progress on Results.....	22
3.4 Assessment by DAC Criteria .....	33
3.5 Audit .....	36
3.6 LO Added Value .....	36
3.8 Some summary key results from TUC.....	37
3.9 Lessons Learnt.....	37
3.10 Challenges.....	37
3.11 Recommendations for Ghana .....	38

## Acronyms

- CBAs** – Collective Bargaining Agreements
- CETU** - Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions
- CL** – Child Labour
- CMS** – Combating Modern Slavery
- CSO** – Civil Society Organization
- DAC** – Development Assistance Criteria
- EEF** - Ethiopian Federation of Employers
- FL** – Forced Labour
- GEA** – Ghana Employers Association
- GPRTU** – Ghana Private Road Transport Union
- GAWU** – General Agricultural Worker Union
- FES** – Friederich Ebert Stiftung
- FGD** – Focus Group Discussion
- ILC** – International Labour Conference
- ILO** – International Labour Organisation
- KII** – Key Informant Interviews
- LO** – Labour Organization of Norway
- MS** – Modern Slavery
- MOU** – Memorandum of Understanding
- MOWSA** - Ministry of Women and Social Affairs
- MOLS** - Ministry of labour and skills
- NORAD** – Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation
- NPA** - National Plan of Action
- NSCCL** – National Steering Committee on Child Labour
- OECD** - Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
- OHSE** – Occupational Health Safety and Environment
- SDGs** – Sustainable Development Goals
- TUC** – Trade Unions Congress
- UNIWA** – Union of Informal Workers Association

## 1.0 Introduction

The overall objective for LO-Norway's programme "Trade union efforts to combat modern slavery" is to contribute to the eradication of forced labour, trafficking and child labour in Ethiopia and Ghana in line with SDG 8.7. To achieve this LO has been working to reinforce the legal instruments and policies on child labour, forced labour and trafficking in the target countries, mobilising trade unions to be a constructive partner for companies and society in preventing child labour and forced labour, and working to protect vulnerable groups against modern forms of slavery. The two implementing partners in this programme are the confederations in the respective countries, Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), and Ghana Trade Unions Congress (TUC). 2021 was the first year of a three year-programme (2021 - 2023).

According to the Grant Agreement with NORAD, the Project was to be implemented during the period from 15 March 2021 to 31 December 2023 (the Support Period).

### 1.1 Expected Project Results

The expected effects for the target groups of the Project are threefold (Outcomes):

**Outcome 1:** Governments have implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors.

Project-specific outcome: Governments in Ethiopia and Ghana have implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors

**Outcome 2:** The corporate sector has implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in their company operations and supply chains.

Project-specific outcome: Trade unions have contributed to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in company operations and supply chains.

**Outcome 3:** Vulnerable individuals and groups are resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery.

Project-specific outcome: Trade unions have contributed to make vulnerable workers in high -risk sectors more resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery

## 1.2 Methodology

### 1.2.1 Evaluation Design

The evaluation methodology considered an approach to ensure each country projects are reviewed and documented within the time allocated. The evaluator thus employed a largely qualitative research design through face to face interviews with implementers and beneficiaries. The evaluation process set out to assess of what the project is delivering compared to the original project document and the extent to which the program is delivering activities as originally intended. An assessment of effectiveness of the project and whether program arrangements/managements are facilitating the implementation was also made. Assessment of factors that had positive and negative effects (intended and unintended) on the implementation of the program were also made.

The overall approach for this mid-term evaluation embodies mixed methods in which in-person interviews with partners CETU and TUC project staff and leadership, selected stakeholders, partners and project beneficiaries, field visit, online questionnaires and desk review analysis is made (drawing on project documents and activity reports).

#### Key methods used included:

**a) Desk review:** The consultants reviewed the progress in ratifying key conventions, partnerships and social dialogue, project proposals, project monitoring and audit reports in the two (2) countries.

**b) Key Informant Interviews (KIIs):** The consultants conducted KIIs with LO's staff, leadership and staff of project partners CETU and TUC and other key stakeholders such as selected Affiliate Unions, Ministries



of Labour, Employer's organisation, Trade Union Solidarity Support Organizations, Civil Society Organizations, ILO, grassroots beneficiaries and the programme auditors. Some interviews were conducted face to face and others digitally using zoom. In Ghana, the interviews were collected using a research assistant based in the country.

**c) Focus Group Discussions:** Beneficiary groups were engaged in focus group discussions during the evaluation process. One FGD in Adama City, about 100km from Addis brought together Affiliate Union leaders, project leaders and beneficiaries in an informal workshop setting to discuss the project in terms of achievements, good practices and lessons to inform current and future projects. The discussions served to verify the outcomes and impacts of the project, their concerns, and recommendations. A virtual FGD was also held in Ghana with the TUC staff and fisher folk to analyse results of the project, gaps and opportunities.

### 1.2.2 OECD DAC Criteria Approach

The study followed the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Development Assistance Committee (DAC) which laid out the evaluation criteria in the 1991 OECD DAC Principles for Evaluation of Development Assistance to harmonize evaluation of projects. These criteria include i) Efficiency: This is the productivity in project implementation. It is the degree to which inputs have been converted into outputs; ii) Coherence: This is the extent to which the programme is implemented in tandem with other similar programmes considering linkages, systems thinking, partnership dynamics, and complexity to reduce duplication and enhance results; iii) Effectiveness: This is the degree to which the project purpose has been achieved by the project outputs; iii) Impact: These are positive and negative changes produced, directly or indirectly, as a result of the implementation of the project; iv) Relevance: This is the validity of the overall goal and project purpose at the evaluation stage; v) Sustainability: This is the durability of the benefits and development effects produced by the project after its completion.

As minimum criteria, LO Norway's international department applies the OECD DAC criteria for evaluations. These criteria with their research questions were to be answered and reflected on in the evaluation (Annex 1).

### 1.2.3 Expected Results and indicators

The key expected results from the program are analysed a matrix (Annex 2) which indicates the results, targets for Year 2 (since this is a mid-term evaluation) and questions on actual progress. The impact result statement was “Trade unions have contributed to the eradication of forced labour, trafficking and child labour in Ethiopia and Ghana” with three indicators: i) Ghana and Ethiopia have improved policy or legal framework of forced labour, trafficking and child labour within 2023, ii) There is increased compliance to ILO conventions/international policies at national level and iii) Policies or collective agreements in place that have provisions on child labour, trafficking and forced labour.

The outcome statement were 1) Governments in Ethiopia and Ghana have implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors 2) Trade unions have contributed to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in company operations and supply chains, 3) Trade unions have contributed to make vulnerable workers in high-risk sectors more resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery. Details of the indicators and outputs are indicated in Annex 2 (Evaluation Matrix and Key Questions)

## 2.0 REPORT FOR ETHIOPIA

### 2.1 Introduction

The Combating Modern Slavery (CMS) project in Ethiopia is operating with a focus on three components of modern slavery including; i) Child labour, ii) Forced labour and iii) Human trafficking. The selection of project sites is based on CETU's branch office arrangements/geographic location and magnitude of modern slavery in the areas. The project is geographically being implemented in the following areas of Ethiopia.

1. Addis Ababa
2. Adama (Oromia Regional State)
3. Bahirdar (Amhara Regional State)
4. Kombolcha (Amhara Regional State, also a hotspot for human trafficking as it is a transit point on the route to Djibouti.
5. Jimma (Oromia Regional State)
6. Hawassa (Seat of both Sidama and SNNP regional states)

CETU implements the project through three intervention strategies;

1. Capacity building: targeting law enforcement bodies such as government employees (including the police, public prosecutors and judges), legal union members, enterprises/undertakings/corporate sector leaders.
2. Policy advocacy by trade union members which is targeting law makers, policy makers and implementers
3. Awareness raising which is targeting the community

The CMS project has eight staff which includes a national project coordinator, finance officer and monitoring and evaluation officer at head office level and a project officer at each of CETU branch offices. Adama branch office however currently does not have project officer.

Summary of key results in Ethiopia

- Human trafficking committees strengthened at the Ethiopian district level, Woreda. Six sub-committees work with different committees
- Eighteen (18) partnership coalitions formed to reduce trafficking
- Leaders of 9 affiliates with adequate capacities to identify modern slavery especially those related to hotel and agriculture
- Awareness created widely on modern slavery mainly through workshops and media

## 2.2 Projected Results

**Outcome 1:** Governments have implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors.

Project-specific outcome: Governments in Ethiopia and Ghana have implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors

The indicators for outcomes and outputs as per the results framework included:

Outcome 1

1. Number of new trade union demands related to forced labour, trafficking and child labour incorporated in national labour policies or laws with a target of 3 demands
2. The number of labour inspectors in Ghana and Ethiopia has increased
3. The number of government officials including labour inspectors trained by trade unions
4. Number of demands/proposals presented/promoted by trade unions to decision makers on modern slavery
5. Number of research studies conducted on the prevalence of modern slavery

Outcome 2

6. Number of companies that have developed or revised new code of conducts or policies on modern slavery.
7. Number of established /strengthened anti human trafficking committees for shop stewards
8. Number of bipartite and/or tripartite consultations held with employers on modern slavery.
9. Number of workplaces using campaign material on modern slavery developed by unions
10. Number of trade union representatives/focal points trained on how to prevent and identify forced labour, trafficking and child labour by trade unions
11. Number of information initiatives made by trade unions (campaigns, brochures etc. for workplaces)

### Outcome 3

12. Number of CBA's in targeted sectors where modern slavery occurs
13. Number of education manuals developed used to reach out to vulnerable workers.
14. Number of trade union representatives trained
15. Number of vulnerable workers in the targeted sectors that have been trained on their rights
16. Number of mechanisms/initiatives in place

## 2.3 Progress of Results

### a) Impact level

The impact result for the LO project was “CETU has contributed to the eradication of forced labour, trafficking and child labour in Ethiopia”. CETU is a worker's union with over 800,000 members. The measurement of these result was pegged on the indicator, “Ethiopia has improved policy or legal framework of forced labour, trafficking and child labour within 2023”. At baseline, it was clear that Ethiopia had not ratified the Minimum Wage Fixing Convention, 1970 (C131), the Migration for Employment Convention C 97 nor the ILC129 on Labour inspection in agriculture and these were to be the target for the project. The results were to be achieved through policy advocacy and dialogue meetings leading to at least one demonstrated improvement in the form of one revised/new law/policy or ratified convention by 2022 and three by 2023.

Of the three targeted conventions, some progress has been made on Minimum Wage Fixing Convention (C131). Through CETU's advocacy efforts (CETU is running several projects and its leadership at higher level strategically plans to bring forward issues for advocacy to Government), some work on policies such as Minimum wage legislation has started. In 2022, the minimum wage draft directives and regulations have been prepared and submitted under Ministry of Justice. After approval, the Government will establish Board members (Government, Employers, Federations) to work on the proposals. A coalition formed by CETU, CSOs and other stakeholders working in the child protection space also generically targets minimum wage and revision of the child labour policy of Ethiopia.

The other two conventions are lagging. Although the government is positive towards ratification of the conventions on Migration for employment (C97) and the Labour Inspection (in agriculture) Convention (C129). According to the ILO coordinator, local realities on the ground (such as poverty, unemployment, legal illiteracy) must be capable of accommodating what the conventions dictate. Some actors, such as ActionAid, are now considering improving legal literacy as a first step after noticing that backlash from adoption of legal instruments mostly comes from the local community.

**“It is important to make the public aware of the rationale for adoption as there was a backlash when the migration proclamation was enacted as the local community where migrants are allowed to work contested the impact on their own employment opportunities” (KII with Action Aid).**

It was also difficult during the evaluation to get much information on the project from the Ministry of Labour officials since it had just been reorganized and the new leadership had been in office for only two months.

The activity on migration for employment can also leverage the African Union's biannual social and employment meeting, a platform that can be used to advocate on issues of modern slavery, developing skills and standards to ensure free mobility and harmonization of labour market information can help reduce forced labour, enhance streamlining of migration employment and rights of workers. Engagements by countries on labour market information will also help countries to see where their comparative advantage lies but Ethiopia will need to have a policy on migration to start with in order to benefit from the advocacy.

Also, although the project is expected to contribute to the work on adoption of these conventions, there seems to be a disconnect between the planned activities and the envisaged results. The LO project has no budgeted activity targeted for lobbying for the identified conventions., although the understanding is that the CMS project was supposed to leverage on Decent Work Project especially on work around policy advocacy, CBAs, gender and social dialogue. There is therefore a need for alignment and linkages of the two projects at CETU and specific mentions of these conventions in the work packages on improvement of legal

framework and policy. A child labour legal framework workshop was held but none of these conventions were a part of it. However, CETU at its higher-level meetings and advocacy campaigns demand the adoption of these and other conventions. Ethiopia as a country – including trade unions and employers have committed to eliminate child labour by 2025.

Thus, as currently framed, the project activities will not directly be able to satisfy this indicator which targets by 2023 at least 3 improvements in the policy or legal framework adopted. However, some aspects may be achieved through the “child protection and child labour policy advocacy coalition” that CETU’s CMS project is part of. The coalition has been formed by several stakeholders working in the child protection space and generically target minimum wage and revision of the child labour policy of Ethiopia. In case it is not possible to advocate on the issues mentioned in the baseline, CETU should work with other policy issues other than what is mentioned.

Another indicator is “*increased compliance to conventions/policies at national level*”. This indicator requires a strengthened mandate of the labour inspectorate and labour inspection units with more personnel and logistics. This however was not planned as activities.

## **b) Outcome Results**

### **Outcome 1**

The budgeted activities for outcome 1 are indicated in the following Table. There seems to be a disconnect as these budgeted activities do not fully tally with the planned activities.

<b>Originally Planned Activities</b>	<b>Activities budgeted for</b>
1. Number of new trade union demands related to forced labour, trafficking and child labour incorporated in national labour policies or laws	1. Organize a child labour legal framework workshop
2. Number of demands/proposals presented/promoted by trade unions to decision makers on modern slavery	2. Training courses on modern slavery for members of law enforcement agencies
3. The number of labour inspectors in Ghana and Ethiopia has increased	3. Media campaign on the worst forms of child labour
4. The number of government officials including labour inspectors trained by trade unions	4. Research on modern slavery
5. Number of research studies conducted on the prevalence of modern slavery	5. Validation workshop on the results of the research

The Table shows a mismatch between most of the originally planned activities and activities budgeted for. For instance, there was no planned activity on training of labour inspectors yet it was one of the indicators. However, there has been attempts to achieve some results as follows.

### **Advocacy for national labour policies and laws**

Specifically, to contribute to advocacy for labour policies and laws, the LO supported project planned and held a Child Labour Legal Framework Workshop in March 2022, targeting 26 participants (18 males, 8 female) different government officials, NGOs, CSOs and different stakeholders including the regulatory/law enforcement bodies.

In the workshop it was noted despite Ethiopia having ratified all key international conventions concerning child labour, it is estimated that thousands of children are still being exploited especially in the informal sector. About 20,000 children are sold to the trafficking industry in Addis Ababa despite laws that prohibit the practice<sup>1</sup>. According to the results of a 2015 national child labor survey published in 2018, almost 16 million children from the ages of 5 to 17 engaged in child labor<sup>2</sup>. The children participating in manufacturing

<sup>1</sup> 10 Facts About Child Labor in Ethiopia. <https://borgenproject.org/facts-about-child-labor-in-ethiopia/>

<sup>2</sup> [https://www.dol.gov/sites/dolgov/files/ILAB/child\\_labor\\_reports/tda2020/Ethiopia.pdf](https://www.dol.gov/sites/dolgov/files/ILAB/child_labor_reports/tda2020/Ethiopia.pdf)

textiles and gold are most prominent in urban areas, while those working in cattle herding and production are the most prominent in rural areas. It was also noted that the legal legislation focuses only on the formal sector and there is lack of awareness, attitude, coordination, cooperation, monitoring system and government budget for implementation. As one participant commented,

**“Implementing the already existing polices and laws is most challenging. Laws and policies by themselves do not bring change” (Workshop participant)**

Thus, challenges of combating modern slavery include lack of adequate legal framework and poor enforcement where there are good legal frameworks. Key gaps identified that need to be addressed by the Ministry of Labour include;

- Absence of minimum wage
- Labour inspection in the agriculture sector which is not legally addressed in legal instruments.
- Laws to organize inspectors and inspection for child labour in the field
- Convention 189 on domestic workers (advocacy is ongoing).

Other challenges are lack of a minimum compulsory education age and systematic data on child labour.

Stakeholders such as ActionAid collaborates, organizes and participates in different forums with CETU to advocate for policy change and ratification of legal instruments. Both are working on ratification of C189. However tangible result cannot be claimed from the collaboration in the area of advocacy for policy change.

### **Presentation of demands/proposals on modern slavery to policy makers**

Negotiations in labour sector are pegged on bipartite and tripartite engagements. In Ethiopia, a key structure, the Labour Advisory Board which normally consists of 15 members (including 5 representatives each from the government, employers and workers) has not been functional for almost a year owing to some ongoing structural adjustments. The absence of this body has delayed tripartite engagements between workers and policy makers, and consequent presentation of demands.

The CETU leadership should continue awareness creation for reestablishing the Labour Advisory Board, and work with the Ministry of Labour to fast track the law reforms on modern slavery at the House of Representatives.

Advocacy activities have also benefited from networking between CSOs such as Action Aid and Woord en Daad, Trade unions and Government agencies. Action Aid, Woord en Daad with CETU have been advocating for ratification of C189. MOUs have been signed with Ministry of Women and Social Affairs and several organizations, and a collective approach to policy makers and law makers has been developed. A child protection/child labour policy advocacy coalition consisting of thematic working groups had been established and Ministry of Women and Social Affairs (MOWSA) and Ministry of labour and skills (MOLS) are expected to get on board soon which is expected to form and amplify collective voice to address law and policy makers.

### **Labour inspection**

Ethiopia has 600 labour inspectors, mostly operating at regional level. These are few considering the country's population of 100 million. Although labour the project has no budgeted activity on labour inspectors, labour inspection has been happening courtesy of the Ministry of labour, to check compliance with labour policies including child labour up to the Ethiopian District level, Woreda.

### **Training law enforcement agencies on modern slavery**

The project has held capacity building of legal regulatory bodies including law enforcement agents, public prosecutor and judges on combating modern slavery. The content covered included modern slavery (basic concepts, facts, and figures), forced labour (basic concepts, practices, and basic national and international legislations), child labour including its worst forms (basic concepts, practices, and basic national and international legislations) and human trafficking (basic concepts, practices, and basic national and international legislations) labour. So far, 108 (Male=82, Female=26) participants from Bahirdar, Jimma and

Hawassa have been reached with the training. The project has contributed to raising awareness on human trafficking, forced labour and child labour among the justice actors and enabled them to be better prepared to handle such cases.

### **Research on Modern Slavery**

CETU has conducted research entitled “The Causes, Practices and Remedies for Modern Slavery in the Forms of Child Labour and Human Trafficking in Ethiopia: Labour Focused” to provide actual facts on the ground, providing a source of knowledge and content for use in policy advocacy and capacity building. CETU intends to utilize the research for policy recommendations by issuing policy briefs. Law makers, policy makers and implementers are the targets of this intervention.

A national validation workshop was held in Addis Ababa with 54 participants (Male=38, Female=16) to validate and disseminate the findings.

The findings of the research indicated multiplicities of causes of “modern slavery” in general in the forms of child labour and human trafficking in particular. Poverty comes out as the key driver for modern slavery among other factors. The study concluded that combating the complex modern slavery in general, and child and human trafficking in particular in Ethiopia, needs refining policy frameworks in line with the socio-economic, cultural, ecological, legal and political aspects, a political will from the government side, building a strong coordination among stakeholders based on integrated approach and enforcement of the already established law.

The plan for policy advocacy based on evidence-based research is a good practice. CETU should also see how researches conducted by other partners could be put in use for its planned advocacies, including for ratification of ILO conventions. The findings of the study have informed the CMS training content.

**Training and Advocacy** has happened with cooperate leaders in agriculture, agro-processing, tourism and hotels. A total of 30 corporate leaders were trained on worst forms of child labour and came up with an action plan for their organizations. They also briefed other management units in their companies.

The project also conducts training of affiliate trade unions. CETU has 9 affiliates. The project targeted 3 leaders per organization (drawn from chief, manager, chairperson, vice chair and secretary). The sectors selected were those related to hotel and agriculture (due to budget constraints). These were regional workshops and each workshop has 25-30 participants and took 2 to 3 days. The content covered included forced labour. The trade union representatives are expected to give awareness to their members through meetings.

### **Outcome 2**

The outcome is ‘corporate sector has implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in their company operations and supply chains’.

Project-specific outcome: Trade unions have contributed to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in company operations and supply chains.

## Planned vs budgeted activities

Planned results	Budgeted
1. Number of companies that have developed or revised new code of conducts or policies on modern slavery.	1. Establish /strengthen anti human trafficking committee
2. Number of established /strengthened anti human trafficking committees for shop stewards	2. Train members of anti-human trafficking committee
3. Number of bipartite and/or tripartite consultations held with employers on modern slavery.	
4. Number of workplaces using campaign material on modern slavery developed by unions	
5. Number of trade union representatives/focal points trained on how to prevent and identify forced labour, trafficking and child labour by trade unions	
6. Number of information initiatives made by trade unions (campaigns, brochures etc. for workplaces)	

## Codes of conduct and policies on modern slavery by employers

CETU has a code of conduct on modern slavery and leads as an example to other unions, CSOs and corporates. The CMS project has not budgeted to develop CBAs but has devised an MoU which is to be signed by CETU branches and corporate sector leaders that take part in the worst forms of child labour by the project. This has also not been part of the project, but it should be noted that the project was designed to leverage on Decent Work Project which has some work on CBAs, but due to poor linkages between the two projects not much collaboration has happened to jointly achieve planned results. The MOUs were an innovative mechanism the CMS project has tried to have in place to answer the gaps. It is expected that these MOUs with the employers will translate to the CBAs.

The next phase needs to track how the MOUs developed during the training sessions are translating to the CBAs.

According to the CETU program coordinator, there are only two budgeted activities under this outcome 3. They include

- Establish /strengthen anti-human trafficking committees
- Train members of anti-human trafficking committees

However, several activities that relate to the results have been conducted and are discussed hereunder.

### Anti-Human Trafficking committees

The Ministry of Justice leads the anti-human trafficking committee which includes the police. It is most active in the hotspot areas or transits such as Kobocho and Jimma. These committees have been established, from the Federal to the Woreda as partnership coalitions in human anti-trafficking. The committee has 6 sub committees comprising of the police, public prosecutor (leader of the committee), committee for overseas recruitment, awareness creation committee led by bureau of Labour and Skills (BOLS), legal committee and education committee with representatives from universities to conduct research. The CMS project has been working with 18 committees in different areas including in Amhara, Oromia, SNNPR, Sidama, Hawassa, Jimma, Bahirdar Zuria, Southern Wollo and Kombolcha woreda. The focus has been on cross boarder trafficking and intra-country trafficking for agricultural labour. Cross-border trafficking usually

begins as smuggling arrangement. The interventions cover hotspot areas and destinations of trafficking, abuse and exploitation.

CETU is supporting in strengthening the partnership coalition. The anti-human trafficking committees are organized both at federal, regional, zonal and woreda level.

The project has given trainings to the committees in October and an experience sharing platform was created. It is difficult to expect tangible results at this stage as the training was given only recently.

The project has not clearly defined the target committees. In discussion with LO-Norway, CETU plans to clearly define and work with the committees in the branch areas.

Four types of trainings that are conducted repeatedly;

- Forced labour for Basic trade union leaders
- Worst forms of child labour: corporate sector
- Human trafficking and roles and responsibilities of actors: partnership coalition members
- Modern slavery: Police and regulatory and law enforcement agency members, judges and public prosecutors

Training: In Addis Ababa, the police commander in charge of child trafficking has together with 76 police officers in the department of women and children received training from the project which has enable her to enhance her work in protecting women and children.

**“We were trained for 4 days, eight hours per day on the trafficking of persons, meaning of modern slavery, data collection, how to treat victims, risks of modern slavery and child labour, and case management” (KII with police commander, Addis Ababa, Women and Children Department).**

Asked what difference the training has created, the police commander says,

**“We learnt many things, how to detect child trafficking and child labour. We are also networking better with NGOs, about 13 to 20 on these issues. We have also learnt that many of the children trafficked come from Oromia region”**

Under Combating Modern Slavery project, EEF has participated in trainings on child labour and forced labour. Technical committee including federation and CETU experts is established in projects (as to how to implement). EEF supports CETU in reaching out to employers for training (through invitation/request letters). EEF’s staffs are also trained.

According to CMS project, child labour and forced labour is rampant in agricultural and informal sector. Women are trafficked for domestic work in the Middle East. Beneficiaries of the trainings were from the agriculture, agro processing, and hotel sectors. There is no CBA addressing issues of child labour/forced labour/human trafficking EEF is aware of.

In a field visit to Adama city by the evaluation team, it was noted the administration has put in place anti-human trafficking committees at Kebele level and in schools to fight human trafficking. Three woredas are identified as hotspots of human trafficking; Fentale woreda (border), Boset woreda, and Adami Tullu woreda. 18 trafficked people have been rescued in these woredas. Bishoftu, Mojo and Adama cities are destinations of trafficked children from rural areas.

The bureau has an expert working on anti-human trafficking and there are also labour inspectors at the office. CETU has given trainings to relevant officers in the bureau (around 3 persons) who are in turn required to pass the knowledge to the community in the bureau’s awareness creation activities. Such awareness creation activities are conducted during Edir meetings and meetings called on communal security. CETU’s trainings are beneficial as refresher and supplementary support to the bureaus ongoing initiatives in fighting human trafficking and child labour.



According to a KII with Adama City Police, 7 people (from the 7 sub-cities in the zone's women and children's affairs office) have attended three trainings on human trafficking and child labour exploitation). The Police work closely with Bureau of Women and Children's affairs and Justice bureau (public prosecutors). CETU's trainings have served as refresher and reminder. The modality of training (use of informative videos) was helpful in understanding issues.

A key result from the police training was alluded to as follows,

**The Police has put in place a structure in which a group of 25 volunteer people consisting of the elderly, Edir leaders, religious leaders, cultural leaders (Abba Gada), and the youth are trained (by the police officers who were trained by CETU) and cascade information to the public. This structure is present in 6 woredas. The groups report to the police where there are cases of child labour and trafficking (particularly child labour below 14 years of age for domestic work). The police also use mini-media and banners to create awareness on the issue and follows up on employment agencies.**

In Adama city, it was reported that after police training in anti-trafficking,

**The Adama police were able to rescue a woman trafficked to Assosa, Benishangul Gumuz for sex work. The woman was initially falsely promised to a job as a waitress in Oromia Region's Assassa town. Good-willed police officers from both regions were able to rescue her upon receiving report from her family.**

Combatting such cases of trafficking across different regions requires resources which the police lack.

### **Tripartite/Bipartite meetings**

The CMS project has not conducted tripartite/bipartite meetings (was supposed to leverage on the Decent Work Project). However, CETU has through its affiliates conducted bipartite meetings with Ethiopian Federation of Employers (EEF) when there are disputes in the workplaces. The importance of social dialogues and tripartite consultations that lead towards stated project objectives in combating modern slavery need to be recognized and efforts to this end must commence. CETU's efforts in protection of the rights and benefits of workers should match efforts from the employers' ends and need to be strengthened. Partners expect that CETU takes lead in creating appropriate platforms and structures and not only limit itself to existing ones. It shall also work towards implementation of ratified conventions and not only advocate for ratification.

Child labour surfaces as an issue in tripartite dialogues. During the time of the evaluation, a tripartite dialogue was planned in the coming month. A big mobilization led by MOLS (including experts over 50000) discussing child labour and human trafficking in Adama. MOLS was also working on integrating its perspective with ILO in terms of knowledge.

### **Media campaign on worst forms of child labour**

A short message on combating child labour had been crafted under the project and aired via FANA TV and Radio and Southern FM Radio stations to sensitize the public. The message on child labour has been broadcast for 139 minutes through these medias (in four languages in Southern FM) while the one on human trafficking awaits airing as the budget was earmarked for child labour only. The messages were crafted in Amharic, Oromifa, Tigrigna, Kamataigna, Hadiyigna, Sidamigna, Wolayitigna. It is important to create awareness on child labour as opposed to prosecutions as,

**“Prosecution of child labour in such settings is not viable as it would mean prosecuting nearly half of the population” (KII with Adama Police)**

Community level awareness creation materials such as t-shirts and billboards are not in use as they are not budgeted for. While broadcast has a wider reach, partners should also consider awareness creation platforms that have relative permanency. Awareness creation among the public is crucial and lays the groundwork for acceptance of legislative and policy reforms in the field. However, as there are other CSOs in the field who

engage with the community on these issues of modern slavery, partners should see if the awareness creation interventions should primarily focus on and be designed to reach higher level, targeting employers.

CETU had bimonthly newsletter which has now become electronic newsletter because of budget constraints. It also has a telegram channel through which it shares the e-newsletters.

Apart from media campaigns, CETU can learn from other CSOs such as Woord en Daad who are using already existing structures for awareness and empowerment. Interventions to combat child labour include;

- Child wellbeing clubs (this makes it possible to notice and follow up if a child is missing from school)
- Community conversation for brokers, employers and families
- Parents Teachers Association (PTA)
- Parenting skills (Intervention by CSOs is of no use where parents endorse decisions of child labour)
- Woord en Daad has also played a key role in establishment of the national Children’s parliament

### Outcome 3

Vulnerable individuals and groups are resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery.

Project-specific outcome: Trade unions have contributed to make vulnerable workers in high -risk sectors more resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery

Child labour is common in agriculture and mining sectors especially in Southern Ethiopia (Gold) but also in other urban settings such as Addis where weaving is big business. The age of employment in Ethiopia is 15 years but this is limited to light work.

Planned vs budgeted activities

Planned	Budgeted
1. Number of CBA’s in targeted sectors where modern slavery occurs	1. Training course on forced labour CETU and trade union leaders
2. Number of education manuals developed used to reach out to vulnerable workers.	2. Training course on the worst forms of child labour for corporate sector leaders
3. Number of trade union representatives trained	
4. Number of vulnerable workers in the targeted sectors that have been trained on their rights	
5. Number of mechanisms/initiatives in place	

### CBA’s in targeted sectors

The project had planned, through affiliate trade unions, to review a number of CBA’s in targeted sectors where modern slavery occurs to ensure the issues are included (CMS project was supposed to leverage on Decent Work Project).

A key result was for policies or collective agreements in place that have provisions on child labour, trafficking and forced labour. It was expected that collective agreements or CBAs of the trade union partner affiliates organising in both formal and informal sectors will be revised to include combating modern slavery aspects but this has not happened as the project target of the project is the formal sector. However, the project has devised an MoU which is to be signed by CETU branches and corporate sector leaders that take part in the worst forms of training by the project. This has also not been part of the project but is an innovative mechanism CETU has tried to have in place to answer the gaps. It is expected that these MOUs with the employers will translate to the CBAs.

CETU has only two budgeted activities under CMS including

- Training course on forced labour CETU and trade union leaders
- Training course on the worst forms of child labour for corporate sector leaders

## **Training of union leaders on forced labour and human trafficking**

Union leaders trained by the project indicate some results with some companies/workplaces enhancing support for vulnerable individuals (trafficked or in danger of being trafficked) were identified in the study.

For example, during the FGD at Adama, the Human resources manager of Naflet Hotel went through a training by CETU on child labour and human trafficking. After the training, the Bureau of Labour and Skills in its engagement with victims of human trafficking (mostly returnee migrants and children on the streets) contacted the hotel for support. Previous to the training, the organization has not been open to recruiting such children below 18 years of age. However, participation in CMS training has created understanding that children below 18 (14 to 18 years) could be employed for light work. This is in line with Ethiopian Labour proclamation, where the minimum age for young workers is 15 years and that they should be assigned appropriate work. Accordingly, the hotel now considers it as part of its support to provide employment opportunity for such vulnerable children.

Victims of trafficking (returnee migrants) who plan to legally migrate to work in foreign countries are also benefiting from the opportunity to familiarize themselves with kitchen and laundry appliances in the hotel for their future legal employment overseas. It can therefore be said that the Human Resources' willingness to recruit such children is a result of the understanding from the training. Trained staff are also training the others who didn't get a chance to participate in the training.

In another case, a cooperate sector leader, the finance manager who attended the CETU training on worst forms of child labour as well as forced labour indicates,

**“attending the training on forced labour has enhanced the understanding on implementation of the labour law relating to working hours and overtime work. Having understood forced labour as a push factor for migration and subsequently human trafficking, union members (7 members of the trade union’s executive committee) have been trained on the issue and salary adjustment of employees has also been made” (KII with Senior Accountant and Basic Trade Union Secretary, Robi Hotel Adama).**

It was noted that as regards companies, business owners are sensitive on time spent on trainings as it takes time from working hours. Owners should thus be targeted for proper understanding of capacity building interventions/trainings. It is important to distribute handouts/brochures/pamphlets etc. for later reference after the training as well as to inform the management and fellow works who did not attend trainings. CETU can also consider possibilities of providing trainings at venues where most workers could easily attend especially at their workplace.

### **Education materials to reach vulnerable workers**

As alluded to under Output 2, physical education materials were not budgeted for under the project. However, short message on combating child labour were crafted under the project and aired via FANA TV and Radio and Southern FM Radio stations to sensitize the public. The message on child labour has been broadcast for 139 minutes through these medias (in four languages in Southern FM). It is expected that these messages will reach many vulnerable workers and possibly influence change.

During the second phase, however, the project needs to produce some educational materials including brochures, t-shirts, posters, in various languages which communities can interact with and message disseminated widely in the community.

## **2.4 Results by DAC Criteria**

### **Relevance of the Project**

CETU is mandated to fight for the rights and benefits of workers including addressing issues of forced labour, child labour and human trafficking (more specifically related to migration). The project's focus on child labour, forced labour and human trafficking is therefore relevant and directly linked to CETU's mandates in the workplace to combat child labour which is prevalent in agriculture, mining, hotel and tourism. Although CETU and its stakeholders have been addressing issues of child labour

in other projects, the issue of human trafficking and forced labour is new and widens its programming mandate.

The following four types of training targeting managers and human resources officers from commercial undertakings in the agriculture, agro-processing, hotel and tourism and agribusiness sectors have been conducted.

1. Forced labour for Basic trade union leaders
2. Worst forms of child labour: corporate sector
3. Human trafficking and roles and responsibilities of actors: partnership coalition members
4. Modern slavery: Police and regulatory and law enforcement agency members, judges and public prosecutors

Awareness creation among the public is crucial and lays the ground work for acceptance of legislative and policy reforms in the field. However, as there are other CSOs on the ground who engage with the community on these issues of modern slavery, partners such as CETU given the convening power should operate at a higher level or create awareness creation interventions that should primarily focus on and be designed to reach higher level, targeting employers.

Worst form of child labour seems to be in the informal sector. CETU can be more strategic in its targets to see how best to achieve its goals within its mandate with due regard to the intersection between the formal and informal sectors relating to issues of modern slavery.

### **Efficiency**

The project selected trainers from government offices rather than hire consultants to reduce on the budget. There is higher value for money and the project is able to reach more people in training. As an example, CETU contracts desk officers/experts from Bureau of Labour and Skills (BOLS) in the intervention areas (branch offices) to deliver trainings and this has been found to be cost effective.

Trickle down strategy for instance in Adama City, after training by CETU, the police train women's self-help groups which RPC organizes and supports. These trained women are key in reporting crimes, mobilizing the community for peaceful demonstration (relating to injustices and raising awareness on human trafficking and other issues). The CSOs also provide logistics support to the police (such as provision of stationary and refreshment for police meetings and trainings)

Synergies with other CETU programmes. The Adama branch office provides technical support in organizing the CMS project trainings and it also facilitates other trainings by CETU including domestic workers by the gender department and decent work by the training and education department. These platforms by the other departments are also used for awareness creation on human trafficking, thus providing leverage or benefiting the combating modern slavery project at least cost. Leveraging the Decent Work Project needed to be emphasized for more efficiency.

### **Effectiveness**

Use of local languages e.g. Oromifa and Amharic ensured the local populations were reached in their own language and was thus an effective strategy. Use of media, both television and radio in 7 languages (Fana Television and radio, South FM) ensures millions of people are reached on the key messages regarding human trafficking, forced labour and child labour

Networking with stakeholders to enhance knowledge sharing from experts. Although the CMS project did not envisage development of training manual, CETU has managed to put in place a training manual under its partnership with ILO. A training manual on "human trafficking and forced labour" was developed. To facilitate implementation, a training of trainers' session was given on the same.

Team formation for instance police investigation teams have helped to fast track assessments and documentation of cases

CETU's cooperation with actors in the field particularly ILO and BOLS in the implementation of the project has contributed towards efficient use of resources and knowledge sharing.

**“Contracting consultants for trainings is unaffordable under the project budget. Consultants would require 15000 ETB-20000ETB per day but experts assigned from BOLS are paid at 3000 ETB per day and they are also best suited in delivering trainings in local languages” (KII with CETU Programme manager).**

However, partners should take caution to ensure their hiring is not just limited to Bureaus as they might not have all the required expertise and there is need to expand the sources to ensure quality is not compromised.

Combining trainees from different sectors, though cost effective may fail to address specific issues for key particular sectors. There is a reported need for tailored trainings for regulatory bodies, particularly the police. Tailored training for the police could enhance effectiveness of the project’s intervention as the police have formal and informal structures through which it campaigns against MS with multiplier effect. The design of such tailored training for the police shall also consider increasing number of trainees from the regulatory sector with due consideration to the project budget.

Trainees lack reference materials to use after training. Design of trainings should involve provision of informative materials such as short notes, pamphlets, brochures etc. that trainees could take with them and share with fellow workers and supervisors.

On media campaigns, community level awareness creation materials such as t-shirts and billboards are not in use as they are not budgeted for yet they have some relative permanency.

### **Sustainability**

Use of government officers in training builds their capacity and ensures continuity even after the project ends. However, this limits the utilization of skills potentially available for the project in the free market.

Use of existing structures for sustainability and to save costs e.g. government facilities and schools during training sessions

The MOUs signed with different stakeholders will also be used to ensure sustainability. CETU is pushing for the modern slavery issues to be included in MOUs and where budget allows MOUs will be signed with regional bodies (BOLS)

### **Impact**

The trainings have enhanced knowledge sharing regarding child labour and have enabled employers to recruit needy or vulnerable children of legal age (15years) to engage in light work and this has been reported beneficial for such children in providing income.

The project is contributing in creating awareness among workers, employers and Trade union members and enabling children to go to school after they are more informed on the dangers and risks of child labour. Children are also informed to report to the Police if trafficked.

The CMS project implementation has shown positive change on the ground. Government task forces on combating modern slavery (human trafficking) in Amhara and SNNPR region have become more active after the project.

In Adama City, it was reported that women’s self-help groups are crucial in reporting cases to the police. The structures in place have created an atmosphere of fear of legal action among the community and trafficking is declining. Employment agencies are also now aware of human trafficking and report cases to the police when they come into contact with trafficked children.

### **Collaboration**

CETU has not been working with the Ministry of Labour and Skills (MOLS) as the ministry was undergoing some organizational restructuring. CETU instead has been working with CSOs who directly receive funds from NORAD and run consortiums of their own (a Dutch organization named Woord en Daad which has 6 organizations under it and a CSO named ActionAid which has 7

organizations under it). CETU and these organizations are working on synergizing their initiatives on research, policy advocacy and awareness raising interventions on modern slavery and report progress during meetings at the Royal Norwegian Embassy.

Although the LO project does not have activities in the informal sector, the CETU gender department is working on a project on domestic workers and addressing the issues on child labour, forced labour and human trafficking. It is difficult to reach the informal sector because there is no legal framework to unionize them. But CETU is selecting a few, for example domestic workers, who are now organizing as an association. CETU has given them office space and material support including at its 8 branch offices.

CETU is networking and collaborating with development partners towards the project objectives. ILO has trained the CETU staff on C181 and C29. ILO has also developed training manual for social partners on forced labour and human trafficking. ILO has also provided a TOT for CETU staff. ILO had also provided support in finalizing CETU's Child labour policy and its validation. As CETU decided to include forced labour and human trafficking issues in the policy and ILO has supported that by contracting a consultant to make the policy comprehensive as requested.

Police are collaborating closely with NGOs on shelters for rescued cases of child trafficking and child labour. In Adama City, Adama police liaises with SNNPR Women and Children's Affairs office for support when it comes across cases of trafficked children. SNNPR Women's and Children's Affairs Bureau has contacts with NGOs that serve as safe houses for children until reintegration. AWSAD takes girl children and Yosef Children's House and Novel Action hosts boys. Around 50 children (mostly girls) were sent to safe houses in the past year (Director of Office of Women's and Children's Affairs, Adama Police)

Need to collaborate on research including sharing research topics and findings among child protection stakeholders rather than duplicating efforts (According to Woord en daad, 10 researches have been done on same topics as stakeholders are operating in silo). Networking and collaboration with partners and actors in the field should continue to avoid duplication of efforts and be strengthened with clear directions and plans on what CETU can provide and needs to be supported with.

National Multi-stakeholder Platform on Child Labour has been formed but needs more members to join including CSOs, UN, ILO, Ministry of Labour – which needs to be the coordinator. CETU is part of it. According to the Confederation of Ethiopian Employers Federation (CEEF)<sup>3</sup>,

**“Information on modern slavery (child labour/forced labour) are fragmented and found at different Ministries. Systematizing and unifying these as well as centralizing the data flow is important as reliable data and is important for response” (KII ED CEEF)**

Working as a coalition ‘cooperation is the new competition’. Lobby for same funding in a coalition to solve issues in child protection. On modalities for collaboration, one CSO leaders says,

**The government needs to be the leader in arrangements whereby ILO coordinates the UN entities and Woord en Daad coordinates the CSOs could be helpful in synergizing. CETU has good personalities for collaboration. The government also needs to coordinate its different Ministries (of agriculture, education, labour, mining and women/children. (Woord en Daad Country Representative).**

In as much as efforts to synergize with external actors are highly valued, it is also important for CETU to reflect inwards and synergize project activities run by its various departments. Internal platforms for planning and reporting so as to monitor and synergize implementation by the different departments should be put in place. Such platforms should be regular and frequent for enhanced efficiency and updated flow of information within CETU.

---

<sup>3</sup> The Confederation is not legally registered yet. But has a membership of 15 federations from different sectors

## Gender considerations

It was noted that 75% of the CETU head office employees are women. At branch office level, 1 of four employees would be a woman. However, women are lacking in top leadership positions. Currently only the Women's Affairs Department is headed by a woman. The finance department had previously been headed by a woman but it is rarely that women come to leadership. However, those in leadership receive equal remuneration and benefits as with the men.

On part of the project, the evaluation revealed planned systems and practices of gender equality integration in implementation of the project are lacking. However, it was noted that the Women's Affairs Department is not involved in the project since tasks are divided among departments at CETU. The Social Affairs department is the one mandated to work on for issues of child labour and human trafficking.

However, both man and women have benefited from the project. During invitations, there is a deliberate effort to ensure both men and women are invited for training. However, these depends on the sector as there are more women in hotel and more men in the agriculture sector.

**“Trafficked children are mostly boys between the ages of 9-12, and forced to work in the informal sector, particularly traditional weaving” (Director of Women's and Children's Affairs Directorate, Addis Ababa police)**

Partners need to duly consider how gender can be mainstreamed for the remainder of the project period.

## 2.5 Comments on the CETU Project Results Framework

The project is overall contributing towards raising awareness on modern slavery. However, the implementing partner needs to revisit if all the expected results during the start of the project could be achieved through the activities currently being implemented. Efforts are also needed to ensure that results achieved so far are anchored and that they can be maintained when external funding ends. The review identified the below concerns regarding the results framework

Some activities do not lead to the set outcomes in the project document. Other CETU activities under its mandate could lead to the set outcomes but the CMS project document fails to make logical linkages with some of its activities and expected results. Results relating to CBAs and labour inspectors are particularly problematic in this regard. For example, increasing number of labour inspectors is set in the project goal but no activities to this end are included. Some activities are not logically connected to the outcome indicators and the results framework needs to be revised. And there aren't activities that would lead to the stated results. Particularly relating to labour inspectors.

At impact level, the project has set as final target “three improvements in the legal or policy framework are adopted.” The bench mark for this are convention 131 on minimum wage fixing, convention 97 on migration for employment and convention on Labour inspection in agriculture. Accordingly, the project is expected to work for adoption of these instruments but the CMS project advocacy activities are not on these. There is therefore a need for alignment of projects at CETU. But CMS is working for the improvement of legal framework and policy. The coalition hopes to request for revision of the national child policy. The project outcome 1 provides it is expected that the Ethiopian government has implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors. Indicators are also set as “No of new trade union demands related to forced labour, child labour and human trafficking incorporated in national labour law and policies” and “Increase of labour inspectors from 685 to 793”. There are however no activities to this end. The activity on advocacy for policy/legal change by trade unions is also not budgeted for (was supposed to leverage on Decent Work Project).

The project outcome 1 provides it is expected that the Ethiopian government has implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors. Indicators are also set as “Number of new trade union demands related to forced labour, child labour and human trafficking incorporated in national labour law and policies” and “Increase of labour

inspectors from 685 to 793". There are however no activities to this end. The activity on advocacy for policy/legal change by trade unions is also not budgeted for. Arrangements to collect feedback from beneficiaries or platforms to inform cases of MS to law enforcement bodies are not in place. Had labour inspectors been targeted under the project, it could have been possible to follow up on enforcement. Approval of budget revision by LO was also delayed.

Dialogue meetings and development of position papers and policy statements under outcome one and Dialogue meetings with employers, Sensitizations of employers under outcome two of the results framework are not budgeted for.

## **2.6 Project Audit**

The audit was conducted for the project period of May 2021-December 2021. It was a clean report and there was no issue. CETU has one institutional procurement and finance manual. There are no project specific manuals.

Funds from LO-Norway (3,118, 516.65 ETB) had been deposited to Abyssinia bank for the period audited. The audit employed simple methods of risk assessment and fraud risk analysis. It was a small audit considering the amount of funds. The audit checked if business was conducted according to the procurement and financial manual. CETU uses Peachtree. Peachtree is old and SAGE is better. Since CETU has many projects, ERP (Enterprise Resource Management Programme) can be used.

## **2.7 LO contributions apart from finances**

Audit training: LO headquarter staff has provided audit training to CETU staff. Two members of CETU's leadership, one expert from CETU's finance unit, and three persons from MS and DW projects got trained on fighting fraud in NGO.

Technical support: The regional consultant and LO headquarter staff (i.e., the financial controller and the international advisor) always provide CETU with technical advice when required.

## **2.8 Challenges in project implementation**

The negative effect of COVID-19 impacted implementation as only small number of people could meet. Provision of COVID-19 prevention materials such as masks and sanitizers for training participants had a bearing on the cost of implementations. Nevertheless, CETU came in to support government in preparation of workplace protocols and advocated for Government to support employers by reducing taxes and giving low interest loans. Consequently, the protocols and policies helped protect workers from sacking during the COVID-19 peak.

Security issues - the project could not be launched in Kombolcha until September 2022 because of the conflict in Northern Ethiopia - conflict in the Amhara region.

The restructuring of Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs had a bearing on implementations related to the ministry. There has also been poor participation by high level Ministry of Labour officers to enable better decision making during the stakeholder forums

Inadequate awareness in the community on issues of modern slavery, child labour and forced labour, meaning more investment is required in awareness raising

Poor operationalization of ratified conventions. Lack of reinforcement due to lack of adequate number of labour inspectors. Nor are labour inspectors included in the training offered by the project

Although a signatory of the UNCRC, there is poor implementation of the law by the government, no attention, no commitment and no particular budget, including emergency budget to implement the law on anti-trafficking

The Labour Advisory Board consisting of 15 members (including 5 representatives each from the government, employers and workers) has not been functional for almost a year owing to some ongoing structural adjustments by Government.



High inflation affecting budgets. The project had to reduce participants in the earmarked activities. COVID-19 led to reduction in the numbers or participants in face-to-face forums. The project also had to buy protection materials such as face masks, sanitisers not budgeted for.

It is difficult to obtain evidence to enable successful prosecution of the many cases of trafficking. According to Action Aid, only about 3 cases are taken up to conviction stage, yet there are so many cases involving child trafficking, child labour and forced labour. Also, expensive due to lots of research needed, collaboration, and tracing. Lack of birth registration and a system to identify the age of a child means one cannot tell their age, which is part of evidence generation.

Related to the above, establishment of a case of human trafficking requires proof of recruitment, transportation and exploitation. During the respondent's tenure at the Directorate for 18 years there has not been a prosecution of a human trafficking case.

Although the stakeholders are working/ telling the employers to not hire children, it is difficult to control the private sector for there is lack of system. The informal sector is also difficult to control for instance restaurants.

It was noted there is lack of follow up on anti-trafficking committees to assess what they are doing and its effectiveness

Attrition where some of the previously trained people have left the programme leaving fewer pursuing the goal towards achievement of project outcomes

It is difficult to enforce compliance due to the low number of labour inspectors. Also, high turnover due to government structures and lack of immediate replacement means no senior labour inspectors. There are no functioning safety committees at worksite level to work with labour inspectors, no OSH (Occupational Safety and Health) institute for dedicated staff, OSH and labour inspectors do not work together, no technical equipment for labour inspectors,

Child protection stakeholders are working in silos and duplicating efforts, competing for resources from the same donors and making it difficult to achieve the goal of reducing modern slavery and child labour.

The police are the first responder to cases of trafficking from Regional States to Addis Ababa. However, the anti- human trafficking coalition is not actively supporting the police despite having a police member. There is also lack of children safe houses - needed in the police stations. Female police officers sometimes take such children home and even share them their lunch.

There is imbalance of power between the government/CSOS and the traffickers. Traffickers are highly resourced and they act swiftly as they have advantage over CSOS/governments that are required to comply with working procedures and protocols to take actions. Thus, Addis Ababa police Commission Child Protection unit had only reported only 3 cases taken to court in 2021 despite the massiveness of the case. The combating modern slavery (human trafficking and child labour and forced labour initiatives are not well budgeted for (in terms of human resources and logistics) by the government. Political commitment is needed.

Internally within CMS/CETU, there is poor linkage between the logframe and the planned activities and results. The planned leverage with the Decent Work Program which is implementing work around some of the unbudgeted results has also been affected by poor networking/linkages.

## **2.9 Lessons Learnt**

- Coordination and programmatic linkages between LO projects are key to achievement of results that depend on synergies.
- CETU is recognized by all stakeholders as holding convening power, putting it in a position to convene strategic stakeholders and influence the direction on strategic issues. However, this power is not fully utilized

- Coalition building is important to achieve results on pertinent and cross sectoral issues such as child labour.
- Collaboration is the new competition and CSOs and other stakeholders can achieve more if they collaborate and approach financiers as a team on issues and funding rather than compete
- A lot of outcome results may be identified if not properly monitored and documented after project activities are completed

### 3.0 Recommendations

There is need to ensure CMS Results Framework references the Decent Work Program related activities and results as well as outcome indicators. Examples include indicator on ‘increased of labour inspectors’ and another on ‘improvements in the policy’ which were not budgeted for under CMS but are part of the Decent Work Program. This also calls for enhanced coordination between the two LO funded programs.

Partners should enhance engagement with MOLS and MOWSA in the remainder of the project to support achievement the stated project objectives. Ensure more active participation and ownership by the high-level Ministry of Labour officers to facilitate better decision making during the stakeholder forums

CETU has networks, geographical spread and is a trustworthy, recognized and credible body with good relationships and convening power with government, donors, CSOs, private sector and community. Thus, they are best placed to create awareness and push for policies on the agenda of the child. CETU also enjoys political will from the government which positions it to influence policies. Examples where CETU needs to add effort include advocacy on the living wage Act, operationalization of ratified conventions, advocacy with government to increase number of labour inspectors for better compliance. CETU shall push forward the national platform agenda. They can work on networking of state and non-state actors. Due to its strengths, CETU could focus on Modern Slavery as a key niche going forward.

CETU’s position for trilateral relation (with the government and employers) and its credibility should be utilized to influence employers and policy makers.

Create more awareness in the community on issues of human trafficking, modern slavery, child labour and forced labour through various methods especially the media. Issues of modern slavery need to be addressed more at community level.

Facilitate a national coordination mechanism to integrate and coordinate strategies on child labour by various actors to remove duplication, enhance synergies and get more value for money. Child protection stakeholders to come together and collaborate on similar matters rather than working in silos – which makes them less effective

Through the field Project officers, follow up with employers on the 38 CBA inclusions as a result of the MOUs signed during the training

Support informal workers to register as associations to enable them fight for their rights and contribute to the war against modern slavery

Follow up and support anti-trafficking committees to enhance cross learning between the active and passive ones

Continue collaborating with government for use of existing public structures and to save costs e.g. government facilities, schools, as this will also ensure sustainability

CETU is geographically well positioned as it has presence at source, transit and destination areas. However, CETU’s mandate is limited to the formal sector.

CETU Should conduct studies to see what is happening on the ground in the agricultural and informal sector regarding child labour and also work on unionizing small firms in the agricultural sector. It should also work on the inclusion of child and forced labour in CBAs.

Stakeholders need to synergize resources (including financial resources) with CSOs working on the field and ILO. Duplication should be avoided

CETU shall not only be using existing platforms but also be a leader in creating platforms and structures when and if needed.

CETU shall also consider adding to its geographical scope to other areas that are identified as hotspots of modern slavery.

Donors need to be more flexible since the work is complicated and very unpredictable. There is need for adaptive programming and flexibility to context. Working on root causes requires longer time engagement and moving from project to partnership (to achieve development partnership) is necessary

The African Union has a biannual social and employment meeting and that platform should be explored to advocate on issues of modern slavery. Developing skills and standards to ensure free mobility and harmonization of labour market information can help reduce forced labour, enhance streamlining of migration employment and rights of workers. It will also help country's see where their comparative advantage lies. Ethiopia also does not have a policy on migration and that should be addressed.

Departments at CETU should be committed to gender issues and utilize budget accordingly. LO Norway project should also closely work with the department to mainstream gender.

The CETU leadership should continue awareness creation for regulatory bodies and fast track the law to implement modern slavery at the house of representatives and also work with the Ministry of Labour and skills. CETU needs to upscale its advocacy on implementation of ratified conventions since while the Government of Ethiopia already has many important policies and programmes in place, these do not always translate into the desired results due to lack of proper implementation. Key focus should be on law enforcement, coordination, integration and capacity building among stakeholders to strengthen the positive effects of the legal and policy commitments and ensure they reach their full potential. The modern slavery policy implementation results also need to be measured and communicated routinely for adaptive programming.

## **3.0 REPORT FOR GHANA**

### **3.1 Introduction**

According to a report by UNICEF, Ghana has one of the highest rates of child labour per country in the world, with about two million children (21%) of the childhood population in the country participating in some form of child labour. The most recent figures from the global slavery index, also reported that there are 133,000 people living in slavery in Ghana. This therefore calls for concerted efforts and renewed strategies to confront the menace.

The rising number of cases of child labour and modern slavery in Ghana can be linked to poverty rates, income inequalities, the increasing level of informality, lack of access to social protection and education, and the population dynamics.

The magnitude of the problem differs across regions. Children who work are more likely not to attend school even if they are within the compulsory education age bracket. Missing out on school usually affects their earnings when they are adults. During the mid-term review, over 25 stakeholders were purposively selected and interviewed including the LO and TUC project team, affiliates, employers' organizations, project beneficiaries, partner organisations and ministry of labour. Engagement was done through virtual meetings, local phone calls, and in-person discussions. Since the visit to Ghana was virtual, we relied on a local consultant who assisted in data collection, contacting the interviewees, setting up appointments for virtual meetings and met with individuals who were available physically. In addition, she conducted phone

interviews, sent out google forms to collect some data and finally visited some fisher folks in Osu and held informal discussions with them. Majority of the stakeholders who participated in the evaluation pointed out that the informal sector has the highest number of cases. These informal sectors include; the fishing, farming, construction and mining and are spread across the Western, Central, Northern, Greater Accra and Volta Regions of Ghana.

The information in this report is for the year 2021 and for the first half of 2022 (January to June). At the time of the interview, the TUC Ghana project team stated that they had not finished collating the information for the second half of 2022.

### **3.2 The Trades Union Congress Ghana**

The TUC, has been in existence since 1945. The organisation currently has a solid membership of 500,000 workers from both public and private sectors. Apart from its vision, which is in part to organize all the working people of Ghana into one independent and democratic trade union organization, it pays a lot of attention to upholding the rights of workers. TUC is committed to eliminating the worst forms of Child Labour and modern slavery and it is of the opinion that children should be in schools and not in workplaces.

In the last TUC congress, held in 2021, child labour was identified as one of the major challenges that unions face in Ghana. This renewed TUC's commitment in eliminating the worst forms of Child Labour and modern slavery at the workplace and beyond. The organisation firmly believes that children should be in schools and not in workplaces.

The TUC partnership with LO-Norway is not new since they are implementing a global programme on Decent work. The two organization once again came together to work on a project dubbed “Trade union efforts to combat modern slavery” in Ghana.

In this partnership LO-Norway plays 2 critical roles, first as a donor and secondly as a partner who offers technical support whereas, the Trades Union Congress (TUC) is the implementing partner in Ghana. Their efforts will contribute towards the eradication of forced labour, end human trafficking and eliminate the worst forms of child labour in Ghana, in line with SDG 8.7. The three-tiered strategy and expected deliverables, of the project include:

- a. Governments have implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors.
- b. The corporate sector has implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in their company operations and supply chains.
- c. Vulnerable individuals and groups are resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery.

According to the Grant Agreement with NORAD, the Project was to be implemented from the 15 March 2021 to 31 December 2023. However, due to COVID-19, the project was launched virtually in June 2021 and the activities began thereafter. Despite this minor setback, TUC has done a good job in ensuring that they carry out the activities and redeem the time lost.

### **3.3 Progress on Results**

#### **Impact**

#### **Law & Policy Reform**

Ghana has taken several steps over the years to address the menace of forced labour and child labour among others by ratifying two (2) core ILO Conventions (i.e., Nos. 29 & 105) that aimed to suppress forced labour. The provisions of these Conventions are reflected in Ghanaian laws especially the 1992 Republican Constitution: Labour Act, 651(Act 2003) and Labour Regulations, 2007 (LI 1833).

The government has also implemented programmes, policies, and related legislations such as the Human Trafficking Act, 2005 (Act 694); the Human Trafficking (Amendment) Act, 2009 (Act 784); the Human Trafficking Prohibition (Protection and Reintegration of Trafficked Persons) Regulations, 2015 and the National Plan of Action for the Elimination of Human Trafficking (2017 – 2021) among others.

As far as law reforms are concerned, progress has been made. During the review of the hazardous work list framework, TUC gave their inputs that were well received. The review process was finalized and the changes validated through NSCCL (National Steering Committee on Child Labour) tripartite committee. The Children's Act that was being reviewed concurrently, is expected to be finalised soon. A decision will then be made as to whether the hazardous work list framework will be adopted into law or whether it will be a legal instrument that will be attached to the Children's Act.

Although the UN CRC Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution, and Child Pornography has not been ratified, a little progress has been made. TUC met with some stakeholder to discuss how the Government can expedite the process and they came up with some proposals. Arrangements are currently being made to meet with the minister of children to discuss the proposals that came from the stakeholders meeting.

TUC is also involved in the review of the National Plan of Action (2017-2021). The reviewed National Plan of Action is meant to guide Ghana's policy and initiatives on child labour. They met to discuss NPA 2 and the way forward, noting that majority of the activities included in NPA 1 had not been carried out. There is a recommendation to carry these activities forward to the next phase, with a debate on whether to call it NPA3 or to change its name completely.

It is important to note that the TUC has gained a lot of knowledge from implementing the project on modern slavery and can now make a meaningful contribution whenever they are called upon to review policy and legislation.

### **Direct beneficiary impacts**

Company level: The TUC has built the capacity of focal persons to act as ambassadors to partner with them in training their union members and fellow workers. Given the right support, this could have a huge multiplier effect. The focal persons are assisting some companies to develop or review CBAs to include clauses on modern slavery.

Community level. Through this programme TUC has reached out to workers in the informal sectors such as, the cocoa farmers and fisher folks. The programme has increased the visibility of the TUC and enhanced awareness on child labour among these communities. Interviews with these communities indicated that with the increased awareness, more children from these communities will be taken to school.

### **3.4 Outcome Results**

**Outcome 1:** The Government has implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors.

**Project-specific outcome:** The government in Ghana has implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors.

Although the government of Ghana may have made some efforts in ratifying conventions/Laws/Policies to prevent, identify and address modern slavery and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors, they are not intentional in addressing the same issues. This finding is supported by the fact that following discussions at the virtual 109th Session of the International Labour Conference, Ghana was given a double footnote by the ILO committee of experts on application of standards and conventions because of failing on their obligations to report and not acting in addressing issues on child labour and modern slavery.

Mr. Andrews Addoquaye Tagoe representing the worker’s group raised some important concerns and made comments regarding the child labour situation in Ghana to the Committee of Experts on the Government’s application of International Labour Standards Convention No. 182, in law and practice. LO supported and strengthened the workers position of Ghana by giving a statement in support of the workers’ position. Ghana’s double footnote was a wakeup call, as they were asked to provide detailed information to the conference by the ILO committee. Government with support from Friederich Ebert Stiftung (FES) has collected feedback from Ministries triggering more attention and discussion on the issues on child labour and modern slavery.

**Below are some of the Workers concerns, issues and suggestions raised by TUC at the 109<sup>th</sup> ILC:**

- Inadequate coverage of government interventions. An example was given of the lake Volta area that has over twelve districts, the direct government interventions had only focused on three out of the 12 districts leaving the remaining 8 districts unattended’.
- Government must redouble, scale-up and accelerate its efforts towards eradicating child labour and complying with its obligations under Convention 182.
- Government must ensure that section 101A of the Criminal Offences Act, 1960 (Act 29), as amended by the Criminal Offences (Amendment) Act of 2012 is further amended, in consultation with social partners to align with Convention 182.
- In relation to the hazardous work list, government was urged, in consultation with social partners to ensure that the list is finalized and a progress report sent to the ILO.
- Child labour denies children their childhood and future. They miss educational opportunities; they are exposed to exploitation including commercial sexual exploitation and early marriages. Children are denied social mobility, which denies them gainful employment, an opportunity to access a higher income in future and the cycle of poverty remains.
- It was argued that with the growing participation of children in the labour market, adults are denied employment opportunities and their negotiation rights are also undermined.

Upon completion of the 109<sup>th</sup> ILC, the ILO Advisory Mission to Ghana visited the social partners including the TUC to follow up on the recommendation of the committee of Application of Standards.

The project activities for the year 2021 and part of 2022 were as follows:

Planned Activities	Implemented Activities
1. Number of new trade union demands related to forced labour, trafficking and child labour incorporated in national labour policies or laws.	1. TUC demands and new proposals on modern slavery promoted by trade unions to decision makers.
2. Number of demands/proposals presented/promoted by trade unions to decision makers on modern slavery.	2. TUC demands and new proposals.
3. The number of labour inspectors in Ghana has increased.	3. Number of labour inspectors in Ghana.
4. The number of government officials including labour inspectors trained by trade unions.	4. Government officials including labour inspectors trained by TUC.
5. Number of research studies conducted on the prevalence of modern slavery	5. TUC Research on modern slavery in Ghana.

## **Activity 1&2: TUC demands and new proposals on modern slavery promoted by trade unions to decision makers.**

The project followed up on the demands that the TUC presented at the 109<sup>th</sup> ILC on behalf of workers on forced labour, trafficking and child labour. The 4 demands that were presented are as follows:

### **I. Government must expedite the ratification of the UN CRC Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution, and Child Pornography.**

As a follow up to this demand, in 2022 the TUC organized for a stakeholders' meeting to discuss this Optional Protocol. Some of the stakeholders who attended the meeting were from the ministry of children's affairs, the police, immigration office and a representative of human rights among others. The agenda was to discuss the fast tracking of the protocol. This is still work in progress with no outcome yet as they resolved to book an appointment with the minister of Gender so that they can discuss the issue further and demand for immediate action.

### **II. Government must intensify efforts to ensure the passage of the Social Protection bill into law review.**

This is still work in progress and not much has been done as far as this bill is concerned.

### **III. Government must review the Hazardous work list.**

TUC as part of NSCCL (under the Ministry of Gender and Child Protection) was in the team that reviewed the hazardous framework. At the time of the interview, the consultants spoke to Mrs Elizabeth Akanbombire, the Director of the Child Labour unit of the Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations who stated that the process was participatory. They had received input from stakeholders. She applauded TUC for giving very valuable input. She mentioned that the framework had already been finalized and validated. The proposal from TUC and other NSCCL members is either added as an attachment to the Children's Act or separately stand on its own as a legal instrument. They will agree on how it can be passed into law.

### **IV. Government must establish a Child labour Inspection Committee made up of members of the tripartite and labour Inspectors. This will aid in identifying and addressing issues on modern slavery.**

At the time of the interview the committee had not been set up. However, since Ghana was exposed on the issue of child labour through the double footnote discussed earlier in this report, it has taken the issue of child labour seriously.

As a start to the envisioned action, the government is currently reviewing legislation to address the gaps that led to the double footnote and has also become more intentional in working with social partners on policy and legal frameworks.

## **Activity 3: Number of Labour Inspectors in Ghana**

According to statistics<sup>4</sup> on Ghana, the estimated population stood at 31,072,094 in the year 2020. Out of this population, there exists only 50 labour inspectors and 6 are waiting to be recruited. At the time of the mid-term evaluation there was no documented evidence showing an increase in the number of new labour inspectors. Even if that number may have increased, six is very small number. Therefore, inadequate human resources still remain a big challenge in the modern slavery sector.

---

<sup>4</sup> On [www.worldometers.info](http://www.worldometers.info) and UN data

#### **Activity 4: The number of government officials including labour inspectors trained by trade unions.**

##### **4.1 National Advocacy Workshop**

TUC held two National Advocacy workshops for different stakeholders. Participants were drawn from the Southern and Northern Sectors. The workshops were held, one from 11<sup>th</sup> - 12<sup>th</sup> May 2022 (TUC Steering Committee) and another one from 28<sup>th</sup> to 31<sup>st</sup> May 2022 for Focal Persons, Gender Officer and Industrial Relations officers the participants were sensitised on the National Plan of Action (NPA). Although the implementation period of the NPA has elapsed (NPA11 2017-2021) TUC felt that it was important for participants to know what is going on at the national level. The 95 participants included TUC steering committee, Government officials (police, immigration officers), NGOs (Rainforest Alliance, Verite), GEA, Women and Youth Committee Chairpersons, Trade Union leaders, Focal Persons, Gender Officers and Industrial Relations officers and GEA just to mention a few.

A representative from the Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations took participants through the NPA and explained that they are discussing the next phase. According to the TUC participants, these were very informative workshops; the participants had no idea about the National plan. The engagement of TUC shows the Government recognizes the important role TUC is playing on matters to address modern slavery.

**“TUC is now recognized, the government even consults TUC on issues of modern slavery, we are committed to continue playing our role”,** Mr. Joshua Ansah, Deputy Secretary General of the TUC proudly told the evaluation team.

##### **4.2. Training of Labour Inspectors**

Labour inspectors in Ghana face 3 unique challenges: understaffing, underfunding and inadequate training. The Labour Department exists to implement policies and programmes and regulate conditions of work, eliminate all forms of slavery, child labour and forced labour, while promoting harmonious industrial relations, ensuring enforcement of labour laws and promoting employment services. In collaboration with other stakeholders, it seeks to promote decent working conditions and improve the quality of life of workers. It takes a knowledgeable and an empowered workforce to perform all those stated duties.

To enhance their capacities, TUC held two workshops on 4<sup>th</sup> to 5<sup>th</sup> and on 14<sup>th</sup> to 15<sup>th</sup> July 2022 with labour inspectors from Sogakope, Volta and Ashanti regions. According to the CMS result matrix, the number of labour inspectors in Ghana was expected to increase to 107 while the number of government officials including labour inspectors trained by the TUC on modern slavery was 43. Participants were trained using the TUC manual. According to TUC facilitators, the original assumption was that many of the labour inspectors knew about the subject. However, TUC realized some knew very little about the topics being discussed.

**“We met in the Volta region for 4-5-day training. The training was good, we had discussions in groups, we were given materials, a project and asked questions” (KII with Labour Inspector Central Region)**

They are now able to carry out their tasks with so much ease. They collaborate with other stakeholders such as Child Welfare Department in rescuing children, following up on cases and ensuring the law takes its course, something they were not doing before. The labour inspectors interviewed said after the training they have been able to rescue more children through the collaborative efforts. Several of the labour inspectors said that they are more enthusiastic in doing this job after the training.

**“We educate parents and the fish mongers on child rights. If they still break the law, we take them to court”. This was a statement made by labour instructors who were interviewed. They were also beneficiaries of the TUC training on MS (KII with Labour inspector).**

At the end of the training, the Labour Inspectors developed Plans of actions for the Ashanti and Greater Accra regions. This plan of actions if properly monitored will enhance outcomes for the CMS project.



### **Plan of Action for the Labour Inspectors**

**Objective:** *Providing Decent Working Conditions and Improve Quality of Life of Workers and without the use of Child Labour, force labour and slavery and Enhancing Employability on a Sustainable Basis.*

**Actions:**

- *Awareness creation, identification and education on child Labour, modern slavery and force Labour issues.*
- *Conduct Labour Inspections to identify Child labour and force labour issues.*
- *To educate job seekers that visits the Public Employment Centre (PECs) offices about forced labour and modern slavery/ trafficking.*
- *To educate job seekers who are vulnerable and can easily be subjected to modern slavery (PECs offices)*
- *Make available the registered certified Private Employment Agency (PEAs)*
- *Pay attention to the informal sector; Kumasi Central market, Kejetia Market is an open-air market in Kumasi and the largest single market in West Africa. The huge human activities carried at the market makes it a center that could promote child labour and modern slavery. Identify practices using the knowledge gained.*

*The common challenges among them were lack of adequate resources to do their work effectively including human resources.*

### **Activity 5: Research studies**

The TUC have done a mapping on the prevalence of modern slavery in Ghana. Two consultants were engaged in the process, namely Mr. Obed Asare [Research Officer, Labour Research and Policy Institute, TUC-Ghana] and Mr. Edmund Adinkra Darko [Research Officer, Public Utility Workers' Union (PUWU), TUC-Ghana]. They assessed the current trends of child labour and modern slavery in Ghana, with special emphasis on cocoa and fishing sub-sectors in the agricultural sector, mining and construction sub-sectors in the industry sector, and wholesale and retail sub-sectors in the services sector. The report focused on these sub-sectors because they exhibit high prevalence rate of child labour and modern slavery. They also visited some communities in the Volta Region, Kpando Toko where some victims of child labor had been rescued and made to pursue formal education and vocational skills.

Findings from the research data include the key issues that need to be focused on by government and stakeholders for instance: 1 out of every 5 children is in hazardous work. Male children are more prone to child labour than their female counterparts, child labour and hazardous work are prevalent in the rural areas than in urban communities. Child labour and its worst forms are common among children from the poorest households. Children not in school are more likely to be victims of child labour. Nearly half of the children work for less than nine (9) hours per week. Description of activities and work referred to in the Children Act, 1998 (Act 560) as hazardous work is not comprehensive enough, and the fine in lieu of imprisonment as a penalty for the perpetrators is not punitive enough.

The study recommends that the Government of Ghana should expedite actions on the formalization of the informal economy; improve access to education nation-wide particularly in the rural areas; target and initiate programmes to create more decent jobs; provide, increase, and regularize access to social protection schemes; and continue to raise awareness and increase education on modern slavery and child labour.

Another recommendation that came from the mapping study report states that the government should organise more trainings/capacity building programmes for government officials (such as judges, immigration officers and police officers), civil society organisations, NGOs, trade unions, and community leaders at all levels on modern slavery and child labour issues. The state institutions, agencies, and other stakeholders should strengthen their efforts to collaborate in order to eliminate modern slavery and child labour in Ghana.

Another recommendation is that the government should mobilise the needed resources for the enforcement of laws on human rights abuse, including modern slavery and child labour. There is a need for a more effective implementation of child labour policies, programmes, and interventions and the need for policy

coherence on child labour. The government needs to strengthen the migration governance system through effective implementation of the National Labour Migration Policy (2020-2024). The state should enforce strictly the regulation on the registration of private employment agencies and ratify the UN CRC Optional Protocol on the sale of children, child prostitution, and child pornography. There is need to review policies and legal frameworks.

The study also pointed out some of the key challenges to the fight against modern slavery and child labour in Ghana; there are insufficient funds to enforce laws and policies and programmes against modern slavery and child labour; lack of reasonable number of shelters for victims of trafficking and child abuse; lack of adequate and victim-friendly infrastructure and logistics; inclusion of a fine in lieu of imprisonment as a penalty for perpetrators of human trafficking; and sentencing of perpetrators of trafficking to a jail term of less than the minimum prescribed jail term of five (5) years.

The TUC personnel stated that information from the mapping study has really been useful when discussing policy issues, review to legal frameworks, and they refer to it during training and sensitization sessions.

It has been observed during this evaluation that the study was supposed to be on modern slavery and child labour, but there is more information on child labour than on the other issues on MS in the research.

## Outcome 2

**Outcome:** The corporate sector has implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in their company operations and supply chains.

**Project-specific outcome:** Trade unions have contributed to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in company operations and supply chains.

The project’s planned and budgeted activities for 2021 and part of 2022 are as follows:

Planned Activities	Implemented Activities
1. Number of companies that have developed or revised new code of conducts or policies on modern slavery.	1. New and Revised codes of conduct or policies on modern slavery.
2. Number of established /strengthened anti human trafficking committees for shop stewards.	2. Established /strengthened anti human trafficking committees for shop stewards.
3. Number of bipartite and/or tripartite consultations held with employers on modern slavery.	3. Bipartite and/or tripartite consultations held with employers on modern slavery.
4. Number of workplaces using campaign material on modern slavery developed by unions.	4. Workplaces using campaign material on modern slavery developed by TUC.
5. Number of trade union representatives/focal points trained on how to prevent and identify forced labour, trafficking and child labour by trade unions.	5. Trade union representatives/focal points trained on how to prevent and identify forced labour, trafficking and child labour by trade unions.
6. Number of information initiatives made by trade unions (campaigns, brochures etc. for workplaces).	6. Information initiatives made by trade unions (campaigns, brochures etc. for workplaces).

**Activity 1: New and Revised codes of conducts or policies on modern slavery.**

Two unions; the Ghana Private Road Transport Unit (GPRTU) and the Union of Informal Workers Association (UNIWA) are in the process of reviewing their policies to include issues on forced labour. At the time of the evaluation, both organisations confirmed the same and TUC is following up on their progress.

Participants in all the TUC workshops identified CBAs as a good strategy for ending child labour and modern slavery.

### **Activity 2: Established /strengthened anti human trafficking committees for shop stewards.**

At the time of the mid-term evaluation, the TUC had not established the Anti-human trafficking committees for Shop Stewards. They mentioned that this activity would be done in 2023.

### **Activity 3: Tripartite/Bipartite meetings**

Although TUC and Ghana Employers Association (GEA) do not have a signed MOU, they have had a very long and productive relationship. They sit together in many committees including the National Steering Committee on Child Labour. They also work together on other issues of common interest, such as labour relations and engage before and after the national budget is finalized to discuss the economy and matters on industrial relations.

According to the Head of Research at GEA, they work with the TUC in a tripartite framework in the area of Social, Labour and Economic policy. Employers participated in the National Advocacy stakeholders workshop training on modern slavery and child labour (described under «National advocacy workshop») After these trainings, GEA has embarked on an advocacy campaign to remove children from child labour in the cocoa and mining sectors. According to the official, the training was useful.

**“We are better sensitised on modern slavery; I did not know that threatening a worker or make them do something against their will is practicing modern slavery. Many employers and employees did not know this too, and it has opened our eyes” (Key Informant Interview with GEA Staff).**

### **Activity 4 & 6: Number of Information materials developed and Workplaces using Advocacy and Campaign materials on modern slavery developed by TUC.**

The TUC has developed some advocacy and campaign materials. The advocacy messages that were used included; STOP Forced Labour, Modern Slavery, Bonded Labour, Forced Labour, Domestic Servitude, Forced Marriage, Child Labour and Sex Trafficking. The messages were intended to capture all aspects of modern slavery.

A total of 7 campaigns were done and materials distributed in 16 different regions across Ghana during the sensitization of farmers, fisher folks and in other programmes in Ghana. The advocacy campaign materials that were produced, distributed and used include; T-shirts, caps, banners (pull ups) and mugs. Approximately 1,500 products were developed, 1,000 of which have already been distributed.



The highlight of these advocacy campaigns was during the 2022 May Day celebrations where the Youth and Informal Economy workers wore the T-shirts. TUC's leadership supported the campaigns by mentioning their work on modern slavery in the Secretary General's speech. Enhanced awareness creation is one of the key results of the project so far and has potential to spur other higher-level outcomes among stakeholders in combating modern slavery.

### **Activity 5: Training of TUC and Affiliates Focal Persons on Modern slavery and Child Labour.**

The 3-day workshop was held in the Volta Region in April. It was attended by 26 participants of 14 males and 12 females. The objectives of the workshop were to bring together the network of focal persons on modern slavery and child labour within TUC and its affiliates, to sensitize them on the concepts of modern slavery and child labour to enhance their capacity and to equip them with the knowledge and sensitization skills of engaging workers at various workplaces.

The TUC had a standard plan for conducting their trainings. Their trainings were mostly interactive and had ice breakers in between/ discussions/ brainstorming/ Questions & presentations. An example of a workshop plan:

- Introductions/Statistics/legal frameworks/policies
- Definition of the key concepts and terms used in modern slavery/ identification of cases/ support/prosecution.
- Participants were taken through the manual.
- Some of these challenges were mentioned / recommendations.

During an interview with the evaluators, one focal person felt that she now had a better understanding of their responsibilities and the knowledge and skills to pass on the same information. Another mentioned that he was grateful for the opportunity to learn, this would strengthen their weak areas. They were also determined to teach their colleagues at the workplace.

The project is therefore likely to have many more ambassadors once the trained focal persons reach others in the workplace, leading to more impact on the ground.

### **Outcome 3**

#### **Vulnerable individuals and groups are resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery.**

Project-specific outcome: Trade unions have contributed to make vulnerable workers in high-risk sectors more resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery.

Activities implemented in 2021 and part of 2022 are as follows:

Planned Activities	Implemented Activities
1. Number of CBA's in targeted sectors where modern slavery occurs.	1. CBAs developed in targeted sectors where modern slavery occurs.
2. Number of education manuals developed used to reach out to vulnerable workers.	2. Education manuals developed by TUC used to reach out to vulnerable workers.
3. Number of trade union representatives trained.	3. Trade union representatives trained.
4. Number of vulnerable workers in the targeted sectors that have been trained on their rights.	4. Vulnerable workers in the targeted sectors trained on their rights.
5. Number of mechanisms/initiatives in place	5. Mechanisms/initiatives in place to reach vulnerable groups.

### Activity 1: Collective Bargaining Agreements on Modern Slavery in Sectors

The TUC project team reported that the total number of new and re-negotiated agreements in 2022 from all their affiliates were about 540. All these CBAs have clauses on child labour. About 5% of these totals contain issues on modern slavery. These CBAs are as a result of the support from LO both the Decent Work and the CMS programmes.

The project team reported that a total of 19 affiliates in the formal and informal sectors are working on their CBAs to include clauses on child labour. The TUC will follow them up and report on the same at the end of the project.

### Activity 2: Development of an educational manual

TUC through collaborative efforts with GAWU (General Agriculture Workers Union), Verité Ghana and other stakeholders developed an educational manual titled **“Manual on Forced Labour and Modern Slavery in Ghana: A Guide for Trade Union Education”**. The manual was validated in a meeting with key stakeholders on 18<sup>th</sup> of February 2022. It is the first of its kind, a learning tool that gives information on forced labour, human trafficking and child labour in Ghana.

The TUC project team stated that the training and sensitization manual is a good resource for unions and has made TUC to be more knowledgeable on issues of modern slavery. It helps them to reach out to their affiliates and partners with a lot of confidence. If put into good use, by the end of the project, all the affiliates should be aware of what modern slavery is and how the issue can be addressed.

So far, the manual has been beneficial to the intended group; the trade unions representatives, negotiators, labour inspectors, vulnerable groups and employers. The TUC project team commented that they receive positive feedback from these organisations whenever they use the manuals. It is also being used widely by NGOs, government officials, and the informal sector to educate their members.

The TUC and the University of Cape Coast, the school of Development Studies have an MOU for collaboration. Mary who is part of the TUC project team, is also a part time lecturer at the university. She stated that the students use the manual. Other organisations that use it are NGOs that work on child labour and modern slavery issues such as Verite (A network of Women’s Rights) and World Vision.

However, there were suggestions on how the content in the manual can reach more people by having it in local languages so that more people can read it.

**“The manual developed by TUC should be domesticated in the local languages and made pictorial” Mr. KII with Tagoe, Deputy General Secretary for the General Agriculture and Workers Union (GAWU).**

Mr. Tagoe mentioned that this will help them to reach and create awareness among all their 52,000 Gawu members.

All the participants that had benefitted from the TUC trainings on MS agreed that the manual is an important tool that can be used in identifying cases on modern slavery and to shape the CBAs in Ghana.

A key observation from the evaluators is that the manual is user/reader friendly and a good resource for trade unions and their partners. It is a good facilitators guide, it has a lot of useful information, the content is broken down into smaller bits that can easily be understood, availability on soft and hard copies makes it easy to move around with, it can be used for a long time with a few changes being made periodically to the data. Most importantly, it allows the active participation of trainees.

### **Activity 3&4: Training of Trade Union Representatives & Number of vulnerable workers in the targeted sectors that have been trained on their rights.**

A total of 410 vulnerable workers from the cocoa and fishing sectors were trained on Modern slavery.

Poverty is a common factor for these workers and child labour to be rampant. Majority of the Fisher folks and cocoa farm workers have inherited the trade from their parents and grandparents, the work is intergenerational. The children's income is counted as part of the household income. The children have to work for long hours and some of them do not go to school. Some of the fisher folks are aware of the risks of having children in this work but they need an extra hand. The community is poor, illiterate/semi-illiterate and vulnerable.

TUC trained the participants from the vulnerable groups from five districts namely: James Town, Osu, La, Botianor and Dixcove on modern slavery, rights, and on the related national laws and policies. The training took place between the 7<sup>th</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2022. The training was attended by both male and female participants. The engagements were participatory and interactive in nature. The campaign also utilized some video content to illustrate child labour and modern slavery. In the end the fisher folks expressed interest to join the unions for more education to enable them fight for their rights and address other grievances. It was also discovered that no organization had previously visited Dixcove to create awareness on child labour and modern slavery, and thus TUC would need to do more work in this area. A small committee of their leaders was formed to follow up on future activities and programmes.

The participants showed a lot of interest in the training,

**“During the workshops the Fisher folks always show up in big numbers when invited. They exceeded the number of participants expected”, KII with TUC project team.**

Training the fisher folks has created an opportunity for TUC to work with the informal and vulnerable workers and have a deeper understanding of the same.

Through this project, the role of the TUC is better understood in the rural communities and among the workers in the informal economy.

During the training the TUC identified that some of the fisher folks were not working in safe and healthy working conditions. The fisher folks also confessed to be using harmful substances such as ‘dynamite’ so that they could catch more fish. The team took this opportunity to educate them on OHSE, safe working conditions and on harmful substances that could harm them, their families and the community.

After the training the fisher folks expressed interest in joining the union. Thus, the fisher fork will organize and bargain for better working conditions. This will be pursued by the TUC. Thus, they have gained both a relationship and the knowledge from TUC.

#### **Sensitisation Workshop for Cocoa Farmers, Western, Ashanti, Brong-Ahafo:**

On an invitation from the General Agricultural Workers Union (GAWU), TUC held a sensitization workshop for Cocoa farmers. The workshop was held from March 28<sup>th</sup> to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2022 with the objective of creating awareness on modern slavery and child labour. This training targeted vulnerable workers on modern slavery and child labour in the communities.

The engagements were participatory and interactive in nature. A video clip that illustrates the extent of child labour and modern slavery was used. Some campaign materials that had modern slavery messages written on them were also distributed at each session.

After training by TUC, some farmers resolved to desist from child labour practices and advocate for children to go back to school for formal education.

For continuity, application of the knowledge gained and for sustainable impact, it is noted by the evaluation team that the TUC must create time to follow up these groups in order to offer them the necessary support and monitor progress.

#### **Activity 5: Number of Mechanisms in Place at TUC and Affiliate Levels.**

After the focal persons had been trained on MS, a network of Focal Persons on modern slavery and child labour was established and a WhatsApp group was formed. The group has not been very active, and the project team had not created time to do a follow up on this. The project team clarified that this would be a priority in their 2023 plan.

### **3.4 Assessment by DAC Criteria**

#### **Relevance of Project**

The modern slavery project is relevant for Ghana, as the country is a source, transit, and destination for modern slavery and child labour, with a high prevalence of child labour within different sectors such as the fishing, agriculture cocoa farms and mining. So long as these vices are there and are not addressed immediately, Ghana may not achieve SDG target 8.7 by 2025.

TUCs influence as a tripartite partner, their ability to sit on the National Steering Committee on child labour (NSCCL), their voice that can be heard at different levels and a strong membership base of 500,000 workers makes them an influential stakeholder to combat modern slavery and the best partner for LO, as they share a common interest in promoting decent work and in addressing other cross cutting issues.

Prior to this project, TUC has been addressing issues on child labour. Although they were not dealing with forced labour and trafficking, the issues are not new to them, but the term modern slavery is quite new. The project has given them an opportunity to educate their members, review policy and legislation, ensure that policies and laws are implemented, work with other partners and ensure workers get the best services.

Through this project, TUC have engaged like-minded partners such as the Rainforest Alliance and Action Aid. These three organisations are working on the same issues on MS and have the same goals. This partnership will help them build synergies, share experiences and avoid duplication of efforts.

#### **Coherence**

The CMS project is well connected to the LO Global decent work programme as they all seek to address issues that affect workers, their wellbeing and their rights. Both can assist TUC achieve its main agenda of organising workers. The CMS project has posed a big challenge to the TUC, to formalise the informal sectors.

#### **Efficiency**

The project document is well written, the goals are clear and realistic, the link between the intended outcome and activities are clear, the budget is adequate, and the results can be achieved.

The project is well coordinated by the project team. The project team works well together, and they have also involved other departments namely, international relations, education. social protection, organizing,

research, industrial relations, gender, finance, youth desk, officer in charge of public relations and campaigns, in the educational activities. This ensures continuity of activities, there are no gaps during implementation, and it is also cheaper to run activities in the long-term.

At the beginning of the project, due to COVID-19 there was a delay in implementing some activities. However, the project team has been able to execute all the activities.

Training of the focal persons has a multiplier effect as they are now able to sensitize other union member and fellow workers.

## Effectiveness

It is likely that the project goals will be achieved by the end of the project period, more than 50% of the activities have been carried out, and a lot of results have been achieved.

The evaluation team will particularly emphasize on partnering with other organisations at all levels, the use of a film to educate vulnerable groups, the use of local languages to reach the illiterate and semi-illiterates, and the use of campaign materials to pass on simple messages, as very effective measures.

We also note that TUC has a database of all the trained participants, with their details, which will facilitate follow up activities.

## Impact

**Internal impact:** the midterm-evaluation revealed that, through this project, TUC and its affiliates have become more knowledgeable on issues of modern slavery. The training of focal persons has a multiplier effect, they are now able to train their colleagues and fellow trade unionists. The TUC CMS project team are committed and intentional in ensuring that they achieve 50% women participation in all their activities. The strategy of inviting 2 participants of both genders per union is deliberate in achieving this.

**External impact:** The project, is changing the behavior and attitudes of the community members for instance trained fisher folks are now able to easily identify cases of child labour. With the knowledge gained from the training, they are leaving a practice that has been passed on from generation to generation and sending their children back to school instead of engaging them in fishing work. The project has made the TUC to be more visible to workers in the informal sectors. The government is using TUC as a reference point and have been consulting them on issues on modern slavery.

## Gender

A human rights report for Ghana published in 2019, stated that young girls involved with work are sometimes subjected to sexual exploitation and early marriages, making them more vulnerable than their male counterpart. Women and young girls are vulnerable at the workplace to sexual exploitation. This calls for the need for TUC to work closely with other organisations and affiliates that address this target group.

A lot of progress has been made by the TUC towards achieving gender equality, and in promoting women's participation in the trade union. Out of 75 TUC leaders, 25 of them are women. TUC has 10 department heads 4 of them are headed by women who are responsible for issues such as industrial relations, social protection, international relations and promoting gender equality. Women's committees and gender desks are established at the district, regional and national levels to promote gender equality and women's active participation at all levels.

TUC congress adopted a 40% minimum for women participation, however the CMS project team challenged themselves to reach a target of 50%. But even with increased numbers, women need to be encouraged to



participate more actively during sessions and share experiences. As a strategy to ensure that mark is achieved in activities, TUC invites 2 participants per organisation, one of whom must be female. If it is in a male dominated sector, such as fishing, in order to balance the gender, the fish smokers and sellers who are mostly female were invited to attend. In addition, the gender coordinators were also invited to attend workshops.

As a recommendation, during sensitization on modern slavery, a gender component should be added so that women can open up to share their experiences and report on specific cases that are happening and discuss issues that affect them directly.

## Sustainability

**The goal towards sustainability:** During its last congress that took place in 2021, TUC and its affiliates decided to set aside 5% of their membership dues that are collected from affiliates at both regional and district levels. These funds are to go towards the continuity of educational activities incase partners exit a project. The TUC will manage the funds and will be accountable to their affiliates, although this is a very good strategy, it will take time to get enough money into the kitty and for it to be fully operational.

Another strategy that they have come up with is decentralizing the CMS activities in other departments which include; social protection, organizing, research, industrial relations, gender, finance, international relations, education, youth desk, public relations and campaigns.

The active involvement of beneficiaries at the programme implementation level will ensure that the programme activities are continuous and sustainable.

In 2023, TUCs priority should be on how to sustain their efforts and develop an immediate comprehensive sustainability plan. This plan can focus on actions that can be sustained in the long-term without donor funding or look at other ways of cooperating with partner organisations like Rainforest Alliance, and Action Aid to jointly mobilise resources.

## Collaboration

Combatting modern slavery and child labour and its associated risk requires a much concerted and sustained actions from all stakeholders including trade unions. One area of growth for TUC has been in collaboration. It has expanded its partnerships base.

At national level, TUC collaborates closely with a number of like-minded organisations such as the ministry of Gender and Protection of children, the ILO, media, non-governmental organisations (Rainforest Alliance, Action Aid), human rights organisations, Ghana immigration office, the police, researchers, organizations that are working on the same issue at community level.

LO-Norway played an important role in connecting all partners implementing NORAD's Modern Slavery that is, the Rainforest Alliance and Action Aid. This partnership has made them to be more involved in each other's activities.

At workplace level, TUC has a very good relationship with employers. This gives them and their affiliates easy access to the workplace. This relationship will be beneficial to the trained focal persons as well.

At beneficiary level, the affiliated unions need to be more involved in the CMS project and take ownership of some programme activities. The informal sector can actively participate and not feel left out. In this regard, it is important for TUC to set up a project beneficiaries committee that will support them during planning, implementation and monitoring of programme activities, since these organisations are on the ground and understand the magnitude of the problem.

At community level they work with their affiliate GAWU who are more experienced on working with workers in the informal sector. TUC uses some materials developed by GAWU in training e.g. the video and their experience on the ground. GAWU mobilized the farmers to be trained by the TUC.

Building stronger links between the community-based organisations, workers and their communities will ensure that the activities are sustained on the ground. The organisation can share their experiences with other unions and be a source for learning for other unions.

### 3.5 Audit

The auditors gave the TUC an unqualified report for the period that ended on 31<sup>st</sup> December 2021. The audit for the project on ‘combating modern slavery’ was prepared in accordance with laws, regulations and auditing standards and practices in Ghana including International Standards on Auditing. The LO funds are managed by the TUC finance team that are part of the project team. Each project funds are disbursed in a transparent manner and in full consultation of the project team. They have a finance and procurement manual in place that guides their work.

Their roles are but are not limited to; monitoring all expenditure to ensure that they are within set budgets, and in ensuring that the process of accounting meets the internal and external procedures set by the management and LO-Norway.

### 3.6 LO Added Value

The TUC and LO have a very long and fruitful partnership. This was stated by the Deputy Secretary General of TUC. In addition to funding the project, they have been able to provide timely technical support, give ideas based on their experience, and to give guidance to the TUC. They have played the role of both partner and funder. In addition to supporting the CMS project, LO support the Global Decent work Programme.

**“We were very happy when Nina from LO supported our position as workers during the virtual 109<sup>th</sup> International Labour Conference”** Interview with TUC project team.

The project team commended the consistent support that they received from the LO-Norway team; Aina Ostreng, Kamilla Berggrav and Alice Siame. The support includes developing the project, identifying opportunities e.g. partners, helping them to understand the result-matrix, advice on training manual development, monitoring progress and finance accountability.

LO has been instrumental in connecting the Stakeholders implementing NORAD’s Modern Slavery projects. This platform is an opportunity for the 3 stakeholders to share information, exchange ideas, discuss challenges, encourages cross-learning, embrace new ideas and is to build synergies among them.

### 3.7 Risk Assessment

The mid-term evaluation noted the key risk that should be addressed to enhance the project, as:

**Risk of Donor Dependence:** The TUC has depended solely on donor funding while implementing this project. Although they have a donor exit strategy, it is still not sustainable. This needs to be discussed and a proper sustainability plan put in place.

**COVID-19 pandemic and other health associated risks:** The lesson we got from COVID-19 is that it can bring programmes and project to a complete halt. In 2021, TUC only managed to implement 2 activities because of COVID-19. To avoid this, TUC should be more creative in the technology and digital space.

**Risk of duplication:** There is always a high risk of duplicating efforts when you do not work with other partners. It is therefore important for TUC to meet regularly with partners to get information on what they are doing and to collaborate. These partnerships will save the already scarce resources and help them build synergies.

### 3.8 Some summary key results from TUC

- One of the major achievements of the LO-Norway/TUC CMS project has been the visibility of TUC specially to partners (they are now being asked to attend a number of activities), workers in the informal economy and to rural communities.
- Through this project TUC has strengthened partnerships with government, civil society, local communities and workers in the informal economy.
- Government is now consulting the TUC that sits on the NSCCL on all matters on modern slavery, child trafficking, forced labour and child labour.
- Training of 23 focal persons from national unions and 43 labour inspectors (from the Northern and Southern Sectors).
- By virtue of this project, the ministry of labor in the Central region has made collaborative efforts to work closely with labor inspectors, metropolitan assembly, and social welfare to identify young people that get involved in child labor, support them financially and reconnect with them to their families.
- Training of 410 farmers and fisher folks on MS, they are now interested in joining the union. They also want TUC to connect them to the ministry of fisheries to discuss how the sector can be improved.
- A total of 19 affiliates are reviewing their CBAs and policies to include issues on modern slavery.
- The findings from the Mapping exercise and the educational manual have helped to shape the CBAs and Policies. It has also helped the TUC in identifying some key challenges and added knowledge on how to address the issue of modern slavery.
- This project has developed new and strengthened partnerships between the TUC and other partners.
- The development of a training and sensitization manual was critical, as this means that there is always a resource that the affiliates can use. The manual is now being used widely by; all the unions to educate their members, at the University of Cape Coast (which is a public university in Ghana) during lectures, labour inspectors and NGOs working on child labour issues such as Verite and World vision among others.

### 3.9 Lessons Learnt

- Behaviour Change –After some farmers were sensitized they began sending their children to school. They ended a tradition of work that had been practiced for many generations i.e. child labour. The fisher folk adapted to using safe methods for fishing instead of using those that were unsafe.
- Organizing - Training the fisher folks has created an opportunity for TUC to organize them. The fisher folk have expressed interest in joining the union and TUC is currently following this up. The lesson is that the project can help TUC to achieve the main goal of the organization which is organizing.
- Building capacity of fisher folks on OHSE – The TUC's visit to Dixcove to train the fisher folk on modern slavery, they identified the need to sensitise them on OHSE. They also discouraged them from using dynamite in fishing (Also called blast fishing when dynamite or other explosives to stun or kill schools of fish for easy collection), instead they encouraged them to use more natural methods to fish. The lesson here is that the training should be flexible and can be changed to suit the needs of the participants. The entry point can be modern slavery, but it can be linked to other issues of equal importance e.g. Decent Work, Occupational Health and Safety Environment (OHSE) etc.

### 3.10 Challenges

- COVID-19 prevented physical interactions and people had to meet virtually, this affected the programme implementation in the beginning.
- Modern slavery is more in the informal sector which is not unionized and thus difficult to intervene in cases.
- TUC project team are not monitoring and following up the trained beneficiaries on a regular basis and thus has not documented outcomes.
- Material developed are in English, they need to be translated into local dialects.

### 3.11 Recommendations for LO & Ghana

#### Lo-Norway should:

- Integrate modern slavery activities into the main LO global decent work project when it ends. This will ensure continuity of the work and not to lose the gains that have already been made.
- Facilitate the proposed exchange, learning and networking visit between Ghana and Ethiopia. This is a practical tool to foster knowledge exchange, across learning and to improve on performance among other reasons.

#### TUC should:

- **Become more creative in using technology and the digital space**, it can be used to collect data, uploading information/materials online and **embrace e-learning**.
- **Explore ways of using social and mass media** when implementing their campaigns and other activities. These can make them to be more efficient when it comes to spreading messages, effective in reaching workers from all over the country and in receiving quick feedback. This will save time, help them to reach more workers and save on resources.
- Develop a standard **format for a plan of action and a monitoring tool** which can be shared with their participants for instance labour inspectors and focal persons. Ensure follow-up of the results from the plans of action.
- Take the **lead role in taking their partnership with Action Aid and Rainforest Alliance to the next level** by defining the various roles and responsibilities of the partnership, ways to jointly mobilize resources and agree on activities that can be done jointly.
- **Establish a TUC CMS committee** at beneficiary level that involves workers from the formal and informal sectors and **encourage them to take ownership** of some activities.
- **Focus on CBAs** with clauses on forced Labour and Human Trafficking.
- Prioritise the **establishment of Anti-Human Trafficking committees for shop stewards** and on other activities not implemented in the year 2022.
- **Develop a systematic way of working with already trained groups** such as Labour Inspectors, focal persons. They can be more proactive in training others and this will have a multiplier effect.
- Translate the training manual and sensitization materials into some **local languages and include pictures**.
- Continue **mainstreaming gender** in the project activities ensuring active participation of women.
- **Lobby the Government to ratify the UN CRC Optional Protocol on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography.**
- **Lobby Government to employ more labour inspectors**, provide them with resources and means of transport, and build more rescue centres for trafficked persons and children.
- In 2023, TUCs priority should be on how to **sustain their efforts and develop an immediate comprehensive sustainability plan as an exit strategy**. This plan can focus on actions that can be sustained in the long-term without donor funding or look at other ways of cooperating with partner organisations.

### Annexes

#### Annex 1: Research Question by Criteria

Criteria	Research questions
Relevance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ To what extent was the project relevant to local context?</li> <li>○ Is the project targeting the right subjects and is it responding to the needs of the target group/beneficiaries (the workers)?</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Is LO adapting to the partners' wishes and needs in project design?</li> <li>○ Is the programme aligned with relevant policies/political priorities in the country? (national labour plans and priorities and SDGs)</li> <li>○ Is the programme a technically relevant/adequate solution to the problem it is trying to address?</li> </ul>
Coherence	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ How well does the intervention fit within LOs strategy (Global and regional)?</li> <li>○ Is the project duplicating the efforts of other actors?</li> </ul>
Effectiveness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Are the goals set by the programme being achieved?</li> <li>○ To what extent are the original objectives being achieved?</li> <li>○ To what extent are the development changes corresponding with the planned results of the programme?</li> <li>○ What are the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of objectives?</li> <li>○ How can the programme become more effective in reaching its goals (objectives)?</li> <li>○ Are LO and partners measuring what they should and with the correct tools? Are results in the programme being fully captured by today's tools?</li> <li>○ How has the implementation, coordination and management of the project been conducted?</li> </ul>
Efficiency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Is the programme cost-efficient? Are the resources being used on the programme providing the maximum quality/results?</li> <li>○ Are the financial and human resources being used in an appropriate and cost-efficient manner?</li> <li>○ Are there alternative solutions (that can produce similar or better results with lower costs or fewer resources)?</li> <li>○ Is it possible to plan the implementation of the project with lower costs/fewer resources? How?</li> </ul>
Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ What changes are occurring as a result/effect of the programme, both intended and unintended, both positive and negative?</li> <li>○ What changes have taken place so far as a result/effect of the project cooperation with our partners, both positive and negative?</li> <li>○ How is the programme affecting the different groups of stakeholders?</li> <li>○ What difference is the programme creating, if any?</li> <li>○ How is the project contributing to capacity development/strengthening of organizations or institutions?</li> <li>○ What positive impact (if any) is the project contributing to the wider society?</li> </ul>
Gender	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Have gender issues been considered and mainstreamed into the project?</li> <li>○ How have issues of women and men been addressed?</li> <li>○ Are the issues on human and women's rights integrated within the modern slavery project?</li> </ul>
Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Will the results of the actions continue/persist over time, and be sustained until the end? (incl. looking at national economic outlook/stability)</li> <li>○ Are the achievements of the programme sustainable in the longer run?</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Is the project consistent with the priorities and demand of the partner (the implementing organisations)?</li> <li>○ What is the participation of relevant partners/stakeholders in the design, planning and implementation of the programme? To what extent are the partner involved in the ongoing programme/ ownership of the programme?</li> <li>○ How is learning incorporated in the organisations (LO included)?</li> </ul>
--	---

## Annex 2

### CETU Ethiopia Results Framework Progress

Result	Target 2022 (Yr 2)	Actual progress/questions
<p>Trade unions have contributed to the eradication of forced labour, trafficking and child labour in Ethiopia and Ghana</p> <p><b>Indicator</b> Ghana and Ethiopia have improved policy or legal framework of forced labour, trafficking and child labour within 2023.</p>	<p>At least one demonstrated improvement in the form of a revised/new law/policy or ratified convention</p>	<p>In Yr 1, TUC and CETU have lobbied for improved legal framework in 2021 and some progress is observed.</p> <p><i>CETU at its higher-level meetings and advocacy campaigns demands the adoption of these and other conventions but the Lo funded project activities are not aligned to this indicator. The project however participates in the child protection and child labour policy advocacy coalition that generically targets minimum wage and revision of the child labour policy of Ethiopia (and not the others)</i> <i>In 2022, the minimum wage draft directives and regulations have been prepared and submitted under Ministry of Justice.</i></p>
<p><b>Indicator</b> There is increased compliance to ILO conventions/international policies at national level</p>	<p>CETU and TUC have participated in dialogue meetings with relevant ministries and advocated for increased compliance</p>	<p><i>CETU continues to advocate for compliance of C190 and C129 and the government is positive towards ratification of the conventions on Migration for employment (C97) and labour inspection in agriculture (c129 to support compliance n provisions of child labour. However, it is noted that local realities on the ground (such as poverty, unemployment, legal illiteracy) must be capable of accommodating what the conventions dictate.</i></p>
<p><b>Indicator</b> Policies or collective agreements in place that have provisions on child labour, trafficking and forced labour.</p>	<p>Detailed targets are included in country specific results frameworks</p>	<p><i>The absence of a Labour Advisory Committee for the last one year has delayed tripartite engagements between workers and policy makers, and presentation of demands.</i> <i>However, the project has devised an MoU which is to be signed by CETU branches and corporate sector leaders that take part in the worst forms of training by the project. This has also not been part of the project. It is an innovative mechanism the project has tried to have in place to bridge such gaps</i></p>
<p>PROGRAM SPECIFIC OUTCOMES</p>		
<p>Governments in Ethiopia and Ghana have implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address</p>	<p>A target of 3 demands</p>	<p><i>Lack of a budget for the activity and the absence of a Labour Advisory Committee for the last one year has delayed presentation of demands.</i></p>

modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors Indicator Number of new trade union demands related to forced labour, trafficking and child labour incorporated in national labour policies or laws		
Indicator The number of labour inspectors in Ghana and Ethiopia has increased	864 (5 % increase from 822) Baseline was 685 for Ethiopia and 97 for Ghana.	<i>No budget for this activity. No new labour inspectors in Ethiopia due to internal rearrangement of the ministry office.</i>
Indicator The number of government officials including labour inspectors trained by trade unions	Target of 480 from 0 baseline	<i>Total 249 141 trained on the worst forms of child labour for corporate sector leaders (Jimma, Hawassa, Addis Ababa, Adama &amp; Bahirdar, 20 each) (Male=111, Female=30) participants 108 law enforcement officers (Male=82, Female=26) trained on modern child slavery for law enforcement bodies (Addis Ababa, Hawassa , Adama, Bahirdar, &amp; Jimma (on going activity))</i>
OUTPUT 1.1 Trade unions have advocated for policy and/or legal changes on modern slavery  Indicator Number of demands/proposals presented/promoted by trade unions to decision makers on modern slavery	Target of 8 (from a baseline of 2 in Ghana and 0 in Ethiopia)	<i>No demands promoted yet since no such activity was not budgeted for  However, the project has contributed to the formation of a child protection/ child labour policy advocacy coalition, expected to form and amplify collective voice to address law and policy makers. CETU, with Action Aid, Woord en Daad d have been advocating for ratification of C189 and C118.</i>
OUTPUT 1.2: Trade unions have produced research studies on the prevalence of modern slavery in Ethiopia and Ghana Indicator Number of research studies conducted on the prevalence of modern slavery	Target was 2 for Yr 1	<i>One (1) achieved.</i>  • <i>CETU has conducted research entitled “The Causes, Practices and Remedies for Modern Slavery in the Forms of Child Labour and Human Trafficking in Ethiopia: initiated in 2021, finalized 2022</i>
Project level outcome: Trade unions have contributed to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in company operations and supply chains. Indicator Number of companies that have developed or revised new code of conducts or policies on modern slavery.	2 for SETU	<i>2 A total of 30 corporate leaders were trained on child labour and came up with an action plan for their organizations. After training, Naflet Hotel in Adama adopted policy on light employment for children under 18 and in need Robi Hotel in Adama – adopted a policy for salary adjustments for working extra hours</i>
Indicator Number of established /strengthened anti human	7 from a baseline of 0	<i>4 committees were strengthened in Ethiopia - having a total of 33 members (Male=20, Female=13).</i>

trafficking committees for shop stewards		<i>CETU enabled them discussed on gaps and help them to put way forwards, Focus was on cross boarder trafficking and intra-country trafficking for agricultural labour</i>
OUTPUT 2.1: Trade unions have advocated for increased compliance with national policies and regulations to avoid modern slavery <i>Indicator</i> Number of bipartite and/or tripartite consultations held with employers on modern slavery.	8 for Yr 2	<i>None due to lack of budget for the activity and also the labour committee body. However, during the period of the evaluation, one was planned to take place in the coming week</i>
OUTPUT 2.2: Employers have increased awareness on prevention and identification of modern slavery <i>Indicator</i> Number of workplaces using campaign material on modern slavery developed by unions	60 for Year 2	<i>A short message in 7 local languages on combating child labour had been crafted under the project and aired via FANA TV and Radio and Southern FM Radio stations to sensitize the public</i>
OUTPUT 2.3: Trade union representatives have necessary knowledge to engage constructively with employers on the prevention of human trafficking and forced labour <i>Indicator</i> Number of trade union representatives/focal points trained on how to prevent and identify forced labour, trafficking and child labour by trade unions	160 for Year 2	<i>CETU has 9 affiliates. 116 participants trained on human trafficking for anti-human trafficking committee members (Addis Ababa, Hawassa, Kombolcha, Adama, Bahirdar, &amp; Jimma (Male=78, Female=38)</i>
OUTPUT 2.4: Awareness raising initiative to fight human trafficking, forced labour and its impact on society. <i>Indicator</i> Number of information initiatives made by trade unions (campaigns, brochures etc. for workplaces)	In year 1, TUC: 1500 copies of campaign material  CETU: 12 newsletters In Yr 2, CETU: 24 newsletters	<i>In Ethiopia, 2 monthly issues of CETU's newsletter were published.  A short message in 7 local languages on combating child labour had been crafted under the project and aired via FANA TV and Radio and Southern FM Radio stations to sensitize the public</i>
PROJECT LEVEL outcome: Trade unions have contributed to make vulnerable workers in high-risk sectors more resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery <i>Indicators</i> Number of CBA's in targeted sectors where modern slavery occurs	A target of 125 CBAs in Yr 2 from a baseline of 114  Ghana target of 10 from 4 Ethiopia 130 from 110	<i>No CBAs signed as there was no budget but 30 MOUs signed with some employers for inclusion of issues of modern slavery</i>



<p>OUTPUT 3.1: Trade union representatives have knowledge to engage constructively with vulnerable workers</p> <p>Indicator</p> <p>Number of education manuals developed used to reach out to vulnerable workers.</p>	<p>Target of 1 in 2021</p>	<p><i>Ethiopia has not developed education materials other than the radio messages described above</i></p>
<p>Indicator</p> <p>Number of trade union representatives trained</p>	<p>Target of 290 from 0</p> <p>CETU 220</p> <p>TUC: 70</p>	<p><i>88 trade union leaders trained in Ethiopia (Male=69, Female=19)</i></p>
<p>OUTPUT 3.2: Vulnerable workers are aware of their rights and the existing national laws and policies on modern slavery</p> <p>Indicator</p> <p>Number of vulnerable workers in the targeted sectors that have been trained on their rights</p>	<p>400</p>	<p><i>The 88 trained union leaders are supposed to reach the workers in their work places (no follow-on training yet)</i></p> <p><i>Radio programmes broadcasting in 7 languages reaching thousands of workers (Data not available)</i></p>
<p>OUTPUT 3.3: Trade unions have implemented mechanisms on how to deal with informal workers and to prevent modern slavery</p> <p>Indicator</p> <p>Number of mechanisms/initiatives in place</p>	<p>4 out of a baseline of 0</p>	<p>2</p> <p><i>CETU: Manual on Forced Labour and Modern Slavery</i></p> <p><i>Community groups organized for identification and reporting of child labour to police (case of Adama city)</i></p> <p><i>CETU support for domestic workers organizing</i></p>

### Annex 3

#### GUC Ghana Results Framework

Result	Target 2022 (Yr 2)	Actual progress
<p>Trade unions have contributed to the eradication of forced labour, trafficking and child labour in Ethiopia and Ghana</p> <p><b>Indicator</b></p> <p>Ghana and Ethiopia have improved policy or legal framework of forced labour, trafficking and child labour within 2023.</p>	<p>Partners have lobbied At least one demonstrated improvement in the form of a revised/new law/policy or ratified convention</p>	<p><b>Ghana</b></p> <p><i>National Plan of Action for the elimination of Human Trafficking in Ghana 2017 _ 2021 not reviewed but there is commitment to do it. The key goals of the plan of Action is to strengthen Ghana's capabilities in Preventing Trafficking in Persons, Protection of victims; Prosecution of offenders and Partnerships with Stakeholders to combat trafficking in persons.</i></p> <p><i>TUC held a meeting for stakeholders to discuss the ratification of the UN CRC Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution, and Child Pornography.</i></p> <p><i>ILO Convention 182: Government has reviewed the Hazardous Child Labour Activity Framework for Ghana (HAF), finalised and validated. Discussions are underway on how to Legalise it.</i></p>

		<i>A Sub-Committee of the NSCCL is currently reviewing the Children's Act.</i>
<p><b>Indicator</b> There is increased compliance to ILO conventions/international policies at national level</p>		<p><i>Available data for 2021 shows that a total of 556 human trafficking cases were identified and investigated, out of which 89 accused persons were prosecuted and 88 convicted. Out of the convictions, 41 were under the Human Trafficking Act, 20 under the Children's Act, 1998 (Act No. 560), and 27 other related offences; 65 out of the 88 convicts were given jail terms ranging from 5 to 7 years and the remaining 23 convicts fined up to 120 penalty units each (a penalty unit is 12 Ghana cedis).</i></p> <p><i>In 2021, a total of 3,266 workplace inspections were conducted by the following institutions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>The Department of Factories Inspectorate inspected 2570 workplaces.</i></li> <li>• <i>The Labour Department conducted 696 workplace and establishment inspections.</i></li> </ul>
<p>Indicator Policies or collective agreements in place that have provisions on child labour, trafficking and forced labour.</p>	<p>Detailed targets are included in country specific results frameworks (At baseline many CBAs from the unions organising the sectors/ areas of interest have provisions on child labour. However, such provisions have not been made to cover modern slavery, and there is not necessarily full compliance with national laws and ILO conventions)</p>	<p><i>All collective agreements from 19 affiliates of the TUC organising in both formal and informal sectors contain articles to prevent employment of children.</i></p> <p><i>Two unions operating in the informal economy (UNIWA &amp; GPRTU) also have developed guidelines/ policies that prohibits the engagement of child by their members.</i></p>
<b>PROGRAM SPECIFIC OUTCOMES</b>		
<p>Governments in Ghana have implemented efforts to prevent, identify and address modern slavery, and to protect vulnerable groups and survivors</p> <p><b>Indicator</b> Number of new trade union demands related to forced labour, trafficking and child labour incorporated in national labour policies or laws</p>	<p>A target of 3 demands</p>	<p><i>2 demands</i></p> <p><i>The need for government to intensify efforts to ensure the passage of the social protection bill into law.</i></p> <p><i>Need for government to establish a Child Labour Inspection Committee made up of members of the tripartite and the labour inspectors to beef up efforts at preventing, identifying and address modern slavery.</i></p>
<p><b>Indicator</b> The number of labour inspectors in Ghana and Ethiopia has increased</p>	<p>864 (5 % increase from 822)</p>	<p><i>2022 data yet be received from the Ministry of Employment</i></p>

	Baseline was 685 for Ethiopia and 97 for Ghana.	
<b>Indicator</b> The number of government officials including labour inspectors trained by trade unions	Target of 480 from 0 baseline	<i>Two trainings are underway as part of 2nd half activities. The actual numbers of government officials trained will be reported as part of the 2022 annual report (TUC so far has trained 43 inspectors as recorded during the baseline)</i>
<b>OUTPUT 1.1:</b> Trade unions have advocated for policy and/or legal changes on modern slavery  <b>Indicator</b> Number of demands/proposals presented/promoted by trade unions to decision makers on modern slavery	Target of 8 (from a baseline of 2 in Ghana and 0 in Ethiopia)	<i>2 demands</i>
<b>OUTPUT 1.2:</b> Trade unions have produced research studies on the prevalence of modern slavery in Ethiopia and Ghana <b>Indicator</b> Number of research studies conducted on the prevalence of modern slavery	Target was 2 for Yr 1	<i>1 (One)</i>  <i>Mapping of Modern Slavery and Child Labour in Targeted Sectors in Ghana</i>
Project level outcome: Trade unions have contributed to prevent, identify and address human trafficking and forced labour, including the worst forms of child labour, in company operations and supply chains. <b>Indicator</b> Number of companies that have developed or revised new code of conducts or policies on modern slavery.	2 for CETU  Targets for TUC will be included later.	<i>All 8 newly organised companies by TUC affiliates from January to June 2022 have clauses on force labour, Child labour and human trafficking.</i>  <i>Data from the Ghana Employers Association indicate that 200 Companies out of 550 have Collective Agreements have clauses on force labour, Child labour and human trafficking.</i>
<b>Indicator</b> Number of established /strengthened anti human trafficking committees for shop stewards	7 from a baseline of 0	<i>Activity not done/No Data from the TUC</i>
<b>OUTPUT 2.1:</b> Trade unions have advocated for increased compliance with national policies and regulations to avoid modern slavery <b>Indicator</b> Number of bipartite and/or tripartite consultations held with employers on modern slavery.	8 for Yr 2	<i>4 (four)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <i>ILO Technical Advisory Mission to Ghana: Follow Up to the recommendation of the Committee of Application of Standards.</i></li><li>• <i>Validation meeting on the Hazardous Activities Framework (HAF) for the Elimination of Child Labour in Ghana</i></li><li>• <i>Tripartite Technical Committee meeting on the review of the National Plan of Action Phase II,</i></li></ul>

		<p><i>on the Elimination of the Worst Form of Child Labour (NPA2, 2017-2021)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Modern Slavery Project Meeting for Partners in Ghana</i></li> </ul>
<p><b>OUTPUT 2.2:</b> Employers have increased awareness on prevention and identification of modern slavery</p> <p><b>Indicator</b> Number of workplaces using campaign material on modern slavery developed by unions</p>	60 for Year 2	<p><i>All 47 Companies organised by TUC affiliates between 2021 and June 2022 are using the campaign materials developed</i></p> <p><i>All 3 Cocoa growing regions (Western, Ashanti, Brong-Ahafo) that have been sensitised</i></p> <p><i>All 3 Coastal fishing cities (James Town, Botianor and Dixcove that have been sensitised</i></p>
<p><b>OUTPUT 2.3:</b> Trade union representatives have necessary knowledge to engage constructively with employers on the prevention of human trafficking and forced labour</p> <p><b>Indicator</b> Number of trade union representatives/focal points trained on how to prevent and identify forced labour, trafficking and child labour by trade unions</p>	160 for Year 2	<p><i>76 trade union representatives made of members of Steering Committee of TUC and Focal Persons, Gender Officer and Industrial Relations from the TUC and its affiliates.</i></p>
<p><b>OUTPUT 2.4:</b> Awareness raising initiative to fight human trafficking, forced labour and its impact on society.</p> <p><b>Indicator</b> Number of information initiatives made by trade unions (campaigns, brochures etc. for workplaces)</p>	In year 1, TUC: 1500 copies of campaign material	<p><i>1500 copies of campaign materials have been printed with approximately 1000 copies distributed</i></p>
<p><b>PROJECT LEVEL</b> outcome: Trade unions have contributed to make vulnerable workers in high-risk sectors more resilient in the face of recruitment to modern slavery</p> <p><b>Indicators</b> Number of CBA's in targeted sectors where modern slavery occurs</p>	<p>A target of 125 CBAs in Yr 2 from a baseline of 114</p> <p>Ghana target of 10 from 4 Ethiopia 130 from 110</p>	<p><i>8 CBAs from Cocoa and Fishing sectors</i></p>
<p><b>OUTPUT 3.1:</b> Trade union representatives have knowledge to engage constructively with vulnerable workers</p> <p><b>Indicator</b> Number of education manuals developed used to reach out to vulnerable workers.</p>	Target of 1 in 2021	<p><i>(Two) 2</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Manual on Forced Labour and Modern Slavery in Ghana: A Guide for Trade Union Education</i></li> <li>• <i>video content put together to illustrate child labour and modern slavery</i></li> </ul>

<p><b>Indicator</b> Number of trade union representatives trained</p>	<p>Target of 290 from 0  CETU 220  TUC: 70</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>76 union representatives trained</i></li> </ul>
<p><b>OUTPUT 3.2:</b> Vulnerable workers are aware of their rights and the existing national laws and policies on modern slavery <b>Indicator</b> Number of vulnerable workers in the targeted sectors that have been trained on their rights</p>	<p>400</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>410 vulnerable workers made up Cocoa and fishing sectors</i></li> </ul>
<p><b>OUTPUT 3.3:</b> Trade unions have implemented mechanisms on how to deal with informal workers and to prevent modern slavery <b>Indicator</b> Number of mechanisms/initiatives in place</p>	<p>4 out of a baseline of 0</p>	<p>Five (5)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Network of TUC focal persons on modern slavery and child labour</i></li> <li>• <i>TUC policy on Child labour</i></li> <li>• <i>Manual on Forced Labour and Modern Slavery in Ghana: A Guide for Trade Union Education</i></li> <li>• <i>TUC representative on the National Steering Committee on child labour</i></li> <li>• <i>A Child Labour Free Zone Model by GAWU of TUC</i></li> </ul>

#### Annex 4: Interview Tools

GUC/CETU

Introduction:

Name

Position:

Date of interview

Provide a brief statement on why you decided to apply for this project?

Specific questions:

#### CETU/TUC Ghana Project Staff

1. Is the project, the stipulated objectives and results well aligned to the needs of the trade union and their affiliates?
2. Which activities were envisaged and implemented? Were the objectives realized?
3. Are the outcomes of the mapping exercise/baseline survey being used in this project? If yes, how?
4. How has CETU/TUC advocated for compliance with modern slavery issues in the country? Any effects of the advocacy?
5. What are the current CBAs being implemented? Do these CBAs have provisions to cover modern slavery? Do the CBAs have full compliance with national laws and ILO conventions with specific clauses on child labour, trafficking and forced labour? If not, what is the progress in revising the CBAs in that line?
6. How many trade unions demands has your Trade union raised as relates to forced labour, trafficking and child labour being incorporated in national labour policies or laws. Which are these and what is the progress so far? (Trade unions) (Probe TUC for demand to evaluate the outcomes of the implementation of the 2nd Phase of the National Plan of Action (NPA2 2017-2021) in 2022 and

- CETU for President's presentation of new demands to government on measures to eliminate child labour
7. How many labour inspectors have been deployed so far to enforce compliance with the child laws? Any tangible impacts from the increase?
  8. How many government officials including labour inspectors have you trained as labour union? How are the trained officials are using the knowledge and skills gained? How are they using their skills? (Probe on whether there have been any reported cases on child labour/forced labour or any on modern slavery? Have they been presented in court? If yes state, the number of cases and how you have been able to follow them up?
  9. How many and what demands has your trade union presented/promoted to decision makers on modern slavery? (Probe on number of trade union articles made public demonstrating proposed changes to labour laws and policies to include modern slavery
  10. What research studies has your trade union produced on prevalence of modern slavery? What gaps/key issues have been identified in the studies that can guide project implementation? Which and how many companies have developed or revised a new code of conduct or policies on modern slavery?
  11. How many anti human trafficking committees have been established/strengthened? What is their role and what results have been achieved so far?
  12. How many bipartite and/or tripartite consultations have been held with employers on modern slavery? Any emerging outcomes from these consultations?
  13. What strategies are being used to create awareness on prevention and identification of modern slavery?
  14. How many campaign materials have been produced by the union and how many workplaces are using them?
  15. What is the progress in capacity building/training of affiliates/trade union workers on identification and prevention of child trafficking, child and forced labour? How many have been trained and what is you training strategy to reach more? What is the impact of the trainings?
  16. What number and type of information materials have been made by trade unions on human trafficking, forced labour and its impact on society.? What content/themes were covered? Were they produced in a user-friendly format? How was it disseminated?
  17. Have you supported development/review of CBAs to incorporate prevention of modern slavery? How many? In which sectors?
  18. How many CBAs are being implemented and what are the experiences and challenges so far?
  19. What education manuals have been developed to reach out to vulnerable workers? If done, what are the key concepts disseminated and how friendly is it to use? How comprehensive/any gaps?
  20. Have you built the capacity of trade union representatives on modern slavery? If so how many and in what areas? Which sector have been covered? What materials are you using to do the training? How are they using the knowledge and skills gained in their work with unions?
  21. Have you trained vulnerable workers on modern slavery? If so how many and in what areas? Which sectors have been covered? What materials are you using to do the training? How are they using the knowledge and skills gained?
  22. Has your trade union developed and/implemented mechanisms to deals with informal workers and to prevent modern slavery?
  23. What lessons have you learnt during the project implementation (**probe on what has worked, what has not worked. Reasons**)
  24. What factors have contributed to the success of the program? What factors have contributed to non-achievement of some planned results?
  25. How has local ownership and collaboration been achieved in the project?
  26. In all the above. Who are the other actors? What is the direct contribution of LO?
  27. What recommendations would you provide for enhanced achievement of project objectives moving forward?
  28. Has the project been implemented within the set time limits and approved budgets?
  29. How have both men and women benefitted from the project?
  30. What partnerships have been developed so far? How have you been benefitting from them?
  31. What is the Exit strategy to enhance sustainability of gains made after the project ends?

1. What is the link between your trade union work and the project on modern slavery?
2. Are the activities being implemented consistent with the overall organizational objectives?
3. Are project objectives integrated into national plans and priorities?
4. What efforts are being made towards sustainability?
5. Recommendations for future improvement

### **Ministry of Labour**

1. What policy or legal framework on forced labour, trafficking and child labour have been supported/advocated by the organization through the project?  
(**For Ghana** – probe progress on ratification of the UN CRC Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution, and Child Pornography.  
**For Ethiopia** – probe for ratification of the Minimum Wage Fixing Convention, 1970 (C131), the Migration for Employment Convention C 97 and the C 129 on Labour inspection in agriculture)
2. What is the level of compliance of Ethiopian Legislation and regulations with ILO conventions C 182 on Worst Forms of Child Labour?
3. What is the level of Ghana’s law compliance with /or provisions on issues of Child labour? What about application of the provisions of the ILC 182 and Recommendation 190, and Convention 138 and its recommendation 146?
4. What are the current CBAs being implemented? Do these CBAs have provisions to cover modern slavery? Do the CBAs fully comply with national laws and ILO conventions with specific clauses on child labour, trafficking and forced labour? If not, what is the progress in revising the CBAs in that line?
5. How many labour inspectors have been deployed so far to enforce compliance with the child laws? Any tangible impacts from the increase?
6. How many bipartite and/or tripartite consultations have been held with employers on modern slavery? Any emerging outcomes from these consultations?
7. Have you engaged in social dialogue? If so when and what were the emerging issue?

### **Employers**

1. How do you collaborate? Any bipartite initiatives on modern slavery?
2. Has your company developed or revised a new code of conduct or policy on modern slavery?
3. How many bipartite and/or tripartite consultations have been held with employers on modern slavery? Any emerging outcomes from these consultations?
4. What challenges do you face as you implement the policies/CBAs?
5. What recommendations do you give to enhance implementation of these policies?

### **Affiliate Unions**

1. How many campaign materials have been produced by the affiliate unions and how many workplaces are using them?
2. What knowledge have you received from CETU/TUC as regards modern slavery? Specifically, on prevention of child trafficking, child and forced labour? How many unionists have been trained and what is the training strategy to reach more? What is the impact of the training?
3. What challenges do you face during implementation of these activities?
4. What recommendations do you give for enhanced results in reducing modern slavery?

### **Workers**

1. Have you been trained on modern slavery? If yes, by who and in what areas?
2. What materials/methods have been used?
3. How are they using the knowledge and skills gained?
4. How have you benefited from the training?
5. Any recommendations for improvement?

### **Auditors**

1. Has the project been implemented within the set time limits and approved budgets?
2. What issues have you identified in finance management?

3. Have the audit issues been addressed?

## Annex 6: List of People Interviewed

### ETHIOPIA

INSTITUTION	ROLE/ OFFICE	NAMES
CETU	President	Mr. Kassahun Follo
CETU	V. president	Mr. Ayalew Ahmed
CETU	Learning and Research department head	Mr Balelign Zewdu
CETU	Head of Department, Social Affairs	Mr. Fischatsion Biadgilgn
CETU	National Project Coordinator, CMS	Wondimu Dirar
CETU	Senior gender expert	Ms. Etalemahu Kefyalew
CETU	Monitoring and Evaluation Officer, CMS	Tsegaye G/Michael
CETU	Finance officer	Elisabet Mekuria
CETU Adama branch office	Industrial relations expert	Kidist Nigussu
MoLS	Head of Labour inspection and OHS desk	Mr. Tumezgi Berhe
MoLS	Head of Bipartite relation desk	Mr Ebisa
MoLS	Tripartite desk head	Mr. Endalk
Addis Ababa police	Director, Women Children directorate,	Commander Atsede Wordofa
Action Aid Eth	Project Manager	Elisabeth Getachew
Woord en Daad	Senior Programme Advisor and Country Representative and	Ephrem Shiferaw
Woord en Daad	Project staff	Esubalew Keno
Confederation of Ethiopian Employers Federation	Executive Director	Abebe Haile
Ethiopian Employers Federations	Acting Director	Mr Seud Mohammed,
Zemedhun Adane certified CFCCA	Owner/manager	Zemedhun Adane
East shoa Zone Bureau of social Affairs	Head of social affairs	Ms. Askale Nigussu
Adama City Police	Director of Office of Women's and Children's Affairs	Inspector Etenesh Derese
Naflet Hotel, Adama	Human Resource Manager	Tefera Bekele
Robi Hotel, Adama	Senior Accountant and Basic Trade Union Secretary	Mr. Mulugeta
ILO	Genene Assefa	Coordinator of project on Forced labor and human trafficking
Zemedkun Adane Certified Audit Firm	Audit Manager	Taye Fekadu
Zemedkun Adane Certified Audit Firm	Audit manager	Getachew Mengesha



## GHANA

INSTITUTION	ROLE/ OFFICE	NAMES
Trade Union Congress	TUC Project team	Alberta Laryea-Djan
Trade Union Congress	TUC Project team	Mary Karimu
Trade Union Congress	TUC Project team	Harriet
Trade Union Congress	Researcher	Obed Asare
Ghana Agriculture W Union	Lead Consultant	Andrews A. Tagoe
Ghana Employees Association	Head of Research	Eugene
Trade Union Congress	Head of Finance	Moses Nanor Sawyer
Trade Union Congress	Researcher	Edward Darko Adinkra
Trade Union Congress	Deputy	Joshua Ansah
Trade Union Congress	Auditor	Patrick
Fisher Folk (Accra/OSU)	Beneficiary (Fisherman)	Robert Nettey
Ministry of Labour	Senoir labour Inspector	Richard Adraku
Ministry of Labour	Labour Inspector	Ernest Boakye
Ministry of Labour	Former Labour Inspector	Cyprian Laryea
Brong Ahafo Region	Regional Secretary of TUC	Comfort Asamoah
TWU	Gender Co-ordinator	Rita Baaba Tamkloe
Verite	Ag. Country Director	Helga Osei Aku
Rainforest	Respondents	Joyce Arboah
International Labour Organization	Respondents	Kwame
Action Aid	Respondents	Samuel Sabuli
MOLS Director of the Child Labour	Director	Elizabeth Akanbombire