



**ETHIOPIAN EVANGELICAN CHURCH MEKANE YESUS
DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL SERVICE COMMISSION
NORTH AREA WORK, TIGRAY
(EECMY DASSC-NAW)**

**Samre Sustainable Livelihoods Development Project
Midterm evaluation Report**

October, 2012



EECMY-NAW-DASSC
የኢ./ወ/ቤ/ክ መካነ ኢ.የሱስ ሰሜን ስራ ክፍል
የልማትና ማህበራዊ አገልግሎት ኮሚሽን



Norwegian Church Aid
Together for a just world

EECMY-NAW-DASSC
"Serving the Whole Person"

Samre Sustainable Livelihood Development Project
Hantabat Watershed

Activities Involvement

- Natural Resource Manag.
- Apiculture
- water supply
- Marketing information

Collaboration with
NCA/Ethiopia



8Km

- Livestock & crop Prod.
- irrigation development
- Health, HTP & HIV/AIDS
- Social Working
- Road
- IGA

| | | | |
|--|--|---|--|
|  <i>Ato Hagos Ayalew</i> Natural Resource |  <i>Ato Habera Tekay</i> Chairman |  <i>Wro. Tadele</i> Women Empowerment |  <i>Keshi. Redae Tadeas</i> Public relation |
|  <i>Ato Tesfay Tesfay</i> Secretary |  <i>Ato Wigebrual Gormay</i> Infrastructure |  <i>Ato Hagos Wokil</i> Social |  <i>Ato G/hiwot G/her</i> Agriculture |

Watershed Development committee of samre sustainable Livelihood Development project

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----------|
| LIST OF ACRONYMS..... | 4 |
| EXECUTIVE SUMMARY..... | 7 |
| BACKGROUND AND JUSTIFICATION..... | 8 |
| PROJECT GOAL AND OBJECTIVES..... | 9 |
| PROGRAMME STATUS..... | 9 |
| Scope and Objectives of the Midterm Evaluation..... | 16 |
| Evaluation methodology..... | 16 |
| Strength & opportunity..... | 16 |
| Limitations and challenges of the project..... | 17 |
| Recommendations..... | 17 |
| Conclusion and lesson learnt..... | 17 |

List of Acronyms

| | |
|----------|--|
| CCC | community care coalition |
| DASSC | Development and Social Service Commission |
| EECMY | Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus |
| ETB | Ethiopian Birr |
| NAW | North Area Work |
| GTP | Growth and Transformation Plan |
| HDW | Hand Dug Well |
| HIV/AIDS | Human Immune Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome |
| HTP | Harmful Traditional Practice |
| IWD | Integrated Watershed Development |
| NCA | Norwegian Church Aid |
| NCA-E | Norwegian Church Aid-Ethiopia |
| NGO | Non Governmental Organization |
| NRM | Natural Resource Management |
| MTE | Midterm evaluation |
| OVC | Orphan and Vulnerable Children |
| PLWHA | People Living With HIV/AIDS |
| SSLDP | Samre sustainable Livelihoods Development Project |
| VCT | Voluntary Counseling and Testing |

Project Summary

Project title: Samre Sustainable Livelihoods Development Project

Donor: Norwegian Church Aid

Implementing partner: EECMY DASSC-NAW

Project start date: January 1, 2011

Project Duration: Three years (January 1, 2011 – December 30, 2013)

Evaluation date: September 30- October 3, 2012

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Samre sustainable livelihood development project (SSLDP) is a three year project that began in 2011 and is scheduled to end in December 2013. The project is implemented by the Ethiopian Evangelical church Mekene Yesus Development and social service commission north area work branch office. The partner for funding is Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) with a total budget of ETB 5,046,255.00 for three years. In addition, NCA has provided ETB **352,000** secured from the Royal Norwegian Embassy in Ethiopia and community contribution in labor is ETB 560,695.00. The total expenditure so far from NCA support is ETB 3,435,441.00, including fund from the Royal Norwegian Embassy, Community contribution in free labor is estimated to ETB 150,000 and material (gabion for gully rehabilitation) contribution from government estimated to ETB 300,000.00.

The watershed-based sustainable livelihood development project in Hantabat watershed-Samre targeted about 1,000 households with 6000 vulnerable people to use the natural resources at their disposal most effectively to cope up with shocks and stresses, and thereby thrive and move on to sustainable and rewarding livelihoods which can sustainably use the natural resources base, increase incomes, improve food security and enhance their well-being. The project follows a watershed approach that recognizes the interrelationships among land use, soil and water, including the linkages between uplands and downstream areas.

It tries to respond to the causes of vulnerability: rainfall variability, flood, population growth, seasonality of job opportunities, high price of farm inputs, stereotyping of gender roles, etc., which are affecting the livelihood basis (capital assets) of the households in the target watershed. The project contributes to the overall economic development of the target watershed, through restoring ecological balance and improvement of socio-economic conditions of the people inhabiting in the watershed.

The project is in line with the overriding development goal of the nation's Growth and Transformation Plan (GTP) to sustain rapid and broad-based growth path that can eventually end poverty. Natural resources conservation and management, market-oriented agricultural development, diversification of livelihood strategies, increasing access to social infrastructure/information, gender mainstreaming and strengthening institutions and community safety nets are the key interventions. Community participation (ownership), multi-level capacity building and utilization of existing local knowledge, skills and structures are the main strategies designed to ensure project sustainability.

Monitoring and evaluation were done to see whether implementation of the planned activities has led to the desired results and impacted the beneficiary community and stakeholders. Participatory monitoring that involves all relevant stakeholders was done each quarter to monitor progress of the activities, i.e., timeliness, quality; quantity and cost of the activities as well as participation of the community.

The Mid- Term Evaluation (MTE) has been undertaken jointly with EECMY DASSC , NCA/Ethiopia , Concerned government line offices at all levels who signed agreement with the implementer EECMY DASSC, Woreda Administration and beneficiaries of the project.

The purpose of the MTE is to assess the SSLDP design and performance to make recommendation to further strengthen the project, through field visit and dialogue with stakeholders and target groups of the project.

1. BACKGROUND AND JUSTIFICATION

The Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus (EECMY) is a national Church in Ethiopia proclaiming the Good News of the Lord Jesus Christ. The Church understands that it is mandated by the Gospel of Jesus Christ to contribute towards meeting spiritual and physical needs of the people through its "Holistic Ministry". Towards this, the church has established a separate non-profit making Development and Social Service Commission (DASSC), which has been increasingly participating in the country's socio-economic development endeavors. EECMY/DASSC has been involved in diversified Development and Social Service projects across the country in order to support vulnerable, poor and marginalized segments of the society.

Significant parts of Ethiopia are characterized by persistent food insecurity. While droughts and other hazards such as floods are significant triggers, more important are the factors which create and/or increase vulnerability to these shocks and which have undermined livelihoods. These factors include land degradation, limited household assets, low levels of farm technology, lack of employment opportunities and population pressure. Although relief was provided, often at great expense, it was rarely adequate or timely. As a consequence, households were forced to sell assets (further constraining their livelihood options); and to restrict consumption with immediate impacts on increasing the risk of disease and longer term impacts on chronic malnutrition.

Saherti Samre woreda is one of the 31 food insecure woredas of Tigray region located in the south eastern zone. According to the data obtained from the woreda office of agriculture, it has an area of 154,485 hectare, which consists of the three agro-ecologies: Dega/high land (3%), Woina Dega/mid land (47%) and Kola/low land (50%). The topography of the land is 28% plain, 50% hilly, 13% undulated and 9% valley; hence 72% of the area requires soil and water conservation measures. The land use pattern of the woreda is covered with annual crops (21%), perennial crops (2.1%), shrubs and forest land (42.6%), bare/marginal land (11%), and grazing land (23.6%). Even though the grazing land is 23.6%, the forage and pasture coverage is very low; the grazing lands are either mountainous or hilly areas. The woreda receives an average annual rainfall of 700 mm.

The watershed is highly degraded and people are still exerting their pressure on the environment to make their living out of it. Hantabat watershed, being located in Addis Alem Tabia (Kebele), which is

known in food insecurity regionally and nationally, as most people migrate seasonally for daily labor and begging in towns, is unable to support the livelihoods of the local community. The watershed is one of the areas where productive safety net is supporting the people through public work (2,119 people), direct support (422 people), and emergency (2,941 people), which shows that the local community is unable to fulfill the food needs from own production and other non farm activities.

For this reason, the target communities of the watershed and Tigray Regional government made a request to EECMY-DASSC NAW for assistance. In response to this request, EECMY DASSC in collaboration with its partner NCA/Ethiopia launched the first phase SSLDP livelihood development project, which is under implementation since January 2011. The project aimed at the improvement of the living standards of the community. The main components of the project are Natural resource conservation and management, agricultural development including small scale irrigation scheme, construction of water supply, Reproductive Health related activities, HTPs & HIV/AIDS prevention and control, increasing access to transportation and market information and capacity building, which are enhancing assets of the targeted households in the watershed.

This project has been focusing specially on land less youth and women headed household who are participating in Apiculture, irrigation practice, sheep rearing & fattening and modern poultry production. And they have shown significantly positive change in their living standard and currently their income sources have been improved to support their family and most of them became food secure and building own assets.

The MTE team has observed the integration of watershed management approach and smooth and workable collaboration and active participation of stakeholders (community, government) to achieve the objectives of the project.

2. PROJECT GOAL AND OBJECTIVES

The goal of the project is to promote overall food security status of the target watershed community through adaptation of climate change and livelihood improvement in the watershed.

The specific objectives of the project are:

Objective 1: Restore biodiversity and environmental rehabilitation by harnessing, conserving and developing natural resources i.e. land, water, vegetation cover.

Objective 2: Mitigate adverse effects posed by vulnerability contexts (shocks, seasonality & critical trends) in the target watershed, and improve food security of the people inhabiting the watershed.

Objective 3: Increase access to infrastructure (water supply, access road, health, and market information that enhance the general well-being of the people inhabiting the target watershed.

Objective 4-promote gender equality particularly women development and reduce HTPs in the target watershed.

Anticipated results that lead to achievement of objectives include:

Result 1.1: Land degradation in the target watershed reduced & degraded lands rehabilitated with increased vegetation cover in the target watershed.

Result 2: Increased/improved crop and livestock production and productivity in the target watershed.

Result 2.3: Increased incomes of the households engaged in different farm/non-farm income generating activities

Result 2.4: Enhanced social networking and community safety nets in the target watershed.

Result 3.1: Increased access to safe water and sanitation services for the people inhabiting the target watershed.

Result 3.2: Increased access to transportation and market information services, including increased outreach health services for the inhabitants of the target watershed.

Result 3.3: People inhabiting in the watershed developed positive attitudes to prevent HIV/AIDS & HTP, and promote gender equality.

3. Project Plans and Accomplishments

Each activity has been successfully accomplished as planned as follows:

3.1 Natural Resource conservation and management (SWC)

3.1.1 Physical and biological soil and water conservation activities

Expected Result 1: Land degradation in the target watershed reduced & degraded lands rehabilitated with increased vegetation cover in the target watershed.

The main rationale for the implementation of this component is prevention of soil erosion, improvement of soil fertility and rehabilitation of the environment. Major activities done are gully rehabilitation, construction of deep trenches, percolation pits and percolation ponds,

Gully reclamation: 1950 M³ gabion check dam,

Deep trench construction: 18,400m³ deep trenches / around 16 kms/

Percolation pits construction: 64 percolation pits (1438.19m³)

Percolation ponds construction: 600 M³percolation ponds

To strengthen the physical work biological measures were also applied on the watershed through planting 100,000 seedlings of different indigenous and exotic tree species. Community contributed free labor during soil and water conservation work and the local government also provided 300 units of gabion freely for construction of gabion check dams for gully rehabilitation. During MTE this integrated approach was observed with appreciation by the MTE team as good practices and it was seen as lesson to other actors in the region too.

3. 1.2 Increased Vegetation Cover in the Watershed

Area Closure

To allow natural resources regeneration on the upper catchment of the watershed and to control from interference of animals and humans, about 350 hectares of land was put under closure and 6 guards from community were selected to look after and supervise the area under control. As a result, vegetation cover is re emerging and the number of wild animals particularly birds is increasing. Rules and regulations were setup to legally protect this enclosed area and to increase user's rights.

In this area closer 500 m² of land was given for land less youth which were organized by the project to work on modern beekeeping and they constructed apiary site on the area closure and their income from honey production is increased. In addition local bylaws were established which allow the right holders to effectively use the regenerated grass through cut and carry system for their animals.

Result of SWC and Area closer

- *Land degradation in the target watershed reduced and degraded lands rehabilitated*
- *soil moisture content developed , river streams recharged*
- *A large amount of water has been accumulated in deep trench and new springs were developed at the bottom of the catchment treated*
- *Runoff water and soil erosion from the upper catchment were reduced*
- *Increased vegetation cover in the target watershed*

3. 1.3 trained farmers and local government development staff on Climate change Adaptation

To create awareness of the target groups of the project, training on climate change adaptation and mitigation was held in the watershed. It was given to 150 farmers of Hantabat watershed from 2 Kebeles, for 4 natural resource management experts of Seharti Samre woreda and 6 development agents from the watershed.

The participants were presenting their own ideas and poem on climate change. They all agreed that the climate change is bringing a serious negative effect on their livelihood. Finally, promising to protect their natural resource from degradation, to manage and to utilize properly and to keep and to transfer for their future generation.

Result:

- *Awareness on climate change mitigation and adaptation among the Hantabat watershed habitant farmers were created*
- *Favorable Situations were created to Sustain ecological system in the target watershed where the current generation can benefit from it without affecting benefits of the future generation;*

The evaluation team in addition to appreciation of the endeavors emphasized the need to continue in strengthening the watershed management to build up and maintain the created assets and sustainably use them.

3. 1.4 Establish & support Environment Clubs in schools

Unwise use of vegetation cover, overgrazing and deforestation has resulted in immeasurable soil erosion in the watershed devastating the natural resource, and recurrent drought has significantly affected the livelihood of the targeted inhabitants.

In order to alleviate the above mentioned problems and to create awareness of the new generation and to maintain natural resource and to protect the environmental degradation and pollution in the targeted watershed, the project established environment club in the school. To strength the club, training on climate change and importance of NRM was given, and also agricultural equipment, books and sport materials were provided to the club. This environmental club is taking part in environmental rehabilitation of the watershed, by delineating small site for reforestation (area closure) and planting tree seedlings.

Result

- *Environment protection club established and strengthened,*
- *Students participating in the club understood the impact of climate change and importance of environmental rehabilitation*

3.1.5 provision of fuel saving stoves

Most women in the watershed fetch fuel wood from the already degraded/deforested land to prepare food at household level. To refrain from deforestation and reduce women work load in fuel wood collection, reducing heat & smoke effect during food preparation, 30 model women in the watershed were trained on utilization of fuel saving stove and provided with 30 fuel saving stoves. The evaluation team encouraged the project to assess the effect and continue with the initiative.

3. 2. Agricultural development

The project is working in improving crop and livestock production practices to enhance food security and target community's income in the targeted watershed.

3. 2.1 Crop production

Expected Result: Increased/improved crop and livestock production and productivity in the target watershed.

Different improved varieties of cereal, vegetable and fruit seeds, seedlings and tubers were introduced to the watershed and provided to some of the watershed farmers. This is resulting in increased productivity and production. To promote modern small scale irrigation scheme in the watershed, 22 water pumps were provided to some landless youth and poor farmers. This has resulted in improved production of cereal crops and vegetables for home consumption and market to earn additional income. The landless youth who participate in the irrigated farming have started earning income. The irrigation users are organized in a cooperative association. The evaluation team recommends expansion of irrigation, use of improved seeds, to improve livestock production through proper use of grazing land and forage development. The project has provided capacity building trainings on the existing grazing land management and forage development, and also experience sharing exposure was given to representatives of the watershed farmers on zero grazing and forage development. The team also emphasized that the project should continue to strengthen the cooperative in administrative and financial arrangements so that it can operate, maintain and utilize the assets sustainably.

3. 3 Promotion of Income Generating Activities.

Expected Result: Increased incomes of the households engaged in different farm/non-farm income generating activities

To engage poor women headed households and land/asset less youth in income generating activities efforts have been exerted. Accordingly; 30 poor women were provided with 160 sheep on credit basis after being trained on how to rear and manage. 30 poor women were also trained on poultry production and provided with 1000 chickens on credit basis. 12 landless youth also trained on apiculture production and were provided with 20 modern beehives with the required accessories on credit basis. At present the above mentioned vulnerable groups are organized in cooperative as owners the asset and started earning their income.

The project also established two self help groups in the watershed to strengthen women participants. These women started working together and begun creating assets that help them to generate income

and develop sense of self reliance. The women group members regularly meet two times a month and exchange ideas related to their rights, businesses, HTP & HIV/ ADIS prevention, hygiene and sanitation, etc. The project should continue strengthening the cooperatives in their institutional capacity, particularly in administrative and financial arrangements to sustainably lead their livelihoods.

3. 4. WASH intervention

Expected Result 4: Increased access to safe water and sanitation services for the people inhabiting the target watershed.

3. 4.1 Construction and maintenance of water supply facility

To have clean water and improve health status of the targeted community in the watershed one spring construction and a shallow well maintenance has been undertaken. The percolation ponds construction in the upper catchment area has revealed improvement in ground water recharging to have enough water supply from the well during dry season too.

3.4.2 Community mobilization to construct sanitation facilities & hygiene promotion in the watershed

To stop open defecation around the elementary school pit latrines were constructed by the project and training was provided for users of the facilities especially for school communities and women on sanitation and hygiene.

3. 5. Increased access to transportation and market information

To improve access to the project site and create market availability, the project has constructed a 4.2 KMs access road from Addiakala to Addis Alem kebele in collaboration with the woreda administration. As a result, farmers in the watershed and surrounding community are able to get access to transportation during the dry and wet season and it helped them to alleviate the multifaceted socio economic problems and able to sell their agriculture products in good price and to buy agricultural inputs easily.

3. 6. Strengthen community support to people with disabilities and OVC

With the collaboration of Community Care Compassionate (CCC) and WDC the project is providing support for the most vulnerable persons (who have no other means for their subsistence) in the watershed. Currently 20 persons with different disabilities, elders and OVCs are getting Birr 100 monthly. To strengthen the community care compassionate the project has provided 10,000 birr, as this CCC is coordinating the people to help the vulnerable group through contribution.

3.7 Expected Result 5: Increased access to information and support developed favorable attitudes to reproductive health and to prevent HIV/AIDS and HTPs

The project has implemented various activities on reproductive health, HIV/AIDS and HTPs such as training on School based early marriage & sexual reproductive health for girl students, training for women households on home garden and provision of improved horticultural crops to improve their nutrition, Provision of voluntary counseling test (VCT), community conversation, creating IGAs for supporting PLWHA and fistula victimized women in the watershed, etc. Girls, anti HIV/AIDS & HTP and mini media Clubs were established and supported by the project. These clubs are now serving the community in awareness creation on the issue of climate change, prevention of HIV/AIDS, HTP, and reproductive health issues.

Monitoring & evaluation

The project organizes participatory monitoring through weekly meetings by all stakeholders and quarterly meetings to see the performance of the project. NCA/Ethiopia has been monitoring the project through telephone, quarterly through receiving reports and conducting field visit. The project signatories of regional bureaus evaluate the project implementation progress annually.

5. Budget utilization

In general, the project is progressing according to plan; the total budget utilized until August, 2012 was ETB 3, 158, 441.00, of which 71 % allocated for direct program cost and 29 % for administration cost. This represents a higher level of utilization when compared to the total pledged budget of the three project years.

6. Conclusions and Recommendation

The evaluation team concludes that the project has the following strength and limitations:

Strengths

- Working in integration with the pertinent government bodies
- Using Participatory approach at all project cycle management
- The project is cost effective (implement with few financial investment but tangible work)
- Mainstreaming and integration of critical issues like reproductive health, empowering of women and youth, Climate change adaptation, HIV/AIDS and HTPs.
- Applied participatory watershed management approach
- Take the initiative to strengthen the community care compassionate/coalition
- Focus on addressing the problems of the most vulnerable groups

Limitations and challenges of the project

- Documentation of success/change stories and sharing for learning
- High turnover of staff due to unattractive salary/payment in such a remote area.
- Material, transport and labour cost Inflation.

Recommendations

- The project is extensively working to restore/rehabilitate the ecosystem controlling or reversing natural resource degradation in the watershed. However, in the watershed there is a lot to do; such as many gullies to be maintained/treated. In order to curb the devastating climate change problems and environmental degradation additional new technologies for water harvesting and irrigation expansion should be incorporated in the watershed in the coming year.
- Continuity in strengthening the watershed management to build up and maintain the created assets and sustainably use them.
- Strengthen the cooperatives in administrative and financial arrangements so that they can operate, maintain and utilize the assets sustainably.
- Further expansion of apiculture technology in the watershed to benefit more user groups,
- Documentation of success/change stories should be strengthened and best practices implemented in the watershed should also be scaled up to other neighboring watersheds.
- Strive for equitable distribution of benefits among all the watershed beneficiaries,

- Part of the gravel road constructed by the project were highly appreciated by all stake holders, however there is a need to extend the road to the watershed site , so the evaluation team encourages the stakeholders to replicate the experience of the project to solve the problem.
- Farmers training center needs be supported/strengthened, to facilitate the intended sustainable development in the watershed.

The EECMY-DASSC/NAW branch Samre Sustainable Livelihood Development Project in collaboration with NCA/ Ethiopia being implemented effectively in the targeted watershed. This is benefiting the poor community and contributing to enhance their socioeconomic status in a number of ways. The focus of the project is in line with the country national Development plan GTP. The collaboration of the local government and active participation of the community to achieve the project objectives is very high. Hence, the project is on the right track in achieving the set goal.

Annex I

Med term Evaluation Participants list

| No. | Name | Responsibility |
|-----|--------------------|---|
| 1 | Mesfin Woldu | Core process owner early warning response and food security of Tigray region state |
| 2 | Gezachew Gebru | Sub core process owner in early warning response and food security PSNT |
| 3 | Haftu kiros | Head planning in Tigray BoA core process Natural Resources protection development |
| 4 | Kahsay G/ Micha | NGO managing officer in early warning response and food security of Tigray region state |
| 5 | Rev. Zenbe Alemu | EECMY Mekelle congregation pastor |
| 6 | Gutema Gezmu | NCA-Ethiopia livelihood development program coordinator |
| 7 | AbeyaWakwoya (Dr.) | EECMY-DASSC coordinator |
| 8 | Getachew Abera | Head of NRM office in S.Samre woreda (WDTT) |
| 9 | Desta Hadera | EECMY DASSC NAW branch office Director |
| 10 | Getachew Tesfay | EECMYDASSC/NAW development committee |
| 11 | Tsegazab Mehari | EECMYDASSC/NAW development committee |
| 12 | Syume | Head of Woreda S.Samre administration office |
| 13 | Dejen Mola | EECMYDASSC/NAW/SSLDP Agriculture &NRM officer |
| 14 | Haftamu Nigusse | SWC expert in NRM office wored S.samre (WDTT) |
| 15 | Hadera Tekay | Chair man of the targeted watershed (WDC) |
| 16 | Danial tadesse | EECMY NAW DASSC officer |