

**TERMINAL MONITORING AND EVALUATION REPORT ON
PROJECT ENTITLED FFSP.**

**IMPLEMENTING PARTNER: ETHIOPIAN EVANGELICAL CHURCH
MEKANE YESUS DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL SERVICE
COMMISSION (EECMY-DASSC)**

DONOR: NLM

PROJECT OPERATIONAL SITE: FILTU WOREDA OF LIBAN ZONE

DIRECT BENEFICIARIES: 700hhhs

DURATION OF THE PROJECT: 2014-16

BUDGET: 4,624,702 ETIOPIAN BIRR

DECEMBER 2016

Table1 Name of the team members

| S/No | Name | Agency | Role | Mobile | Email |
|------|---------------------------|--------|------------------|----------------|---------------------------------|
| 1 | Abdikarim Ahmed | Bofed | Member | 0915211 236 | |
| 2 | Abdullahi Weirah Karie | Bofed | Team assigner | 0915774 942 | Abdullahiweirahkarie9@gmail.com |
| 3 | Ahmed Abdi Kalif | RLCRD | Member | | |
| 4 | Mustafa Abdi Ali | DPPB | Team delegate | 0916179 011 | Mustafe.abdi.114@gmail.com |

Profile of Filtu woreda

Filtu woreda is one of the 11 districts of Liban zone that located in Liben zone, South East of Ethiopia composed of 28 main kabales and 56 sub-kabales with total population of 110,090 that, 80% of them depend on livestock sale, production and productivity. While 20% of them are categorized depended on agro-pastoralist and food aid dependants, even though they are affected by Elninino phenomenon backed by global climate change. Thus resulted livestock deaths, deterioration of livestock body condition for all species as a result of pasture and water scarcity due to failure of seasonal rains during the two rainy season.

The failure of the two rainy seasons has tremendously affected the food security situation of Filtu woreda pastoralist/agro-pastoralist community that resulted poor purchasing power of the poor HHs that used to drive their main income from livestock and currently their food security is believed to be insecure as result of recurrent drought impacted by **ELNININO** episode. Hence DASSC with in collaboration of the implementing agency is responding FFSP from 2014-16 through creating access to improved agricultural inputs, dry land farming techniques and improved knowledge on gender and nutrition for enhanced quality of life, even though, the lifespan of the FFSP phase-out December 2016 as per the regional MOU.

Introduction/Background of liban zone

The liban zone of Somali region as many pastoral community of the country has been hardest hit by recurrent drought caused by elnino and flooding which caused different impacts to the resilient community living within the zone. Even though there is a change when comparing to previous years, however the frequent elninino impact has cussed deaths of numerous livestock and the situation have remained a challenge of chronic food in security as well as water scarcity. By the way 3 years consecutive starting from 2014-16 due to in sufficient rain, the drought was increasing from year to year and approximately 80% of livestock died and large number of the population become dependent on external food aid and water rationing activity by humanitarian organizations.

The current poor living conditions of the pastoralist and scarcity of important external recourse makes them weakened to easily adopt with this harsh climate situation. As a result the mentioned crisis and the need for humanitarian assistance are not sufficient still and need more external

support compared to the situation and support the affected community is opened for external support.

Currently EECMY DASSC with its back donor NLM is one of the developmental organizations currently operating in Filtu woreda of Liban zone for intervention of food security in four targeted sites of filtu woreda namely as Bnder, Kllajeh, Hyadimtu and Masajid with total beneficiaries of 700HHs through creating access to improved agricultural inputs, dry land farming techniques and improved knowledge on gender and nutrition for enhanced quality of life

Objective of the FFSP terminal M&E

- ✓ Asses the number of the beneficiaries that benefited from the project since its implementation.
- ✓ Assess implementing agency is closely working with the concern sectors and administration at woreda and kabale level to strengthen the program jointly
- ✓ Assess challenge faced if any between the implementing agency and sectors/ administration in order to correct the gap.
- ✓ Assess projects financial and physical
- ✓ Assess project staffs are working as per project plan/period and earning salary from the project.
- ✓ Draw key lesson learnt from EECMY DASSC operating in filtu woreda of Somali region
- ✓ To establish smooth collaboration between the implementing agency and the concerns lines department as well as administrative organs at the zone and the woreda concerns offices to strength the program by increasing and expanding to other geographical areas of the filtu woreda
- ✓ Produce precise monitoring and evaluation report to all concern offices and the implementing agency.

The purpose of this terminal evaluation is to evaluate the project for the last 3 years and from 2014-2016 performances of the project, document the output and outcomes, lesson learnt, challenges if any during the implementation focusing the contribution of the project toward behavioral change of the targeted beneficiaries to ensure that targeted beneficiaries have benefited from the FFSP, and government concern offices have jointly implemented the project with the implementing agency as per the regional agreement to ensure the smooth

implementation/collaboration of the project went well during the implementation to win for any anticipated next project, that will be benefit for the entitled beneficiaries.

Methodology used during monitoring

For this particular terminal evaluation a team composed of multi-sectors was organized by the regional government to come up with sounding outcome about the activities being implemented by the implementing agency and its relations with concerned stakeholders at the grass root level. As a result, this the evaluations was conducted by a team that consists of different sectors who have relevant knowledge and experience in the project implementing area. The member of the evaluation team was drawn from bureau of Finance and Economic development, Bureau crop and rural development, Zonal dppc and coordination head and the implementing agency.

The evaluation team mainly focused on qualitative data to avoid time taking in order to assess the performance of the project as well as the impact of the project among the stakeholders.

The process of data collection and analysis were made through the following methodology:

- ✓ Briefing and debriefing of the sector and woreda administration and the Zanal about monitoring team mission toward project entitled FFSP running by EECMY DASSC by funded NLM.
- ✓ Review of the project activities implemented from January 2014 –16
- ✓ Observation through field visit on project sites
- ✓ Focus group discussion(FGD) with different groups of project stake holders
- ✓ Discussion with/interviews with key informants(KII) and government line departments

This terminal monitoring and evaluation covered Filtu food security project implemented in Filtu and it will be smoothly precursor for the next new anticipated project for filtu and other districts of the zone and finding report will be shared with government concern offices and the implementing agency.

Major findings:

As found by the evaluation team, the main objectives of “*FFSP* is to ensure the food security situation of the agro-pastorals living in the selected kebeles of the district, more or less, through increased knowledge and awareness of the community in dry land agricultural practices and provision of improved seed varieties and improve health states of the community affected by the recurrent drought that enabled them susceptible to ensure their food security.

The evaluation has found to have, the community image towards the evaluated project according to the questioners and feedbacks from the host community along with what has been observed from the field during the field visit by the team.

Generally after careful compilation and analysis of the data, this final evaluation, the monitoring team has found the organization achievement in addressing the issue of food security among agro-pastoral community of Filtu woreda of Liban zone by adapting the different techniques. Hence most of the project activities were found to be focused on food security related activities along with nutrition/health and home development.

Regarding the project intervention area there was positive impact that can be justified to the concerns as observed by the monitoring and evaluation team.

Shortly after project sites observation, interviewed key informant, focus group discussion and observation made by the monitoring team it was found that, the project progress was reached up to extent and beneficiaries were found appreciating support towards the FFSP and requesting continuation of the project. The community including line department appreciated the progress generally based on the following below mentioned activities:

- ✓ Established demonstration site at Hayadmitu that has used to introduce the community different techniques dry land agriculture to the community and the evaluation team has observed positive feedbacks from the community.
- ✓ Establishment of women seed banking In Hatdimtu that will enable their self reliant for future after having adaptation mechanism of the project/dry land techniques
- ✓ Intervention in agricultural activities in messajid, bandhire and hayadimitu peasant associations were successful;

- ✓ Established new nursery site at Massajid community and demonstration site at Hayadmitu.
- ✓ Distribution of improved seed to agro-pastoral, vegetable seeds and adaptability trials of different seeds from research centre were done in good manner.
- ✓ Nutrition and Health and hygiene training, seed bank cooperatives training, water pump operators and maintenance training has contributed to the community in increasing the basic knowledge.
- ✓ Establishment of area enclosure in haydimtu with capacity of 5ha,
- ✓ Activity based capacity building training for the stakeholders and government staffs
- ✓ Distribution of varieties of seeds for the targeted beneficiaries
- ✓ Distribution deferent of seedling trees that shown good progress at all distributes sites.

Table1 indicates type of activities, status and remark if any

| Activities | Type of activities | Status | Remark |
|------------|--|--|--|
| 1 | Target agro pastoral community& agricultural inputs | Finalized as per the per project plan. | 20 quintal variety of improved Legume seed distributed and sown on 50 hectares of land Vegetables seed distributed to agro-pastoral Establishment of Women seed bank cooperatives able to collect and store seeds and currently the Community are using the seed bank -10 Household vege. Garden established Purchase and use of 5 different types of agricultural tools |
| Activity2 | To provide and familiarize agro-pastorals with the necessarily skill and knowledge on dry land farming practices | “ | Agro-pastoral create strong working relation with project demonstration site - Agro-pastoral will apply the techniques of dry |

| | | | |
|------------|---|-----------|--|
| | | | land agriculture on their field - Develop guide Manual - Project and district agriculture office staffs acquires good knowledge on dry land agriculture |
| Ativity3 | The household nutrition status improved due to the various fruit and forest tree plantation | “ | Functional and well looking one nursery site - 13000 trees are planted with care by community members - 5 hectare of land protected from entrance of livestock - 2000 trees of different species planted - |
| Acivity4 | Rehabilitation previously built of birkas | “ | All the necessary protection has been done for two birka |
| Activity5 | Capacity building training | “ | Project staffs, district staffs and stakeholders have received capacity building training that enabled them to cope with the FFSP |
| Activity 6 | Establishment of area enclosure | completed | Well fenced and it is good condition |

The weakness of the project

- ✓ The main weakness of the project thematic areas as observed by the monitoring team is that 80% of the pastoralist community drives their main source of income from livestock sale, production and productivities as you can recall in the profile of the woreda/zone. Hence what is missing from the project and would have been backbone for the targeted beneficiaries was inclusion of livestock part in the design project from the very beginning putting in to consideration that, the community depending on livestock. For instance create market linkage opportunities for the /targeted pastoralist beneficiaries to enhance the livelihood more/less as result of recurrent drought. In relation to this factor livestock vaccination/ treatment and fodder for the pastoralist would have been more crucial for those who depend on livestock products as they depend on livestock.

- ✓ Good collaboration with the government line offices and improved consultation` has also become an issue that strengthened the project implementation. Because as observed by the monitoring team and interview made with chain sector of Filtu woreda emphasized good collaboration with line department.
- ✓ As per indicated in the project document, project administration officer was not been employed after the announcement of the position while the budget indicated in the project document. Because the project administrator would have been pillar for the project, when the project manager is away from the office.
- ✓ Project is only focusing limited thematic areas of Filtu woreda, without putting in to consideration other parts of the zone by increasing and expanding the project, so that many beneficiaries would have benefited from the project. The reason is the EECMY DASSC started supporting the local community over decades and aware of community need within the zone.
- ✓ Another weakness of the project is the exclusion of emergency intervention fund like other implementing agencies when the need arises, because of the recurrent drought causing by elninno episodic as result of global climate change.
- ✓ Lack of ever participating regular and humanitarian coordination meeting at zonal level and any other assessment design by the zonal government at all level, thus would have support the project in terms of seeking fund from the back door and other required support by the government.

Field visit analysis

This evaluation team composed of deferent sectors as mentioned in the above monitoring team table was made, the first formal meeting with the project manager (Tamrat) and some of the project staff in order to inform them, the mission of the evaluation team. And lastly, the project manger the evaluation team has discussed about the field visit, TOR, and selected some of the sample projects sites to be visited by the evaluation team.

In short, after document review, key informant interview and focus group discussion and observation made by the monitoring team it was found that the mentioned above activities monitored/ evaluated. In addition to that the team has come up with identified goals that may

contribute the project to be successful and create trust between the organization and the concerns government's lines departments and the stake holders as well.

In our review the regional NGO guidelines and project agreement document at the region emphasis the importance of communication and information sharing among stake holders for better achievement of results and in addressing target beneficiaries need and service satisfaction. In addition transparency and coordination among stake holders are the main essential elements of partnership these were clearly indicated in memorandum of understanding and other guidelines. The practical observation of the working relationships between the organization and the district administration as well as the target community seems to be very normal and the evaluation team has come with same progress, even though same weakness of the project found as mentioned in the weakness part.

Distributed seed

As found by team, the project has distributed seeds for the targeted beneficiaries as per the project activity plan in the project operational sites and the beneficiaries upheld the way they received, during distribution. Particularly Messajid and Hayadimitu farmers expressed their willingness since, the project started distributing the varieties of seeds.

The beneficiaries emphasised, that, the distributed seeds is believed to be drought tolerant seeds that can be planted where, the rainfall is below normal and most of them appreciated the distributed varieties of seeds. Even though as result of EL-NINO impact has caused deferent effect to the expected crops

Established Women Seed Bank Cooperatives:

During this evaluation period the evaluation team has visited established women seed bank cooperatives that are established in the targeted sites (Hayadmitu and Messajid kebeles)

During the terminal evaluation, the women were found feeling pleasure saying that, during seed distribution they sold it back the seeds to the community with fair price. The women cooperatives were established following the formal cooperative establishment guideline by the woreda agriculture office.

The women cooperatives have received training and experiences to cope up with the needs of the community and now have experience of coping with the situation. Currently, the women have performed according to the initial plan and it needs to be strengthened more. Here with attached secondary photos of the women during the training:



Demonstration site:

Visiting the project demonstration sites found, established dry land agriculture practical learning site as a demonstration site for the agro-pastorals living in the targeted area.

Having focused group discussion and key informant interview with the Haydimtu kebele community, their image towards about the demonstration site situated in Haydimtu assessed that some activities were done inside the demonstration site e.g.

- ✓ Water harvesting structures (small ponds and half moon structures)
- ✓ Dimba garden

Nursery site:

The nursery site selected in messajid community is one of the activities carried out by the project during 2014 – 2016 project periods accomplishment.

Interviewed made with deferent groups of the project stakeholders told to the monitoring team as if the nursery site was functioning during the project period and the selected site projected for nursery purpose and waiting next project.

During midterm evaluation, the team went masjid and found, the site functioning and planted in different and the local community including kebele administration were appreciating the fruitfulness of the outcome of the nursery site.

According to the monitoring team observation of the distributed seedlings were fruit and shade



trees. The evaluation team has also observed the effort of the community adapting the nursery site and the seedling grown in farm during its term. And here with attached photos of the grown seedling:

Area closure:

Area closure is one of the mechanisms that, drought affected vulnerable HHs can benefit from it in order to protect weak cattle and goats that cant migrate from place to place during dry season in search of pasture and water.

Actually, the idea behind establishing area enclosure for the pastoral community is beyond ironic concept putting into consideration, the current ELNINO episodic that, has largely affected the livestock production and productivity. In addition to this, teaching the pastoral community to rehabilitate deforested and degraded land is another social phenomenon that will result environmental protection to avoid land degradation and deforestation around grazing areas.

Having interviewed and discussion with the kebele community confirmed that, the established area enclosure estimated to be five (5) hecters of land and during drought cattle and shoats can survive though grazing along with establishment of natural resource management committees, even though not yet confirmed, that NRMC has received training on NRM for the established enclosure.

Women empowerment and home management

Somali context women were only given house calendar like cooking food, washing clothes, birthing and entertaining children setting aside all other rights like generating income source, participating decision making etc. Thus resulted men dominant over women undermining all women related rights, hence establishing this training and supporting women will enable them to seek their own income source that will make them self reliance for future.

During the evaluation, the team has visited Haydimtu site where the project has conducted the trainings in the community. The training of health and nutrition was organized by the project and woreda concern offices to enhance the women capacity. During the evaluation most of the interviewed were women beneficiaries and the team has come to know that there was close cooperation with the government concern office in organizing the trainings. we also have known that there were smooth relationship between project implementers and target beneficiaries at kebele and partners at woreda level. In addition one of the sectors staffs emphasized that, close collaboration by the parties will enable to speedy up the project implementation at all levels (Sectors, stakeholders and other vested concern government bodies)

Roofing of previously built water points:

Water points in the worreda are composed of Birkas, HDW, THDW, Ponds and 1 newly excavated Hafir- dump, that only prides water for two months after the 2 seasonal rainfall and some of them

are even non functional as a result of recurrent drought. That enabled the water sources became cracked and none functioning.

In addition most of the previously built birkas during Filu wirer, sanitation and hygiene project were not covered by iron sheets in the previous phases the project. For your information multi-sectors evaluation made late 2013 found most of the constructed birkas by EECMY-DASSC were not covered and the evaluation team commented to re-cover the water points. Because, as observed by the monitoring team, the sanitation of the water was totally found contaminated and changed by it-self and it was really highly commented.

Currently as observed by the evaluation team, rehabilitation and protection of the 2 previously built birkat is highly appreciated by the beneficiaries and will contribute water scarcity more or less as the water availability became dilemma situation as a result of **ELNINO** impact for the last 3consecutive years.

Field visit and experience sharing:

As indicated in the term of reference of the evaluation team was interviewing sector department as they are working with the implementing agency at grass root level. The sector department confirmed that Farmer's field visit experience sharing was conducted and supported by the implementing agency. He said the agro-pastoralist has got chance of visiting Diredawa to have experience sharing with their counterpart and visited some sites haring experience about water harvesting and irrigation system Thus field visit experience will contribute allot for practicing on their own farms. He mentioned over 15 participants invited by EECMY-DASSC through LCRD office and it need to be encouraged/strengthened more. The monitoring tem has obtained this information using secondary data though interview made with sector department and participants.

Project management at field level.

Generally the project has implementation and planning effort at field level. But one of the key pillar that would support the project as project administration is missing at field level while the budget is indicated in the project. As discovered by the team, sometimes when the manager was moving out to head office or others places for related works, some gaps were existing between delegated person and partners or there was no official delegation. In honest speaking there is good improvement and change when compared with the previous manager and mostly he was working and staying in site. But for the future, when the manager is away for others works, he should have to delegate right person until he back and that person should able to attend coordination meetings..

The problem observed at field level office was reshuffling of the previous manager and the current manager that resulted little bit misunderstanding with the line department. Before, there was one person who has been working as project administration, but in this 2016 working year we have not seen any one who is working on that position. Hence the main problem found at project fields level is that, project manager alone cannot held managerial position and administration as well due to over work load. Otherwise if this fulfilled the management capacity of the project would have been perfect, even though, the local context (Somali language) is resource for the project.

Sustainability of the project:

As per interview made with sector, focus group discussion, key informant and field visit observation about the sustainability of the phased out project discovered that, the community aware of, that the project will sustain through using lesson learnt from the project for future.

In addition, woreda concern line department and the kebele administration can manage the sustainability of the project if they show their commitments at local level. Even though, they will obviously encounter lack of frequent support. Thus may result lack of ownership due to lack of incentive and logistic support for sustaining the project.

.On the other hand the distributed types of different multi-purpose forest and fruit tree seedlings will have long term positive impact of sustaining the project outputs as the fruit trees will attract the farmers and positively affects the work nature of the community in ensuring sustainability of the outcome.

The evaluation team has observed that, though the project achieved good progress but it need continuation of the project still, because as observed by the evaluate team, beneficiaries have benefited from this project more and still need empowering to cope with the project outcome..

Analysis/Discussion made

The integrated terminal evaluation team has visited different project sites for some days as per the prepared team tor and had discussion with project manager about future of the project and sustainability of the project. After all, the main discussion had with the project manager was to increase and expand projects thematic areas than only focusing limited sites. Also EECMY-DASSC seeks more funds on emergency parts.

Because currently one the main problem in pastoral /agro-pastoral areas is recurrent drought impacted by ELNINO episodic. That resulted food insecure as result of much below normal rainfall. For instance in terms of emergency the following projects should be considered:

- ✓ Emergency intervention like EWASH
- ✓ Livestock intervention like Emergency vaccination, treatment, livestock feed and
- ✓ Nutrition intervention for vulnerable groups (PLW, under 5, elder groups and chronic illness people). As discussed with the manager those pointed issue is totally excluded in the Filtu Food Security Project/FFSP which is currently faced out and would have been included in the project.

During discussion, those mentioned points raised by the community and government were almost accepted by both parties (The manager and the M&E team) to include the coming next anticipated project due to prolong Elnino impact.

Challenges encountered during evaluation

The evaluation team has come to know the following challenges during monitoring through field visit, KII, FGD and review document:

- ✓ As observed by the monitoring team, starting from 2014-2016, the project is being running by very limited budget less than 6M which was found below the need of the community/targeted groups compared to its thematic areas of the project.
- ✓ The project has also 1 old vehicle that, even unable the monitoring and evaluation couldn't go to hard to reach area like Bander site and used secondary data as a result of logistic constraint and some attractive photos couldn't obtained during that field visit.
- ✓ The project has not employed the FFSP administration officer as indicated in the weakness part of the project, which would enable to manage project staffs and sometime act as project acting in absence of project manager. In addition to this, as observed from the project agreement, the position has already budget line and it's unable to know the reason why that happened?
- ✓ The monitoring team requested to know numbers of the project staffs and their qualifications as well as project inventory, but not yet submitted to the team.

- ✓ Utilized financial document which was backbone for implementation of the project not yet submitted and still waiting from the manager.
- ✓ More/less communication gaps with government sectoral are also another challenges at field level.

Conclusion

The terminal team entitled/ assigned to evaluate this particular project implementing by EECMY-DASSC with collaboration of NLM-E has witnessed/ observed the different sites of the project and observed by the team, the all visited sites activities were accomplished. In the midterm evaluation, the evaluation team has observed most of the activities were ongoing as per the project plan. But in this terminal evaluation the whole activities were accomplished.

Base on the regional agreement, the lifespan of the project was intended to accomplish within 3 years starting from 2014-2016. Interview made with the project stakeholders and government chain department appreciated generally, the importance of the project during its lifespan and has positively impacted good image to the targeted beneficiaries in relation to the following aspects:

- ✓ Different capacity buildings conducted for the agro-pastoralist and woreda agriculture staffs that has enabled to increase the trainees capacities
- ✓ Farmers field visit experience sharing that capacitated agro-pastoralist and government staffs
- ✓ Management of area enclosure is another opportunities for the targeted kebele beneficiaries. The monitoring team knew that dry land agricultural practice become import for the local community.

All in all during monitoring mission, the team has come up with justifiable reason that can contribute the sustainability of the project for future.

Recommendations

- ✓ The evaluation team has recommended EEMY-DASSC, should think beyond implementing limited activities in the area of implementation than targeting very few beneficiaries which does not match the higher need in the community, because as observed the need of the resilient agro-pastoralist community is more than targeted, even though, the initial target has showed good progress compared to the needy people.

- ✓ Livestock part to be included the coming next project if any as 80% of the pastoralist community and agro-pastoralists are driving their main source of income from livestock sale production and productivity, because as observed during evaluation, livestock part was not included in the FFS project as livestock is one of the components of food security.
- ✓ Inclusion of emergency intervention fund though Emergency WASH, livestock Drugs (vaccination/ treatment) and fodder for the pastoralist will have more benefit for those who depend on livestock products as they depend on livestock. The organization should closely work with the line departments and other concern government bodies.
- ✓ The regional M&E team should obey this terminal evaluation report done by multi-sectors from regional and zonal which will in turn has door for signing new project.
- ✓ The monitoring team has also recommended DASSC to participate regular and humanitarian coordination meeting at zonal level at anytime and participate others assessment required by the zonal government at all level, thus would have weight support in terms of seeking fund from the back door and other required support by the Zone and regional government learning lessons from the past.
- ✓ Requested number of the project staffs, project inventory and utilized budget to be submitted to the team.
- ✓ EECMY-DASSC should create more smooth relationship with the government line department and others relevant concerns to implement any active project for future.
- ✓ Clarify project administration officer as indicated in the weakness part which indicated in the project document and was absent from the project staffs
- ✓ EECMy-DASSC requested to continue this project and increase number of beneficiaries and targeted limited sites by expanding and increasing project areas.
- ✓ Nursery sites, seedling distribution, Women seed bank cooperatives, established area enclosure, capacity buildings are all found went well during project lifespan and has to be strengthening more.