

# Evaluation of Yayasan Citra Mandiri Mentawai (YCMM)



Project “*Strengthening the participation of the Mentawai indigenous communities in public policy*”, 2008-2012

Carol Yong and Giorgio Budi Indrarto  
30 August 2013

The evaluation team wishes to acknowledge the assistance received from a large number of individuals and organizations, in particular Lorelou Desjardins and Hege Karsti Ragnhildstveit (RFN), all staff and board members of YCMM in Padang and in the Mentawai Islands, the Mentawai communities and all YCMM stakeholders interviewed.

The views expressed in this report do not necessarily represent those of the RFN, YCMM or any other partner of RFN in Indonesia.

This report is for the Rainforest Foundation Norway  
(RFN)



**Regnskogfondet**  
RAINFOREST FOUNDATION NORWAY



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	6
KEY FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS [Rn.].....	6
1. INTERNAL CAPACITY AND PROCESSES .....	6
1.1. Internal and organizational management .....	6
1.2. YCMM Management and Governing Boards.....	8
1.3. Human resources issues.....	10
1.4. Planning, reporting and monitoring .....	11
1.5. Cooperation between YCMM and external actors .....	11
2. POLICY AND ADVOCACY .....	12
2.1. Campaign against oil palm.....	12
2.2. Advocacy on APBD and strengthening village governments .....	13
2.3. Anti-corruption campaigns .....	14
2.4. Issues in YCMM advocacy and campaign work .....	15
3. YCMM AND AMA-PM .....	16
4. ALTERNATIVE EDUCATION AND CULTURAL IDENTITY.....	17
4.1 Jungle schools ( <i>sekolah hutan</i> ).....	17
4.2 Local curriculum on Mentawai culture .....	17
5. MEDIA WORK .....	19
6. MAIN RESULTS OF YCMM's WORK .....	21
7. GENDER BASELINE ASSESSMENT .....	22

Abbreviations and Acronyms..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

MAIN REPORT .....

1. INTRODUCTION .....

    1.1. Objectives and scope.....

    1.2 Approach and methods .....

    1.3 Challenges and limitations .....

2. KEY FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS .....

    2.1 Internal capacity and processes .....

        2.1.1 Internal and organizational management .....

        2.1.2 YCMM Management and Governing Boards.....

        2.1.3 Human resources issues.....

        2.1.4 Planning, reporting and monitoring .....

        2.1.5 Cooperation between YCMM and external actors .....

    2.2 Policy and Advocacy .....

        2.2.1 Campaign against oil palm.....

        2.2.2. District revenue and budget issues and strengthening village governments.....

2.2.3. Anti-corruption campaigns .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.2.4. YCMM advocacy work and use of internal media .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3 YCMM and AMA-PM .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.1 YCMM and AMA-PM relationship .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.2 YCMM's activities implemented with/for AMA-PM .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.3 Impacts .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4 Alternative education and cultural identity .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.1 Jungle schools ( <i>sekolah hutan</i> ) .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.2 Local curriculum ( <i>muatan lokal</i> ) on Mentawai culture ( <i>Budaya Mentawai</i> , BUMEN) .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.3 Lobbying and policy work on education and Mentawai culture .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5 Media work .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.1 Status of Puailiggoubat and Radio Sura' in YCMM .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.2 Challenges and issues .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.3 Perception of these media .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6 Main results of YCMM'S work .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.1 Main results in external activities .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.2 Internal results and organizational achievements .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.3 Cooperation with external actors (the government, NGO networks, church actors) .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
GENDER BASELINE ASSESSMENT .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
G1. Where YCMM stands on gender issues? .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
G2. Why YCMM should do more on gender issues, and why now? .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Situation 1: .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Situation 2: .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Situation 3: .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
G2.1 Further issues assessed .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
G3. Lessons learned .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
G4. How to go about it? .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
G4.1 Checklist and/or practical actions (how to do gender) ..	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
G4.2 Considerations for RFN .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
G5. Critical gender issues for Mentawai, identified by the evaluator: .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3. RECOMMENDATIONS .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.1 Internal capacity and processes .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.2 Policy and advocacy .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.3 YCMM and AMA-PM .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.4 Alternative education and cultural identity .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.5 Media work .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.6 Main results .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Gender assessment .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
APPENDICES .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>

Appendix 1 - Evaluation Terms of Reference (ToR) ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**  
Appendix 2 - ToR list of guide questions ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**  
Appendix 3 - List of persons and organizations interviewed ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**  
Appendix 4 - Map of fieldwork..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**  
Appendix 5 - Field schedule..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**  
Appendix 6 - Field work in pictures..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This evaluation of the Yayasan Citra Mandiri Mentawai (hereafter, YCMM) covers the period between 1st January 2008 and 31st December, 2012. It has focused on YCMM's project "Strengthening the participation of the Mentawai indigenous communities in public policy", with the financial support of Rainforest Foundation Norway (hereafter, RFN). The project's overall goal is "to promote the involvement of the indigenous people of the Mentawai islands in policy decisions related to political, social and cultural aspects, and that natural resource and forest management is fair and sustainable". The evaluation was conducted by Carol Yong and Giorgio Budi Indrato, using RFN's prescribed terms of reference. It has assessed the effectiveness of YCMM's work in the Mentawai Islands and, in the context of YCMM's wider work, also included its office in Padang and findings of the previous evaluation conducted in 2007.

This evaluation has focused on six main themes as below, and an assessment on gender:

1. Internal capacity and processes
2. Policy and advocacy
3. YCMM and AMA-PM
4. Alternative education and cultural identity
5. Media work
6. Main results of YCMM's work over the project period

Data was collected using a combination of tools including documentary review, interviews with different stakeholders and field visits to Padang and the Mentawai undertaken from 2nd to 26th April, 2013. The evaluation was conducted under challenging environments and unexpected serious flooding especially in Siberut island, which affected the timing and implementation of some village trips and interviews. Nevertheless, both evaluators managed to overcome those difficulties and completed the schedule. Such conditions are part of a range of challenges that YCMM faces in their work with the Mentawai people and RFN staff when they go on field missions to YCMM's focus areas.

Key findings of the evaluation and the recommendations are outlined below.

## **KEY FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS [Rn.]**

### **1. INTERNAL CAPACITY AND PROCESSES**

#### **1.1. Internal and organizational management**

1.1.1. YCMM has a new executive director since 2010. This brought in a new style of leadership and management, experiences, personal skills and priorities. The

organizational structure has been revised twice during the period under review to reflect the internal change in directorship. While accepting the change, staff see the current director more inclined towards office management than field and advocacy work when compared with the former director. This applies most particularly for those in the field. This also applies to those who have started to question about the “non-transparent” budget decisions and the lack of financial resources, dynamic process and response to needs on the ground and field staff issues.

**R1.** The office environment is changing because the internal leadership has been in transition. The board and management should communicate clearly to the staff both in Padang office and the field about the present executive body mandate. Issues and tensions around the office and field contexts that should have been addressed after the 2007 evaluation needs to be revisited to accommodate the new structural changes. Management should take all necessary measures to address them. Such measures should stress the strengthening of synergy and peer learning among all levels of staff.

**R2.** The executive director needs to find ways to communicate clearly to staff the internal policies on managing and solving human resource matters of both the Padang office and field, i.e. hiring and firing staff, salary/honorarium, field budget, gender roles, etc.

**R3.** The executive director could develop a periodic field schedule with clear aims and agenda to increase a sense of the field contexts. This schedule is to be planned in advance and in consultation with the heads of various units/programs and field staff. In doing so this can ensure the visits are seriously considered in the field activities and the field staff have ample time to prepare and, if necessary, inform also the communities.

**R4.** The boards and management need to find ways to address the lack of understanding among some staff about the procedure of making decision on the budget and who has the authority to do so. The financial requirements of RFN grants could be used as a guide.

**R5.** Another strategy for the boards and executive is to seriously consider the feasibility of establishing partnership management of all of the internal branch - office and field, divisions and media, where all the heads are represented in major strategic decisions and in financial management and work systems. It is important for YCMM to be implementing good practices on transparency and accountability at all levels (management, financing, programming, planning, etc), and specifically implementing the obligation from the Freedom of Information Act no. 14/2008/.

1.1.2. External effects of the Indonesian mainstream are increasingly imposed on the islands and putting more pressures on the Mentawai people and YCMM's work. Yet synergy between and across the different components of YCMM's project remains weak. There is also a lack of progress in resolving issues of internal coordination and communications of decisions, programs, staffing, etc. Some of the basic problems faced:

- Uneven distribution of work burden in YCMM with practically only the chair of executive board, executive director and head of policy division dealing with programmatic and management matters.
- The YCMM teams and staff are widely dispersed between Padang and Mentawai, as well as scattered across the islands without easy access to transportation and communication facilities.
- Internal discussions, consultations and meetings (e.g. Strategic Planning) are not solving several issues relating to communication, solidarity and long term vision of YCMM. They are seen as only bringing together staff and Mentawai representatives to make a list of “next project”.

**R6.** The board and executive body should find a way to create a more clear working system to supervise staff performance and the various units/programs. The limitations currently faced by YCMM such as finding qualified staff and limited funding should be kept in mind while developing strategies.

**R7.** Enhancing coordination between Padang and the field requires YCMM to put in place a more systematic updating mechanism from the field. This way the Padang office can get regular updates from the field and vice versa. Sharing information can also stimulate creative ideas through a routine discussion among YCMM staff in Padang and the field.

**R8.** Developing a more coherent internal communications strategy could be a way to ensure all levels of staff participate in planning the core programs/activities in their division.

**R9.** YCMM needs to give greater value and considerations to the findings and recommendations of internal and external evaluations, in their Strategic Planning, management assessments, etc. This is one way to find out about their strengths and weaknesses and find workable solutions to address them. As an example, the 2007 evaluation found that YCMM was depending solely on RFN for its funding. Although the working relationship with RFN is very positive, the 2007 evaluation had raised concerns and recommended that YCMM explore alternative donors to diversify its funding pool. This present evaluation reiterates that YCMM needs to actively and creatively seek other sources of funding. Any future extra funding from sources other than RFN not only helps YCMM to be more independent but also to meet the organization and program needs that fall outside of RFN’s scope of work or priorities. Thus evaluations do give YCMM important inputs to improve and develop the organization in the future (see also R28).

## 1.2. YCMM Management and Governing Boards

1.2.1. The overall structure of the Board is not operating fully. Not all board members are participating in meetings, making decisions or advising the executive and staff. This can be seen as lack of objectivity in conducting the board’s role. This can also create confusion in the executive branch of YCMM when there is no consensus on board decisions.



**R10.** The power balance and participatory decision-making process in the board should be enhanced to build up trust and understanding between the executive branch and board. Some of the ways for the board to achieve this:

- Build an increasing sense of self-improvement in conducting one's role.
- Critically review the power and position of each member internally.
- Proactively communicate through Skype, telephone, email, facebook, etc. when face-to-face meeting is not possible.
- Build in processes to ensure power balance and decision-making is conducted in the manner of collective collegian spirit.

**R11.** Board members need to identify and assess one's own strengths, weaknesses and potentials on gender issues. This will be for addressing the longer-term strategic needs for board participation and leadership in supporting YCMM to be more gender inclusive.

1.2.2. Currently there is no field staff representative sitting in the meetings of the Boards and executive branch. Strengths and weaknesses in coordination between management and field staff cannot be evaluated to identify potential areas of improvement.

**R12.** Management need to find ways to co-opt key field staff into management meetings whenever there is a need to obtain their input and analysis on field staff and issues. Specific efforts are needed to support this process, e.g. fixing the meeting date in advance to enable the field staff concerned to collect data and organize their travel plans ahead.

1.2.3. There are questions on internal administration and management of financial systems and finance-related issues from some field staff and communities about budgets, financial allocation, allowances (logistic, food, honorarium) for staff and communities, staff contracts, costs, expenses and income from other sources, e.g. sales of Puailiggoubat.

**R13.** Advocating for better internal administration of finances, financial reports and project budget management requires the boards and executive branch to work together. They should have a coordinated but independent oversight of finance-related issues.

**R14.** Organizational development should be part of the process towards developing a more professional and consistent approach to managing internal issues and finances. A different process and approach would be needed for issues and situation of the field staff and communities.

**R15.** YCMM should practise its obligation as a public body to provide basic information to the public, i.e. all the public reports including financial reports that are mandated by the law (FOIA, see R5). They could be in print or as a soft copy available from the YCMM website.

### 1.3. Human resources issues

1.3.1. One key issue of human resources is the relatively small pool of staff in YCMM (only 23 persons, office and field staff, during the period under review). They work with selected Mentawai communities sparsely spread across the Mentawai islands and with a range of stakeholders in Padang and in the field. This is a reason why YCMM cannot expand quickly, geographically and programmatically. The boards and executive have pursued efforts to find more people to address this situation. More work still needs to be done to find the “right people” with a sense of activism.

**R16.** There is a need for clearer job desks. This will serve as a guideline in choosing individuals who are best suited to perform the required tasks for the project needs. The Standard Operational Procedure (S.O.P) can set out clearer job specifications for each staff. The management and executive need to make provisions to review and revise the S.O.P as recommended in the 2007 evaluation report and in this present evaluation.

**R17.** YCMM needs to think about how to gradually increase the capacity of management and staff to understand the basic concepts of gender and integrating gender into the organization and all of its work. As an example, including gender training and capacity development to build up staff gender awareness and sensitivity. This is essential to ensuring they have the basic skills to carry out a gender analysis and collect gender data, understand power relations between women and men in the community or program context, understand gender impacts of processes of development, etc. in future projects.

**R18.** To keep track of ensuring gender balance in YCMM, keep a record of staff recruited, deployed, dismissed or resigned, by program and gender, for mid and final project periods.

1.3.2. Management decisions on human resource tend to focus on daily routines and administration issues. Strategic management of human resources is lacking, i.e. scouting new talents, building second line leaders, developing staff career or work motivation, etc. Feedback from some external stakeholders is that YCMM is losing its fighting spirits due to the problem of inadequacy of salary and human resources.

**R19.** YCMM can improve the situation by reviewing all the office and field staff regarding their passion in YCMM. Then follow up systematically by an experienced management person to supervise and nurture their development from time to time. This will encourage staff themselves to find out the work they like best and acquire competence in that area.

**R20.** Action plan, key indicators and monitoring in a timely manner need to be implemented, with external technical assistance if necessary, to develop a good working system and a passionate working environment. Findings from this evaluation could be a starting point to reflect and create a clear step-by-step organizational development plan.

**R21.** The boards and management will need to re-evaluate the salary gird in order to retain good staff and to attract people with potentials to join the organization.

1.3.3. Expectation of YCMM from all sides is very high, stretching the workload of staff and financial resources. Yet positioning of the suitable person in the “right place or job” is rarely maximized effectively. In practice, the system is not so easy for staff to choose the “right job” they want. Staff positions are fixed by the executive in consultation with the Board.

**R22.** Management may need to provide some clear direction and guidelines to enable program coordinators to take on some managerial roles. This will help to redistribute the work burden of the executive body.

**R23.** Ask staff to do self and peer assessments to identify the passion, willingness, characteristic and suitability of each one in YCMM. This will help staff to match their personal goals, talents, skills and experience with organizational goals and needs.

**R24.** It would be important to have an internal system to create a supportive environment for cross-cutting issues to be integrated across divisions. This will provide staff with opportunities to learn from each other and to make decisions collectively.

#### 1.4. Planning, reporting and monitoring

1.4.1. Poor communication and transport networks, high costs and weather conditions pose serious challenges to enable reliable connections between Padang and Mentawai. This can create difficulties in supervising and receiving reports between the field and Padang office. This can also hamper fieldwork and monitoring progress in the field.

**R25.** To overcome these difficulties, alternative ways of managing communications and information base have to be developed, such as:

- Developing more systematic updating mechanisms from the field to deliver regular updates to the office.
- Monitoring periodic field progress through coordinated field missions by the director, unit/program coordinators, Puailiggoubat reporters from Padang and RFN staff.
- Channeling creative ideas flow among and between staff through staff meetings, periodic reviews and pre-planned events both in Padang and in the Mentawai.
- Having an officer in the field (on each island) focusing on supervision and reporting could be an advantage to overcome the issue of delays on the report and updates.
- Future planning, programming, reporting and monitoring should address gender issues. This is currently lacking or missing in existing plans and project activities.

#### 1.5. Cooperation between YCMM and external actors

1.5.1. YCMM maintains strong networks with various non-governmental organizations, church organizations, etc., in particular with policy and advocacy networks in Padang such as WALHI, Qbar and Legal Aid Bureau (LBH). These network partners have high regard and respect for the quality of YCMM’s work. YCMM has consistently worked in

Mentawai to build trust-based relationships with the Mentawai communities. However, there are two aspects that are seen as relatively weak in YCMM:

- the lack of emphasis on gender issues
- too focused on Mentawai general issues only, neglecting recent issues such as the destruction of natural and coastal ecosystems or raising sea water level

**R26.** YCMM needs to take stock of their current networking strategies to see how some of the gender needs on the ground could be strengthened.

**R27.** YCMM also needs to know what is the scope for developing gender as a cross-cutting theme in its future work plans and programs. Subsequently, it needs to gradually develop its own gender strategies and staff capacity. This is because gender is a long term commitment. Specific donors and funds need to be found to support these processes.

**R28.** YCMM needs to be clear if it wants to deal with issues linked to oceans or corals and find other sources of funding as such projects are not within the scope of RFN funding. That means YCMM should give serious consideration to determining how to work with its network partners or other Indonesian NGOs to create their own strategies, ideology of funding and opportunities for new sources of funding. This will allow YCMM and its network partners to work based on the needs of the community and urgency of an issue rather than programs based on the availability of funding. But the current practice of YCMM is that it is dependent fully on RFN funding only.

## **2. POLICY AND ADVOCACY**

### **2.1. Campaign against oil palm**

2.1.1. The anti-oil palm campaigns through YCMM workshops have created awareness among the Mentawai people about the threats of oil palm companies. Mentawai communities in potential sites of the plantations have mobilized themselves against the opening of these plantations on their lands, e.g. initiating their own signature campaigns and petitions to governments. After 2011, YCMM field support in this area was reduced. Staff have stopped visiting the communities or providing inputs and further trainings.

**R29.** The oil palm companies are still trying to incite some villages to accept the plantations. It is vital that YCMM continue with the anti oil palm campaign activities at the village level. This would involve strengthening its cooperation with NGO networks working around these issues, e.g. Sawit Watch in Indonesia and/or RFN other local partners.

**R30.** YCMM's advocacy and campaign strategies need to go beyond awareness raising on the effects of oil palm. Most particularly on consolidating efforts to focus on lobbying the district and national policy makers and executive members. This is aimed to strengthen engagement with government actors in positions of power.

2.1.2. More conscious efforts should be taken to integrate gender issues in the campaign strategies and messages, which is currently not visible.

**R31.** There is a need to be gender inclusive in the planning and implementing campaigns, using culturally appropriate approaches to discuss the issues and raise their awareness level as well as enabling more women to join field visits to areas to meet with other communities affected by oil palm plantations.

2.1.3. The anti oil palm campaigns are launched without a full internal discussion in YCMM about the issue. The oil palm activities are not part of a programmatic based activity. YCMM took some ad hoc advocacy steps when the companies started to encroach into Mentawai. As an activity based on a reaction, the campaign can be considered a success. YCMM achieved the goal of withholding the issuance of new permit and getting a commitment from the *Bupati* not to issue another palm oil license. However, there is no longer term strategies to counter oil palm threats in Mentawai.

**R32.** It is vital that YCMM continue with its palm oil advocacy work. If there is no policy intervention on this issue (oil palm industry), there is a big possibility that the oil palm industry will invade in the future. It is critical to create a development option, particularly a concrete economical strategy to the local government to get a legal basis for it.

**R33.** YCMM should build on its unique relationship with the *Bupati* and *Wakil Bupati* - both of them are former YCMM activists in the early days of YCMM. In the context of advocacy, this will enable YCMM to optimize a big advocacy potential to stop the oil palm companies in Mentawai.

**R34.** Advocacy work with local communities and partners have to be maintained. At the same time, the campaigns could be strengthened by broadening the advocacy at national and international levels to create greater pressures on the government and companies.

## 2.2. Advocacy on APBD and strengthening village governments

2.2.1. The advocacy campaigns on district revenue and budget (APBD) and strengthening village governments (*Pemerintahan Desa*) have not been optimized in several villages. YCMM has no systematic approach. It does only one event one time in some villages but does not continue in other villages. Now YCMM only does monitoring to ensure that allocation from the central government is fairly distributed and used, particularly for agriculture. With more Mentawaian growing cash crops like cocoa and rubber, advocacy work on APBD is quite urgent to ensure transparency of financial flows. There is also a new budget scheme, the *Alokasi Dana Desa* (ADD).

**R35.** It is vital that YCMM conducts more systematic and comprehensive activities in their village to assist the village officials regarding the APBD and ADD budget schemes. The campaign has been effective in building community awareness where YCMM intervened. Continuing this work is important to control misuse of agricultural development funds and subsidy allocation for rural communities. It also provides check-and-balance on abuses or violation of basic human rights.

2.2.2. The campaigns have not been so successful in changing bureaucratic behaviors both at the agency level and project level. YCMM lacks a systematic long term and strategic approach for this advocacy. This includes the lack of effective use of the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) in this overall advocacy.

**R36.** Continuation of assisting the villages on the issues of APBD and *pemerintahan desa* needs to be strategized comprehensively. Strategic steps of what is the goal and target of this advocacy in the long, middle and short terms need to be in place. As an example, creating alternative scenarios and proposing them to the district government, starting from the low level bureaucrats.

**R37.** YCMM needs to use the FOIA more effectively for the *pemerintahan desa* advocacy. The villagers need to have a strong understanding of their rights to public information. There is still no significant advocacy on the transparency issue in Mentawai. YCMM should focus on creating a policy intervention to implement the FOIA at the local level.

2.2.3. Village politics may need some attention from a third party because assistance given by villagers is considered not objective. The communities hope YCMM can facilitate or assist the village officials and village communities in their planning and implementation.

**R38.** This role could be filled by YCMM through assisting the village officials in the job division (*tugas pokok dan fungsi*) of each village officials and ensure that there is no overlap and contradictions in their function.

**R39.** YCMM can train some key community members to monitor and ensure that the procurement contracts are awarded via open and competitive tenders or the allocation channeled to the rightful beneficiaries as budgeted for. This could be done by providing them with a checklist to make a report card on the officials.

## 2.3. Anti-corruption campaigns

2.3.1. YCMM's role in tracking corrupt practices has exposed a number of high profile corruption cases at the local, sub-district and district levels. Such news are published in Puailiggoubat and distributed around the Mentawai islands. This can sometimes make the government agencies or officials targeted view Puailiggoubat in bad light. This can also result in tensions between YCMM and the local government.

**R40.** If YCMM wants to move towards a more collaborative work (including policy works) with the government in future, then it has to decide on a strategic level the relationship between the organization and the media. The question is: Should YCMM use the media for campaigning and strategic purposes, or should the media have a life of their own? This re-positioning should be seriously considered by the management. It can help to address the issue of building trust between the government and YCMM when the status of the media and YCMM is clearer.



## 2.4. Issues in YCMM advocacy and campaign work

### 2.4.1. Strategies and approach:

**R41.** To further increase the effectiveness of the policy and advocacy work, YCMM should find ways to form strategic links with lawyers or legal organizations. YCMM can bring lawyers into contact with Mentawai communities to assess developments on the ground as an input into planning future actions. [YCMM played an important role in bridging lawyers with communities to use legal means to resolve land conflicts such as in Rogdok and against illegal logging issues, as noted in the 2007 evaluation report.]

**R42.** YCMM can learn from previous experiences in formulating legal strategies for campaigns and policy advocacy. This has learning potential, especially to bridge the communication for new staff in YCMM or potential new generation of YCMM staff. To date the learning process is not yet being written down (documented).

**R43.** The advocacy approach needs to be repackaged to communicate effectively and persuasively to policy makers, decision makers and local authorities. Specifically, YCMM needs to adapt from hard line to be more collaborative. It also needs to understand the bureaucratic process and protocols to follow.

**R44.** There is a need for YCMM to be more gender inclusive in the approaches and strategies of the policy and advocacy work (see also Section on Gender Assessment).

### 2.4.2. Human resources in the policy and advocacy division:

**R45.** This division currently has only one person, who is also the division head. YCMM should give a greater priority to this problem. It should make some efforts to increase the number of people or train new people to strengthen the division.

**R46.** YCMM is not optimizing the potential of Mentawai students studying in Padang. YCMM should look for ways to engage with the students in a more systematic and consistent way such as in discussions or other activities. This can help to stimulate critical thinking of Mentawai students to be interested in YCMM. This can also help YCMM address the lack of qualified human resources.

### 2.4.3. Use of YCMM's media in advocacy and campaign works:

**R47.** Some concrete improvements will be needed to coordinate the different campaigns and advocacy works using Radio Sura' and Puailiggoubat. Highlighting the campaign gains and community actions should be reinforced. Currently the results and achievements are not shared to both media for reporting. Effective use of the media can help to strengthen the communities to push for legal and policy reforms on Mentawai issues.

**R48.** When evaluating the relation between the media and advocacy/campaign, YCMM needs to re-strategize the media positioning in the overall advocacy work. The media should be seen as a part of advocacy work and becoming two of the pillars of the

organization. In the future they could sustain YCMM when they grow bigger since they have a big opportunity to generate income from commercial, advertorial, etc.

**R49.** The idea of separating the media works from YCMM works has already started in some of the annual meetings. But operationalizing the idea remains vague. Issues such as the media's initial modal and sustaining their business in longer term. A probable solution could be YCMM regularly "buying" news slots from the media to provide the media with a regular "customer". The implementation of this idea is a big decision and needs to be further discussed in the future project period (2013-1017).

### **3. YCMM AND AMA-PM**

3.1 YCMM's role in the Mentawai Islands is vital. This is a region where many other organizations are afraid to enter because of the many challenges: geographical remoteness, extreme weather conditions, unreliable boat schedules, high transportation costs and limited communications access. YCMM has made great progress in strengthening the capacity of local communities. This work is largely through collaboration with the Mentawai organization, *Aliansi Masyarakat Adat Peduli Mentawai* (AMA-PM) which YCMM helped to establish in 2002. The Padang office management did not include AMA-PM as a major component in their new 5-year program (2013-2017) to RFN. They want AMA-PM to become more independent and to strengthen themselves with grassroots network like AMAN Mentawai, formed in 2010. YCMM will still work together with AMA-PM (in the future will be AMAN Mentawai). But a communication issue between AMA-PM members had led to a misunderstanding that YCMM is leaving AMA-PM behind.

**R50.** The relationship between YCMM and AMA-PM is changing because YCMM is adjusting to a new working scheme with AMA-PM. It is vital that the management clarify to YCMM staff and communities all the issues clearly relating to AMA-PM.

**R51.** It is also vital that the Padang office management explain clearly to AMA-PM why it wasn't included as a major component in its 2013-2017 proposal to RFN.

**R52.** YCMM management should consider having a stop-gap exit strategy in place while phasing out moral and financial support for AMA-PM. For example, providing logistical support, if not financial, to AMA-PM committee to organize a final meeting among themselves to sort themselves out and to position themselves with AMAN Mentawai.

3.2. A consensus output from the last congress of AMAN and the AMA-PM congress in 2012 was that AMA-PM should be transformed into AMAN Mentawai. This proposed collaboration scheme needs to be understood by all members of both organizations.

**R53.** YCMM should continue to foster linkages with AMA-PM for some time to make sure they get the big picture of the status of AMA-PM and AMAN Mentawai in future.



**R54.** YCMM should start thinking about facilitating/bridging the process of AMA-PM and AMAN Mentawai merger. This can ensure that its own strategies for community organizing and capacity building are appropriate for future collaboration with them.

**R55.** An important future role for YCMM is to build capacity of AMAN Mentawai management to become an accountable alliance. This will provide YCMM with a base to continue working with the communities in Mentawai through their grassroots organizations.

## **4. ALTERNATIVE EDUCATION AND CULTURAL IDENTITY**

### **4.1 Jungle schools (*sekolah hutan*)**

4.1.1. YCMM's jungle schools in the villagers of Magosi and Tinambo have produced fairly good results. In 2012, 7 girls and 4 boys entered a government elementary school in Siberut sub-district. However, the leap from the jungle setting to a town school is a culture shock, especially for the girls. They are also teased and bullied by some non-Mentawai students. This, in addition to coping with the strict rules and regulations in the formal school, is increasing their sense of insecurity. The jungle school's approach is more appropriate with cultural and local conditions, i.e. flexible hours to suit home and field needs, less bureaucratic teaching and learning methods, use of Mentawai language, etc.

**R56.** To prepare future Mentawai students, YCMM and the Mentawai communities should involve the school authorities and teachers to assess the situation and emerging issues and ensuring the school promotes a safe environment for Mentawai girls and boys.

**R57.** YCMM needs to seek support of the school and education authorities to address educational matters concerning Mentawai students. Monitor and evaluate institutional arrangements and identify ways to address the longer-term needs of Mentawai students entering the formal school system. An example is expanding the terms of the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) signed in December 2012 between YCMM and SDN16 Saliguma. The MoU as it is now is largely about administrative matters on admission of jungle school pupils into formal schools.

### **4.2 Local curriculum on Mentawai culture**

4.2.1. The local curriculum (*muatan lokal*) on Mentawai culture is developed by YCMM together with the Mentawai communities and the sub-districts Education Departments. After more than 10 years of consistent lobbying by YCMM, the local curriculum is now integrated as a teaching subject in 38 out of 46 Siberut sub-district level elementary schools. This is an important advocacy work to strengthen Mentawai language and culture. However, the Mentawai Regency government has not authorized the

mainstreaming of this local curriculum in all the district level schools. This is delaying the adoption and implementation of the curriculum in other areas and schools.

**R58.** An immediate priority is for YCMM to intensify communications with the *Bupati* and district level authorities/institutions to hasten the formal adoption of the local curriculum at district level. This will ensure an entry point for future lobbying and advocacy work on pushing for the adoption of a nation-wide curriculum on Mentawai culture.

**R59.** The schools and teachers aspire to implement the local curriculum effectively. It is vital that YCMM follow up with the sub-district schools and teachers to lead on the contents, means of delivery, best practice on applying the curriculum, etc.

**R60.** The curriculum is currently for students in Grades 4-6 only. YCMM could consult with the education authorities and schools about introducing it to children from Class 1.

4.2.2. Resource materials to supplement the curriculum is lacking, with only two books on Mentawai culture produced by YCMM given to the teachers as teaching aid.

**R61.** YCMM can use information and data from the field to provide new knowledge and fresh insights to the teachers on Mentawai culture.

**R62.** YCMM should aim at producing more practical books and audio-visuals on Mentawai culture as resources for the teachers and students. [Indonesia will be guest-country at the Frankfurter Buchmesse 2015. The organizers of this book fair specifically speak about the rich oral literature tradition of Indonesia. YCMM could try to find publishers for German translations of the Mentawai books they produced especially on Mentawai oral history and mythology, and request for proceeds of the German version publications to go to YCMM.]

4.2.3. The latest development is that the Magosi jungle school, at the *Bupati's* instructions will be affiliated with SDN12 Muntei in Siberut Selatan sub-district. At the time of the evaluation (April 2013) this issue is still in the infant stage of discussions between the school authorities, communities and YCMM.

**R63.** An immediate priority is for YCMM internally to set up a team of people to liaise with the Mentawai communities and the jungle school students and teachers. They need to gather information and work on how to respond to the proposed affiliation. Issues to seek answers include the implications to the communities if the jungle school is operated under a new model, the challenges in implementing the proposal, what the problems and advantages could be in the long run, etc.

**R64.** YCMM needs to ensure that the government and school authorities include the YCMM and the Mentawai communities in the discussions and decision-making processes. Effective and strategic lobbying by YCMM will help to ensure that education policies and decisions will empower the Mentawai communities. It is not to assimilate them into the mainstream without their free and prior informed consent (FPIC).

4.2.4. The national curriculum will be changed sometimes in 2013. This can influence the overall education system including the curriculum, modules and syllabus at all levels.

**R65.** YCMM needs to monitor and ensure that the local curriculum on Mentawai culture is included in the new curriculum. YCMM should work with colleagues in the policy and advocacy division to strengthen lobbying and policy work on education.

## **5. MEDIA WORK**

5.1. The media work of YCMM has proven to be successful and impacting the Mentawai public. At the organizational level, a crucial internal issue that needs to be tackled is the communication between the radio-newspaper-YCMM office. Sometimes good work go totally wrong because of communication failure and also an effective communication protocol is missing. So far no effective solution is being developed to deal with communication failure between all of the internal divisions, i.e. both the office and the media. There is also a lack of a clear policy on harmonization of the media with the main programs of YCMM. Coordination between the leadership of the newspaper and radio has been improving but the practice of sharing resources, news and lessons learned between the two media can be further improved.

**R66.** This issue needs to be prioritized and addressed by implementing a comprehensive communication protocol and the process is to be monitored to ensure it is effective.

**R67.** The relationship between Puailiggoubat and Radio Sura' Mentawai needs to improve. They should work closely together on developing news and exchanging information. They should complement and not compete with each other.

**R68.** To be considered as professional media and value for money, there is a need for both media to deliver results or outputs of high quality to meet the minimum standard. Importantly, the radio and newspaper reporters need to be more professional in their work. This can be improved through specific skills upgrading and capacity building, e.g. critical thinking, investigative reporting, issue analysis, media development, etc.

**R69.** Puailiggoubat needs to develop an information system (database) to assess and monitor its readership and circulation, which should be updated on regular basis, i.e. profile of readers, subscribers, advertisers and distribution outlets. The online version also needs to be updated to ensure information are current and timely. This is because internet is becoming a popular source of information for those with access to the facilities.

5.2. Communication is also an important issue with the external actors, particularly government officials. Several government officials are seeing YCMM and Puailiggoubat as one entity. This can make them tense because of the critical stance of Puailiggoubat in reporting about the government. Yet YCMM needs to start working together with the government, but the government is often suspicious when working with YCMM.

**R70.** To build understanding in working with government officials, it is necessary for the radio, newspaper and YCMM office to develop a clearer structure for themselves. This includes defining their respective roles and management systems to avoid being confused or seen as one entity. This will also facilitate collaboration between the radio-newspaper-YCMM office and the government in sync with each other's own terms and needs.

**R71.** YCMM needs to strategize clearer steps in creating a strong and independent media and also a strong and advanced NGO network. An example is clarifying the media position within all of YCMM's works. That is, working from outside the YCMM structure and independently, but can be considered as a strategic media partner for YCMM.

5.3. The organizational and operational work of both the radio and newspaper will not be implemented adequately in the field unless minimal resources (funds, human resources) can be gathered. In order to become a truly professional media, they must build up a good organizational culture and financial management. This means producing committed staff/crew and managing funds professionally.

**R72.** Having an experienced and skilled manager to prepare all the calculations to bring the media to a professional standard is needed. Linkages among and between all the levels (office and media) have to be developed according to clear standards and guidelines for administration, reporting and monitoring.

**R73.** Both media need to formulate policies and standard operating procedures that will improve their work system and operations. It is vital to provide staff/crew with clear standards and guidelines for their work and for good institutional management. These include rewards/punishments, compensation, promotions and other human resource matters. The S.O.P. needs to be reviewed and revised for this purpose.

5.4. A main challenge for both media is the issue of funding. They realized that they cannot rely solely on YCMM main funding support. Some efforts to generate income, e.g. from advertisements provided some incentives. The radio has already proven that it can find technical assistance outside of YCMM main funding support. In 2010, the 1-year technical support from *Surf Aid* enabled it to buy some radio equipments. This was followed by cooperation work with the local disaster management agency (BPBD) to build an early warning mechanism throughout Mentawai, although the focus is only on Tuapejat.

**R74.** There is potential for both media to do more fund raising and be financially more self-sufficient. For example, Puailiggoubat can get more advertisements, and sell more copies, if the number of copies are increased and the distribution network is strategically targeted.

**R75.** Another important ground work is to develop their own strategies and mechanisms that would enable them to organize themselves and build adequate implementing capacity. They need to develop a clear marketing strategy with concrete targets. An example is setting up the two media to become YCMM official media partners.

Improving the marketing skills for these media to create a stabilized market in Mentawai is needed. With this step, the media could become more professional and independent. YCMM will then become their “regular customer.” With proper planning, this step could create confidence in YCMM and both media to turn an idea into reality.

## 6. MAIN RESULTS OF YCMM’s WORK

YCMM’s existence and presence in Mentawai has contributed to significant progress of the Mentawai people there as well as numerous positive outcomes in local governance issues, Mentawai cultural identity and democratization. YCMM was an active and vital player in the process towards the creation of the Mentawai Regency in 1999. This justifies why the presence of YCMM in the Mentawai islands is appreciated, even until today. Some major strengths and successes of YCMM’s work during the project period 2008-2012 in terms of external activities, internally in the organization, and cooperation with external actors (the government, NGO networks, church actors, etc.) are summarised below.

6.1. YCMM continues to play a vital role in supporting the participation of especially Mentawai people from the villages to be considered in local government processes, development projects and programs and leadership positions. Successes include the government recognition of AMA-PM leaders and their appointments as village heads, Village Representative Committee Members and village governments. In the run-up to the 2014 presidential elections, YCMM will continue to intensify and strengthen key areas of work in political lobbying and campaigning to influence those in power.

6.2. YCMM’s campaigns, advocacy and lobbying works on raising awareness among the Mentawai people about the threats of oil palm companies, on the district revenue and budget (APBD), on strengthening village governments and on anti-corruption have achieved various successes. A concrete example is how some of the villages in Sipora are changing their perspectives on palm oil industry after YCMM conducted several workshops. Another example is that two oil palm licenses were canceled in June 2012 because of their lobby work on the *Bupati*.

6.3. Another significant success is the two jungle schools in Magosi and Tinambo villages have been recognized by the government especially the Education Department branches in the Mentawai sub-districts of Siberut and Sikakap. The Mentawai culture local curriculum (*muatan lokal BUMEN*) has also been adopted in 38 formal elementary schools in Siberut and over a dozen jungle school students have gained admission into a formal state elementary school in Siberut.

6.4 YCMM is continuously building and consolidating its knowledge base and experience on understanding the difficult terrains of Mentawai islands and issues in the Mentawai. This reflects that YCMM’s work is firmly rooted at grassroots level, including efforts to support the Mentawai communities and their indigenous organizations such as AMA-PM and AMAN Mentawai.

6.5 YCMM continues to produce high quality documentation of issues and situation in Mentawai, including Puailiggoubat, books and audio-visual materials. These media are

particularly important for educational and awareness raising in remote areas where Mentawai communities have very limited access to information and communication.

6.6. YCMM has built and strengthened networks and collaboration at local, sub-district and district levels in lobbying and campaign works, education, community organizing, etc. with a range of stakeholders, including the government, NGO networks, church actors, media, academics and other professional bodies (e.g. lawyers).

**R76.** YCMM's role and work in facilitating the empowerment of the Mentawai local communities is still highly relevant and needed. Thus YCMM should continue the good work through its programs, activities and networks, but most importantly, YCMM's small but highly dedicated staff both in the Padang office and in the field.

**R77.** YCMM's grounding in the Mentawai peoples' experiences, issues and challenges - one reason is because of its consistent and long-standing experience there - is definitely a great asset and strength. So YCMM should continue its efforts to work at the grassroots levels with the communities. At the same time, YCMM should continue strengthening cooperation and direct intervention in governmental policies to ensure they benefit the Mentawai people, especially now with the strong moral and historic ties between YCMM and the current Mentawai *Bupati* and Wakil *Bupati*.

## 7. GENDER BASELINE ASSESSMENT

7.1. YCMM has a weak gender balance in the board and no resources have been allocated for gender-equality specific actions in all previous project cycles. Crucial aspects and causes of gender inequality have not been sufficiently addressed in the communities and in the organization, limiting the potential of its projects and activities to contribute to achieving the goals of gender equality and rights of both Mentawai women and men.

**R78.** Gender awareness should be emphasized in all aspects of YCMM's work and in the project cycle management from project identification/formulation, planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. The broad framework on this:

- Project identification/formulation: carry out a gender analysis to identify the priority issues, gender relations, control and access to resources, decision-making and impacts of the processes of development or program context.
- Planning: formulate project objectives (general and specific) based on gendered information from gender analysis, incorporate gender issues into programming.
- Implementation: Put gender mainstreaming in practice, e.g. implementing activities that are gender-sensitive, with expected outcomes and impacts differentiated by gender as cross-cutting theme.
- Monitoring and evaluation: Gender should be included in ToR for all assessments and evaluation. Ensure that monitoring and evaluation frameworks measure program output and outcome using indicators that are gender-sensitive.

**R79.** Ensure both women and men in the organization and the communities are part of project design to help develop the gender perspective of projects using local cultural

ways which can avoid creating gender divisions/tensions in the family, community and YCMM.

**R80.** For the longer term gender strategy, RFN should emphasize that YCMM address the absence of its consideration of gender issues in future work plans, budgets, project implementation, monitoring and evaluation procedures and reports. This is to ensure that YCMM take gender issues seriously. They can start with collecting and incorporating gender-disaggregated data, using available/existing gender methods and tools already generated and, possibly later, they can develop their own gender tools, data and indicators relevant to their own context.