

MID-TERM REVIEW OF NORWEGIAN CHURCH AID'S INTEGRATED DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME IN NUBA MOUNTAINS



OCTOBER 2010

Evaluation Team

Mr. Joseph Gathogo Ngugi

Mr. Fudolalla A. Gadir Abukindi

Mr. Mahdi Anur Daud

- External Consultant/ Team Leader

- SRRC/HAC

- NRRDO

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Background	1
1.2 Project Goal and Specific Objectives	1
1.3. Mid-Term Review	1
1.4. Review Team	2
1.5. Approach and Methodology.....	2
1.6. 0 A Summary and Brief Assessment of the Overall Impact of the NCA Presence in the Nuba Mountains and the Implemented Projects.	3
1.6.3. Other funded projects (CHF)	5
1.7 Recommendations on specific components.	5
1.7.1. NCA's relationship with local authorities and local partners and the program's impact on partner organizational and institutional capacity.....	6
1.7.2. The current political situation and possible changes over the coming.....	6
1.7.3. NCA's own capacity to make meaningful contribution through the project	7
1.7.4. Review of the different components of the ongoing programme	8
CHAPTER ONE	11
1.0 NORWEGIAN CHURCH AID SUDAN PROGRAM	11
1.1 Introduction.....	11
1.2 Problems addressed	12
CHAPTER TWO	14
2.0 PURPOSE, SCOPE AND PROCESS OF THE REVIEW.	14
2.1. Purpose	14
2.3. Review process and approach	15
CHAPTER THREE	16
3.0 THE REVIEW FINDINGS	16
(Part 1 of the TOR)	16
3.1 Overview.....	16
3.1.1 Recommendations.....	17
3.2 Review of the progress of the various components	17
3.2.1 Education	17
3.2.3 Hiv/Aids	20
3.2.4 Water and Sanitation	20
3.2.5 Environment	21
3.2.6 Peace Building	22
3.2.7 Gender.....	23
3.4 Objective Two of the TOR	25
3.4.0. Assessing the Project's Impact on the Right Holders in the Targeted Area	25
3.4.1 Introduction.....	25
3.4.4 Evaluation of the project components	29
3.4.4.1 Education.....	30
3.4.4. 3 HIV/AIDS.....	32
3.4.4.6 Peace Building	36
3.4.4.7 Gender.....	37
3.5 OBJECTIVE THREE OF THE TOR	38
Assessing how the Other Funded Projects (CHF) NCA is Implementing in the Nuba Mountains is Supporting the Goal and Overall Objectives of the MFA Funded Project	38
3.5.1 Introduction.....	38
CHAPTER FOUR	41
4.0 REVIEW FINDINGS	41
(Part 3 of the TOR)	41
4.1 A REVIEW OF NCA'S RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND LOCAL PARTNERS AND THE PROGRAMMS IMPACT ON PARTNERS AND LOCAL AUTHORITIES' ORGANIZATIONAL AND INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITIES	41
4.1.2 NCA Working Relationship with the Local Government.	42
4.1.3. Working with Other Partners.	42

4.2.1 Introduction and background	43
4.2.2 Current political situation	44
4.3 A REVIEW OF NCA'S OWN CAPACITY TO MAKE MEANINGFUL CONTRIBUTION TO THE CRITICALLY NEEDED SOCIAL SERVICES THAT WOULD IMPROVE THE HUMAN DIGNITY OF THE PEOPLE WHO HAVE BEEN MARGINALIZED FOR FAR TOO LONG AND SUGGEST POSSIBLE CHANGES IN THE ORGANISATIONAL SETUP OR STAFFING OF THE PROGRAM	45
4.3.1 Introduction.....	45
4.3.2 NCA in Nuba Mountains.....	45
4.2.3 Organizational setup.....	46
4.4 REVIEW THE DIFFERENT COMPONENTS OF THE ONGOING PROGRAMME (EDUCATION,HEALTH, HIV & AIDS,WATER AND SANITATION, RESETTLEMENT AND CROSS CUTTING ACTIVITIES) AND PROPOSE ANY CHANGES IN THE PROGRAMMES THAT ARE CONSIDERED JUSTIFIED BASED ON IMMEDIATE NEEDS, RSOURCES AVAILABLE AND A MORE LONG TERM DEVELOPMENT IMPACT.	48
4.4.1 Introduction.....	48
4.4.2 Education	48
4.4.3 Health.....	49
4.4.4 HIV and AIDS.....	50
4.4.4 Water and Sanitation.....	50
4.4.5 Resettlement.....	51
4.4.5 Cross cutting issues.	52
APPENDIX 1: Background information to the proposal submitted in 2008 to MFA.....	53
APPENDIX 2A:Review plan: programme of meetings and consultations with stakeholder.....	57
APPENDIX 2B: List of people met during the mission.....	58
APPENDIX 3: Speech from a head teacher (Kauda Model School).....	60
APPENDIX 4: Tangal Community meeting with review team and NCA staff	61
APPENDIX 5: Report on Stakeholders Forum Held on 14th October 2010 at NCA Compound, Kauda	61
APPENDIX 6: Some background data on Nuba Mountains.....	66
APPENDIX 7: List of NCA partners in the Nuba Mountains.....	69
APPENDIX 8: Questionnaires to NCA staff and partners.....	70
APPENDIX 9: Terms of Reference for consultant	73

MID-TERM REVIEW OF NCA'S INTEGRATED DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME IN NUBA MOUNTAINS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Background

Nuba Mountains is located in South Kordofan in the central western part of Sudan. The area is characterized by a range of mountains, which are inhabited by semi-agro pastoralist communities. Nuba Mountains is classified as one of the least developed areas in the Sudan when it comes to existing infrastructure and public services such as education, health and water. The area is only open between November and May every year, as the rainy season from June to October renders it inaccessible. The area is inhabited by tribes of Lebang, Ottoro, Tira, Shawaya, Moro and Lira, of which the majority are located in the former SPLA/M controlled areas. The Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA) signed between NCP and SPLA/M has created opportunities for humanitarian agencies wishing to work to uphold the peace and promote reconciliation among the people in Nuba Mountains.

Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) started an integrated program in Nuba in 2002, working on both sides of the conflict line, but within a relatively limited geographical range. The area spans from Kauda on the former SPLA/M area, via the Hieban locality in the former GoS area to Kadugli, the capital town of South Kordofan. NCA is currently implementing a three years project, which is a continuation of the Integrated Development Programme in the Nuba Mountains funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA).

1.2 Project Goal and Specific Objectives

The Goal of the Project is:

"Sustained peace by empowering right holders to claim their fair share of opportunities, resources and services".

The Specific Objectives are:

- (a) *"Strengthening the Duty Bearers ability to deliver basic social services to the Right Holders".*
- (b) *"Strengthening a holistic understanding of peace building and conflict transformation".*

1.3. Mid-Term Review

NCA has decided to carry out a Mid-term review, to take stock of the status of the project implementation to date. The objective of the review as set out in the Terms of Reference (TORs) is:

- (1) To review the progress to date and the effectiveness of the Project and to what extent the purpose of the Project is being/has been achieved.
- (2) Assessing the Projects impact on the Right Holders in the targeted areas
- (3) Assessing how the other funded projects (CHF) NCA are implementing in the Nuba Mountains is supporting the Goal and the Overall Objectives of the MFA funded Project.

The review should specifically consider the following components and suggest possible changes in the present approach used:

3.1 NCA's relationship with local authorities and local partners and the programs impact on partners and local authorities' organizational and institutional capacities.

3.2 How the project relates to the current political situation and the possible political changes over the coming years.

3.3 NCA's own capacity to make meaningful contribution to the critically needed social services that would improve the human dignity of the people who have been marginalized for far too long and suggest possible changes in the organizational setup or staffing of the program.

3.4 Review the different components of the ongoing programme (Education, Health, HIV & AIDS, Water and Sanitation, Resettlement and Cross Cutting Activities) and propose any changes in the programmes that are considered justified based on immediate needs, resources available and a more long term development impact.

1.4. Review Team

NCA contracted a team of three to carry out the review.

Mr. Joseph Gathogo Ngugi - External Consultant/ Team Leader

Mr. Fudolalla A. Gadir Abukindi - SRRC/HAC

Mr. Mahdi Anur Daud - NRRDO.

The review team made a field visit to the various locations and operational areas of the project implementation in the Nuba Mountains from 6th -15th October 2010.

The Programme Manager, Mr. Dawood Narbi, Mr. Muhager Hamid, the Field Manager and the programme staff at Kauda Field Office, accompanied the team during the visits and accorded the team a lot of support.

1.5. Approach and Methodology

The team used a variety of methods to carry out the evaluation. These included:

1. A literature Survey. Among the documents we referred to include the Three Year Project Proposal document, Annual Plans, Annual Reports and other previous reports.
2. Consultations with Senior Management Staff at NCA
3. Field visits and consultation meetings with NCA's partners, i.e. NRRDO, UNICEF, SRRC/HAC and Local government officials, among the Education, Water and Health. We visited 23 project sites, met and held discussions with the beneficiaries and paid courtesy calls to three Locality Commissioners. (See appendix 1 for details)
4. Interviews and administrating structured questionnaires.
5. Data analysis

6. We held a consultative forum of representatives of Local Government, Civil Society and beneficiaries of the project on 14th October at the NCA compound in Kauda.

1.6. 0 A Summary and Brief Assessment of the Overall Impact of the NCA Presence in the Nuba Mountains and the Implemented Projects.

1.6.1 The overall impact of NCA's presence is summarized below:

Overall the project has contributed to improving the living standards and enhanced the quality of life of the people. More specifically it has;

- *Enhanced community development and positive attitude to life*
- *Improved quality and accessibility of education*
- *Improved quality and numbers of teachers*
- *Improved quality of health and accessibility of health facilities*
- *Reduced mortality and morbidity rate*
- *Increased accessibility to potable and safe drinking water*
- *Reduced conflicts among the beneficiaries contributing to peace*
- *Encouraged returnees to come back*
- *Empowered communities to be aware of their rights*
- *Created opportunity for women participation in delivery of basic services*
- *Increased HIV and AIDS awareness*

Observation.

The project has had more impact on the project goal of sustained peace by empowering right holders to claim their fair share of opportunities, resources and services. It had less impact on duty bearer's ability to deliver basic social services. This is consistent with project activities which are basically targeted to right holders.

Recommendation.

For NCA to achieve the goal and objectives of the project and have more impact:

1. NCA should consider incorporating activities aimed at building capacity of the duty holders to deliver services.
2. NCA should endeavour to implement the " Nuba Mountain Integrated Programme" as described in the project proposal document submitted MFA in November 2008 as it meets the needs which were expressed by the community during the evaluation¹. NCA should consider to expand the geographical coverage of the project as needs exists, but this would demand increased funding and NCA's expanded capacity.

¹ See footnote 2 for further explanation

The approach being used in implementation of the project is fairly effective and the overall objective of the programme is being achieved. However in our view, it is an uphill task “to strengthen the Duty Bearers ability to deliver basic social services to the Right Holders” in the prevailing political circumstances in Nuba Mountains, but is a goal worth pursuing.

1.6. 2. The project’s impact on Right Holders

Overall the programme is achieving the stated objective of “sustained peace by empowering the Right Holders to claim their fair share of opportunities, resources and services”. There is relative peace in the region due to the CPA and the project has contributed to maintaining peace through provision of essential services. The Right Holders are starting to claim their rights but mostly to “secondary duty bearers”.

In the team's view the following are the impacts of each component:

Education:

- *Improved quality of education through provision of trained teachers and supply of school materials*
- *Accessibility of schools and improved learning environment*
- *Increased enrollment and attendance in schools especially by girls*
- *Improved performance in schools*
- *Increased quality and quantity of teachers*
- *Encouraged community participation in delivery of education*
- *Established a base for further development in education*
- *Expanded the scope of school leavers to further education by learning English*

Health

- *Improved accessibility to primary health care*
- *Improved health facilities*
- *Increased deliveries of babies in the healthy centres*
- *Improved mother and child health care*
- *Increased skills and knowledge of health workers*
- *Increased awareness of dangers of FMG*
- *Reduced incidences and impact of epidemic diseases*
- *Contributed to a growing team of trained health workers*

HIV/AIDS

- *Increased awareness and understanding of HIV/AIDS*
- *More openness on the issue*
- *Created a forum for joint action HIV&AIDS*
- *Increased demand for commodities has increased (Condoms)*

Water and Sanitation

- *Enhanced access to safe and potable drinking water*
- *Reduced walking distance by women to fetch water creating space for other activities*
- *Reduce dispute over water points creating peaceful coexistence among communities*
- *Enhanced community participation in water management and maintenance especially by women*
- *Increased awareness on sanitation, personal and household hygiene*
- *Enhanced health of the community*
- *Contributed to improved living standards*
- *Reduction of water borne diseases*

Environment

- *Insignificant impact due to limited activities implemented*

Resettlement and Emergency Preparedness

- *Encouraged returnees to come due to the services provided by the project*

Peace Building

- *The implementation of the project has to some degree contributed to peace building*

Gender

- *Women involvement in community affairs and decision making*
- *Issues affecting women like FMG and other Harmful Traditional Practices have been brought to the public domain and are receiving attention*

Points to Note

1. Impact takes time to be felt and the impacts discussed above are not necessarily from the last two years, but have been cumulative from the start of the programme implementation
2. NCA is not the only actor in the field. There are others working in the same field and is not easy to gauge who has contributed to what extent

1.6.3. Other funded projects (CHF)

The U. N. funded Common Humanitarian Fund (CHF) projects which NCA is implementing in Nuba Mountains are complementary to the MFA funded project as they are funding the same components i.e. Education, Health, Water and Sanitation.

-The projects are an added financial boost which bridges the gap of the needs of the beneficiaries

Challenge

Channeling of funds: The evaluation team learnt that the funds are always received in June/July during the rainy season, when activities cannot be undertaken due to the rains. This always leaves a short period to carry out the tasks (end October, November and December).

1.7 Recommendations on specific components.

The team was requested to consider the components below and suggest possible changes in the present approach used. Our views:

1.7.1. NCA's relationship with local authorities and local partners and the program's impact on partner organizational and institutional capacity.

- The relationship with local authorities/ secretariats is supportive and cordial. The relationship is guided by the Technical Agreements and MOUs which defines roles and responsibilities
- There exists good inter-personal relationship between the local authorities' staff and NCA programme staff
- There exists mutual respect and understanding.

The above also applies with the relationship with NGOs, CBOs and the traditional leaders.

However there some points to note:

- The capacity of the secretariats and most of the partners is very weak and is a challenge to project implementation
- The secretariats are manned by volunteers who are not on salary and in some cases do not have the requisite qualifications for the tasks they are performing
- There are challenges of communication between them and NCA
- The project does not have a specific budget for capacity building of the partners.

It is important to note that relationships with Local Authorities are undergoing a change with integration process. NCA has now to work with line ministries/departments under the Localities Commissioners.

We recommend NCA to contribute to the capacity building of its implementing partners as it is the goal of the project and also as part of the *Exit Strategy*.

1.7.2. The current political situation and possible changes over the coming

Current political situation

- The current political situation has created uncertainty. There is foreboding in the air. But this has not for now affected the project implementation.
- The matter of integration is creating apprehension. Not all those who have been "volunteering" are being integrated, and in most cases less than 50% of the volunteers have been integrated, a case in point being teachers
- The State Government has introduced new working and reporting systems which is having an impact on the project. Case in point is sector coordination meetings which were formally coordinated by RCS office and are now been coordinated by a newly formed commission, "*State Council for Coordination of Humanitarian and Development Aid*" at Kadugli. The position is not clear at Locality level. (NCA is the Secretariat for the WASH sector within the Ministry of Water Resources.)

-The evaluation team's take on the integration is that it will be good for the project implementation taking into account that "Localities" will plan better and have clear geographical area, and the line ministries will be manned by paid professionals' staff that will be more accountable.

Possible Political Changes

There are issues of immense significance which are hanging in the air. This includes:

- i) Census results which had not been announced (October 2010)
- ii) State Elections.
- iii) Popular Consultation.
- iv) Referendum in South Sudan and Abeyi

The outcome of all the above will have major implications which will have a bearing on the project implementation.

Some possible scenarios:

- Mass movement of people which may call for Emergency Response
- Change of government leading to change of policy on INGOS leading to more restrictions
- Possible resumption of conflict and related consequences

It is recommended that NCA prepare for these possible outcomes in its planning

1.7.3. NCA's own capacity to make meaningful contribution through the project

The current capacity of NCA in terms of personnel and equipment are operating at their maximum capacity. The staff is doing a commendable job with the available facilities. However the following has to be noted:

Staff

-There is an urgent need to replace the Health Officer, who resigned in May, 2010.

-We recommend the recruitment of a "Gender Consultant" and "Peace Officer" as was proposed in the Project Proposal Document of September 2008.

Staff Capacity building

-For efficiency staff needs to upgrade their skills and knowledge.

-It was noted that the working environment in Kauda Field Office needs upgrading in terms of space and furniture

Vehicles

The availability of vehicles becomes a challenge at the peak of the operations after the rains.

-The grounded vehicles should be repaired to support the programme implementation. We learnt it takes time to have this done

Procurement

-There is need to review the procurement system. We learnt this takes a very long time. A case point is there has been no supply of drugs for more than year despite orders having been made.

1.7.4. Review of the different components of the ongoing programme

Education

There is still an Education deficit in Nuba Mountains despite the commendable work done by NCA and others in the field. There was an outcry about the proposed phasing out of education by NCA. This, it was said will "Do Harm".

- We recommended that NCA develop an exit strategy which involves all the stakeholders. We suggest NCA to lobby another agency take over the education component when it exits.
- The aspects being implemented so far are in line with needs of the beneficiaries but as it was recommended in the project document there is need to support Adult Literacy, Vocational training for the school leavers and dropouts and Early Childhood Education

Health

The sector is making a good contribution but demand is high especially after the expulsions of six INGOs last year.

- Major concern is supply of drugs and medicines
- The Revolving Fund for drugs is a critical need for long term sustainability. NCA should work with other partners and Duty Bearers to set it up as the matter needs a joint effort of all players.

HIV/AIDS

More funding is needed to implement the planned activities which are meeting the needs of the community.

- NCAs and other actors in health should work together to establish a VCT centre in Nuba Mountains for the people to test and establish their HIV status.
- There is an immediate need to produce I.E.C materials to be given after training and awareness events.
- NCA and should work with others in this sector to supply commodities

Water and Sanitation

The implementation of this component is doing well but there is great demand for water due to increasing population. The water table level is decreasing and wells are drying up.

We recommend NCA to consider being involved in lobbying the Duty Bearers to develop long term plan for water in Nuba Mountains.

Resettlement

- More sanitization events need to be carried out as had been detailed in the September 2008 Project Document.

- NCA should explore the possibility of provide returnees with local materials for building (Bricks and Grass) which are more in tune with local culture rather the plastics and tents

Cross Cutting Issues.

We recommend that as it has been detailed in the September 2008 Project Document *Environment, Peace Building and Gender* should be independent components and catered for in the budget.

1.8 Acronyms

AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
CBO	Community Based Organization
CPA	Comprehensive Peace Agreement
DNA	Do No Harm
GoNU	Government of National Unity
GoSS	Government of South Sudan
GoS	Government of Sudan
HAC	Humanitarian Aid Commission
HIV	Human immune deficiency Syndrome
KTTC	Kauda Teacher Training Center
NuWEDA	Nuba Women Development Association
IDPs	Internally Displaced Persons
MFA	Ministry Of Foreign Affairs
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
NCA	Norwegian Church Aid
NRRDO	Nuba Relief, Rehabilitation and Development Organization
NORAD	Norwegian Agency for International development
SCC	Sudan Council of Churches
SRRC	Sudanese Relief and Rehabilitation Commission
SPLA	Sudanese Liberation Army
SPLM	Sudanese Liberation Movement
RBA	Rights Based Approach
VCT	Voluntary Counseling and Testing
PHCC/CU	Primary Health Care Centre/ Unit
UNICEF	United Nation Children Fund

1.9 Acknowledgments

The Review team would like to extend its gratitude to the following who contributed to the success of this exercise;

- Mr. Dawood Narbi, the Programme manager
- Mr. Muhager Hamid, the Field Manager at Kauda Office
- The NCA staff at Kauda Field Office
- Ms Eirin Naess-Sorensen, acting Senior Programme Coordinator for Nuba Mountains and Khartoum
- Mr. Tore Torstad, Deputy Country Director
- The NCA partners who are listed in Appendix 1 of this report for their cooperation.

To all those who contributed in one way or the other to the success of the mission: you are all appreciated.

1.10 Norwegian Church Aid

Norwegian Church Aid is an ecumenical, diaconal and humanitarian organization mandated by churches and Christian organizations in Norway to work for a just world. This implies to enable the poor and influence the wealthy and powerful.

In pursuit of this vision, NCA is guided by five values which are rooted in the Christian faith and embraced by people of all faiths globally: *Integrity of creation, human dignity, global justice, inclusive communities and compassion.*

NCA's assistance is provided unconditionally and without any intention of influencing people's religious affiliation.

1.10.1 NCA's priorities in Sudan

NCA- Sudan priorities according to the Sudan Country Plan 2005-2009 are;

- Civil Societies for Accountable Governance and Economic Justice
- Faith Communities address HIV and AIDS
- Fresh Water and Safe Sanitation
- Gender Based Violence
- Religion for Conflict Resolution and Peace
- Emergency Preparedness and Response

CHAPTER ONE

1.0 NORWEGIAN CHURCH AID SUDAN PROGRAM

1.1 Introduction

Sudan relief program started in 1972, providing rehabilitation and development assistance in Southern Sudan. Then NCA operated under its initial name Norwegian Church Relief/Sudan Programme (NCR/SP). As from 1975 onwards it assumed its present name, reflecting its evolving emphasis on development issues. In 1986 NCA established an office in Khartoum with responsibilities for Government of Sudan (GoS) controlled areas. This enabled NCA to operate on both sides of the conflict line. This position allowed NCA to develop strong relationships with Sudanese organizations and national and local authorities alike. NCA has over years been concentrating efforts within Southern Sudan in Eastern Equatorial. Over the last years, it has added Wau and rural areas in Bahr el Ghazal.

NCA mainly operates in five locations in Sudan i.e., Greater Khartoum, Greater Equatorial, Nuba Mountains, Bahr el Ghazal and Greater Darfur. NCA is Partner and Theme oriented, negotiating involvement according to partners' priorities and program themes.

NCA was in 2002/2003 asked by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) to start humanitarian operations in the Nuba Mountains as a complementary support to the efforts made by the then Joint Military Commission (JMC). Since then NCA has been working on both sides of the conflict line. NCA has been one of few actors operating in the area, and has in close collaboration with local authorities and the local communities been able to implement a significant range of activities that has improved the daily life both for the local population and for the returnees coming back after the cessation of conflict. Nuba Mountains is located in South Kordofan in the central western part of Sudan. The area is characterized by a range of mountains, which are inhabited by semi-agro pastoralist communities. Nuba Mountains covers an area of 158,477 sq.km. It is classified as one of the least developed areas in the Sudan when it comes to existing infrastructure and public services such as education, health and water. The area is only open between November and May every, as the rainy season from June to October renders it inaccessible. The area is inhabited by tribes of Lebang, Ottoro, Tira, Shawaya, Moro, Lira, Achrun, Tojo, Krongo, Angolo, and Logan of which the majority are in the former SPLA areas. They are a mixture of Christians, Muslims, and the so called Animists all co-existing peacefully.

In 1994 Kordofan was divided into three federal states, and in August 2005 the three states became two - North and South Kordofan - as part of the implementation of the Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA). Parts of the boundaries of South Kordofan remain unclear pending the final demarcation of the 1956 north-south border. South Kordofan has an area of 144.000 km² and a population of 2.3 million

according to the 2008 National Census. This census was contested and the exercise was repeated in June/July 2010, but the results had not been announced by the time of mid-term evaluation (October 2010). Kadugli is the capital of the state.

The Nuba Mountains area is governed by the Government of Sudan as part of Southern Kordofan State. The inclusion into the CPA of the "Protocol of Nuba Mountain" provides for initial power sharing on a rotational basis between the NCP and SPLM, followed by a general election, then a popular consultation to renegotiate the protocol if necessary. According to the protocol, the popular consultation will give citizens of Southern Kordofan state the opportunity to rectify shortcomings in the CPA's constitutional, political and administrative arrangements, while respecting its general framework. A process of integration of GOS and SPLM governance structures has started but the state still remains politically divided between GOS and SPLM influence. During the devastating civil war, the Nuba population suffered aerial bombardment, isolation, shortages, land expropriation and forced population movements. During the CPA period the return of more than 350.000 returnees back to Nuba Mountains has increased the burden of the struggling communities in relation to rebuilding livelihoods, access to basic services as well as dealing with conflicts in relation to land rights issues.

Currently, the Ministry Foreign Affairs (MFA) supported programme has focus on the following objective; *"To sustain peace by empowering the community members in the programme areas in Nuba Mountains, both women and men as right holders to claim their rights to their fair share of opportunities, resources and services"*.

It specifically aims *"to ensure the Duty Bearers ability to deliver basic services to the Right Holders in the Nuba Mountains is strengthened and Holistic understanding of peace building and conflict transformation in the Nuba Mountains is strengthened"*.

NCA has a Field Office in Kadugli headed by a Programme Manager and a Sub-Office in Kauda with a number of Programme staff that is responsible for the day to day implementation of the programme.

1.2 Problems addressed

Nuba Mountain faced many problems during the conflict which caused serious reductions and destruction to the limited infrastructure and means of income generating activities particularly agricultural and livestock which are the main profession of Nuba communities. The marginalization of the Nuba people as a distinct social group has deprived the area from accessing basic services: there are few schools with poor structures and mainly built from local materials by the community, very low school attendance, teachers are reluctant to work in remote areas and most are not trained, and there no educational materials provided by the State Ministry of Education.

The water and environmental sanitation situation in the Nuba Mountains is described as poor in most of the areas under control of former SPLA' and former GoS areas bordering SPLA. Most communities in the Nuba Mountains region have no access to safe drinking water, or sanitation facilities which makes them vulnerable to waterborne and environmental diseases. The community's main drinking water source is a *wadi* or spring dug in the *wadi*. There are some water points and hand pumps but almost all of them had been destroyed during the conflict. The communities generally suffer severe water scarcity in the summer when the seasonal water points dry up.

The health system is poor and has limited capacity to secure access to basic health services. There were a numbers of NGOs rendering health services with very limited capacity and unfortunately most of them were kicked out the region in 2009. However even for those remaining, lack of roads, infrastructure and medical supplies coupled with inadequate number of trained health workers has left the area vulnerable to frequent outbreak of diseases.

After the signing of the CPA there was a lot of hope and expectations that the situation would improve and the Duty Bearers would deliver services to the people. But this has not happened. The implementation of CPA had stalled and the expected integration of the civil service has just started. Currently there are two governing systems in use in the area, the New Sudan law under the former SPLM controlled areas and government law in areas under the Sudan Government of national unity (or former GoS). As a consequence very minimal government funding has been released by the State Government for the last three years or so. The civil servants have not been paid and delivery of all services is seriously strained as it has depended on volunteers.

Donor agencies and International NGOs have been providing most of the basic services. A number of them withdrew after the signing of CPA arguing peace had returned. Among those which remained six of them were kicked out in 2009. This has put a strain to those agencies that have decided to remain.

CHAPTER TWO

2.0 PURPOSE, SCOPE AND PROCESS OF THE REVIEW.

2.1. Purpose

In the revised Sudan Country Plan 2005—2009 it is stated that NCA will continue to work in the following three geographical areas in Sudan. These are Eastern Equatorial State, Bahr el Ghazal and the Nuba Mountains.

The Norwegian ministry of Foreign Affairs in November 2008 approved the funding of a three year project as part of continued support to the ongoing NCA Integrated Development Programme in the Nuba Mountains.² As part of the project NCA was to carry out a mid-term evaluation to assess the progress of project the implementation of the programme.

2.2. Scope of the assessment

The TOR's of the evaluation team were as detailed below;

Objective of the Mid-Term review:

- (1) To review the progress to date and the effectiveness of the Project and to what extent the purpose of the Project is being/has been achieved.
- (2) Assessing the Projects impact on the Right Holders in the targeted areas
- (3) Assessing how the other funded projects (CHF) NCA are implementing in the Nuba Mountains is supporting the Goal and the Overall Objectives of the MFA funded Project.

The review should specifically consider the following components and suggest possible changes in the present approach used:

1. NCA's relationship with local authorities and local partners and the programs impact on partners and local authorities' organizational and institutional capacities.
2. How the project relates to the current political situation and the possible political changes over the coming years.
3. NCA's own capacity to make meaningful contribution to the critically needed social services that would improve the human dignity of the people who have been marginalized for far too long and suggest possible changes in the organizational setup or staffing of the program.
4. Review the different components of the ongoing programme (*Education, Health, HIV & AIDS, Water and Sanitation, Resettlement and Cross Cutting Activities*) and propose any changes in the programmes that are considered justified based on immediate needs, resources available and a more long term development impact.

² To see the history of the proposal and changes made and subsequent approved by the MFA please see annex 6
Mid-Term Review of NCA Nuba Mountains Integrated Development Programme

2.3. Review process and approach

The approach to the review process and sources of input were as set out in the TORs. The review was structured in clearly defined steps as detailed below.

The first step was literature review of the NCA Programme in Sudan documents and design of the tools to be used during the programme review exercise. The documents included:

- i) NCA Project Proposal presented to MFA in November 2008
- ii) NCA Annual Activity Plans and Reports (2009&2010)
- iii) Application MFA GAP 2007/2008, Nuba Mountain Integrated Development Project
- iv) NCA Sudan Country Plan 2005-2009
- v) Projects Documents and Final Reports to Sudan Common Humanitarian Fund (CHF), 2009&2010
- vi) Report of the Programme Review of NCA's Operation in Nuba Mountains (April 2008)
- vii) Draft NCA Global Strategy (2011-2015)
- viii) Draft NCA Strategy for Nuba Mountains (2011-2015)

The sample of questionnaires administered to NCA's partners and staff is attached in the annex.

The second step was consultation with NCA Sudan staff. The Team Leader had meetings with the Programme Manager in Kadugli prior to the field trip of the programme area. The Evaluation Team held meetings with the Programme Manager, the Field Office Manager and the other programme staff in Kauda. In these meetings a programme for the field trips was discussed and agreed on. The field mission was carried out between 6-15 October. The next steps involved consultations and meetings with local governments and other partners. The Evaluation Team accompanied by the NCA staff visited more than 23 projects in the four localities covered by the project including courtesy calls to Locality Commissioners of Hieban, Umdorain and Dalam; Secretariats of Education, Water and Health, and other local partners i.e. NRRDO, UNICEF, and SRRC/HAC. The projects visited included Schools, Water Points, PHCC and PHCU, KTTTC, Printing Press, Drug Store among others. The full list is given in the Appendix 1. During these meetings we held consultations with School Committees and PTAs, Health Committees, Water Management Committees, Local Leaders and Traditional Leaders (Chiefs), and beneficiaries. On average at each site we met at least twenty people and in some case we had more than a hundred people present! In these forums we had opportunity to get the views of the beneficiaries of NCA programme and their expectations

We also held a consultative meeting at NCA compound with the representatives of Local Government, NGOs, CBOs, and other partners and beneficiaries on 14th October. Over twenty participants attended the forum. See attendance list Appendix 1b

At the conclusion of the field mission the Evaluation team had a debriefing session with the Programme Manager and Field Office Manager. The Team Leader held a similar session with the acting Senior Programme Coordinator in Khartoum.

CHAPTER THREE

3.0 THE REVIEW FINDINGS

(Part 1 of the TOR)

Below we present the findings of the evaluation as set out in the TORs of the Mid-Term of the NCA three years "Nuba Mountain Integrated Development Programme", which is a continuation of MFA funded programme in South Kordofan in Sudan.

The main reference document used for the purpose of the mid-term review is the three year Project Proposal submitted to MFA by NCA in November 2008. However it is important to note there were amendments introduced to the proposal agreed through various communications between MFA and NCA. Hence for accuracy the Annual Work Plans and Budget (2009 and 2010) have been used as reference point.³

1. To review the progress to date and the effectiveness of the Project and to what extent the purpose of the Project is being/has been achieved.

We shall present our finding by first looking at the overall achievement to date and then have a detailed analysis of each of the project's thematic components.

3.1 Overview

The overall goal of the programme which the project is contributing to is "*Sustained peace by empowering the Right Holders to claim their fair share of opportunities, resources and services*" and the specifics objectives as set out the project are;

- 1. The Duty Bearers ability to deliver basic social services to Right Holders in the Nuba Mountains is strengthened*
- 2. Holistic understanding of peace building and conflict transformation in Nuba Mountains is strengthened.*

³ Again, see appendix ?

This was/is to be achieved by implementing the following thematic components: Education; Health; HIV/AIDS; Water and Sanitation; Environment; Resettlement and Emergency Preparedness and Cross Cutting Activities i.e. Peace Building and Gender.

In our view the project implementation team has made very commendable progress in carrying out the activities set out in the project document, and this has contributed to achieving the project's goal and objectives. The project's implementation of the various components was rated as follows:

- -Education, Health, Water and Sanitation are above 90%.
- -For HIV/AIDS and Resettlement and Emergency Preparedness is in the range of 50%.
- -Environment, Peace Building and Gender is less than 5%

The above rating is arrived by analyzing the rate of implementing activities set out in the Annual Plans (2009&2010) in the field and the reports of achievements of the same period i.e. NCA Annual Activity Plan and Report in the Log frame Matrix. We also had detailed presentations and discussions with the programme staff. (See appendix 5)

The Evaluation Team makes the following observations:

1. The goal and objectives of the project are very noble but are not easy to achieve given the capacity and resources at the disposal of NCA, especially given the prevailing political environment.
2. There is no budget allocation or activities targeting the "Duty Bearers"- to strengthen their capacity to deliver basic social services. All project activities are geared towards "Right Holders"

3.1.1 Recommendations

1. NCA should consider undertaking some capacity building initiatives for its implementing partners.
2. As had been proposed in the Project Document, Environment, Peace Building and Gender should be treated as separate thematic components as they are meeting a felt need in the community.

The "Integrated Approach", being applied in the implementation of the project, which is in line with NCA global approach, is fairly effective and the overall objective of the programme is being achieved. However there is need to in-build a more proactive exit strategy which is known to the partners to ensure sustainability of the programme.

3.2 Review of the progress of the various components

As indicated above the project has seven thematic components and a cross cutting component. The project proposal document describes specific projected results and activities to achieve the results. We analyze each of them.

3.2.1 Education

The expected result for education is "*enhanced access to quality basic education, teachers' education and adult literacy training*"

The activities projected to achieve this are;

- *Provision of school uniforms and educational materials to primary school students and schools.*
- *Support to NRRDO.*
- *Support to Kauda Teacher Training Institute.*
- *Support to the secondary school.*
- *Maintenance / repair of Kauda Printing Press*

Achievement

1. Provision of school uniforms and educational materials.

i) School uniforms: Projected in Annual Plan i) 2009-1000 students (60% girls)

ii) 2010-1200 students (60 % girls)

- In 2009: 840 were distributed to girls only

- In 2010: 1200 were delivered during the mission (i.e. October 14th. 2010) to be distributed to girls and boys

ii). Educational materials. Projected in Annual Plan: i) 2009 – 2000 students (40% girls)

ii) 2010 – 6400 students (50% girls)

- In 2009: 6714 pupils (4113 boys and 2601 girls) in 18 schools received materials

- In 2010: 6878 pupils (4174 boys and 2701 girls) in 15 schools received materials

2. Proposed support in 2009 and 2010. Provide incentives 12 to teachers (50% women) through NRRDO.

-in 2009: 12 teachers (8 male and 4 female) paid

-in 2010: 12 teachers (8male and 4 female) paid

3. Proposed support to KTTC in 2009 and 2010. 100 students (40% women); 8 tutors and 15 local staff (45% women) paid incentives; Kitchen and store renovated and teachers' compound fenced.

In 2009 and 2010 support to KTTC:

- Intake at KTTC 117 trainees. Currently 103 due to dropouts. (32 female and 71 male)

-8 tutors (1 female and 7 male) received incentives in 2009 and 2010

- 12 (5 male and 7 female) local staff received incentives in 2009 and 2009

-support to transport cost of the 8 tutors

-payment of incentives to 3 Administrative staff

-general support to KTTC (food items, maintenance of generator, fire wood, transport of trainees etc)

-Kitchen and Store renovation completed

4. Support to Secondary School. Not in the work plan for 2009&2010

5. Repairing the Kauda Printing Press

- done. Completed in 2010

Comment

All the activities were carried out apart from support to *Secondary School* which was not included in the annual work plans.

3.2.2 Health

The expected result “the right holders have equal access to basic sustainable and acceptable health services”

To be achieved by following activities

- Construction of medical store for medicines in Kauda.
- Training of health workers.
- Training of village health educators.
- Providing incentives to health workers.
- Providing medicines and vaccines to health units.

Achievement

Targets set in Work Plan.

1. Construction of Medical Store in 2009 work plan

-Done.

2. Training of Medical staff/nurses/lab technicians at various institutions in Sudan

i) Projected in 2009: 10 candidates (6 women), ii) in 2010: 45 health workers trained and one clinical officer

- Done. 11 medical assistance (10 male and 1 female) trained locally and 1 clinical officer in training externally.

-20 Vaccinators trained (11 male and 9 female)

3. Training of 10 Village Health Educators, 2009 work plan

- 12 health educators trained in Heiban and Umdorain Localities.

4. Provide incentives to Community Health Workers in 2009: 45 (25 women; in 2010: 50 (25 women)

-45 community workers (18 women) paid Nov. 2008 to Dec. 2009

-50 community workers paid Jan-Sept 2010.

5. Provision of vaccines. In both years: 8 health units to receive vaccines and 6000 children under five vaccinated.

- worked with the ministry of health in EPI campaigns.5000 children vaccinated in 2009 and 5550 in 2010.

-NCA's PHCC and PHCU used by ministry to store vaccines and for vaccinations.

6. Supply of essential medicines to 6 PHCU and 2 PHCC in both years.

- 6 PHCU and 2 PHCC received drugs for 10 months in 2009.

-34,162 patients were attended in health units and centres supported by NCA (19203 female and 14959 male) in 2009.

-No supply of drugs in 2010

Note:

Most of the targets were achieved in some cases exceeded, as CHF funded project boosted the efforts.

Major problem was non-supply of drugs for more than a year. The delay was caused by slow procurement procedures at Khartoum level. (The drugs arrived on 14th October 2010).

3.2.3 Hiv/Aids

The expected results "increased awareness of HIV and AIDS and its implications. Access to counseling assistance".

To be achieved by undertaking the following activities as projected in September 2008 Project Proposal.

- *Support to awareness initiatives and distribution of dissemination material.*
- *Training of Trainers.*
- *Training of policy makers.*

Achievement

Targets as set in the Annual Plans

1. Facilitate and support awareness sessions on HIV/AIDS for 1000 persons (50% women) in 2009 and 3000 (50%), in 2010 targeting school children, teachers, youth and health workers.

- In 2009 three workshops were held and attended by 91 (55 male and 36 female)

-in 2010 five workshops held reaching 229 (141 male and 88 female)

2. in 2009, Facilitate Training of Trainers for 20 (12 women and 8 men)

- Done. These were trained in the workshops held above

3. Distribution of dissemination materials on HIV/AIDS: in 2009, 3000 leaflets and 9000, in 2010.

-not done.

- In 2010: T.V and Video cassettes available

-Done. TV and videos made available at the field office.

4. Facilitate training of 20 (10 men&10 women) policy makers on HIV/IADS.

-not done.

Note:

A number of the planned activity did not take place; hence the targets were not achieved. We were informed this was because funds were not made available.

3.2.4 Water and Sanitation

The expected result "*Improved access to portable water and acceptable sanitation facilities*"

To be achieved by the following activities

- *Rehabilitation / digging of new shallow wells.*
- *Repairing of broken hand pumps.*
- *Training of hand pump mechanics and provision of tools to repair hand pumps and digging of latrines.*
- *Cleaning of surface dam.*
- *Training of village water committees.*
- *Training women on house hold hygiene.*

Achievements:

Targets set in project document and work plan.

1. In 2009, Rehabilitate or dig 2 shallow wells.

- Done

2. Repair hand pumps: in 2009, 20 and 25 in 2010.

- 25 broken hand pumps repaired benefiting 6,250 people

3. Provide 5 sets of hand tools for digging pit latrines to community in 2009

- Done.

4. Cleaning of the surface of Chawere dam in both years.

- done in 2009.

5. Training of 15 hand pump mechanics including 6 women, in 2009 work plan.

- 30 trained (10 female and 20)

6. Providing 5 toolboxes to local authorities for hand pump repairs

- Not done.

7. Training members of village water committees; 60 (50% women) in each year.

-various trainings conducted: in Umdorain 22 (15 male and 7 female), in Dalami 32 (17 male 15 women) and in Heiban 20 people.

8. Training of Women on House Hold hygiene. In 2009: 40 women/head of house hold.

- Done. 40 women trained in Haiben in 2009.

Note.

Most of the projected activities were implemented.

3.2.5 Environment

The expected result as per September 2008 Project Proposal "*men and women have equal access to environmental sustainable livelihoods through increased environmental awareness and action*".

To be achieved by the following activities

- *Support to awareness training and local initiatives to combat environmental degradation.*
- *Support to establish tree nurseries.*
- *Support to World Environmental Day.*
- Some seedlings were distributed in Heiban in 2009

The above activities were not undertaken as they were not in work plans for 2009/2010.

3.2.6 Resettlement and emergency preparedness

The expected result "*returnees and IDPs are peacefully settled and integrated into local communities*".

To be achieved through the following activities as projected in September 2008 Project proposal.

- *Sensitize and support host communities to receive and reintegrate returnees.*
- *Provision of emergency response kits and shelter materials.*

- *Training of NCA and Partner staff in emergency preparedness and response.*

Achievement

Targets as set out in Annual work plans: i) 2009: 600 kits and shelter materials made available

ii) 2010: 2000 returnees received NFI kits and shelter materials

- 1000 emergency kits purchased

- 451 NFI kits distributed.

Most of the activities in the original 2008 Project Proposal document were not carried out as they were not included in the work plans in 2009 and 2010.

3.2.6 Peace Building

The expected result *"local communities are living peacefully together and able to solve conflicts through recognized principles for peaceful conflict resolution"*.

To be achieved through the following activities as projected in September 2008 project proposal

- *Facilitate and support workshops for building trust and reconciliation.*
- *Dissemination of elections and the Popular Consultation.*
- *Support to Peace Focal Point (KUSH Network).*
- *Support to various peace building initiatives.*
- *Training of trainers (ToT) on peace building and reconciliation.*
- *Dialogue forums on peace building.*
- *Training of NCA and Partners on peace building approaches.*

It is important to note that Peace Building was not approved by MFA as an independent component, and was retained as a cross cutting issue in 2009 and 2010.

In 2010 annual plan another expected result was added *"the newly established localities have vision and mission for the development within their respective localities and the local communities are aware of the coming election and popular consultation process"*

Activities added to achieve the result were:

- *Awareness raising on election and popular consultation*
- *Strategic development plan workshops in Heiban, Umdorain and Dalami Localities.*

Activities in 2009 work plan:

a) 2000 persons (70%) attended awareness training

b) KUSH Network is functioning and able to coordinate/facilitate local Peace initiative

c) Training of 30 people (15 women) NCA partners on peace building tools like DNH and RBA

Achievement

-A strategic Planning Workshop was held for KUSH Network.

-Conducted DO NO HARM workshop for KUSH Network. 35 participants attended (11 female and 24 male)

- One awareness training event was held with partnership with NRRDO in Haiben but the target not reached.

Activities in 2010 Work Plan: a) 2500 persons (70% women) attended awareness on election and popular consultation.

b) 3 localities have developed 3-5 years master plans for development to be presented to the government and donors.

The above activities have not been done.

3.2.7 Gender

The expected result *“reduced GBV and increased awareness about gender issues among local authorities. Increased equitable opportunities to earn income for women and men”*.

To be achieved through the following activities as set out in the September 2008 Project Proposal.

- *Workshops/training on gender issues.*
- *Training on income generating activities and book keeping.*
- *Facilitate and support a women conference.*
- *Facilitate a consultant to work with the women groups.*
- *Support to Kauda Women Training Center.*
- *Support to awareness initiatives on Gender Based Violence and FGM*
- *Support to awareness initiatives on Gender Based Violence and FGM.*

It is important to note that MFA did not approve this component in the original proposal in 2008 proposal and gender was incorporated as a Cross Cutting Activity.

The activities in projected in 2009 and 2010: Support Kauda Women Centre to reactivate activities.

- Support was extended to Kauda Women Centre to repair the roof which was blown off by the wind.

3.3.0 The Project Effectiveness.

3.3.1 Introduction

An organization effectiveness is assessed based on how successful it is in serving the needs of it's' clients. It is said *“creating an effective organisation stems from the organisation being able to do the things it needs to do with minimum use of resources”*. So effectiveness is gauged by ability to deliver services using available resources i.e. the best 'resources mix'. It is from this perspective we analyze the effectiveness of the project. The *“clients' needs”* and the *“services”* of this project are reflected by the goals, objectives and expected results as indicated below.

3.3.2 Overall goal:

Sustained peace by empowering the Right Holders to claim their fair share of opportunities, resources and services.

3.3.2.1 Specific objective(s):

- 1. The Duty Bearers ability to deliver basic social services to the Right Holders in the Nuba Mountains is strengthened*
- 2. Holistic understanding of peace building and conflict transformation in the Nuba Mountains is strengthened.*

3.3.2.2 The expected results:

1 Education

Enhanced access to quality basic education, teachers' education and adult literacy training.

2 Health

The right holders have equal access to basic sustainable and acceptable health services.

3 HIV and AIDS

Increased awareness of HIV and AIDS and its implications. Access to counseling assistance.

4 Water and Sanitation

Improved access to portable water and acceptable sanitation facilities.

5 Environment

Men and women have equal access to environmental sustainable livelihoods through increased environmental awareness and action.

6 Resettlement and Emergency Preparedness

Returnees and IDPs are peacefully settled and integrated into local communities.

7 Peace Building

Local communities are living peacefully together and able to solve conflicts through recognized principles for peaceful conflict resolution.

8 Gender

Reduced GBV and increased awareness about gender issues among local authorities. Increased equitable opportunities to earn income for women and men.

3.3.3 NCA Approach

To deliver the above services and achieve the goals of the project NCA is using 'Integrated Approach'. This " approach to organizational cooperation reflects a firm belief that working with and through local and national partner organizations and institutions – rather than directly through our own staff – is more likely to ensure lasting, locally owned, development and the eradication of poverty and injustice. This approach refuses to do things for people or over their heads, but works with them, and at best enables them to do the work for themselves"(Draft NCA Global Strategy 2011-15). "Integrated Approach" also involves balancing between emergency, long term interventions and advocacy.

Based on this approach, NCA has been implementing the project through the local governments and other local civil society Organisations as listed earlier. However in some instances, NCA is involved in direct implementation due to dearth of capacity of the local partners.

Using this “mix”, the implementation has been fairly effective though it has limitations. As our assessments above under (3.0-3.2.7) demonstrates the rate of implementation is very high where the financial resources were made available on time. And as indicated later under impact (3.4), the project is achieving the intended goal of providing basic services to right holders.

3.3.4 A critique of the approach.

Working through partners has challenges. The best approach would be direct implementation where one would have overall control. Some observations;

1. It is time consuming as you have to work with other partners where NCA has no control. This leads to delays.
2. The secretariats are manned by volunteers who are not on a salary and hence cannot be relied on, to deliver on a full time basis. It also means using limited resources to pay for incentives.
3. The capacity of the local partners is limited making it tough for them to deliver as expected.
4. There is occasional communication gap between NCA and partners leading to delays in implementation.
5. Dependency syndrome. As NCA is keen to have the project implemented it tends to go out of it's way to have things done, meaning doing things others should have done leading to a situation where people expects NCA to deliver all the time. It is also the challenge of moving from relief to development.

3.3.5 Conclusion.

The implementation of the project would have been more efficient if NCA was to directly implement the project. But there is merit and justification for the approach used as explained under “Integrated Approach” above. For now, as efficiency is about choosing to do the right things, the “mix” approach be used is justified under the given social/political environment. However NCA needs to do more as mentioned elsewhere to develop the capacity of the partners to play their role.

3.4 Objective Two of the TOR.

3.4.0. Assessing the Project's Impact on the Right Holders in the Targeted Area

3.4.1 Introduction.

As it has been detailed in the background information Nuba Mountains has suffered years of deprivation and marginalization and the Nuba people lacks basic services. The region was theater of many years of conflict and war and during those years most of the basic infrastructures was destroyed. The government did not provide the basic services, health facilities, water, schools, roads etc, and donor agencies and

NGOs stepped in to fill the gap. As noted NCA started operations in Nuba Mountains in 2002 at the invitation of Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and it operated both sides of the conflict zone. A programme review of NCA's operation in Nuba Mountains between years 2006-2008 was carried out in April 2008. The report gives more details on NCA operation, statistics and data which have been used as a reference during the evaluation. (See appendix 5). The current project being evaluated is continuation of the programme, thus as we discuss the project's impact, this should be taken into account.

3.4.2 Overview of the overall impact

The overall goal of the programme which the project is contributing to is *"Sustained peace by empowering the Right Holders to claim their fair share of opportunities, resources and services"* and the specific objectives as set out the project are:

1. *The Duty Bearers ability to deliver basic social services to Right Holders in the Nuba Mountains is strengthened*
2. *Holistic understanding of peace building and conflict transformation in Nuba Mountains is strengthened.*

As we discuss the impact we should take note of the following observations:

- a) Impact take time to materialize and,
- b) As noted above there are other organizations working in the same area and providing similar services and facilities.

There was also a challenge of getting accurate data and reliable statistics as they are not readily available, as during the war the system of data collection had collapsed. The data used for purpose of arriving at conclusions in this chapter is mostly what we got from NCA and from discussions with the respondents. They are same "Sources of Verification" for the indicators identified in the project documentation, as indicated below under 3.4.2.1

(Also refer to Appendix 1b and Appendix 5)

The impacts were arrived at after;

- Analysis of data and statistics supplied by NCA*
- soliciting the views and opinions of the beneficiaries*
- soliciting views and opinions of partners*
- soliciting views and opinions of local authorities and local leaders*
- soliciting views of NGOs and donor agencies operating in the same area*
- views of staff*
- direct observation in the field*
- literature review and analysis of the various reports*

This was done through interviews, discussions, administering structured questionnaires, site visits and direct observations. A sample of the questionnaire used is in the Appendix 6

3.4.2.1 Project achievement indicators

The project proposal had spelt out indicators to assess the achievement of the objectives as detailed below.

SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES	INDICATORS	SOURCES OF VERIFICATION
Strengthening the Duty Bearers ability to deliver basic social services to the Right Holders	Target groups benefits from social services like education, health, water and sanitation	Reports. Statistics. Interviews Field Visits
Strengthening a holistic understanding of peace building and conflict transformation.	Peaceful coexistence between different communities and ethnic groups. Good governance and transparency are the working principals within the local communities and the authorities	Reports Meetings and consultations with local communities and local authorities. Field visits.

Using these indicators as the base and the process described above we assessed the projects effects and the extent to which its goals were attained, and the resultant impact or the long lasting benefit to the beneficiaries.

3.4.3 Overall Impact.

From the above assessment the following are the major impacts of the NCA intervention and presence in the Nuba Mountains according evaluation team. These impacts are due to the implementation of the various components which provides basic services to the people. The details of the activities undertaken are discussed earlier (3.0 -3.2.7). In the appendix is a summary of the discussion forum with stakeholders who gave their views on the project achievement.

- *Improved living standard and enhanced quality of life for the beneficiaries*
The project has made available basic services like water, health facilities, education, and sanitation and hygiene education to the community. The services have enhanced the quality of life. These basic services were not available as the few which had been there had been destroyed during the war.
- *Reduced conflicts among the beneficiaries contributing to peace*

Most of the conflicts between the tribes arose due to disputes on sharing the limited resources like water. With the provision of water for instance through boreholes, water yards, shallow wells etc these conflicts have reduced.

- *Encouraged returnees to come back*

Thousands of Nuba people had been forced to flee from the region during the prolonged years of insecurity. After signing of the CPA it was expected many of them would return spontaneously. This did not happen as they had been used to these basic services in the temporally settlements where they had relocated. In fact some of the returnees who had come back after signing of CPA had moved again. With the provision of basic facilities the number of returnees has shot up and the population of Nuba Mountains has almost doubled since 2006, as indicated in the table below.

Data on Returnees between January 2005 and August 2010.

Locality/ County	Total Number of Returnees
Kadugli Locality	108,503
Kadugli County	70,301
Dilling Locality	38,352
Dilling County	44,332
Rashad Locality	18,714
Rashed County	55,812
Lagawa Locality	20,129
Lagawa County	15,458
Talodi Locality	19,182
Kielak Locality	501
About Jubayah Locality	5,369
Total	396,653

Source: IOM

- *Community is more empowered politically and are aware of their rights*

As it normally happens once the basic needs are met, a people get space to move to the next level of hierarchy of needs. Again in the process of provision of services the community has been involved and in the process enlightened about their rights.

- *Created opportunity for women to participate in delivery of services*

A key part of project implementation is the involvement of women. Women are involved in various committees e.g. water, health, PTA and other capacities like Village health Educators. This had very positive impact in community life.

- *Enhanced community development and positive attitude to life*
Community involvement from the initiation and identification of needs has boosted the morale of the community. This participatory approach has led to empowerment of the beneficiaries as they are involved in decision making through the various committees.
- *Improved quality and accessibility of education*
As described later under education component the project has provided school buildings, materials, uniforms which have boosted education in the region.
- *Improved quality and numbers of teachers*
Through the project, the area got its only Teacher Training College. Most of the trained teachers teaching in the area have been trained in KTTC
- *Improved quality of health and accessibility of health facilities*
The details of the project contribution are given under health component. The project is a major contributor to these basic services. For instance it is the main supplier of drugs and has constructed the only standard drug store to serve the needs in the region.
- *Reduced mortality and morbidity rate*
This is a consequence of the points discussed above
- *Increased accessibility to safe drinking water*
The details are given under the component but suffice to say the project has played a key role in provision of water and sanitation in the programme area.
- *Increased HIV and AIDS awareness*
NCA has played an important role in creating awareness on HIV&AIDS as detailed under the discussion on this component. It was in the forefront in tackling a topic once considered taboo in the area.

Observation.

1. The impacts are consistent with the global aim and objectives of project as represented by the indicators tabulated above.
2. The project has had more impact on the project goal of sustained peace by empowering right holders to claim their fair share of opportunities, resources and services. It had less impact on duty bearers' ability to deliver basic social services. This is consistent with project activities which are targeted to right holders.

Recommendation.

NCA should consider incorporating activities targeted at the duty bearers.

3.4.4 Evaluation of the project components

The project is implementing six main components and a cross cutting component as set out in the project document which are complementary as they all contribute to the goal of the project. These are

Education, Health, HIV/AIDS, Water and Sanitation, Environment, Resettlement and cross cutting represented by Peace Building and Gender. Below we look at their impact on the Right Holders.

3.4.4.1 Education.

The expected result and indicators of this component is as indicated below.

Expected Result	Indicators	Sources of Verification
Enhanced access to quality basic education, teachers' education and adult literacy training	1. Numbers of schools with conducive teaching environment 2. Number of children enrolled in primary school. 3. Number of trained teachers teaching in the schools	Reports. Statistics. Field Visits

In the team's view the following are the impacts of the education component.

- *Improved quality of education through provision of trained teachers and supply of school materials*

KTTC the first Teachers Training College was established through the project. To date it has trained over 300 teachers who are contributing to quality of teaching in the project area. The communities in the area have limited income and they do not have much disposable income to spend on their children education, meaning they are not able to buy basic learning materials like books, pencils and so forth for their children. This leads to poor performance. So the supply of school materials through the programme has enhanced to learning.
- *Accessibility of schools and improved learning environment*

Most of the schools in the area were destroyed during the war. The few schools which existed were constructed from local materials and classes are/were conducted under trees. The schools are problematic to maintain meaning they are in constant need of repairs and are not ideal for learning especially during the rainy season. Hence the schools constructed through the programme are contributing to availability of schools.
- *Increased enrollment and attendance in schools especially by girls*

As noted the available schools were not suitable for learning and there were few, meaning children had to travel for distances to get to school. The accessibility of schools and provision of school materials and uniform through the project has led by more pupils enrolling in school.
- *Improved performance in schools*

The improved learning environment provided by provision of better classrooms, school materials like books and uniforms, trained teachers has boosted the performance in schools.
- *Encouraged community participation in delivery of education*

It is a condition that the local community has to make a contribution especially in construction of the schools supported by the programme. They are also involved in the management of the schools through the PTAs whose members are trained through the programme. All these have contributed to a sense of ownership.

- *Established a base for further development in education*

The building of permanent schools, training of teachers, and training of head teachers and PTAs in schools management is building a strong foundation for education in the area.

- *Expanded the scope of school leavers to further education by learning English*

The medium of learning in the schools supported by the programme is English. The ability to community in English has opened up opportunities for the learners as they can be able to advance in their chosen field in other countries

Note.

In appendix 5 data and statistics on education are given

Observation

The component had no impact on Adult Literacy.

Recommendation

NCA should consider some activity on Adult Literacy as indicated in the project document for those who got no opportunity due to many years of war.

3.4.4.2 Health

The expected result and indicators for health is as indicated below.

Expected Results	Indicators	Sources of Verification
The Right Holders have equal access to basic sustainable and acceptable health services.	1.Number of people referred to health clinics and hospitals 2.death rate for pregnant women and children below 5 years	Reports Statistics Field Visits

The following are the impacts of the health component intervention.

- *Improved accessibility to primary health care*

The project has provided PHCCs and PHCUs which were not available before. These facilities and the health workers trained through the programme are availing health care to the beneficiaries.

- *Improved health facilities*

This is made possible by the construction of 2 PHCC and 7 PHCU. (See appendix 5 b) and provision of medical equipment in these facilities.

- *Increased deliveries of babies in the healthy centres*

Most of the health centres supported by the project have a delivery room and there is a midwife or a trained Traditional Birth Attendant, who attended to pregnant mothers. This has reduced the death of mothers and children during delivery.

- *Improved mother and child health care*

The health centres under the programme provide Pre and Post maternal care. They also provide inoculations for mothers and children and this have led to improved health of mothers and children.

- *Increased skills and knowledge of health workers*

Through the programme many health workers have been trained in the country and even outside. This is contributing better treatment and prevention of diseases.

- *Increased awareness of dangers of FMG*

In all the health centres and all the project activities awareness is created about the dangers of FMG

- *Reduced incidences and impact of epidemic diseases*

The reduction has been as a result of curative services in health centres, and preventative measures through training and awareness interventions of the programme.

- *A growing team of trained health workers*

As noted above and as per details given in appendix 5, a growing cadre of health workers has been trained through the programme who is contributing to uplifting the health standards of the beneficiaries.

Observation.

The project is contributing to a healthy and productive community as projected in the project proposal indicators.



A local Primary Health Unit

3.4.4. 3 HIV/AIDS

The expected result and indicator are detailed below;

Expected Results	Indicators	Sources of Verification
"Increased awareness of HIV	Number of people affected by	Reports

and AIDS and its implications. Access to counseling assistance	HIV and AIDS	Statistics Field Visits
--	--------------	----------------------------

The following are the impacts of this component.

- *Increased awareness and understanding of HIV/AIDS*
NCA through the programme is among those who first introduced HIV and AIDS awareness in the area through organising seminars and workshops. NCA is sector chair on HIV&AIDS
- *More openness on the issue*
Like in many other communities in the country and the region, discussion on this topic was a taboo, but thanks to the activities noted above and details given in appendix 5, there is now more openness on the issue.
- *Created a forum for joint action*
For several years now NCA has been the sectoral focal point for the agencies dealing with HIV and AIDS in the region. They share their plans and participate in joint activities.
- *Demand for commodities has increased (Condoms)*
As result of the awareness created there is demand for preventive commodities. This good indicator of awareness of danger of unprotected sex.

Observation:

The project activity is contributing to breaking barriers on HIV/AIDS communication.

Recommendation

NCA should increase funding for the component to cover activities projected in the 2008 project proposal document.

3.4.4.3 Water and Sanitation

The expected result and indicators are shown below;

Expected Result	Indicators	Sources of Verification
"Improved access to portable water and acceptable sanitation facilities	1. Number of boreholes providing portable water. 2.Number of pit-latrines in use 3.Number of causalities due to improper sanitation and waterborne diseases	Reports Statistics Field Visits

The following impacts were generated by this component according to the team

- *Enhanced access to safe and potable drinking water*

This is due to water facilities provided like shallow wells, boreholes, repaired boreholes and hand pumps through the project. See details Appendix 5.

- *Reduced walking distance by women to fetch water creating space for other activities*

Again as noted above this is as result of water facilities provided.

- *Enhanced community participation in water management and maintenance especially by women*

This is as a result of a deliberate effort of the project to involve women in all water management activities in the villages. They are members of the village water committees and they have been trained along with men in maintenance of the water facilities. See details in Appendix 5.

- *Increased awareness on sanitation, personal and household hygiene*

This has been as result of the various awareness activities and trainings conducted as part of the project implementation as detailed in Appendix 5.

- *Enhanced health of the community*

Water or lack of is a major contributor to ill health in all communities. Hence improved access to safe drinking water leads to improved health in the community.

- *Contributed to improved living standards*

As noted above, availability of safe drinking water reduces incidences of diseases and improves the health standards.

- *Reduction of water borne diseases*

Again as noted earlier water is major cause of diseases, so availability of safe drinking water reduces incidences of diseases.

- *Reduced water conflicts leading to peaceful coexistence*

One of the major causes of conflicts in Nuba Mountains is water both for human and livestock consumption. The supply of water through the programme has increased availability thereby reducing competition for water and reduced conflicts

Observation

The demand for safe drinking portable water has increased, as the population increases due to returnees.



A Village Water Point.

3.4.4.4 Environment

The expected result and indicators of the component are shown below;

Expected Results	Indicators	Sources of Verification
Men and women have equal access to environmental sustainable livelihoods through increased environmental awareness and action.	1.Number of trees planted 2.Number of households engaged in agriculture	Reports Statistics Field visits

NOTE

Although this component was in the original proposal submitted to MFA in September 2008, it does not appear in 2009 and 2010 work plans and budget approved by MFA.

-No felt impact.

Recommendation.

Reinstate the environment activity in the project, as the need is still there.

3.4.4.5 Resettlement and Emergency Preparedness

The expected result and indicator for the component is as below;

Expected Results	Indicator	Sources of Verification
Returnees and IDPs are peacefully settled and integrated into local communities	Numbers of returnees and IDPs settled without conflict with host communities	Reports Statistics Field visits

Impact

- *Encouraged the returnees to come back*

The provision of basic services such water, health, education and NFI through the programme has contributed to attracting the returnees to come back to Nuba Mountains.

Observation

The impacts are limited due limited activities.

Recommendation

Upscale the activities of the component as in the project document to increase impact.

3.4.4.6 Peace Building

The expected result and indicators for the component are as shown below;

Expected Results	Indicator	Sources of Verification
<p>New added in 2010</p> <p>1.The Newly established localities have visions and mission for development within their respective localities and the local communities are aware of the coming election and popular consultation process</p> <p>2.Local communities are living peacefully together and able to solve conflicts through recognized principles for peaceful conflict resolution</p>	Number of incidents or clashes between different tribes and communities and between authorities and individuals	Reports Statistics Field visits

NOTE.

Although Peace Building had been treated as independent component in the project proposal submitted to MFA, it was not approved and it has been treated as a Cross Cutting Activity in 2009 and 2010 work plan and budget in agreement with MFA. A new "Expected Result" was added in 2010 as indicated above.

Impact

- *Reduced conflicts in the community*

Observation

The impact is due provision of services by the project and not due to specific activities of this component

Recommendation

Upscale the activities of the component for more impact

3.4.4.7 Gender

The expected result and indicators for the component:

Expected Results	Indicator	Sources of Verification
Reduced GBV and increased awareness about gender issues among local authorities. Increased equitable opportunities to earn income for women and men	1. Number of women engaged in public activities 2. Number of women with their own means of income	Reports Statistics Field visits

Note

Gender had been treated as separate component in the project proposal submitted to MFA in September 2008, but was not approved. In 2009 and 2010 Work Plan and Budget approved by MFA it is treated as a Cross Cutting Activity.

Impact

- *Increased involvement of women in community affairs and visibility in decision making*

Observation

Women participation has come about due training and membership to various committees in the project implementation e.g. PTA, Water Committee, Health Committee, etc.

Recommendation

We recommend upgrading of Gender as stand alone component in the project as proposed in September 2008 Project proposal.



A lady addressing a Meeting with Evaluation Team

3.5 OBJECTIVE THREE OF THE TOR

Assessing how the Other Funded Projects (CHF) NCA is Implementing in the Nuba Mountains is Supporting the Goal and Overall Objectives of the MFA Funded Project

3.5.1 Introduction.

The Common Humanitarian Fund (CHF) for Sudan is a U.N. pooled funding mechanism for humanitarian activities in Sudan, first established in 2005 as a pilot project and fully implemented and operational since 2006. Only humanitarian projects included in the *UN and Partners Work Plan for Sudan* are eligible for CHF funding. The main objective of the CHF is to provide early and predictable funding and to support the timely allocation and disbursement of donor resources to the most critical humanitarian needs of Sudan under direction of the Humanitarian Coordinator (HC).

The CHF is designed to give the HC greater ability to target funds to the most critical needs, encourage donor contributions and allow rapid response to unforeseen needs. Both the Work Plan and the CHF help advance humanitarian aid reforms as proposed in the Secretary-General's report, "*In Larger Freedom*" such as strengthened response capacity, more predictable and timely funding to organizations, strengthened coordination, as well as donor endorsement of good humanitarian donor ship principles.

Under the CHF, donors pool their funds; however, the HC manages the funds with support from OCHA and UNDP. OCHA serves as the CHF technical unit and is responsible for managing the allocation process, whereas UNDP is the administrative agent managing the disbursement of funds to recipient organizations.

The Common Humanitarian Fund (CHF) projects which NCA is implementing in Nuba Mountains are complementary to the MFA funded project as they are funding the same components i.e. Education, Health, Water and Sanitation.

The projects are an added financial boost which bridges the gap of the needs the beneficiaries.

The CHF funded projects which NCA implemented in 2008/2009 period are as detailed below:

1. *Support to Basic Education (SUD-08/E 37).*

The goal which the project contributed to was "Ensure access to basic education for the primary school-age children belonging to returnees and host communities in Rashad and Kadugli County.

The Specific objectives of the project were;

- Increase access to quality basic education,
- Improve the quality of basic education and learning skills

2. Resettlement and Reintegration Assistance to Returnees, IDPs and Host Community (SUD-08/NS20).

The goal which the project contributed to was "Contribute to a sustainable and dignified resettlement, reintegration of returnees, IDPs and vulnerable host communities in Rashad and Kadugli County.

The Specific objective of the project was:

- Returnees, IDPs, Vulnerable host communities have access to non-food items.

3. Water and Sanitation Programme in Rashad and Kadugli Counties.

The goal it contributed to is "Increased access to clean palatable water and ensure clean healthy environment for the vulnerable host communities, and the organized and spontaneous returnees.

Specific objective

- Access to safe drinking water.
- Access to safe sanitary facilities
- Empowerment of the communities with knowledge and skills to manage their water and Sanitation facilities.
- Awareness rising among community on sanitation and hygiene aspects.

4. Primary Healthcare Services in Rashad and Kadugli County

The goal it contributed to "To increase accessibility to quality health services and to raise HIV/AIDS awareness among the communities in Rashad and Kadugli County

Specific objectives:

- Increase accessibility and quality of health services in 7 main villages
- Raise HIV and AIDS awareness
- Increase skills of health cadres in 7 health units.

In 2010 CHF is supporting the following projects

1. Support to basic education in Rashad county, Kadulgi county and Kadulgi locality.

The goal it is contributing to is "Access to quality basic education for primary school-age children belonging to returnees and host communities in Rashad and Kadulgi County (Umdorain locality, Hieban locality, and Dallamy locality)"

Specific Objective:

- to increase access to basic education
- To enhance the quality of teaching and learning environment

2. NCA Health Response Program in South Kordofan

The goal the project is contributing to is "To increase accessibility to quality health services and to raise HIV/AIDS awareness among returnees and host communities in Rashad and Kadulgi County

Specific Objective:

- Increase accessibility and quality of health services in 7 main villages
- Raise HIV and AIDS awareness
- Increase skills of health cadres in 7 health units

Observation:

A close look at the goals and objectives of these CHF sponsored project indicates that they are in harmony with the stated objectives of the NCA's "Nuba Mountain Integrated Development Programme" which is supported by MFA. The projects are complimenting NCA programme as;

a) **Location.** The project are implemented in the same localities as those supported by MFA i.e. Heiban, Dalami, Umdorain and Aburam

b) **Goals and Objective.** The activities of CHF supported projects are a mirror image those of NCA's Integrated Programme. The projects funded in 2009 and 2010 benefited *Education, Returnees, Primary Health Care, Water and Sanitation*. The beneficiaries are the same and the aim is to provide additional support where MFA support is not sufficient to meet all the required inputs. For example in 2010 the goal for support to education is stated as "Access to quality basic education for primary school-age children belonging to returnees and host communities in Rashad and Kadulgi County (Umdorain locality, Hieban locality, and Dallamy locality)". And the goal for health: "To increase accessibility to quality health services and to raise HIV/AIDS awareness among returnees and host communities in Rashad and Kadulgi County". In both cases they target the same location, community and share similar objectives. As a matter of fact the institutions like schools and health units benefiting are the same as those supported by MFA funding.

c) **Methodology.** The implementation of CHF sponsored projects is fully integrated with NCA's Nuba Mountain Development Programme. The same staff, facilities (office, vehicles), and approach is utilized. The same partners' i.e. local government and NGOs are part of the implementation process. A similar process for reporting and monitoring is in place.

Challenge

1. Channeling of funds: The evaluation team was informed that the funds are always received in June/July during the rainy season, when activities cannot be undertaken due to the rains. This always leaves a short period to carry out the tasks (end October, November and December).
2. There is a possibility of overlap in implementation so proper checks needs to be put in place.

Recommendation.

1. During the evaluation field mission, the most frequent requests put across to us was for further support for the services provided. We recommend that NCA continues to apply for funds from CHF, to supplement the support from MFA.

2. NCA should explore faster means of disbursing CHF funds.

CHAPTER FOUR

4.0 REVIEW FINDINGS

(Part 3 of the TOR)

4.1 A REVIEW OF NCA'S RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCAL AUTHORITIES AND LOCAL PARTNERS AND THE PROGRAMMS IMPACT ON PARTNERS AND LOCAL AUTHORITIES' ORGANIZATIONAL AND INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITIES

4.1.1 Introduction

NCA philosophy is working through partners rather than directly through their staff. This is in harmony with its' Vision **"Together for a Just World"**. This is reaffirmed and described in details in the NCA's "Draft Global Strategy" (2001-2015) as follows:

"Norwegian Church Aid's approach to organizational cooperation reflects a firm belief that working with and through local and national partner organizations and institutions – rather than directly through our own staff – is more likely to ensure lasting, locally owned, development and the eradication of poverty and injustice. This approach refuses to do things for people or over their heads, but works with them, and at best enables them to do the work for themselves. It guards against the assumption that outsiders know best, even if an outsider's perspective can be useful. It accepts that people, whether rich or poor, are as wise as anyone about what is best for them and how to bring it about.

Local and national institutions and organizations are therefore main actors in the work for poverty reduction and a more just distribution of resources. The development of robust, legitimate, relevant and accountable civil society is a core contribution to nation building processes and for assuring democratic ownership of development. As we support local groups and communities in their efforts to achieve immediate changes in their daily lives we also strengthen their organizations and social movements so they can better contest and advance people's rights in the longer term"

In the Nuba Mountains where NCA is implementing the MFA funded "Integrated Development Programme", it is working through partners, some are;

1. The Local Government through the Secretariats and Line Ministries
2. Non- Governmental Organizations (NGOs)
3. Locally Based Organizations (CBOs)
4. Faith Based organizations.

However the main partner is the Local Government.

(See appendix 7 for details)

4.1.2 NCA Working Relationship with the Local Government.

In Nuba Mountains NCA has worked with the local government for a long time. Since it started operating in the area in 2002 it has established a cordial working relationship with the secretariats which has been reciprocated by both parties. This relationship is based on mutual trust which has been developed over time. The working relationship is guided by Memorandum of Understanding (MOU). This MOU set out sets out the roles and responsibilities of each of the partners in the implementation process.

For a long time the secretariats have been manned by volunteers as the government presence was scarce. As such NCA was obliged to undertake direct implementation of some of the project components. After signing of CPA it was expected there would more resources and increased government presence but this did not materialize as there were disagreement at the state government level, between SPLM and NCP who formed the government. This led to existence of a dual system of government in the Nuba Mountains.

However the integration of the civil service has started, though it too has come along with some other complications. The major issue of concern is, not all those volunteers who served in the secretariat are being integrated in the government. This is bound to cause tension in the working places.

The Integration process is impacting on the project. NCA now will have to work with line ministries. The sector coordination meetings which are integral to the coordination of the sectoral activities are taking a different dimension. SRRC/HAC used to coordinating them but a new body, “ *State Council for Coordination of Humanitarian and Development Aid*” has been set up to carry out this task. At the local level it has not been clarified how this will operate.

Working with local authorities had challenges though. They had no government funding for years meaning they had very limited organizational and institutional capacities. This meant they were in most cases not able to meet their obligations as set out in the MOU. It was apparent to the review team that the project had a strain on the local authorities' capacity.

4.1.3. Working with Other Partners.

NCA is supposed to work with civil society partners in the project implementation. So far it has worked with NRRDO and to limited extent with KUSH Network and Sudan Aid. We learnt that it has been a challenge to work with local CBOs and NGOs as they are few and in their early formative stage. This is a major challenge for NCA because, the project is supposed to be building the capacity of Civil Society, i.e. “Empowering Right Holders”. The few civil societies which exist have limited capacity both institutional and organizational. It has therefore meant that NCA has had to work with few partners than was envisaged in the project.

Observation

1. NCA has overtime cultivated very good working relationship with Local Government. This is an asset. But on the flip side, this has encouraged a culture of expecting and demanding too much from NCA, as it had to go out of its way to fill gap left by local authorities and civil society.
2. The secretariats have had minimal resource in terms of material, human and financial forcing NCA to offer direct service
3. The CBOs and NGOs are very weak and at an early stage of formation.

Recommendation

1. NCA has to adapt to working with the line ministries as the secretariats are phased out through the integration process. This will mean working more closely with the Locality Commissioners' who will be coordinating all the Departments/Line Ministries at the Locality Level. When we made a courtesy call at Heiban Locality Commissioner he indicated as much. We are of the opinion this would be an opportunity as the Line Ministries will be manned by full time paid professionals. It is expected they will get financial support from the ministries' budgets.
2. NCA has to be more aggressive in seeking out local CBOs and NGOS to partner with. This should be aligned to strengthening local capacity and the NCA exit strategy from Nuba Mountains.
3. NCA should include capacity building for the local partners as part of the Integrated Development Programme.

4.2 A REVIEW OF HOW THE PROJECT RELATES TO THE CURRENT POLITICAL SITUATION AND THE POSSIBLE POLITICAL CHANGES OVER THE COMING YEARS

4.2.1 Introduction and background

Sudan is undergoing a very critical period in its history. The political decisions which have to be made in the next few months will decide the destiny of the nation. These decisions will also have significant impact on South Kordofan.

According to the CPA, Nuba Mountains is one of the "three areas" referred to as potentially explosive spots between north and south. The Nuba Mountains area is governed by the Government of Sudan as part of Southern Kordofan State. The inclusion into the CPA of the Protocol of Nuba Mountain provides for initial power sharing on a rotational basis between the NCP and SPLM, followed by a general election, then a popular consultation to renegotiate the protocol if necessary. According to the protocol, the popular consultation will give citizens of Southern Kordofan state the opportunity to rectify shortcomings in the CPA's constitutional, political and administrative arrangements, while respecting its general framework. The time to do this as set out in the CPA is at hand.

4.2.2 Current political situation

As the integration of the civil service goes on in Nuba Mountains, meaning increased government presence, there is anxiety in the air as people watch the unfolding political scenario. There are issues of significance hanging in the air.

1. The State Census announcement. This was census held in June/July 2010, after the disputed earlier census results were rejected.
2. The State Elections
3. Popular Consultation
4. Referendum in South Sudan and Abeyi.

The above are interlinked and will have significant consequence to the future of Southern Kordofan and Nuba Mountains in particular.

It is important to take into account that the current state government is a coalition between SPLM and NCP and it had its share of problems as the parties jostle for political control of the state. Hence both parties are preparing to take control of the state assembly during the next state elections schedule to be held early next year. The census results are important to this process as they dictate the number and boundaries of the constituencies for the electoral process. The control of the State Assembly is significant in that it will be the one to conduct the Popular Consultation which will decide the relationship between the state and the national government. In word it will decide the status of the state in new political dispensation.

The referendum in South Sudan and Abeyi is also closely watched in Nuba Mountains for a number of reasons. For one there is strong presence of SPLM in the region and number of Nuba people holds key positions in SPLM as they fought along with them during the war. Nuba region is on the border with South Sudan and Abeyi, so in case of conflict the impact will be felt there. It is also anticipated that there will be mass movement of people after the referendum and this will have and this will have an impact in the region.

The possible scenarios after State Elections which will have an impact in Nuba Mountains include.

- (i) SPLM loses power in South Kordofan and that will put the Popular Consultation at stake. As explained above the State Assembly elected will decided the future relations of the state and the national government, so if SPLM is not in power its preferred options will not be taken on board.
- (ii) The SPLM remain in power shared with other parties. This will mean SPLM will be in strong bargaining position to influence the future of the state.
- (iii) The National Congress Party loses power and that will put the unresolved issue in CPA and the Nuba protocol into problems. As per CPA Southern Kordofan will remains in North Sudan, so if NCP is not in power in the state, it will lead to a strained relationship with the national government.
- (iv) The South Sudan separate and that will put the SPLA in Nuba Mountain into a new situation particularly the SPLA forces. As observed earlier SPLM is key player in Nuba Mountains and has forces in the state. These forces will have to be moved leading to disruptions.

(v) An extension of the GONU into an uncertain period of no peace no war.

All the scenarios will have consequences for the implementation of the project in Nuba Mountains

Observation

1. Currently the political situation is having a minimal effect on the project implementation but, as it was said by some of those we spoke to the situation is "pregnant" and the delivery is uncertain.
2. The integration so far has had no impact. The only concern expressed is that it may cause low morale to those who will not be integrated.
3. NCA has to scrutinize those it is paying incentives to avoid double payment
4. The outcome of the State Elections and the Referendum will definitely have implications on the project. Some possibilities:
 - a) Mass movement of people from North to South and from South to North forcing NCA to relief and emergency operations
 - b) Change of Government policies which might create a more difficult operating environment for NGOs
 - c) Resumption of conflict and violence and the related insecurity consequences

Recommendation.

1. NCA to continue implementation of the project as scheduled.
2. NCA and its partners to be prepared to implement Emergency Response Plan which were informed had been collectively prepared.
3. NCA to be aware and be prepared to review focus if some of the worst case scenarios come to be.

4.3 A REVIEW OF NCA'S OWN CAPACITY TO MAKE MEANINGFUL CONTRIBUTION TO THE CRITICALLY NEEDED SOCIAL SERVICES THAT WOULD IMPROVE THE HUMAN DIGNITY OF THE PEOPLE WHO HAVE BEEN MARGINALIZED FOR FAR TOO LONG AND SUGGEST POSSIBLE CHANGES IN THE ORGANISATIONAL SETUP OR STAFFING OF THE PROGRAM

4.3.1 Introduction.

NCA's global approach to project implementation is working with local partners. However, to ensure proper and timely programme implementation its need to have its own internal capacity. In Sudan and especially in the Nuba Mountains the partners are still very weak. NCA is therefore involved in direct implementation of the project, working hand in hand with the government and other civil society partners.

4.3.2 NCA in Nuba Mountains

The main NCA office in South Kordofan is in Kadugli, with a Field office in Kauda. Until recently there was a sub-office in Heiban which has been phased out. Currently NCA has 28 programme and support staff working from the two offices. This includes:

Kadugli Office

- Programme manager
- Accountant
- Logistics/Store Keeper
- Receptionist/secretary
- Driver (2)
- Cleaner/Messenger
- Cook (at the guest house)
- Watchmen (3)

Kauda Sub- Office

- Field Officer
- Education Officer
- Water and sanitation Officer
- Resettlement Officer
- Health Officer (Vacant)
- HIV and AIDS Mobiliser
- Logistics Officer
- Accountant
- Human Resources Officer
- Drivers (3)
- Watchmen (3)
- Cooks/Cleaners (2)

The human resource is backed up with working tools which include:

- Vehicles
- Computers
- Furniture
- Communication tools
- Equipped Guests Houses in Kadugli and Kauda

4.2.3 Organizational setup

When NCA commenced operations in Nuba Mountains it operated under the South Sudan Programme which was managed from Nairobi, and later from Juba. In January 2006, NCA merged its Sudan Programme and opened its country office in Khartoum, with the office of south Sudan placed in Juba.

The Nuba Mountains operation is led by a Programme Manager based in Kadugli supported by a Field Manager based in Kauda.

The Programme Manager reports directly to the Deputy Country Director based in Juba, but he also reports to Finance and Human Resources on issues related to them. The Field Manager reports to the Programme Manager and the programme staff reports to him. We were informed this has changed from 1.10.2010 and he now reports to Senior Programme Manager based in Khartoum.

Observations

The current capacity of NCA in terms of personnel and equipment is at optimum point. The staff is doing a commendable job given the available facilities.

Reporting.

The current reporting system is cumbersome as the Programme Manager reports to various people as noted above. However we were informed that he will now be reporting to newly created office of Senior Programme Manager based in Khartoum on all matters.

Procurement.

We were informed this takes a long time for deliveries of items requisitioned by the field office from Khartoum to be delivered leading to delays in the project implementation.

Recommendation.

Staff

- There is an urgent need to replace the 'Health Officer' who resigned in May.
- We recommend the recruitment of a 'Gender Consultant' and 'Peace Officer' as proposed in the Project Proposal Document, to hasten the implementation of these components of the project. (Note: This had been proposed in the Project Proposal but was not approved by MFA)
- Gender balance should be taken into account in recruitment.

Staff Capacity building

- For efficiency staff needs to upgrade their skills and knowledge. NCA has to plan for training of the staff in Nuba Mountains as was discussed in the Senior Staff meeting in Juba earlier this year
- It was noted that the working environment in Kauda Field Office needs upgrading in terms of space and furniture.

Communication

The internet and the extension of mobile telephone network have greatly improved communication. But the field staff expressed a need for radio communication fitted to the vehicles for emergency response and for use in areas without network.

Vehicles

The availability of vehicles becomes a challenge at the peak of the operations after the rains. Hence the grounded vehicles should be repaired to support the programme implementation. We learnt it takes time to have this done.

Procurement

-There is need to review the procurement system. We learnt this takes a very long time. A case point is there has been no supply of drugs for more than year despite orders have been made.

Note

An additional expatriate position has been established, to support the programme with logistics, capacity development and emergency preparedness. The staff member will join in November 2010.

4.4 REVIEW THE DIFFERENT COMPONENTS OF THE ONGOING PROGRAMME (EDUCATION, HEALTH, HIV & AIDS, WATER AND SANITATION, RESETTLEMENT AND CROSS CUTTING ACTIVITIES) AND PROPOSE ANY CHANGES IN THE PROGRAMMES THAT ARE CONSIDERED JUSTIFIED BASED ON IMMEDIATE NEEDS, RESOURCES AVAILABLE AND A MORE LONG TERM DEVELOPMENT IMPACT.

4.4.1 Introduction.

In the proceeding chapters we have reviewed in details the project implementation. Chapter 1 we analyzed in details the progress made to date and the effectiveness of the project in meeting the projects goals. In chapter 2 we looked in some details the projects impacts on the Right Holders in the targeted area. Here we shall analyze the various components vis-à-vis the community needs.

The analysis is based on the views we got from the Right Holders during the field trips. The details of the visits are given in Appendix 1 a. We visited twenty three project sites and met with the beneficiary communities. We also held consultative meetings with the partners both local authorities and civil society. And we had a meeting with beneficiaries, partners, traditional leaders and the staff. We also consulted widely with the project staff.

4.4.2 Education

There is still an Education deficit in Nuba Mountains despite the efforts made by NCA and other actors in the last couple of years. Education was severely affected during the war, due insecurity and destruction of facilities.

The CPA and the relative peace over the last five years in South Kordofan has give an opportunity to organizations and the government to address education issues related to quality education in the state. During the last five years more schools have been constructed and opened but still many children continue to have little access to quality education resulting from poor physical and learning facilities

Despite of efforts by the organizations to build local capacities and community –school partnership through training of PTA members to participate in school management and community mobilization for construction and rehabilitation of schools, still there is low and often poor school management and community participation in many areas, and this again affects the quality of the education offered in the schools. Most of the teachers and head teachers are not trained due to lack of teacher training facility to offer short training to teachers in school management, planning, school data.

NCA has since 2003 supported the education in the Nuba through construction and rehabilitation of class rooms, distribution of school materials and school uniforms with priority to girls, supported Kauda Teacher

Training Centre with educational materials, feeding, Tutors, trained head teachers and PTAs , and support to the Printing Press, but the gap remains. See details in appendix 5

The Nuba Mountain Integrated Development Project which NCA is implementing is continuation of this intervention.

Observation.

1. A lot ground has been covered but a lot more remains to be done. NCA has contributed to laying the foundation of basic education and this has increased the appetite for more (education)
2. There was an outcry about the proposed NCA global strategy to pull out of education. Those who spoke to us said this would "DO HARM" in Nuba Mountains.
3. The matter of curriculum and the quality of teachers remains an issue of high significance, not only as an educational issue but also as an issue in relation to peaceful coexistence
4. Some of the teachers have been integrated in the civil service.

Recommendation

1. Continue the implementation of Education component as it is in the project document
2. Consider support to Adult Literacy, Vocational Training as proposed in the project document. Consideration should also be given to Early Childhood Education and scholarships as expressed by those we spoke to due the evaluation
3. NCA develops an exit strategy from the education sector in consultation with the partners. We suggest NCA identify an agency that can takeover the educational component in the project when they exit.
4. NCA to be involved as lobby in searching a solution to unification of the curriculum.

4.4.3 Health

South Kordofan has been assessed as one of the four most underserved states in South Sudan in regard to Health Services. Access to health care services and provision of quality health care services in the post conflict areas in Nuba Mountains remain low particularly in the selected areas of the former SPLM/ areas. However, the disparity in availability of health care services between war affected areas and the relatively more peaceful areas continues to be evident. The quality of health care services provided in existing facilities remains to be poor due to lack of trained health personnel and shortage of medicine. The absence of trained personnel in these localities served by NCA project is a very great gap in implementing health service in these areas.

The Nuba Mountain Integrated Project, health component is making a contribution but the needs are huge. So far the component implementation has achieved all the set targets apart from the supply of drugs.

Observation

1. The implementation of the health is meeting a need in the community especially after the other INGOs providing health services were expelled.
2. There is very limited government presence in delivery of health services

3. There has been a shortage of drugs in NCA's supported PHCC and PHCU for the last one year
4. There is increased delivery of babies in NCA's supported health units
5. The proposed Revolving Fund for drugs did not take off
6. Integration process has started and some of medical workers paid incentives have been absorbed by the civil service
7. There is an increased demand due high number of returnees.

Recommendation

1. Continue with the implementation of the component as is in the project document
2. Urgently look into the issue of drug procurement
3. NCA to work with other in health sector to look into the issue of sustainability of medical services especially drugs

4.4.4 HIV and AIDS

HIV and AIDS is one of the concerns in South Kordofan State. The awareness on HIV and AIDs in the Country and the States is the responsibility of SNAP (Sudan National AIDs Program) and they are not reaching the communities in remote areas due to the difficulty to disseminate the information about HIV/AIDS in a manner that is relevant to the multi cultures in Nuba Mountains and engagement of local structures and the faith based groups that are closed to the communities. The area also shows a high level of S.T.I. These problems are compounded by a lack of basic knowledge within the community, and lack of capacity among health workers to diagnose and treat cases.

It is also important to note that there in no VCT in Nuba project area.

Observations.

1. The project implementation is making good contribution despite limited funding.
2. The awareness of HIV and AIDS has increased in the project area.
3. There is a shortage of I.E.C. materials to support the awareness campaign like leaflets, t-shirts etc

Recommendation

1. Increase funding to cover activities projected in the project document
2. The geographical coverage of the component needs to be expanded.
3. NCA should work with actors involved in the sector to establish a VCT.
4. Support I.E.C materials need to be provided.

4.4.4 Water and Sanitation

The water and environmental sanitation situation in the Nuba Mountain region is described as poor in most of the areas under the control of former SPLA, and the GOS areas bordering the former SPLA. Most communities in the Nuba Mountains region have no access to safe drinking water sources, or sanitation facilities which make them vulnerable to waterborne and environmental diseases.

In South Kordofan only 55% of the population in former GoS areas and only 20% in the former SPLM controlled areas have access to safe drinking water.

Observation

1. The implementation of the component has achieved its targets but the demand for water is very high.
2. The provision of water and hygiene education has contributed to the communities' health.
3. The supply of water has encouraged the returnees to come back there by increasing the demand.
4. Community involvement in water management has increased through the water committees.
4. Water level is decreasing.
5. Maintenance of water pumps by the locals has increased.

Recommendation

1. Continued capacity building of partners and local authorities.
2. Introduce harvesting of rain water in buildings constructed by NCA.
3. More involvement in harvesting of surface water by construction of dams and enhance "haffairs".
4. With others who are in the sector look into supply of spare parts for the pumps.
5. NCA to lobby the government and others to develop a long-term water plan for Nuba Mountains.

4.4.5 Resettlement

Resettlement of returnees is of major concern in the Nuba Mountains. There is a need for coordinated and peaceful reintegration of returnees into the local communities. Host communities have to be sensitized and immediate needs of returnees such as food and shelter, as well as longer-term needs have to be secured.

The signing of the CPA was an important point in the Sudanese journey towards peaceful resettlement and development of people.

Since the signing of the CPA, thousands of people have returned to the Nuba Mountains. The numbers of returnees are well over 650,000 and all these have to be settled and provided with basic facilities. These high numbers are putting pressure on available resources and services. They are also adding pressure on the fragile environment.

Observation

1. There is a great need to respond to the needs of thousands of voluntary returnees.
2. There is a need to prepare host communities and provide basic services.
3. The project has responded to needs by providing NFIs.

Recommendation

1. Implement the proposals in the project document.
2. More awareness campaigns are needed for the host communities.
3. Need to train NCA staff and partners in emergency preparedness.
4. Consider the use of local materials like bricks, grass in constructions for returnees.

4.4.5 Cross cutting issues.

In the implementation of the project, *Environment, Peace Building and Gender* are combined together as cross cutting issues. But in the Project Proposal Document they had been separated and each treated as a stand alone component. This had been done, we believe because of the needs that had been identified. In fact during the evaluation, needs expressed by the respondents were similar to those in the document

Observation.

1. Only limited activities have been carried out on cross cutting issues. We believe this is due to limited funds availed in the budget and minimal staff support as there is no focal point. This is a pity because all the three areas are critical in the current situation in Nuba Mountains.

2.Environment is being degraded at alarming rate by the thousands of returnees, women involvement in decision is critical as is the need to address the issues affecting them like FMG and other traditional harmful practices, and of course peace is critical to development.

Recommendation.

1. Reinstate the component as stand alone thematic components in the project implementation
2. Avail funds to implement the activities projected in the project proposal.
3. Recruit the Gender Consultant



APPENDIX 1 Background information to the proposal submitted in 2008 to MFA

E-mail correspondence between the consultant and acting Senior Programme Coordinator pertinent to the main reference document used in the review.

Fra: Eirin Næss-Sørensen
Sendt: 11. november 2010 13:20
Til: Gathogo Ngugi
Kopi: Tore Torstad; Dawood Nabi
Emne: SV: Feedback to the mid-term review regarding the correct reference document

Dear Gathogo,

Since Eid is coming up and our office will be closed, I just wanted to be proactive and answer the question you mention in your e-mail might come, so to be sure you have the information you need now.

The benchmark to keep NCA against are the objectives and expected results that NCA says it will achieve is the annual plan 2009 and 2010 as they both have the same text (except one addition in 2010). This is what we are to be held accountable to. As far as progress on activities you have already in the report differentiated between 2009 and 2010 activities and commented on progress. That said I still think that a section should be included (as mentioned in my e-mail from yesterday) about the history of the proposal and the changes made. I think it is important to be transparent on this point.

If you have any further questions over the next 10 days, kindly contact Dawood or Tore, do cc me in, but I will not be online.

Best regards,

Eirin

Fra: Gathogo Ngugi [gathogongugi@yahoo.co.uk]
Sendt: 10. november 2010 15:40
Til: Eirin Næss-Sørensen
Kopi: Tore Torstad; Dawood Nabi
Emne: Re: Feedback to the mid-term review regarding the correct reference document

Dear Eirin,

Thanks for the email.

I will study the letters. I am sure they have an impact on the report presentation. The changes were mentioned/explained to me but I assumed those affected the Annual Plans and not the Three Year Project, from where the Annual Plans are drawn from.

My question still remains, What document do I use as a benchmark?. What are we measuring the achievement against?. Just the annual

plan? Maybe it will be clear when i read the attachment. I will come back to you.
Kind regards,
Gathogo

--- On Wed, 10/11/10, Eirin Næss-Sørensen <Eirin.Naess-Sorensen@nca.no> wrote:

From: Eirin Næss-Sørensen <Eirin.Naess-Sorensen@nca.no>
Subject: Feedback to the mid-term review regarding the correct reference document
To: "gathogongugi@yahoo.co.uk" <gathogongugi@yahoo.co.uk>
Cc: "Tore Torstad" <tore@ncasudan.org>, "Dawood Nabi" <dawood@ncasudan.org>
Date: Wednesday, 10 November, 2010, 11:20

Dear Gathogo,
I have been in touch with Tore and Dawood and learnt that the three documents (proposal 2008, annual work plan 2009 and 2010) have been shared with you. They told me that they have explained the changes to you and that the annual plans for 2009/2010 are the result of the feedback from MFA to the first proposal and that they have kept the same expected results during these two years. That they are different from the original proposal is true, but these changes are also approved by the MFA. One reason why this communication has not been as clear as might have been desired is that NCA had not updated the original proposal or attached an amendment to it to make this clear. A lot of the information in grant letters between NCA HQ and the Norwegian MFA is also in Norwegian which makes it difficult for all to access this information. These two points we recognise as issues that are our responsibility and also issues to be addressed by us. Moving on to finalise the report I therefore suggest that a section is added, where appropriate, to trace and explain the history of the proposal, so that it is clear for the reader as well, to explain what was taken out and why. I have added some background information to this below to provide you with as much information as possible. The implications to the report of this is that some of the points in the report where it is referred to that activities have not happened, it must be checked if this then refers to the 2008 document or to the annual plan of 2009/2010. If it is the first it should either be taken out as it is not relevant (we can not be judged on something we never set out to do) or a footnote added explaining that due to MFA recommendations NCA made changes which were accepted and hence some activities were not included, although they were in the original proposal.

Information on the history of the proposal, taken from communication between NCA and Norwegian MFA, donor to the project:

1. Late 2008 (12.10.08) MFA granted the 3 year proposal with the

following issues for clarification to the original proposal (see attached letter translated to English from Norwegian)

2. NCA responded with a letter on the 1st March 2009, together with the annual work plan and budget 2009, which was subsequently approved (the letter is only in Norwegian so I have translated the main points here):

'Responding to the specifications asked for in MFA's letter NCA has done a new assessment of the programme and wishes to present a revised work plan and budget, where the main components will be on education, WASH and health. To contribute to a holistic approach to development NCA will continue to integrate the peace and reconciliation work and to secure women's participation into the other main components of the programme. However, we have chosen to keep a budget line on cross cutting initiatives to provide a transparent budget. Funds for the suggested position as Peace and Reconciliation Officer has been taken out as well as that for the Gender consultant. The efforts will be concentrated in the geographical areas where NCA has its other activities: Rashad County and Kadugli County'.

Further the letter goes on to saying that NCA sees the attached revised budget and work plan as in line with what the Norwegian MFA called for in their letter on 10.12.08

As you can see from these two letters, changes were done and approved by the MFA, which provided a set of objectives and expected results which were different from the original proposal, but still kept the overall intent. This is important to make clear in the review. Late 2009 a new work plan and budget for 2010 was presented to MFA and approved. It had an added expected result, but apart from that, objectives and expected results were kept the same. The activities changed of course.

I hope this information gives you a clearer picture of the life of the project and a better position on which to finalize the report according to the agreed TOR.

Please contact me if you have any further questions, although tomorrow is my last day in the office before the office breaks for Eid. I am back in the office again on the 22nd Nov.

Best regards,
Eirin

Fra: Gathogo Ngugi [gathogongugi@yahoo.co.uk]

Sendt: 5. november 2010 13:06

Til: Eirin Næss-Sørensen

Kopi: Tore Torstad; Dawood Nabi

Emne: Re: SV: Feedback to the mid-term review

Dear Eirin,

Thanks for the email.

I still need more clarity on what document we should use as point of reference for the mid-term review. As you have pointed out we used the proposal submitted to MFA in November 2008. This was done

because:

1. If you look at the TORs the project period is 15.11.2008--31.12.2011. Further the last paragraph of the background (page 1: 1.0), reads "NCA is currently implementing a three years integrated development programme in the Nuba Mountains funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA)." . To us this was logical because it is a "Mid-Term Evaluation" of a given period (3 years), to assess what has been achieved vis-a-vis what is projected. Using the annual plans as you have suggested cannot achieve this objective. Please consult on this and let me know what the position is.

2. On the report, as indicated earlier I will provide more details. But note again I was guided more by the expected output of the TORS which laid more emphasis on the IMPACT. It reads in part ,

"6.1A summary and brief assessment of the overall impact of the NCA presence in the Nuba Mountains and implemented Projects

6.2 A more detailed evaluation of the impact of the various components of the Projects and possible recommendations for changes (geographically, thematically, approach, etc.)".

I look forward to hearing from you.

Kind regards,

Gathogo

--- On Thu, 4/11/10, Eirin Næss-Sørensen <Eirin.Naess-Sorensen@nca.no> wrote:

From: Eirin Næss-Sørensen <Eirin.Naess-Sorensen@nca.no>

Subject: SV: Feedback to the mid-term review

To: "Gathogo Ngugi" <gathogongugi@yahoo.co.uk>

Cc: "Tore Torstad" <tore@ncasudan.org>, "Dawood Nabi" <dawood@ncasudan.org>

Date: Thursday, 4 November, 2010, 13:55

Dear Gathogo,

Just to clarify this point a bit further. The proposal itself was not revised, but the adjusted annual plan for 2009 and 2010 have both been approved by the MFA and is what we are kept to. So there is no detailed document that has been resubmitted. The MFA asked NCA to adjust some of the elements in the original proposal before they could accept it full. This was done and approved through the annual plan for 2009.

I look forwards to hearing from you. Best regards, Eirin

Fra: Gathogo Ngugi [gathogongugi@yahoo.co.uk]

Sendt: 4. november 2010 14:43

Til: Eirin Næss-Sørensen

Kopi: Tore Torstad; Dawood Nabi

Emne: Re: Feedback to the mid-term review

Dear Eirin

thanks for the email.

I will look at the issues you have raised and come back to you.
I did not get the revised version of Feb. 2009. What I was availed were annual plans, but not a detailed document resubmitted.

Kind regards,

Gathogo

APPENDIX 2A Review plan: programme of meetings and consultations with stakeholder

(The field mission took place from 4th -17th October 2010)

DATE	ACTIVITY	REMARKS
4 th	-External consultant arrival Khartoum	
5 th	-External consultant travel to Kadugli -Meeting with the Programme Manager -Security briefing -Introduction to South Kordofan State, the context (Economic, Social and Political) -NCA Nuba Mountains Program	
6 th	-Visit to SRRC/HAC -Visit to ministry of Water -Preparation of evaluation documents	
7 th	-Travel to Kauda -Evaluation Team Meeting -Meeting with the Field Manager and Program Staff -Setting and discussions on project sites visits, meetings with local vernment and other partners.	
8 th	-Visit to SRRC/HAC -Meeting with secretariat oh health -Meeting with NRRDO (Executive Director and Programme Manager) -Meeting with WASH (UNCIEF Representative and Ministry of Water)	-All the visits were within Kauda
9 th	-Meeting with K TTC (Deputy Principal and Dean of Students) -Visit the Printing Press -Visit to Drug Store -Visit Kuda Primary -Kudi Primary Schools	-Proposed visit to Farish Primary School could not take place due heavy rains - in both schools we met parents, teachers, local leaders and

		former students
10 th	-Visit Longoro Health Center -Visit to Shawaya Health unit -Visit to Hieban Dispensary -Courtesy call on Hieban Locality Commissioner	
11 th	-Travel to Umdorain Locality -Visit To Abuliela School -Visit Kurchi Health Unit Visit Tangle School Visit Kain Health Unit -Meeting with Umdorain Locality Commissioner (met Executive Director)	
12 th	-Meeting with Regional Education Office/REO -Meeting with Programme Staff	
13 th	-Travel to Dalami Locality -Visit to Sabat Primary School -Courtesy call Locality Commissioner (met Deputy Commissioner, local leaders and Community representatives)	
14 th	-Forum for Partners, Beneficiaries, and Civil Society -Evaluation Team meeting with Field Manager -Evaluation Team Meeting	The Forum was attended by 25 participants
15 th	-Evaluation Team briefing with the Programme Manager and Field Manager -Travel back to Kadugli	
16 th	-Travel back to Khartoum	
17 th	-Briefing with Senior Programme Manager -Travel back to Nairobi	

APPENDIX 2B: List of people met during the Mission.

NAME	ORGANISATION	POSITION
Mr. Dawood	SRRC/HAC, Kadugli	Deputy Commissioner
Mr. Ali	Ministry of Water Resources, Kadugli	Ag. General Manager, Rural Works
Ms Nagwa Musa Konda	NRRDO	Executive Director
Ms Fatuma Ibrahim	KTTC	Head Girl
Khamis Khalid	KTTC	Head Boy

Makhtar Saad	Health Secretariat	Kauda
Suleman Damre	Kudi "A' Primary School	Chairman, PTA
Isaac Malak	NCA	H R Officer
Kajiri Marjan	Women Association	Member
Elamin Shawish	NCA	Resettlement Officer
Juma Suleiman	NCA	HIV&AIDS Officer
Majdi Abdurahaman	NCA	Education Officer
Gasim Kodi Kome	KTTC	Member, Board of Governors
Habil Stephanus Salley	Regional Education Office	Education Officer
Mahdi Amur Daud	NRRRDO	Education Coordinator
Fadollalla Kindi	SRRC/HAC	Evaluation Team
James K.	KTTC	Principal
Muhager Hamid	NCA	Field Officer
Mary Ibrahim	Women Association	Finance
Hussein Nalukuri	Traditional Chief	Chief of Otoro
Younan Plbaroud	SPLM	Chair, Heiban
Carlo John Kuku	NCA	Accountant
Suleiman Kodi	NCA	WASH Officer
Yeshiwas Assefa	NRRDO	Programme Manager
Dawood Narbi	NCA	Programme Manager
Ms Khamisa Mohamed	UNICEF	Representative, Kauda
Hakim Suleiman Kodi	WES/Ministry of Water Resources	Representative.
Mr. Kamal Noor	Heiban Locality	Commissioner, Heiban
Ibrahim Osman	Secretariat of Health	Deputy Director
Kwaje Joseph Abraham	KTTC	Deputy Principal
Daniel Mayom Deng	Kauda Model Primary School	Head teacher
Jacob	KTTC	Dean: Academics
James Khalifa Hassan	Kauda Model Primary School	Deputy Head teacher
Ramtallah Ibrahim Damri	Kauda Model Primary School	Chairman, PTA

NOTES

1. In the site we visited we met with members of the committees (PTAs, Health, Water), local leaders (traditional chiefs), and beneficiaries. In all the meetings there was an average of twenty participants
2. Women well represented in the meetings
3. In all the meetings the participants spoke highly of NCA contribution, and invariably asked for more services!

4. All those we met were well informed of NCA's programme
5. In the meetings the community expressed their needs as Education, Water and Health
6. We visited all the localities where the project is being implemented i. e. Heiben, Umdorin, Dalami and Aburam.
7. The programme staff accompanied the Evaluation team during the visits.

APPENDIX 3: Speech from a head teacher

(KAUDA MODEL PRIMARY SCHOOL)

I would like to take this opportunity to welcome you to our School, thanks for your concern of you being here today to see how far we have gone as far as education is concerned.

You as our donors surely you have done great to us as well as South Kordofan region. Today we are not ashamed to say that most of the school facilities we have is from you.

Though you have done a lot we are still looking forward for more aid or help, for example our school is facing a rough time when it comes for the issue of fetching water. Kauda model school is densely populated to an extent that you can get nearly every tribe, therefore the 2 boreholes we are having can't serve the school and the communities. We beg if possible to drill one borehole for us within the school compound.

Second Point. Due to large numbers of pupils we have, it is hard for us to control them during break time. I and the committee of the school, we have that the only solution to this problem is to seek help from you our donors to make for us a permanent fence.

Third Point is about teachers' compound. You know our people have not yet understood the importance of education. We are facing it hard to convince them to construct a permanent teacher's compound. I therefore beg you again if possible to use this school as an example by erecting permanent structures for our teachers. In addition to that we've our young children / pre-unit who are still learning under the trees. Please we beg for an addition of 1 or 2 classrooms.

Fourth point. If you can move around our school compound you may realize that most of the classes are electrified but no generators. We are still waiting for a well wisher to stand with us so that when we have such coaching in future pupils/candidates may make proper use of their time.

Fifth, I would like to talk about school uniforms. Surely it is very hard for a visitor to differentiate a teacher and a pupil. I therefore stand this opportunity to ask you if possible you can also stand with us.

Lastly school materials. We have been receiving support from other bodies but it cannot sustain us. Please if possible you can help in the following

- 1) Text books: English, math, science, C.R.E, Kiswahili and S.S.T
- 2) Exercise books, pencils, geometrical set, rulers, e.t.c

Thank in advance

Signed

1. Daniel Mayom Deng (Head teacher).
2. Ramtallah Ibrahim Damri (PTA Chairman)
3. James Khalifa Hassan (Deputy Head teacher)

APPENDIX 4: Tangal Community meeting with review team and NCA staff

AGENDA

Appreciation from community about passed work.

- Construction of the four classrooms, two offices and two stores
- Drilling of water through some bore holes were completed

EXPECTATIONS/REQUESTS

- Drilling of uncompleted borehole talked about above
- Addition of 4 more classrooms to be constructed
- Renovation of classroom blown by the wind
- Recent constructed Clinic but not support in which we need your help
- Water. The present water is far from school, if you can extend to near the school

By Tangal Development Committee.

APPENDIX 5: Report on Stakeholders Forum Held on 14th October 2010 at NCA Compound, Kauda

A) List of Participants

NAME	ORGANISATION	POSITION
Ms Nagwa Musa Konda	NRRDO	Executive Director
Ms Fatuma Ibrahim	KTTC	Head Girl
Khamis Khalid	KTTC	Head Boy
Suleman Damre	Kudi "A' Primary School	Chairman, PTA
Isaac Malak	NCA	H R Officer
Kajiri Marjan	Women Association	Member
Elamin Shawish	NCA	Resettlement Officer
Juma Suleiman	NCA	HIV&AIDS Officer
Majdi Abdurahaman	NCA	Education Officer
Gasim Kodi Kome	KTTC	Member, Board of Governors
Habil Stephanus Salley	Regional Education Office	Education Officer

Mahdi Amur Daud	NRRRDO	Education Coordinator
Fadollalla Kindi	SRRC/HAC	Evaluation Team
James K.	KTTC	Principal
Muhager Hamid	NCA	Field Officer
Mary Ibrahim	Women Association	Finance
Hussein Nalukuri	Traditional Chief	Chief of Otoro
Younan Plbaroud	SPLM	Chair, Heiban
Carlo John Kuku	NCA	Accountant
Suleiman Kodi	NCA	WASH Officer
Yeshiwas Assefa	NRRDO	Programme Manager
Dawood Narbi	NCA	Programme Manager
J. Gathogo Ngugi	Evaluation Team	Consultant

B) Summary of Group Discussions.

After the plenary session on introductions and welcome remarks, participants were briefed on the Mid-Term evaluation and their participation in the process. To facilitate their input it was agreed to break into discussion group, where there would be more in-depth discussions and report back in the plenary session. The forum was divided into four groups and topics allocated as follows:

1. Benefits of NCA Activities/Programme to the Community
2. NCA's Relationship with Local Governments and other Partners.
3. NCA Projects Impacts in the Community
4. Identifying Community needs

Group One Report.

Benefits of the Project, "Nuba Mountain Integrated Development Programme", to the Community

1. Education
 - Eight Schools constructed (Kudi ,Chawere, Tangel, Al Ferish, Kauda, Abulela), Kauda Teacher Training College.
 - Training conducted to P.T.A, Teachers, and Head Teachers.
2. Health
 - Vaccinations to children
 - Construction of Health Centres
 - Provision of Drugs to Health Centres
 - Training of Health Workers
 - 2005 Yellow Fever Vaccination
3. HIV & AIDS

- Conducted Training/Workshops to Communities
- Conducted Awareness Campaigns

4. Water

- Drilling of Boreholes/Shallow Wells: Fixing pumps: Training: Spare Parts (but many are broken, spare parts not sufficient)
- Water Sanitation Training, Pit Latrines slabs (but little and stopped)

5. Environment

- Not well done

6. Resettlement and Emergency

- NFI Kits distributed but not enough
- Resettlement of returnees was not done properly,(they suffered shortage of water and kits)
- NCA provided water and health for community which let the returnees to back

7. Peace and Governance

- We are not getting awareness on popular consultation

8. Gender

- Gender Awareness training conducted
- Renovation of Kauda Women Center
- Skill training on Tailoring , machines given

Group Two

NCA's Relationship with Local Authorities and Other Partners.

1) There is good relationship, cooperation and coordination between NCA and Local Authorities.

These are

i) Consult before implementing the project

ii) There is always co-operation and coordination in implementing the projects

iii) They (NCA) are always punctual and committed to their contract

iv) NCA always makes awareness to the community before starting any project by showing the benefits of the project

2) Amiable relationship between NCA and its partners. E.g. On many occasions NCA has hosted partners in its premises.

3) They are also cooperative with the communities in assisting with materials e.g. chairs etc for events and formal activities

Recommendation

We recommend further extension of NCA services to the community in the areas not reached by their services e.g. Dalamani area and its surrounding villages, Buran locality and surroundings to strengthen relation between NCA and the community

Group Three

NCA Projects Impacts in the Community.

Education

- Build capacity of teachers
- Provision of teachers
- Provision of school environment
- Reduced the burden of parents and reduced the drop out of pupils and attract them to continue in school.
- Reduced illiteracy in the communities and encouraged self reliance

Negative Impact

- NCA is not covering all the areas so some communities feel that they are left out and marginalized.

Health

- Improved the health facilities and environment
- Access to EPI and free treatment
- Reducing the distance to health service
- Improving the awareness of community on health issues
- Capacity building of health workers
- Reduction of diseases prevalent in the area

Negative Impact

- Dependency Syndrome due to free services

Water and Sanitation

- Stability and security for the community by providing safe drinking water

Group Four

Community Basic Needs.

1. Education

- Training of Teachers
- Training of head teachers and PTA on schools management
- Provision of school materials/text books and sports materials
- Construction and rehabilitation of classrooms
- Adult education
- Vocational training centres
- Capacity building of local authorities
- Community mobilization
- Provision of boreholes to schools
- Provision of schools uniform
- School latrines
- Support to secondary schools
- Support to scholarships.

Health

- Capacity building for health workers (internal and external)
- Construction and rehabilitation of health centres/units
- Provision of medicines and medical equipment
- Support of vaccination programme
- Provision of ambulance

Capacity building for local authorities

- Support to HIV/AIDS

Water and Sanitation

- Drilling of boreholes
- Construction of dams
- Capacity building of water committees
- Maintenance of boreholes
- Construction of pit latrines (schools, public and household)

Environment

- Support establishment of tree nurseries
- Support World Environment Day
- Capacity building

Resettlement

- Provision of Emergency Kit
- Capacity building

Peace Building

- Facilitate and support workshops for building trust and reconciliation
- Support of various peace building initiatives
- Training of Trainers

Gender

- Income generating
- Support to their activities

APPENDIX 6: Some background data on Nuba Mountains

a) Education

2010 Statistics

- Number of Primary Schools in the region - 288
- Number of pupils registered in the region - 45,000
- Number of Teachers in the region - 1163
- Number of Secondary Schools - 6
- Number of Teachers integrated into Civil Service – 533 (October 2010)
- Number of pupils enrolled in NCA supported Schools - 7087 (2750 F 4236M)

2009 Statistics

County	Nos. Of Schools	Boys Registered	Girls Registered	Male Teachers	Female Teachers
Rashed	129	12729	9254	330	69
Kadugli	72	9428	6681	117	13

Source: Regional Education Office, Kauda.

Kaunda Teachers Training Centre:

Started in 2003 with NCA support. To date it has trained over 300 teachers

NCA contribution in 2009 & 2010

- Constructed 8 classrooms and 4 offices: Benefiting 2051 pupils (598 F and 1453 M)
- Distribution of educational materials to 18 schools in 2009 and 15 schools in 2010: Benefiting 13589 (5302 F and 8287 M)
- Distribution of School uniforms: 840 girls in 2009 and 1200 pupils in 2010.
- Training of Head Teachers: 104 (18 F and 86 M)
- Training of PTA: 118 (36 F and 82M)
- Support to K TTC: 8 tutors; 12 Support Staff; 3 Administration staff.
- In 2009 K TTC graduated 97 Teachers. (23F and 74 M)
- Support to Printing Press: Repair and Renovation of building
- Payment of Expatriate Teachers: 12 each year (4F and 8M)

NCA Contribution during 2006 -2008

Component/Activity	2006	2007	2008
1. EDUCATION.			
1.1.1Number of classrooms constructed/rehabilitated.	See table below	See table below	See table below
1.1.2Number of school Uniforms given (girls 600: boys 700). Number of Textbooks and Stationeries (girls 1347:boys	7schools in former SPLA	See table below	1300 uniforms, (600F and

2000)	area. 9schools in former GoS area	See table below	700M)
1.1.3'Food for Education Programme' -Number of Schools reached -Number of pupils reached (girls.67 boys 61)	3 128	3 700	1 150
1.1.4 Short Term Management Training/workshops. -Teachers trained -Head Masters -PTA Members		25 22	
1.1.5 Number of teachers provided incentive through NRRDO	12	12	12
1.1.6 Support to KTTC. -Number of course held -Number of teachers trained (male: 18. Female.13) -Number of Tutors and Local staff received incentives -Educational Materials provided	150 23 128	3 150 23 127	1 30 23 128

Table below show the Construction of Classrooms and distribution of Educational Materials in 2006-2008.

School	County	Payam	The number of villages	Classrooms constructed	The number of the Pupils benefiting.		
					M	F	Total
Rashad County							
Smoking	Rashad	Eldo	6	6+ educational materials	505	359	864
Kodi	Rashad	Eldo	8	4+educational materials	260	518	778
Kumo	Rashad	Kumbur	4	2+educational materials	259	159	418
Uroma	Rashad	Kawaleeb	4	Educational materials	224	150	374
Sabad	Rashad	Kawaleeb	7	Educational materials	233	245	478
Kambara	Rashad	Eldo	6	Educational materilas	242	136	378
Total Rashad			35	12	1723	1567	3290
Kadulgi County							
Kororak	Kadulgi	Ngorban	4	Educational materials	140	125	265

Tangel	Kadugli	Ngurban	5	2+edu materials	345	195	540
Alabu	Kadugli	Ngorban	7	2+Edu materials	250	124	374
Abuliela	Kadugli	Nogurban	6	2+Edu materials	312	179	491
Total Kadulgi County			22	6	1047	623	1670
Kadulgi Locality							
Hieban Girls	Heiban administrative unit		1	2+edu materials		690	690
Hieban boys	..		1	2+educational materilas	860		860
Eri	..		3	Educational materials	415	202	617
Umdarafi Lira	..		1	+education materials	311	121	432
Umdarafi Shaibon	..		1	+educational materials	156	98	254
Alazrag			3	2+educational materials	205	140	345
Total Kadulgi Locality			10	6	1947	1251	3198
Grand Total			67	24	4717	3441	8158

Source: Report of Programme of Review of NCA's Operation in the Nuba Mountains; April 2008

b) Health

NCA is:

-Supporting 2 Primary Health Care Centres and 7 Primary Health Care Units

In 2009, 34162 people attended NCA supported health units (19203 F and 14959 M)

-Sponsoring training of health cadres as shown below.

-Paying incentives for 50 health Workers

-Supporting the supply of essential drugs in the region

-Supported the construction of the only WHO standard Medical Store

-Supporting EPI, through transport, storage of drugs, vaccination campaigns and training of vaccinators.

Health Achievement Matrix

2.HEALTH	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010
2.1.1 Number of health facilities constructed -Number of health facilities rehabilitated.	See table below	See table below			
2.1.2 Clinical training: Nos. trained	-	-	2	10	11

2.1.3 Nursing training: Nos. trained	2	-	2		
2.1.4 Laboratory technicians trained	-	-	3		
2.1.5 Vaccinators trained	25	-	25		20
2.1.6 Number of nurses trained locally	-	-	4		
2.1.7 Refresher courses: nos. health workers trained (CHW, TBA,	45 15CHW 30 TBA	-	15 CHW		
2.1.8 Training of village Health Educators. Nos.	15	-	22	12	
2.1.9 Provide incentives to Health workers; nos.	42	42	49	45	
2.1.10. Vaccination Campaigns. -Nos. of campaigns held -Nos. of partners supported	4 2	5 2	1 1		
2.1.11 Supply of essential drugs and vaccines to health centers. -No. of PHCC supplied - No. of health units supplied and supported	60 kits 1 6	30 kits 2 disp. 1 6	- 2 disp. 1 6	6PHCU 2PHCC	
Organize Health education Sessions held Nos. attended		82 4209			
2.2.3Monthly Routine Immunization Nos. Vaccinated		7339	5000		5550

Table of PHCCs and PHCUs supported by NCA

Name of clinic	Type	County	Payam	Population	Partner
Longoro Health Center	Health center	Rashad	Eldo	45 645	Secretariat of Health
Shawaya	Health unit	Rashad	Eral	8 712	Secretariat of Health
Heiban	Health dispensary	Rashad	Eral	No information available	GOS and secretariat of Health
Chawery	Health unit	Rashad	Eldo	10 123	Secretariat of Health
Kain	Health unit	Kadugli	Ngorban	12 316	Secretariat of Health
Ere	Health unit	Rashad	Eldo	6 817	Secretariat of Health
Kurchi	Health unit	Kadugli	Ngorban	14 209	Secretariat of Health
Total				72 822	

APPENDIX 7: List of NCA partners in the Nuba Mountains.

Local Governments and Secretariats.

Education, Health

Water Resources, SRRC/HAC

Civil Society

Nuba Relief, Rehabilitation and Development Organisation. (NRRDO)

KUSH Network

The Women Association (Nuba)

Sudan Council of Churches, Sudan Aid

APPENDIX 8: Questionnaire to NCA Staff and partners

We have been tasked to carry out a Mid-Term Review of NCA's Integrated Development Programme (MFA) in Nuba Mountains. To assist in this exercise we request your input by responding to the following questions.

1. According to you what are the major achievements of the NCA supported programmes:

1.1-----

1.2-----

1.3-----

2. In your opinion what components of the programme [Education, Health, HIV/AIDS, Water and Sanitation, Environment, Resettlement, Peace Building and] had the most positive impact?

2.1-----

2.2-----

2.3-----

3. And which component would you consider to have had the least impact.

3.1-----

3.2-----

3.3-----

4. In your opinion is the programme coverage area [geographical] adequate compared to community needs

a.Adequate

B .Too Wide

c. Limited.

Please comment on your answer above;

5 Based on your experience and knowledge what are the pressing community needs in the Nuba Mountains?

51-----

52-----

53-----

6. In your opinion is the current NCA capacity adequate to implement the project?

Yes/No.

Comment on your choice

7. In you opinion is current staffing level adequate to carry out the task of implementing the programme.

Yes/No,

Comment on your Choice.

8. In your opinion is the current organizational structure of NCA suited for the implementation of the programme.

Yes/No.

Your suggestion on suitable structure for proper implementation

9 How would describe/comment on the working relationship with partners and local authorities

10. In your opinion are the partners important to the project implementation

Yes/No

Comment

11. According to your knowledge and experience is the project supporting all those in need in the project area

Yes/No.

Comment

12. Are there some communities or section who feels left out by the project

13 How is the current political situation affecting the implementation of the project?

14. In your opinion what changes needs to introduced to the programme implementation to ensure sustainability after the project funding ends

15. Any additional comments or suggestions

Name.....

Position.....

QUESTIONNAIRE FOR PARTNERS

We have been requested to carry out a review of NCA's Integrated Development Programme in Nuba Mountains (MFA). Your response to the questions below will be very helpful to this exercise

1. List the project component you are partnering with NCA.

2. How long have your organisation been working with NCA

3. Briefly comment on your partnership/working relationship with NCA-

4. From your experience does the partnership demand too much resource [Staff, transport, office space] from your organization?

Yes/No

Please briefly comment your response above

5. How would you rate NCA response to your requests on project implementation?

Fast

Normal

Slow

Comment on you answer above

6. From your experience how would you describe the achievements and benefits of NCA programme to the community

7. Which of the six components of the project [Education, Health, Water and Sanitation, Peace Building and Gender], you would consider to have had the most impact

8. According to your opinion is NCA project reaching most of those in need?

Yes

No

Please Comment on your response.

9. What is you opinion on geographical coverage of the project

Adequate

Not adequate

Can be expanded.

Please comment on your response.

10. From your experience what are the pressing needs of the communities living in Juba Mountains

11. In your opion how is the current political situation affecting the project implementation?

13. From your experience what needs to be done to ensure the project sustainability once the donor support ends

Name of Organizations –

Respondent –

APPENDIX 9: Terms of Reference for the consultant

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Subject:	Mid-Term review of NCAs Integrated Development Programme in Nuba Mountains
Project period:	15.11.2008 – 31.12.2011
Project ID:	NCA: PID 170033 MFA: SDN-2019 SDN-07/055
Duration:	Two weeks (September 2010)
Team Leader:	External Consultant
Team members:	(3+1)

1.0 Background

Nuba Mountains is located in South Kordofan in the central western part of Sudan. The area is characterized by a range of mountains, which are inhabited by semi-agro pastoralist communities. Nuba Mountains is classified as one of the least developed areas in the Sudan when it comes to existing infrastructure and public services such as education, health and water. The area is only open between November and May every year, as the rainy season from June to October renders it inaccessible. The area is inhabited by tribes of Lebang, Ottoro, Tira, Shawaya, Moro and Lira, of which the majority are located in the former SPLA/M controlled areas. The Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA) signed between NCP and SPLA/M has created opportunities for humanitarian agencies wishing to work to uphold the peace and promote reconciliation among the people in Nuba Mountains.

NCA started an integrated program in Nuba in 2002, working on both sides of the conflict line, but within a relatively limited geographical range. The area spans from Kauda on the former SPLA/M area, via the Hieban locality in the former GoS area to Kadugli, the capital town of south Kordofan.

NCA is currently implementing a three years integrated development programme in the Nuba Mountains funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA).

2.0 Project Goal and Specific Objectives

The Goal of the Project is:

Sustained peace by empowering right holders to claim their fair share of opportunities, resources and services.

The Specific Objectives are:

- (A) Strengthening the Duty Bearers ability to deliver basic social services to the Right Holders.
- (B) Strengthening a holistic understanding of peace building and conflict transformation.

3.0 Objective of the Mid-Term review:

- (1) To review the progress to date and the effectiveness of the Project and to what extent the purpose of the Project is being/has been achieved.
- (2) Assessing the Projects impact on the Right Holders in the targeted areas
- (3) Assessing how the other funded projects (CHF) NCA are implementing in the Nuba Mountains is supporting the Goal and the Overall Objectives of the MFA funded Project.

The review should specifically consider the following components and suggest possible changes in the present approach used:

- 3.1 NCA's relationship with local authorities and local partners and the programs impact on partners and local authorities' organizational and institutional capacities.
- 3.2 How the programme relates to the current political situation and the possible political changes over the coming years.
- 3.3 NCA's own capacity to make meaningful contribution to the critically needed social services that would improve the human dignity of the people who have been marginalized for far too long and suggest possible changes in the organizational setup or staffing of the program.
- 3.4 Review the different components of the ongoing programme (Education, Health, HIV & AIDS, Water and Sanitation, Resettlement and Cross Cutting Activities) and propose any changes in the programmes that are considered justified based on immediate needs, resources available and a more long term development impact.

4.0 Approach

The review shall be carried out in close contact with the Senior Management staff of NCA Sudan programme, Core Partners and Local Authorities.

The review team shall visit the field office in Kadugli and the sub-office in Kauda, and carry out consultation meetings with all major partners and Local Government Officials.

Before the Review Team prepare their final report they should have a debriefing and discussions on their findings with the Programme Manager for Nuba Mountains and other available Senior Management Staff in Khartoum.

5.0 Sources of input

The main work will be carried out through a field visit to the various locations and operational areas in the Nuba Mountains. Relevant information will also be collected from NCA's Country Office in Khartoum. NCA will provide the review team with relevant documents and statistics.

The team will during the field work consult relevant NCA staff, local partners and local authorities in the Nuba Mountains.

6.0 Expected Output

The output of the Mid-Term review shall be in the form of a report describing the following elements:

- 6.1 A summary and brief assessment of the overall impact of the NCA presence in the Nuba Mountains and implemented Projects
- 6.2 A more detailed evaluation of the impact of the various components of the Projects and possible recommendations for changes (geographically, thematically, approach, etc.)

The Review Report shall be submitted to NCA Country Director / Deputy Country Director before 30 October 2010.

7.0 Budget

Tentative budget figures:

External consultant / Team leader: 20 days x USD 300	USD 6.000
Consultant Travel Costs	USD 2.500
Travel costs / per diem national staff (4x10xUSD 30)	USD 1.200
Contingencies	<u>USD 300</u>
<u>Grand Total</u>	<u>USD 9.000 x 2,6 = SDG 23.400</u>

All costs related to the assessment study will be covered by NCA from PID 170033