

WORKERS' AWARENESS CAPACITY BUILDING PROGRAM

EVALUATION REPORT

**CONFEDERATION OF ETHIOPIAN TRADE UNIONS
AND NORWEGIAN CHURCH AID ETHIOPIA**

DEBEBE HAILEGEBRIEL

FEBRUARY 2011
ADDIS ABABA

Contents

Contents	2
Chapter One	3
Introduction	3
1. Socio Political Context	3
2. Legal and policy contexts for non state actors and trade unions in Ethiopia..	4
3. Purpose of the Evaluation.....	6
4. Scope of the Evaluation	6
5. Methodology of the Evaluation	6
Chapter Two	7
Governance.....	7
1. Organizational Background.....	7
2. Organizational Objectives	7
3. Organizational structure.....	8
Chapter Three	11
Project Context, Design and Implementation	11
1. Context	11
2. Project Design	13
3. Project Implementation	16
Chapter Four.....	18
Project Analysis.....	18
1. Introduction	18
2. Relevance.....	18
3. Effectiveness of the Project.....	20
4. Efficiency of the Project.....	21
5. Sustainability.....	23
6. Impact	25
7. Gender	25
8. Lessons Learned.....	26
9. Recommendations	26

Chapter One

Introduction

1. Socio Political Context

The size and vibrancy or level of participation of civil society in a given country is closely linked to the historical as well as existing socio-cultural and political contexts. Different researches show that in most of the sub-Saharan countries early civil society was formed during the pre-independence period as tribal associations for advancing the economic well-being of their members and fighting for independence against colonial regimes. However, Ethiopia's socio-economic and political history provided a unique context for the emergence and growth of civil society.

Civil society, in its socio-political sense is a recent development in Ethiopia. The sector has witnessed a relative development in the last two decades in size, diversification as well as self-organization. Unlike the experience of other African countries particularly those who have been under colonial powers, the sector has mainly emerged and developed in response to natural disasters the country had faced in the 1970s than being rooted in the defence of collective and individual rights.

The Ethiopian Trade Union is not only one of the oldest civil society organizations in Ethiopia but also it is among the first associations established to defend collective and individual rights. It was established in April 1963, and has passed through different forms of developments. The year 1963 can be taken as one of the landmarks in the development of trade unions in Ethiopia. In this year, Ethiopia ratified the ILO Geneva Conventions No 87 and 98 and following the ratification, the country enacted the first law providing legal recognition to trade unions¹. This had introduced a system whereby unions can be registered and carrying out their activities. This Decree had remained operational until the fall of the emperor regime. In December 1975 another legislation which was highly dominated by socialist

¹ The 1963 Labour relation Decree

principles was enacted by the *Dergue* government, and this had led for the establishment of trade unions on the basis of their sectors (manufacturing, construction, etc.) with one body at the apex called "All Ethiopian Trade Unions". Again following the dawn fall of the *Dergue* regime, the 1975 Proclamation was repealed and replaced by Proclamation number 42/1993 and then by Proclamation Number 377/2003.

2. Legal and policy contexts for non state actors and trade unions in Ethiopia

Ethiopia is party to different international and regional human rights instruments which provide for the protection of freedom of association as well as trade unions. Article 20 (1) of the Universal declaration of Human Rights provides that 'everyone has the right to freedom of peaceful assembly and association' while article 23 (4) states that 'everyone has the right to form and to **join trade unions** for the protection of his interests' (emphasis added). Similarly, Article 22 (1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights recognizes that 'everyone shall have the right to freedom of association with others, including the right to form and join **trade unions** for the protection of his interests' (emphasis added). Specifically, the two Geneva Conventions, No. 89 and 98, have provided high recognition to the right to establish and join trade unions. As can be discerned from the provisions of these two international instruments, the rights to establish and join trade unions has been given primacy in the different forms of associations and ensuring freedom of association.

As fundamental human rights, freedom of association has found its place in various national and international laws separately or in combination with other rights such as freedom of expression, assembly, religion etc. Article 31 of the FDE Constitution guaranteed freedom of association for every person, and for any lawful cause or purpose. Rights of Labour is one of the fundamental rights guaranteed by the FDRE Constitution and in this regard Article 42(1)(a) provides that;

Factory and service workers, farmers, farm labourers, other rural workers and government employees whose work compatibility allows for it and who are

below a certain level of responsibility, have the right to form associations to improve their conditions of employment and economic well-being. This right includes the right to form trade unions and other associations to bargain collectively with employers or other organizations that affect their interests.

The Labour Proclamation Number 377/2003 is one the major subsidiary legislations enacted by the Ethiopian Government to give effect for the protection of freedom of association. This Proclamation provides, among others,

- Workers and employers have the right to establish and form trade unions or employers federations respectively and to actively participate in dialogue with each other and also with government so as to ensure smooth labour relations, workers safety and industrial peace;
- A minimum number of ten workers can establish a Trade Union;
- Trade union can form federation and only federation are allowed to form confederations;
- No worker can belong to more than one Trade Union;
- Unions will have to observe the conditions and fulfil the obligations, respect the rights and interests of the members, and are entitled to represent the members in collective negotiation and labour disputes,
- Federations and Confederations are entitled to represent the members in all occasions,
- Trade Unions and Employers Federations have to issue their own constitutions containing elements for identification of the organisation;
- Trade Unions or Labour Unions have to be registered by Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MOLSA);
- Unions through the regulating Ministry (MOLSA) are provided the opportunity to actively participate in the preparation and amendments of laws and regulations related to their objectives;
- The registration process is subjected to examination of documents to ascertain completion and the ministry shall issue a certificate of registration within 15 days;

The law grants a high level of freedom for associations to be in line with the ILO Covenant but the definition used are sometimes misleading and offer a wide room for intrusion and interpretation particularly with regard to illegal practices, engagement in prohibited activities and protection of existing organisations (it is difficult to establish a Trade Unions' Confederation not calling it Trade Union).

3. Purpose of the Evaluation

The general objective of the evaluation is to assess and provide recommendations on the project "Workers' Rights Awareness Creation Program" which CETU has agreed to implement in collaboration with the Norwegian Church Aid. The evaluation is expected to assess critically and analytically CETU's progress and performance against its planned objectives as well as the overall mission, vision and values of CETU.

4. Scope of the Evaluation

The scope of the review process will cover the following major areas: project context and design, governance, project objectives, the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, outcome, sustainability and lesson. Further, the review will, on the basis of its findings and observations, draw conclusions and suggest recommendations that will help CETU to learn and evolve for future interventions. In terms of time, this evaluation covers the period from 2007 to 2010

5. Methodology of the Evaluation

The evaluation was conducted based on two sources of information. The first was the review of the documents of the organization which among others included: the Memorandum of association, project proposal, project agreement and project reports. The other source of information was through interviews and discussions with heads of branch offices who were in charge of coordinating the different trainings of the project. Consultations were also made with representative of NCA and CETU.

Chapter Two

Governance

1. Organizational Background

CETU is a non-governmental and not-for-profit making organization registered by the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs. The association has been established in a form of confederation wherein its members are also established in a form of federation. Federation, according to the definition given by the Memorandum of Association, is a consortium of trade unions which have similar or related business activities whereas "trade unions" are associations formed by workers of same or different business organizations. Currently there are 9 federations which are registered as member of the Confederation. There are 679 trade unions which have a total of 350,000 members throughout the country. The main function of the federations is to coordinate inter-union activities and build the capacity of unions. CETU has opened six regional branch offices in Hawasa, Jima, Diredawa, Adama, Bahirdar and Mekele.

2. Organizational Objectives

CETU is found at the apex level in the hierarchy of unions in Ethiopia and it has been delegated to carry out the following major duties and responsibilities;

- Works for the establishment and strengthening of unions where all Ethiopian workers in all levels come together for their common interest regardless of their race, ethnicity, religion, gender and language
- Advance the interests member federations particularly in relation with better salary, working hours, and working conditions
- Advocate for the enactment and implementation of policies and laws regarding basic conditions of work including job security, working hours, leaves, working safety and health
- Safeguard the rights and interests of workers particularly in relation to social security, salary and prices of basic consumptions as well as taking part in policy issues affecting the life of workers
- Resolving jurisdictional disputes among member unions

- Facilitate trainings to build the professional capacity of the workers to make use of new discoveries which are the results of science and technology
- Strives for the establishment of peaceful and common understanding between employee and employers as well as unions
- Represent and assist its members in any labour dispute
- Represent the workers in any national forums requiring their participation
- Observe the implementation of laws, regulations and rules enacted to promote and protect the interests of the workers

3. Organizational structure

Structure and governance influence performance. Organizational structure helps an organization in three ways; reduce external and internal uncertainty, allows the organization to undertake varieties of activities and keep the activities of the organization coordinated. It is also one mechanism of ensuring accountability of organization by creating a system of check and balance.

As stated above, CETU has been established in a form of consortium of different federations of unions. Membership is open to any legally established industrial federation which is accepting and be willing to be abided by the terms and conditions of the memorandum of association. According to its memorandum, CETU has the following governing organs;

1. General Assembly
2. Supreme Council
3. Executive Committee
4. Audit Committee
5. Branch offices

The General Assembly

Each organ is entrusted with clearly defined powers and responsibilities which are essential to regulate the operation of the organization and thereby achieve its organizational objectives. As stated in the Constitution of CETU, the General Assembly (GA) is the supreme organ which comprises;

1. Members of the Supreme Council
2. Members of the Executive Committee
3. Members of the Audit Committee
4. Representatives of federations whose number is determined based on the number of members paying their membership fees

As the supreme organ of CETU, the GA has the following powers and responsibilities;

- ▶ Design policies and provide directions and decisions for their implementations;
- ▶ Approve, amend and change the Memorandum of Association;
- ▶ Elect members of the Supreme council and Audit Committee;
- ▶ Examine, approve and reject reports of Audit Committee and Supreme Council;
- ▶ Decide according to the proposal of the Supreme Council on the structure and governance of industrial federations;

The Supreme Council (SC)

Accountable to the GA, the SC is a body which is in charge of leading the overall activities, supervising and administering CETU, and has the following major powers and responsibilities;

- ▶ Follow the implementation of the decision of the GA;
- ▶ Approve the budget of branch offices and provide direction for its utilization
- ▶ Ensure the observance and implementation of the Memorandum of Association as well as rules and directives issued accordingly;
- ▶ Nominate Members of the Executive and seek the approval of the GA;
- ▶ Examine, approve and provide the necessary directions and decisions on the reports of the Executive Committee, and take the necessary measures based on the reports of the Audit Committee

The Executive Committee

This organ is made accountable to the SC, and consists of one representative from each federation as well as a representative of women. The Executive Committee has been organized as follows;

- ▶ President;
- ▶ Vice president
- ▶ Chief Secretary
- ▶ Head of Social Affairs Section
- ▶ Head of Finance Section
- ▶ Head of External Relation Section
- ▶ Head of Planning, Research and Information Section
- ▶ Head of Industrial Relation and Unions Organization
- ▶ Head of Education and Training
- ▶ Head of Women Workers Affairs Section

The Executive Committee is in charge of the day-to-day activities of the Confederation, and term of office of its members is four years.

The Audit Committee

This Committee is accountable to the GA, and consists of three elected individuals who are elected by the GA. It is in charge of supervising whether members of the governing bodies are carrying out their activities according to the Memorandum of Association, by-laws and directives. It is also responsible examine and provide recommendations on the administration of finance, property and purchasing transaction.

Chapter Three

Project Context, Design and Implementation

1. Context

NCA and CETU have partnership agreement since 2007 to work on different thematic areas with the objectives of enhancing the capacity of trade unions to;

- ☞ Defend the rights, privileges and benefits of the Ethiopian workers
- ☞ Organize workers and strengthen the unity of those organized
- ☞ Contribute its due share for development, peace, democracy, human rights and peoples equality
- ☞ Promote god relationship between employees and employer and their organization

CETU firmly believes that education and short term trainings are vital in enhancing the capacity of the workers and thereby ensuring industrial peace which is the vital condition to achieve and facilitate sustainable and over-all economic, political and social development in the country. Accordingly, it has been working with different governmental and non-governmental organizations including different civic societal organizations on various issues concerning Ethiopian workers, with an extended effort towards bringing changes and productivity in the industrial sector. The following are some of the major issues CETU's awareness raising programs were focusing on;

- ▶ work culture and productivity;
- ▶ Labour Proclamation;
- ▶ industrial conflict handling and resolving;
- ▶ collective bargaining;
- ▶ Trade Unions leadership and financial management;
- ▶ occupational safety and health;
- ▶ social dialogue;
- ▶ working women and gender issues

Productivity is a fundamental source of national development and corporate survival. However, productivity or the performance of individual work can be affected by different factors, and cultural belief and individual attitudinal, motivational and behavioral factors are among to be mentioned. Productivity growth depends on accepting change: it requires us to alter our perceptions, attitudes and mind-set. Productivity of an organization benefits not only the employer but also the employees as their existence is highly dependent on the survival and profitability of the organization. With this in mind, CETU has been working intensively on work culture and productivity.

The magnitude of the global impact of occupational accidents and diseases, as well as major industrial disasters, in terms of human suffering and related economic costs, have been a long-standing source of concern at workplace, national and international levels. According to ILO estimates over 2 million workers die each year from work-related accidents and diseases, and that globally this figure is on the increase. Unfortunately, we do not have a well organized and accredited source of information on the prevalence of such problem in Ethiopia, although with the expansion of the private industrial sector and weak enforcement mechanisms of Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) standards, we may expect a high degree of causalities.

Promoting social dialogue is one of the thematic areas CETU has been working on in collaboration with NCA. The term "social dialogue" refers to the cooperation between social partners, i.e. workers' and employers' organizations, as well as the Government. It has become an important component of good governance in many countries as it plays crucial role in furthering democracy, social justice and a productive and competitive economy. Economic prosperity, stability, and social progress cannot be achieved by governments, employers or workers acting alone. Social dialogue provides social partners and other stakeholders with the opportunity to participate in deciding their future. The aim of this participation and cooperation is to facilitate agreements and avoid potential conflicts among the different actors. In other words, social dialogue is an effective tool used to facilitate constructive

interaction in order to arrive at social consensus among the stakeholders in the industrial sector.

Employees represent the human side of an organisation and trade unions serve to give them a collective voice to protect and further their interests. At the firm level, it is the interaction between the attitudes of management to employees and unions, the attitudes of employees to management, and the attitudes of employees to unions that determines the quality of industrial relations. The collective bargaining that trade unions facilitate becomes relevant and perhaps a necessary means to achieve the societal objectives of redistributing income, rights, political voice, and power to employees. Trade unionism is a means for workers to liberate themselves from poverty and social exclusion. Workers use trade unions as their representative voice to demand their rights and improve their living and working conditions.

Nevertheless, the absence of an effective dispute settlement machinery can result in widespread industrial conflict and have negative effects on the collective bargaining process itself and on economic growth in general. There is a growing realization in many countries that the success of economic reforms depends among other things on achieving industrial harmony. Effective prevention and settlement of labour disputes remains a cornerstone of sound labour-management relations, and it is essential that there be an efficient and accessible machinery for this purpose in the interests of economic growth and social justice.

2. Project Design

Project design is a crucial stage in any project management. As we all know, project design defines overall goal, objectives, beneficiaries, project strategy and organization. Therefore, this section of the report deals with these issues in relation to the project under evaluation.

2.1 Objectives

The overall objective of the project was to improve the awareness of workers, employers and union leaders as well as relevant government institutions on workers'

rights and conditions of works on occupational safety and maintenance of workplace environment. Specifically, the project has the following objectives;

- ▶ To raise the awareness of workers on occupational health and environmental issues
- ▶ To raise the conscious of workers on economic development and their role in environmental conservation activities
- ▶ To raise the awareness of working women and union members on issues of protecting workplaces from pollutions and chemical hazards
- ▶ To foster workers' awareness in the techniques of handling and resolving workplace conflicts and conducting collective bargaining at the enterprise level

2.2 Target Group/Beneficiaries of the Project

1. CETU Executives
2. CETU Audit Committee Members
3. Industrial Federations' Executives
4. CETU's branch office leaders
5. Basic trade union members and leaders
6. Women and youth workers

2.3 Project Strategies

1. CETU's Educational and Training Division is responsible to co-ordinate project activities aimed at conducting awareness creation programs at different project sites
2. CETU's Financial Division is responsible to manage the finance
3. Progressive and narrative activity reports will be presented by CETU
4. CETU's branch offices will be engaged to assist in coordinating activities at regional level in the implementation of awareness creation programs
5. Different CETU's training and financial formats will be used to carry out and manage training activities as well as the financial flow of the project
6. Every program shall be put in record and informed to NCA

2.4 Major Activities of the Project

1. Pre-implementation discussion will take place between CETU and NCA
2. CETU's Training Division will conduct all pre-training activities such as modification and allocation of financial and human resources. In addition, the training schedule shall be organized by CETU
3. Training reports will be prepared by CETU and submitted to NCA
4. CETU and the donor of the project will evaluate and supervise the overall project implementation and achievements
5. Training follow up mechanisms will be established conjointly by CETU and NCA

2.5 Project Inputs

A. Human Resources

- ▶ CETU will assign resource persons
- ▶ CETU will assign co-ordinates to each training programs
- ▶ CETU's financial experts will administer financial activities

B. Financial Resources

- ▶ Short-term training activities will be conducted with the financial support of NCA
- ▶ Cost estimation to each training program will be determined by CETU based on the project agreement document

C. Monitoring and Evaluation of the Project

- ▶ CETU and NCA will evaluate the accomplished programs
- ▶ Participants' suggestions will be gathered using designed formats for evaluation
- ▶ Financial aspects will be managed by CETU and NCA

3. Project Implementation

3.1 Activities Carried Out

In the last four years, CETU has conducted several types of awareness raising trainings and discussion forums on different issues including;

- OHS and workplace environment protection
- Industrial conflict handling and social dialogue
- Environmental impacts on economic development
- Trade Union Leadership
- Social dialogue
- work culture and productivity;
- Labour Proclamation;
- industrial conflict handling and resolving;
- collective bargaining;
- working women and gender issues

A total of 1582 individuals with different capacities have been reached through these programs, and of which 406 were women. The trainings and the discussion forums were conducted in 11 places such as Adama, Addis Ababa, Afar, Bahirdar, Bishoftu, Diredawa, Harar, Hawasa, Jimma, Kombolcha and Mekele. Concerning the composition of the participants, they were drawn from;

- ▶ CETU's executives, branch office offices and audit committee
- ▶ 9 Industrial Federation Trade Unions Leaders
- ▶ Basic Trade Unions found in different enterprises,
- ▶ Employers, and
- ▶ Government offices such as the Bureau of Labour and Social Affairs

The table below summarizes the number of participants in each year as well as the operational places where the trainings and discussion forums were conducted by CETU from 2007 to 2010.

Target Group	2007		2008		2009		2010		Total
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	
Adama	155	23					32	8	218
Addis Ababa	14	27	29	27	22	4	29	9	161
Afar					40				40
Bahirdar	32	15	7	32	40				126
Bishoftu	106	12							118
Diredawa			28	22	40				90
Harar	84	10							94
Hawasa	51	1	115	15	28	11	49	27	297
Jimma			23	16	28	22	26	14	129
Kombolcha			22	19	25	14	26	12	118
Mekele					93	58	32	8	191
Total/Gender	442	88	224	131	316	109	194	78	1582
Total/year	530		355		425		272		1582

3.2 Budget allocated and utilized

As indicated in the different financial reports of CETU, the organization has received a total of XXXX Birr from NCA in the last four years. Except in 2010, the amount of money allocated to CETU was increasing each year. Generally, CETU has witnessed a good performance in utilizing the budget.

year	Budget allocated	Budget Utilized	Balance
2007	457,770.00	45217	4800
2008	456,500	387,999	68500
2009	489000	489211	1
2010	439100	437346	1753
Total	1,434,829	1,359,773	75054

Deleted: 50,017

Deleted: 489212

Deleted: 1,434,829

Deleted: 1,359,773

Deleted: 75054

Chapter Four

Project Analysis

1. Introduction

These are different criteria that should be used in conducting project evaluation. At the minimum, however, the evaluation report is expected to address the following important aspects of the project; relevance efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. Taken together, these five criteria should provide the decision-maker with the essential information and clues to understand the situation and determine what should be done next as a learning and evolving institution. These criteria are also indicated in the project agreement that was concluded between CETU and NCA. Therefore, this chapter deals with assessing the project using these criteria.

2. Relevance

Relevance of a project can be assessed from different perspectives; it can be assessed from the angle of its contribution to the national policy, its relation with the vision and mission of the implementing organization and the advantages it may bring to the life of the target groups. In other words, this criterion measures the appropriateness of the project objectives to the problems that it was supposed to address, and to the physical and policy environment within which it operated.

A. Consistency with Objective and National Policy

The overall objective of this program was to raise the awareness of workers, union leaders and officials of CETU as well as government institutions on the rights of workers, the relationship between workers and employers as well as government, and working conditions in general. At the global level we have the International Labour Organization (ILO) which puts the subject of occupational safety and health at the heart of its work since it was founded in 1919. This organization has put in place different international instruments (Conventions, Recommendations and Codes of Practice) to some of which Ethiopia is also a party.

While recognizing the right to form and join trade union, both the Constitution and the Labour Proclamation accorded due attention to the different rights of workers. The Labour Law puts an obligation on employers, among others, to register employment accident and occupational diseases and notify the Labour Inspection of same. It also calls for the establishment of Labour Inspector which is in charge of supervising, executing, educating, studying, making research and preparing a standard of work to ensure the implementation of the provisions issued in accordance with the Proclamation and other laws regarding working conditions, occupational safety, health and working environment.

We have also seen that one of the organizational objectives of CETU is to advocate for the adoption and implementation of policies and laws regarding basic conditions of work including job security, working hours, leaves, working safety and health.

Awareness raising activity is one form of advocacy which is essential not only to raise the awareness of the beneficiaries but also to enhance the commitment and willingness of the duty bearers including employers and government. To sum up, the objective of the project was in conformity with the global and national policies as well as the organizational objectives of CETU.

B. Needs Assessment (Problem Identification)

The first step in any project activity is to identify the issue that the project could address. This usually involves a 'needs assessment' which finds out what the target groups' needs are. Only when we know what people really want that we can develop an effective project. Therefore, project identification is the stage at which the initial project idea is conceived and formulated.

Questions have been forwarded to the target groups how the thematic areas, were selected. All the respondents confirmed that they were asked by Training and Education Department of CETU to identify contemporary issues in their respective areas challenging the working environment and that can be addressed through training. There were also joint planning sessions wherein officials of all branch

offices came together to the head office and selected the thematic areas. Therefore, the project issues were identified in collaboration with the target groups, and thus the process was participatory.

C. Relevance to NCA's Ethiopia Agenda

The overall vision for NCA's program in Ethiopia is promoting human dignity for the poor and marginalized people by supporting partners and programmes that contribute to their increased participation, equity and protection. To achieve this objective, NCA has identified six thematic areas of programmatic intervention, and Civil Society for Accountable Governance is one of these areas. NCA believes that the Civil Society and Accountable Governance programme contributes to tackling the participation, equity and protection deficits which are visible in the country. As part of the Civil Society, CETU works with the objective of promoting and defending the rights of workers, and bringing industrial peace which is the corner stone for economic development and social justice. Therefore, the project implemented by CETU greatly contributes to NCA's Ethiopia development agenda.

3. Effectiveness of the Project

Effectiveness is a measure of the extent to which the intervention's intended outcomes have been achieved. In other words it is an assessment of the contribution made by Results/Outputs to achievement of the Project Purpose. Therefore, measuring effectiveness goes beyond measuring outputs as it focuses on measuring the changes that have been brought as result of the out puts.

A total of 272 individuals drawn from different organizations including government and employers have taken the trainings on Occupational Safety and Health; this is the output of the project. Indeed the initial plan was to give the training to 240 participants in six places (40 participants in one training). However, as indicated in the activity report, two round trainings were given in Hawasa; one on OHS and another on Industrial conflict handling, Trade Union Leadership and Social Dialogue. As a matter of fact, this second training was not included in the plan.

In terms of output the project has achieved its target successfully and has gone beyond what has been planned. But the main question is the outcomes of the trainings. It would have been good if the project plan has included indicators (milestones) against which results can be measured, or at least indicate the intended outcomes which can be measured. We may fairly say that the project plan was more of activity oriented than clearly indicating the intended outcomes, and this makes it somehow difficult to measure the achievements.

Nevertheless, an attempt was made to gather information on the kind of outcomes that have been brought by the project; and these can be summarized as follows;

1. In some places, like Jima, Occupational Safety and Health Committees have been established after the training
2. Attitudinal changes have been brought by employers who have attended the trainings towards Occupational Safety and Health,
3. Reduction of industrial conflicts
4. Reduction of court cases
5. Establishment of new trade unions

4. Efficiency of the Project

This criterion measures whether the results have been achieved at reasonable cost, i.e. how well inputs/means have been converted into Results, in terms of quality, quantity and time, and the quality of the Results achieved. This generally requires comparing alternative approaches to achieving the same outputs, to see whether the most efficient process has been adopted. The inputs may include finance and human resources utilized to implement the project.

A. Human Resource

As indicated in the project plan, CETU has been utilizing its own experts to organize and conduct the different trainings. This has undoubtedly assisted the organization in becoming cost effective. As a person in the consultancy market, the writer is very much familiar with market value of conducting trainings of similar natures particularly the consultancy fee. It is very challenging to get a consultant who can

prepare training material, and provide training for 1,000 Birr per day. To our surprise, the payment does not include the day spent for the preparation of the training material.

Informants were also asked on the capacity of the experts who delivered the trainings, and all confirmed that the trainers were well organized, well versed with the subject matter and had the required capacity to express themselves. Participants were given the chance to evaluate and provide comments on trainers. They also appreciated the training methodologies which were dominated by participatory approaches such as group discussion and plenary sessions

We also checked the coordination level between the branch offices and the head quarter. However, we came out with no major problems, apart from the fact that the Training and Education Department as well as the branch offices are not well equipped with modern IT facilities such as fax and fast email access.

B. Financial Administration

Financial administration is one of the aspects of project effectiveness which needs to be measured. During the review process, the writer has learnt that CETU has a strict and centralized financial administration system. Bids are conducted on a competitive and transparent ways following accepted standards. However, we learnt that the finance section often lacks the necessary flexibility which the nature of the work demands.

There is a periodic and regular audit review each year by an independent and external audit firm, and from the report we observed no financial irregularities.

As can be gathered from the financial report of 2010, there were some budget deviations where expenses are incurred for activities not included in the plan as well as incurring cost beyond the planned budget limit. The cost incurred for the training on Conflict Handling, Trade Union Leadership and Social Dialogue which was

conducted in Hawasa, was not in the plan. In addition, expenses have been incurred beyond the agreed budget for the activities indicated in the table below;

NO.	Items	Budget Allocated	Budget Used	Balance	In %
1	Resource persons	18,000	21,000	-3000	116
2	Coordinators	42,000	43,500	-1500	103
3	Material duplication	5,700	7,740.4	-2040.4	135
4	Stationary	6,240	10,183.33	-3943.3	163
5	Car fuel	4,458	8531.32	-4073.3	191
6	Audit	3500	3569.91	-69.9	102
Total		79,898	94,524.96	-14626.9	118

Major deviation (191%) observed on the budget allocated for fuel, and this might have something to do with the high fluctuation of fuel price both at the national and global levels.

As compared to the total amount of money allocated for the budget, the amount that failed to observe the budget line and limit is not exaggerated. In addition, the deviation did not affect the total amount of budget allocated for the year.

C. Time

Time is another factor affecting the efficiency of project activities, and thus we looked into the sufficiency and suitability of the time allocated to the implementation of the project. Concerning this factor, participants had only one major concern. Almost all informants expressed the time allocated for the trainings were very short to cover the subject matter.

5. Sustainability

This is an act of assessing the likelihood of benefits produced by the project to continue to flow after external funding has ended, and with particular reference to factors of ownership by beneficiaries, policy support, economic and financial factors.

To ensure sustainability of project intervention, plan has to be designed at the earliest (planning) stage of the project. Unfortunately, no sustainability strategy has been included in the project document, and this made it very difficult to assess success or failure of such aspects of the project.

CETU has more than 350,000 members, 679 trade unions and nine federations. Reaching all these target groups together with employers and concerned government institutions is very challenging and costly. One way of tackling such problem and ensuring the sustainability of the project would have been to provide the trainings on a Training of Trainers (TOT) level. In this approach, there would be a good chance for the training to continue even after the withdrawal of the external support.

The other major problem observed in relation to the sustainability of the project was the level of the turnover of union leaders or those who have taken the training. These people are coming to the position through election and they can easily be removed from their position or leave the organization. The different informants have expressed this as one of the major concerns affecting the sustainability of the project.

Advocacy for structural changes is one means of ensuring sustainability. In the project under review, efforts have been made to convince employers so that their organizations establish Occupational Safety and Health schemes. In this regard we can mention as good example the experience of Jima where some employers agreed and established the scheme.

Lobbying concerned government institutions particularly Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs/Bureau Labour and Social Affairs of (MOLSA/BOLSA) for the effective implementation of existing laws and policies can also be considered as one strategy.

6. Impact

Impact is a measure of all significant effects of the development intervention, positive or negative, expected or unforeseen, on its beneficiaries and other affected parties. It is the effect of the project on its wider environment, and its contribution to the wider sectoral objectives summarised in the project's Overall Objectives, and on the achievement of the overarching policy objectives of the organization. Therefore, it is not something which can be achieved easily and in a very short period of time as it demands lifelong changes in the life of the beneficiaries.

This project is a four years project, and it is also limited in geographical area. Even in the areas where the trainings were given, only a very small portion of the target groups have been reached. In addition, the project lacks a systematic and strong follow up mechanisms which is important to trace and record changes brought as result of the intervention.

7. Gender

Consideration to gender can also be taken as one criterion to evaluate the success and weakness of a project. Women have been taken as one of the target groups of the project. As indicated in the table above, 406 women (27% of the total) participated in the different trainings. However, as compared to the number of male participants, the total number of women who took the trainings was below average, and thus attention should be given for future activities.

While discussing the organizational structure of CETU we have seen that there is a separate section for Women Workers Affairs. This can be considered as one positive aspect in providing special attention to gender issue. However, there is a high concern on the coordination level between this section and the Education and Training section which is in charge of designing and implementing the project. Participatory project cycle management requires among others the participation of all stakeholders not only in the implementation but also in the design of projects.

8. Lessons Learned

Organizations must aim to be learning organizations, building in structures and systems to help them to learn from the successes and challenges of their work and that of others. For an organisation to be effective, it must become learning organisations which can adapt to change and learning from its own mistakes and successes, as well as those lessons learnt by others. Monitoring and evaluation are vital activities in organisational learning. Particularly, evaluation can be an important tool in this process by creating dynamic and self-renewing organizations.

From the implementation of the project under review, one may draw the following major lessons;

1. Using organizational expertise can make an organization more cost efficient than outsourcing
2. Due care must be given to project planning particularly projects should not be activity oriented but should also have measurable outcomes
3. Progress milestones or indicators should be used in project planning so that achievements can be measured at the end of the project intervention
4. Project sustainability should be accorded with greater emphasis, and thus different strategies to this end have to be envisaged in advance
5. Working for structural changes and implementation of existing laws and policies is key to ensure sustainability of projects

9. Recommendations

1. **Sustainability;** given the number of trade unions and their members, it might not be possible for CETU to continue as actual implementer of the different trainings in all its operational areas. Therefore, Training Department of CETU shall focus on providing Training of Trainers and leave the trainings to the regional branch offices
2. **Effectiveness;** mechanisms should be designed to follow and measure the outcomes (and impacts) of the training programs
3. **Gender;** due attention should be given to increase the number of women taking part in the capacity building programs. There must be a strong

coordination between the two sections; Education and Training and Women Workers Affairs on the design and implementation of trainings

4. **4. Financial Administration;** Without disregarding the importance of being flexible in the administration and utilization of financial resources, CETU shall also consider providing equal attention to adhere to budget limits and lines. This can be avoided through having a realistic budget plan which takes in to account changing circumstances or market fluctuations