

**Assessment of Effectiveness of Teacher Training
Conducted by Save the Children**

Submitted to Save the Children

Submitted by

Dr. Tulashi P Thapaliya

Dr. Sushan Acharya

Educational Research Center

Ichhangu VDC, Kathmandu

TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND	3
ASSESSMENT OF TRAINING EFFECTIVENESS.....	6
PRELIMINARY FINDINGS	6
REVIEW OF TRAINING MATERIALS CONTENT AND PROCESSES OF TRAINING.....	6
<i>Review of Training Contents.....</i>	6
<i>Discussion on the Training process</i>	12
<i>Adoption of desired teaching methods, concepts and processes.....</i>	16
ENABLING AND HINDERING FACTORS FOR THE ADOPTION OF TRAINING SKILLS	26
<i>Training design</i>	26
<i>The delivery process</i>	27
<i>Realization of importance of the skills.....</i>	28
<i>Supportive school environment</i>	29
<i>Monitoring of the performance</i>	30
<i>On-site professional support.....</i>	30
MAJOR FINDINGS	30
FUTURE DIRECTIONS.....	32
ANNEX-1 THE FIVE DAY TRAINING COURSE ON CFS FOR PRIMARY TEACHERS ORGANIZED JOINTLY BY THE DEO, KAVRE AND SAVE THE CHILDREN	33
REFERENCES.....	34

Background

Realizing the critical role of teachers for quality education and considering the importance of teacher training for improving the capacity of the workforce directly involved in the primary production process, the government of Nepal put efforts to enhance the capacity of teachers. Despite the efforts, there are gaps in terms of covering certain group of teachers (e.g., the teachers working in the temporary positions, or teachers appointed in the schools' sources), or meeting the continuous skills enhancement requirements. The Save the Children (SC) designed and conducted training programs in collaboration with the concerned District Education Office to address to these needs.

Education is one of core priority program areas for Save the Children (SC). SC primarily works on creating opportunity for children to access education and improving quality of primary level education. Intervention has also been extended to secondary level but the purpose of this evaluation is to review the primary level intervention only. The MOE systems have trained almost all primary level teachers through long term and short term in service and pre service trainings. However as mentioned above gaps and issues were observed in relation to transferring skills learned in such trainings inside the classroom and providing training to teacher who are hired from local sources and Relief quota. Thus Save the Children identified teacher capacity as one of the core areas where it needed to focus to meet the agency's education and child rights related objectives and thereby support government's efforts to fill the gap in reducing the number of untrained teachers. Moreover enhancing teacher capacity through training and follow up support are key program activities within education both in terms of resources and efforts. Since SC's role has been primarily to support the government's initiative the teacher trainings are also conducted by SC in collaboration with District Education Office or through SC's implementing partner organizations. SC felt it necessary to assess the existing training modality with the aim to make the contents and processes more effective and enhance transfer of skills in the classroom. Thus in a nutshell the objective was to review effectiveness of the current training modality and suggest future modality.

Specific objectives

- To assess the effectiveness of teacher training in improving teaching methods and processes in the classroom.
- To assess adoption of teaching methods, concepts and processes introduced by Save the Children inside the classroom.
- To identify the enabling/hindering factor in the adoption of teaching methods.
- To review the module, training guidelines content and processes of training conducted for teacher.
- To suggest future modality.

Study Approach

The evaluation was basically qualitative in design. The study utilizes the Kirkpatrick's four-level training evaluation framework, as a guiding frame to assess the effectiveness of the training as much as possible. The four levels are: 1) reaction level; 2) learning level; 3) behavior level; and 4) results level.

Three districts: Bardiya, Kavrepalanchok and Sindhupalchok were selected for study. Study participants included two schools in each district; DEO personnel, teachers, head teachers, RPs, trainers, social mobilizers, and PNGOs representatives. The following methods and tools were applied for data collection.

Document review Existing training manuals on ATL prepared at district levels were reviewed. Training process reports were also reviewed.

Classroom observation Classroom practices of ATL trained teachers of grades one and two from all three selected districts were observed.

Group discussion Discussions were held with DEO personnel; newly trained teachers, teachers who were already trained in ATL and CFS; PNGO representatives and social mobilizers.

Limitation

Time was limited and the field visit followed a major festival, Makar Sankranti that many ethnics celebrate. The consequence of this was that many students were absent from school. Even

where they were all present the student population was very limited. This made it difficult to get the real picture of a normal size classroom practice. This happened particularly in Kavrepalanchok.

Assessment of Training Effectiveness Preliminary Findings

Review of training materials content and processes of training

Review of Training Contents

Design of the training course:

The training programs follow a flexible structure. It was found that there does not exist a centrally designed training package- both for Active Teaching Learning and for the Child Friendly Schooling training. The contents are decided at the district level. As a result of this flexibility the practices in the districts were found varied. For example, a seven-day- ATL training was followed by two three-day refresher courses in Bardiya. On the other hand, it was found that the ATL training was organized for five days in Kavre and for three days in Sindhupalchowk district. As an example Bardiya model is presented below in a table.

Training contents of the seven-day ATL Training Course- Bardiya		
Day	Activities	Remarks
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction to the course and introduction to the participants. • Preparing job charts for smooth management of training. • Analysis of the present status of the respective schools / classes in learning achievement. • Child rights and thinking from children's perspectives. • Roles of stakeholders. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	Classroom management and child rights
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 1 activities. • Child friendly schooling and child-centered learning pedagogy (including a game). • Introduction to the SSRP; national policies on education. • Early days in schools and appropriate response from the teachers. • Learning children's songs. 	Child friendly schooling National education policies;

Training contents of the seven-day ATL Training Course- Bardiya		
Day	Activities	Remarks
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion and design of daily classroom activities (teacher-student interaction; story telling; message from teachers; news sharing etc.). • Bingo game (word games). • Analysis of primary school curriculum; relationship between curriculum and textbook. • Game (blind folded person attempts to attach tail to the given picture of the horse); making curriculum relevant. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	Learning about school curriculum
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 2 activities. • English chants. • Teaching simple commands in English- activities. • Teaching communicative English- relevant activities. • Learning colors. (Teaching vocabulary). • Making words game (run to the board- and make words). • Using phonetic charts. • Teaching letter shapes. • Vocabulary ladder. • Hunting action words. • Memory folder preparation. • Do this-Do that game. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	Teaching English in primary grades
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 3 activities. • Learning children's songs. • Acting the songs. • Number and numerals. • Concept of place value. • Teaching addition. 	Teaching mathematics

Training contents of the seven-day ATL Training Course- Bardiya		
Day	Activities	Remarks
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geometrical shapes. (Recognizing; using classroom shapes and objects to teach shapes). • Preparing multiplication tables. • Counting by twos, threes and fours. • Teaching bar-graph: using the data on birth months of students. • Different games on number and operations. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 4 activities. • Teaching stories: acting it out or use pictures. • Games (finding the meaning or finding appropriate words). • Developing stories: starting from the children's writings. • Interviewing friends. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	Teaching Nepali
6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 5 activities. • Creating family tree. • Writing two letter words- using objects around the classroom. • Word games: finding appropriate word –quick (to create, write and name- a kind of race). • Attendance activity (using a letter, word or an opposite word). • Lesson related activities for teaching Nepali (writing names; animals, opposites...); matching the words; or words and pictures. • Word games using two die: throwing two die with letters and matras in the face and make words (the children has to put the letters in order and recognize the sensible word). • Word game: <i>multiplying words</i>- the first person write a word and passes to the next- and s/he adds an adjective to it; it goes on and they make a long use of adjectives to describe the naming word. 	Teaching Nepali

Training contents of the seven-day ATL Training Course- Bardiya		
Day	Activities	Remarks
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Word ladder game. • Word and meaning game. • Constructing birthday cards. • Hang men game to learn words. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	
7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 6 activities. • My daily routine- planning for students. • Teaching science: parts of plants; • Living and non-living things. • Things that are edible and that are not. • Evaluating and recording student learning: the use of formats developed for Continuous Assessment System (CAS). • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	

From the discussions with the trainee teachers, and RPs in Kavre and Sindhupalchowk it was revealed that they follow similar contents and structures for the ATL training. The only difference is they use some selected activities from the long list. Because of the shortened training duration it was observed that the courses appear condensed to keep the character of the course. Particularly, the character of 'active' learning has remained. The child friendly component and CAS component has remained. The difference is mainly on subject specific teaching activities. For example, one of the trainee teacher from Sindhupalchowk reported that he teaches English language and he did not find activities that are directly relevant to teach English language.

The other training course that is conducted is on Child Friendly Schooling (CFS). Again there is some variation observed in training contents under the course. Hence, the details of the training contents of CFS from Kavrepalanchowk are reviewed.

Description of training contents of CFS course Kavre:

Day	Activities	Remarks
-----	------------	---------

1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction to the course and introduction to the participants. • Introduction to the concept of child friendly school and its importance. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	conceptual understanding
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 1 activities. • Characteristics of child friendly schools. • Managing child friendly schools. • Child friendly schools and role of stakeholders • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	Child friendly schools
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 2 activities. • Project work in child friendly teaching. • Practical experience in projects in child friendly teaching. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 3 activities. • Presentation of projects. • Introduction to the ABC Framework: [It talks about three distinct phases for teaching any new concept: i) Anticipation phase; ii) Building knowledge phase and iii) Consolidation phase.] • Sample activities; how it works. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. 	
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and day briefing for day 4 activities. • ABC Framework: Sample activities; Micro teaching. • Review and evaluation of the day's work. • Training evaluation and closing. 	

It appears that the CFS training broadly covers two areas: child friendly schooling practices and pedagogy that utilizes students' previous level of understanding. In fact, anticipation phase is for preparing learners for learning in the thinking process. The second phase is for building on what

is already with the learner. The third phase is for consolidating what is learned in phase two- it is to extend learning; it is to relate to the context and generate meaning.

Analyzing training contents:

- Scope of the training course: Through the analysis of the training materials used in Bardiya it was observed that the training package is quite comprehensive in terms of coverage of content areas. The training contents covered during the training can be grouped under five distinct themes:
 - The first theme relates to the *generic professional skills* to the teachers. This includes platform skills- managing classroom, mobilizing students, using instructional time effectively etc. Under this theme, the teachers are made aware and also given opportunity to prepare materials like 'job chart'; and engage in constructing instructional materials; and singing children's songs.
 - The second area relates to *knowing children and their needs*. This is based on the premise that teaching is for facilitating learning and so it is critical to understand children and understand their rights, their interests. With this premise, the training content includes topics on child friendly schooling practices as well. Thus, it is observed that the training has set aside some time to help teachers realize the children's perspective in the teaching learning process and given opportunity to reflect upon their practices whether or to what extent they were 'child friendly'.
 - The third area is related to *understanding primary curriculum and teaching primary school subjects* (e.g., teaching Mathematics, science, Nepali and English). The training has given some space to help teachers realize the relationship between curriculum and textbook, though the time allotted may not permit for detailed discussion and practice.
 - The fourth area that is covered in the training material relates to *teaching primary lessons*. It appears through the analysis of training content that the training has allotted some 60 percent of the training time in this theme. The time under this theme is again divided among different primary school subjects- like teaching English language, teaching mathematics, teaching Nepali (stories, vocabulary, etc..), teaching science etc. This theme relates directly to what the trainee teachers teach in the

- classroom. The teachers shared many of the contents from this theme when asked to share what they still remember after one year of participation in the training course.
- The fifth area that is covered in the training course relates to the *introduction to the national education program - SSRP*. It seems that it is included so as to make the working teachers aware of the national policies and programs of education.
 - As discussed earlier, since the training is not centrally designed and implemented, there exist visible variations. Hence, it is not quite possible to be definitive regarding the training contents. However, the general character of the training contents as observed through the review is that they are designed to promote activity based teaching-learning.
 - The CFS training contents are found organized in such a way to make the trainees aware of the contents related to child rights and at the same time develop basic skills to creating appropriate classroom environment. Moreover, there are contents on pedagogical skills- that give opportunity to practice a 3-phase teaching-learning process- referred to ABC framework- to the trainee teachers. Thus, the contents were found to be organized in such a way that trainee teachers not only 'know' something about, but they 'do' something to creating child friendly environment and to teaching classroom lessons.

Discussion on the Training process

Training management:

- For the management of training program at the district level- it was found that there are two different agencies / institutions with specific roles and responsibilities: the District Education Office (DEO) and the partner NGO in the district.
- The District Education Office (DEO) is the institution mandated with responsibilities for teacher management. This unit is responsible for assessing teacher development needs, making provision of such development opportunities and providing follow-up support and supervision and monitoring to the teachers after training. Hence, the role of the DEO is very critical in the management of training.
- It was observed that the partner NGO works closely at the community level on different matters including teacher training. It is based on some sort of prior understanding / agreement with the DEO. The role of the NGOs in matters of teacher training was found

varied in these three districts. Besides, there is also role of the District Development Committee in the mobilization of the NGOs at the district level.

- In Bardiya, it was reported that the partner NGO, Dalit Welfare Organization (DWO) gets approval of its annual program from a Coordination Committee chaired by the Local Development Officer, where the DEO is also a member. Besides this approval, the NGO reports progress periodically to the Committee and informs its relevant activities to the District Education Office. But then, the partner NGO- Dalit Welfare Organization (DWO) is entirely responsible for the design and delivery of training courses, taking required consent from the DEO.
- In Kavre, for the purpose of coordinating training programs supported by Save the Children, a Committee structure is created at the district level that is chaired by the DEO. The members include- representative of Save the Children, representative of partner NGO (Nangshal) relevant RPs and an officer at the DEO assigned as the Focal Person for the program. The committee approves the program annually and reviews status of program implementation periodically. Thus, in Kavre the DEO takes the lead role in the management of training program.
- In Sindhupalchowk, it was observed that there are two different modalities of training management. Under the Jalpadevi Resource Centre with four VDCs and 31 schools in it, the partner NGO- Tuki Sangh Sunkoshi (TSS) is mainly responsible for the design and delivery of training courses. Based on the earlier agreement with Save the children, the DEO manages training activities in the other RC.

Standardization of training process:

- In many of the large scale training systems, one can observe measures that are taken to standardize the training process. These include a) training objectives and training package, b) trainer preparation, c) trainee selection, d) training delivery process.
- The standardization starts with training objectives and *training package*. A standard set of materials and planning and a standard package is used by these systems to standardize training program. In the case of training programs organized by Save the Children Nepal, this was not exactly the case. It was found that the training is designed mainly at the district level- with variations in scope and intensity of training contents. Variations were observed in terms of duration of training course; in terms of mix of training contents and also in terms of the

training process. For example, the seven-day ATL training in Bardiya provided space to discuss and practice subject-specific teaching-learning activities. Such a space could not be expected from a three day ATL training course organized in Sindhupalchowk. Hence, one could observe variations in terms of training process as well. However, it was found through the discussion with the trainee teachers and Resource Persons that all these training courses- preserved something in common- they were full of activities- the activities relevant to teaching primary children.

- *Trainer preparation* is the next area that is important to standardize the training process. Again, the practice is not uniform across the sample districts. In this regard the District Education Office, Kavre reported that they invite many of the trainers, experts from the respective fields from Katmandu. They also reported that the budgetary constraints limit their choice of the best trainers available in the market. Besides, the DEO uses RPs, some teachers who have experience of implementing child-friendly schooling practices as trainers for the ATL and CFS training courses. For example, they have separate roster of trainers in the field of CAS, in the field of Multi-Grade Multi-Level (MGML), in the field of- Learning Without Fear (LWF) etc. These trainers are invited whenever possible. Besides these experts, some of the trainers are from the district, the RPs, the teachers / HTs – from the schools where the program is already in practice for years. Some other trainers are invited from outside the district- like SETO GURANS etc. The case of Sindhupalchowk is very much similar to Kavre. They have utilized some of the experienced primary teachers in child friendly schooling as trainers. They also invited some of the trainers from Kathmandu. The partner NGO in Bardiya reported that they have a roster of trainers- from the centre and from the region- some of them are from among the primary teachers as well. Thus, there is no standardization measure in trainer preparation. However, the trainee teachers interviewed reported that the trainers were very much active and experienced to run the courses and they were appreciated by the trainees as good to practicing child friendly learning activities.
- *Trainee selection* is another important part in the process of training standardization. If trainees with similar level of experience and 'training needs' participate in the course- it would be easier for the trainer to respond to the needs. When asked about the trainee selection process the people working at the partner NGO- the DWO, in Bardiya reported that they prepare a list of trainees- get it approved through the DE Office and issue letter to the

schools to release the trainees for the training period. However, the training design that demands the same trainee teacher to participate in three phases- 7+3+3 days course- was not followed in the selection of trainees. There were many cases where trainees join the 3-day refresher without undergoing the basic 7-day ATL training course. It was observed that the schools have different interest- they wanted to give opportunity to as many teachers as possible and so tend to nominate different person to participate in the course. Similar case was observed in Sindhupalchowk- where there were different participants in the materials construction workshop and in the ATL training. In Kavre, the DE Office takes responsibility to trainee selection and training conduction, but they coordinate with the partner NGO- *Nangshal*.

- *Training delivery process:* A training manual on ATL training was supplied for analysis. The manual was found elaborate enough to guide the conduction of training. The manual provides the details like- the objectives of the activity, materials, and details of processes. A similar training manual was found in use for Child Friendly School training in Kavre. Though, the partner NGO- responsible for training could not produce such a manual in case of Sindhupalchowk, the trainers might have used similar manuals or activities from other manuals. Trainee teachers were asked about the training delivery process- in all the three districts. Here are common responses from the trainees: a) the training was full of activities; b) the trainees were quite busy working, constructing materials, or engaging in other activities; c) it was fun to engage in those activities; d) the games and other activities were very much relevant to be used in classroom context.
- The trainee teachers reported that the activities demanded teachers to act like children. According to them they were required to be flexible; to be open- to sing, to dance, to draw, to mimic, to tell stories; to run like children. All these activities seem very much relevant and important for primary teachers where the major focus is *learning through acting*.
- Practical usefulness and relevance: The training design is closely aligned to the primary curriculum. The teachers create songs; create games and play; construct materials. It appears that when implemented rigorously, it may stimulate teachers to be creative; design their own games and activities.

Training contents of the five-day Child Friendly School (CFS) Training Course- Kavre

- Scope of the training course: a) Introduction to and managing child friendly school, b) Introduction to the ABC framework- (that discusses the three phases of teaching and learning: i. Anticipation phase; ii. Building knowledge phase and iii. consolidation phase); c) examples of use of these three phases in T/L process ; d) preparation and practice of the ABC framework and e) micro teaching based on the ABC framework.
- Training process: According to the participants the training was conducted on workshop mode: the trainee teachers were required to actively engage, work and produce materials during the training. Some of the main activities as outlined in the training report include: designing project works based on ABC framework; quick write; brain-storming sessions; think-pair-share; walk around- talk around, materials preparation etc. Thus, it appears that the process was not only limited to 'knowing about'; it goes beyond to 'doing level'.
- Practical usefulness and relevance: The training design is a bit free from the curricular contents. The course deals with the generic issues of learning like- making them receptive- anticipation phase; learning main content and consolidation through examples and reflective exercises. These generic skills have advantages and limitations at the same time. These skills are generally content free and teachers can adapt these skills to the task at hand. The limitation is that these skills are too broad to get immediately applied in the classroom teaching. The usefulness and relevance of this kind of training skills may get strengthened with on-site professional support and monitoring.

Adoption of desired teaching methods, concepts and processes

1. The basic condition for the effectiveness of any training course after the design and implementation phase is the adoption of the training skills in the workplace. Possible measures to assess the extent of adoption of the desired training skills include- direct observation, self-reporting, indirect reporting of the behaviors of the trainee teachers after undergoing the training process.

Direct Observation

2. This is one of the most difficult measures in terms of time and expertise required. The observers should be knowledgeable about the intent and processes of the training. The

observers should observe the teaching and other important aspects of teacher behavior over a period of time. The observation should capture all important aspects of teacher behavior and be informed by the desired level of behavior in terms of standard practice and in terms of the training design.

3. During the study period, a number of classes were observed- three classes in Bardiya, two classes in Kavre and one class in Sindhupalchok.
4. During field work in Bardiya it was planned to visit three of the schools with Save the Children intervention. Because one of the schools was closed on the day of visit two schools were visited: they were Dharmabhakta Secondary School Katarniya and Shree Shukra HSS, Taratal.
 - a. It was reported and also observed that the classroom environment has been improved. It was after the training input to the teachers of the school. According to the DWO the schools were provided some support to improve the learning environment, especially in early grades. One of the teachers trained from the program was awarded last year for creativity and level of achievement.
 - b. In Dharmabhakta Secondary School, the same teacher who was awarded last year was teaching in grade three as a grade teacher. There were about 35 students on the day visited. It was a very cold winter day- and the whole city was facing cold wave. Still the class was almost full. The class was decorated with instructional materials, and the students were sitting on the floor with carpet. The classroom set up was in accordance with the child friendly schooling practices. The students appeared quite motivated and excited with a number of visitors in the class.
 - c. The teacher was teaching English and teaching them to 'follow instructions'. The students were following commands actually they were acting as per the instructions from the teacher. The teacher looked quite confident in teaching the subject and he was utilizing the available resources in the class. The competence and confidence that I could observe from the teacher provided some ground to link it with the teacher training.
 - d. The other school visited in Bardiya was Shree Shukra HSS, Taratal. In the school- one of the teachers was teaching Nepali in grade two. I could observe the class only for 15-20 minutes and the class ended. However, I could draw some

insight from the teaching observation. He was telling stories, he was acting the story and students were almost glued to the story telling. At the end he asked few questions to the students- regarding the events in the story and the responses were quite encouraging. Thus, I could observe the skills in the teaching behavior that could be linked to the training course that dealt with the contents like teaching listening skills, or teaching stories.

- e. In Shukra HS School, the next class was planned to observe at grade three- English language. It was observed that the school follows 'subject teaching' instructional organization. However, to keep some of the elements of grade teaching the school maintained one teacher responsible for the grade through assigning two or more classes to the same teacher. It was informed that the teacher participated in two training courses including one on ATL.
- f. It was grade three and the class was almost full with 25 students present- almost equal number of boys and girls and sitting on the carpeted floor –mainly around the walls and some inside. There was space for the teacher to move around.
- g. She started the lesson writing the topic on the white board- it was from the text book- 'oral conversation'.

She asked to turn page 40 of the textbook. It was English text and presented in dialogue- of about eight lines- about four lines for each of the characters.

She started to read it out for students and asked students to follow; word by word and line by line.

After two lines- she asked a pair to stand up and read it for others-the others were asked to follow; students started reading (it was not a real conversation; it appeared that the students were not ready for conversation).

The teacher hardly spoke any words outside of the textbook. I was not sure whether or how many of the students were following the conversation (text). I could observe that the students on the back of the class were not following the flow of the text in the book. The teacher was trying to involve as many students as possible- in the reading and chorus- but it was almost no guarantee that the students were following the text- I tried with few students and found that they were just uttering with the teacher or peers but- they were actually not following the text- they were in second line- when the dialogue was already in fourth line. Hence, relevance of the teaching was a matter of concern.

However, the teacher was using teaching skills like- reading for the students, asking them repeat with the teacher; asking a pair to recite;

- h. The teacher looked unsure to address these complexities. She could not construct sentences from the context. She could have asked students to talk on matters like the food the students had that morning. She could have asked students to use or a follow a structure of question and answer- providing a structure to the students and asking them to complete the sentence choosing appropriate words.
 - i. At the end she told that it is because of English language- she experienced some difficulty. She expressed that the students do not understand English and she herself lacks confidence in using the language.
 - j. The class provided some evidence regarding the use of the teaching skills: the involvement of students in the learning process; correcting mistakes of students when there is a need; keeping eyes to all of the students in the room; asking all the students to follow. So, I could observe some of the skills and at the same time some difficulties with the teacher.
5. In Kavrepalanchowk two classes were observed: one in Kalidevi Primary School Mangaltar and the other in Shree Buddha Primary School Katunje.
 6. In Kalidevi Primary School it was grade two: there were only 8 students (4 girls and 4 boys) present on the day of observation though there were 19 students as reported. Since it had been only 3 days after a festival many students were absent as said by the teachers. Nepali period ended and Math period begun. Lesson distribution in the school such that two periods for Nepali, one for Mathematics and one period for English, rest other subjects.
 7. Different charts and figures were displayed in the class: e.g. Job chart, Days and Month charts, letter and number charts, word chart (English and Nepali), Season chart, classroom contract, classroom rules. However, the white board was totally worn out.
 - a. Since there were only eight students teacher was teaching writing to individually. In Mathematics period the teacher asked to the class if anyone knew how to do the addition that he presented in the white board. The smart ones raised hands and got opportunity to solve the problem in the white board.

- b. One girl as told by the teacher had difficulty in learning and comprehending what she learnt. So she was much slower than other children in learning. She has difficulty in retaining what was taught said the teacher. But neither was he oriented nor aware about the special needs education. He said he gives 'individual attention' to the girl.
 - c. Since there were very few students the real classroom practice could not be observed. One smart boy seemed to dominate the class. Because of the special circumstance in the school, mainly because of low student enrolment not much could be established regarding the training skills- the extent of learning and the extent of adoption of the skills in the classroom.
8. The next school was Shree Buddha Primary School. It was a big classroom with only few students- one girl and five boys on the day visited. The class was full of displays, decorated with colorful pictures, different charts and diagrams. Most of these materials were kept there with purpose. For example, there was a calendar and other charts that students adjust every day.
- a. The teacher appeared active. It was grade 2 and the teacher was teaching mathematics. Students were asked one by one to solve the subtraction in the board. Teacher tried to teach the concept by making students draw and count vertical lines.
 - b. Boys seem to dominate the class. But according to the teacher since the girl was younger than others they treat her like younger sister.
 - c. One could sense that the teacher was utilizing these lines on the whiteboard to counting and subtracting. It is the use of semi-concrete materials for teaching mathematical concepts. He could have also used the classroom materials (concrete) to teach the concept of subtraction. The classroom environment tells the story that the skills has reached to the classroom and made some impact in the actual teaching. However, there is not much big difference in the teaching practices. For example, the teachers have learned the mathematical games to teach these concepts. These skills could have easily been used- as the numbers of

students was very small. That was not that case. However, there was some change from the traditional classroom set up and traditional teaching practices.

9. Four schools were visited in Sindhupalchowk. However, on the day of visit, there were classes on only two of the schools- Shivapuri Primary School and Nibugaon Lower Secondary School. There were examinations scheduled in the remaining two schools.
10. In Shivapuri Primary School, the classrooms were small but full of instructional materials. There were not many students in the higher grades- grades four and five. There were about 25 students in grade one but only students in grade five. The school has received permission from the DE Office to run up to grade three only.
 - a. The teachers were active- singing and reciting with the students. It was the head-teacher who participated in the materials construction training. She briefed how she changed the classroom environment after the training.
11. Next school was Nibugaon Lower Secondary School. The teacher was a young higher secondary graduate. He has been appointed as a teacher in the school's source and was in the job for a year. He participated in the ATL training last year and it was his first training experience of this kind.
 - a. It was grade five with 10 students, all of them from Tamang community. There were six boys and four girls.
 - b. It was a very much traditional classroom arrangement with rows, with few cardboards hanging on the walls. These materials on the wall were also indicative of the use of training skills in the classroom practice.
 - c. He was teaching the concept of triangle- he started teaching the concept with three line segments in the whiteboard and then moved to using board-markers in place of line segments. His presentation was not following a logical sequence- he started talking about a triangle with all the three-sides equal- before establishing the concept of triangle itself.
 - d. He made every attempt to involve students in the learning process: a) asking questions and making students think; b) showing the triangular shape using the board markers- and asking the students to form shapes; c) demonstrating the different types of triangles by side-lengths and asking the students to make shapes- again using the same markers. When any of the students were found

unable to make the shape- he involved other students who could make it. After every successful completion of the task I could hear a round of applaud to encourage the students. It seems that he was practicing the importance of involving students in the learning process and use of reinforcers for the correct responses.

- e. The teacher was trying to cover so many concepts- starting from the concept of triangle to equilateral, isosceles and scalene triangle. He was asking students to construct those triangles using board-marker; he was trying to teach the difference between those different types of triangles- mainly based on the lengths of sides.
 - f. It looked like he was trying to impress the observer. He demonstrated some of the training skills in the class- he was using some of the instructional materials; he was asking students to participate; he was reinforcing to the correct responses and correcting incorrect ones. However, he was not fully confident to handle the subject matter.
12. Thus, the direct observation provided some evidence of adoption of training skills in the class. In almost all the classes observed the teachers were using some of skills- particularly evident were – the involvement of students in the learning process and the use of instructional materials.

Self-reporting

13. One could observe only few of the sample classes to establish the extent of use of training skills in the classroom. There are so many variables that affect the choice of instructional methods and design. Hence, direct observation of many varied cases was practically impossible. The alternative to direct observation is report from the trainees themselves.
14. The teachers were asked regarding the skills they learned during training and use of those skills in classroom instruction. In Bardiya the teachers reported that they learned different games and activities that they thought useful for classroom instruction. The teacher who was observed- was also asked regarding the extent of use of those skills. In Dharmabhakta School the teacher replied that he has benefitted a lot and has applied in classroom instruction in maximum. In Sukra HSS the teacher replied that she has been using the skills. However, she felt some difficulty in teaching English. She believed, it

was particularly because of her weak language competence- that limited her capacity to use those skills in teaching English.

15. In Kavre, the teachers were not that confident in their remarks regarding the use of skills in the classroom. They shared that the training was interesting- but they did not put the matter confidently that they have applied the skills to the maximum. According to them there are 3 to 4 skill levels in the classroom. This has been a challenge. However, some are asked to copy from the board and some are asked to copy from the book. Students are grouped according to the level and taught. This report provides some ground on their awareness on the diversity that exists in the classroom. This awareness is the starting point to think and design appropriate activities to these diverse groups.
16. In the case of Sindhupalchowk, the teachers replied that they are using some of the skills. However, they cited many reasons for not using the skills in the classroom. For example, the students are not that regular; the parents are rural farmers and are not aware of importance of education. Hence, the teachers believe, the students hardly complete their homeworks. They provided a number of reasons to justify the case. It appears that they normally follow the traditional chalk and talk. It is not to generalize the case in all the schools. The case of Shivapuri was different- the teachers put confidently that they are using the skills in classroom teaching.
17. The overall impression from the direct reporting from the trainee teachers is that they have started to uplift the classroom environment; and there are clear signs of improvement in terms of involvement of students in the learning process. So, the dependence on classroom lecture has reduced and the space is taken over by other activities. The skill to design and use appropriate activities is still a matter of concern in many of the cases.

Indirect reporting

18. Besides the direct report from the trainee teachers- the head-teachers, the RPs, the people from the partner NGO were asked regarding their perception on the use of training skills in the classroom by the teachers.
 - a. According to the headteacher of Shree Buddha Primary School, Kavre- 'due to the use of different activities- the 45 minutes time passes so quickly'. This gives some

indication regarding the use of the skills learned during training in classroom context. It also highlights how difficult it is to the new teachers to be with the students for 45 minutes. Further, it appears that the new skills have eased their job- that is one of the preconditions of adoption of skills in the classroom. Further, he shared that better students are grouped and given tasks and weaker ones provided extra support. This does not guarantee the adoption, but guarantees the level of awareness of diversities in the classroom and possible implications on teaching.

- b. According to the trainers and RPs, the extent of adoption of skills also varies. For them realization of importance of the skills and activities is very important for use of such skills. When trainees do something during training but do not realize how important it is, they eventually, do not get enough drive to put them into practice. The RPs expressed that some of the schools- where they are highly impressed with the CFS practices ad changed their daily instructional schedule into 'Block design'- with 1.5 hrs for a block. All this requires that the teachers are fully convinced with the new methods- that works and that helps and that eases the job.
- c. Again in Kavre, the trainees were asked to share with the colleagues after returning back from the training. However, to the experience of the trainers the sharing has not been that visible. The trainers shared that there are some instances of effective transfer of training but that is not observed in many other schools.
- d. The RP in Sindhupalchowk reported that there is visible change in terms of display of materials. The classrooms look different in terms of decoration- seating arrangements. The teachers, as reported by the RP have started involving students more in the learning process. So, according to the RP he could observe some visible change in the instructional practices. However, the extent of adoption of skills compared to what they were exposed to during the training is still minimal.
- e. The headteacher from Dharmabhakta School Bardiya reported that teachers do make some efforts after they come back from the training. After few days or weeks they revert back to their original habits. As a result, he shared 'the effects fade away with time'.

- f. The HT from one of the schools in Bardiya reported that 'mobile meetings' has helped to adopt the skills learned during training. These meetings, according to the headteacher and also supported by the partner NGO that is organized in schools in turn. At the time of the meeting the schools are pushed, creating some sort of peer pressure to demonstrate the improvement in the school environment and in the instructional practices. These meetings have helped to promote some sort of competition among the teachers- they get to compare their performances among themselves. This kind of drive is important to check from reverting back to the old habits. The official from the partner NGO shared that she realized the need to provide follow up support- and also monitoring to make them adopt these skills.
- g. In Sukra HSS in Bardiya, the head-teacher made a remark that is very much interesting. After participating in the training program the teacher in grade one insisted to have some budget for lifting the classroom environment. And accordingly the headteacher allocated Rs 40,000 for grade one classroom from the school's source. The headteacher is happy with the motivation of the teacher and this year he assured that he is going to set aside similar amount for grade two. This sort of demand from the teacher and support from the school certainly influences the extent of use of training skills in the classroom.

Enabling and hindering factors for the adoption of training skills

The following paragraphs present the lessons on enabling / hindering factors from the three different districts: Bardiya, Kavre and Sindhupalchowk.

1. Again for the adoption of training skills- the enabling / hindering factors can be analyzed at different levels: a) training design, b) training delivery process, c) the realization of importance of training and the mastery learning, d) supportive environment in the school, e) monitoring and performance linked management system; and f) on-site professional support.

Training design

2. The training, design as discussed earlier, is not uniform across the districts and across the courses. However, the design element encompasses the need of the trainees, their work environment, the real purpose of the training etc. When the training is designed to implement some new changes the trainees are required to understand the new elements, practice the new formats, and gain mastery over it. The focus here is mainly to get ready to 'implement' the given material. When the purpose is to prepare trainees to identify areas of practices that are not meeting the expectations and improve them- the analytical skills and reflection is critical. Furthermore, when the purpose is help trainees to innovate that suits best to their environment then the training design is certainly different from the one that focuses on 'implementation'. Creemers et al. (2013) has classified this approach of teacher education as 'inquiry oriented paradigm' and some others use the term 'holistic' or 'reflective' paradigm. The prime focus in this approach is to help teachers generate knowledge through reflective practices.
3. The main purpose in the context of Save the Children teacher training is to 'implement' these new techniques and also help teachers improve their practices. For example, the training design in the case of ATL and CFS has some structured elements that demand strict 'implementation'. There are other elements like creating games, or songs- that leaves scope to discuss further for improving the practices and the design is loose enough to incorporate demands and interests from the trainees.

4. The analysis of training design in Bardiya revealed that the training was sequenced in three phases- making room for reflection and further consolidation in the subsequent phases. However, the design was not fully implemented. The training in sequence with provision of discussion on the experience of implementation of the skills learned during first phase would certainly help bring in the issues from the classroom and may provide opportunity to adapt to the local situations.

The delivery process

5. The reaction of the trainees during the training was mostly positive- they appreciated the training content and delivery. Specifically, they appreciated the activity based learning design. This kind of appreciation from the trainees is an important precondition for adoption in the classroom practices.
6. One of the participants in Saraswoti HSS, Bhotechour who participated in the training last year and recalls the training event as entertaining. He participated in the 10-month training course organized by the National Centre for Educational Development before this training event. He shared that this training is full of activities relevant for teaching in the primary classes. He remembers a game that requires participants to make words out of the given letters- integrated with physical activity- like the children run to other corner- make word and come back- to win the competition. Similarly, he remembers an activity related to memory testing; singing a song related to diarrhea.
7. The trainee teachers were asked the content areas that they learned during the course that they are still using in classroom instruction. Here are some of the important skill areas- that the teachers reported as using in their classroom instruction:
 - a. Use of 'group-work' as a learning strategy.
 - b. Some others highlighted contents like- Base ten Block; Job chart; Dice making;
 - c. involving students in materials construction; use of tooth pick- twigs ; pebbles for teaching mathematics lessons; learning English alphabets with the names of fruits; teaching mathematics through songs; recognizing numerals through dice; using students (asking to stand up)- to teach multiplication tables; Using letter cards- to teach alphabets (they can recognize it- through games); teaching place value through- 'hit the target game'; mimicking the animals; making words: run- make

words from scrambled letters and back with the word- the fastest one wins;
making numbers: throwing a pair of dice and ask them to make biggest number possible; songs for teaching words- ask to express- teaching expression on the words; the grade-wise songs are performed; using book corner: asking to read something and tell; teaching 'time': using the wall clock or student made clock.

8. One of the basic conditions for the transfer of training skills is learning during the training phase. Some of the training courses require trainees to pass the learning test. With regard to these courses there is no such requirement. However, the trainees were required to demonstrate skills through group work, materials development and presentations, etc. towards the end of the course. Even the delivery sessions, as reported by the trainers, were so designed that the trainees were required to engage actively rather than remaining as passive listeners. As a result, the trainers think that the trainees learn the basics of the activity based learning.
9. It was found that the trainees from Bardiya were quite confident in naming the activities they liked. That was not exactly the case in Sindhupalchowk. It may be linked to the duration of training. The training in Sindhupalchowk was only for three days- and it is possible that there was not enough practice of the skills. So, the 'practice' part seems important during the training delivery. This is also linked to mastery learning: when the trainees feel confident, when the trainees attain the mastery over the skills learned- that enables for adoption in the classroom practices.
10. The involvement of trainees in the actual activities during training contributes to mastery learning and it is generally expected that this facilitates the use of skills in actual classroom teaching. When given opportunity to practice- it is more than remembering lessons- and learning hands on skills. So the trainers were asked about the delivery process: the trainers from Kavre reported that the trainees have learned the basics of the activity based learning system through practice.

Realization of importance of the skills

11. The adoption of training skills depends to a large extent on the perception of the trainee teachers towards training. When they see the training as useful, it is more likely that they will adopt it in the classroom instruction. So, the teachers were asked about the

usefulness of the training course. The importance or usefulness of the new skills according to the trainees is mainly- it is fun; the students take responsibility; not that difficult for the teacher to handle.

12. Some of the teachers, for example the trainees from Kavre, were not that confident regarding the use of these skills learned. They shared that the activities may be fun but not necessarily helpful in developing cognitive competence. They shared that the students are not that shy and they become more assertive. But, their motivation for hard work is not that evident. This clearly signals their lack of confidence on these new methods- that may hinder the application of these skills in the classroom.
13. When asked about the use of skills learned to a trainee teacher in Sindhupalchowk, he replied that he is teaching English language (optional to students) and so the activities that were learned were not that useful in the class. The activities were useful for teaching Nepali and Social Studies- not that useful for teaching English. He did not feel very comfortable- with the question on use of training skills. He shared that – though what he learned was interesting- the classroom environment does not allow for using what was learned there. He was further asked what inhibits him from using the skills- he started talking about the school environment, the unavailability of materials, and family factors- like students are irregular etc. All this leaves questions unanswered regarding whether the trainees were convinced with the new methods- whether there was excitement to use- in absence of all these they participate in training and appreciate it and still do not put adequate efforts to change the status quo.

Supportive school environment

14. Supportive environment is one of the very important conditions for the successful implementation of training skills in classroom. In Shukra School of Bardiya, the head-teacher mentioned that the teachers asked for improving classroom environment and the school supported from the school's source. In some other instances, the trainee teachers go back to the school and revert to their usual teaching practices. As a remedy to this the teachers suggested to go for Whole School Approach training- so that all the teachers and staffs reach to the same level. And it is easier to have common understanding for effective implementation of the skills.

Monitoring of the performance

15. When there is need to work hard because of the school environment- that enables effective implementation of training programs. In Shivapuri School of Sindhupalchowk, the expectation from the teachers is high and there is regular monitoring from the head-teacher. As a result of this there is visible change in the classroom practices. When head-teachers are aware of the training they may monitor the classroom practices and encourage teachers to adopt the skills.

On-site professional support

16. The onsite support part is not that strong in any of these districts visited. The RPs and supervisors are aware about the training course in kavre. In Sindhupalchowk the RP told that he participated in one of the training courses as observer and he has some awareness of the course. In Bardiya, the supervisors were not that aware of the training courses. Thus, there is clear variation in terms of capacity to provide on-site support. Even in Kavre and Sindhupalchowk where there is some awareness among the Supervisors and RPs, there is not much support from them to the teachers. In Bardiya the coordinator from the partner NGO reported that there is a clear need for professional support to the teachers.
17. The partner NGO in Kavre shared that they would like to have some mechanisms to provide onsite support to the trained teachers. It is not possible to recruit someone outside of the system to provide onsite professional support.

Major Findings

18. *Training of Trainers (TOT)*: This is one of the mechanisms that many training providers with large scale implementation use to ensure uniform delivery of training. In the three districts visited the training courses were found implemented with very brief interaction among the trainers rather than a standard TOT for preparing trainers. The limited scale of training operation-few cycles, use of the same trainers might have made it possible to avoid the need for TOT.
19. *Management of Training conduction*: Again, It was found that there is no uniform modality of training delivery. In Kavre, the District Education Office takes lead in the management of training courses- including the design of the courses, selection of

participants and trainers, and conduction of training courses. Contrary to the practice, in Bardiya, the partner NGO takes lead in all important aspects of training management. The partner NGO seeks permission for the selection of trainees- even the names of participating teachers comes through the NGO. It was observed that both of these practices exist at Sindhupalchowk district. In one area the DEO leads the management of the training courses- in some other area the partner NGO takes responsibility.

20. *Implementation of training design*: It was reported that the training design is not uniform across the districts. For example, in Bardiya the training program included three cycles- basis, refresher 1 and refresher 2. The basic training was designed for seven days and focused on foundational skills on active learning, plus curricular alignment to suit the needs of teaching in grade one. The next two cycles was expected to enrich the same teachers for teaching grade two and grade- three curriculum. Thus, the expectation was to practice an instructional design in the schools where teachers promote along with their students to grades two and three in the subsequent years. However, such a practice could not be traced in the schools. Moreover, there are many instances where there are different participants for these different cycles- thus the implementation is again flexible to accommodate the larger numbers of teachers than that was planned.
21. *Assessing learning from the training*: The trainee teachers shared that they are better prepared to engage students in the learning process. They learned some of the instructional strategies i.e. use games, songs, stories, and other activities- that are fun for students. In Bardiya, the teachers shared a number of content areas that they learned from the trainings.
22. *The use of training skills*: The classrooms are different. They are more exciting than they used to be in the past. There are instructional materials. The classroom environment has improved. The teachers have started engaging students in the learning process than in the past.
23. *Outcomes of training*: The head-teachers and teachers shared that they have started mobilizing students for managing classroom activities, for decorating classrooms, for collecting and constructing instructional materials, and they have positive feeling regarding the cooperation received from the students. They share that the students have become more assertive than before, they are not that shy any more. They have noticed

that there is visible improvement in student regularity. However, the teachers expressed that they are not quite sure and they are not in a position to claim that there is a distinct improvement in the learning achievement.

Future directions

On the basis of the review the following paragraphs provide some suggestion to consider while implementing teacher training programs in the future.

1. Districts had their own design of training management. Certain level of uniformity is desirable to assess the effectiveness. For example DEO's involvement from the very beginning will help in post training support and follow up.
2. Training was designed on the basis for some assumptions e.g. schools would adopt grade teaching, same teacher will participate in follow-up training. But the field level reality is different. Therefore training is assumed to be more effective if it is designed on keeping in view the reality of the implementation level.
3. Teachers require follow up and post training supports. Besides, PNGO social mobilizers are potential resources to undertake the post training support and follow up tasks. But to undertake the task effectively social mobilizers need to be familiar with the training. Therefore they also need to be part of all the trainings provided to the teachers.
4. Any innovation to be successful requires supports from co workers and institution. However co workers provide support only if they are convinced and knowledgeable about the innovation. In order to create a supportive environment at school at least all the teachers from primary level and head teachers need to be trained in ATL and CFS.
5. General child-centered pedagogical skills are necessary for all teachers. However the review of the implementation of the teacher training also indicated that teachers also need language teaching skills e.g. English as a second and/or third language, and Nepali as second language teaching techniques.
- 6.

Annex-1 The five day training course on CFS for primary teachers organized jointly by the DEO, Kavre and Save the Children

Venue: Kalidevi Secondary School, Patlekhet, Kavre

Duration: BS 2070/07/05 to 2070/07/09 (five days)

Training schedule

Day	Session I 10:30- 12:00	Session II 12:15- 13:45	Session III 14:30- 16:00
One	Introduction to the trainees and course	Introduction to the concept of child friendly school and its importance	Introduction to the concept of child friendly school and its importance
Two	Characteristics of child friendly schools	Managing child friendly schools	Child friendly schools and role of stakeholders
Three	Project work in child friendly teaching	Practical experience in projects in child friendly teaching	Practical experience in projects in child friendly teaching
Four	Presentation of projects	Introduction to the ABC Framework	ABC Framework: Sample activities; how it works
Five	ABC Framework: Sample activities; Micro teaching	ABC Framework: Sample activities; Micro teaching	Training evaluation and closing

References

1. ATL training manual Bardiya.
2. ATL training manual, Sindhupalchowk.
3. CFS training manual, Kavrepalanchok.
4. Creemers, Bert., Kyriakides, Leonidas and Antonior, Panayiotos. (2013). Teacher professional development for improving quality of teaching. NY: Springer
5. Kirkpatrick, Donald D., and Kirkpatrick, James D. (2007). Implementing the four levels: A practical guide for evaluation of training programs.