

Evaluation of LO-Norway Programme of Co-operation with Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions

May 2010



Project NZ13: Organization Development -ZCTU



Report compiled by
Mohammed Mwamadzingo and Hassan Raha

Table of contents

Acronyms and abbreviations	iii
Executive summary	iv
I Introduction	1
I.1 Background.....	1
1.2. Purpose of the evaluation.....	2
1.3 Methodology of the evaluation	3
II Zimbabwe: Brief Country Context	5
II.1 Economic and labour market profile	5
II.2 Social profile	6
II.3: Political profile	8
III Trade union situation in Zimbabwe	9
III.1 Background	9
III.2 Trade union challenges and strategies	11
IV Findings of the evaluation	16
IV.1 Introduction.....	16
IV.2 Relevance of support.....	16
IV.3: Efficiency in implementation.....	17
IV.4: Results of the programme cooperation.....	17
IV.5: ZCTU sustainability	20
IV.6: External impact	21
IV.7: Gender issues	21
IV.8: Internal democracy.....	23
IV.9: Risks analysis.....	23
V Summary and Conclusions	25
VI: Recommendations	26
VI.1 Overall recommendation	26
VI.2 Specific recommendations for effective co-operation.....	26
Appendix 1: Terms of reference for evaluation	30
Appendix 2: Persons met and interviewed	33
Appendix 3: International Labour Conventions ratified by Zimbabwe	39

Acronyms and abbreviations

ANSA	Alternatives to Neoliberalism in Southern Africa
CBA	Collective Bargaining Agreement
CPI	Consumer Price Index
CSO	Civil Society Organization
CTUC	Commonwealth Trade Union Council
DANIDA	Danish International Development Assistance, Denmark
EMCOZ	Employers' Confederation of Zimbabwe
FES	Friedrich Ebert Stiftung
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNU	Government of National Unity
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immuno-deficiency Syndrome
HLM	High-Level Mission from the International Labour Conference Committee on Application of Conventions and Recommendations
ILO	International Labour Organization
ITUC	International Trade Union Confederation
LEDRIZ	Labour and Economic Development Research Institute of Zimbabwe
LO/FTF Council	Danish Trade Union Council for International Development Co-operation
LO-Norway	Norwegian Confederation of Trade Unions
MDC-M	Movement for Democratic Change–Mutambara
MDC-T	Movement for Democratic Change–Tsvangirai
NCA	National Constitutional Assembly
NEDLAC	National Economic Development and Labour Advisory Council
NGO	Non-Government Organization
NORAD	The Norwegian Agency for Development Co-operation
OATUU	Organization of African Trade Union Unity
OHS	Occupational Health and Safety
PPP	Purchasing Power Parity
PTUZ	Progressive Teachers' Union of Zimbabwe
ZCIEA	Zimbabwe Chamber of Informal Economy Associations
SATUCC	Southern African Trade Union Co-coordinating Council
SAPs	Structural Adjustment Programmes
WTO	World Trade Organization
ZANU–PF	Zimbabwe African National Union–Patriotic Front
ZLFHR	Zimbabwe Lawyers for Human Rights
ZIMRIGHTS	Zimbabwe Human Rights Association

Executive summary

The collaboration between the LO-Norway and ZCTU started in the late 1980s. Initially much of the support was in the increasing the capacity of women in trade unions, but since 1997 the collaboration has been aimed at supporting work to strengthen the trade union movement in general and the capacity of the ZCTU. The basic objective was to enable the ZCTU and its affiliated unions to be able to develop strategies on how to improve labour rights through negotiating collective agreements to benefit its members as well as strengthening capacity of the trade union movement.

The basis of this evaluation is to determine the performance and progress of the programme cooperation, and to gauge if results or objectives are being met. The evaluation was also deemed necessary in order to form a basis for decisions in LO-Norway regarding possible finalising or continuation of the project. The evaluation will cover the period 2006-2009.

Under ordinary circumstances, the LO-Norway prefers to evaluate its programme cooperation with the collaborating partners at least once within each project cycle. However, due to the extra-ordinary circumstances that engulfed Zimbabwe, and especially the ZCTU, it has not been possible to undertake any evaluation since 2004. As such the just-ended project phase (2006-2009) did not have the benefit of an evaluation exercise for the preceding period.

The objectives of the evaluation were stated as follows:

- (i) To assess results of the support provided to ZCTU by LO to strengthen capacity of the organisation; and
- (ii) To assess modalities of cooperation with ZCTU and provide recommendations on areas for improvement, in particular related to monitoring and reporting on performance by ZCTU.

During the period under review the economic profile of Zimbabwe continued to be characterized by a wide variety of difficult economic problems. Consequently, this deteriorating economic and poverty profile has had a disastrous effect on the social life to the extent that life expectancy at birth has dramatically declined, the health system has more or less collapsed, while education is under threat. At the same time, the political profile remains highly complex, unpredictable and subject to rapid machinations.

After the relative optimism of 2009, the government of national unity looks terminally disunited. The current political issues have brought about further disenfranchisement among leaders. These issues include the indigenisation law, ZANU-PF diamond sales, sanctions, constitutional reform process and fear of blood bath, human and trade union rights, and the announcement about wage freeze.

Despite these challenges, the ZCTU enjoys vibrant structures at national, regional and district structures. Currently, the ZCTU has a membership base of thirty-four affiliated unions, whose total membership stood at 238 998. However, the national centre is confronted by increased challenges including liberalization of labour markets, mass poverty and massive unemployment, a shrinking economy, rival unions and declining membership. There are also

reports of continued pressure on organized labour from unscrupulous employers who emphasize on individualized contracts and temporary work.

This evaluation has noted overall positive outcomes on the ZCTU/LO-Norway co-operation in general. Through the LO-Norway support, ZCTU has remained highly relevant in the context of a very challenging external environment. Through the support, the ZCTU has managed to educate, train and build a discernible cadre of trained women and men.

The cooperation has also enabled the ZCTU to effectively participate in national debates, influence the establishment of the ILO Commission of Inquiry, and maintain the trust and confidence of many national and international partners. For many years, the LO-Norway was the only visible and consistent partner supporting ZCTU. This support has enabled the ZCTU to play an admirable role in the continuing democratisation of the country while at the same time upholding and defending workers' rights. In a nutshell, the co-operation has been relevant, efficient and effective.

Nonetheless, the co-operation faced notable bottlenecks. Of paramount negative significance is the ongoing quagmire in the social, political, economic and trade union spheres. There have been poor project results especially in relation to increase in membership, payment of subscription dues by affiliates, and the merger and amalgamation processes. The increasing agitation of some "concerned affiliates" has also caused some level of internal disharmony amongst some affiliates. It is also worth noting that the sustainability of the ZCTU is not guaranteed in the absence of the programme co-operation.

The findings of the evaluation exercise (summarized below) are organized into nine categories as specified in the Terms of Reference for the evaluation.

Relevance:	Programme cooperation is very relevant as it targets the needs, almost always reaches its objectives and strengthens the capacity of the ZCTU and its affiliated unions.
Efficiency:	Despite the adverse social, economic, political and economic situation, the operations of the programme has remained substantially efficient and the
Project results:	The programme cooperation has achieved good results, including commendable financial management. However, many of the quantitative objectives related to membership recruitment and organizing and payment of union dues have not been realized.

Sustainability:	Given the current financial base, the ZCTU is considered a going concern for the next one year. But, the organization is not financially sustainable after the withdrawal of donor support.
External impact:	ZCTU has been very influential with a national and international outlook. It is the cornerstone of the bedrock of the labour and human rights movement in Zimbabwe. It enjoys strong support from its membership as well as with external partners and has much respect in its interventions in human and trade union sphere.
Gender issues:	The level of women participation in trade union activities remains low and gender disaggregated data remains a challenge. Despite the absence of a comprehensive gender policy and lack of dedicated budget to support women activities ZCTU maintains a strong position that labour should not be divided or discriminated on the basis of gender. During the period under consideration, the ZCTU achieved many positive attributes in relation to gender mainstreaming.
Internal democracy:	ZCTU leadership have largely practiced the principles of internal democracy by holding elections every five years. Many of the constitutional meetings have also been held regularly. In recent times, there has emerged a group of the “concerned affiliates” who have increasingly expressed some discomfort with the current leadership.
Risks analysis:	The effects of the social, economic, political and trade union situation have had decimating effects to the implementation of the programme cooperation. It was highly unsafe to carry out trade union work, yet ZCTU remained steadfast to the set objectives.

Finally, the evaluation team recommends for a more sustainable continuation of the co-operation between LO-Norway and ZCTU. The ZCTU requires a sustained (if not increased) level of support from its partners. It is further recommended that this continuation must be in accordance with clear and specific indicators of achievement that are subject to internal periodic monitoring and evaluation.

It is the informed opinion of the evaluation team that specific steps could be undertaken to further enhance the next phases of the programme cooperation. The specific recommendations for effective co-operation include:

- Baseline survey and database on union membership,
- Update of the ZCTU Constitution,
- Enhance the role of gender mainstreaming in trade union work,

- Young workers holding the key of the future of the trade union movement,
- Enhance trade union solidarity amongst affiliates and increase viability of unions through mergers and amalgamations,
- Focus on sustainability aspects,
- Information networks within unions,
- Project and financial management including enhanced relations with the external auditors, and
- ZCTU/LO-Norway relations

I Introduction

I.1 Background

The Norwegian Confederation of Trade Unions (LO-Norway) has had close collaboration with the Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU) since late 1980s. Initially much of the support was in the increasing the capacity of women in trade unions, but since 1997 the collaboration has been aimed at supporting work to strengthen the trade union movement in general and the capacity of the ZCTU.

The programme cooperation has mainly involved support to the national trade union centre, but also targeted the elected national and local leaders of ZCTU and the affiliated national unions. The main types of activities have been in the area of negotiations, organizing, education and training. The basic objective was to enable the ZCTU and its affiliated unions to be able to develop strategies on how to improve labour rights through negotiating collective agreements to benefit its members as well as strengthening capacity of the trade union movement. The co-operation and dialogue between LO-Norway and its partner in Zimbabwe is built on mutual respect for the organisations' right to develop their own policies, accountability and full transparency.

At the beginning of 2010, both LO-Norway and ZCTU agreed to evaluate the programme cooperation in order to assess the performance and progress, and to gauge if results or objectives are being met. The evaluation was also deemed necessary in order to form a basis for decisions in LO-Norway regarding possible finalising or continuation of the project. The evaluation will cover the period 2006-2009.

The project co-operation between LO-Norway and ZCTU for the period 2006-2009 was coded as: NZ13: Organization Development - ZCTU. The objectives of the co-operation were stated as follows:

Programme goal:

The ZCTU becomes a financially viable, effective, democratic and influential trade union movement in Zimbabwe.

Programme objectives:

The objectives of the project were divided into immediate and medium to long term objectives.

Immediate objectives:

- To increase membership by at least 10% annually from the 2005 figure through the affiliated unions.
- To establish effective structures at various levels for effective service delivery.
- To raise income from subscriptions by at least 150% over the 2005 level.
- To ensure sound financial management.
- To eliminate the organizations internal inter-fund borrowing.
- To ensure internal democracy.

Medium and long term objectives:

- To maintain at least 50% unionization in the country.
- To attain financial self-reliance.
- To redeem the organization's overall debt.
- To build trade union strength and capacity, for effective service delivery and influence in society.
- To create fewer but bigger and stronger unions through mergers and or amalgamations.
- To protect and promote good governance, human and trade unions rights.

1.2. Purpose of the evaluation

(a) Objectives of the evaluation

Ordinarily, the LO-Norway prefers to undertake an evaluation of its programme cooperation with the collaborating partners at the end of each project phase. However, due to the extraordinary circumstances that engulfed Zimbabwe, and especially the ZCTU, it has not been possible to undertake such an exercise since 2004. As such the just-ended project phase (2006-2009) did not have the benefit of an evaluation exercise for the preceding period.

The evaluation of which this report is based was aimed at reviewing the progress and results of the co-operation projects, and to see what has been achieved during the project implementation period 2006 through 2009. The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the performance and progress of the co-operation and to see if the intended results and objectives had been met. As earlier indicated, the evaluation was also intended to form the basis for LO-Norway's decisions regarding the future co-operation agreement with ZCTU as from 2010.

According to the terms of reference agreed between the collaborating partners, the objectives of the evaluation were stated as follows:

- To assess results of the support provided to ZCTU by LO to strengthen capacity of the organisation; and
- To assess modalities of cooperation with ZCTU and provide recommendations on areas for improvement, in particular related to monitoring and reporting on performance by ZCTU.

The evaluation was expected to include, but not necessarily be limited to, an assessment of the relevance, efficiency, project results, sustainability, external impact, gender issues, internal democracy, and risk analysis of the programme cooperation. The Terms of Reference also give leeway to the evaluator to comment on other issues relating to the co-operation.

The LO-Norway engaged the support of the International Labour Organization (ILO) through Dr Mohammed Mwamadzingo (Senior Economist, ILO Headquarters in Geneva) and Mr Hassan Raha (independent consultant and former trade union leader in Tanzania) as consultants to undertake the evaluation. The Terms of Reference for the evaluation are annexed as Appendix 1.

(b) What the evaluation is not about

In the course of undertaking this evaluation, it became apparent to the evaluators that there have been indeed many other evaluations undertaken by other ZCTU partners in the recent months. Though the outcomes of these evaluations have generally been positive, there was also a growing level of anxiety towards such activities, particularly within the trade union movement in Zimbabwe. Because of the anxiety generated by the current evaluation, there were many respondents who were keen to meet with the evaluators for purposes that could well be described as beyond the mandate of the Terms of Reference of this evaluation.

Consequently, the evaluators found it prudent to politely state to some respondents and to the collaborating partners (LO-Norway and ZCTU) that this evaluation was not an investigation of ZCTU activities. The evaluators were not concerned about law enforcement, scientific tests, forensic audits or discoveries. Neither was this exercise meant to be a research, an inspection, or an exploration of trade union activities in Zimbabwe.

1.3 Methodology of the evaluation

(a) Approach

The evaluators chose a simplistic approach towards fulfilling the Terms of Reference, while at the same ensuring technical proficiency of the work and cognisant of the sensitivity associated with the trade union movement and its partners in Zimbabwe. As such, much of the findings of this evaluation were based on either the review of relevant documentation or through broad-based interviews with prior-identified selected respondents.

(b) Review of relevant documentation

Prior the commencement of the interviews, the LO-Norway made available to the evaluators an extensive range of documents pertaining to the project cooperation. Much of these documents related to management reports, audited accounts, and activity reports. The evaluators were also able to access various reports of the International Labour Conference and ILO Governing Body pertaining to the trade union situation in Zimbabwe. More documentation was obtained from the field visits including ZCTU Congress Resolutions, Constitution, policy documents and position papers, speeches, work plans, and evaluation reports.

(c) Interviews

Before the commencement of field visits, the evaluators presented to the ZCTU an outline of the proposed plan of work for the evaluation exercise and identified categories of ZCTU structures, institutions and individuals to be interviewed. Mrs Alice Gondwe-Siame, the LO-Norway Regional Representative (Africa) and Mr Last Tarabuku (ZCTU Project Coordinator) accompanied the evaluators and coordinating many of the local interviews, respectively.

The field visit to Zimbabwe took place during the period 2 – 14 May 2010. This included a field trip to Masvingo Province on 8 and 9 May 2010.

The full list of people interviewed is shown in appendix 2, but the main institutions and persons met can be summarized as follows:

- ZCTU (elected leadership, Women's Advisory Committee, Administration and Finance F Committee, selected affiliates, heads of departments, regional offices (2), shop stewards)
- Minister of Labour and Social Services
- Employers' Confederation of Zimbabwe (EMCOZ)
- National Constitutional Assembly
- Human rights organizations
- ILO Country Office
- Friedrich Ebert Stiftung
- American Center for International Labor Solidarity
- Royal Norwegian Embassy
- LEDRIZ, ANSA
- External auditors

At the end of the field visit, the evaluators made a presentation to the ZCTU leadership (elected leaders) and the Women's Advisory Committee on 13 May 2010. The presentation was aimed at highlighting the general findings of the evaluation, discuss the conclusions and suggest recommendations emanating from the exercise.

(d) Limitations of the evaluation

As in exercise of this nature, certain bottlenecks are bound to occur. Firstly, the evaluators had anticipated administering some questionnaires to some of the respondents. The first type of questionnaire was to be administered to the selected ZCTU affiliates with the aim of generating statistical opinion of respondents towards the mission, vision and services offered by the national centre. There was also another questionnaire that could have been used to individual educators and shop stewards and aimed at identifying the modalities of implementing the programme of cooperation. However, due to the understanding of the local situation by the evaluators and to avoid any divisive tendencies to be generated by statistical evidence, the evaluators decided against the use of structured questionnaire. This decision was also attributed to poor organizational arrangements by the accompanying local counterpart, especially during the early field visits.

The second limitation is that the evaluators did not adopt any scientific sampling technique in the identification of the organizations or individuals interviewed. Many of the respondents were chosen and interviewed on the basis of convenience.

Finally, due to time constraints and other logistical issues the evaluation exercise had a rather limited outreach, especially to regions and shop stewards. The rather poor logistical, coordination and transport arrangements by the designated ZCTU official had a particular discomforting effect to the exercise right from the very first appointment on the morning of Monday the 3rd of June.

II Zimbabwe: Brief Country Context

II.1 Economic and labour market profile

During the period under review the economic profile of Zimbabwe continued to be characterized by a wide variety of difficult economic problems. The background to these challenges range from the involvement in the war in the DRC between 1998 and 2002 which drained hundreds of millions of dollars from the economy; the chaotic and violent land reform programme that badly damaged the commercial farming sector; to the routine printing of money by Reserve Bank of Zimbabwe (RBZ) to fund the bludgeoning budget deficit, causing the highest recorded hyperinflation from about 2003 to April 2009. The economy deteriorated from one of Africa's strongest economies to the world's worst.

In recent years, there has been considerable economic hardship in Zimbabwe. Many western countries argue that the Government of Zimbabwe's land reform programme, recurrent interference with, and intimidation of the judiciary, as well as maintenance of unrealistic price controls and exchange rates has led to a sharp drop in investor confidence.

Some observers attribute Zimbabwe's economic difficulties to sanctions imposed by the Western powers, a thesis also advanced by the Mugabe Government. It has been argued that the sanctions imposed by Britain, the US, and the EU have been designed to cripple the economy and the conditions of the Zimbabwean people in an attempt to overthrow President Mugabe's government.

As of February 2004 Zimbabwe's foreign debt repayments ceased, resulting in compulsory suspension from the International Monetary Fund (IMF). This, and the United Nations World Food Programme stopping its food aid due to insufficient donations from the world community, has forced the government into borrowing from local sources.

Zimbabwe began experiencing severe foreign exchange shortages, exacerbated by the difference between the official rate and the black market rate in 2000. In 2004 a system of auctioning scarce foreign currency for importers was introduced, which temporarily led to a slight reduction in the foreign currency crisis, but by mid 2005 foreign currency shortages were once again chronic.

There had been numerous currency devaluation, revaluations and re-denominations before the Zimbabwe dollar was officially abandoned on 12 April 2009.

Poverty and unemployment are both endemic in Zimbabwe, driven by the shrinking economy and hyper-inflation. Both unemployment and poverty rates run near 80%.

By the start of the 2009 the situation had been catastrophic for some time. The three parliamentary parties entered into a Government of National Unity (GNU) that became functional in February. Morgan Tsvangirai, the president of the Movement for Democratic Change (MDC) and former trade union leader, became Prime Minister.

Despite serious internal differences the government made some important decisions that improved the general economic situation, first of all the suspension of the national currency, the Zimbabwean Dollar in April 2009. That stopped hyperinflation and made normal forms of

business possible again, by using foreign currency such as the US American Dollar, the South African Rand, the EUs Euro or the Botswana Pula.

The power-sharing government formed in February 2009 has led to some economic improvements, including the cessation of hyperinflation by eliminating the use of the Zimbabwe dollar and removing price controls. The economy is registering its first growth in a decade, but will be reliant on further political improvement for greater growth.

The labour market profile in Zimbabwe is characterized by dual challenge of the scourge of unemployment and endemic poverty. The emergence of the global economic and financial crisis has further exacerbated this quagmire, especially because of the over-reliance on world markets for its primary exports.

Largely due to dual and enclave nature of the economy, Zimbabwe had been experiencing these challenges even before the onset of the national crisis in 1997. As such, Zimbabwean workers and their trade unions have endured high levels of setbacks since the 1990s. The Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) and the ongoing political crisis have compounded the unemployment situation. The unemployment rate is not exactly known but is estimated to now be as high as 95%, with most of those unemployed being young women and men in the 15-24 year age group. Strategies and programmes adopted to deal with unemployment and underemployment, and indeed poverty reduction (and its eradication) have therefore largely failed to stem and reverse the scourge. Most Zimbabweans today have to try to make a living in the informal sector.

II.2 Social profile

The deteriorating economic and poverty profile in Zimbabwe has had a disastrous effect on the social life. For instance, life expectancy at birth for males in Zimbabwe has dramatically declined since 1990 from 60 to 44, to become among the lowest in the world. Life expectancy for females is even lower at 43 years. The amount of time a Zimbabwean citizen is expected to live healthily at birth is 34 for males and just 33 for females.

The health system has more or less collapsed, while education is under threat since the economic changes in 2000 with teachers going on strike because of low pay, students unable to concentrate because of hunger and the price of uniforms soaring making this standard a luxury.

Table 2 gives a quick synopsis of the social profile in Zimbabwe.

Table 1: A brief on the economy of Zimbabwe

Currency	US Dollar and South African Rand
Statistics	
GDP (ppp)	\$332.1 million (2009 est.) ¹
GDP growth	-5.7% (2007) 3.7% (2009 est.)
GDP per capita	\$200 (2008 est.) ²
GDP by sector	Agriculture: 19.1.7%, Industry: 23.9%, Services: 56.9% (2009)
Inflation (CPI)	5.1% (2009 est.); 14.9 billion% (2008 est.)
Population below poverty line	68% (2004)
Gini index	50.1% (1995) 56.8% (2003)
Labour force	3.84 million (2009 est.)
Labour force by occupation	Agriculture: 60%, Services: 9%, Wholesale, Retail, Hotels, Restaurants: ~4%, Manufacturing: 4%, Mining: 3% (2003)
Unemployment	95% (2009 est.); 80% (2005 est.)
Main industries	Mining (coal, gold, platinum, copper, nickel, tin, clay, numerous metallic and non-metallic ores), steel; wood products, cement, chemicals, fertilizer, clothing and footwear, foodstuffs, beverages
External	
Exports	\$1.09 billion (2009 est.); \$1.396 billion (2008 est.)
Export goods	Platinum, cotton, tobacco, gold, ferroalloys, textiles/clothing
Main export partners	South Africa 32.1%, Democratic Republic of the Congo 9.7%, Botswana 8.7%, China 5.6%, Zambia 4.8%, Japan 4.5%, Italy 4.4%, US 4.3% (2008)
Imports	\$2.03 billion (2009 est.); \$1.915 billion (2008 est.)
Import goods	Machinery and transport equipment, other manufactures, chemicals, fuels
Main import partners	South Africa 60.1%, China 4.2%, Botswana 3.7% (2008)
Public finances	
Public debt	304.3% of GDP (2009 est.); 265.6% of GDP (2008 est.)
Revenues	\$138 million

Main data source: CIA World Fact Book

All values, unless otherwise stated, are in US dollars

¹. Zimbabwe is ranked as 207th among a list of 223 countries where data exists

². Zimbabwe is ranked as 152th among a list of 152 countries where data exists

Table 2: A social profile of Zimbabwe

Population growth rate (avg. annual %)	0.3 (2005-2010)
Urban population growth rate (avg. annual %)	2.2 (2005-2010)
Rural population growth rate (avg. annual %)	0.2 (2005-2010)
Urban population (%)	36.8 (2007)
Life expectancy at birth (women and men, years)	44.3/43.4 (2005-2010)
International migrant stock (000 and % of total population)	372.3/2.9 (mid 2010, including refugees)
Education: Government expenditure (% of GDP)	4.6 (UNESCO estimate)
Seats held by women in national parliaments (%)	15.2 (2009)

Source: UN data at <http://data.un.org/CountryProfile.aspx?crName=Zimbabwe>

II.3: Political profile

During the period under evaluation, the political profile of Zimbabwe remains highly complex and difficult to describe. The political landscape is highly unpredictable and subject to rapid machinations overnight. In a nutshell, current politics in Zimbabwe can be summarized as “crisis in democracy and the rule of law”. Some commentators have referred to Zimbabwe politics as “autocratic regime based on personal rule”.

Since the power-sharing deal signed in September 2008, where President Mugabe remains head of state, head of the cabinet and head of the armed services and former trade unionist and opposition leader Morgan Tsvangirai was eventually (in February 2009) sworn in as prime minister the specific features of Zimbabwe politics can be summarized as: conspiratorial politics replacing democratic elections; a high incidence of clientelism and rivalry for the leader's favours; widespread corruption; purges or rehabilitations and succession manoeuvres within political parties.

After the relative optimism of 2009, the government of national unity looks terminally disunited. The current political issues have brought about further disfranchisement among leaders. Such issues include the indigenisation law, ZANU-PF diamond sales, sanctions, constitutional reform process and fear of blood bath, human and trade union rights, and the announcement about wage freeze.

III Trade union situation in Zimbabwe

III.1 Background

When Zimbabwe gained its political independence in 1980 there were six national trade union centres. They all merged into the Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU) in 1981. However, the government-sponsored the formation of the Zimbabwe Federation of Trade Unions (ZFTU) in 1998, substantially with the intention of engineering splinter unions and weaken the ZCTU.

Currently, the ZCTU has a membership base of thirty-four affiliated unions, whose total declared membership stood at 238 998 as at 7 May 2010 (see table 3). There has been a general decline in union membership that started way back in 1998 is attributable largely to economic decline, to deaths resulting from HIV/AIDS and to the emergence of splinter unions spearheaded by ZFTU. This decline in membership is still continuing in recent times as the figures in December 2005 stood at 247,713.

The ZCTU enjoys vibrant structures at national, regional and district levels. It has established six regional offices in Eastern, Western, Northern, Southern, North-Eastern and Central. The supreme organ of the ZCTU is the Congress that meets every five years. Next in line is the General Council composed of a representative from each affiliate union. The General Council has established various Standing Committees including Administration and Finance Committee and the Women Advisory Council made up of elected members.

The secretariat of the ZCTU is composed of the following departments:

- Education and training
- Women and gender
- Legal
- Informal economy
- Organizing
- Information
- Health and safety
- Capacity building
- Accounts
- Advocacy and parliament
- *The Worker* magazine

The ZCTU unions currently only organize workers in the formal sector, although they realized the need to protect workers in the informal sector as well. Trade unions have begun to develop strategies to organize workers in the informal sector.

Table 3: Affiliates of ZCTU in 2010

7 May 2010

Union	Membership
Associated Mineworkers Union of Zimbabwe - AMWUZ	18,000
Cement Lime Workers Union - CLWU	2,541
Civil Services Employees Association – CSEA	5,235
Commercial Workers Union of Zimbabwe - CWUZ	41,000
Communication and Allied Services Union - CASU	1,405
Federation of Food Workers Union of Zimbabwe - FFAWUZ	6,746
General Agriculture & Plantation Workers Union of Zimbabwe - GAPWUZ	15,000
Zimbabwe Leather, Shoe and Allied Workers Union - ZLSAWU	5,619
Motor Vehicle Manufacturers Union – MVMU	387
National Airways Workers Union - NAWU	491
National Engineering Workers Union - NEWU	15,000
National Union of Clothing Industry - NUCI	10,530
Progressive Teachers Union of Zimbabwe	4,016
Zimbabwe Pulp, Paper Manufacturing Workers Union - ZPPMWU	945
Railways Artisan's Workers Union - RAU	787
Railway Association of Enginemen - RAE	-
Transport and General Workers Union - TGWU	3,000
Zimbabwe Education, Scientific, Social and Cultural Workers Union - ZESSCWU	7,145
Zimbabwe Amalgamated Railway men Unions - ZARU	8,600
Zimbabwe Banks and Allied Workers Union - ZIBAWU	4,055
Zimbabwe Catering Hotel Workers Union - ZCHWU	8,700
Zimbabwe Chemicals, Plastics and Allied Workers Union - ZCPAWU	4,818
Zimbabwe Construction and Allied Trade Workers Union - ZCATWU	8,701
Zimbabwe Domestic and Allied Workers Union - ZDAWU	8,700
Zimbabwe Electricity and Energy Workers Union - ZEWU	5,051
Zimbabwe Furniture Timber Allied Workers Union - ZFTAWU	8,247

Zimbabwe Graphic Workers Union - ZGWU	3,045
Zimbabwe Rural District Council Workers Union - ZRDCWU	5,500
Zimbabwe Sugar Milling Union – ZSMU	-
Zimbabwe Textile Workers Union - ZTWU	11,363
Zimbabwe Tobacco, Industrial Workers Union - ZTIWU	6,500
Zimbabwe Union of Journalists - ZUJ	460
Zimbabwe Urban Council Workers Union - ZUCWU	7,382
Zimbabwe Metal & Energy Allied Workers Union - ZMEAWU	8,200
Zimbabwe Security Guards Union ZISEGU	1,469
Total	238,998

Source: Field interviews (May 2010)

III.2 Trade union challenges and strategies

The current strategies for the ZCTU remain largely to have been influenced by the liberalization of labour laws which formed part of the country's overall neoliberal policies of the 1990s under the pretext of the Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs). In effect, the decimating effects of SAPs to the working people and the general populace in Zimbabwe, as indeed in many other African countries, forced the Zimbabwean labour movement to engage in broader policy debates, away from being enterprise-based to the national level.

In a highly focused approach, in 1997 the ZCTU presented its alternative policy proposals in the form of a publication entitled *Beyond ESAP*. Over time, the ZCTU organized national actions and included governance issues in their agenda. Since then the ZCTU has become a driving force championing the course of workers and the communities at the national stage.

In spite of the mass support that ZCTU enjoys, the national centre is confronted by increased challenges including liberalization of labour markets, mass poverty and massive unemployment, a shrinking economy, rival unions and declining membership. There is continued pressure on organized labour from unscrupulous employers who emphasize on individualized contracts and temporary work.

Over the years, the ZCTU and its affiliates have to contend with a highly hostile government using untold repression to silence union activists. Consequently, the ZCTU has identified three principle challenges facing the labour movement in Zimbabwe as follows:

(a) Political challenges

Despite ZCTU's well-known skepticism of coalition governments and despite calling for a Neutral Transitional Authority that would lead to a free and fair election, the labour movement remained hopeful when the Government of National Unity (GNU) was constituted in 2009. One year down the line the GNU is in a comatose. Whilst shops are full of imported goods, schools have opened, some hospitals and clinics are now functioning, but the suffering of the ordinary citizen has not abated. People in the real economy do not have the money to buy food, take their children to schools or go to hospitals. There is no progress to report on

the democratic space, and in fact many more people have been harassed since the emergency of the GNU. Many issues in the Global Political Agreement remain unimplemented and there is no cohesion in the current set-up with one party pulling one way, another in a different direction. There are reports of continued victimization and harassment. There is fear of rising violence as political leaders indicate their desire for a general election in 2011.

The ZCTU is also concerned about the current constitutional making process. What was initially aimed to be a parliament-led process, has now turned out to be driven by the executive. This is not the best way of writing a constitution. ZCTU have called for a people-driven constitution headed by an independent chairperson and have thus been vilified for not taking part in the process..

The ZCTU political demands for 2010 include:

- The crafting of a people-driven Constitution by a Commission chaired by an independent person
- Restoration of civil liberties
- Application of Rule of Law
- Reform of the Labour Act to reflect a democratic dispensation
- Repeal of POSA, AIPPA and the Criminal Codification Act
- Reform of media laws

(b) Economic challenges

After a decade of economic decline and hyperinflation, Zimbabwe's economy grew about 4 percent last year, consumer prices fell about 8 percent, and bank deposits tripled. However, recent analysis, including reports from the International Monetary Fund characterized the outlook for this year as "highly uncertain." Much of this uncertainty is derived from the absence of improved aggregate demand by the local economy. Some of the Ministers (who were once friends of ZCTU) have publicly turned against workers welfare by calling for a freeze in salary increments. Workers in the agriculture sector are earning as low as \$30 per month, while the Poverty Datum Line linked wage is US\$494.

Prior the introduction of multicurrency in 2009, trade unions experienced numerous difficulties. For a start subscriptions deducted from members would be sent by cheque or transferred to union banks much later after deductions were actually effected. This implied trade unions received income which had already lost value due to hyperinflation. This situation highly compromised the service provision to union members.

Even the subsequent introduction of multicurrency did not immediately help unions out of their problems. Most workers received allowances rather than during the first half of the year, yet union due cannot be effected on the basis of non-wage payments. These allowances were ultimately converted to salaries but could still not offer any respite to the unions as the amounts received were very low. Thus, the unions could not immediately remit their subscriptions to ZCTU

Some Ministers have openly interfered with collective bargaining agreements by requesting National Employment Councils to reverse agreements. At the same time Government's insistence on some local ownership of companies has also slowed foreign investment. ZCTU leadership feels let down by former comrades now in Government.

The ZCTU economic demands for 2010 include:

- Poverty Datum Line linked minimum wage
- A stop to privatization
- A reduction in income tax
- That workers freely access ARV's
- Government lifts salary freeze for civil service workers

(c) Trade union rights and the ILO Commission of Inquiry

Zimbabwe has ratified a total of 25 conventions including all eight core conventions and convention number 144 on tripartite consultation.

During the period of programme cooperation review, trade union violations in Zimbabwe deteriorated even further and reached an extremely violent pitch during the period of the elections in 2008. One trade unionist is known to have been assassinated, whilst several were tortured, women activists were sexually assaulted and dozens of unionists were arrested or beaten. The main union leaders have been frequently arrested and threatened. Even as recent as 11 June 2010, there are reports of police banning the ZCTU commemoration of the remembrance of 427 mine workers who died and buried at Kamandama shaft in Hwange in 1972. The police banned the gathering saying they had been given enough notice as required by POSA.

The Public Order and Security Act (POSA) bans any public gathering held without police permission. Although public gatherings held by a registered trade union for bona fide trade union activities are exempted from the act, in practice it is still used to obstruct union activities and harass trade unionists. Under the POSA, people found guilty of disturbing the peace, security or public order, or of invading the rights of other people, are liable to a fine and/or imprisonment for up to ten years.

According to the 2010 Annual Violation of Trade Union Rights published by the International Confederation of Trade Unions (ITUC) there were fewer serious trade union rights violations in 2009 than in previous years, thanks in part to the new Government of National Unity. However, many trade unionists belonging to the ZCTU still faced harassment at the hands of the police, ZANU-PF youths and the Central Intelligence Organisation.

For many years, the Zimbabwe government repeatedly refused to cooperate with the ILO and for two years running refused to appear before the Committee on the Application of Standards at the International Labour Conference. As a result, in November 2008, the ILO Governing Body decided to apply one of its toughest measures. The ILO set up a Commission of Inquiry to examine complaints concerning the non-observance by Zimbabwe of the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87) and the Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98). The Commission of Inquiry began its work in February 2009.

The ILO Commission of Inquiry found evidence of violations that bordered on curtailment of the right to strike and demonstrate arrests, detentions, torture, assaults, intimidation and harassment of trade unionists, interference in trade union affairs, trade union discrimination, and collective bargaining.

The report of the Commission of Inquiry on Zimbabwe contained the following recommendations:

- The relevant legislative texts, and most particularly the Labour Act, the Public Service Act and the Public Order and Security Act, be brought into line with Conventions Nos 87 and 98;
- All anti-union practices – arrests, detentions, violence, torture, intimidation and harassment, interference and anti-union discrimination – cease with immediate effect and steps be taken by the authorities to ensure that there is no repetition of such acts in the future. It further recommended that steps be taken to bring all outstanding and pending court cases against trade unionists to an end.
- Trade unionists participate in a national process of truth and reconciliation and that the Zimbabwe Human Rights Commission and the Organ for National Healing and Reconciliation could play an important role in this regard;
- Training, education and support be given to key institutions and personnel in the country, most notably the police, security forces and the social partners, in relation to freedom of association and collective bargaining, civil liberties and human rights;
- Government take steps to reinforce the rule of law and the role of the Courts in Zimbabwe by ensuring that the Courts are respected and properly resourced in material and human terms, and that training, education and support in relation to freedom of association and collective bargaining, civil liberties and human rights are provided to members of the judiciary and court staff at all levels of the court hierarchy;
- The Government strengthens and supports social dialogue in recognition of the role that social dialogue plays in the maintenance of democracy; and
- The Government takes advantage of technical assistance by the International Labour Office in relation to the implementation of these recommendations.

In April 2010, the government informed the ILO that it accepted the recommendations and welcomed the guidance and support of the ILO in their implementation. In his reply, the Director-General indicated that he had instructed the Office to provide assistance to support implementation of the recommendations.

It should be recalled that in 2009, the ILO provided support to assist achievement of the Government's 100-day plan through four activities:

- High level retreat on social dialogue: a working paper on best practices for social dialogue institutions formed part of discussions concerning the reform of the Zimbabwean Tripartite Negotiating Forum.
- High level tripartite study visit to NEDLAC.
- Presentation of draft employment policy to Government and social partners: Zimbabwe was expected to soon be in the position to ratify ILO Convention No. 122.
- Tripartite workshop on the harmonization of labour and public service law: a discussion paper on freedom of association rights for public servants formed the basis of the discussion on harmonization.

The labour movement is watching to see how the government will respond and implement the recommendations.

IV Findings of the evaluation

IV.1 Introduction

The aim of this chapter is to discuss the main findings derived from the fieldwork during the course of the evaluation. The findings are organized into nine categories as specified in the Terms of Reference for the evaluation. In addition to these categories this section also contains an overall analysis of the strengths and weakness of the programme cooperation.

IV.2 Relevance of support

In assessing the relevance of support, this evaluation was concerned with the validity of the objectives and the usefulness of the results of the programme cooperation and its success in fulfilling the objectives specified at the beginning of the period. The relevance of the project was assessed by addressing two basic questions:

- Has the project targeted the needs of the organisation and its affiliates?
- If the project has been changed during its implementation, has it been modified in accordance with any changing needs of the partner?

The evaluators found out that the programme cooperation has indeed strengthened the capacity of ZCTU to implement its core mandate. It was clear that the programme cooperation has actually become the bedrock of in sustaining the trade union movement in Zimbabwe, especially during the seemingly endless political and economic instability.

The evaluation can list the following programme outcomes as evidence of relevance of support:

- Involvement of women in ZCTU structures
- Informed membership
- Training of shop stewards, rank and file
- Involvement of all unions
- Development of core cadre of co-ordinators
- Union recognition by employers

It is also worth noting that there were challenges associated with the programme cooperation. In the first instance, the existence of two major political parties created some differences in opinion on various matters amongst the ZCTU leadership. Whilst it was generally understood that the majority of ZCTU membership were in support of the MDC policies, there were few leaders who had links with ZANU-PF. This difference of opinion certainly created some problems within the labour movement and affected the extent of the relevance of the ZCTU/LO- Norway cooperation. Several union leaders used the public media to distort the intended outcomes of the cooperation and the policies of the ZCTU. Notwithstanding such counterproductive developments, many of the workers remained united and focused and supported the objectives of the national centre.

On overall, the evaluation concludes that that the programme collaboration is relevant to the needs and priorities of ZCTU.

IV.3: Efficiency in implementation

To determine the efficiency of the programme cooperation the evaluation was interested to determine whether or not the use of allocated resources was justifiable in the context to the results obtained. In this case, the efficiency in programme implementation was determined by the following questions, as stated in the Terms of Reference:

- How efficient has the organisation been in the implementation of the project i.e. has the work been carried out, and the financial and human resources been used in an appropriate and cost-efficient manner?
- Are there in place functioning internal controls/systems for effective programme management and administration in general to foster accountability and transparency?

The evaluation established that the programme cooperation was largely efficient in implementation and that the results have justified the costs incurred and resources utilised.

The evidence adduced to support the efficiency in implementation can be listed as follows:

- In spite of the increased political onslaught and harsh economic realities, the ZCTU was able to service the needs of its affiliated unions. The ZCTU provided various support systems to affiliated union in the form of accommodation arrangements (either through payment of rents or providing office space), assisting in membership recruitment or retaining current levels, and providing education and training. More attention was given to specific unions who had expressed more distressful concerns;
- ZCTU has maintained effective structures at regional and district levels;
- ZCTU has established and maintained effective and working internal and organizational systems through the Secretariat and the Finance and Administrative Committee of the General Council that has enabled checks and balances for appropriate reporting;
- Maintained strong links with all affiliates as evidenced by the successful organization of campaigns and demonstrations over the years on various labour issues;
- Maintained excellent links with the informal economy, especially through the affiliation of the Zimbabwe Chamber of Informal Economy Associations (ZCIEA);
- Disseminated appropriate information to its regional and district structures, affiliates and general public through publication of *The Worker* newspaper, bulletins, press statements, adverts and interviews.

IV.4: Results of the programme cooperation

In determining the results of the programme cooperation the evaluators were interested at reviewing the progress and results of the co-operation projects, and to see what has been achieved during the period under consideration. In this regard, the evaluation assessed the performance and progress of the co-operation based on the following questions.

- Have the objectives been met, and all the expected results of the project realised by the end of 2009? If not, - why?

- Have the objectives been unclear and/or unrealistic or is it due to other internal and/or external factors?
- Have recommendations of auditors, LO-Norway and internal reviews been followed up in an appropriate manner?

(a) Results on trade union membership

At the beginning of the programme cooperation, one of the prominent immediate objectives of the ZCTU was to increase membership by at least 10% annually from the 2005 figure through the affiliated unions. At the same time, the medium-term objective was to maintain at least 50% unionization in the country.

In trying to corroborate the membership figures received from the national centre, with those of the affiliates, the evaluators realized various inconsistencies in membership data. In fact, whilst the ZCTU claimed to be maintaining an up-to-date database of union membership, many of the affiliates interviewed were not able to establish reliable sources of their membership. The implication here is that much of the data on membership maintained at ZCTU may not match the real information at the affiliate level.

Notwithstanding the challenges of membership figures, the evaluators were informed that as at December 2005, ZCTU had a total membership of 247,713. The corresponding membership figures for 2008 were given as 300,000 members. However, information availed during the field interviews it showed that as at 7 May 2010, the ZCTU has a total membership of 238 998 members. Thus, the short-term objective of at least 10% annually from the 2005 figure was not met.

In the same vein, the medium-term objective of at least 50% unionization seem a very long way off, as the current unionization is only 6.2% of labour force. But, on further reflection, the evaluators noted that the current membership figures are actually impressive as they represent 62.0% of those in formal employment in the country.

(b) Results on income from subscriptions

One other prominent immediate objective of the ZCTU at the commencement of the current phase of programme cooperation was to raise income from subscriptions by at least 150% over the 2005 level. As one would expect, due to the adverse social, economic, political and trade union situation in the country, most of the ZCTU unions could not adequately and immediately subscribe to the national centre. According to documents availed to the evaluation team, union subscriptions to the ZCTU in 2009 amounted to only USD 33,045, which is about 22% of the target.

It was expected that due to the economic turnaround in 2009 and 2010 there would be some improvement in the payment of union dues. Unfortunately, this does not seem to be the case as data availed during the evaluation showed further declines on union receipts at ZCTU. For instance, it was reported that affiliates contribution declined from USD 9,170 in January 2010 to USD 2,685 in March 2010. The union dues received in April amounted to only USD 390, while at the time of the evaluation (as at 7 May 2010) only USD 100 had been collected by ZCTU.

(c) Results on financial management and internal reviews

The evaluation revealed both positive and negative results associated with financial management and internal practices. At the outset, it should be mentioned that the weight of positive attributes far outweigh the negative sentiments. In brief, the positive elements include:

- Commendable overall financial management of the programme cooperation;
- Maintenance of effective and up-to-date financial rules and regulations;
- Experienced financial administrator; and
- ZCTU is a viable going concern for the next 12 months as determined by the asset portfolio.

The negative attributes that would need to be addressed can be listed as follows:

- ZCTU has not responded with the shift of the financial situation (old habits still evident despite the challenging times)
- High staff costs, at the risk of no activities being undertaken
- The culture of respecting budgets is diminishing: e.g inter-fund borrowing has assumed a new dimension, and without consulting donors
- Long delays in submitting audited reports
- Numerous variances mentioned in management report
- Management responses to auditors report not exhaustive or convincing
- Inability to effect statutory deductions (currently amounting to USD 240,000, plus penalties and interest payment)
- High staff turnover, especially experienced book keepers
- Limited advance planning arrangements to replace book keepers going on maternity leave-creates accounting and management risks

(d) Other results associated with the programme cooperation

Through the programme cooperation the ZCTU has better articulated its mandate of defending and promoting workers issues of attaining decent work and social dialogue in the country. The signing of the Kadoma Declaration on “Towards A Shared National Economic and Social Vision” is yet another tripartite engagement aimed at improving the plight of Zimbabwean workers and the general public.

Some of the other recorded results identified by the evaluators include:

- The establishment of structures for young workers at ZCTU, regional and affiliate levels aimed at improving the involvement and participation by young women and men in trade unions. Through the programme cooperation ZCTU has offered appropriate training to these structures in order to empower them. The Informal Economy Desk at ZCTU has provided a very important link with informal workers through their structures. This collaboration has enabled ZCTU to remain relevant to the workers and the communities in Zimbabwe, thus improve its public appeal;
- ZCTU continued to disseminate appropriate information to its structures, affiliates and general public through publication of *The Worker* newspaper, weekly bulletins, press statements, adverts and at times private radio interviews;
- Assisted eleven affiliate unions to develop sectoral HIV/AIDS policies, some of which have been adopted by their respective National Employment Councils. In addition, the training on HIV/AIDS at workplaces (involving shop stewards as the

entry point) has resulted in some companies developing HIV/AIDS policies at Works Councils level, thus contributing to the creation of a favourable environment for the infected and affected;

- Facilitated the amalgamation of four unions into the Zimbabwe Metal Energy and Allied Trade Union. However, the evaluation noted that there are some operational difficulties associated with the mergers and amalgamations processes;
- Training of workers' committees at the workplace levels: in grievance handling, collective bargaining and labour laws;
- Civic education training for all ZCTU structures and affiliates leadership; and
- Skills training such as paralegal training and HIV/AIDS for educators and organizers.

IV.5: ZCTU sustainability

In determining the sustainability of the ZCTU, the evaluation team considered the durability of the national centre, its effects and impact after the withdrawal of the programme cooperation and more general with the absence of external funds. The assessment of the sustainability of the programme cooperation was undertaken by addressing the questions below:

- Is ZCTU able to continue the project activities when LO-Norway support ends?
- Has the capacity of the organisation been permanently improved? If so, what are the indicators of this?

In response to these questions, the opinion of the evaluation team is that ZCTU is not sustainable after the withdrawal of donor support. Whilst the capacity of the national centre has been improved through education and training of the rank and file, the labour movement in Zimbabwe is unlikely to stand on its own without international solidarity. The factors that indicate weak sustainability tendencies include the following:

- Union subscription received by the national centre account for only 7.8% of total income in 2009, while many affiliates continue to struggle to survive and are would be unable to meet their obligations for some time to come;
- Whilst ZCTU budgeted to receive USD 150,000 from union subscription in 2009, only USD 33,045.48 (22% of the budget) was realized from local sources;
- Because of the expectation that the general economic conditions in Zimbabwe would improve in the next few year, there is a likelihood that much of the foreign funding to the national centre would dry up. There are already indications that some of the cooperation partners are considering reducing their level of support. The evaluation teams estimated that the ZCTU General Fund could reduce from USD 414,331 in 2009 to about USD 250,000 in 2010;
- Interviews with most of the ZCTU affiliated unions showed that the concern on sustainability was not a major priority. There was a feeling that international solidarity will always be available. The interviews did not identify any aggressive efforts towards improving internal budgeting processes amongst unions;
- Due to the ongoing unstable political and economic situation, the challenges facing ZCTU and its affiliated unions are likely to continue for much longer.

IV.6: External impact

The Terms of Reference posed two questions with respect to determining the external support of the ZCTU:

- Has ZCTU been able to make a positive impact for the benefit of its members and society in its engagement with government, employers and other relevant national organisations as a result of the project?
- Are there indicators of improved trade union rights, better labour legislation, etc, that may be directly or indirectly linked to the project?

The evaluation has established that the ZCTU is an institution with a national and international outlook. The national centre has been the cornerstone of the strength of the labour movement in Zimbabwe. On the whole, many of the external collaborators interviewed during the evaluation expressed strong support to the role played by ZCTU in its interventions in human and trade union sphere. On the political environment, the positive role played by the ZCTU leadership in all facets of life in Zimbabwe is beyond reproach. Similarly, on the labour market environment the quality of ZCTU interventions on topical issues such as labour law reforms, HIV/AIDS, tripartism and social dialogue, unemployment and underemployment, informal economy, and privatisation have been admirable.

The evidence of the high visibility of ZCTU to external factors includes the following:

- ZCTU (and its international partners) was instrumental to the setting up of the special ILO Commission of Inquiry. The Commission findings have vindicated ZCTU and accused the Government of violations of human rights.
- All National and International labour-linked events were commemorated, despite the political and economic situation.
- Collaborate with civic organizations to enhance labour interests through massive civic education centered on the current constitution making process and the Global Political Agreement.
- Open participation of trade union leaders in political parties has created some differences in opinion on various matters.

IV.7: Gender issues

Although the ZCTU does not have a gender policy its position is that labour should not be divided or discriminated on the basis of gender. The ZCTU calls for equal opportunities for employment, promotion and advancement of workers without discrimination. It also encouraged its affiliates to ensure effective participation of the working women in trade union activities, leadership, management, mobilization, lobby and all issues that relate to trade union work.

To determine the practice of these principles within the context of the programme under consideration, the evaluation team considered the following three questions:

- Has gender been mainstreamed in the project?

- Are the numbers of male and female beneficiaries equal?
- Has the project improved the women situation?

The evaluation established that the ZCTU is truly committed to consistently advocate for equality between men and women and has indeed press for legal protection of women's rights and protect them from sexual harassment. The innovation service of distributing sanitary pads to women workers at the workplace received many accolades, especially among those interviewed at the ZCTU regional structures.

It was difficult to clearly establish the level of women participation in trade union activities as estimates of total membership are far from precise. Data that might demonstrate the extent of ZCTU's diversity and inclusiveness of gender issues in trade unions and at leadership levels are therefore not easy to analyze. However, anecdotal evidence shows that women constitute about 21 percent of total membership. Some of the sectors that exhibit a balanced ratio of men to women members include the Civil Services Employees Association with 49 percent women; Zimbabwe Domestic and Allied Workers Union with 55 percent women; and Zimbabwe Education Scientific Workers Union with 46 percent women. In the same vein, there are sectors with no female members, such as in the Railways Association of Enginemen and in the Motor Vehicle Manufacturers Workers Union.

During the period under consideration, the ZCTU achieved the following positive attributes in relation to gender mainstreaming:

- The Women's Advisory Council (WAC) was able to hold regular sessions, thus encouraging women participation in union activities;
- Re-establishment of Women Desk at the ZCTU secretariat in order to pay special attention to issues that affect women workers at workplaces and ensure they participate and integrate in trade union structures;
- ZCTU encouraged the establishment of Gender Desks in affiliate unions;
- There were notable achievements in relation to gender issues:
 - Members of WAC now have delegate status at Congress,
 - Identification of many women trained under the auspices of the ZCTU/LO-Norway programme cooperation are now in senior leadership, both at the unions and government levels,
 - Gender perspective teams at affiliates.

In spite of the progress made on gender issues, the evaluation also established that many challenges still exist. These challenges include:

- Lack of budgetary allocations for Gender Desk at the ZCTU and its affiliates, in spite of the written mutual agreement that ZCTU should apportion at least 10 % of the funds from LO-Norway to women's programmes;
- Absence of a gender policy at ZCTU;
- Cultural constraints on women issues still persist in the larger society; and
- Gender mainstreaming is still not evident in most of the ZCTU affiliates interviewed.

IV.8: Internal democracy

One of the factors known to contribute to the weakening of the trade union movement is the lack of internal democracy. In searching for an answer to this issue the Terms of Reference posed the following question:

- Are there systems in place to promote and guarantee internal democracy within the organization and among its affiliates?

To a large extent the leadership of ZCTU have been faithful towards maintaining the principles of internal democracy. Elections of senior ZCTU leadership have routinely taken place every five years since 1990. ZCTU held its Sixth congress on 19 -20 May 2006. This implies that the current leadership has been democratically elected and given a fresh mandate by their membership. The same cannot be said of all affiliated unions, but the 2006 Congress has set the ball rolling as 20 affiliates have also held their congresses.

The ZCTU has also managed to hold all its constitutional Executive Committee and General Council meetings. The same applies with Women's Advisory Council (WAC). Field visits to some of the regions also indicated that elections of ZCTU Regional Councils also take place on a regular basis. The democratic tenets also seem to permeate to lower structures of the unions as evidenced by the survival of Works Councils and Worker Committees enterprise levels.

It is also important that the practice of democracy means that there will be some disgruntled elements in the process. The team of evaluators came across some ZCTU affiliates (calling themselves "concerned affiliates") who openly expressed some discomfort with the current leadership. Among the issues in contention include violation of ZCTU Constitution at the 2006 Congress, interference by ZCTU leadership at union level, and ZCTU role in partisan politics.

IV.9: Risks analysis

The last finding considered by the evaluation is to answer the following question:

To what extent have political tensions and the unstable economic climate impacted on trade union operations and functions, and ultimately programme implementation?

The challenges stipulated in the Chapter Two have far reaching effects to the operations of the programme cooperation. The following issues have negative influence to the intended outcomes:

- The project period under review coincided with ZANU-PF Government onslaught on opposition members and trade unionists. It was unsafe to carry out trade union work.
- The same period witnessed massive retrenchments due to company closures thereby depleting further our membership.
- The hyperinflation witnesses during the period negatively affected planning and implementation of many programmes.

- The political situation prevailing inhibited participation by some members who feared for their lives as it was perceived to be dangerous to be identified with the ZCTU.
- The existence of two major political parties created some difference in opinion on various matters. Although it was common cause that the majority of ZCTU membership were in support of the MDC policies, the few leaders who had links with ZANU-PF created some problems within the labour movement.

To complement the findings on risk analysis the evaluation team also undertook a strengths and weaknesses analysis as summarized in Table 4 below.

Table 4: Strengths and weaknesses of the ZCTU and its affiliates

Strengths:

- Ability to challenge government
- Massive moral support from civil society, workers and the community
- Participation in tripartite forums
- International solidarity
- Committed cooperating partners
- Service to membership (training, education, paralegal support, organizing)
- Ownership of assets: in Harare and regional offices
- Visibility and responsiveness of leadership
- Trained, committed and experienced staff
- Impressive public image, especially among civil societies and collaborating partners
- *The Worker* newspaper

Weaknesses:

- Low level of membership
- Highly donor dependent
- Inability to prepare own financial statements
- Visible factions amongst unions
- Merge process not making much headway

V Summary and Conclusions

This evaluation has noted overall positive outcomes on the ZCTU/LO-Norway co-operation in general. Through the LO-Norway support, ZCTU has remained highly relevant in the context of a very challenging external environment. Through the support, the ZCTU has managed to educate, train and build a discernible cadre of trained women and men. In the words of the leadership:

“The ZCTU owes its continued existence to the LO-Norway whose assistance through the project sustained the Centre administratively and through capacity building. The flexibility offered allowed the ZCTU to respond to the immediate situations in a timely manner and retain some staff members who would have otherwise left for greener pastures.”

The other major highlights of this cooperation include enabling the national centre to effectively participate in national debates, influence the establishment of the ILO Commission of Inquiry, and maintain the trust and confidence of many national and international partners. For many years, the LO-Norway was the only visible and consistent partner supporting ZCTU. This support has enabled the ZCTU to play an admirable role in the continuing democratisation of the country while at the same time upholding and defending workers' rights. In a nutshell, the co-operation has been relevant, efficient and effective.

Nonetheless, the co-operation faced notable bottlenecks. Of paramount negative significance is the ongoing quagmire in the social, political, economic and trade union spheres. There have been poor project results especially in relation to increase in membership, payment of subscription dues by affiliates, and the merger and amalgamation processes. The increasing agitation among so-called “concerned affiliates” has also caused some level of internal disharmony amongst some affiliates. At the same, sustainability of the ZCTU is not guaranteed in the absence of the programme co-operation, and such issues are not yet receiving high levels of consideration within the collaborating partners.

VI: Recommendations

VI.1 Overall recommendation

On the basis of the analysis and concluding remarks in the preceding chapters, the evaluation team recommends for a more sustainable continuation of the co-operation between LO-Norway and ZCTU. The continuing challenging environment and the possibility of reduced financial contribution from other partners may well call for LO-Norway's increased support to the trade union movement in Zimbabwe. In this regard, it is further recommended that this continuation must be in accordance with clear and specific indicators of achievement that are subject to internal periodic monitoring and evaluation.

It is the informed opinion of the evaluation team that specific steps could be undertaken to further enhance the next phases of the programme cooperation. The specific recommendations for effective co-operation include:

- Baseline survey and database on union membership,
- Update of the ZCTU Constitution,
- Enhance the role of gender mainstreaming in trade union work,
- Young workers holding the key of the future of the trade union movement,
- Enhance trade union solidarity amongst affiliates and increase viability of unions through mergers and amalgamations,
- Focus on sustainability aspects,
- Information networks within unions,
- Project and financial management including enhanced relations with the external auditors, and
- ZCTU/ LO-Norway relations.

VI.2 Specific recommendations for effective co-operation

(a) Baseline survey and database on union membership:

The evaluation exercise has identified that ZCTU and its affiliates do not have reliable database on membership. At the same time, the estimates of total membership are far from precise. It is therefore recommended that the ZCTU undertakes a baseline survey of union membership and services to members, and maintain an up-to-date database of members.

This recommendation is made on the understanding that statistical or baseline surveys are important tools used to collect quantitative information about items in a given population. As such, the baseline survey on union membership will help ZCTU and its affiliates to focus on opinions and factual information prevailing to both members and other working people in Zimbabwe. The baseline survey should be undertaken to ensure that truly democratic organizations, such as the ZCTU, will only thrive in its objectives if its operations are based on the assessment of the views, opinions and preferences of their existing and potential members. The overall outcome of the baseline survey will be to develop powerful and effective labour policies and strategies, through analyzing the key challenges confronting the labour movement and how they are perceived by its own membership as well as by other

relevant parties. The baseline survey will form the basis of the membership database, but will also allow for a better picture of developments in the areas of union membership, so that ZCTU and its affiliated national unions can be more effective and provide a better service to its members.

(b) Update of the ZCTU Constitution

The evaluation team had a quick review of the current Constitution of the ZCTU and noted that it is indeed highly progressive. The only missing links that could be considered for update include the following:

- Role of young workers and its associate structures at Congress level
- Improve internal governance by incorporating some of the good practices into the Constitution (e.g., timing of audit reports, project management committee, leadership remuneration and allowances)
- Role of regional and/or district structures in Congress
- Now that the Women's Advisory Committee is enshrined in the Constitution and has full delegate status, the word "Advisory" should be dropped.

(c) Enhance the role of gender mainstreaming in all trade union activities

The ZCTU and its affiliates have made good progress on gender issues, but the evaluation still identified many challenges, the lack of budgetary allocations for Gender Desk at the ZCTU and its affiliates, absence of a gender policy at ZCTU, and gender mainstreaming is still not evident in most of the ZCTU affiliates.

On the realization that labour force has become more evenly balanced between men and women, the evaluation recommends that all organizing campaigns must put in place a policy on promotion of gender equality and ensure that this is achieved through education to both men and women, through appointment to positions of leadership and strive for 50% female representation in every activity.

The current levels of women organizing are still very low: make up only one fifth of the trade union membership and still embarrassingly low in union leadership. Sincere and sustained political and economic commitments are needed in order to overcome the outdated conservative cultural attitudes towards women if any progress in trade union organizing is to be realized. It is high time that the ZCTU crafts a comprehensive policy on gender mainstreaming, to be followed with a deliberate allocation of budget to gender issues.

(d) Young workers and the future of the trade union movement

The future of trade unions in Africa and in particular, their effectiveness in promoting and defending workers interests depends on how the young people are involved, in their activities. It is therefore imperative that the ZCTU and its affiliated unions strengthen their capacities, in organizing and recruiting young workers to join trade unions, providing proper and adequate services and encourage young workers to participate in trade union work at every level.

(e) Establish a task force to enhance trade union solidarity amongst affiliates

The evaluation established that there is a group of disgruntled affiliates who openly expressed some discomfort with the current leadership. Among the issues in contention include violation of ZCTU Constitution at the 2006 Congress, interference by ZCTU leadership at union level, and ZCTU role in partisan politics.

It is strongly recommended that ZCTU establishes a General Council task force to effectively address some of the other factors known to contribute to the weakening of the trade union movement: these include the proliferation of trade unions that leads to problems of cooperation, financing and viability; poor organizational structures; lack of internal democracy; commercialization of trade unionism by some people who encourage splinter unions; multiplicity of political parties that encourage proliferation of trade union centres on ideological grounds; some governments fear strong trade unions and therefore encourage splinter groups; and actions by international trade union bodies aimed at creating splits within national trade union centres with the aim of obtaining membership.

This task force should also be responsible to realize the mergers and amalgamations of unions that have largely remained ineffective. The task force should undertake a detailed analysis on the current impasse with regard to mergers and amalgamations to respond to the following concerns:

- What sort of shape do these new mechanisms find the trade union movement in?
- What do trade unions want to achieve in the coming years, and how can unions work together to make that happen?
- What will be the mission and vision of the new dispensation?
- How will this mechanism affect the existing local, sectoral, national, sub-regional and regional trade union structures?

(f) Focus on sustainability aspects and income-generating possibilities

One of the findings of this evaluation team is that ZCTU is not sustainable after the withdrawal of donor support. It is thus prudent for the ZCTU to consider all means possible to balance its budgetary needs. This calls for critical examination of not only its sources of income, but also the expenditure patterns.

For a start, it is recommended that the ZCTU carefully examines its wage bill, through a staff audit. It was apparent that much of the ZCTU budget is actually spent on staff wages, more than on activities. At the end of the day, this means that much of the current staff is rather idle and do not contribute to the desirable operations of the organization. It is, therefore, necessary to balance staff salaries with the ability to undertake trade union activities.

It is also important for ZCTU to get itself to the identification of other sources of income including looking for innovative strategies for sustainability. For trade unions to play a more meaningful role in the area of job creation, poverty alleviation, and achieve internal financial sustainability they should aim at becoming major economic actors themselves. For instance trade unions in South Africa and Ghana are turning to devising financial strategies, through the innovative establishment of labour-based enterprises, to supplement their collective bargaining strengths.

(g) Other recommendations

- **Information networks within unions:** most ZCTU affiliates lack the necessary capacity to package and disseminate information about their organizations, for the primary benefit of their members. As such, they depend solely on the efforts of the national centre, and especially, through *The Worker* magazine and the weekly bulletins. It is thus recommended that the national unions also find mechanisms of establishing their own in-house information networks that would directly serve their respective members and sectors of operation.
- **Project and financial management:** Given the size of LO-Norway support to ZCTU and the importance associated with this programme cooperation, it is desirable for ZCTU that establishes a Project Steering Committee that will be charged with the responsibility of nurturing and promoting a sound relationship with the collaborating partner.
- **Enhanced relations with the external auditors:** The ZCTU leadership should establish a top-level line of communication with the external auditors for purposes of effective communication and timely preparation of accounting documents
- **ZCTU/LO-Norway relations:** The LO-Norway support to the trade union in Zimbabwe is indeed magnanimous. LO-Norway has timeously transferred funds throughout the project period. In addition, LO-Norway provides professional advice and adds value to the capacity of union leadership through the award of scholarships in specialized fields at universities. Furthermore, during the onslaught of the ZCTU, LO-Norway and other international trade unions exposed the abuse of trade union rights in Zimbabwe. On further reflections, it appears that the LO-Norway has treated the labour movement in Zimbabwe with deep empathy. This may have contributed to a sense of laxity towards achieving some of the stated objectives of the programme cooperation. It is thus recommended that the LO-Norway should treat the ZCTU in the same manner as other cooperating partners in other parts of the continent.

Appendix 1:
TERMS OF REFERENCE
FOR
EVALUATION OF LO' PROGRAMME CO-OPERATION WITH ZCTU IN
ZIMBABWE

Background

The Norwegian Confederation of Trade Unions (LO-Norway) has since 1997 supported the Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU) work to strengthen the trade union movement in general and the capacity of the ZCTU.

Through negotiations, organising, education and training the ZCTU and its affiliated unions should be able to develop strategies on how to improve labour rights through negotiating collective agreements to benefit its members as well as strengthening capacity of the trade union movement.

The programme has mainly involved the ZCTUs central organisation. Target group has been elected national and local leaders of ZCTU and the affiliated national unions.

LO Norway would like to evaluate the programme co-operation in the beginning of the year 2010, in order to assess the performance and progress, and to gauge if results or objectives are being met. It is further required to evaluate the programme in order to form a basis for decisions in LO-Norway regarding possible finalising or continuation of the project. The evaluation will cover the period 2006-2009.

The co-operation and dialogue between LO-Norway and its partner in Zimbabwe is built on mutual respect for the organisations' right to develop their own policies, accountability and full transparency.

The agreement for the period 2006-2009 between ZCTU and LO-Norway outlines further objectives, expected results and indicators as reference for the evaluation.

Objective of evaluation

- To assess results of the support provided to ZCTU by LO to strengthen capacity of the organisation
- To assess modalities of cooperation with ZCTU and provide recommendations on areas for improvement, in particular related to monitoring and reporting on performance by ZCTU

Scope of work:

The evaluation should include, but not necessarily be limited to, an assessment of the following issues;

1. Has LO's support been relevant i.e. has the project targeted the needs of the organisation and its affiliates, and if the project has been changed during its implementation, has it been modified in accordance with any changing needs of the partner?
2. The efficiency in implementation of the project. The principal parties involved in the project are LO-Norway, ZCTU and its affiliates. How efficient has the organisation been in the implementation of the project i.e. has the work been carried out, and the financial and human resources been used in an appropriate and cost-efficient manner? Are there in place functioning internal controls/systems for effective programme management and administration in general to foster accountability and transparency?
3. What are the results of the project so far? Is it likely that the objectives will be met, and that all the expected results of the project were realized by the end of 2009? If not, - why? Have the objectives been unclear and/or unrealistic or is it due to other internal and/or external factors? Have recommendations of auditors, LO-Norway and internal reviews been followed up in an appropriate manner?
4. Sustainability. Is ZCTU able to continue the project activities when LO-Norway support ends? Has the capacity of the organisation been permanently improved? If so, what are the indicators of this?
5. External impact. Has ZCTU been able to make a positive impact for the benefit of its members and society in its engagement with government, employers and other relevant national organisations as a result of the project? Are there indicators of improved trade union rights, better labour legislation, etc, that may be directly or indirectly linked to the project?
6. Gender issues. LO-Norway has a gender mainstreaming policy, meaning that all its activities and projects must give consideration to a gender perspective. There should be a specific analysis of the gender dimension in the project. Has gender been mainstreamed in the project? Are the numbers of male and female beneficiaries equal? Has the project improved the women situation?
7. Internal Democracy: Internal democracy is a vital tenet in a trade union structure. Are there systems in place to promote and guarantee internal democracy within the organisation and among its affiliates?
8. Risk analysis: The political and trade union environment in the country during the last four years has been somewhat difficult. To what extent have political tensions and the unstable economic climate impacted on trade union operations/functions, and ultimately programme implementation?
9. Other findings. In addition to the above the evaluation team may include what they consider relevant.

The Consultants should review any strengths or weaknesses of the programme and their partner, and if appropriate make recommendations for a possible continuation or termination of the programme.

The evaluation report should include requirements of a situation analysis of the conditions for the trade union movement.

Implementation

Two external consultants will be contracted to do the evaluation of the ZCTU Organisational Development Programme. The evaluation will take place in May 2010. The cost of the evaluation will be covered under the LO-Norway's global evaluation project 2010NDWLONMN.

An evaluation mission will undertake a field visit to Zimbabwe, visiting the ZCTU Headquarters as well as its affiliates and other organisations relevant to labour. Interviews with elected leaders, staff of ZCTU, some of the national unions and seminar participants will be of great importance. If necessary, further information should be sought through written material and interviews with shop stewards and rank and file members. Relevant research institutions, employers' organisations, government authorities/departments, the ILO Harare Office and resident cooperating partners are also considered important to this exercise. The evaluation team may also interview the programme Auditor and any other individuals/institutions they may find relevant to their assignment.

The evaluation report should be limited to approximately 20 pages in addition to an executive summary.

In total 20 working days are calculated for this consultancy. This includes a visit to Zimbabwe, review of documentation as well as preparations and reporting to LO. The Consultants should complete a draft report in English to LO by the 1 June 2010. Based on comments to the draft report the Consultants will submit a final report within three weeks after the comments has been received.

Oslo, 5th March 2010

LO Norway – International Department

Nina Mjøberg

Head of Division for International Trade Union Solidarity

Appendix 2: Persons met and interviewed

Monday, 3 May 2010

Employers' Confederation of Zimbabwe:

John W. Mufukare Executive Director, EMCOZ

Elected leaders of ZCTU:

Lovemore Matombo President, ZCTU
Wellington Chibebe Secretary General, ZCTU
George Nkiwane Second Vice President, ZCTU
Japhet Moyo First Deputy Secretary General, ZCTU
Last Tarabuku Project Coordinator-Capacity Building, ZCTU

Women's Advisory Council, ZCTU:

Shillet Gutu Chairperson, WAC-ZCTU
Sithokozile Siwela Secretary, WAC-ZCTU
Fiona Magaya Women and Gender Coordinator, ZCTU

American Center for International Labour Solidarity (Solidarity Center):

Fisseha Tekie Country Representative, American Center for International Labour Solidarity
Ashbel Musaringo Programme Officer, American Center for International Labour Solidarity

Tuesday, 4 May 2010

ZCTU Administration and Finance Committee:

George Nkiwane Second Vice President, ZCTU
Wellington Chibebe Secretary General, ZCTU
Japhet Moyo First Deputy Secretary General, ZCTU
Shillet Gutu Chairperson, WAC-ZCTU
Emson Sibanda General Secretary, Zimbabwe Tobacco Industrial Workers Union
James Gumbe General Secretary, ROCWU
Francis Peter Gombweza President, Zimbabwe Chemicals, Plastics & Allied Workers Union
Blessings Mujuru President, Zimbabwe Banks & Allied Workers Union
Ephanus Makiwa President, Zimbabwe Urban Councils Workers Union
Galileo Chirebvu ZCTU Financial Administrator

Zimbabwe Zimbabwe Metal and Energy Allied Workers Union (ZMEAWU):

Stephen Dhliwayo General Secretary, ZMEAWU

Wednesday, 5 May 2010

Separate meetings with ZCTU heads of departments:

Nathan Banda Safety Officer-Health and Social Welfare Department, ZCTU

Elijah Mutemeri Coordinator-Informal Economy Department, ZCTU

Ben Madzimure Editor, *The Worker* Newspaper, ZCTU

Miriam Assumpta Head-Education and Training Department, ZCTU

Chikamba

Galileo Chirebvu ZCTU Financial Administrator

Ministry of Labour and Social Services

Honourable Paurina Minister of Labour and Social Services
Mpariwa, MP

Paul Z. Dzviti Director-Labour Administration, Ministry of Labour and
Social Services

C. Z. Vusani Deputy Director-Registration of Labour Administration,
Ministry of Labour and Social Services

Zimbabwe Chamber of Informal Economy Associations:

Wisborn Malaya General Secretary, Zimbabwe Chamber of Informal Economy
Associations

Elijah Mutemeri Coordinator-Informal Economy Department, ZCTU

Ben M. Moyo Territorial President-Chitungwiza and Information and
Publicity Officer, Zimbabwe Chamber of Informal Economy
Associations

Egnesi Mumba Territorial President-Chinhoyi, Zimbabwe Chamber of
Informal Economy Associations

Charity Mandishona Territorial President-Harare, Zimbabwe Chamber of Informal
Economy Associations

Thursday, 6 May 2010

International Labour Office-Country Office Harare:

Dr Rajendra G. Paratian Officer-in-Charge and Senior Labour Market Policy and
Employment Specialist

Chiratidzo Iris Mabuwa Head of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation

Adolphus Chinomwe Programme Assistant

The Royal Norwegian Embassy, Harare:

H.E. Gunnar Foreland	Ambassador
Mariann Ruud Hagen	First Secretary

Labour and Economic Development Research Institute of Zimbabwe (LEDRIZ) and Alternatives to Neoliberalism in Southern Africa (ANSA):

Dr Godfrey Kanyenze	Director, LEDRIZ
Naomi Chakanya	Development and Research Economist, LEDRIZ
Timothy F. Kondo	Regional Programme Coordinator, ANSA

Zimbabwe Lawyers for Human Rights

Irene Petras	Executive Director
--------------	--------------------

Civil Service Employees Association:

Masimba Kadzimu	President, Civil Service Employees Association
Emelda Rungano Mhuto	Deputy General Secretary, Civil Service Employees Association

Friday, 7 May 2010

Kudenga and Company Auditors:

Martin Makaya	Partners, External Auditor, Kudenga and Company Auditors
Brian Nzombe	Manager, Kudenga and Company Auditors
Hazel Charamba	Audit Senior, Kudenga and Company Auditors

Zimbabwe Human Rights Association:

Olivia Gumbo	National Programmes Coordinator
--------------	---------------------------------

National Engineering Workers Union:

Wise Garira	Second Deputy President, National Engineering Workers Union
Lovemore Mazenge	Deputy General Secretary, National Engineering Workers Union
Paidamovo G. Howera	Regional Officer, National Engineering Workers Union
Shephard Mashingaidze	Regional Officer, National Engineering Workers Union

General Agriculture and Plantation Workers Union:

Gift Muti	Deputy Secretary General, General Agriculture and Plantation Workers Union
Juliet Sithole	Gender and Child Labour Coordinator, General Agriculture and Plantation Workers Union

Sunday, 9 May 2010

ZCTU Regional Office, Masvingo:

Misheck Gapare	Regional Chairman, ZCTU Regional Office, Masvingo
Idaishe Matsika	Regional Councilor, ZGWU
Mouline Sidakwa	Regional Vice Chairperson, ZUCWU
Manase Vunganai	Regional Councilor, ZUCWU
Tafara Berget	Paralegal Officer, ZCTU
Tavengarama	
Elliot Muposhi	Regional Officer, ZCTU

ZCTU Regional Office, Masvingo (shopstewards:

Jowanisi Tapuwa Chari	Shopsteward, CWUZ
Kariot Muvongomerwa	Shopsteward, ZUCWU
Winnet Musorosekwa	Shopsteward, NEWU

Monday, 10 May 2010

Separate meetings with ZCTU heads of departments:

Michael Kandukutu	National Organizer, ZCTU
Zakayo Mtintema	Legal Advisor, ZCTU
Last Tarabuku	Project Coordinator, Capacity Building, ZCTU
Fiona Magaya	Women and Gender Coordinator

Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, Harare:

Kathrin Meissner	Resident Director, <i>Friedrich Ebert Stiftung</i>
------------------	----------------------------------------------------

Zimbabwe Leather Shoe and Allied Workers Union:

Isidore Zindonga	Secretary General, Zimbabwe Leather Shoe and Allied Workers Union
Lloyd Ndaba	President, Zimbabwe Leather Shoe and Allied Workers Union
Richard Rukweza	Education Officer, Zimbabwe Leather Shoe and Allied Workers Union

Tuesday, 11 May 2010

National Constitutional Assembly:

Dr Lovemore Madhuku	National Chairperson, National Constitutional Assembly
---------------------	--------------------------------------------------------

International Labour Office-Country Office Harare:

Alphonse Tabi-Abodo	Deputy Director and Officer-in-Charge
---------------------	---------------------------------------

Limpho Mandoro	Social Dialogue and Labour Administration Specialist
Ida Chimodza	National Programme Coordinator, HIV/AIDS
<i>Progressive Teachers Union of Zimbabwe:</i>	
Raymond Majongwe	General Secretary, Progressive Teachers Union of Zimbabwe

Zimbabwe Urban Councils Workers Union:

Moses Tshimukeni	General Secretary, Zimbabwe Urban Councils Workers Union
Mahlangu	
Rosewinter Kandekande	Secretary

Commercial Workers' Union of Zimbabwe:

March Makanya	President, Commercial Workers' Union of Zimbabwe
Hon. Lucia Matibenga, MP	General Secretary, Commercial Workers' Union of Zimbabwe

Separate meetings with ZCTU heads of departments:

Khumblani Ndlovu	Information Officer, ZCTU
Vimbai Zinyama	Parliamentary and Advocacy Officer, ZCTU

Wednesday, 12 May 2010

ZCTU Regional Office, Harare:

Nyikadzino Mandzonga	Regional Officer, ZCTU Regional Office, North Eastern Region, Harare
Ndakatadzeyi Chikoti	Branch Chairman, FFAWUZ
Godknows Biya	Branch Chairman, ZCPAWU
Arizona Gudoricharima	Branch Committee Member, CLAWUZ
Taurai Gurure	Branch Committee Member, CLAWUZ

Zimbabwe Chemicals, Plastics and Allied Workers Union:

Dennis Chiwara	General Secretary, Zimbabwe Chemicals, Plastics and Allied Workers Union
----------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------

Thursday, 13 May 2010

Presentation of findings and conclusions to ZCTU elected leaders and Women Advisory Council at Quality International Hotel):

Lovemore Matombo	President, ZCTU
Wellington Chibebe	Secretary General, ZCTU
Lucia Matibenga	First Vice President, ZCTU
George Nkiwane	Second Vice President, ZCTU

Japhet Moyo	First Deputy Secretary General, ZCTU
Blessings Mujuru	Treasurer, ZCTU
Shillet Gutu	Chairperson, WAC-ZCTU
Sithokozile Siwela	Secretary, WAC-ZCTU
John Ngirazi	Executive Committee, ZCTU
Ephanos Makiwa	Executive Committee, ZCTU
Miriam Katumba	Vice Chairperson, WAC-ZCTU
Gideon Shoko	Committee Member

Friday, 14 May 2010

Zimbabwe Construction and Allied Trades Workers' Union (meeting at Harare International Airport):

Nicholas Muchapiwa	General Secretary, Zimbabwe Construction and Allied Trades Workers' Union
Mazarura	

Appendix 3: International Labour Conventions ratified by Zimbabwe

Name of Convention	Ratification date	Status
C14 Weekly Rest (Industry) Convention, 1921	06:06:1980	ratified
C19 Equality of Treatment (Accident Compensation) Convention, 1925	06:06:1980	ratified
C26 Minimum Wage-Fixing Machinery Convention, 1928	16:09:1993	ratified
C29 Forced Labour Convention, 1930	27:08:1998	ratified
C45 Underground Work (Women) Convention, 1935	06:06:1980	denounced on 30:05:2008
C81 Labour Inspection Convention, 1947	16:09:1993	ratified
C87 Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948	09:04:2003	ratified
C98 Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949	27:08:1998	ratified
C99 Minimum Wage Fixing Machinery (Agriculture) Convention, 1951	16:09:1993	ratified
C100 Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951	14:12:1989	ratified
C105 Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957	27:08:1998	ratified
C111 Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958	23:06:1999	ratified
C129 Labour Inspection (Agriculture) Convention, 1969	16:09:1993	ratified
C135 Workers' Representatives Convention, 1971	27:08:1998	ratified
C138 Minimum Age Convention, 1973	06:06:2000	ratified
C140 Paid Educational Leave Convention, 1974	27:08:1998	ratified
C144 Tripartite Consultation (International Labour Standards) Convention, 1976	14:12:1989	ratified
C150 Labour Administration Convention, 1978	27:08:1998	ratified
C155 Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 1981	09:04:2003	ratified
C159 Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment (Disabled Persons) Convention, 1983	27:08:1998	ratified
C161 Occupational Health Services Convention, 1985	09:04:2003	ratified
C162 Asbestos Convention, 1986	09:04:2003	ratified

C170 Chemicals Convention, 1990	27:08:1998	ratified
C174 Prevention of Major Industrial Accidents Convention, 1993	09:04:2003	ratified
C176 Safety and Health in Mines Convention, 1995	09:04:2003	ratified
C182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999	11:12:2000	ratified

Ratified: 25 Conditional ratification: 0 Declared applicable: 0 Denounced: 1

Source: ILOLEX - 25. 6. 2010